

Long Discourses

Bhikkhu Sujato

LONG DISCOURSES

A faithful translation of the Dīgha Nikāya



translated and introduced by

BHIKKHU SUJATO

VOLUME 2

DN 14–23

THE GREAT CHAPTER

MAHĀVAGGA



SUTTACENTRAL

Long Discourses is a translation of the Dighanikāya by Bhikkhu Sujato.

Creative Commons Zero (CC0)

To the extent possible under law, Bhikkhu Sujato has waived all copyright and related or neighboring rights to *Long Discourses*.

This work is published from Australia.

This translation is an expression of an ancient spiritual text that has been passed down by the Buddhist tradition for the benefit of all sentient beings. It is dedicated to the public domain via Creative Commons Zero (CC0). You are encouraged to copy, reproduce, adapt, alter, or otherwise make use of this translation. The translator respectfully requests that any use be in accordance with the values and principles of the Buddhist community.

Web publication date 2018

This edition 2026-07-29 12:02:09

Publication type paperback

Edition ed5

Number of volumes 3

Publication ISBN 978-1-76132-052-1

Volume ISBN 978-1-76132-095-8

Publication URL <https://suttacentral.net/editions/dn/en/sujato>

Source URL <https://github.com/suttacentral/bilara-data/tree/published/translation/en/sujato/sutta/dn>

Publication number scpub2

Map of Jambudipa is by Jonas David Mitja Lang, and is released by him under Creative Commons Zero (CC0).

Published by SuttaCentral

*SuttaCentral,
c/o Alwis & Alwis Pty Ltd
Kaurua Country,
Suite 12,
198 Greenhill Road,
Eastwood,
SA 5063,
Australia*

Contents

Summary of Contents	vi
---------------------	----

THE GREAT CHAPTER

DN 14 The Great Discourse on Traces Left Behind (<i>Mahāpadānasutta</i>)	2
DN 15 The Great Discourse on Causation (<i>Mahānidānasutta</i>)	46
DN 16 The Great Discourse on the Buddha's Extinguishment (<i>Mahāparinibbānasutta</i>)	67
DN 17 King Mahāsudassana (<i>Mahāsudassanasutta</i>)	166
DN 18 With Janavasabha (<i>Janavasabhasutta</i>)	185
DN 19 The Great Steward (<i>Mahāgovindasutta</i>)	203
DN 20 The Great Congregation (<i>Mahāsamayasutta</i>)	228
DN 21 Sakka's Questions (<i>Sakkapañhasutta</i>)	250
DN 22 The Longer Discourse on Mindfulness Meditation (<i>Mahāsatiṭṭhānasutta</i>)	277
DN 23 With Pāyāsi (<i>Pāyāsisutta</i>)	302
Colophon	330

Summary of Contents

The Great Chapter (*Mahāvagga*) This chapter contains a diverse range of discourses. Several focus on the events surrounding the Buddha's death, while others range into fabulous scenarios set among the gods, and still others are grounded in detailed discussions of doctrine.

DN 14: The Great Discourse on Traces Left Behind (*Mahāpadānasutta*) The Buddha teaches about the six Buddhas of the past, and tells a lengthy account of one of those, Vipassī.

DN 15: The Great Discourse on Causation (*Mahānidānasutta*) Rejecting Venerable Ānanda's claim to easily understand dependent origination, the Buddha presents a complex and demanding analysis, revealing hidden nuances and implications of this central teaching.

DN 16: The Great Discourse on the Buddha's Extinguishment (*Mahāparinibbānasutta*) The longest of all discourses, this extended narrative tells of the events surrounding the Buddha's death. Full of vivid and moving details, it is an ideal entry point into knowing the Buddha as a person, and understanding how the Buddhist community coped with his passing.

DN 17: King Mahāsudassana (*Mahāsudassanasutta*) An elaborate story of a past life of the Buddha as a legendary king who renounced all to practice meditation.

DN 18: With Janavasabha (*Janavasabhasutta*) Beginning with an account of the fates of disciples who had recently passed away, the scene shifts to a discussion of Dhamma held by the gods.

- DN 19: The Great Steward (*Mahāgovindasutta*)** A minor deity informs the Buddha of the conversations and business of the gods.
- DN 20: The Great Congregation (*Mahāsamayasutta*)** When deities from all realms gather in homage to the Buddha, he gives a series of verses describing them. These verses, which are commonly chanted in Theravadin countries, give one of the most detailed descriptions of the deities worshiped at the the time of the Buddha.
- DN 21: Sakka's Questions (*Sakkapañhasutta*)** After hearing a love song from a god of music, the Buddha engages in a deep discussion with Sakka on the conditioned origin of attachment and suffering.
- DN 22: The Longer Discourse on Mindfulness Meditation (*Mahāsatipaṭṭhānasutta*)** The Buddha details the seventh factor of the noble eightfold path, mindfulness meditation. This discourse is essentially identical to MN 10, with the addition of an extended section on the four noble truths derived from MN 141.
- DN 23: With Pāyāsi (*Pāyāsisutta*)** This is a long and entertaining debate between a monk and a skeptic, who went to elaborate and bizarre lengths to prove that there is no such thing as an afterlife. The discourse contains a colorful series of parables and examples.

THE GREAT CHAPTER

DN 14

The Great Discourse on Traces Left Behind

Mahāpadānasutta

1. On Past Lives

- 1.1.1 SO I HAVE HEARD.¹ At one time the Buddha was staying near Sāvattthī in Jeta’s Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika’s monastery, in the hut by the kareri tree.²
- 1.1.3 Then after the meal, on return from almsround, several mendicants sat together in the pavilion by the kareri tree and this Dhamma talk on the subject of past lives came up among them, “So it was in a past life; such it was in a past life.”³
- 1.2.1 With clairaudience that is purified and superhuman, the Buddha heard that discussion among the mendicants. So he got up from his

1. In the suttas, *apadāna* means “evidence”, “traces left behind” (DN 27:16.4, DN 24:2.7.3, MN 15:3.32, AN 3.2:1.1). The sense here seems to have been “(story about) the traces that deeds leave behind”. The sense “legend of past lives” probably grew out of this sutta, and later became the title of the collections of legends of past lives of the monks (Thera-apadāna) and nuns (Therī-apadāna).

2. *Kareri* is evidently *Miliusa tomentosa*, known as *hoom* or *kari* in Hindi. It is related to the custard apple, not the curry tree (*Murraya koenigii*).

3. “Past life” is *pubbenivāsa*, literally “former abode”.

seat and went to the pavilion, where he sat on the seat spread out and addressed the mendicants: “Mendicants, what were you sitting talking about just now? What conversation was left unfinished?”

The mendicants told him what had happened, adding, “This is the conversation that was unfinished when the Buddha arrived.” 1.2.4

“Would you like to hear a Dhamma talk on the subject of past lives?” 1.3.1

“Now is the time, Blessed One! Now is the time, Holy One! Let the Buddha give a Dhamma talk on the subject of past lives. The mendicants will listen and remember it.” 1.3.2

“Well then, mendicants, listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.” 1.3.4

“Yes, sir,” they replied. The Buddha said this: 1.3.5

“Ninety-one eons ago, the Buddha Vipassī arose in the world, perfected and fully awakened.⁴ Thirty-one eons ago, the Buddha Sikhī arose in the world, perfected and fully awakened.⁵ In the same thirty-first eon, the Buddha Vessabhū arose in the world, perfected and fully awakened.⁶ In the present fortunate eon, the Buddhas Kakusandha,⁷ Koṇāgamana,⁸ and Kassapa arose in the world, per- 1.4.1

4. At MN 71:14.2 and SN 42.9:4.5 the Buddha says he recollects ninety-one eons, which must refer back to the life of Vipassī. We shall see the origin of his name below.

5. *Sikhī* means “crested one” and refers to a halo or crown. A story of him and his disciples is told at SN 6.14; cf. AN 3.80.

6. *Vessabhū* is Sanskrit *Viśvabhṛt*. It means “all-bearing”, probably originating as a word for the earth. A legendary king of the same name once ruled over the city of Avantī (DN 19:36.14).

7. Due to the appearance of four Buddhas in this cycle it is known as “fortunate” (*bhadda*). | Stories from Kakusandha’s day appear at MN 50 and SN 15.20:2.8. There is no obvious etymology for his name, but perhaps it stems from *kaku* (“peak”) and thus “the union of the peaks”, a valley at the junction of mountains.

8. The meaning of Koṇāgamana is unclear. In Sanskrit it is often spelled Kanakamuni, “the golden sage”, while in the (dubious) Nigali Sagar Edict of Ashoka it is Konākamana. At Thig 16.1:71.1 we hear the past life of three nuns in the time of Koṇāgamana.

fected and fully awakened.⁹ And in the present fortunate eon, I have arisen in the world, perfected and fully awakened.¹⁰

1.5.1 The Buddhas Vipassī, Sikhī, and Vessabhū were born as aristocrats into aristocrat families. The Buddhas Kakusandha, Koṇāgamana, and Kassapa were born as brahmins into brahmin families. I was born as an aristocrat into an aristocrat family.¹¹

1.6.1 Koṇḍañña was the clan of Vipassī,¹² Sikhī, and Vessabhū. Kassapa was the clan of Kakusandha, Koṇāgamana, and Kassapa. Gotama is my clan.¹³

9. Kassapa (Sanskrit Kaśyapa) means “tortoise”. It is a common Brahmanical clan name, stemming from an ancient figure reckoned as the eldest of the “seven sages”, to whom some Vedic verses are attributed. Details of the Buddha Kassapa’s time are found at MN 81, SN 15.20:4.1, and SN 48.57:3.1.

10. These numbers make up a quasi-logarithmic scale: the time gaps multiply by three, while the number of Buddhas divides by two. In eon one there are four Buddhas. Thirty eons ago the number is halved, so they had two Buddhas. Twice-thirty eons before that, the number is halved again, to one Buddha, thus ending the scale.

11. In ancient India, the “aristocrats” (*khattiya*) and the brahmins vied for the prestige of being the highest class. The traditional business of the aristocrats was land, politics, agriculture, and war, while the brahmins were a hereditary priestly caste who served as advisers and ritualists. It is said that the Buddha-to-be was born in whatever caste was most prestigious at the time so that his word would have the most impact. | In this sutta, the Buddha simply refers to himself as “I” with no personal name. When the seven Buddhas are listed at DN 32:3.14, however, he is called Aṅgīrasa.

12. The Koṇḍaññas (Sanskrit Kauṇḍīnya) originated as the leading clan of the city of Kuṇḍīna the capital of Vidarbha, which is probably modern Kaundīnāpura on the Wardha River.

13. Gotama is an ancient Brahmanical clan name, which like Kassapa stems from the Vedas and the seven sages. Why does the Buddha, an aristocrat, have a Brahmanical clan? During initiation by a Brahmanical family priest (*purohita*), an aristocrat was ritually determined to be a brahmin for a short time, during which he would assume the lineage name of the priest. After being restored as an aristocrat, he and his family would still be referred to by that name. Thus the Sakyans’ *purohita* must have been of the Gotama lineage. Other examples of this practice include the Mallas who are called Vāseṭṭha (DN 16:5.19.2) and Saccaka who is called Aggivessana (MN 35:4.2). The Jain Ācārāṅgasūtra 2.15.15 records a similar situation, for while Mahāvīra was, like the Buddha, a *khattiya*, he was of

For Vipassī, the lifespan was 80,000 years. For Sikhī, the lifespan 1.7.1
was 70,000 years. For Vessabhū, the lifespan was 60,000 years. For
Kakusandha, the lifespan was 40,000 years. For Koṇāgamana, the
lifespan was 30,000 years. For Kassapa, the lifespan was 20,000 years.
For me at this time the lifespan is short, brief, and fleeting. A long
life is a hundred years or a little more.

Vipassī was awakened at the root of a patala tree.¹⁴ Sikhī was awak- 1.8.1
ened at the root of a white-mango tree.¹⁵ Vessabhū was awakened at
the root of a sal tree.¹⁶ Kakusandha was awakened at the root of a
lebbeck tree.¹⁷ Koṇāgamana was awakened at the root of a cluster
fig tree.¹⁸ Kassapa was awakened at the root of a banyan tree.¹⁹ I was
awakened at the root of a peepal tree.²⁰

Vipassī had a fine pair of chief disciples named Khaṇḍa and Tissa. 1.9.1
Sikhī had a fine pair of chief disciples named Abhibhū and Samb-
hava.²¹ Vessabhū had a fine pair of chief disciples named Soṇa and
Uttara. Kakusandha had a fine pair of chief disciples named Vidhura
and Sañjīva. Koṇāgamana had a fine pair of chief disciples named
Bhiyyosa and Uttara. Kassapa had a fine pair of chief disciples named

the Kāśyapa *gotta*, and various relatives were assigned to Vāsiṣṭha, Kauṇḍinya,
and Kauśika.

14. *Stereospermum chelonoides*. Dictionaries of Pali and Sanskrit call this the
“trumpet-flower tree”, but that is more commonly used for *Oroxylum indicum*.

15. *Puṇḍarika* is the white lotus, but here it is the name of a tree. The commen-
tary says this is *setamba* (“white-mango”). It is not, however, the mango variety
known by that name today (*Mangifera caesia*), which is not found in India.

16. *Shorea robusta*.

17. *Albizia lebbeck*, sometimes still known by the old name of sirisa. Older
sources sometimes call it an acacia.

18. *Ficus racemosa*.

19. *Ficus benghalensis*.

20. *Ficus religiosa*, sacred to Buddhists, Jains, and Hindus alike. Ancient sources
referred to it both as *assattha* (Sanskrit *aśvattha*) and *pippala*. Buddhists today
simply call it the Bodhi (or Bo) tree.

21. Abhibhū means “Victor”, while Sambhava means “son of Śambhu the
blessed”. Śambhu is commonly found in the Rīg Veda in the sense, “blessing,
benefit”, and became a common name or epithet of gods, etc.

Tissa and Bhāradvāja. I have a fine pair of chief disciples named Sāriputta and Moggallāna.

- 1.10.1 Vipassī had three gatherings of disciples—one of 6,800,000, one of 100,000, and one of 80,000—all of them mendicants who had ended their defilements.²²
- 1.10.2 Sikhī had three gatherings of disciples—one of 100,000, one of 80,000, and one of 70,000—all of them mendicants who had ended their defilements.
- 1.10.3 Vessabhū had three gatherings of disciples—one of 80,000, one of 70,000, and one of 60,000—all of them mendicants who had ended their defilements.
- 1.10.4 Kakusandha had one gathering of disciples—40,000 mendicants who had ended their defilements.
- 1.10.5 Koṇāgamana had one gathering of disciples—30,000 mendicants who had ended their defilements.
- 1.10.6 Kassapa had one gathering of disciples—20,000 mendicants who had ended their defilements.
- 1.10.7 I have had one gathering of disciples—1,250 mendicants who had ended their defilements.²³
- 1.11.1 Vipassī had as chief attendant a mendicant named Asoka. Sikhī had as chief attendant a mendicant named Khemaṅkara. Vessabhū had as chief attendant a mendicant named Upasanta. Kakusandha had as chief attendant a mendicant named Buddhija. Koṇāgamana had as chief attendant a mendicant named Sotthija. Kassapa had as chief attendant a mendicant named Sabbamitta. I have as chief attendant a mendicant named Ānanda.

22. The number of disciples diminishes as we approach historical time.

23. An extensive journey of the Buddha with 1,250 mendicants is documented in Kd 6, at one point of which occurs the events of the Selasutta (Sn 3.7 and MN 91). The Buddha is also accompanied by 1,250 mendicants in the Sāmañña-phalasutta (DN 2) and the Parosahassasutta (SN 8.8).

Vipassī's father was King Bandhumā,²⁴ his birth mother was 1.12.1
Queen Bandhumatī, and their capital city was named Bandhumatī.

Sikhī's father was King Aruṇa,²⁵ his birth mother was Queen Pa- 1.12.4
bhāvati,²⁶ and their capital city was named Aruṇavatī.²⁷

Vessabhū's father was King Suppatita,²⁸ his birth mother was 1.12.7
Queen Vassavatī, and their capital city was named Anoma.

Kakusandha's father was the brahmin Aggidatta,²⁹ and his birth 1.12.10
mother was the brahmin lady Visākhā.³⁰ At that time the king was
Khema, whose capital city was named Khemavatī.³¹

Koṇāgamaṇa's father was the brahmin Yaññadatta,³² and his birth 1.12.14
mother was the brahmin lady Uttarā.³³ At that time the king was
Sobha, whose capital city was named Sobhavatī.³⁴

24. *Bandhumā* literally means “one who has kin”. A King Bandhumant is recorded as a descendant of Ikṣvāku, son of Manu, son of the Sun (Viṣṇu Purāṇa 4.1). Gotama, likewise, was a “kinsman of the sun” (*ādiccabandhu*).

25. The son of King Dawn and Queen Radiant in the City of the Dawn, Sikhī is the streaming rays of sunrise. These names recall a solar myth.

26. In Mārkaṇḍeya Purāṇa ch. 131, a Pabhāvati, daughter of the king of Vi-darbha, is said to have married Marutta, king of Vajji.

27. There is an Arunawati River in Maharashtra, not far from the ancient home-land of the Koṇḍaññas in Kuṇḍina.

28. Vessabhū's parents King Goodfall and Queen Rainy recall a seasonal fertility myth, where they gave life to their son the earth, “the nourisher and bearer of all”. Note, however the variants *suppatita* (“well pleased”) and *yasavatī* (“celebrated”).

29. The names of the brahmin fathers all refer to ritual offerings. Aggidatta means “offered to the fire”.

30. The names of the brahmin mothers all recall Indian *nakkhatta*. These are “constellations” or more properly “lunar mansions”; segments of the sky through which the Moon passes and which are associated with certain stars or clusters. In the Atharvaveda system, Visākhā is the 16th lunar asterism (Libra).

31. Based on the Ashoka pillar there, this is identified with modern Gotihawa, southeast of Kapilavastu in Nepal.

32. “Offered in sacrifice”.

33. Several constellations are distinguished as “former” (*pubba*) and “later” (*uttara*). Since it lies between Visākhā and Dhanavatī, this may be the 21st constellation, Uttara Āṣāḍhā (Sagittarius/Capricorn).

34. If the dubious Ashokan edict there is to be believed, this was traditionally identified with the town known today as Nigali Sagar near Kapilavastu in Nepal.

- 1.12.18 Kassapa's father was the brahmin Brahmadatta,³⁵ and his birth mother was the brahmin lady Dhanavati.³⁶ At that time the king was Kikī,³⁷ whose capital city was named Varanasi.
- 1.12.22 In this life, my father was King Suddhodana,³⁸ my birth mother was Queen Māyā,³⁹ and our capital city was Kapilavatthu."
- 1.12.25 That is what the Buddha said. When he had spoken, the Holy One rose from his seat and entered his dwelling.
- 1.13.1 Soon after the Buddha left, those mendicants discussed among themselves:
- 1.13.2 "It's incredible, reverends, it's amazing! The Realized One has such psychic power and might! For he is able to recollect the birth, names, clans, lifespan, chief disciples, and gatherings of disciples of the Buddhas of the past who have become fully quenched, cut off proliferation, cut off the course, finished off the cycle, and passed beyond all suffering:⁴⁰ 'Such is the birth, names, clans, conduct, teachings, wisdom, meditation, and freedom of those Blessed Ones.'

35. "Offered to Brahmā". Many of the Jātakas feature a king of this name, usually said to reside in Benares.

36. Dhanavati means "wealthy", but it is also an alternate name for the 23rd constellation, *dhaniṣṭhā* (or *śraviṣṭhā*, Delphinus).

37. Kikī ("blue jay") appears in the story of the past Buddha Kassapa at MN 81.

38. Suddhodana means "white rice". He is mentioned by name at Thag 10.1:8.1, Snp 3.11:7.2, and Kd 1:54.1.4.

39. Māyā means "illusion". She is mentioned by name at Thag 10.1:8.2 and Thig 6.6:6.2.

40. This is the only doctrinal context where we find *vaṭuma* ("course"). The commentary explains it as the "course of craving". However, in Buddhist Sanskrit we find the phrases *chinnaṃ vartmaṃ na vartati* (Mahāvastu 2.416) and *chinnaṃ vartma na pravartate* (Nidāna Saṃyukta 11.6), which recall the Pali phrase *vaṭṭaṃ vattati* (DN 15:22.6), where *vaṭṭa* occurs in the next word of the current passage. This suggests that the sense is, rather, the "course of transmigration", as in the later Sanskrit phrase *saṃsāravartmani*.

Is it because the Realized One has clearly penetrated the principle 1.13.5
of the teachings that he can recollect all these things?⁴¹ Or did deities
tell him?” But this conversation among those mendicants was left
unfinished.

Then in the late afternoon, the Buddha came out of retreat and 1.14.1
went to the pavilion by the kareri tree, where he sat down on the
seat spread out and addressed the mendicants: “Mendicants, what
were you sitting talking about just now? What conversation was left
unfinished?”

The mendicants told him what had happened, adding, “This was 1.14.4
our conversation that was unfinished when the Buddha arrived.”

“It is because the Realized One has clearly penetrated the principle 1.15.1
of the teachings that he can recollect all these things. And the deities
also told me.

Would you like to hear a further Dhamma talk on the subject of 1.15.5
past lives?”

“Now is the time, Blessed One! Now is the time, Holy One! Let 1.15.6
the Buddha give a further Dhamma talk on the subject of past lives.
The mendicants will listen and remember it.”

“Well then, mendicants, listen and apply your mind well, I will 1.15.8
speak.”

“Yes, sir,” they replied. The Buddha said this: 1.15.9

“Ninety-one eons ago, the Buddha Vipassī arose in the world, 1.16.1
perfected and fully awakened. He was born as an aristocrat into an
aristocrat family. His clan was Koṇḍañña. He lived for 80,000 years.
He was awakened at the root of a patala tree. He had a fine pair of
chief disciples named Khaṇḍa and Tissa. He had three gatherings of
disciples—one of 6,800,000, one of 100,000, and one of 80,000—
all of them mendicants who had ended their defilements. He had
as chief attendant a mendicant named Asoka. His father was King

41. “Principle of the teachings” is *dharmadhātu*. At SN 12.32:18.1, Sāriputta’s mastery of the *dharmadhātu* gives him the ability to answer any questions on the Dhamma.

Bandhumā, his birth mother was Queen Bandhumatī, and their capital city was named Bandhumatī.

2. What's Normal For One Intent on Awakening

1.17.1 When Vipassī, the being intent on awakening, passed away from the host of joyful gods, he was conceived in his mother's womb, mindful and aware.⁴² This is normal in such a case.⁴³

1.17.3 It's normal that, when the being intent on awakening passes away from the host of joyful gods, he is conceived in his mother's womb. And then—in this world with its gods, Māras, and divinities, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, gods and humans—an immeasurable, magnificent light appears, surpassing the glory of the gods. Even in the boundless gloom of interstellar space—so utterly dark that even the luminosity of the moon and the sun, so mighty and powerful, makes no impression—an immeasurable, magnificent light appears, surpassing the glory of the gods.⁴⁴ And the sentient beings reborn there recognize each other by that light: 'So,

42. These characteristics of the birth of the Buddha-to-be are also found in MN 123, where Ānanda quotes the Buddha, although the wording is a little different and three extra details are added at the start. In addition, this detail and that about emerging mindfully from the womb are found at AN 4.127. | Normally in early Pali, the word *bodhisatta* is reserved for the Buddha-to-be once he has left home and is practicing "intent on awakening" (eg. MN 26:13.1). This passage extends the usage back as far as the end of the immediate past life.

43. "Normal" is *dhammatā*, a natural principle. This entire passage differs from the earliest concept of the bodhisatta ("one intent on awakening"), which in early texts is typically applied to Siddhattha after he left the home.

44. The commentary identifies this realm of "utter darkness" (*andhakāratimisā*) with a cold hell realm. There is a corresponding Purāṇic hell called *andhatāmisra*. | *Asaṃvutā* was translated by Ñāṇamoḷī as "abysmal", but this relies on a commentarial cosmology that is not found in the suttas. The sense, rather, is "boundless". The root harks back to the Vedic serpent Vṛtra who wraps the world in darkness. | *Nānubhonti* ("makes no impression") is glossed in the commentary to AN 4.127 as *nappahonti* ("ineffective").

it seems other sentient beings have been reborn here!’⁴⁵ And this ten-thousandfold galaxy shakes and rocks and trembles. And an immeasurable, magnificent light appears in the world, surpassing the glory of the gods. This is normal in such a case.

It’s normal that, when the being intent on awakening is conceived in his mother’s womb, four godlings approach to guard the four quarters, so that no human or non-human or anyone at all shall harm the being intent on awakening or his mother.⁴⁶ This is normal in such a case. 1.17.9

It’s normal that, when the being intent on awakening is conceived in his mother’s womb, she becomes naturally ethical. She refrains from killing living creatures, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying, and beer, wine, and liquor intoxicants.⁴⁷ This is normal in such a case. 1.18.1

It’s normal that, when the being intent on awakening is conceived in his mother’s womb, she no longer thinks of men in a sexual way, and she cannot be violated by a man of lustful intent. This is normal in such a case. 1.19.1

It’s normal that, when the being intent on awakening is conceived in his mother’s womb, she obtains the five kinds of sensual stimulation and amuses herself, supplied and provided with them.⁴⁸ This is normal in such a case. 1.20.1

It’s normal that, when the being intent on awakening is conceived in his mother’s womb, no afflictions beset her. She’s happy and free 1.21.1

45. The light is a physical one, not just a metaphor. From this, it appears that sentient beings may be spontaneously reborn in interstellar space. Compare the problem of the “Boltzmann brain” in physics.

46. These are the Four Great Kings, regarded as protector deities. | The term *okkanti* (“conception”) is a synonym of “rebirth” (DN 15.4.3). It literally means “descent”. Its usage in this context is anticipated by Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 4.4.1, which describes how, as a man is dying, his self “descends” into the heart. He loses sense awareness, the tip of his heart lights up and he departs, “rising” (*utkrāṃanta*) with his life-breath, and “descending” with consciousness into a new life, taking his knowledge, deeds, and past experiences.

47. The five precepts.

48. While sensual pleasures provoke attachment, they are nonetheless a kind of pleasure and therefore a sign of virtue and good past kamma.

of bodily fatigue. And she sees the being intent on awakening in her womb, whole in his major and minor limbs, not deficient in any faculty. Suppose there was a beryl gem that was naturally lustrous, eight-faceted, well-worked, transparent, clear, and unclouded, endowed with all good qualities. And it was strung with a thread of blue, yellow, red, white, or golden brown. And a person with clear eyes were to take it in their hand and examine it: ‘This beryl gem is naturally lustrous, eight-faceted, well-worked, transparent, clear, and unclouded, endowed with all good qualities. And it’s strung with a thread of blue, yellow, red, white, or golden brown.’

1.21.4 In the same way, when the being intent on awakening is conceived in his mother’s womb, no afflictions beset her. She’s happy and free of bodily fatigue. And she sees the being intent on awakening in her womb, whole in his major and minor limbs, not deficient in any faculty. This is normal in such a case.

1.22.1 It’s normal that, seven days after the being intent on awakening is born, his mother passes away and is reborn in the host of joyful gods.⁴⁹ This is normal in such a case.

1.23.1 It’s normal that, while other women carry the infant in the womb for nine or ten months before giving birth, not so the mother of the being intent on awakening. She gives birth after exactly ten months.⁵⁰ This is normal in such a case.

1.24.1 It’s normal that, while other women give birth while sitting or lying down, not so the mother of the being intent on awakening. She only gives birth standing up.⁵¹ This is normal in such a case.

49. This tragic detail is also mentioned in Ud 5.2. The Buddha is raised by a step-mother, which in our Buddha’s case was Māyā’s sister Mahāpajāpatī (AN 8.51:9.8, MN 142:3.3).

50. Ten signifies fullness and completion, as for example the “ten directions”. | The notion that the term of pregnancy was “nine or ten months” is also found at Chāndogya Upaniṣad 5.9.1. In the Rig Veda it is typically “in the tenth month” (5.78.7, 10.84.3), as also at Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 6.4.22.

51. In illustrations she is depicted standing while holding a tree in the pose known as *sālabhañjikā*, a common motif in Indian art representing the abundance of springtime.

It's normal that, when the being intent on awakening emerges 1.25.1
from his mother's womb, gods receive him first, then humans. This
is normal in such a case.

It's normal that, when the being intent on awakening emerges 1.26.1
from his mother's womb, before he reaches the ground, four godlings
receive him and place him before his mother, saying: 'Rejoice, O
Queen! An illustrious son is born to you.' This is normal in such a
case.

It's normal that, when the being intent on awakening emerges 1.27.1
from his mother's womb, he emerges already clean, unsoiled by
waters, mucus, blood, or any other kind of impurity, pure and clean.
Suppose a jewel-treasure was placed on a cloth from Kāsi. The jewel
would not soil the cloth, nor would the cloth soil the jewel.⁵² Why
is that? Because of the cleanliness of them both.

In the same way, when the being intent on awakening emerges 1.27.5
from his mother's womb, he emerges already clean, unsoiled by
waters, mucus, blood, or any other kind of impurity, pure and clean.
This is normal in such a case.

It's normal that, when the being intent on awakening emerges 1.28.1
from his mother's womb, two showers of water appear from the sky,
one cool, one warm, for bathing the being intent on awakening and
his mother. This is normal in such a case.

It's normal that, as soon as he's born, the being intent on awaken- 1.29.1
ing stands firm with his own feet on the ground. Facing north, he
takes seven strides with a white parasol held above him, surveys all
quarters, and makes this dramatic proclamation: 'I am the foremost
in the world! I am the eldest in the world! I am the first in the world!

52. Kāsi is the nation of which Varanasi is the capital. Their cloth was of exceptional quality.

This is my last rebirth; now there'll be no more future lives.⁵³ This is normal in such a case.

- 1.30.1 It's normal that, when the being intent on awakening emerges from his mother's womb, then—in this world with its gods, Māras, and divinities, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, gods and humans—an immeasurable, magnificent light appears, surpassing the glory of the gods. Even in the boundless gloom of interstellar space—so utterly dark that even the luminosity of the moon and the sun, so mighty and powerful, makes no impression—an immeasurable, magnificent light appears, surpassing the glory of the gods. And the sentient beings reborn there recognize each other by that light: 'So, it seems other sentient beings have been reborn here!' And this ten-thousandfold galaxy shakes and rocks and trembles. And an immeasurable, magnificent light appears in the world, surpassing the glory of the gods. This is normal in such a case.

3. The Thirty-Two Marks of a Great Man

- 1.31.1 When Prince Vipassī was born, they announced it to King Bāndhumā,⁵⁴ 'Your Majesty, your son is born! Let Your Majesty ex-

53. This passage implies that Buddhahood was destined from the time of birth, which stands in contrast to the rest of the suttas, where Buddhahood was hard-won by the Bodhisatta's efforts while striving for awakening. | "Stands firm on his own feet" signifies that he will be awakened by his own efforts. | "North" is *uttara*, which is also "the beyond"; this predicts his attaining Nibbāna. | "Seven strides" signifies crossing over the vast cycles of birth and death, especially by developing the seven awakening factors. | The "white parasol" signifies purity and royalty (DN 14:1.34.3, Snp 3.11:11.3, Cp 26:3.3; Viṣṇu Purāṇa 5.35.14), and a white canopy at SN 41.5:5.2 is said to symbolize freedom. | "Surveying all quarters" signifies his universal knowledge. | The "dramatic proclamation" is *āsabhiṃ vācam*, literally the "voice of a bull". Other contexts show that this is an expression emphasizing speech that is dramatic and imposing (SN 52.9:3.2, DN 28:1.5 = SN 47.12:5.2). | At Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 6.1.1 and Chāndogya Upaniṣad 5.1.1 the "vital breath" (*prāṇa*) is said to be "eldest and first" (*jyeṣṭhaśca śreṣṭhaśca*).

54. Many of the details of the following account were later incorporated into the life of Gotama, under the principle that the major events of the lives of Buddhas

amine him!’ When the king had examined the prince, he had the brahmin soothsayers summoned and said to them,⁵⁵ ‘Gentlemen, please examine the prince.’ When they had examined him they said to the king, ‘Rejoice, O King! An illustrious son is born to you. You are fortunate, so very fortunate, to have a son such as this born in this family! For the prince possesses the thirty-two marks of a great man. A great man who possesses these has only two possible destinies, no other.⁵⁶ If he stays at home he becomes a king, a wheel-turning monarch, a just and principled king. His dominion extends to all four sides, he achieves stability in the country, and he possesses the seven treasures. He has the following seven treasures:⁵⁷ the wheel, the elephant, the horse, the jewel, the woman, the householder, and the commander as the seventh treasure. He has over a thousand sons who are valiant and heroic, crushing the armies of his enemies. After conquering this land girt by sea, he reigns by principle, without rod or sword. But if he goes forth from the lay life to homelessness, he becomes a perfected one, a fully awakened Buddha, who has cast off the veil from the world.

And what are the marks which he possesses?⁵⁸

1.32.1

He has well-planted feet.⁵⁹

1.32.7

follow a natural order. Nonetheless, they are not always consistent with other accounts in early texts. For example, in the Attadaṇḍasutta the Buddha says his going forth was prompted by disillusionment and fear due to chronic conflict and warfare (Snp 4.15).

55. In Snp 3.11, the newborn Siddhattha is examined by the dark hermit Asita. These two versions are combined in later accounts.

56. Asita did not look at the 32 marks, and he predicted only one destiny: that he would become a Buddha.

57. Various “treasures” (*ratana*) or “gems” of a king are discussed in such texts as Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 5.3.1.

58. The marks are elsewhere listed in DN 30:1.2.1 and MN 91:9.1. Here I list the related marks in the Bṛhatsamhitā as identified by Nathan McGovern (*On the Origins of the 32 Marks of a Great Man*, Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, 2016, vol. 39, pp. 207–247).

59. This echoes the posture of the newborn bodhisatta, and has the same meaning: that he will become awakened by “standing on his own two feet”.

- 1.32.8 On the soles of his feet there are thousand-spoked wheels, with rims and hubs, complete in every detail.⁶⁰
- 1.32.9 He has stretched heels.⁶¹
- 1.32.10 He has long fingers.⁶²
- 1.32.11 His hands and feet are soft and tender.⁶³
- 1.32.12 He has serried hands and feet.⁶⁴
- 1.32.13 The tops of his feet are arched.⁶⁵
- 1.32.14 His calves are like those of an antelope.⁶⁶
- 1.32.15 When standing upright and not bending over, the palms of both hands touch the knees.⁶⁷
- 1.32.16 His private parts are sheathed in a foreskin.⁶⁸
- 1.32.17 He is golden colored; his skin shines like lustrous gold.⁶⁹
- 1.32.18 He has delicate skin, so delicate that dust and dirt don't stick to his body.⁷⁰
- 1.32.19 His hairs grow one per pore.⁷¹
- 1.32.20 His hairs stand up; they're blue-black and curl clockwise.⁷²

60. These are solar symbols, evoking the sun as the “twelve-spoked wheel of truth” (Rig Veda 1.164.11). They leave marks that were seen by Doṇa (AN 4.36:1.3). They are often depicted in Buddhist art, signifying the perfection and completeness of the traces that the Buddha leaves behind in his teachings and practice. Bṛhatsamhitā 69.17 lists several auspicious marks, including the wheel.

61. Described as “abundantly long” at DN 30:1.12.8.

62. Same at Bṛhatsamhitā 68.36.

63. Tender feet at Bṛhatsamhitā 68.2.

64. Bṛhatsamhitā 68.2 has *śliṣṭāṅgulī* (“compact or sticky fingers”). The commentary denies that the Pali *jāla* means a physical web. I think it means that the fingers and toes were usually held together rather than splayed, hence not letting things slip through the fingers.

65. *Ussaṅkha* means “(curved) up like a shell”, while Bṛhatsamhitā 68.2 says “curved up like a tortoise”. The descriptive verse at DN 30:1.21.12 shows that it refers to the tops of the feet.

66. These are presumably the long, elegant rear calves of the Indian Blackbuck.

67. This agrees with Bṛhatsamhitā 68.35.

68. Same at Bṛhatsamhitā 68.8.

69. Bṛhatsamhitā 68.102 says kings have a shining complexion.

70. Bṛhatsamhitā 68.102 mentions a “clean complexion” (*śuddha*).

71. Same at Bṛhatsamhitā 68.5.

72. Bṛhatsamhitā 68.26 says those with hairs turning right become kings.

His body is tall and straight-limbed. ⁷³	1.32.21
He has bulging muscles in seven places. ⁷⁴	1.32.22
His chest is like that of a lion. ⁷⁵	1.32.23
He is filled out between the shoulders. ⁷⁶	1.32.24
He has the proportional circumference of a banyan tree: the span of his arms equals the height of his body. ⁷⁷	1.32.25
His torso is cylindrical.	1.32.26
He has ridged taste buds. ⁷⁸	1.32.27
His jaw is like that of a lion.	1.32.28
He has forty teeth.	1.32.29
His teeth are even. ⁷⁹	1.32.30
His teeth have no gaps.	1.32.31
His teeth are perfectly white.	1.32.32

73. Here *brahm-* is an adjective from $\sqrt{\text{brah}} + \text{ma}$, equivalent to the Sanskrit *bṛ̥mh*, having the sense “grown, extended”. The Sanskrit form here is *bṛhadṛjugātra*.

74. Hands, feet, shoulders, and chest (DN 30:1.13.5).

75. Bṛhatsamhitā 68.18 compares not the chest but the hips with a lion.

76. Bṛhatsamhitā 68.27 says the heart is raised and muscular.

77. Bṛhatsamhitā 69.13 has the same proportions without the simile. These are the normal human proportions, yet we cannot touch our knees without bending. The only way these marks could be reconciled is if the arms were extra long and the length of the legs below the knees was extra long as well. And this is exactly what we are told: the ankles are stretched and long, and the calves are like those of an antelope, whose rear calves are long proportionate to the thigh. Thus in this regard the marks appear to be internally consistent, though not describing normal human anatomy.

78. “Ridged taste buds” is *rasaggasaggī*. *Rasa* can mean either “taste” or “nutrition”, but the use of *ojā* in DN 30:2.9.8 confirms the latter. *Gasa* is “swallow” and per DN 30:2.7.4 it is the “conveyance of savor” (*rasaharaṇīyo*). *Agga* often means “best”, but this is derived from the primary sense of “peak”. The descriptors *uddhagga* (“raised”) at DN 30:2.7.4 and *susanṭhitā* (“prominent”) at DN 30:2.9.8 confirm that the latter is meant. The mark refers to taste buds raised in noticeable ridges on the tongue that absorb nutrition and aid digestion. It has often been interpreted as “excellent (*aggī*) sense (*gasa*) of taste (*rasa*)”, but this, being imperceptible to others, is rather a secondary consequence of the mark.

79. Even, gapless, and white teeth are at Bṛhatsamhitā 68.52.

- 1.32.33 He has a large tongue.⁸⁰
- 1.32.34 He has the voice of the Divinity, like a cuckoo's call.
- 1.32.35 His eyes are indigo.⁸¹
- 1.32.36 He has eyelashes like a cow's.⁸²
- 1.32.37 Between his eyebrows there grows a tuft, soft and white like cotton-wool.
- 1.32.38 The crown of his head is like a turban.⁸³
- 1.33.1 These are the thirty-two marks of a great man that the prince has. A great man who possesses these has only two possible destinies, no other. If he stays at home he becomes a king, a wheel-turning monarch. But if he goes forth from the lay life to homelessness, he becomes a perfected one, a fully awakened Buddha, who has cast off the veil from the world.'

4. How He Came to be Known as Vipassī

- 1.33.9 Then King Bandhumā had the brahmin soothsayers dressed in unworn clothes and satisfied all their needs.⁸⁴ Then the king appointed nursemaids for Prince Vipassī.⁸⁵ Some suckled him, some bathed him, some held him, and some carried him on their hip. From when he was born, a white parasol was held over him night and day, with the thought, 'Don't let cold, heat, grass, dust, or damp bother him.' He was dear and beloved by many people, like a blue water lily, or a pink or white lotus. He was always passed from hip to hip.

80. Same at Bṛhatsaṃhitā 68.53.

81. At Thig 13.1:6.2 Ambapālī describes her eyes as *abhinīla*. While some Indians do indeed have blue eyes, this probably describes a black so deep it appears blue.

82. Cows have long and elegant eyelashes.

83. The *uṇhisa* is depicted as a bulge on the Buddha's crown.

84. This is the *dakkhiṇā*, the religious offering given in gratitude and respect for the services.

85. His birth mother has passed away and there is no mention of a step-mother.

From when he was born, his voice was charming, graceful, sweet, 1.35.1
and endearing. It was as sweet as the song of a cuckoo-bird found in
the Himalayas.

From when he was born, Prince Vipassī had the power of clairvoy- 1.36.1
ance which manifested as a result of past deeds, by which he could
see for a league all around both by day and by night.⁸⁶

And he was unblinkingly watchful, like the gods of the thirty- 1.37.1
three. And because it was said that he was unblinkingly watchful, he
came to be known as ‘Vipassī’.⁸⁷

Then while King Bandhumā was sitting in court, he’d sit Prince 1.37.3
Vipassī in his lap and explain the case to him. And sitting there in his
father’s lap, Vipassī would thoroughly consider the case and draw a
conclusion using a logical system. So this was all the more reason
for him to be known as ‘Vipassī’.⁸⁸

Then King Bandhumā had three stilt longhouses built for him— 1.38.1
one for the winter, one for the summer, and one for the rainy season,
and provided him with the five kinds of sensual stimulation. Prince
Vipassī stayed in a stilt longhouse without coming downstairs for
the four months of the rainy season, where he was entertained by
musicians—none of them men.

The first recitation section.

86. Normally clairvoyance and related abilities are said to arise due to the power of the fourth *jhāna*, whereas here it comes naturally due to past kamma. After *jhāna* this ability is empowered by the radiant mind clear of hindrances, whereas here it seems to be a more limited ability to see clearly and in the dark.

87. Vipassī’s name is simply the personal form of the word made famous in Buddhist meditation, *vipassanā*. This is usually rendered as “insight”, but the sense here is more like “clear seeing”. | Pali frequently blurs the line between names and epithets. Here we see how a name is given, not at birth, but as a descriptive nickname that caught on.

88. Indian epistemology acknowledges two fundamental sources of knowledge: direct perception (*paccakkha*) and inference (*anumāna*). This passage shows that *vipassanā* includes both. I render *vipassanā* with “discernment” in an attempt to capture both nuances, rather than the standard “insight”.

5. The Old Man

- 2.1.1 Then, after many years, many hundred years, many thousand years had passed, Prince Vipassī addressed his charioteer,⁸⁹ ‘My dear charioteer, harness the finest chariots. We will go to a park and see the scenery.’
- 2.1.3 ‘Yes, sir,’ replied the charioteer. He harnessed the chariots and informed the prince, ‘Your Majesty, the finest chariots are harnessed. Please go at your convenience.’ Then Prince Vipassī mounted a fine carriage and, along with other fine carriages, set out for the park.
- 2.2.1 Along the way he saw an elderly man, bent double, crooked, leaning on a staff, trembling as he walked, ailing, past his prime. He addressed his charioteer, ‘My dear charioteer, what has that man done? For his hair and his body are unlike those of other men.’
- 2.2.5 ‘That, Your Majesty, is called an old man.’
- 2.2.6 ‘But why is he called an old man?’
- 2.2.7 ‘He’s called an old man because now he has not long to live.’
- 2.2.8 ‘But my dear charioteer, am I liable to grow old? Am I not exempt from old age?’
- 2.2.9 ‘Everyone is liable to grow old, Your Majesty, including you. No one is exempt from old age.’
- 2.2.10 ‘Well then, my dear charioteer, that’s enough of the park for today. Let’s return to the royal compound.’⁹⁰
- 2.2.11 ‘Yes, Your Majesty,’ replied the charioteer and did so.

89. Here begins the story of the four signs that led to Vipassī’s going forth—an old man, a sick man, a dead man, and a renunciate. Later texts apply the same story to Siddhattha, indeed to all bodhisattvas. | These four “signs” (*nimitta*) are also called “messengers of the gods”, reckoned as five (MN 130) or three (AN 3.36).

90. *Antepuraṃ* (“royal compound”) was the inner sanctum of the royal residence. Maximally it referred to the area enclosed by walls within which the ruling families and staff lived. It later became used in the more restricted sense of “harem”.

Back at the royal compound, the prince brooded, miserable and sad:⁹¹ ‘Curse this thing called rebirth, since old age will come to anyone who’s born.’ 2.2.12

Then King Bandhumā summoned the charioteer and said, ‘My dear charioteer, I hope the prince enjoyed himself at the park? I hope he was happy there?’ 2.3.1

‘No, Your Majesty, the prince didn’t enjoy himself at the park.’ 2.3.3

‘But what did he see on the way to the park?’ And the charioteer told the king about seeing the old man and the prince’s reaction. 2.3.4

6. The Sick Man

Then King Bandhumā thought, ‘Prince Vipassī must not renounce the throne. He must not go forth from the lay life to homelessness. And the words of the brahmin soothsayers must not come true.’⁹² To this end he provided the prince with even more of the five kinds of sensual stimulation, with which the prince amused himself. 2.4.1

Then, after many thousand years had passed, Prince Vipassī had his charioteer drive him to the park once more.⁹³ 2.5.1

Along the way he saw a man who was sick, suffering, gravely ill, collapsed in his own urine and feces, being picked up by some and put down by others. He addressed his charioteer, ‘My dear charioteer, what has that man done? For his eyes and his voice are unlike those of other men.’ 2.6.1

‘That, Your Majesty, is called a sick man.’ 2.6.5

‘But why is he called a sick man?’ 2.6.6

‘He’s called a sick man; hopefully he will recover from that illness.’ 2.6.7

91. “Brood” is *pajjhāyati*. He is having an existential crisis.

92. In any story of prophecy, efforts are made to avert it and they invariably fail. This is a recursive property of prophetic myth. If the prophecy were averted, the myth would not exist and we would not know of it; but because the myth does exist, we know how it ends and the prophecy must come true.

93. An existential crisis takes its own time; it cannot be rushed.

- 2.6.8 'But my dear charioteer, am I liable to fall sick? Am I not exempt from sickness?'
- 2.6.9 'Everyone is liable to fall sick, Your Majesty, including you. No one is exempt from sickness.'
- 2.6.10 'Well then, my dear charioteer, that's enough of the park for today. Let's return to the royal compound.'
- 2.6.11 'Yes, Your Majesty,' replied the charioteer and did so.
- 2.6.12 Back at the royal compound, the prince brooded, miserable and sad: 'Curse this thing called rebirth, since old age and sickness will come to anyone who's born.'
- 2.7.1 Then King Bandhumā summoned the charioteer and said, 'My dear charioteer, I hope the prince enjoyed himself at the park? I hope he was happy there?'
- 2.7.3 'No, Your Majesty, the prince didn't enjoy himself at the park.'
- 2.7.4 'But what did he see on the way to the park?' And the charioteer told the king about seeing the sick man and the prince's reaction.

7. The Dead Man

- 2.8.1 Then King Bandhumā thought, 'Prince Vipassī must not renounce the throne. He must not go forth from the lay life to homelessness. And the words of the brahmin soothsayers must not come true.' To this end he provided the prince with even more of the five kinds of sensual stimulation, with which the prince amused himself.
- 2.9.2 Then, after many thousand years had passed, Prince Vipassī had his charioteer drive him to the park once more.
- 2.10.1 Along the way he saw a large crowd gathered making a bier out of garments of different colors.⁹⁴ He addressed his charioteer, 'My dear charioteer, why is that crowd making a bier?'
- 2.10.4 'That, Your Majesty, is for someone who's departed.'
- 2.10.5 'Well then, drive the chariot up to the departed.'

94. Neither reading *vilāta* or *milāta* appears to occur elsewhere in this sense. The commentary says it is a bier (*sivika*).

‘Yes, Your Majesty,’ replied the charioteer, and did so. 2.10.6

When the prince saw the corpse of the departed, he addressed the charioteer, ‘But why is he called departed?’ 2.10.7

‘He’s called departed because now his mother and father, his relatives and kin shall see him no more, and he shall never again see them.’ 2.10.9

‘But my dear charioteer, am I liable to die? Am I not exempt from death? Will the king and queen and my other relatives and kin see me no more? And shall I never again see them?’ 2.10.10

‘Everyone is liable to die, Your Majesty, including you. No one is exempt from death. The king and queen and your other relatives and kin shall see you no more, and you shall never again see them.’ 2.10.13

‘Well then, my dear charioteer, that’s enough of the park for today. Let’s return to the royal compound.’ 2.10.16

‘Yes, Your Majesty,’ replied the charioteer and did so. 2.10.17

Back at the royal compound, the prince brooded, miserable and sad: ‘Curse this thing called rebirth, since old age, sickness, and death will come to anyone who’s born.’ 2.10.18

Then King Bandhumā summoned the charioteer and said, ‘My dear charioteer, I hope the prince enjoyed himself at the park? I hope he was happy there?’ 2.11.1

‘No, Your Majesty, the prince didn’t enjoy himself at the park.’ 2.11.3

‘But what did he see on the way to the park?’ And the charioteer told the king about seeing the dead man and the prince’s reaction. 2.11.4

8. The Renunciate

Then King Bandhumā thought, ‘Prince Vipassī must not renounce the throne. He must not go forth from the lay life to homelessness. And the words of the brahmin soothsayers must not come true.’ To this end he provided the prince with even more of the five kinds of sensual stimulation, with which the prince amused himself. 2.12.1

Then, after many thousand years had passed, Prince Vipassī had his charioteer drive him to the park once more. 2.13.2

- 2.14.1 Along the way he saw a man, a renunciate with shaven head, wearing an ocher robe.⁹⁵ He addressed his charioteer, ‘My dear charioteer, what has that man done? For his head and his clothes are unlike those of other men.’
- 2.14.5 ‘That, Your Majesty, is called a renunciate.’
- 2.14.6 ‘But why is he called a renunciate?’
- 2.14.7 ‘He is called a renunciate because he celebrates principled and fair conduct, skillful actions, good deeds, harmlessness, and sympathy for living creatures.’⁹⁶
- 2.14.8 ‘Then I celebrate the one called a renunciate, who celebrates principled and fair conduct, skillful actions, good deeds, harmlessness, and sympathy for living creatures! Well then, drive the chariot up to that renunciate.’
- 2.14.10 ‘Yes, Your Majesty,’ replied the charioteer, and did so.
- 2.14.11 Then Prince Vipassī said to that renunciate, ‘My dear, what have you done? For your head and your clothes are unlike those of other men.’
- 2.14.14 ‘Your Majesty, I am what is called a renunciate.’
- 2.14.15 ‘But why are you called a renunciate?’
- 2.14.16 ‘I am called a renunciate because I celebrate principled and fair conduct, skillful actions, good deeds, harmlessness, and sympathy for living creatures.’
- 2.14.17 ‘Then I celebrate the one called a renunciate, who celebrates principled and fair conduct, skillful actions, good deeds, harmlessness, and sympathy for living creatures!’

95. “Renunciate” is *pabbajita* (“one who has gone forth”), one of the many words for religious ascetics. It is a general term and does not specify his affiliation.

96. “Celebrate” is *sādhū*, the famous Buddhist words of approval and rejoicing still heard every day in Theravāda Buddhist cultures. It later acquired the meaning “renunciate” but does not have that sense in early Pali. The virtues that he celebrates are common values of Indian religions.

9. The Going Forth

Then the prince addressed the charioteer, ‘Well then, my dear charioteer, take the chariot and return to the royal compound. I shall shave off my hair and beard right here, dress in ocher robes, and go forth from the lay life to homelessness.’⁹⁷ 2.15.1

‘Yes, Your Majesty,’ replied the charioteer and did so. 2.15.4

Then Prince Vipassī shaved off his hair and beard, dressed in ocher robes, and went forth from the lay life to homelessness. 2.15.5

10. A Great Crowd Goes Forth

A large crowd of 84,000 people in the capital of Bandhumatī heard that Vipassī had gone forth. It occurred to them, ‘This must be no ordinary teaching and training, no ordinary going forth in which Prince Vipassī has gone forth. If even the prince goes forth, why don’t we do the same?’ 2.16.1

Then that great crowd of 84,000 people shaved off their hair and beard, dressed in ocher robes, and followed the one intent on awakening, Vipassī, by going forth from the lay life to homelessness.⁹⁸ 2.16.6
Escorted by that assembly, Vipassī wandered on tour among the villages, towns, and capital cities.⁹⁹

Then as he was in private retreat this thought came to his mind, ‘It’s not appropriate for me to live in a crowd. Why don’t I live alone, withdrawn from the group?’ After some time he withdrew from the group to live alone. The 84,000 went one way, but Vipassī went another. 2.17.1

97. His apparently sudden decision to go forth arises only after an extensive period of crisis and contemplation.

98. The idea that a whole populace would follow the bodhisatta on his renunciate path occurs several times in the Jātakas.

99. Following the PTS edition in omitting *janapada*, which is absent from the commentary and the parallel passage at DN 19:58.3.

11. Vipassī's Reflections

- 2.18.1 Then as Vipassī, the one intent on awakening, was in private retreat in his dwelling, this thought came to his mind,¹⁰⁰ ‘Alas, this world has fallen into trouble. It’s born, grows old, dies, passes away, and is reborn, yet it doesn’t understand how to escape from this suffering, from old age and death.’¹⁰¹ Oh, when will an escape be found from this suffering, from old age and death?’
- 2.18.4 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what exists is there old age and death? What is a requirement for old age and death?’¹⁰² Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom,¹⁰³ ‘When rebirth exists there’s old age and death. Rebirth is a requirement for old age and death.’¹⁰⁴
- 2.18.8 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what exists is there rebirth? What is a requirement for rebirth?’¹⁰⁵ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When continued existence

100. This is the only place *vāsūpagata* (“entered his dwelling”) is added to this stock phrase.

101. At SN 12.4–10 this same reflection is attributed to each of the seven past Buddhas, kicking off an investigation into dependent origination in reverse order, starting with the outcome: suffering. Here this is treated as a meditative contemplation, whereas the next sutta, DN 15 Mahānidānasutta, delves into the philosophical implications.

102. The reflection shows how the bodhisatta is still digging into the trauma of discovering the reality of old age and death.

103. *Yoniso maniskāra* (“rational application of mind”) is a distinctively Buddhist term that literally means “applying the mind by way of source”. It is mostly used in investigating causality, although over time it came to have a more general sense of “reflection, inquiry, attention”.

104. Here begins the sequence of dependent origination. I give basic definitions of terms here, and more details in DN 15. See also my notes in the Nidāna-samyutta, especially SN 12.1 and SN 12.2. | Rebirth is a necessary antecedent condition for old age and death. Note that it is not a *sufficient* condition for old age, for many die when young.

105. Since there cannot be an end to the “birth” that starts this life, *jāti* means “rebirth”, the next stage in the ongoing cycle.

exists there's rebirth. Continued existence is a requirement for rebirth.'¹⁰⁶

Then Vipassī thought, 'When what exists is there continued existence? What is a requirement for continued existence?' Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, 'When grasping exists there's continued existence. Grasping is a requirement for continued existence.'¹⁰⁷ 2.18.12

Then Vipassī thought, 'When what exists is there grasping? What is a requirement for grasping?' Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, 'When craving exists there's grasping. Craving is a requirement for grasping.'¹⁰⁸ 2.18.16

Then Vipassī thought, 'When what exists is there craving? What is a requirement for craving?' Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, 'When feeling exists there's craving. Feeling is a requirement for craving.'¹⁰⁹ 2.18.20

Then Vipassī thought, 'When what exists is there feeling? What is a requirement for feeling?' Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, 'When contact exists there's feeling. Contact is a requirement for feeling.'¹¹⁰ 2.18.24

106. *Bhava* means "being, existence, life" in the sense of "past and future lives". It refers to the ongoing process of continued existence, transmigrating through life after life. By itself, *bhava* has a positive connotation, and represents the longing that many people have to continue to exist after death in a permanent and happy state. The Buddha, however, situates it as just one more dimension of the flow of conditions.

107. "Grasping" (*upādāna*) at sensual pleasures, views, precepts and observances, and theories of a self (DN 15:6.3). Grasping has the active sense of "taking up" a new life, not just "clinging" to what one has. It has a dual sense, because it also means the "fuel" that sustains the fire of existence.

108. Craving (*taṇhā*, literally "thirst") and grasping have a similar meaning, but craving is primal desire while grasping is more complex, involving doctrines and behaviors.

109. "Feeling" (*vedanā*) is more fundamental than the complex concept of "emotion". It refers to the hedonic tone of experience as pleasant, painful, or neutral.

110. "Contact" is literally "touch" (*phassa*), and refers to the stimulation that occurs when sense object meets sense organ in experience.

- 2.18.28 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what exists is there contact? What is a requirement for contact?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When the six sense fields exist there’s contact. The six sense fields are requirements for contact.’¹¹¹
- 2.18.32 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what exists are there the six sense fields? What is a requirement for the six sense fields?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When name and form exist there are the six sense fields. Name and form are requirements for the six sense fields.’¹¹²
- 2.18.36 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what exists are there name and form? What is a requirement for name and form?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When consciousness exists there are name and form. Consciousness is a requirement for name and form.’¹¹³
- 2.18.40 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what exists is there consciousness? What is a requirement for consciousness?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When name and

111. The five senses with the mind as sixth. This topic is treated extensively throughout early Buddhism, with a special focus on understanding and restraining the pull of sense stimulation. *Āyatana* has a root sense “stretch”, from which derived senses include “dimension”, “field”, etc.

112. “Name and form” (*nāmarūpa*) is a Vedic concept referring to the multiplicity of material forms (*rūpa*) and associated names (*nāma*), especially the individual “sentient organisms” such as gods and humans (Rig Veda 5.43.10, Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 1.6.1, Chāndogya Upaniṣad 6.3.2), which are ultimately absorbed into the divine, like rivers in the ocean (Muṇḍaka Upaniṣad 3.2.8, Praśna Upaniṣad 6.5). The Buddha treated “name” analytically as feeling, perception, intention, contact, and application of mind, and “form” as the four elements and derived matter (DN 15:20.8, MN 9:52.1–54.7, and SN 12.2:11.1).

113. “Consciousness” (*viññāṇa*) is simple subjective awareness, the sense of knowing. It arises stimulated by either an external sense impression or a mental phenomena such as thought, memory, etc. It is the subjective awareness that makes the entire multiform world of concepts and appearances possible. Thus far the analysis agrees with Yājñavalkya, who says that the manifold appearances in the world arise from consciousness (*etebhyo bhūtebhyaḥ samutthāya*, Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.4.12).

form exist there's consciousness. Name and form are requirements for consciousness.'¹¹⁴

Then Vipassī thought, 'This consciousness turns back from name 2.19.1
and form, and doesn't go beyond that.'¹¹⁵ This is the extent to which one may be reborn, grow old, die, pass away, or reappear. That is: Name and form are requirements for consciousness. Consciousness is a requirement for name and form. Name and form are requirements for the six sense fields. The six sense fields are requirements for contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. Craving is a requirement for grasping. Grasping is a requirement for continued existence. Continued existence is a requirement for rebirth. Rebirth is a requirement for old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress to come to be.¹¹⁶ That is how this entire mass of suffering originates.'

'Origination, origination.' Such was the vision, knowledge, wis- 2.19.6
dom, realization, and light that arose in Vipassī, the one intent on awakening, regarding teachings not learned before from another.¹¹⁷

114. Here the Buddha decisively departs from Yājñavalkya's view that individuated awareness (*saññā*) returns into "this great reality, infinite, unbounded, a sheer mass of consciousness" (*idaṃ mahadbhūtaṃ anantaṃ apāraṃ vijñānaghana eva*, Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.4.12). Consciousness (*viññāṇa*) is not a fundamental reality (*mahadbhūta*) underlying multiplicity, but rather a conditioned process that exists only together with name and form.

115. Dependent origination normally continues with two further factors: choices and ignorance. The full series does not appear in the Dīghanikāya. This truncated series emphasizes the mutuality of name and form with consciousness, but does not preclude the normal linear series. Each presentation of dependent origination reveals a different aspect of a complex, ramified process.

116. Note the use of repetition to sum up the main doctrinal teachings. This serves to lock the sequence in memory and ensure no items are missing or displaced, while for one who is reciting the text from memory it provides an opportunity to reflect and apply the meaning in their own experience.

117. This phrasing recalls the Buddha's first sermon (SN 56.11:5.1), an insight that is said to be common to all Buddhas (SN 56.12:1.1). *Pubbe ananussutesu* ("not learned before from another") means that this is a fresh insight not passed down in an oral tradition.

- 2.20.1 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist is there no old age and death? When what ceases do old age and death cease?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When rebirth doesn’t exist there’s no old age and death. When rebirth ceases, old age and death cease.’
- 2.20.5 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist is there no rebirth? When what ceases does rebirth cease?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When continued existence doesn’t exist there’s no rebirth. When continued existence ceases, rebirth ceases.’
- 2.20.9 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist is there no continued existence? When what ceases does continued existence cease?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When grasping doesn’t exist there’s no continued existence. When grasping ceases, continued existence ceases.’
- 2.20.13 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist is there no grasping? When what ceases does grasping cease?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When craving doesn’t exist there’s no grasping. When craving ceases, grasping ceases.’
- 2.20.17 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist is there no craving? When what ceases does craving cease?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When feeling doesn’t exist there’s no craving. When feeling ceases, craving ceases.’
- 2.20.21 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist is there no feeling? When what ceases does feeling cease?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When contact doesn’t exist there’s no feeling. When contact ceases, feeling ceases.’
- 2.20.25 Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist is there no contact? When what ceases does contact cease?’ Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wisdom, ‘When the six sense fields don’t exist there’s no contact. When the six sense fields cease, contact ceases.’

Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist are there no 2.20.29
six sense fields? When what ceases do the six sense fields cease?’
Then, through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with
wisdom, ‘When name and form don’t exist there are no six sense
fields. When name and form cease, the six sense fields cease.’

Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist are there no 2.20.33
name and form? When what ceases do name and form cease?’ Then,
through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wis-
dom, ‘When consciousness doesn’t exist there are no name and
form. When consciousness ceases, name and form cease.’

Then Vipassī thought, ‘When what doesn’t exist is there no con- 2.20.37
sciousness? When what ceases does consciousness cease?’ Then,
through rational application of mind, Vipassī penetrated with wis-
dom, ‘When name and form don’t exist there’s no consciousness.
When name and form cease, consciousness ceases.’

Then Vipassī thought, ‘I have discovered the path to awakening. 2.21.1
That is:¹¹⁸ When name and form cease, consciousness ceases. When
consciousness ceases, name and form cease. When name and form
cease, the six sense fields cease. When the six sense fields cease,
contact ceases. When contact ceases, feeling ceases. When feel-
ing ceases, craving ceases. When craving ceases, grasping ceases.
When grasping ceases, continued existence ceases. When continued
existence ceases, rebirth ceases. When rebirth ceases, old age and
death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress cease. That is
how this entire mass of suffering ceases.’

‘Cessation, cessation.’ Such was the vision, knowledge, wisdom, 2.21.5
realization, and light that arose in Vipassī, the one intent on awaken-
ing, regarding teachings not learned before from another.¹¹⁹

118. The PTS edition has *vipassanā-maggo* here, despite admitting the term is found in no manuscripts and is taken from the commentary, where it is clearly an explanation not a reading (*maggoti vipassanāmaggo*). This error is followed by Rhys Davids and Walshe in their translations.

119. Insight into dependent origination here indicates the attaining of stream entry.

2.22.1 After some time he meditated observing rise and fall in the five grasping aggregates.¹²⁰ ‘Such is form, such is the origin of form, such is the disappearance of form. Such is feeling, such is the origin of feeling, such is the disappearance of feeling. Such is perception, such is the origin of perception, such is the disappearance of perception. Such are choices, such is the origin of choices, such is the disappearance of choices.’¹²¹ Such is consciousness, such is the origin of consciousness, such is the disappearance of consciousness.’¹²² Meditating like this his mind was soon freed from defilements by not grasping.¹²³

The second recitation section.

120. The five grasping aggregates (*pañcūpādānakkhandhā*) are mentioned as a summary of suffering in the Buddha’s first sermon (SN 56.11:4.2). Most of the teachings on this topic are collected in the Khandhasaṃyutta at SN 22, but they are also found in the Dīghanikāya at DN 22:14.1, DN 33:1.11.45, DN 33:2.1.4, and DN 34:1.6.16. The contemplation on the aggregates dispels the mistaken assumption of a self. Many of the theorists in DN 1 identify the self with one or other of the aggregates.

121. *Saṅkhāra* in early Buddhism has three main doctrinal senses. (1) The broadest sense is “conditioned phenomena”, which we find in the Dīghanikāya at DN 16:6.10.10, DN 17:2.16.1, and DN 34:1.8.59. This essentially means “everything except Nibbāna”. (2) Sometimes it is a physical or mental “process” or “activity” as at DN 18:24.1, where it refers to the gradual stilling of energies in the development of meditation. (3) In the five aggregates and dependent origination it has the sense of “morally potent volitions or choices” and is a synonym for *cetanā* (“intention”). It is defined as good, bad, and imperturbable choices (DN 33:1.10.77), the latter of which refers to the kamma of the fourth *jhāna* and above. In this sense it is the moral “choices” for good or ill that propel consciousness into a new rebirth.

122. The radical thesis of the Buddha’s teaching is the idea that consciousness is merely another empirical phenomena that comes to an end, as is also emphasized in the concluding verses of DN 11.

123. This indicates the attainment of arahantship, the complete release from all attachments leading to rebirth.

12. The Appeal of the Divinity

Then it occurred to the Blessed One Vipassī, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha,¹²⁴ ‘Why don’t I teach the Dhamma?’¹²⁵ 3.1.1

Then he thought, ‘This principle I have discovered is deep, hard to see, hard to understand, peaceful, sublime, beyond the scope of logic, subtle, comprehensible to the astute.¹²⁶ But people like clinging, they love it and enjoy it.¹²⁷ It’s hard for them to see this topic; that is, specific conditionality, dependent origination.¹²⁸ It’s also hard for them to see this topic; that is, the stilling of all activities, the letting go of all attachments, the ending of craving, fading away, cessation, extinguishment.¹²⁹ And if I were to teach this principle, others might not understand me, which would be wearying and troublesome for me.’¹³⁰ 3.1.3

And then these verses, which were neither supernaturally inspired, nor learned before in the past, occurred to him:¹³¹ 3.2.1

124. No longer a bodhisatta, he is now called a Buddha for the first time.

125. In early Buddhism, the idea of teaching the Dhamma only arose after awakening.

126. A similar account is told of Gotama Buddha at SN 6.1:1.4, MN 26:19.2, MN 85:43.2, and Kd 1:5.2.2.

127. Here “clinging” is *ālaya*, from a root meaning “to stick”.

128. “Specific conditionality” (*idappaccayatā*) refers to the fact that dependent origination traces the specific conditions for other specific things: this conditions that. It is not a general principle of universal conditionality (“everything is interconnected”).

129. “Stilling of all activities” (*sabbasaṅkhārasamatho*) is the cessation of all conditioned energies or phenomena. | “Attachment” here is *upadhi*, which is both the things of the world to which we cling, and the inner clinging. The Jains defined *upadhi* similarly (Tattvārthasūtra 9.26). The dominant meaning in Sanskrit is “fraud”, which perhaps informs the Buddhist sense.

130. The commentary is careful to specify that the Buddha means physical exhaustion only.

131. “Not supernaturally inspired” (*anacchariyā*) rejects the Vedic “channeling” of scripture from the Divinity, while “not learned before in the past” (*pubbe a-ssutapubbā*), echoing the Dhammacakkappavattanasutta (SN 56.11:5.1), rejects the oral tradition.

- 3.2.2 ‘I’ve struggled hard to realize this,
there’s no need to reveal it now!
Those mired in greed and hate
can’t really understand this teaching.
- 3.2.6 It goes against the stream, subtle,
deep, obscure, and very fine.
Those besotted by greed cannot see,
for they’re cloaked in a mass of darkness.’¹³²
- 3.2.10 So, as the Buddha Vipassī reflected like this, his mind inclined to
remaining passive, not to teaching the Dhamma.¹³³
- 3.2.11 Then, knowing the Buddha Vipassī’s train of thought, it occurred
to a certain Great Divinity,¹³⁴ ‘Oh lord! The world will be lost, the
world will perish! For the mind of the Blessed One Vipassī, the
perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha, inclines to remaining
passive, not to teaching the Dhamma.’ Then, as easily as a strong
person would extend or contract their arm, he vanished from the
realm of divinity and reappeared in front of the Buddha Vipassī.
He arranged his robe over one shoulder, knelt on his right knee,
raised his cupped palms toward the Buddha Vipassī, and said, ‘Sir,
let the Blessed One teach the Dhamma! Let the Holy One teach the
Dhamma!’¹³⁵ There are beings with little dust in their eyes. They’re

132. “Cloaked” is *āvuṭṭā*, which is from the same root as *asamvutā* in DN 14:1.17.5 above, as well as *nīvaraṇa* (“hindrance”). All these terms ultimately stem from the Vedic serpent Vṛtra (“the constrictor”) who wraps the world in darkness.

133. Had he followed this inclination he would have been a *paccekabuddha*, a Buddha “awakened for himself”.

134. In the accounts of Gotama’s life this is specified as Brahmā Sahampati (see MN 26:20.1 and note). This whole passage is a moment of high cosmic solemnity and drama.

135. The Buddha teaches on the invitation of the highest divinity. This sets a precedent for Buddhists to refrain from proselytizing, but rather teach by invitation. These passages are still recited in some places to invite a teaching.

in decline because they haven't heard the teaching. There will be those who understand the teaching!' ¹³⁶

When he said this, the Buddha Vipassī said to him, 'I too thought this, Divinity, "Why don't I teach the Dhamma?" Then it occurred to me, "If I were to teach this principle, others might not understand me, which would be wearying and troublesome for me." 3.4.1

So, as I reflected like this, my mind inclined to remaining passive, 3.4.19
not to teaching the Dhamma.'

For a second time ... For a third time that Great Divinity begged 3.5.1
the Buddha to teach.

Then, understanding the Divinity's invitation, the Buddha Vipassī 3.6.1
surveyed the world with the eye of a Buddha, out of his compassion for sentient beings. ¹³⁷ And he saw sentient beings with little dust in their eyes, and some with much dust in their eyes; with keen faculties and with weak faculties, with good qualities and with bad qualities, easy to teach and hard to teach. And some of them lived seeing the danger in the fault to do with the next world, while others did not. ¹³⁸
It's like a pool with blue water lilies, or pink or white lotuses. Some of them sprout and grow in the water without rising above it, thriving underwater. Some of them sprout and grow in the water reaching the water's surface. And some of them sprout and grow in the water but rise up above the water and stand with no water clinging to them.

In the same way, the Buddha Vipassī saw sentient beings with 3.6.4
little dust in their eyes, and some with much dust in their eyes.

Then that Great Divinity, knowing the Buddha Vipassī's train of 3.7.1
thought, addressed him in verse:

136. *Aññātāro* is an agent noun in plural, literally "understanders".

137. Previously he simply reflected to himself, now he uses his psychic abilities to ascertain people's spiritual potential.

138. *Indriya* ("faculty") is an abstract noun from *indra*, the name of the potent Vedic god of war. In the Vedas, Indra manifests his *indriya* by drinking soma. The drug enables him to release his full potential and power; originally this probably referred to drinking an amphetamine-like substance before battle. Here we see that it means something like "spiritual potential" which is unleashed by the practice of the eightfold path.

3.7.2 ‘Standing high on a rocky mountain,
you can see the people all around.
In just the same way, All-seer, so intelligent,
having ascended the Temple of Truth,
rid of sorrow, look upon the people
swamped with sorrow, overcome by rebirth and old
age.

3.7.8 Rise, hero! Victor in battle, caravan leader,¹³⁹
wander the world free of debt.¹⁴⁰
Let the Blessed One teach the Dhamma!
There will be those who understand!’

3.7.12 Then the Buddha Vipassī addressed that Great Divinity in verse:

3.7.13 ‘Flung open are the doors to freedom from death!
Let those with ears to hear commit to faith.¹⁴¹
Thinking it would be troublesome, Divinity,
I did not teach

139. Here we see a verbal echo of Sahampati’s martial origins.

140. A “caravan leader” (*satthavāha*) guides their flock through treacherous deserts and wastelands, as illustrated at DN 23:23.3. | *Anaṇa* (“debtless”) is a technical term in the Vedic system. According to Manu 6.35–7, a renunciate must first pay off three debts: study of Vedas, begetting a son, and offering of sacrifices. One who goes forth with these debts unpaid is headed for a downfall. The Buddha has indeed paid off all these debts: he studied the Vedas under his former teachers (MN 26:15.6); he has a son Rāhula; and his path is regarded as the highest form of sacrifice (DN 5:24.1). But in Buddhism the concept is reinterpreted as meaning one has let go of all defilements, becoming a “perfected”, literally “worthy” one, after which one can eat almsfood free of debt (MN 124:38.1, SN 16.11:13.2).

141. *Pamuñcantu saddham* has long troubled translators, as the basic sense of *pamuñcantu* is “release”. The problem is a long-standing one, for Sanskrit variants include *pramodantu* (“celebrate”) or *praṇudantu kāṅkṣāḥ* (“dispel doubts”). I think it is a poetic variant of *adhimuñcantu*, to “decide” or “commit” to faith. Pali commonly uses a synonymous verb to reinforce the sense of the noun. In Snp 5.19, *muttasaddho*, *pamuñcassu saddham*, and *adhimuttacittam* are all used in this sense.

the sophisticated, sublime Dhamma among mankind.’

Then the Great Divinity, knowing that his request for the Buddha Vipassī to teach the Dhamma had been granted, bowed and respectfully circled him, keeping him on his right, before vanishing right there. 3.7.17

13. The Chief Disciples

Then it occurred to the Blessed One Vipassī, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha, ‘Who should I teach first of all? Who will quickly understand this teaching?’ Then he thought, ‘That Khaṇḍa, the king’s son, and Tissa, the high priest’s son, are astute, competent, intelligent, and have long had little dust in their eyes.¹⁴² Why don’t I teach them first of all? They will quickly understand this teaching.’ 3.8.1

Then, as easily as a strong person would extend or contract their arm, he vanished from the tree of awakening and reappeared near the capital city of Bandhumatī, in the deer park named Sanctuary.¹⁴³ 3.9.1

Then the Buddha Vipassī addressed the park keeper,¹⁴⁴ ‘My dear park keeper, please enter the city and say this to the king’s son Khaṇḍa and the high priest’s son Tissa: “Sirs, the Blessed One Vipassī, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha, has arrived at Bandhumatī and is staying in the deer park named Sanctuary. He wishes to see you.”’ 3.9.2

‘Yes, sir,’ replied the park keeper, and did as he was asked. 3.9.5

142. In the account of Gotama, he first thinks to teach his former colleagues under whom he practiced the formless attainments. Here we see the start of a tendency in the legends of past Buddhas to erase the education among other spiritual teachers before awakening. Note that these two, who will become Vipassī’s chief disciples, are leading *khattiya* and brahmin sons of the royal household. Khaṇḍa was Vipassī’s brother, and the priest’s son was virtually family.

143. *Khema* (“sanctuary”) originally meant “oasis”. It is common name for lakes and nature parks in the Jātakas.

144. There is a clear distinction between such managed “parks” and wilderness regions (*arañña*).

- 3.10.1 Then the king's son Khaṇḍa and the high priest's son Tissa had the finest carriages harnessed. Then they mounted a fine carriage and, along with other fine carriages, set out from Bandhumatī for the Sanctuary. They went by carriage as far as the terrain allowed, then descended and approached the Buddha Vipassī on foot. They bowed and sat down to one side.
- 3.11.1 The Buddha Vipassī taught them step by step, with a talk on giving, ethical conduct, and heaven. He revealed the drawbacks of sensual pleasures, so sordid and corrupt, and the benefit of renunciation. And when he knew that their minds were ready, pliable, rid of hindrances, elated, and confident he revealed the special teaching of the Buddhas: suffering, its origin, its cessation, and the path. Just as a clean cloth rid of stains would properly absorb dye, in that very seat the stainless, immaculate vision of the Dhamma arose in the king's son Khaṇḍa and the high priest's son Tissa: 'Everything that is liable to arise is liable to cease.'
- 3.12.1 They saw, attained, understood, and fathomed the Dhamma. They went beyond doubt, got rid of indecision, and became self-assured and independent of others regarding the Teacher's instructions. They said to the Buddha Vipassī, 'Excellent, sir! Excellent! As if he were righting the overturned, or revealing the hidden, or pointing out the path to the lost, or lighting a lamp in the dark so people with clear eyes can see what's there, the Buddha has made the teaching clear in many ways. We go for refuge to the Blessed One and to the teaching. Sir, may we receive the going forth and ordination in the Buddha's presence?'
- 3.13.1 And they received the going forth, the ordination in the Buddha Vipassī's presence.¹⁴⁵ Then the Buddha Vipassī educated, encouraged, fired up, and inspired them with a Dhamma talk. He revealed the drawbacks of conditioned phenomena, so sordid and corrupt,

145. In the early period, there was no distinction between "going forth" (*pabbajjā*) and "ordination" (*upasampadā*). They refer to two sides of the same coin: leaving the home life and entering the ascetic life. Ordination was originally granted with the simple call, "Come mendicant!" (*ehi bhikkhu*).

and the benefit of extinguishment. Being taught like this their minds were soon freed from defilements by not grasping.¹⁴⁶

14. The Going Forth of the Large Crowd

A large crowd of 84,000 people in the capital of Bandhumatī heard that the Blessed One Vipassī, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha, had arrived at Bandhumatī and was staying in the deer park named Sanctuary. And they heard that the king's son Khaṇḍa and the high priest's son Tissa had shaved off their hair and beard, dressed in ochre robes, and gone forth from the lay life to homelessness in the Buddha's presence. It occurred to them, 'This must be no ordinary teaching and training, no ordinary going forth in which the king's son Khaṇḍa and the high priest's son Tissa have gone forth. If even they go forth, why don't we do the same?' Then those 84,000 people left Bandhumatī for the deer park named Sanctuary, where they approached the Buddha Vipassī, bowed and sat down to one side. 3.14.1

The Buddha Vipassī taught them step by step, with a talk on giving, ethical conduct, and heaven. He revealed the drawbacks of sensual pleasures, so sordid and corrupt, and the benefit of renunciation. And when he knew that their minds were ready, pliable, rid of hindrances, elated, and confident he revealed the special teaching of the Buddhas: suffering, its origin, its cessation, and the path. Just as a clean cloth rid of stains would properly absorb dye, in that very seat the stainless, immaculate vision of the Dhamma arose in those 84,000 people: 'Everything that is liable to arise is liable to cease.' 3.15.1

They saw, attained, understood, and fathomed the Dhamma. They went beyond doubt, got rid of indecision, and became self-assured and independent of others regarding the Teacher's instructions. They said to the Buddha Vipassī, 'Excellent, sir! Excellent!' And just like 3.16.1

146. Thus they became arahants, realizing the same truth that Vipassī had.

Khaṇḍa and Tissa they asked for and received ordination. Then the Buddha taught them further.

- 3.17.1 Being taught like this their minds were soon freed from defilements by not grasping.

15. The 84,000 Who Had Gone Forth Previously

- 3.18.1 The 84,000 people who had gone forth previously also heard: ‘It seems the Blessed One Vipassī, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha, has arrived at Bandhumatī and is staying in the deer park named Sanctuary. And he is teaching the Dhamma!’ Then they too went to the Buddha Vipassī, realized the Dhamma, went forth, and became freed from defilements.

16. The Allowance to Wander

- 3.22.1 Now at that time a large Saṅgha of 6,800,000 mendicants were residing at Bandhumatī. As the Buddha Vipassī was in private retreat this thought came to his mind, ‘The Saṅgha residing at Bandhumatī now is large. What if I was to urge them:
- 3.22.4 “Wander forth, mendicants, for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans.¹⁴⁷ Let not two go by one road. Teach the Dhamma that’s good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, meaningful and well-phrased. And reveal a spiritual practice that’s entirely full and pure. There are beings with little dust in their eyes. They’re in decline because they haven’t heard the teaching. There will be those who understand the teaching! But

147. As at Kd 1:11.1.4 and SN 4.5:2.3. One of the Buddha’s first acts is to empower his students.

when six years have passed, you must all come to Bandhumatī to recite the monastic code.”¹⁴⁸

Then a certain Great Divinity, knowing the Buddha Vipassī’s train 3.23.1
of thought, as easily as a strong person would extend or contract their
arm, vanished from the realm of divinity and reappeared in front of
the Buddha Vipassī. He arranged his robe over one shoulder, raised
his cupped palms toward the Buddha Vipassī, and said, ‘That’s so
true, Blessed One! That’s so true, Holy One! The Saṅgha residing
at Bandhumatī now is large. Please urge them to wander, as you
thought. And sir, I’ll make sure that when six years have passed the
mendicants will return to Bandhumatī to recite the monastic code.’

That is what that Great Divinity said. Then he bowed and respect- 3.23.10
fully circled the Buddha Vipassī, keeping him on his right, before
vanishing right there.

Then in the late afternoon, the Buddha Vipassī came out of retreat 3.24.1
and addressed the mendicants, telling them all that had happened.
Then he said,

‘Wander forth, mendicants, for the welfare and happiness of the 3.26.1
people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and
happiness of gods and humans. Let not two go by one road. Teach
the Dhamma that’s good in the beginning, good in the middle, and
good in the end, meaningful and well-phrased. And reveal a spiritual
practice that’s entirely full and pure. There are beings with little
dust in their eyes. They’re in decline because they haven’t heard the
teaching. There will be those who understand the teaching! But
when six years have passed, you must all come to Bandhumatī to
recite the monastic code.’

Then most of the mendicants left to wander the country that very 3.26.7
day.

148. In the Vinaya of the current Buddha, the recitation occurs every fortnight on the *uposatha* (“sabbath”), and it includes only the mendicants resident in a specific monastery. Here they gathered from all over India.

- 3.27.1 Now at that time there were 84,000 monasteries in the Black Plum Tree Land.¹⁴⁹ And when the first year came to an end the deities raised the cry: ‘Good fellows, the first year has ended. Now five years are left. When five years have passed, you must all go to Bandhumatī to recite the monastic code.’
- 3.27.6 And when the second year ... the third year ... the fourth year ... the fifth year came to an end, the deities raised the cry: ‘Good fellows, the fifth year has ended. Now one year is left. When one year has passed, you must all go to Bandhumatī to recite the monastic code.’
- 3.27.13 And when the sixth year came to an end the deities raised the cry: ‘Good fellows, the sixth year has ended. Now is the time that you must go to Bandhumatī to recite the monastic code.’ Then that very day the mendicants went to Bandhumatī to recite the monastic code. Some went by their own psychic power, and some by the psychic power of the deities.
- 3.28.1 And there the Blessed One Vipassī, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha, recited the monastic code thus:¹⁵⁰
- 3.28.2 ‘Patient acceptance is the ultimate fervor.¹⁵¹
Extinguishment is the ultimate, say the Buddhas.¹⁵²
No true renunciate injures another,
nor does an ascetic hurt another.

149. “Black Plum Tree Land” is *jambudīpa*, the South Asian subcontinent, including India, Pakistan, Nepal, Bangladesh, and Afghanistan. The number 84,000 does not seem excessive, as the Chinese pilgrims recorded many thousands of monasteries throughout India. In modern Thailand there are around 40,000 monasteries.

150. The verses that follow form the climax of the whole discourse. They are known as the *Ovāda Pātimokkha*, the “monastic code for exhortation”. It seems that they were recited on the *uposatha* in the days before the establishment of the list of rules that is also called *pātimokkha*. Most of the extant Vinayas still include these verses in the *pātimokkha* texts, the Pali being a notable exception.

151. The Buddha redefines *tapas* from painful mortification to gentle acceptance. | See the Jain Ācārāṅga 8.25, *titikkham paramaṃ*.

152. These verses speak of “Buddhas” in plural.

Not to do any evil;¹⁵³ 3.28.6
 to embrace the good;¹⁵⁴
 to purify one's mind;¹⁵⁵
 this is the instruction of the Buddhas.¹⁵⁶

Not speaking ill nor doing harm; 3.28.10
 restraint in the monastic code;¹⁵⁷
 moderation in eating;
 staying in remote lodgings;
 commitment to the higher mind—¹⁵⁸
 this is the instruction of the Buddhas.'

17. Being Informed by Deities

This one time, mendicants, I was staying near Ukkaṭṭhā in the Subhaga Forest at the root of a magnificent sal tree.¹⁵⁹ As I was in private retreat this thought came to mind, 'It's not easy to find an abode of sentient beings where I haven't previously abided in all this long time, except the gods of the pure abodes.¹⁶⁰ Why don't I go to see them?'

153. These famous lines serve as a succinct summary of the entire Buddhist path.

154. "Embrace" is *upasampadā*, to "enter into". It is the same word used for taking ordination as well as entering *jhāna*.

155. Through meditation.

156. The *buddhasāsana* ("instruction of the Buddha" or "dispensation of the Buddha") is the normal word used by Buddhists to refer to their own religion.

157. Here "monastic code" means the principles outlined in these verses. They are spelled out in more detail in the Gradual Training (DN 2, etc.), and ultimately in the detailed legal code of the Vinayaṭṭaka.

158. The "higher mind" is the four *jhānas* (AN 3.90:3.2).

159. The Buddha now returns to the present life. Ukkaṭṭhā is the home of Pokkharasāti (DN 3:2.13.1) and the site of the astonishing and cosmically significant discourses MN 1 and MN 49.

160. Only non-returners are born in the pure abodes (*suddhāvāsā*), from where they realize full awakening.

3.29.5 Then, as easily as a strong person would extend or contract their arm, I vanished from the Subhaga Forest and reappeared with the gods of Aviha.

3.29.6 In that order of gods, many thousands, many hundreds of thousands of deities approached me, bowed, stood to one side, and said to me,¹⁶¹ ‘Ninety-one eons ago, good fellow, the Buddha Vipassī arose in the world, perfected and fully awakened. He was born as an aristocrat into an aristocrat family. Koṇḍañña was his clan. He lived for 80,000 years. He was awakened at the root of a patala tree. He had a fine pair of chief disciples named Khaṇḍa and Tissa. He had three gatherings of disciples—one of 6,800,000, one of 100,000, and one of 80,000—all of them mendicants who had ended their defilements. He had as chief attendant a mendicant named Asoka. His father was King Bandhumā, his birth mother was Queen Bandhumatī, and their capital city was named Bandhumatī. And such was his renunciation, such his going forth, such his striving, such his awakening, and such his rolling forth of the Wheel of Dhamma.¹⁶² And good fellow, after leading the spiritual life under that Buddha Vipassī we lost our desire for sensual pleasures and were reborn here.’¹⁶³

3.29.20 And other deities came and similarly recounted the details of the Buddhas Sikhī, Vessabhū, Kakusandha, Koṇāgamana, and Kassapa.¹⁶⁴

3.30.1 In that order of gods, many thousands, many hundreds of thousands of deities approached me, bowed, stood to one side, and said to me, ‘In the present fortunate eon, good fellow, you have arisen in the world, perfected and fully awakened. You were born as an aristocrat into an aristocrat family. Gotama is your clan. For you the

161. “Order of gods” is *devanikāya*. I use “deity” to distinguish *devatā* from *deva* but there is no substantial difference.

162. This is a list of the major events in any Buddha biography.

163. The lifespan in such a realm can be many hundreds of eons.

164. These are absent in the Pali text at this point, but they are mentioned below, and the commentary says they should be included here.

lifespan is short, brief, and fleeting. A long life is a hundred years or a little more. You were awakened at the root of a peepal tree. You have a fine pair of chief disciples named Sāriputta and Moggallāna. You have had one gathering of disciples—1,250 mendicants who had ended their defilements. You have as chief attendant a mendicant named Ānanda. Your father was King Suddhodana, your birth mother was Queen Māyā, and your capital city was Kapilavatthu. And such was your renunciation, such your going forth, such your striving, such your awakening, and such your rolling forth of the Wheel of Dhamma. And good fellow, after leading the spiritual life under you we lost our desire for sensual pleasures and were reborn here.’

Then together with the gods of Aviha I went to see the gods of 3.31.1
Atappa ... the gods fair to see ... and the fair seeing gods. Then together with all these gods I went to see the gods of Akaniṭṭha, where we had a similar conversation.

And that is how the Realized One is able to recollect the birth, 3.33.1
names, clans, lifespan, chief disciples, and gatherings of disciples of the Buddhas of the past who have become fully quenched, cut off proliferation, cut off the course, finished off the cycle, and passed beyond all suffering. It is both because I have clearly penetrated the principle of the teachings, and also because the deities told me.”¹⁶⁵

That is what the Buddha said. Satisfied, the mendicants approved 3.33.5
what the Buddha said.

165. This is the detailed answer to the question asked by the mendicants at DN 14:1.13.6.

DN 15

The Great Discourse on Causation

Mahānidānasutta

1. Dependent Origination

- 1.1 SO I HAVE HEARD.¹⁶⁶ At one time the Buddha was staying in the land of the Kurus, near the Kuru town named Kammāsadamma.¹⁶⁷
- 1.3 Then Venerable Ānanda went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him,¹⁶⁸ “It’s incredible, sir, it’s amazing, in

166. This sutta with its commentary was translated by Bhikkhu Bodhi in his *The Great Discourse on Causation*. It is the longest and most complex discourse on dependent origination in early Buddhism.

167. The Kurukṣetra was an ancient Brahmanical kingdom situated in the region around modern Delhi, bordered by the Ganges in the east, the Sarasvati in the west, the Himalayas in the north, and the hills of the Aravalli Range in the south. The Mahābhārata climaxes with the battle fought there between the Kurus and the Pāṇḍavas. These events, to the extent that they can be established historically, took place several centuries before the Buddha. Kuru marks the north-western extent of the Buddha’s travels. Kammāsadamma is identified with modern Kumashpur in Haryana, about 40 km north of Delhi.

168. While we cannot date this text, the fact that Ānanda has evidently been studying deep matters for a long time, that it takes place outside the Buddha’s accustomed locales, and that it builds on teachings found elsewhere, suggests

that this dependent origination is deep and appears deep, yet to me it seems as plain as can be.”¹⁶⁹

“Don’t say that, Ānanda, don’t say that! This dependent origination is deep and appears deep.¹⁷⁰ It is because of not understanding and not penetrating this teaching that this population has become tangled like string, knotted like a ball of thread, and matted like rushes and reeds, and it doesn’t escape the places of loss, the bad places, the underworld, transmigration.”¹⁷¹

When asked, ‘Is there a specific condition for old age and death?’ you should answer, ‘There is.’¹⁷² If they say, ‘What is a requirement for old age and death?’ you should answer, ‘Rebirth is a requirement for old age and death.’¹⁷³

When asked, ‘Is there a specific condition for rebirth?’ you should answer, ‘There is.’ If they say, ‘What is a requirement for rebirth?’ you should answer, ‘Continued existence is a requirement for rebirth.’¹⁷⁴

When asked, ‘Is there a specific condition for continued existence?’ you should answer, ‘There is.’ If they say, ‘What is a re-

that it happened rather late in the Buddha’s life. At SN 12.60 we find the same introduction to a much shorter discourse.

169. At SN 6.1:1.6 (and DN 14:3.1.6 in the case of Vipassī), the Buddha hesitated to teach because dependent origination is so hard to see. Ānanda was not only learned and wise, he was a stream-enterer, and therefore must have directly experienced dependent origination (SN 12.27:5.1, SN 12.41:12.1), yet he still underestimates it.

170. The sutta introduce subtle variations in the standard formula as a means to illuminate hidden implications and dimensions.

171. The Buddha establishes the primary purpose of dependent origination: to understand transmigration so as to be free from it.

172. Dependent origination is here taught in reverse order, starting with the existential problem: we are all going to die. This factor and the next are resultant, so we cannot solve them directly.

173. With this the Buddha denies the promise of immortality in this or any other realm.

174. “Continued existence” (or “life”) is an encompassing term, including both resultant and causal dimensions.

quirement for continued existence?’ you should answer, ‘Grasping is a requirement for continued existence.’¹⁷⁵

- 2.7 When asked, ‘Is there a specific condition for grasping?’ you should answer, ‘There is.’ If they say, ‘What is a requirement for grasping?’ you should answer, ‘Craving is a requirement for grasping.’
- 2.9 When asked, ‘Is there a specific condition for craving?’ you should answer, ‘There is.’ If they say, ‘What is a requirement for craving?’ you should answer, ‘Feeling is a requirement for craving.’¹⁷⁶
- 2.11 When asked, ‘Is there a specific condition for feeling?’ you should answer, ‘There is.’ If they say, ‘What is a requirement for feeling?’ you should answer, ‘Contact is a requirement for feeling.’
- 2.13 When asked, ‘Is there a specific condition for contact?’ you should answer, ‘There is.’ If they say, ‘What is a requirement for contact?’ you should answer, ‘Name and form are requirements for contact.’¹⁷⁷
- 2.15 When asked, ‘Is there a specific condition for name and form?’ you should answer, ‘There is.’ If they say, ‘What is a requirement for name and form?’ you should answer, ‘Consciousness is a requirement for name and form.’
- 2.17 When asked, ‘Is there a specific condition for consciousness?’ you should answer, ‘There is.’ If they say, ‘What is a requirement for consciousness?’ you should answer, ‘Name and form are requirements for consciousness.’¹⁷⁸

175. “Grasping” and “craving” (together with “ignorance” in the full sequence) are the defilements that drive the process on. It is here that the practice of the path takes effect, uprooting them entirely.

176. The next three factors spell out the process of sense experience that unfolds automatically. Meditation slows it down so it can be seen clearly, but the process remains even for the perfected ones.

177. Here we encounter the first unique feature of this sequence, as normally the six sense fields appear as the condition for contact. The reason for this special presentation becomes clear later on.

178. The mutual conditioning of consciousness with name and form is a further subtlety of this presentation. We have met this idea before in DN 14:2.18.43; it also occurs in SN 12.65 and SN 12.67. Again, implications of this are explored below.

So: name and form are requirements for consciousness. Con- 3.1
sciousness is a requirement for name and form. Name and form
are requirements for contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling.
Feeling is a requirement for craving. Craving is a requirement for
grasping. Grasping is a requirement for continued existence. Contin-
ued existence is a requirement for rebirth. Rebirth is a requirement
for old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress
to come to be.¹⁷⁹ That is how this entire mass of suffering originates.

‘Rebirth is a requirement for old age and death’—that’s what I 4.1
said. And this is a way to understand how this is so.¹⁸⁰ Suppose
there were totally and utterly no rebirth for anyone anywhere.¹⁸¹
That is, there were no rebirth of sentient beings into their various
realms—of gods, centaurs, spirits, creatures, humans, quadrupeds,
birds, or reptiles, each into their own realm. When there’s no rebirth
at all, with the cessation of rebirth, would old age and death still be
found?”¹⁸²

“No, sir.” 4.4

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of old age 4.5
and death, namely rebirth.”¹⁸³

‘Continued existence is a requirement for rebirth’—that’s what 5.1
I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so. Suppose
there were totally and utterly no continued existence for anyone
anywhere. That is, continued existence in the sensual realm, the
realm of luminous form, or the formless realm. When there’s no

179. The sequence is recapped in forward order (*anuloma*, Ud 1.1:1.4).

180. The Buddha now takes up each of the terms in more depth.

181. This emphatic phrasing drives home that “cessation” (*nirodha*) is not simply temporary suppression or non-arising, but permanent and complete absence.

182. “Rebirth” (*jāti*) is defined as the birth of a new life, not as simple arising.

183. The various terms for “cause” are used as synonyms (*hetu*, *nidāna*, *samudaya*, *paccaya*). The purpose of using different terms is not to add nuances, but to reinforce the central meaning and guard against the corruption of meaning; if one word is lost or misunderstood, the meaning of the sentence as a whole is not changed.

continued existence at all, with the cessation of continued existence, would rebirth still be found?”¹⁸⁴

5.4 “No, sir.”

5.5 “That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of rebirth, namely continued existence.

6.1 ‘Grasping is a requirement for continued existence’—that’s what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so. Suppose there were totally and utterly no grasping for anyone anywhere. That is, grasping at sensual pleasures, views, precepts and observances, and theories of a self. When there’s no grasping at all, with the cessation of grasping, would continued existence still be found?”¹⁸⁵

6.4 “No, sir.”

6.5 “That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of continued existence, namely grasping.

7.1 ‘Craving is a requirement for grasping’—that’s what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so. Suppose there were totally and utterly no craving for anyone anywhere. That is, craving for sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas. When there’s no craving at all, with the cessation of craving, would grasping still be found?”¹⁸⁶

184. These realms relate to the kamma that projects consciousness into them. The realms of “luminous form” (*rūpabhava*) and the “formless” (*arūpabhava*) are generated by the form and formless attainments respectively. Any other kamma, good or bad, pertains to the sensual realm (*kāmaabhava*). All rebirth takes place in one or other of these realms.

185. “Grasping” (*upādāna*) begins with the primal desire of the senses, but the three other grasplings are rather intellectual and sophisticated. Only a grown human being with a developed linguistic ability is able to formulate a view to become attached to, and likewise with attachment to religious observances and vows, and to theories of a self. This is why the bulk of kamma is produced by adult humans, rather than by, say, animals or children, for whom these dimensions of grasping are nascent.

186. “Craving” (*taṇhā*) is a fundamental desire or urge. Unlike grasping, it is fully active in children and animals. Often it has a threefold definition, which we find below, but in dependent origination it is usually defined in terms of the six senses, which relates it to the items to come.

“No, sir.” 7.4

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of grasping, 7.5
namely craving.

‘Feeling is a requirement for craving’—that’s what I said. And this 8.1
is a way to understand how this is so. Suppose there were totally
and utterly no feeling for anyone anywhere. That is, feeling born of
contact through the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. When
there’s no feeling at all, with the cessation of feeling, would craving
still be found?”¹⁸⁷

“No, sir.” 8.4

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of craving, 8.5
namely feeling.

So it is, Ānanda, that feeling gives rise to craving. Craving gives rise 9.1
to searching. Searching gives rise to gaining material things. Gaining
material things gives rise to evaluation. Evaluation gives rise to desire
and lust. Desire and lust gives rise to attachment. Attachment gives
rise to ownership. Ownership gives rise to stinginess. Stinginess
gives rise to safeguarding.¹⁸⁸ Owing to safeguarding, many bad, un-
skillful things come to be: taking up the rod and the sword, quarrels,
arguments, and disputes, accusations, backbiting, and lies.¹⁸⁹

‘Owing to safeguarding, many bad, unskillful things come to be: 10.1
taking up the rod and the sword, quarrels, arguments, and disputes,
accusations, backbiting, and lies’—that’s what I said. And this is

187. The usual threefold definition of feeling (pleasant, painful, neutral) is reframed in terms of the six senses.

188. Here the Buddha introduces another, even more radical, departure from the typical sequence. Rather than continue back to contact and name and form, he branches out in an entirely new direction. These “nine things rooted in craving” are found independently at AN 9.23:1.2 and DN 34:2.2.31, but only here are they integrated with the standard dependent origination.

189. While the purpose of the main dependent origination is to disclose the web of conditions that generates the suffering of transmigration, here the Buddha looks at the arising of social conflict and disorder.

a way to understand how this is so.¹⁹⁰ Suppose there were totally and utterly no safeguarding for anyone anywhere. When there's no safeguarding at all, with the cessation of safeguarding, would those many bad, unskillful things still come to be?"

10.3 "No, sir."

10.4 "That's why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason for the origination of those many bad, unskillful things, namely safeguarding.

11.1 'Stinginess gives rise to safeguarding'—that's what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so.¹⁹¹ Suppose there were totally and utterly no stinginess for anyone anywhere. When there's no stinginess at all, with the cessation of stinginess, would safeguarding still be found?"

11.3 "No, sir."

11.4 "That's why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of safeguarding, namely stinginess.

12.1 'Ownership gives rise to stinginess'—that's what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so. Suppose there were totally and utterly no ownership for anyone anywhere. When there's no ownership at all, with the cessation of ownership, would stinginess still be found?"

12.3 "No, sir."

12.4 "That's why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of stinginess, namely ownership.

13.1 'Attachment gives rise to ownership'—that's what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so.¹⁹² Suppose there were totally and utterly no attachment for anyone anywhere. When there's no

190. In DN 27 Aggaññasutta the Buddha narrates a legend showing how these things arise. The point is not that we should not safeguard (*ārakkha*) our possessions. It is, rather, that so long as we live in a world where safeguarding possessions is necessary, there will be conflict and violence.

191. "Stinginess" is *macchariya*.

192. There are many words in Pali that approximate the English word "attachment". Here it is *ajjhosaṇa*.

attachment at all, with the cessation of attachment, would ownership still be found?”

“No, sir.” 13.3

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of ownership, namely attachment. 13.4

‘Desire and lust gives rise to attachment’—that’s what I said. And 14.1
this is a way to understand how this is so. Suppose there were totally
and utterly no desire and lust for anyone anywhere. When there’s
no desire and lust at all, with the cessation of desire and lust, would
attachment still be found?”

“No, sir.” 14.3

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of attachment, namely desire and lust. 14.4

Evaluation gives rise to desire and lust’—that’s what I said. And 15.1
this is a way to understand how this is so.¹⁹³ Suppose there were
totally and utterly no evaluation for anyone anywhere. When there’s
no evaluation at all, with the cessation of evaluation, would desire
and lust still be found?”

“No, sir.” 15.3

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of desire and lust, namely evaluation. 15.4

‘Gaining material things gives rise to evaluation’—that’s what I 16.1
said. And this is a way to understand how this is so.¹⁹⁴ Suppose there
were totally and utterly no gaining of material things for anyone
anywhere. When there’s no gaining of material things at all, with
the cessation of gaining material things, would evaluation still be
found?”

“No, sir.” 16.3

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of evaluation, namely the gaining of material things. 16.4

193. “Evaluation” is *vinicchaya*. We like to weigh up and consider the pros and cons of different objects of desire.

194. Those who have nothing are grateful for any small thing, and do not indulge in picking and choosing.

- 17.1 ‘Searching gives rise to gaining material things’—that’s what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so.¹⁹⁵ Suppose there were totally and utterly no searching for anyone anywhere. When there’s no searching at all, with the cessation of searching, would the gaining of material things still be found?”
- 17.3 “No, sir.”
- 17.4 “That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of gaining material things, namely searching.
- 18.1 ‘Craving gives rise to searching’—that’s what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so. Suppose there were totally and utterly no craving for anyone anywhere. That is, craving for sensual pleasures, craving for continued existence, and craving for nonexistence. When there’s no craving at all, with the cessation of craving, would searching still be found?”¹⁹⁶
- 18.4 “No, sir.”
- 18.5 “That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of searching, namely craving. And so, Ānanda, these two things meet at the two aspects of feeling.¹⁹⁷
- 19.1 ‘Contact is a requirement for feeling’—that’s what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so.¹⁹⁸ Suppose there were totally and utterly no contact for anyone anywhere. That is, contact through the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. When there’s no contact at all, with the cessation of contact, would feeling still be found?”¹⁹⁹

195. Our senses are tuned to hunt out and acquire pleasure.

196. This is the normal definition of craving in the four noble truths, supplementing the previous definition in terms of the six senses. Both are included in this sutta to show that they do not contradict, but rather reveal different aspects of the same thing. It is not just sensual desire that drives acquisition. For example, religious people fight over sacred ground or holy objects to gain a place in heaven; or else those driven by nihilism go to any lengths for alcohol or drugs to erase existence.

197. The threefold analysis of feeling leads to the process of acquisition, while the sixfold analysis of feeling leads to dependent origination.

198. And now we rejoin the main sequence.

199. People mostly want to enjoy pleasant sensations, in this life and the next, but those sensations depend on a constant supply of the appropriate stimuli.

“No, sir.” 19.4

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of feeling, namely contact. 19.5

‘Name and form are requirements for contact’—that’s what I said. 20.1
And this is a way to understand how this is so.²⁰⁰ Suppose there were none of the features, attributes, signs, and details by which the set of mental phenomena known as name is found. Would labeling contact still be found in the set of physical phenomena?”²⁰¹

“No, sir.” 20.3

“Suppose there were none of the features, attributes, signs, and details by which the set of physical phenomena known as form is found. Would impingement contact still be found in the set of mental phenomena?”²⁰² 20.4

“No, sir.” 20.5

“Suppose there were none of the features, attributes, signs, and details by which the set of phenomena known as name and the set of phenomena known as form are found. Would either labeling contact or impingement contact still be found?”²⁰³ 20.6

“No, sir.” 20.7

200. Name and form are said to be conditions for contact also at Snp 4.11:11.1.

201. The “set of mental phenomena known as name” is *nāmakāya*. Its function depends not on any underlying essence, but on the “features” by which it is “made known”; this is a phenomenological analysis. | “Labeling contact” is *adhivacanasaṃphassa*; it is the active process by which the mind makes sense of the world by attaching labels to experience. This passage reinforces the linguistic significance of *nāma*.

202. The “set of physical phenomena known as form” is *rūpakāya*. | “Impingement contact” is *paṭiḥhasaṃphassa*. Here *paṭiḥha* refers to the “striking” of physical phenomena against each other, such as light “hitting” the eye. It most commonly appears in this sense in the formula that begins the formless attainments.

203. Labeling moves from the mind to the world; impingement moves from the world to the mind. Together they create a dynamic two-way process by which we learn about the world and how to make sense of it.

- 20.8 “Suppose there were none of the features, attributes, signs, and details by which name and form are found. Would contact still be found?”²⁰⁴
- 20.9 “No, sir.”
- 20.10 “That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of contact, namely name and form.
- 21.1 ‘Consciousness is a requirement for name and form’—that’s what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so.²⁰⁵ If consciousness were not conceived in the mother’s womb, would name and form coagulate there?”²⁰⁶
- 21.3 “No, sir.”
- 21.4 “If consciousness, after being conceived in the mother’s womb, were to be miscarried, would name and form be born into this place?”²⁰⁷

204. Contact is fundamentally a meeting, normally expressed as the coming together of the sense stimulus (light), the sense organ (eye), and sense consciousness. By skipping the direct mention of the six senses, the Buddha opens another perspective on this process: mental labeling meets sense impingement, each essential to the other, and together making contact possible. The analysis itself exemplifies this process, as it starts by looking at the process from each side, and moves toward integration, seeing them both together.

205. Consciousness in dependent origination is normally defined as the six kinds of sense consciousness (SN 12.2:12.3). The purpose of this is to emphasize that the process of rebirth and transmigration is an empirical process, which depends on the same ordinary consciousness we are experiencing now. Here, once again, by skipping the six senses, a new mode of analysis opens up, which emphasizes the organic growth of the individual.

206. “Conceived” is *okkamissatha*, literally “descend” or “arrive”. | “Coagulate” assumes the PTS reading *samucchissatha* (Sanskrit *sammurch*). I believe this echoes the belief that the embryo is “coagulated” from the mix of blood and semen. Compare the Jain term *sammūrcchana*, “congealment”, which covers all kinds of birth not from a uterus or spontaneous (Tattvārtha Sūtra 2.35). | Linguistically, this passage through to DN 15:22.2 is marked with the extremely rare verbal ending *-issatha*, which is the middle form of the third person singular conditional.

207. “Miscarried” is *vokkamissatha*. | “This place” is *itthattā*, which is most commonly found in the declaration of the arahant that they will no longer be reborn in “this place”, namely transmigration. | Here “born” is *abhinibbatti*,

“No, sir.” 21.5

“If the consciousness of a young boy or girl were to be cut off, would name and form achieve growth, increase, and maturity?”²⁰⁸ 21.6

“No, sir.” 21.7

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of name and form, namely consciousness. 21.8

‘Name and form are requirements for consciousness’—that’s what I said. And this is a way to understand how this is so.²⁰⁹ If consciousness were not established in name and form, would the coming to be of the origin of suffering—of rebirth, old age, and death in the future—be found?”²¹⁰ 22.1

“No, sir.” 22.3

“That’s why this is the cause, source, origin, and reason of consciousness, namely name and form. This is the extent to which one may be reborn, grow old, die, pass away, or reappear.²¹¹ This is how far the scope of labeling, definition, and description extends; how far the sphere of wisdom extends; how far the cycle of rebirths spins so that this state of being may be found; namely, name and form together with consciousness.²¹² 22.4

which is listed along with *jāti*, *okkanti*, and other terms as a synonym in the standard definition of rebirth (SN 12.2:4.2, MN 9:24–26.7, DN 22:18.4).

208. The connection between dependent origination and childhood development is further explored in MN 38:28.1.

209. Now we turn to the mirror side of the pair of conditions.

210. Just as name and form—the organic, sensual, and sense-making body—cannot grow without consciousness, so too consciousness must acquire a landing or grounding place to be “planted” in name and form. | *Dukkhasamudayasambhavo* (“the coming to be of the origin of suffering”) might be rendered “the coming to be and origin of suffering”. However, *dukkhasamudaya* occurs some hundreds of times in the sense “origin of suffering” so I take it in the same way here. This is supported by the PTS variant reading *dukkhasamudayo sambhavo*.

211. This passage continues to employ rare middle forms, this time *-etha*, the third person singular optative.

212. This passage explains why the sequence ends here rather than proceeding in the usual way to choices and ignorance. Any state of being ultimately depends on the codependency of name and form with consciousness. Within this key relationship is the extent not only of language, but also of wisdom, and

2. Describing the Self

- 23.1 How do those who describe the self describe it?²¹³ They describe it as formed and limited:²¹⁴ ‘My self is formed and limited.’²¹⁵ Or they describe it as formed and infinite: ‘My self is formed and infinite.’²¹⁶ Or they describe it as formless and limited: ‘My self is formless and limited.’²¹⁷ Or they describe it as formless and infinite: ‘My self is formless and infinite.’²¹⁸
- 24.1 Now, take those who describe the self as formed and limited. They describe the self in the present as formed and limited; or they de-

the secret to the undoing of transmigration itself. One of the many profound implications of this is that there is no such thing as a state of pure consciousness independent of concepts. | *Ettāvatā vaṭṭaṃ vattati itthattaṃ paññāpanāya* should be read with such passages as SN 22.56:5.3: *ye kevalino vaṭṭaṃ tesam natthi paññāpanāya* (“For consummate ones, there is no cycle of rebirths to be found”). | In Chāndogya Upaniṣad 7.1.5, one who worships Divinity as name can do as they please “within the limits of name” (*yāvannāmo gataṃ*). | The Mahāsaṅgīti reading *aññamaññapaccayatā pavattati* is spurious, since it inserts an Abhidhamma concept from the commentary.

213. The text now turns to an analysis of theories of “self” (*attā*), which is comparable to some of the passages of DN 1. The Buddha began his discourse by stating that it is the failure to understand dependent origination that keeps beings trapped in transmigration. Dependent origination explains transmigration in a purely empirical way by inferring from the mental and physical phenomena we experience here and now. Self theorists, on the other hand, explain transmigration by introducing a new metaphysical principle, the “self” or “soul”, by which they assume that the individual has an eternal underlying essence.

214. “Formed” is *rūpī* (“possessing form”), identifying the self with the first of the five aggregates. If something were really the core essence of a person, you would think it is readily knowable. But the Buddha shows that theorists describe the self in multiple different and incompatible ways. Each of these draws on some more-or-less arbitrary aspect of empirical reality, such as “form”, to describe an unknowable metaphysical entity that is in fact just pure supposition.

215. An example of a self that is “physical and limited” would be the body.

216. Such as the cosmos.

217. Perhaps this is the self of “limited perception” (DN 1:2.38.13). This would be where the mind is aware of something limited, and the self is identified with the mental dimension of that awareness.

218. Such as the formless dimensions.

scribe it as sure to be in some other place formed and limited; or else they think: ‘Though it is not like that, I will ensure it is provided with what it needs to become like that.’²¹⁹ This being so, it’s appropriate to say that a theory of self as formed and limited underlies them.²²⁰

Now, take those who describe the self as formed and infinite ... 24.4
formless and limited ... formless and infinite. They describe the self as formless and infinite in the present; or as sure to become formless and infinite in some other place; or else they think: ‘Though it is not like that, I will ensure it is provided with what it needs to become like that.’ This being so, it’s appropriate to say that a theory of self as formless and infinite underlies them. That’s how those who describe the self describe it.

3. Not Describing the Self

How do those who don’t describe the self not describe it?²²¹ They 25.1
don’t describe it as formed and limited ... formed and infinite ... formless and limited ... formless and infinite: ‘My self is formless and infinite.’

219. The three options (“it is”, “it will be so”, and “I will make it be so”) illustrate how the theorist resorts to ever more convoluted means to justify the lack of empirical support for their pet theory. | *Bhāviṃ* (“sure to become”) is the root *bhū* with the primary affix -ī, which connotes an inevitable future state. | *Tattha* (“in some other place”, literally “there”) is explained by the commentary as *paraloke* (“in the next world”).

220. Their surface differences rest on the same underlying assumption, so if the assumption is disproved there is no need to refute each individual theory. | *Iccālaṃ* resolves to *iti alaṃ*.

221. This is the Buddha, who does not theorize a metaphysical self. Implicit in this argument is Occam’s razor, “entities must not be multiplied beyond necessity”. Since the self theorists want to prove the existence of the “self”, it is up to them to supply the grounds to support their suppositions. Since they fail to do so, the rational position is that there is no self. The Buddha is not under a similar obligation to prove the non-existence of the “self”, since it is reasonable to assume that things do not exist until the evidence says otherwise.

- 26.1 Now, take those who don't describe the self as formed and limited ... formed and infinite ... formless and limited ... formless and infinite. They don't describe the self in the present as formless and infinite; or as sure to become in some other place formless and infinite; and they don't think: 'Though it is not like that, I will ensure it is provided with what it needs to become like that.' This being so, it's appropriate to say that a theory of self as formless and infinite doesn't underlie them. That's how those who don't describe the self don't describe it.

4. Regarding a Self

- 27.1 How do those who regard the self regard it?²²² They regard feeling as self.²²³ 'Feeling is my self.'²²⁴ Or they regard it like this: 'Feeling is definitely not my self. My self does not experience feeling.'²²⁵ Or they regard it like this: 'Feeling is definitely not my self. But it's not that my self does not experience feeling. My self feels, for my self is liable to feel.'²²⁶

222. Having asserted a metaphysical "self", the theorists go on to make certain observations and interpretations regarding it.

223. The Buddha moves from theories of the self as form to feeling, the second of the five aggregates.

224. For example, identifying the self with the supposed eternal bliss of heaven. As with the description of self in physical terms, the theorist proceeds from a simple assertion of identity to more complicated hypotheses.

225. This is the inverse of the previous. The self is still defined *in relation to* feeling, but it is a negative relation. Such theories are commonly found in the Upaniṣads, where a prominent thread of analysis systematically rejects all the things that are *not* the self (*neti*), before finally arriving at what *is* the self (eg. Brhadāranyaka Upaniṣad 4.5.15).

226. Here the theorist describes feeling as a function of the self: it is not what the self *is*, but what the self *does*. At MN 38:5.11 (= MN 2:8.8), Sāti describes the self as consciousness, "the speaker and feeler who experiences the results of good and bad deeds in all the different realms".

Now, as to those who say:²²⁷ ‘Feeling is my self.’ You should say 28.1
 this to them: ‘Reverend, there are three feelings: pleasant, painful,
 and neutral.’²²⁸ Which one of these do you regard as self?’ Ānanda,
 at a time when you feel a pleasant feeling, you don’t feel a painful or
 neutral feeling;²²⁹ you only feel a pleasant feeling. At a time when
 you feel a painful feeling, you don’t feel a pleasant or neutral feeling;
 you only feel a painful feeling. At a time when you feel a neutral
 feeling, you don’t feel a pleasant or painful feeling; you only feel a
 neutral feeling.

Pleasant feelings, painful feelings, and neutral feelings are all im- 29.1
 permanent, conditioned, dependently originated, liable to end, van-
 ish, fade away, and cease. When feeling a pleasant feeling they think:
 ‘This is my self.’ When their pleasant feeling ceases they think: ‘My
 self has expired.’ When feeling a painful feeling they think: ‘This is
 my self.’ When their painful feeling ceases they think: ‘My self has
 expired.’ When feeling a neutral feeling they think: ‘This is my self.’
 When their neutral feeling ceases they think: ‘My self has expired.’
 So those who say ‘feeling is my self’ regard as self that which is ev-
 idently impermanent, mixed with pleasure and pain, and liable to
 rise and fall. That’s why it’s not acceptable to regard feeling as my
 self.

Now, as to those who say: ‘Feeling is definitely not my self. My 30.1
 self does not experience feeling.’ You should say this to them, ‘But
 reverend, where there is nothing felt at all, would the thought “I am”
 occur there?’²³⁰

227. The Buddha goes on to develop specific arguments addressing each posi-
 tion.

228. The Buddha points out the universal experience of feeling, thus establish-
 ing his argument on common ground. This same argument is found at MN
 74:10.1.

229. The idea that only one kind of feeling can be experienced at a time became
 an adage of Buddhist psychology, but it is not obvious to me that it is the case.
 Here and at MN 74 it is assumed to be a shared belief with non-Buddhists.

230. Feeling is part of the fundamental structure of consciousness. This argu-
 ment comes through more clearly in Pali, for the word for “feeling” (*vedanā*) is

30.4 “No, sir.”

30.5 “That’s why it’s not acceptable to regard self as that which does not experience feeling.

31.1 Now, as to those who say: ‘Feeling is definitely not my self. But it’s not that my self does not experience feeling. My self feels, for my self is liable to feel.’ You should say this to them, ‘Suppose feelings were to totally and utterly cease without remainder. When there’s no feeling at all, with the cessation of feeling, would the thought “I am this” occur there?’”²³¹

31.6 “No, sir.”

31.7 “That’s why it’s not acceptable to regard self as that which is liable to feel.

32.1 When a mendicant does not regard feeling as self; does not regard self as not experiencing feeling; and does not regard it thus: ‘my self feels, for my self is liable to feel’—not regarding in this way, they don’t grasp at anything in the world. Not grasping, they’re not anxious. Not being anxious, they personally become extinguished.²³² They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’

derived from and still lies close to the sense of “knowing, experiencing”. Thus the question is, “If there was no mind, would there be the thought ‘I am this?’” The commentary explains that this refers to the bare material realm which is devoid of consciousness. The commentary appears to support the variant reading *ahamasmī* here. This makes sense in context, for “I am” is the first and most primordial assertion of a self, while “I am this” is a more sophisticated identification of the self in relation to the aggregates.

231. The theorist avoids identifying feeling as the self, but they must identify *something* as the self (as for example, Sāti said the self was *viññāṇa*). Feeling, however, is deeply wound into the structure of consciousness, so if feeling were to be utterly absent, no other mental phenomena could continue, and there would therefore be no possibility of forming a theory of self.

232. Letting go is not just a conceptual matter, it has immediate emotional consequences. *Paritassati* conveys the twin senses of desire and agitation, for which “anxiety” seems the best fit.

It wouldn't be appropriate to say that a mendicant whose mind is freed like this holds the following views: 'A realized one still exists after death'; 'A realized one no longer exists after death'; 'A realized one both still exists and no longer exists after death'; 'A realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death' 32.5

Why is that? A mendicant is freed by directly knowing this: how far labeling and the scope of labeling extend; how far definition and the scope of definition extend; how far description and the scope of description extend; how far wisdom and the sphere of wisdom extend; how far the cycle of rebirths and its continuation extend. It wouldn't be appropriate to say that a mendicant freed by directly knowing this holds the view: 'There is no such thing as knowing and seeing.'²³³ 32.10

5. Planes of Consciousness

Ānanda, there are seven planes of consciousness and two dimensions.²³⁴ What seven? 33.1

There are sentient beings that are diverse in body and diverse in perception, such as human beings, some gods, and some beings in the underworld. This is the first plane of consciousness.²³⁵ 33.3

233. This recalls the similar statement at DN 15:22.6. Whereas there it was a statement about name and form with consciousness, here it is a description of the arahant who has fully realized it. Unlike the theorists whose views do not withstand empirical scrutiny, the arahant's liberation is based on a direct understanding of reality. | *Nirutti* means the "clear expression" or "definition" of a word. In the pre-Buddhist literature, that which is "undefined" is the mystical truth to be muttered under the breath, whereas that which is "defined" is clearly expressed in language. A list of such definitions is a *nirukti*, a glossary or dictionary.

234. The Buddha returns once more to the question of rebirth, describing various states of rebirth in terms of consciousness. The seven planes are also mentioned at DN 33:2.3.28, DN 34:1.8.11, and AN 7.44:1.1.

235. "Plane of consciousness" is *viññāṇaṭṭhiti*, which could also be rendered "station".

- 33.5 There are sentient beings that are diverse in body and unified in perception, such as the gods reborn in the Divinity's host through the first absorption. This is the second plane of consciousness.
- 33.7 There are sentient beings that are unified in body and diverse in perception, such as the gods of streaming radiance. This is the third plane of consciousness.
- 33.9 There are sentient beings that are unified in body and unified in perception, such as the gods of universal beauty. This is the fourth plane of consciousness.
- 33.11 There are sentient beings that have gone totally beyond perceptions of form. With the disappearance of perceptions of impingement, not focusing on perceptions of diversity, aware that 'space is infinite', they have been reborn in the dimension of infinite space. This is the fifth plane of consciousness.
- 33.13 There are sentient beings that have gone totally beyond the dimension of infinite space. Aware that 'consciousness is infinite', they have been reborn in the dimension of infinite consciousness. This is the sixth plane of consciousness.
- 33.15 There are sentient beings that have gone totally beyond the dimension of infinite consciousness. Aware that 'there is nothing at all', they have been reborn in the dimension of nothingness. This is the seventh plane of consciousness.
- 33.17 Then there is the dimension of non-percipient beings, and secondly, the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception.²³⁶
- 34.1 Now, regarding these seven planes of consciousness and two dimensions, is it appropriate for someone who understands them—and their origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape—to take pleasure in them?"²³⁷

236. In the first of these dimensions there is no consciousness at all, and in the second there is no consciousness in the normal sense, which is why they cannot be called "planes of consciousness".

237. *Abhinanditum*, to "take pleasure in", to "relish", or to "delight in" appears in the standard formula for the second noble truth, where craving "takes pleasure in various realms" (*tatratatrābhinandinī*).

“No, sir.”

34.3

“When a mendicant, having truly understood the origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape regarding these seven planes of consciousness and these two dimensions, is freed by not grasping, they’re called a mendicant who is freed by wisdom.”²³⁸

34.10

6. The Eight Liberations

Ānanda, there are these eight liberations.²³⁹ What eight? 35.1

Having physical form, they see forms.²⁴⁰ This is the first liberation. 35.3

Not perceiving form internally, they see forms externally.²⁴¹ This is the second liberation. 35.5

They’re focused only on beauty.²⁴² This is the third liberation. 35.7

Going totally beyond perceptions of form, with the disappearance of perceptions of impingement, not focusing on perceptions of diversity, aware that ‘space is infinite’, they enter and remain in the dimension of infinite space. This is the fourth liberation. 35.9

Going totally beyond the dimension of infinite space, aware that ‘consciousness is infinite’, they enter and remain in the dimension of infinite consciousness. This is the fifth liberation. 35.11

Going totally beyond the dimension of infinite consciousness, aware that ‘there is nothing at all’, they enter and remain in the dimension of nothingness. This is the sixth liberation. 35.13

238. One “freed by wisdom” has wisdom as the dominant faculty.

239. The eight liberations (*vimokkhā*) are an alternative way of describing the meditative experiences of *jhāna*. Elsewhere they are listed at DN 16:3.33.1, DN 33:3.1.168, DN 34:2.1.191, AN 8.66, MN 77:22.1, and referred to at AN 4.189:1.8 and Thag 20.1:33.1. At AN 8.120 and MN 137:27.1 they are listed but not called the eight liberations.

240. Someone sees a meditative vision based on the perception of their own body, such as through mindfulness of breathing or one’s own body parts. The first three liberations all cover the four *jhānas*.

241. A meditator grounds their practice on some external focus, such as a light, the sight of a corpse, or an external element such as earth.

242. This is a practice based on wholly pure and exalted meditation, such as the meditation on love, or the sight of a pure brilliant color like the sky.

- 35.15 Going totally beyond the dimension of nothingness, they enter and remain in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is the seventh liberation.
- 35.17 Going totally beyond the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, they enter and remain in the cessation of perception and feeling.²⁴³ This is the eighth liberation.
- 35.19 These are the eight liberations.
- 36.1 When a mendicant enters into and withdraws from these eight liberations—in forward order, in reverse order, and in forward and reverse order—wherever they wish, whenever they wish, and for as long as they wish;²⁴⁴ and when they realize the undefiled freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom, and live having realized it with their own insight in this very life due to the ending of defilements, they’re called a mendicant who is freed both ways.²⁴⁵ And, Ānanda, there is no other freedom both ways that is better or finer than this.”
- 36.4 That is what the Buddha said. Satisfied, Venerable Ānanda approved what the Buddha said.

243. The “cessation of perception and feeling” (*saññāvedayitanirodha*) is a culminating meditation state of supreme subtlety that often leads directly to awakening (but see AN 5.166). The state itself, like all meditation states, is temporary, but afterwards the defilements can be eliminated forever. This liberating insight is the consequence of the balanced development of all eight factors of the path.

244. This passage emphasizes that this person is fully adept and has mastered all the states of meditation. The Buddha claimed such mastery (AN 9.41:16.1), and retained the ability even on his deathbed (DN 16:6.8.1).

245. Here we see the terms “one who is freed” used in two ways. All arahants have “freedom of heart” (by means of *samādhi*) and “freedom by wisdom” (the realization of the Dhamma). At the same time, one who emphasizes *samādhi* is said to have “freedom of heart” in contrast with one who emphasizes wisdom, who has “freedom by wisdom”. One who has consummate mastery of both *samādhi* and wisdom is said to be “freed both ways”.

DN 16

The Great Discourse on the Buddha's Extinguishment

Mahāparinibbānasutta

SO I HAVE HEARD.²⁴⁶ At one time the Buddha was staying near 1.1.1
Rājagaha, on the Vulture's Peak Mountain. Now at that time King
Ajātasattu of Magadha, son of the princess of Videha, wanted to
invade the Vajjis.²⁴⁷ He said: "I shall wipe out these Vajjis, so mighty
and powerful! I shall destroy them, and lay ruin and devastation
upon them!"²⁴⁸

246. The longest of all early discourses, this dramatic and moving narrative tells the story of the Buddha's slow journey toward his final passing.

247. After the events of DN 2, Ajātasattu retained and consolidated his power. Magadha ultimately conquered the Vajji Federation and continued to expand until almost all of India was under its sway.

248. According to the commentary, Ajātasattu's anger was rooted in a dispute on trade routes. Control of shipping on the Ganges was essential for establishing international trade. There was a port on the Ganges extending over a league, split half and half between Magadha and Vajji. Valuable products were sourced from a mountain and brought down for trade, but the Vajjis kept absconding with the whole lot. The place is not identified, but Munger, a strategic port east of Patna, fits the description. The nearby hills have been mined since paleolithic times. It is also likely, as maintained in Jain tradition, that the Vajjis disputed Ajātasattu's accession after committing regicide. His threatening posture toward the Vajjis is also mentioned in SN 20.8:2.2.

- 1.2.1 And then King Ajātasattu addressed Vassakāra the brahmin, a chief minister of Magadha,²⁴⁹ “Please, brahmin, go to the Buddha, and in my name bow with your head to his feet. Ask him if he is healthy and well, nimble, strong, and living comfortably. And then say: ‘Sir, King Ajātasattu of Magadha, son of the princess of Videha, wants to invade the Vajjis. He says, “I shall wipe out these Vajjis, so mighty and powerful! I shall destroy them, and lay ruin and devastation upon them!”’²⁵⁰ Remember well how the Buddha answers and tell it to me. For Realized Ones say nothing that is not so.”²⁵¹

1. The Brahmin Vassakāra

- 1.3.1 “Yes, worthy sir,” Vassakāra replied. He had the finest carriages harnessed. Then he mounted a fine carriage and, along with other fine carriages, set out from Rājagaha for the Vulture’s Peak Mountain.²⁵² He went by carriage as far as the terrain allowed, then descended and approached the Buddha on foot, and exchanged greetings with him.
- 1.3.3 When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to the Buddha, “Worthy Gotama, King Ajātasattu of Magadha, son of the princess of Videha, bows with his head to your feet. He asks if you are healthy and well, nimble, strong, and living comfortably. Worthy Gotama, King Ajātasattu wants to invade the Vajjis. He said: ‘I shall wipe out these Vajjis, so mighty

249. Vassakāra appears in the suttas as a devoted follower of the Buddha.

250. The Vajji Federation harks back to an early settlement founded by the legendary Nābhānediṣṭha in the Vedic period. It built its wealth on its extensive fertile plains and the trading possibilities opened up by the Gandak and Ganges rivers.

251. While it may seem strange to consult the Buddha on such a violent plan, Ajātasattu knows from his experience in DN 2 that the Buddha will not hesitate to tell him the truth, even if it is bad news. It seems he is trying to avoid the downfall of tyrants who are surrounded only with yes men.

252. Reading *yojapetvā* (“had them harnessed”), which is found in the Mahāsaṅgīti in similar passages, and in this passage in the PTS edition.

and powerful! I shall destroy them, and lay ruin and devastation upon them!”

2. Principles That Prevent Decline

Now at that time Venerable Ānanda was standing behind the Buddha fanning him.²⁵³ Then the Buddha said to him, “Ānanda, have you heard that the Vajjis meet frequently and have many meetings?”²⁵⁴ 1.4.1

“I have heard that, sir.” 1.4.4

“As long as the Vajjis meet frequently and have many meetings, they can expect growth, not decline. 1.4.5

Ānanda, have you heard that the Vajjis meet in harmony, leave in harmony, and carry on their business in harmony?”²⁵⁵ 1.4.6

“I have heard that, sir.” 1.4.7

“As long as the Vajjis meet in harmony, leave in harmony, and carry on their business in harmony, they can expect growth, not decline. 1.4.8

253. Ānanda cares for the Buddha in his old age. Shortly after these events, Ānanda was entrusted with reciting the suttas at the First Council. This discourse would have been composed by him in the years following his Master's death. More than a simple interlocutor, Ānanda shapes the story as its second lead, a relatable character with an empathetic point of view. He imbues the discourse with his emotional struggles as he deals with the Buddha's passing and helps ensure the future survival of the Dhamma, while still developing his own meditation practice.

254. As for example at AN 8.12:1.2.

255. Harmony is especially important as the Vajji Federation was comprised of several different clans, among them the Licchavis of Vesālī, the Ñātikas just south of Vesālī, the Uggas of Hatthigāma (Elephant Village), and the Bhogas of Bhoganagara. Some sources say the Vajjis proper were another tribe within the alliance. The Videhans of Mithilā are also sometimes included, but several sources indicate that they remained an independent, if reduced, kingdom until they were conquered by Magadha some years later. The Mallas of Pāvā and Kusinārā formed a closely allied independent republic (MN 35:12.8).

- 1.4.9 Ānanda, have you heard that the Vajjis don't make new decrees or abolish existing decrees, but proceed having undertaken the ancient Vajjian principles as they have been decreed?"²⁵⁶
- 1.4.10 "I have heard that, sir."
- 1.4.11 "As long as the Vajjis don't make new decrees or abolish existing decrees, but proceed having undertaken the ancient Vajjian principles as they have been decreed, they can expect growth, not decline.
- 1.4.12 Ānanda, have you heard that the Vajjis honor, respect, esteem, and venerate Vajjian elders, and think them worth listening to?"
- 1.4.13 "I have heard that, sir."
- 1.4.14 "As long as the Vajjis honor, respect, esteem, and venerate Vajjian elders, and think them worth listening to, they can expect growth, not decline.
- 1.4.15 Ānanda, have you heard that the Vajjis don't forcibly abduct the women or girls of the clans and make them live with them?"²⁵⁷
- 1.4.16 "I have heard that, sir."
- 1.4.17 "As long as the Vajjis don't forcibly abduct the women or girls of the clans and make them live with them, they can expect growth, not decline.
- 1.4.18 Ānanda, have you heard that the Vajjis honor, respect, esteem, and venerate the Vajjian shrines, whether inner or outer, not neglecting the proper spirit-offerings that were given and made in the past?"²⁵⁸
- 1.4.19 "I have heard that, sir."

256. The "ancient Vajjian principles" (or "laws", *porāṇe vajjidhamme*) would have been established with the founding of the Vajji Federation some centuries earlier, which ensured that the members of the federation would have a voice in the Licchavi-dominated union. Compare with the "ancient traditions of the brahmins" (*porāṇā brāhmaṇadhammā* at AN 5.191 and Snp 2.7), the falling away from which is said to be the cause of Brahmanical decline. Similarly, the Buddha elsewhere scolds the Vajjis for their indulgence (AN 5.143), suggesting that the decline may have already set in.

257. This advocates for legal protection for women from sexual violence. | For various legal regulations regarding women and sex, see Kauṭilya's Arthaśāstra 12.

258. The Buddha will stay at several of these shrines later in this discourse. They were sacred groves, maintained by the people in reverence for the powerful

“As long as the Vajjis honor, respect, esteem, and venerate the Vajjian shrines, whether inner or outer, not neglecting the proper spirit-offerings that were given and made in the past, they can expect growth, not decline. 1.4.20

Ānanda, have you heard that the Vajjis organize proper protection, shelter, and security for perfected ones, so that more perfected ones might come to the realm and those already here may live in comfort?”²⁵⁹ 1.4.21

“I have heard that, sir.” 1.4.22

“As long as the Vajjis organize proper protection, shelter, and security for perfected ones, so that more perfected ones might come to the realm and those already here may live in comfort, they can expect growth, not decline.” 1.4.23

Then the Buddha said to Vassakāra, “Brahmin, this one time I was staying near Vesālī at the Sārāṇḍada Shrine.²⁶⁰ There I taught the Vajjis these seven principles that prevent decline.²⁶¹ As long as these seven principles that prevent decline last among the Vajjis, and as long as the Vajjis are seen following them, they can expect growth, not decline.” 1.5.1

When the Buddha had spoken, Vassakāra said to him, “Worthy Gotama, if the Vajjis follow even a single one of these principles they can expect growth, not decline. How much more so all seven! King Ajātasattu cannot defeat the Vajjis in war, unless by bribery or by 1.5.5

spirits of nature. | “Spirit-offerings” is *bali*. | The commentary explains “inner or outer” as inside or outside the town.

259. It is an old Indian belief that the presence of holy persons provides a kind of umbrella effect that protects the realm.

260. This event is recorded at AN 7.21, where the Buddha addresses the Licchavis. That chapter of the *Aṅguttara* mostly consists of the teachings found here presented as separate suttas. | The Sārāṇḍada shrine was short walk from Vesālī (AN 5.143).

261. There is a certain tension here: the Buddha taught these principles to the Vajjis, one of which is that the Vajjis should not adopt new decrees. It seems that a “decree” (*paññatta*) is more like constitutional law, whereas a “principle” (*dhamma*) is more like a behavioral guideline.

sowing dissension.²⁶² Well, now, worthy Gotama, I must go. I have many duties, and much to do.”

- 1.5.10 “Please, brahmin, go at your convenience.” Then Vassakāra the brahmin, having approved and agreed with what the Buddha said, rose from his seat and left.

3. Principles That Prevent Decline Among the Mendicants

- 1.6.1 Soon after he had left, the Buddha said to Ānanda, “Go, Ānanda, gather all the mendicants staying in the vicinity of Rājagaha together in the assembly hall.”²⁶³
- 1.6.3 “Yes, sir,” replied Ānanda. He did what the Buddha asked. Then he went back, bowed, stood to one side, and said to him, “Sir, the mendicant Saṅgha has assembled. Please, sir, go at your convenience.”
- 1.6.5 Then the Buddha went to the assembly hall, where he sat down on the seat spread out and addressed the mendicants: “Mendicants, I will teach you these seven principles that prevent decline.²⁶⁴ Listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.”
- 1.6.9 “Yes, sir,” they replied. The Buddha said this:
- 1.6.11 “As long as the mendicants meet frequently and have many meetings, they can expect growth, not decline.”²⁶⁵

262. *Upalāpana* is used a number of times in the Vinaya, where it always has the sense of giving someone something to get them to do what you want. It has the same sense at SN 3.25:4.13, where an enemy king may be bribed with gold from the royal treasury. | The commentary says that Vassakāra himself was assigned with the task of weakening the Vajjis in this way.

263. There were several monasteries and hermitages around Rājagaha (Kd 2:11.1.1).

264. Also at AN 7.23.

265. This especially refers to the fortnightly *uposatha*. Despite the dangers faced in the rugged hills around Rājagaha (Kd 2:12.1.1), the Buddha insisted that all monks of the locality attended the *uposatha* (Kd 2:5.3.1).

As long as the mendicants meet in harmony, leave in harmony, 1.6.12
and carry on their business in harmony, they can expect growth, not
decline.²⁶⁶

As long as the mendicants don't make new decrees or abolish 1.6.13
existing decrees, but proceed having undertaken the training rules
as they have been decreed, they can expect growth, not decline.²⁶⁷

As long as the mendicants honor, respect, esteem, and venerate 1.6.14
the senior mendicants—of long standing, long gone forth, fathers
and leaders of the Saṅgha—and think them worth listening to, they
can expect growth, not decline.²⁶⁸

As long as the mendicants don't fall under the sway of arisen 1.6.15
craving for future lives, they can expect growth, not decline.²⁶⁹

As long as the mendicants take care to live in wilderness lodgings, 1.6.16
they can expect growth, not decline.²⁷⁰

As long as the mendicants individually establish mindfulness, 1.6.17
so that more good-hearted spiritual companions might come, and
those that have already come may live comfortably, they can expect
growth, not decline.²⁷¹

266. The Buddha encouraged the mendicants to recite the Dhamma in harmony (MN 103:3.2), to resolve issues in harmony (MN 104:14.3), and on the *uposatha* to recite and train in the *pātimokkha* in harmony (Bu As 7:4.11).

267. Picking up from the similar injunction to the Vajjis, this kicks off a long narrative arc that binds together the Buddha's invitation to abolish the minor rules (DN 16:6.3.1) with the bad monk Subhadda's seizing on the Buddha's death as an excuse to give up the rules, which was the direct motivation for the First Council (DN 16:6.20.3 = Kd 21:1.1.24), at the end of which the Saṅgha agreed not to abolish any rules (Kd 21:1.9.20), a decision that was affirmed a century later at the Second Council (Kd 22).

268. The nature of seniority in the Saṅgha is often misunderstood. There is no "hierarchy" (literally "rule of priests") in the sense of power-based relationships: no monastic has the authority to command another monk or nun. Seniority is owed respect, not obedience.

269. This stands in place of the injunction against sexual violence, both principles being concerned with the harmful effects of desire.

270. This stands in place of the injunction to maintain the shrines, where mendicants would frequently stay.

271. This stands in place of the injunction to look after arahants.

- 1.6.18 As long as these seven principles that prevent decline last among the mendicants, and as long as the mendicants are seen following them, they can expect growth, not decline.
- 1.7.1 I will teach you seven more principles that prevent decline. ...²⁷²
- 1.7.4 As long as the mendicants don't relish work, loving it and liking to relish it, they can expect growth, not decline.²⁷³
- 1.7.5 As long as they don't relish talk ...
- 1.7.6 sleep ...
- 1.7.7 company ...
- 1.7.8 they don't have corrupt wishes, falling under the sway of corrupt wishes ...²⁷⁴
- 1.7.9 they don't have bad friends, companions, and associates ...
- 1.7.10 they don't stop half-way after achieving some trifling distinction, they can expect growth, not decline.²⁷⁵
- 1.8.1 As long as these seven principles that prevent decline last among the mendicants, and as long as the mendicants are seen following them, they can expect growth, not decline.
- 1.8.2 I will teach you seven more principles that prevent decline. ...²⁷⁶
As long as the mendicants are faithful ... conscientious ... prudent ... learned ... energetic ... mindful ... wise, they can expect growth, not decline. As long as these seven principles that prevent decline last among the mendicants, and as long as the mendicants are seen following them, they can expect growth, not decline.
- 1.8.11 I will teach you seven more principles that prevent decline. ...²⁷⁷

272. Also at AN 7.24.

273. "Work" is *kamma*, which especially means "building work". Of course it is essential to do work, but one should not get too caught up in it. The Buddha did not believe that working hard was ennobling in and of itself.

274. "Corrupt wishes" (*pāpicchā*) is defined as when a faithless person wishes to be known as faithful, or person otherwise lacking good qualities wishes to be known as having them (AN 10.23:6.2).

275. This item and the preceding two were the downfall of Devadatta (Iti 89).

276. Also at AN 7.25.

277. Also at SN 46.25 and AN 7.26.

As long as the mendicants develop the awakening factors of mind-fulness ... investigation of principles ... energy ... rapture ... tranquility ... immersion ... equanimity, they can expect growth, not decline. 1.9.1

As long as these seven principles that prevent decline last among the mendicants, and as long as the mendicants are seen following them, they can expect growth, not decline. 1.10.1

I will teach you seven more principles that prevent decline. ...²⁷⁸ 1.10.2

As long as the mendicants develop the perceptions of impermanence ... not-self ... ugliness ... drawbacks ... giving up ... fading away ... cessation, they can expect growth, not decline. 1.10.5

As long as these seven principles that prevent decline last among the mendicants, and as long as the mendicants are seen following them, they can expect growth, not decline. 1.10.12

I will teach you six principles that prevent decline. ...²⁷⁹ 1.11.1

As long as the mendicants consistently treat their spiritual companions with bodily kindness ... verbal kindness ... and mental kindness both in public and in private, they can expect growth, not decline. 1.11.4

As long as the mendicants share without reservation any material things they have gained by legitimate means, even the food placed in the alms-bowl, using them in common with their ethical spiritual companions, they can expect growth, not decline. 1.11.7

As long as the mendicants live according to the precepts shared with their spiritual companions, both in public and in private—such precepts as are intact, impeccable, spotless, and unmarred, 1.11.8

278. As at AN 7.27. These “perceptions” are all meditation practices which are described at AN 10.60.

279. These six principles are found in several places, but they are not elsewhere called “principles that prevent decline”; for example at AN 6.11 they are called “warm-hearted qualities” (*dharmā sārāṇīyā*). At AN 6.22, however, a different six qualities are called “principles that prevent decline”: not relishing work, talk, sleep, and company, being easy to admonish, and having good friends.

liberating, praised by sensible people, not mistaken, and leading to immersion—they can expect growth, not decline.

1.11.9 As long as the mendicants live according to the view shared with their spiritual companions, both in public and in private—the view that is noble and emancipating, and delivers one who applies it to the complete end of suffering—they can expect growth, not decline.²⁸⁰

1.11.10 As long as these six principles that prevent decline last among the mendicants, and as long as the mendicants are seen following them, they can expect growth, not decline.”

1.12.1 And while staying there at the Vulture’s Peak the Buddha often gave this Dhamma talk to the mendicants:²⁸¹

1.12.2 “Such is ethics, such is immersion, such is wisdom. When immersion is imbued with ethics it’s very fruitful and beneficial.²⁸² When wisdom is imbued with immersion it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When the mind is imbued with wisdom it is rightly freed from the defilements, namely, the defilements of sensuality, desire to be reborn, and ignorance.”²⁸³

1.13.1 When the Buddha had stayed in Rājagaha as long as he pleased, he addressed Venerable Ānanda, “Come, Ānanda, let’s go to Ambalaṭṭhikā.”²⁸⁴

1.13.3 “Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants arrived at Ambalaṭṭhikā, where he stayed in the royal rest-house. And while staying there, too, he often gave this Dhamma talk to the mendicants:

280. This is the right view of the noble eightfold path, in other words, the four noble truths.

281. This epitome of the Dhamma is repeated eight times in this discourse, summarizing the teachings in the Gradual Training. It is not found in this exact form elsewhere.

282. “Imbued” (*paribhāvita*) as a mother hen imbues her eggs with warmth by sitting on them (AN 7.71:2.2). See also SN 55.21:2.3.

283. Some editions add *diṭṭhāsava* (“defilement of views”), but since that appears to be a late interpolation I follow the Mahāsaṅgīti in omitting it.

284. This is the same rest-house at which the Buddha sojourned on his way from Rājagaha to Nāḷandā in the Brahmajālasutta (DN 1).

“Such is ethics, such is immersion, such is wisdom. When immersion is imbued with ethics it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When wisdom is imbued with immersion it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When the mind is imbued with wisdom it is rightly freed from the defilements, namely, the defilements of sensuality, desire to be reborn, and ignorance.” 1.14.3

When the Buddha had stayed in Ambalaṭṭhikā as long as he pleased, he addressed Venerable Ānanda, “Come, Ānanda, let’s go to Nālandā.” 1.15.1

“Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants arrived at Nālandā, where he stayed in Pāvārika’s Mango Grove. 1.15.3

4. Sāriputta’s Lion’s Roar

Then Sāriputta went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him,²⁸⁵ “Sir, I have such confidence in the Buddha that I believe there’s no other ascetic or brahmin—whether past, future, or present—whose direct knowledge is superior to the Buddha when it comes to awakening.” 1.16.1

“That’s a grand and bold statement, Sāriputta. You’ve roared a definitive, categorical lion’s roar, saying: ‘I have such confidence in the Buddha that I believe there’s no other ascetic or brahmin—whether past, future, or present—whose direct knowledge is superior to the Buddha when it comes to awakening.’” 1.16.4

What about all the perfected ones, the fully awakened Buddhas who lived in the past? Have you encompassed their minds to know 1.16.7

285. This was apparently the last time that the Buddha met Sāriputta. This encounter is recorded in an independent sutta at SN 47.12 and expanded into a long discourse at DN 28. The Saṃyutta follows this meeting with the record of Sāriputta’s passing at SN 47.13, and then the lament for the absence of both Sāriputta and Moggallāna at SN 47.14. For some reason these events were omitted from the present discourse, even though they fit well thematically.

that those Buddhas had such ethics, or such qualities, or such wisdom, or such meditation, or such freedom?”

1.16.9 “No, sir.”

1.16.10 “And what about all the perfected ones, the fully awakened Buddhas who will live in the future? Have you encompassed their minds to know that those Buddhas will have such ethics, or such qualities, or such wisdom, or such meditation, or such freedom?”

1.16.12 “No, sir.”

1.16.13 “And what about me, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha at present? Have you encompassed my mind to know that I have such ethics, or such qualities, or such wisdom, or such meditation, or such freedom?”

1.16.15 “No, sir.”

1.16.16 “In that case, Sāriputta, given that you don’t encompass the minds of Buddhas past, future, or present, what then are you doing, making such a grand and bold statement, roaring such a definitive, categorical lion’s roar?”

1.17.1 “Sir, though I don’t encompass the minds of Buddhas past, future, and present, still I understand this by inference from the teaching.²⁸⁶ Suppose there was a king’s frontier citadel with fortified embankments, ramparts, and arches, and a single gate. And it has a gatekeeper who is astute, competent, and intelligent. He keeps strangers out and lets known people in. As he walks around the patrol path, he doesn’t see a hole or cleft in the wall, not even one big enough for a cat to slip out. He thinks, ‘Whatever sizable creatures enter or leave the citadel, all of them do so via this gate.’

1.17.8 In the same way, I understand this by inference from the teaching: ‘All the perfected ones, fully awakened Buddhas—whether past, future, or present—give up the five hindrances, corruptions of the heart that weaken wisdom. Their mind is firmly established in the

286. As at DN 14:1.37.4, inference (*anvaya*) is regarded as a valid form of knowledge. The Buddha himself is said to rely on inference using the same simile at AN 10.95:10.4. See SN 12.33 and notes for discussion.

four kinds of mindfulness meditation. They correctly develop the seven awakening factors. And they awaken to the supreme perfect awakening.”

And while staying at Nālandā, too, the Buddha often gave this Dhamma talk to the mendicants: 1.18.1

“Such is ethics, such is immersion, such is wisdom. When immersion is imbued with ethics it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When wisdom is imbued with immersion it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When the mind is imbued with wisdom it is rightly freed from the defilements, namely, the defilements of sensuality, desire to be reborn, and ignorance.” 1.18.2

5. The Drawbacks of Unethical Conduct

When the Buddha had stayed in Nālandā as long as he pleased, he addressed Venerable Ānanda, “Come, Ānanda, let’s go to Pāṭali Village.”²⁸⁷ 1.19.1

“Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants arrived at Pāṭali Village. 1.19.3

The lay followers of Pāṭali Village heard that he had arrived. So they went to see him, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him, “Sir, please consent to come to our guest house.” The Buddha consented with silence. 1.20.1

Then, knowing that the Buddha had consented, the lay followers of Pāṭali Village rose from their seats, bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on their right. Then they went to the guest house, where they spread carpets all over, prepared seats, set up a water jar, and placed an oil lamp. Then they went back to the Buddha, 1.21.1

287. This is modern Patna. In this account we see how it was developed from the simple riverside village of Pāṭaligāma to the citadel of Pāṭaliputta. Ajātasattu ultimately moved the capital of Magadha from the defensively-postured Rājagaha surrounded by hills to this trading center on open waters. Under Ashoka it became one of the greatest cities of the ancient world. It was named after the *pāṭali* tree (*Stereospermum chelonoides*), known as *patala* in Hindi.

bowed, stood to one side, and told him of their preparations, saying: “Please, sir, come at your convenience.”

1.22.1 In the morning, the Buddha robed up and, taking his bowl and robe, went to the guest house together with the Saṅgha of mendicants. Having washed his feet, he entered the guest house and sat against the central column facing east. The Saṅgha of mendicants also washed their feet, entered the guest house, and sat against the west wall facing east, with the Buddha right in front of them. The lay followers of Pāṭali Village also washed their feet, entered the guest house, and sat against the east wall facing west, with the Buddha right in front of them.

1.23.1 Then the Buddha addressed them:

1.23.2 “Householders, there are these five drawbacks for an unethical person because of their failure in ethics.²⁸⁸ What five?

1.23.4 Firstly, an unethical person loses great wealth on account of negligence.²⁸⁹ This is the first drawback for an unethical person because of their failure in ethics.

1.23.6 Furthermore, an unethical person gets a bad reputation. This is the second drawback.

1.23.8 Furthermore, an unethical person enters any kind of assembly unconfident and embarrassed, whether it’s an assembly of aristocrats, brahmins, householders, or ascetics. This is the third drawback.

1.23.10 Furthermore, an unethical person feels lost when they die.²⁹⁰ This is the fourth drawback.

1.23.12 Furthermore, an unethical person, when their body breaks up, after death, is reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell. This is the fifth drawback.

1.23.14 These are the five drawbacks for an unethical person because of their failure in ethics.

288. Also at AN 5.213, Ud 8.6:4.1, DN 33:2.1.36, and Kd 1:28.4.1.

289. The Buddha begins with the things most obvious and pertinent to the audience.

290. Bewildered by fear and regret.

6. The Benefits of Ethical Conduct

There are these five benefits for an ethical person because of their accomplishment in ethics. What five? 1.24.1

Firstly, an ethical person gains great wealth on account of diligence. This is the first benefit. 1.24.3

Furthermore, an ethical person gets a good reputation. This is the second benefit. 1.24.5

Furthermore, an ethical person enters any kind of assembly bold and self-assured, whether it's an assembly of aristocrats, brahmins, householders, or ascetics. This is the third benefit. 1.24.7

Furthermore, an ethical person dies not feeling lost. This is the fourth benefit. 1.24.9

Furthermore, when an ethical person's body breaks up, after death, they're reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. This is the fifth benefit. 1.24.11

These are the five benefits for an ethical person because of their accomplishment in ethics." 1.24.13

The Buddha spent much of the night educating, encouraging, firing up, and inspiring the lay followers of Pāṭali Village with a Dhamma talk. Then he sent them off, "The night is getting late, householders. Please go at your convenience." 1.25.1

"Yes, sir," replied the lay followers of Pāṭali Village. They got up from their seat, bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on their right, before leaving. Soon after they left the Buddha entered a private cubicle.²⁹¹ 1.25.3

291. *Suññāgāra* normally means an "empty dwelling", but here the commentary describes it as a curtained-off cubicle.

7. Building a Citadel

- 1.26.1 Now at that time the Magadhan chief ministers Sunidha and Vassakāra were building a citadel at Pāṭali Village to keep the Vajjis out.²⁹² At that time thousands of deities were taking possession of building sites in Pāṭali Village.²⁹³ Illustrious rulers or royal ministers inclined to build houses at sites possessed by illustrious deities. Middling rulers or royal ministers inclined to build houses at sites possessed by middling deities. Lesser rulers or royal ministers inclined to build houses at sites possessed by lesser deities.
- 1.27.3 With clairvoyance that is purified and superhuman, the Buddha saw those deities taking possession of building sites in Pāṭali Village. The Buddha rose at the crack of dawn and addressed Ānanda, “Ānanda, who is building a citadel at Pāṭali Village?”
- 1.27.6 “Sir, the Magadhan ministers Sunidha and Vassakāra are building a citadel to keep the Vajjis out.”
- 1.28.1 “It’s as if they were building the citadel in consultation with the gods of the thirty-three. With clairvoyance that is purified and superhuman, I saw those deities taking possession of building sites. Illustrious rulers or royal ministers inclined to build houses at sites possessed by illustrious deities. Middling rulers or royal ministers inclined to build houses at sites possessed by middling deities. Lesser rulers or royal ministers inclined to build houses at sites possessed by lesser deities. As far as the civilized region extends, as far as the trading zone extends, this will be the chief city: the Pāṭaliputta trade

292. Vassakāra was no dawdler, as he preceded the Buddha to Pāṭaligāma. And not long after, he returned to Rājagaha to build more fortifications there (MN 108:6.2). | *Nagara* here means “citadel, fortress”, not “city”. It has the same sense as *pura*. The construction is defensive and may well have begun before Ajātasattu began thinking of invading.

293. The relation between deities and building sites (*vatthu*) appears only in this passage in the early texts (repeated at Ud 8.6:15.2 and Kd 1:28.7.3). Divination and geomancy (*vatthuvijjā*) for building sites is said to be a wrong livelihood at DN 1:1.21.2.

center.²⁹⁴ But Pāṭaliputta will face three threats: from fire, flood, and dissension.”²⁹⁵

Then the Magadhan ministers Sunidha and Vassakāra approached the Buddha, and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, they stood to one side and said, “Would the worthy Gotama together with the mendicant Saṅgha please accept today’s meal from me?” The Buddha consented with silence. 1.29.1

Then, knowing that the Buddha had consented, they went to their own guest house, where they had delicious fresh and cooked foods prepared. Then they had the Buddha informed of the time, saying, “It’s time, worthy Gotama, the meal is ready.” 1.30.1

Then the Buddha robed up in the morning and, taking his bowl and robe, went to their guest house together with the mendicant Saṅgha, where he sat down on the seat spread out. Then Sunidha and Vassakāra served and satisfied the mendicant Saṅgha headed by the Buddha with their own hands with delicious fresh and cooked foods. When the Buddha had eaten and washed his hand and bowl, Sunidha and Vassakāra took a low seat and sat to one side. 1.30.3

294. From this point, later texts always refer to Pāṭaliputta, but the reason for the change of name from Pāṭaligāma is not explained in the commentary. *Putta* is a suffix indicating the people of a certain clan or place, so *pāṭaliputta* means “a person from Pāṭalī (village)” or as we might say, “Pāṭalian”. As the city became well known and its identity as a village receded, it must have become known as the “city of the Pāṭaliputtas” and hence simply Pāṭaliputta. Compare the uses of *ñātika* below. | The commentary explains that *puṭabhedanam* refers to the “opening of packages”, signifying that it was a center of trade. This usage is attested as late as the 13th century Jain Vividhatirthakalpa of Jinaprabhasūri. | “Civilized region” is *ariyaṃ āyatanam*, the cultural region defined by use of the Ariyaka language (cf. AN 6.96:1.3, Ud 8.6:17.9 and note to DN 26:4.8).

295. Excavations reveal that Pāṭaliputta was constructed of wood, so the danger of fire was real. It is situated on a low-lying flood plain of the Ganges, so flooding would also have been an obvious danger. As for dissension (*mithubheda*), Vassakāra had indicated that this was a means of bringing down the Vajjis, so it would seem that kamma was lying in wait for them.

- 1.31.1 The Buddha expressed his appreciation with these verses:²⁹⁶
- 1.31.2 “In the place he makes his dwelling,
having fed the astute
and the virtuous here,
the restrained spiritual practitioners,
- 1.31.6 he should dedicate an offering²⁹⁷
to the deities there.
Venerated, they venerate him;
honored, they honor him.
- 1.31.10 After that they have sympathy for him,
like a mother the child at her breast.
A man beloved of the deities
always sees nice things.”²⁹⁸
- 1.31.14 When the Buddha had expressed his appreciation to Sunidha and
Vassakāra with these verses, he rose from his seat and left.
- 1.32.1 Sunidha and Vassakāra followed behind the Buddha, thinking,
“The gate through which the ascetic Gotama exits today shall be
named the Gotama Gate. The ford at which he crosses the Ganges
River shall be named the Gotama Ford.”²⁹⁹

296. This is the *anumodanā* recited for the meal offering. Other examples are found at Snp 3.7:34.3 = MN 92:25.6, SN 55.26:20.1, Kd 1:15.14.4, and Kd 1:1.5.1. | It is worth noting that no early *anomodanā* uses the imperative verb form *-tu* signifying giving a blessing (eg. *bhavatu sabbamaṅgalaṃ*, “may all blessings be”). They strictly use the indicative *-ti* to teach cause and effect: if you do this, that happens.

297. Buddhism promotes good neighborliness with all beings, seen and unseen. Making an offering to the local spirits helps create a positive and healthy sense of place.

298. At AN 4.67:8.3 a similar sentiment is expressed for animals.

299. The “ford” (*tittha*) is symbolic; those who forge a path to salvation are called *titthakara*, such as the six leading ascetics of DN 2. Today there is a 5.7 km bridge at this crossing, which is appropriately called the Mahatma Gandhi Setu.

Then the gate through which the Buddha exited was named the 1.32.4
Gotama Gate.

Then the Buddha came to the Ganges River. 1.32.5

Now at that time the Ganges was full to the brim so a crow could 1.33.1
drink from it. Wanting to cross from the near to the far shore, some
people were seeking a boat, some a dinghy, while some were tying
up a raft.³⁰⁰ But, as easily as a strong person would extend or con-
tract their arm, the Buddha, together with the mendicant Saṅgha,
vanished from the near shore and landed on the far shore.³⁰¹

He saw all those humans wanting to cross over. Knowing the 1.34.1
meaning of this, on that occasion the Buddha expressed this heartfelt
sentiment:

“Those who cross a deluge or stream³⁰² 1.34.3
have built a bridge and left the marshes behind.
While some people are still tying a raft,
intelligent people have crossed over.”

The first recitation section.

8. Talk on the Noble Truths

Then the Buddha said to Venerable Ānanda, “Come, Ānanda, let’s 2.1.1
go to the village of Koṭi.”³⁰³

“Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. Then the Buddha together with a large 2.1.3
Saṅgha of mendicants arrived at the village of Koṭi, and stayed there.

300. “Dinghy” translates *uḷumpa*.

301. In this stock phrase, we sometimes find *paccuṭṭhāsi* (“landed”) and some-
times *pāturahosi* (“reappeared”).

302. *Aṇṇavaṃ* cannot mean “sea” here, since it is to be crossed with a bridge.

303. Koṭigāma lay a short distance from the Ganges. The Buddha’s stay here
must therefore have followed the events of SN 47.14 at Ukkacelā on the Vajjian
bank of the Ganges, where he laments the passing of Sāriputta and Moggallāna.
He would have heard of Sāriputta’s passing before then, while on the road from
Nālandā to Pāṭaligāma, even though that is implausibly said to have happened
at Sāvattihī (SN 47.13).

- 2.2.1 There he addressed the mendicants:³⁰⁴
- 2.2.2 “Mendicants, due to not understanding and not penetrating four noble truths, both you and I have wandered and transmigrated for such a very long time. What four? The noble truths of suffering, the origin of suffering, the cessation of suffering, and the practice that leads to the cessation of suffering. These noble truths of suffering, origin, cessation, and the path have been understood and comprehended. Craving for continued existence has been cut off; the leash to existence is ended; now there’ll be no more future lives.”
- 2.3.1 That is what the Buddha said. Then the Holy One, the Teacher, went on to say:
- 2.3.3 “Because of not truly seeing
the four noble truths,
we have transmigrated for a long time
from one rebirth to the next.
- 2.3.7 But now that these truths have been seen,
the leash to existence is eradicated.
The root of suffering is cut off,
now there’ll be no more future lives.”
- 2.4.1 And while staying at the village of Koṭi, too, the Buddha often gave this Dhamma talk to the mendicants:
- 2.4.2 “Such is ethics, such is immersion, such is wisdom. When immersion is imbued with ethics it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When wisdom is imbued with immersion it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When the mind is imbued with wisdom it is rightly freed from the defilements, namely, the defilements of sensuality, desire to be reborn, and ignorance.”

304. Also at SN 56.21.

9. The Deaths in Nātika

When the Buddha had stayed in the village of Koṭi as long as he pleased, he said to Ānanda, “Come, Ānanda, let’s go to the land of the Nātikas.”³⁰⁵ 2.5.1

“Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants arrived in the land of the Nātikas, where he stayed in the brick house at Nātika.³⁰⁶ 2.5.3

Then Venerable Ānanda went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him, “Sir, the monk named Sālha has passed away in Nātika. Where has he been reborn in his next life?³⁰⁷ The nun named Nandā, the layman named Sudatta, and the laywoman named Sujātā have passed away in Nātika. Where have they been reborn in the next life?³⁰⁸ The laymen named Kakkāṭa,³⁰⁹ Kaḷibha, Nikata, Kaṭissaha, Tuṭṭha, Santuṭṭha, Bhadda, and Subhadda have passed away in Nātika. Where have they been reborn in the next life?” 2.6.1

305. Nātika (also spelled *nātika*, or *nādika*; Sanskrit *jñātṛka*; Prākṛit *nāyika*) was the clan to which the Jain leader Mahāvīra (called Nāṭaputta, i.e. Nātīputta) belonged. Here it is unusually spelled in plural, which means “the land of the Nātika clan”. | Despite the variant spellings, the commentary supports Nātika, explaining that it is one of two villages by a lake originally settled by the sons of two brothers, hence being “of the relatives” (*nātika*).

306. Here Nātika is in singular and appears to be the name of a town. Thus Nātika is first of all a name of a clan, then the land they live in, then their chief town. | Over a millennium previously, the Indus Valley Civilization had built cities of fired brick with standardized size and construction methods, but in the Buddha’s day most buildings were wood. This is the only brick building mentioned in the suttas; brick construction is also discussed in the Vinaya.

307. It is unprecedented to discuss the spiritual destinies of an entire town like this. Normally this question is only asked when specific individuals known to the Buddha have passed away. Likely the passage was created in the wake of the passing of Mahāvīra to show that even his own people were enthusiastic Buddhists. This portion of the text is also found at SN 55.8.

308. SN 55.9 inserts another series on a monk, nun, layman, and laywoman all called Asoka.

309. This portion of the text is at SN 55.10. I spell names consistently with there.

- 2.7.1 “Ānanda, the monk Sālha had realized the undefiled freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom, having realized it with his own insight in this very life due to the ending of defilements.
- 2.7.2 The nun Nandā had ended the five lower fetters. She’s been reborn spontaneously, and will be extinguished there, not liable to return from that world.
- 2.7.3 The layman Sudatta had ended three fetters, and weakened greed, hate, and delusion. He’s a once-returner; he will come back to this world once only, then make an end of suffering.
- 2.7.4 The laywoman Sujātā had ended three fetters. She’s a stream-enterer, not liable to be reborn in the underworld, assured, destined for awakening.
- 2.7.5 The laymen Kakkāṭa, Kaḷibha, Nikata, Kaṭṭissaha, Tuṭṭha, Santuṭṭha, Bhadda, and Subhadda had ended the five lower fetters. They’ve been reborn spontaneously, and will be extinguished there, not liable to return from that world.³¹⁰
- 2.7.13 Over fifty laymen in Ñātika have passed away having ended the five lower fetters. They’ve been reborn spontaneously, and will be extinguished there, not liable to return from that world.
- 2.7.14 More than ninety laymen in Ñātika have passed away having ended three fetters, and weakened greed, hate, and delusion. They’re once-returners, who will come back to this world once only, then make an end of suffering.
- 2.7.15 More than five hundred laymen in Ñātika have passed away having ended three fetters. They’re stream-enterers, not liable to be reborn in the underworld, assured, destined for awakening.³¹¹

310. The suttas consistently depict lay folk as attaining the third stage of awakening, non-return, but not the highest stage of arahantship, except in rare cases on the deathbed. The tradition extended this by saying that if a lay person becomes an arahant, they must ordain or die that day, but this is not supported in the early texts. The point is not whether you receive an ordination, but whether you let go of attachments.

311. The commentary to the Saṃyutta attributes the large number of deaths to a recent plague (*ahivātaroga*, “viper’s breath disease”). This deadly contagion was known to kill off entire families (Kd 1:50.1.1). According to the commentaries,

10. The Mirror of the Teaching

It's no wonder that a human being should pass away. But if you should come and ask me about it each and every time someone passes away, that would be a bother for me. 2.8.1

So Ānanda, I will teach you the explanation of the Dhamma named 'the mirror of the teaching'. A noble disciple who has this may declare of themselves:³¹² 'I've finished with rebirth in hell, the animal realm, and the ghost realm. I've finished with all places of loss, bad places, the underworld. I am a stream-enterer! I'm not liable to be reborn in the underworld, and am assured, destined for awakening.' 2.8.3

And what is that mirror of the teaching?³¹³ 2.9.1

It's when a noble disciple has experiential confidence in the Buddha:³¹⁴ 'That Blessed One is perfected, a fully awakened Buddha, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, holy, knower of the world, supreme guide for those fit for training, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.'³¹⁵ 2.9.3

They have experiential confidence in the teaching: 'The teaching is well explained by the Buddha—apparent in the present life, imme- 2.9.5

the same disease once afflicted Vesālī, prompting the teaching of the Ratanasutta (Snp 2.1, Kp 6).

312. Mirrors are for doing makeup (DN 1:1.16.2) or admiring oneself (MN 77:33.18), which a mendicant should not do (Kd 15:2.4.1). In the Dhamma a mirror is for self-reflection (MN 61:8.2), while the mind is purified like polishing a mirror (AN 3.70:13.4).

313. The four principles that follow are elsewhere identified as four factors of stream-entry (AN 9.27). At SN 12.41, understanding of dependent origination is included.

314. "Experiential" is *avecca*, literally "having undergone". "Experiential confidence" is the faith of a stream-enterer, who has seen for themselves.

315. They have experiential confidence in the Buddha as a teacher because they have followed his path and realized the results that he speaks of.

diately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.’³¹⁶

- 2.9.7 They have experiential confidence in the Saṅgha: ‘The Saṅgha of the Buddha’s disciples is practicing the way that’s good, direct, systematic, and proper. It consists of the four pairs, the eight individual persons. This is the Saṅgha of the Buddha’s disciples that is worthy of offerings dedicated to the gods, worthy of hospitality, worthy of a religious donation, worthy of greeting with cupped palms, and is the supreme field of merit for the world.’³¹⁷
- 2.9.9 And a noble disciple’s ethical conduct is loved by the noble ones, unbroken, impeccable, spotless, and unmarred, liberating, praised by sensible people, not mistaken, and leading to immersion.³¹⁸
- 2.9.10 This is that mirror of the teaching.”
- 2.10.1 And while staying there in Nātika the Buddha often gave this Dhamma talk to the mendicants:
- 2.10.2 “Such is ethics, such is immersion, such is wisdom. When immersion is imbued with ethics it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When wisdom is imbued with immersion it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When the mind is imbued with wisdom it is rightly freed from the defilements, namely, the defilements of sensuality, desire to be reborn, and ignorance.”
- 2.11.1 When the Buddha had stayed in Nātika as long as he pleased, he addressed Venerable Ānanda, “Come, Ānanda, let’s go to Vesālī.”

316. A stream-enterer has direct experience of the four noble truths, so they have confirmed that the teaching is indeed realizable in this very life.

317. The suttas distinguish between two senses of Saṅgha. The “mendicant Saṅgha” (*bhikkhusaṅgha*) is the conventional community of monks and nuns. The “Saṅgha of disciples” (*sāvakaśaṅgha*) is classified as fourfold according to the stages of awakening: stream-entry, once-return, non-return, and perfection. Each of these stages is further subdivided into those of the path who are practicing for realization and those of the fruit who have realized. These are referred to as “noble disciples”, four of the path and four of the fruit, making eight individuals in total.

318. This entails keeping the five precepts at a minimum.

“Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants arrived at Vesālī, where he stayed in Ambapālī’s Mango Grove.³¹⁹ 2.11.3

There the Buddha addressed the mendicants: 2.12.1

“Mendicants, a mendicant should live mindful and aware.³²⁰ This is my instruction to you. 2.12.2

And how is a mendicant mindful?³²¹ It’s when a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world.³²² They meditate observing an aspect of feelings ... mind ... principles—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world.³²³ That’s how a mendicant is mindful. 2.12.4

And how is a mendicant aware? It’s when a mendicant acts with situational awareness when going out and coming back; when looking ahead and aside; when bending and extending the limbs; when bearing the outer robe, bowl and robes; when eating, drinking, chewing, and tasting; when urinating and defecating; when walking, standing, sitting, sleeping, waking, speaking, and keeping silent. That’s how a mendicant is aware. A mendicant should live mindful and aware. This is my instruction to you.” 2.13.1

319. Ambapālī means “protector of mangoes”. Here the text just says she had a “grove”, but it is identified as a mango grove below (DN 16:2.14.1).

320. In some versions, the Buddha is said to have taught the monks mindfulness in anticipation of the arrival of the beautiful courtesan.

321. In the Gradual Training the mendicant “establishes mindfulness” to begin meditation. Here this practice is expanded, and in DN 22 it is expanded even further.

322. The locative idiom *kāye kāyānupassī* indicates that the meditator focuses on a particular aspect of body contemplation, such as observing the breath, awareness of the body parts, or reflection on the four elements. | “Rid of desire and aversion for the world” refers to clearing the mind through the previous practice of sense restraint.

323. *Dhammā* here refers to the “principles” of cause and effect and the four noble truths which are understood by reflecting on the psychology of meditation itself. In this context *dhammā* does not mean “mental objects” or “phenomena” or “mental qualities”.

11. Ambapālī the Courtesan

- 2.14.1 Ambapālī the courtesan heard that the Buddha had arrived and was staying in her mango grove.³²⁴ She had the finest carriages harnessed. Then she mounted a fine carriage and, along with other fine carriages, set out from Vesālī for her own park. She went by carriage as far as the terrain allowed, then descended and approached the Buddha on foot. She bowed and sat down to one side. The Buddha educated, encouraged, fired up, and inspired her with a Dhamma talk.
- 2.14.5 Then she said to the Buddha, “Sir, would the Buddha, together with the mendicant Saṅgha, please accept tomorrow’s meal from me?” The Buddha consented with silence. Then, knowing that the Buddha had consented, Ambapālī rose from her seat, bowed, and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on her right, before leaving.
- 2.15.1 The Licchavis of Vesālī also heard that the Buddha had arrived and was staying in Ambapālī’s Mango Grove. They had the finest carriages harnessed. Then they mounted a fine carriage and, along with other fine carriages, set out from Vesālī. Some of the Licchavis were in blue, of blue color, clad in blue, adorned with blue. And some were similarly colored in yellow, red, or white.³²⁵
- 2.16.1 Then Ambapālī the courtesan collided with those Licchavi youths, axle to axle, wheel to wheel, yoke to yoke.³²⁶ The Licchavis said to her, “What, you wench Ambapālī, are you doing colliding with us axle to axle, wheel to wheel, yoke to yoke?”³²⁷

324. A *gaṇikā* was a trained entertainer and escort whose company commanded a high fee (Kd 8:1.1.7). It was a respected position, as we see the city guild of Rājagaha, with King Bimbisāra’s blessing, appoint the young woman Sālavatī in a similar position (Kd 8:1.2.13).

325. The text spends more time on the Vajjis’ appearance than on Ambapālī’s. At Thig 15.1:12.1 the nun Isidāsī recalls how she used to do the makeup for her husband every day, like his own personal beautician.

326. There are various readings for *paṭivatteṣi*. The commentary glosses with *pahari* (“struck, collided”).

327. The derogatory indeclinable vocative *je* is otherwise used of the “naughty maid” Kālī at MN 21:9.13. “Wench” is a term meant to insult on the basis

"Well, masters, it's because I've invited the Buddha for tomorrow's meal together with the mendicant Saṅgha." 2.16.4

"Wench, give us that meal for a hundred thousand!" 2.16.5

"Masters, even if you were to give me Vesālī with her provinces, I still wouldn't give that meal to you."³²⁸ 2.16.6

Then the Licchavis snapped their fingers, saying, "We've been beaten by the aunty! We've been beaten by the aunty!"³²⁹ Then they continued on to Ambapālī's Mango Grove. 2.16.7

The Buddha saw them coming off in the distance, and addressed the mendicants: "Any of the mendicants who've never seen the gods of the thirty-three before, just have a look at the assembly of Licchavis. See the assembly of Licchavis, check them out: they're just like the thirty-three!" 2.17.1

The Licchavis went by carriage as far as the terrain allowed, then descended and approached the Buddha on foot. They bowed to the Buddha, sat down to one side, and the Buddha educated, encouraged, fired up, and inspired them with a Dhamma talk. 2.18.1

Then they said to the Buddha, "Sir, would the Buddha, together with the mendicant Saṅgha, please accept tomorrow's meal from us?" 2.18.3

Then the Buddha said to the Licchavis, "I have already accepted tomorrow's meal from Ambapālī the courtesan." 2.18.5

Then the Licchavis snapped their fingers, saying, "We've been beaten by the aunty! We've been beaten by the aunty!" 2.18.7

of servitude or promiscuity, so it seems appropriate. The Licchavis are not distinguishing themselves here; given their youth, wealth, licentiousness, and evident familiarity with Ambapālī, it seems safe to conclude that they had been her clients.

328. *Dassatha* is second future plural of *dadāti*. The Vinaya parallel at Kd 6:30.4.5 uses optative forms instead. | "With provinces" is *sāhāraṃ* (literally "with food", commentary: *sajanapadam*) refers to the holdings around the city that supplied food and other necessities.

329. Despite the context, *ambakā* has no etymological relation to *amba* ("mango") but is a term for "woman, mother", used here as a play on words.

- 2.18.9 And then those Licchavis approved and agreed with what the Buddha said. They got up from their seat, bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on their right, before leaving.
- 2.19.1 And when the night had passed Ambapālī had delicious fresh and cooked foods prepared in her own park. Then she had the Buddha informed of the time, saying, “Sir, it’s time. The meal is ready.”
- 2.19.3 Then the Buddha robed up in the morning and, taking his bowl and robe, went to the home of Ambapālī together with the mendicant Saṅgha, where he sat down on the seat spread out. Then Ambapālī served and satisfied the mendicant Saṅgha headed by the Buddha with her own hands with delicious fresh and cooked foods.
- 2.19.5 When the Buddha had eaten and washed his hands and bowl, Ambapālī took a low seat, sat to one side, and said to the Buddha, “Sir, I present this park to the mendicant Saṅgha headed by the Buddha.”³³⁰
- 2.19.8 The Buddha accepted the park.³³¹
- 2.19.9 Then the Buddha educated, encouraged, fired up, and inspired her with a Dhamma talk, after which he rose from his seat and left.
- 2.20.1 And while staying at Vesālī, too, the Buddha often gave this Dhamma talk to the mendicants:
- 2.20.2 “Such is ethics, such is immersion, such is wisdom. When immersion is imbued with ethics it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When wisdom is imbued with immersion it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When the mind is imbued with wisdom it is rightly freed from the defilements, namely, the defilements of sensuality, desire to be reborn, and ignorance.”

330. This demonstrates that a woman of Ambapālī’s profession could own land and control significant resources.

331. An *ārāma* is a tended and pleasant ground, a “park”. Here it has previously been referred to as “grove” (*vana*) and “mango grove”. Usually in the suttas, however, it is a name for a place where monastics live. In English, monastics don’t live in parks, they live in monasteries. So once a place has been dedicated for the Saṅgha, I translate *ārāma* as “monastery”.

12. Commencing the Rains at Beluva

When the Buddha had stayed in Ambapāli's Mango Grove as long as he pleased, he addressed Venerable Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, let's go to the little village of Beluva."³³² 2.21.1

"Yes, sir," Ānanda replied. Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants arrived at the little village of Beluva, and stayed there. 2.21.3

There the Buddha addressed the mendicants: "Mendicants, please enter the rainy season residence with whatever friends or acquaintances you have around Vesālī.³³³ I'll commence the rainy season residence right here in the little village of Beluva." 2.22.1

"Yes, sir," those mendicants replied. They did as the Buddha said, while the Buddha commenced the rainy season residence right there in the little village of Beluva. 2.22.4

After the Buddha had commenced the rainy season residence, he fell severely ill, struck by dreadful pains, close to death. But he endured unbothered, with mindfulness and situational awareness. Then it occurred to the Buddha, "It would not be appropriate for me to be fully extinguished before informing my supporters and taking leave of the mendicant Saṅgha.³³⁴ Why don't I forcefully suppress this illness, stabilize the life force, and live on?"³³⁵ 2.23.1

332. Pali texts waver between *beluva* ("wood-apple") and *veluva* (from *veluvant*, "full of bamboo").

333. The Buddha was travelling with a large retinue, which could become burdensome on a small village if they were to stay the three months of the rains residence. The texts note several monasteries and places to stay around Vesālī.

334. Here *upaṭṭhāka* refers to the lay devotees, who the Buddha informs below. | *Apaloketi* ("take leave") also has a literal sense of "glance back"; both senses are found in the sutta (see DN 16:4.1.2).

335. "Life force" is *jīvitasāṅkhāra* whereas below we find *āyusāṅkhāra* (DN 16:3.10.1). They are evidently synonyms; Ps 1.6:4.3 refers to the three *jīvitasāṅkhāras* from MN 43:24.2, but there the text has *āyusāṅkhāra*. The sense is not "will to live" but "life force", i.e. the vital energy that sustains life (SN 20.6:3.2, MN 43:23.1). This leans on the old use of Sanskrit *samas kurva* or *saṁskāra* for the "reviving" or "rejuvenation" of the god Pajāpati when he is depleted by the

- 2.24.1 So that is what he did. Then the Buddha's illness died down.
- 2.24.3 Soon after the Buddha had recovered from that sickness, he left his dwelling and sat in the shade of the porch on the seat spread out. Then Venerable Ānanda went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him, "Sir, it's fantastic that the Buddha is comfortable and well. Because when the Buddha was sick, my body felt like it was drugged. I was disorientated, and the teachings didn't spring to mind."³³⁶ Still, at least I was consoled by the thought that the Buddha won't be fully extinguished without bringing something up regarding the Saṅgha of mendicants."³³⁷
- 2.25.1 "But what could the mendicant Saṅgha expect from me, Ānanda?"³³⁸ I've taught the Dhamma without making any distinction between secret and public teachings.³³⁹ The Realized One doesn't have the closed fist of a tutor when it comes to the teachings.³⁴⁰ If there's anyone who thinks: 'I shall lead the mendicant Saṅgha,' or 'the Saṅgha of mendicants is meant for me,' let them bring something up regarding the Saṅgha. But the Realized

act of creation, like a fire run low or a man after sex (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 7.2.1.5 *et passim*).

336. This is the first indication of Ānanda's fragile emotional state in the days to come. | Read *diṭṭhā* (Sanskrit *diṣṭyā*), "fantastic, how fortunate", per DN 26:21.9 and Ja 81:1.4.

337. Previously the Buddha had spoken of "taking leave" of the Saṅgha, but here something more specific is meant. *Udāharati* is typically used when a previously-mentioned matter (often unpleasant) is "brought up", as at the monastic procedures for confession or invitation to admonish (Kd 1:16.2.5, Kd 1:2.1.9). Ānanda is implying that there is some unfinished disciplinary business that needs attention. Despite the Buddha's response, he did in fact go on to make a number of statements and rulings.

338. For forty-five years he had been teaching and supporting the community.

339. A principle not followed by some contemporary Buddhist schools that harbor "secret teachings".

340. "Closed fist of a tutor" is *ācariyamutṭhi*. Compare Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 6.2.4: "I have taught you all that I know."

One doesn't think like this, so why should he bring something up regarding the Saṅgha?³⁴¹

I'm now old, elderly and senior. I'm advanced in years and have reached the final stage of life. I'm currently eighty years old. Just as a decrepit old cart is kept going by a rope,³⁴² in the same way, the Realized One's body is kept going as if by a rope.³⁴³ Sometimes the Realized One, not focusing on any signs, and with the cessation of certain feelings, enters and remains in the signless immersion of the heart. Only then does the Realized One's body become more comfortable.³⁴⁴ 2.25.9

341. *Pariharissāmi* needs careful parsing with regard to tenses. The general meaning is to “carry about” or “maintain, nurture”. The Buddha elsewhere said that he “leads” the Saṅgha (DN 26:25.6: *pariharāmi*). When the Buddha was about to go on retreat, Moggallāna said that he and Sāriputta “shall lead” (*pariharissāmi*), to which the Buddha said they “should lead” (MN 67:13.7: *parihareyyam*). Devadatta, on the other hand, ensured his downfall when he determined that he “shall lead” the Saṅgha, having taken over from the Buddha (AN 5.100:2.3, Kd 1:2.1.23). Thus the future tense indicates the determination to lead. But at this point, the Buddha's mind is already set on letting go. He is not saying that no one should lead the Saṅgha, but that it is up to whoever leads it to address the issues.

342. The reading and derivation of *veṭhamissakena* are unclear. As a form of violence we find *veṭhamissena* at Thag 2.12:1.1, notably also in instrumental. *Veṭha* means “twist, strap, turban”. *Missa* means “mixed” or “plaited” (Bu Ss 2:2.1.21). Thus it probably refers to a kind of strong twisted material used to tie or bind, i.e. rope.

343. Compare Rig Veda 8.48.5: “As leather binds a chariot, soma knits my joints together.” Bṛhadāranyaka Upaniṣad 4.3.35 compares the labored breathing of one near death with the creaking of a heavily-laden cart. Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 13.2.7.8 says a handsome cart is well-finished with ropes. Indian carts were bound with ropes down to modern times. See too SN 41.5:5.5 and note.

344. The suttas say little about this signless (*animitta*) meditation. Its defining characteristic is that consciousness does not “follow after signs” (*nimittānusāri viññāṇam*, eg. AN 6.13:5.3). This is explained in MN 138:10.2 as not being distracted or affected by the features of sense impressions, as the “signs” are created by greed, hate, and delusion (MN 43:37.1). It is distinguished from the four kinds of mindfulness meditation (SN 22.80:8.4). The mental unification (*ekattaṃ*) based on this practice is listed after the form (and formless) *jhānas*, so it is very advanced. It is nonetheless a conditioned state (MN 121:11.4), so

2.26.1 So Ānanda, live as your own island, your own refuge, with no other refuge. Let the teaching be your island and your refuge, with no other refuge.³⁴⁵ And how does a mendicant do this? It's when a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. They meditate observing an aspect of feelings ... mind ... principles—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. That's how a mendicant lives with themselves as island and refuge, without other refuge; with the teachings as island and refuge, without other refuge.

2.26.8 Whether now or after I have passed, any who shall live as their own island, their own refuge, with no other refuge; with the teaching as their island and their refuge, with no other refuge—those mendicants of mine who want to train shall be among the best of the best.”³⁴⁶

The second recitation section.

13. An Obvious Hint

3.1.1 Then the Buddha robed up in the morning and, taking his bowl and robe, entered Vesālī for alms. Then, after the meal, on his return from almsround, he addressed Venerable Ānanda: “Ānanda, get

it is possible that a mendicant might fall from it and disrobe (AN 6.60:8.10). However it may also be used to describe the meditation of an arahant (SN 41.7:6.12). It is clear from MN 121:10.5 that the six senses are still functioning, unlike in deep serenity meditations. It seems that in such a state, the Buddha was able to function normally while seeing through the pain in his body.

345. This central theme of the Buddha's teaching—that each of us is responsible for our own salvation—becomes even more important as the Buddha's days grow short.

346. Read *tama(t)agge* with *tama* as superlative, literally “at the peak of the best”.

your sitting cloth.³⁴⁷ Let's go to the Cāpāla Shrine for the day's meditation."

"Yes, sir," replied Ānanda. Taking his sitting cloth he followed behind the Buddha. 3.1.5

Then the Buddha went up to the Cāpāla Shrine, where he sat down on the seat spread out. Ānanda bowed to the Buddha and sat down to one side. 3.2.1

The Buddha said to him: "Ānanda, Vesālī is lovely. And the Udena, Gotamaka, Seven Maidens, Many Sons, Sārāndada, and Cāpāla Shrines are all lovely. 3.2.3

Whoever has developed and cultivated the four bases of psychic power—made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up, consolidated them, and properly implemented them—may, if they wish, live for the proper lifespan or what's left of it.³⁴⁸ The Realized One has developed and cultivated the four bases of psychic power, made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up, consolidated them, and properly implemented them. If he wished, the Realized One could live for the proper lifespan or what's left of it." 3.3.1

But Ānanda didn't get it, even though the Buddha dropped such an obvious hint, such a clear sign. He didn't beg the Buddha: "Sir, may the Blessed One please remain for the proper lifespan! May the Holy One please remain for the proper lifespan! That would be for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the 3.4.1

347. This detail is often mentioned in texts of the Sarvāstivāda school, but rarely in Pali.

348. Normally *kappa* as a period of time means "eon", but the late canonical texts *Kathāvatthu* (Kv 11.5) and *Milindapañha* (Mil 5.1.10) argue that it means the "lifespan", an interpretation followed by the commentaries. Support for this comes from DN 26:28.3, which says that "long life" for a mendicant is the four bases of psychic power which enable you to remain for the *kappa*. Here it is surely talking about a full lifespan. Underlying this is the idea that in different epochs the "proper lifespan" varies; in the Buddha's day it was one hundred years (DN 14:1.7.7). We can resolve the problem if we read *kappa* here, not as a period of time, but as "proper, fitting", i.e. the "proper" lifespan of a hundred years.

world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans.”
For his mind was as if possessed by Māra.³⁴⁹

- 3.5.1 For a second time ... And for a third time, the Buddha said to Ānanda: “Ānanda, Vesālī is lovely. And the Udena, Gotamaka, Seven Maidens, Many Sons, Sāranda, and Cāpāla Shrines are all lovely. Whoever has developed and cultivated the four bases of psychic power—made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up, consolidated them, and properly implemented them—may, if they wish, live for the proper lifespan or what’s left of it. The Realized One has developed and cultivated the four bases of psychic power, made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up, consolidated them, and properly implemented them. If he wished, the Realized One could live for the proper lifespan or what’s left of it.”
- 3.5.6 But Ānanda didn’t get it, even though the Buddha dropped such an obvious hint, such a clear sign. He didn’t beg the Buddha: “Sir, may the Blessed One please remain for the proper lifespan! May the Holy One please remain for the proper lifespan! That would be for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans.” For his mind was as if possessed by Māra.
- 3.6.1 Then the Buddha got up and said to Venerable Ānanda, “Go now, Ānanda, at your convenience.”
- 3.6.4 “Yes, sir,” replied Ānanda. He rose from his seat, bowed, and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on his right, before sitting at the root of a tree close by.

349. Here Ānanda’s mind is “as if” possessed (*yathā*), but in the Vinaya *yathā* is missing: he is possessed (Kd 1:1.10.17). Remember, Ānanda is telling this story about himself.

14. The Appeal of Māra

And then, not long after Ānanda had left, Māra the Wicked went up to the Buddha, stood to one side, and said to him:³⁵⁰ 3.7.1

“Sir, may the Blessed One now be fully extinguished! May the Holy One now be fully extinguished! Now is the time for the full extinguishment of the Buddha.³⁵¹ Sir, you once made this statement: ‘Wicked One, I shall not be fully extinguished until I have monk disciples who are competent, educated, assured, learned, have memorized the teachings, and practice in line with the principle of the teaching. Not until they practice properly, living in line with the teaching. Not until they’ve learned their denomination, and explain, teach, assert, establish, disclose, analyze, and make it clear. Not until they can legitimately and completely refute the doctrines of others that come up, and teach with a demonstrable basis.’³⁵² 3.7.2

Today you do have such monk disciples. May the Blessed One now be fully extinguished! May the Holy One now be fully extinguished! Now is the time for the full extinguishment of the Buddha. 3.8.1

Sir, you once made this statement: ‘Wicked One, I shall not be fully extinguished until I have nun disciples who are competent, educated, self-assured, learned ...’³⁵³ 3.8.3

350. Māra (see SN 4.1:2.1) is the Buddhist deity of death, sex, and delusion; his aim is to trap beings in transmigration. He appears in many guises, both real and metaphorical, throughout the canon, but this sequence is his only direct appearance in the *Dīghanikāya*. Here he feigns compassion, urging the Buddha to find his final peace; but he has an ulterior motive, for with the Buddha’s passing Māra’s job will be much easier.

351. *Parinibbāna* means “extinguishment”, as of a flame. Here it appears as both noun (“extinguishment”) and verb (“become extinguished”). It is not a particularly difficult term to translate. Linguistically it has nothing to do with “attachment”, so renderings such as “unbinding” are untenable. It should be translated rather than just keeping “Nibbāna”, not least because English resists verbifying adopted words, resulting in such constructions as “enter Nibbāna”, which reifies it in a way that the Pali does not.

352. Māra is citing the Buddha’s words for his own purpose.

353. This passage makes it clear that it was the Buddha’s intention from the beginning to establish an order of nuns (*bhikkhuni*). This passage lists the four

- 3.8.5 Today you do have such nun disciples. May the Blessed One now be fully extinguished! May the Holy One now be fully extinguished! Now is the time for the full extinguishment of the Buddha.
- 3.8.7 Sir, you once made this statement: ‘Wicked One, I shall not be fully extinguished until I have layman disciples who are competent, educated, self-assured, learned ...’
- 3.8.9 Today you do have such layman disciples. May the Blessed One now be fully extinguished! May the Holy One now be fully extinguished! Now is the time for the full extinguishment of the Buddha.
- 3.8.11 Sir, you once made this statement: ‘Wicked One, I shall not be fully extinguished until I have laywoman disciples who are competent, educated, self-assured, learned ...’
- 3.8.13 Today you do have such laywoman disciples. May the Blessed One now be fully extinguished! May the Holy One now be fully extinguished! Now is the time for the full extinguishment of the Buddha.
- 3.8.15 Sir, you once made this statement: ‘Wicked One, I will not be fully extinguished until my spiritual path is successful and prosperous, extensive, popular, widespread, and fully revealed among gods and humans.’
- 3.8.17 Today your spiritual path is successful and prosperous, extensive, popular, widespread, and fully revealed among gods and humans. May the Blessed One now be fully extinguished! May the Holy One now be fully extinguished! Now is the time for the full extinguishment of the Buddha.”
- 3.9.1 When this was said, the Buddha said to Māra, “Relax, Wicked One. The full extinguishment of the Realized One will be soon.”³⁵⁴

assemblies that constitute a full dispensation; a similar pattern was recognized by the Jains.

354. This passage is the narrative inverse of the occasion when Brahmā begged the Buddha to teach (SN 6.1:5.5, etc.). Throughout, the sutta artfully preserves a degree of narrative ambiguity. Here it almost appears as if the Buddha assents to passing away because of Māra’s request, although his intent was clear earlier. Māra’s reasoning, moreover, is based on the Buddha’s own words.

Three months from now the Realized One will be fully extinguished.”³⁵⁵

15. Surrendering the Life Force

So at the Cāpāla Shrine the Buddha, mindful and aware, surrendered the life force.³⁵⁶ When he did so there was a great earthquake, awe-inspiring and hair-raising, and thunder cracked the sky.³⁵⁷ Then, understanding this matter, on that occasion the Buddha expressed this heartfelt sentiment:

“Comparing the incomparable
with the creation of prolonged life,³⁵⁸
the sage surrendered the life force.”³⁵⁹

355. It seems that at this point, the Buddha is still spending the rains in Beluva village, from where he would sometimes go to nearby Vesālī for alms, or to a local shrine for meditation. He left Vesālī only after holding a meeting for all the Saṅgha, which probably signified the completion of the rains (DN 16:4.1.2). If this reasoning is correct—and the text is not explicit—then he made this statement during the rains retreat. If, however, this reasoning is incorrect and we are already after the rains, it could not have been long after. Thus it is probably September/October, meaning that the final extinguishment was to take place in December/January. This conflicts with the tradition of ascribing his final extinguishment to the full moon of Vesak, in May.

356. The Cāpāla shrine is unknown outside of this context. The Udāna commentary says that it was named after the *yakkha* who formerly lived there. Now, *cāpalla* means “fickleness, propensity to tremble” and is from the same root as earth-“quake” (*bhumicāla*; *capala* = *pacala* via metathesis). It is no great leap to *cāpāla*. If this is correct, it suggests that the shrine was dedicated to an earth spirit who commanded earthquakes; a fitting setting for the events to follow.

357. Northern India lies in the shadow of the seismically active Alpide Belt, so the occurrence of earthquakes is realistic even if the causes are not scientific.

358. For this difficult verse, I generally follow Bhikkhu Bodhi’s long discussion in *Connected Discourses of the Buddha*, note 255 on the Mahāvagga. | *Sambhava* means “production, creation”, and here I think it refers to the prolonging of life which the Buddha had just rejected.

359. *Bhavasāṅkhāra* (“life force”) here is equivalent to *āyusāṅkhāra* and *jīvita-sāṅkhāra*.

Happy inside, serene,
he shattered self-creation like a suit of armor.”³⁶⁰

16. The Causes of Earthquakes

- 3.11.1 Then Venerable Ānanda thought, “How incredible, how amazing! That was a really big earthquake! That was really a very big earthquake; awe-inspiring and hair-raising, and thunder cracked the sky! What’s the cause, what’s the reason for a great earthquake?”
- 3.12.1 Then Venerable Ānanda went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him, “How incredible, sir, how amazing! That was a really big earthquake! That was really a very big earthquake; awe-inspiring and hair-raising, and thunder cracked the sky! What’s the cause, what’s the reason for a great earthquake?”
- 3.13.1 “Ānanda, there are these eight causes and reasons for a great earthquake. What eight?
- 3.13.3 This great earth is established on water, the water is established on air, and the air stands in space. At a time when a great wind blows, it stirs the water, and the water stirs the earth.³⁶¹ This is the first cause and reason for a great earthquake.
- 3.14.1 Furthermore, there is an ascetic or brahmin with psychic power who has achieved mastery of the mind, or a god who is mighty and powerful. They’ve developed a limited perception of earth and a limitless perception of water. They make the earth shake and rock and tremble.³⁶² This is the second cause and reason for a great earthquake.

360. *Attasambhava* (“self-creation”) harks back to *sambhava* in the first line.

361. So far as it goes, this is a naturalistic explanation. The “water element” has the quality of softening, while the “air element” is traditionally understood as “movement”. Thus in modern terms this means, “When underground forces disturb a region of instability.”

362. The might of ascetics was legendary in ancient India (eg. MN 56:14.2). The meditation described here might be compared with the “dimensions of mastery” below (DN 16:3.25.1).

Furthermore, when the being intent on awakening passes away 3.15.1
from the host of joyful gods, he's conceived in his mother's womb,
mindful and aware. Then the earth shakes and rocks and trembles.³⁶³
This is the third cause and reason for a great earthquake.

Furthermore, when the being intent on awakening comes out of 3.16.1
his mother's womb mindful and aware, the earth shakes and rocks
and trembles. This is the fourth cause and reason for a great earth-
quake.

Furthermore, when the Realized One awakens to the supreme 3.17.1
perfect awakening, the earth shakes and rocks and trembles.³⁶⁴ This
is the fifth cause and reason for a great earthquake.

Furthermore, when the Realized One rolls forth the supreme 3.18.1
Wheel of Dhamma, the earth shakes and rocks and trembles.³⁶⁵ This
is the sixth cause and reason for a great earthquake.

Furthermore, when the Realized One, mindful and aware, surren- 3.19.1
ders the life force, the earth shakes and rocks and trembles. This is
the seventh cause and reason for a great earthquake.

Furthermore, when the Realized One becomes fully extinguished 3.20.1
in the element of extinguishment with no residue, the earth shakes
and rocks and trembles.³⁶⁶ This is the eighth cause and reason for a
great earthquake.

These are the eight causes and reasons for a great earthquake. 3.20.3

363. At DN 14:1.17.7 and MN 123:7.6 it is, rather, the entire galaxy that trembles, perhaps indicating that the enhanced miracle is a later development.

364. There are many accounts of the Buddha's awakening in the suttas, but none, so far as I know, that mention an earthquake.

365. See SN 56.11:13.2.

366. This refers to the Buddha's death. The Pali here uses both *nibbāna* and *parinibbāna*. Sometimes it is said that *nibbāna* is the attainment of arahantship, while *parinibbāna* is the death of an arahant, but this distinction is not consistently applied in the suttas. | Regarding *nibbānadhātuyā* ("the element of extinguishment"), in Pali the case is ambiguous. It is sometimes translated "by means of" or "through", which assumes the instrumental; but the Sanskrit is *nirvāṇadhātau*, which must be locative.

17. Eight Assemblies

- 3.21.1 There are, Ānanda, these eight assemblies.³⁶⁷ What eight? The assemblies of aristocrats, brahmins, householders, and ascetics. An assembly of the gods of the four great kings. An assembly of the gods of the thirty-three. An assembly of Māras. An assembly of divinities.³⁶⁸
- 3.22.1 I recall having approached an assembly of hundreds of aristocrats. There I used to sit with them, converse, and engage in discussion. And my appearance and voice became just like theirs. I educated, encouraged, fired up, and inspired them with a Dhamma talk. But when I spoke they didn't know: 'Who is this that speaks? Is it a god or a human?' And when my Dhamma talk was finished I vanished. But when I vanished they didn't know: 'Who was that who vanished? Was it a god or a human?'³⁶⁹
- 3.23.1 I recall having approached an assembly of hundreds of brahmins ... householders ... ascetics ... the gods of the four great kings ... the gods of the thirty-three ... Māras ... divinities. There too I used to sit with them, converse, and engage in discussion. And my appearance and voice became just like theirs. I educated, encouraged, fired up,

367. As at AN 8.69. The following series of "eight things" seems arbitrarily inserted here and breaks the flow of the narrative. They are absent from the Sanskrit Sarvāstivāda text edited by Waldschmidt, which goes directly to the conversation where Ānanda realizes that the Buddha is going to die.

368. These "assemblies" were formal deliberative meetings, not just gatherings. Thus "householders" here does not mean "lay folk" in apposition to "ascetics"; rather it means "home owners". Some of these assemblies are depicted or alluded to in the Dīghanikāya. At DN 6:1.3, brahmins assemble in Vesālī; while at DN 3:1.13.3, Ambaṭṭha speaks of an assembly of Sakyans, who were aristocrats. At DN 18:12.1, we get a glimpse of the proceedings at a meeting of the gods of the thirty-three.

369. There do not appear to be any records of this happening in the early texts, although that is perhaps to be expected. It does feel out of character for the Buddha, as normally he is very up front. The commentary says that this ruse was adopted so the Buddha could plant subtle seeds (*vāsanā*) for the future. At Kena Upaniṣad 3, Brahma appears to the gods and tests them, but they do not know him.

and inspired them with a Dhamma talk. But when I spoke they didn't know: 'Who is this that speaks? Is it a god or a human?' And when my Dhamma talk was finished I vanished. But when I vanished they didn't know: 'Who was that who vanished? Was it a god or a human?'

These are the eight assemblies.

3.23.17

18. Eight Dimensions of Mastery

Ānanda, there are these eight dimensions of mastery.³⁷⁰ What eight? 3.24.1

Perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally, limited, 3.25.1
both pretty and ugly.³⁷¹ Mastering them, they perceive: 'I know and see.' This is the first dimension of mastery.

Perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally, limit- 3.26.1
less, both pretty and ugly. Mastering them, they perceive: 'I know and see.' This is the second dimension of mastery.

Not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally, 3.27.1
limited, both pretty and ugly.³⁷² Mastering them, they perceive: 'I know and see.' This is the third dimension of mastery.

Not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally, 3.28.1
limitless, both pretty and ugly. Mastering them, they perceive: 'I know and see.' This is the fourth dimension of mastery.

370. These are another way of describing the different experiences of *jhāna*. Also at AN 8.65, AN 10.29:6.1, DN 33:3.1.142, DN 34:2.1.160, and MN 77:23.1.

371. "Perceiving form (*rūpa*) internally" refers to someone developing meditation based on an aspect of their own body, such as the breath or the parts of the body. The "forms" (*rūpā*) seen externally are the lights or other meditation phenomena that today are usually called *nimitta*. An "ugly" form is the mental image that arises in such contemplations as the parts of the body. A "beautiful" image arises from practices such as mindfulness of breathing.

372. "Not perceiving form internally" refers to meditations such as the external elements, or the decaying of another's body.

- 3.29.1 Not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally that are blue, with blue color and blue appearance.³⁷³ They're like a flax flower that's blue, with blue color and blue appearance. Or a cloth from Varanasi that's smoothed on both sides, blue, with blue color and blue appearance. In the same way, not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally, blue, with blue color and blue appearance. Mastering them, they perceive: 'I know and see.' This is the fifth dimension of mastery.
- 3.30.1 Not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally that are yellow, with yellow color and yellow appearance. They're like a champak flower that's yellow, with yellow color and yellow appearance. Or a cloth from Varanasi that's smoothed on both sides, yellow, with yellow color and yellow appearance. In the same way, not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally that are yellow, with yellow color and yellow appearance. Mastering them, they perceive: 'I know and see.' This is the sixth dimension of mastery.
- 3.31.1 Not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally that are red, with red color and red appearance. They're like a scarlet mallow flower that's red, with red color and red appearance. Or a cloth from Varanasi that's smoothed on both sides, red, with red color and red appearance. In the same way, not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally that are red, with red color and red appearance. Mastering them, they perceive: 'I know and see.' This is the seventh dimension of mastery.
- 3.32.1 Not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally that are white, with white color and white appearance. They're like the morning star that's white, with white color and white appearance. Or a cloth from Varanasi that's smoothed on both sides, white, with

373. This is the meditation where one contemplates an external color, either a prepared disk or a natural phenomena such as the sky or a flower, which eventually gives rise to a "counterpart" image. Today such meditations are called *kaṣiṇa* following the Visuddhimagga, but in the early texts *kaṣiṇa* means "totality" and refers rather to the state of *samādhi* that results.

white color and white appearance. In the same way, not perceiving form internally, someone sees forms externally that are white, with white color and white appearance. Mastering them, they perceive: 'I know and see.' This is the eighth dimension of mastery.

These are the eight dimensions of mastery.

3.32.6

19. The Eight Liberations

Ānanda, there are these eight liberations.³⁷⁴ What eight?

3.33.1

Having physical form, they see forms. This is the first liberation.

3.33.3

Not perceiving form internally, they see forms externally. This is the second liberation.

3.33.5

They're focused only on beauty. This is the third liberation.

3.33.7

Going totally beyond perceptions of form, with the disappearance of perceptions of impingement, not focusing on perceptions of diversity, aware that 'space is infinite', they enter and remain in the dimension of infinite space. This is the fourth liberation.

3.33.9

Going totally beyond the dimension of infinite space, aware that 'consciousness is infinite', they enter and remain in the dimension of infinite consciousness. This is the fifth liberation.

3.33.11

Going totally beyond the dimension of infinite consciousness, aware that 'there is nothing at all', they enter and remain in the dimension of nothingness. This is the sixth liberation.

3.33.13

Going totally beyond the dimension of nothingness, they enter and remain in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is the seventh liberation.

3.33.15

Going totally beyond the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, they enter and remain in the cessation of perception and feeling. This is the eighth liberation.

3.33.17

These are the eight liberations.

3.33.19

Ānanda, this one time, when I was first awakened, I was staying in Uruvelā at the goatherd's banyan tree on the bank of the Nerañjarā

3.34.1

374. Already encountered at DN 15:35.1.

River.³⁷⁵ Then Māra the wicked approached me, stood to one side, and said: ‘Sir, may the Blessed One now be fully extinguished! May the Holy One now be fully extinguished! Now is the time for the full extinguishment of the Buddha.’ When he had spoken, I said to Māra:

- 3.35.1 ‘Wicked One, I shall not be fully extinguished until I have monk disciples ... nun disciples ... layman disciples ... laywoman disciples who are competent, educated, self-assured, learned.
- 3.35.5 I shall not be fully extinguished until my spiritual path is successful and prosperous, extensive, popular, widespread, and fully revealed among gods and humans.’
- 3.36.1 Today, just now at the Cāpāla Shrine Māra the Wicked approached me once more with the same request, reminding me of my former statement, and saying that those conditions had been fulfilled.
- 3.37.1 When he had spoken, I said to Māra: ‘Relax, Wicked One. The full extinguishment of the Realized One will be soon. Three months from now the Realized One will be fully extinguished.’ So today, just now at the Cāpāla Shrine, mindful and aware, I surrendered the life force.”

20. The Appeal of Ānanda

- 3.38.1 When he said this, Venerable Ānanda said to the Buddha, “Sir, may the Blessed One please remain for the proper lifespan! May the Holy One please remain for the proper lifespan! That would be for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans.”
- 3.38.3 “Enough now, Ānanda. Do not beg the Realized One. Now is not the time to beg the Realized One.”

375. This period is depicted in the Pali text of the first Khandhaka of the Vinaya (Kd 1), but this event is not recorded there. However, the Sanskrit Sarvāstivāda Catusparisatsūtra, which depicts the same period as a Sutta, includes it immediately after the encounter with the merchants Tapussa and Bhallika.

For a second time . . . For a third time, Ānanda said to the Buddha, 3.39.1
 “Sir, may the Blessed One please remain for the proper lifespan! May
 the Holy One please remain for the proper lifespan! That would be
 for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the
 world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans.”

“Ānanda, do you have faith in the Realized One’s awakening?” 3.39.4

“Yes, sir.” 3.39.5

“So why then do you keep pressing me up to the third time?” 3.39.6

“Sir, I have heard and learned this in the presence of the Bud- 3.40.1
 dha:³⁷⁶ ‘Whoever has developed and cultivated the four bases of
 psychic power—made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up,
 consolidated them, and properly implemented them—may, if they
 wish, live for the proper lifespan or what’s left of it. The Realized
 One has developed and cultivated the four bases of psychic power,
 made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up, consolidated them,
 and properly implemented them. If he wished, the Realized One
 could live for the proper lifespan or what’s left of it.’”

“Do you have faith, Ānanda?” 3.40.4

“Yes, sir.” 3.40.5

“Therefore, Ānanda, the misdeed is yours alone, the mistake is 3.40.6
 yours alone. For even though the Realized One dropped such an
 obvious hint, such a clear sign, you didn’t beg me to remain for
 the proper lifespan, or what’s left of it.³⁷⁷ If you had begged me, I
 would have turned you down twice, but consented on the third time.
 Therefore, Ānanda, the misdeed is yours alone, the mistake is yours
 alone.

376. Note that this is the idiom that Ānanda uses when directly quoting the Buddha.

377. “Misdeed” is *dukkataṃ*. This term is familiar as the most minor class of offenses in the Vinaya. Here we see an informal use of the term as something that has been wrongly done, rather than a legal violation. It is used in a similar way by Mahākassapa at the First Council, who accuses Ānanda of several misdeeds. As a legal term, *dukkata* is late; the category of offenses is not found in the Vinayas of the Mahāsaṅghika group of schools, which use *vinayatikkrama* for a similar idea.

3.41.1 Ānanda, this one time I was staying near Rājagaha, on the Vulture's Peak Mountain.³⁷⁸ There I said to you: 'Ānanda, Rājagaha is lovely, and so is the Vulture's Peak. Whoever has developed and cultivated the four bases of psychic power—made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up, consolidated them, and properly implemented them—may, if they wish, live for the proper lifespan or what's left of it. The Realized One has developed and cultivated the four bases of psychic power, made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up, consolidated them, and properly implemented them. If he wished, the Realized One could live for the proper lifespan or what's left of it.' But you didn't get it, even though I dropped such an obvious hint, such a clear sign. You didn't beg me to remain for the proper lifespan, or what's left of it. If you had begged me, I would have turned you down twice, but consented on the third time. Therefore, Ānanda, the misdeed is yours alone, the mistake is yours alone.

3.42.1 Ānanda, this one time I was staying right there near Rājagaha, at the Gotama banyan tree ...³⁷⁹ at Bandit's Cliff ...³⁸⁰ in the Sattapaṇṇi cave on the slopes of Vebhāra ...³⁸¹ at the Black Rock on the slopes of Isigili ...³⁸² in the Cool Grove, under the Cobra's Hood Grotto

378. The Buddha goes on to list multiple places where he hinted to Ānanda, but the only record of such a conversation is at the Cāpāla shrine.

379. The following group of places are all near Rājagaha, and collectively illustrate the variety of dwellings and environs enjoyed by the mendicants practicing there. | The Gotama banyan tree-shrine is mentioned only here. Gotama is a common name, and this shrine does not appear to have any connection with the Buddha.

380. A cliff from which bandits were tossed as a means of execution.

381. The Sanskrit form is Vaibhāra or Vaihāra. The Pali tradition says the First Council was held near the entrance to this cave (Dīpavaṁsa 4.19, Mahāvaṁsa 3.19, Samantapāsādikā Paṭhamamahāsaṅgītikathā). The Vinayas all agree that it was at Rājagaha, but traditions vary as to the exact location.

382. A large open area where Jains did their penances (MN 14:15.2) and the Buddha taught occasionally (SN 8.10), but it is most famous as the place the monks Godhika (SN 4.23) and Vakkali took their lives (SN 22.87).

...³⁸³ in the Hot Springs Monastery ...³⁸⁴ in the Bamboo Grove, the squirrels' feeding ground ...³⁸⁵ in Jīvaka's Mango Grove ... in the Maddakucchi deer park ...³⁸⁶

And in each place I said to you: 'Ānanda, Rājagaha is lovely, and so are all these places. ... If he wished, the Realized One could live for the proper lifespan or what's left of it.' But you didn't get it, even though I dropped such an obvious hint, such a clear sign. You didn't beg me to remain for the proper lifespan, or what's left of it. 3.43.1

Ānanda, this one time I was staying right here near Vesālī, at the Udena Shrine ...³⁸⁷ at the Gotamaka Shrine ...³⁸⁸ at the Seven Maid- 3.45.1

383. Mentioned several times in the suttas as a pleasant place to meditate, it is notable as the site of the conversion of the Buddha's chief layman disciple Anāthapiṇḍika (SN 10.8). But the most famous event there was when the Buddha moderated the monk Soṇa's excessive striving (AN 6.55).

384. The hot springs near Rājagaha were a popular place for monks to bathe, so much so that they prompted a rule ensuring that the monks did not monopolize the springs (Bu Pc 57). They are still in use and just as popular as ever.

385. A personal gift of King Bimbisāra, this was the first permanent monastery offered to the Buddha and his Saṅgha (Kd 1:22.17.3).

386. Mahākappina stayed here (Kd 1:5.3.1), and the Buddha rested there when his foot was first injured, apparently by Devadatta, before Jīvaka offered his mango grove (SN 1.38, SN 4.13).

387. The following group of places are all in the Vajjian country near Vesālī. Whereas the varied sites around Rājagaha reflect the rugged terrain there, at Vesālī all the sites are tree-shrines, as the surrounding land is flat. DN 24:1.11.5 indicates where they lay relative to Vesālī; the Udena shrine was to the east, and the next three to the south, west, and north respectively. | *Udena* is an epithet of the "arising" sun (Rig Veda 1.48.7), although here it may have the sense "prosperity".

388. Named after the local *yakkha*, to whom offerings would have been made. It could get cold enough to snow, prompting the Buddha to lay down a rule permitting three robes (Kd 1:13.2.1). A short but galaxy-shaking discourse was once taught there (AN 3.125:0.3).

ens Shrine ...³⁸⁹ at the Many Sons Shrine ...³⁹⁰ at the Sāranda Shrine ...³⁹¹ and just now, today at the Cāpāla Shrine. There I said to you: ‘Ānanda, Vesālī is lovely. And the Udena, Gotamaka, Seven Maidens, Many Sons, Sāranda, and Cāpāla Shrines are all lovely. Whoever has developed and cultivated the four bases of psychic power—made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up, consolidated them, and properly implemented them—may, if they wish, live for the proper lifespan or what’s left of it. The Realized One has developed and cultivated the four bases of psychic power, made them a vehicle and a basis, kept them up, consolidated them, and properly implemented them. If he wished, the Realized One could live for the proper lifespan or what’s left of it.’ But you didn’t get it, even though I dropped such an obvious hint, such a clear sign. You didn’t beg me to remain for the proper lifespan, or what’s left of it, saying: ‘Sir, may the Blessed One please remain for the proper lifespan! May the Holy One please remain for the proper lifespan! That would be for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans.’

389. The Pali has *amba* (“mango”) and *ambaka* (“maiden”) as variants. The commentary supports the latter, saying it was named for seven legendary princesses of Varanasi in the time of Buddha Kassapa, all of whom went on to become great disciples of our Buddha. I made this translation on the small island of Qimei off the south coast of Taiwan, where there is a shrine to the “seven maidens” who gave the island its name. Stories of “seven maidens” are widespread in myth and folklore all over the world, including Aboriginal Dreamtime stories. The archetype descends from the constellation known in English as Pleiades and in Sanskrit as Kṛttikā. Since there are six main visible stars in the cluster today, the stories often tell of how the youngest of the seven sisters was lost. In the Buddhist telling this is Visākhā, the only sister not to become an arahant in this life.

390. This was, obviously, a fertility shrine.

391. Previously mentioned as the place where the seven principles of non-decline were taught to the Licchavis. The meaning of Sāranda is obscure and variants profligate, but it might be derived from the Munda word *sara*, “funeral pyre”. The commentary says it was taken over from an old shrine to a *yakkha* of that name.

If you had begged me, I would have turned you down twice, but 3.47.7
consented on the third time. Therefore, Ānanda, the misdeed is
yours alone, the mistake is yours alone.

Did I not prepare for this when I explained that we must be parted 3.48.1
and separated from all we hold dear and beloved? How could it
possibly be so that what is born, created, conditioned, and liable
to wear out should not wear out? The Realized One has discarded,
eliminated, released, given up, relinquished, and surrendered the life
force. He has categorically stated: 'The full extinguishment of the
Realized One will be soon. Three months from now the Realized
One will be fully extinguished.' It's not possible for the Realized
One, for the sake of life, to take back the life force once it has been
given up like that.³⁹²

Come, Ānanda, let's go to the Great Wood, the hall with the 3.48.8
peaked roof."³⁹³

"Yes, sir," Ānanda replied. 3.48.9

So the Buddha went with Ānanda to the hall with the peaked roof, 3.49.1
and said to him, "Go, Ānanda, gather all the mendicants staying in
the vicinity of Vesālī together in the assembly hall."³⁹⁴

"Yes, sir," replied Ānanda. He did what the Buddha asked, went up 3.49.3
to him, bowed, stood to one side, and said to him, "Sir, the mendicant
Saṅgha has assembled. Please, sir, go at your convenience."

Then the Buddha went to the assembly hall, where he sat down 3.50.1
on the seat spread out and addressed the mendicants:

"So, mendicants, having carefully memorized those things I have 3.50.3
taught you from my direct knowledge, you should cultivate, develop,

392. "Take back" is *paccāvamissati*, which has several variants. It occurs in Ja 69 and Ja 509, where it is the opposite of *vamati*, to "expel, vomit".

393. This was the major Saṅgha residence near Vesālī. The Great Wood, according to the commentary, stretched as far as the Himalayas. Later tradition says that a town should have three woods: a "great wood" for wilderness (*mahāvana*); a "prosperity wood" for resources (*sirivana*); and an "ascetic wood" for spiritual practice (*tapovana*).

394. Compare the earlier request to gather all the mendicants around Rājagaha (DN 16:1.6.2).

and make much of them so that this spiritual practice may last for a long time. That would be for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans.³⁹⁵ And what are those things I have taught from my direct knowledge? They are: the four kinds of mindfulness meditation, the four right efforts, the four bases of psychic power, the five faculties, the five powers, the seven awakening factors, and the noble eightfold path.³⁹⁶

3.51.1 These are the things I have taught from my direct knowledge. Having carefully memorized them, you should cultivate, develop, and make much of them so that this spiritual practice may last for a long time. That would be for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans.”

3.51.2 Then the Buddha said to the mendicants:

3.51.3 “Come now, mendicants, I say to you all: ‘Conditions fall apart. Persist with diligence.’³⁹⁷ The full extinguishment of the Realized One will be soon. Three months from now the Realized One will be fully extinguished.”

395. Memorization was considered an essential basis for learning. In similar passages, we also find the injunction to “recite” the teachings, thus authorizing the recitation of the Buddha’s teachings after his death, which was later formalized in the Councils (*saṅgīti*).

396. These are the sets of practices later called the 37 *bodhiyapakkhiyā dhammā*, the “wings to awakening”. Here they are presented as an essential summary of the Buddha’s teachings. They form the backbone of the final book of the Saṃyuttanikāya, the Moggavagga (or Mahāvagga). It is likely that the Buddha was referring to the earliest recension of this text. They are found as a summary of the Buddha’s teachings at DN 29:17.3, MN 103:3.2, MN 104:5.3, and AN 8.19:17.2 = Ud 5.5:25.2.

397. This is perhaps the briefest summary possible of the Buddha’s teaching. The world as it is, and all the beings in it, are created and sustained through conditions. Since the conditions that sustain them are finite, the conditioned phenomena are also finite and must come to an end. Reflecting on this gives rise to gratitude for the life we have and the opportunities it grants us, and determination to live and practice dedicated to the realization of the unconditioned, Nibbāna.

That is what the Buddha said. Then the Holy One, the Teacher, 3.51.7
went on to say:

“I’ve reached a ripe old age,³⁹⁸ 3.51.9
and little of my life is left.
Having given it up, I’ll depart;
I’ve made a refuge for myself.

Diligent and mindful, 3.51.13
be of good virtues, mendicants!
With well-settled thoughts,³⁹⁹
take good care of your minds.

Whoever meditates diligently 3.51.17
in this teaching and training,
giving up transmigration through rebirths,
will make an end to suffering.”

The third recitation section.

21. The Elephant Look

Then the Buddha robed up in the morning and, taking his bowl and 4.1.1
robe, entered Vesāli for alms. Then, after the meal, on his return from
almsround, he turned to gaze back at Vesāli, the way that elephants
do. He said to Venerable Ānanda:⁴⁰⁰ “Ānanda, this will be the last

398. “Ripe old age” is *paripakko vayo*.

399. “Well-settled thoughts” is *susamāhitasāṅkappā*. Compare *asamāhitasāṅkappa* at AN 4.22:5.3.

400. *Nāgāpalokitaṃ* is the “elephant look”. There is a similar Sanskrit term *siṃhāvalokana*, the “lion look”, said to be the slow glance back that a lion makes as he leaves his kill. There is a nuance in meaning here, because while *apalokana* literally means to “look back”, it is used in the sense to “take leave” before setting out on a journey.

time the Realized One sees Vesālī. Come, Ānanda, let's go to Wares Village."⁴⁰¹

4.1.5 "Yes, sir," Ānanda replied.

4.2.1 Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants arrived at Wares Village, and stayed there. There the Buddha addressed the mendicants:

4.2.4 "Mendicants, due to not understanding and not penetrating four things, both you and I have wandered and transmigrated for such a very long time. What four? Noble ethics,⁴⁰² immersion, wisdom, and freedom. These noble ethics, immersion, wisdom, and freedom have been understood and comprehended. Craving for continued existence has been cut off; the leash to existence is ended; now there'll be no more future lives."

4.3.1 That is what the Buddha said. Then the Holy One, the Teacher, went on to say:

4.3.3 "Ethics, immersion, and wisdom,
and the supreme freedom:
these things have been understood
by Gotama the renowned.

4.3.7 And so the Buddha, having insight,⁴⁰³
explained this teaching to the mendicants.
The teacher made an end of suffering,
seeing clearly, he is fully quenched."⁴⁰⁴

401. *Bhaṇḍagāma*, where *bhaṇḍa* means "wares"; it must have been a trading post. It seems the villages in this passage were named after their chief economic activity, so I translate them to highlight this pragmatic system.

402. These four also found at AN 4.1:2.3 and AN 7.66:14.4.

403. Here the text refers to the Buddha in the third person; compare the previous set of verses in first person. Although the text states that these verses were spoken by the Buddha, it is possible that, as with many similar cases especially in the *Aṅguttaranikāya*, the verses were added by redactors.

404. Note the use of "quenched" (*parinibbuto*) here while the Buddha is still alive.

And while staying there, too, he often gave this Dhamma talk to the mendicants: 4.4.1

“Such is ethics, such is immersion, such is wisdom. When immersion is imbued with ethics it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When wisdom is imbued with immersion it’s very fruitful and beneficial. When the mind is imbued with wisdom it is rightly freed from the defilements, namely, the defilements of sensuality, desire to be reborn, and ignorance.” 4.4.2

22. The Four Great References

When the Buddha had stayed in Wares Village as long as he pleased, he addressed Ānanda, “Come, Ānanda, let’s go to Elephant Village.” 4.5.1
...⁴⁰⁵

“Let’s go to Mango Village.” ...⁴⁰⁶ 4.5.3

“Let’s go to Black Plum Village.” ...⁴⁰⁷ 4.5.4

“Let’s go to Bhoga City.”⁴⁰⁸ 4.5.5

“Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants arrived at Bhoga City, where he stayed at the Ānanda Shrine. 4.6.1

There the Buddha addressed the mendicants: “Mendicants, I will teach you the four great references.⁴⁰⁹ Listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.” 4.7.2

“Yes, sir,” they replied. The Buddha said this: 4.7.5

405. *Hatthigāma*, probably a village which specialized in training elephants.

406. *Ambagāma*.

407. *Jambugāma*.

408. Departing from the economic naming scheme, here *bhoga* does not mean “wealth”. Rather, the Bhogas were one of the clans of the Vajji Federation.

409. “Great references” is *mahāpadesa*; also at AN 4.180. A different set of four *mahāpadesas* are Kd 1:40.1.1, which provide criteria by which mendicants may judge what is and is not allowable.

4.8.1 “Take a mendicant who says: ‘Reverend, I have heard and learned this in the presence of the Buddha:⁴¹⁰ this is the teaching, this is the training, this is the Teacher’s instruction.’⁴¹¹ You should neither approve nor reject that mendicant’s statement.⁴¹² Instead, having carefully memorized those words and phrases, you should make sure they fit in the discourse and are exhibited in the training.⁴¹³ If they do not fit in the discourse and are not exhibited in the training, you should draw the conclusion:⁴¹⁴ ‘Clearly this is not the word of the Buddha. It has been incorrectly memorized by that mendicant.’ And so you should discard it. If they do fit in the discourse and are

410. The phrase used in the suttas when reporting a teaching heard directly from the Buddha, eg. SN 55.52:5.1, SN 22.90:9.1, MN 47:10.7, etc.

411. *Dhamma*, *vinaya*, and *satthusāsana* are used in the suttas in the general sense of the entirety of the Buddha’s teachings. In his advice to Mahāpajāpati (AN 8.53) and Upāli (AN 7.83), they are said to be whatever conforms with letting go. A stream-enterer who is a lay person is grounded in them (AN 6.16:7.2). They are more frequent in the Vinaya, being used as a general qualifier of a legitimate legal procedure (Bu Pc 63:2.1.8). Due to this, the fact that there are three items, and the fact that *dhamma* and *sutta* are different words, we should not take *dhamma* and *vinaya* here as equivalent to *sutta* and *vinaya* below. Rather, they are a general claim to authenticity and do not specify particular texts.

412. As at MN 112:3.1, DN 29:18.4, and AN 4.180:2.5.

413. It is tempting to assume that *sutta* here means the Suttapiṭaka and *vinaya* means the Vinayapiṭaka, or at least an earlier version of these texts; but this is not supported by tradition. The late canonical Netti explains *sutta* as “the four noble truths” and *vinaya* as “the removal of greed, hate, and delusion” (Ne 6). The commentaries discuss many interpretations; ultimately they agree with the Netti for *vinaya*, but say *sutta* means the entire Tipiṭaka. I think the Netti is correct: teachings should “fit in” with the four noble truths (like other footprints fit in to an elephant’s footprint, MN 28), and they should “be exhibited” in that the results of practice should be apparent (*sandiṭṭhika*). | “Memorize” (*uggahetvā*), because in an oral tradition a text is not learned until it is known by heart; such claims must be taken seriously. | “Fit into” is *osāreti* or *otāreti* per AN 4.180; the two words have a similar meaning, “to flow down into”.

414. The text has *ca* (“and”) rather than *vā* (“or”), which would be expected if they were to be found in one or other textual collection. This is urging that any teaching fits in with the fundamental principles of the four noble truths, and is effective in removing defilements.

exhibited in the training, you should draw the conclusion: 'Clearly this is the word of the Buddha. It has been correctly memorized by that mendicant.' You should remember it. This is the first great reference.⁴¹⁵

Take another mendicant who says: 'In such-and-such monastery 4.9.1
lives a Saṅgha with seniors and leaders.⁴¹⁶ I've heard and learned this in the presence of that Saṅgha: this is the teaching, this is the training, this is the Teacher's instruction.' You should neither approve nor reject that mendicant's statement. Instead, having carefully memorized those words and phrases, you should make sure they fit in the discourse and are exhibited in the training. If they do not fit in the discourse and are not exhibited in the training, you should draw the conclusion: 'Clearly this is not the word of the Buddha. It has been incorrectly memorized by that Saṅgha.' And so you should discard it. If they do fit in the discourse and are exhibited in the training, you should draw the conclusion: 'Clearly this is the word of the Buddha. It has been correctly memorized by that Saṅgha.' You should remember it. This is the second great reference.

Take another mendicant who says: 'In such-and-such monastery 4.10.1
there are several senior mendicants who are very learned, inheritors of the heritage, who have memorized the teachings, the monastic

415. The Pali text appears to say that one should remember the *mahāpadesa*, whereas the Sanskrit clearly says one should remember the passage (*ayaṃ dharmo'yaṃ vinaya idaṃ śāstuḥ śāsanam iti viditvā dhārayitavyāḥ*). It seems as if this pattern should underlie the Pali too, for if the passage is false, one "should discard it" (*chaḍḍeyyātha*). In the case of a correct passage we should expect a parallel injunction that one "should remember it" (*dhāreyyātha*). But if this applies to the *mahāpadesa* there is no such injunction. Thus it seems as if the Sanskrit is correct here and the Pali corrupt. I restore it by reversing the order of the phrases.

416. Each of the four references is a little less solid than the previous. Here one hasn't heard from the Buddha, but from the Saṅgha. The fact that one hears it from the Saṅgha implies a kind of formal group recitation such as a *saṅgīti* or "council".

law, and the outlines.⁴¹⁷ I’ve heard and learned this in the presence of those senior mendicants: this is the teaching, this is the training, this is the Teacher’s instruction.’ You should neither approve nor reject that mendicant’s statement. Instead, having carefully memorized those words and phrases, you should make sure they fit in the discourse and are exhibited in the training. If they do not fit in the discourse and are not exhibited in the training, you should draw the conclusion: ‘Clearly this is not the word of the Buddha. It has not been correctly memorized by those senior mendicants.’ And so you should discard it. If they do fit in the discourse and are exhibited in the training, you should draw the conclusion: ‘Clearly this is the word of the Buddha. It has been correctly memorized by those senior mendicants.’ You should remember it. This is the third great reference.

- 4.11.1 Take another mendicant who says: ‘In such-and-such monastery there is a single senior mendicant who is very learned, an inheritor of the heritage, who has memorized the teachings, the monastic law, and the outlines.⁴¹⁸ I’ve heard and learned this in the presence of that senior mendicant: this is the teaching, this is the training, this is the Teacher’s instruction.’ You should neither approve nor reject that mendicant’s statement. Instead, having carefully memorized those words and phrases, you should make sure they fit in the discourse and are exhibited in the training. If they do not fit in the discourse and

417. Now one learns not from a unified Saṅgha, but from several learned elders. This is a stock description of learned mendicants (eg. AN 3.20:6.2). | “Inheritors of the heritage” is *āgatāgamā*, where *āgama* means “what has come down”, namely the scriptural heritage. *Āgama* is a synonym for *nikāya* in the sense of “collection of scripture”. | The “outlines” (*mātikā*, literally “matrix”) are the summary outlines of topics that served as seeds for the development of Abhidhamma. DN 16:3.50.5 features one of the earliest of such lists, the 37 path factors that the Buddha “taught from his own direct knowledge”. These serve as outline for the section on the path in the Saṃyutta, from where they were adopted in various Abhidhamma texts such as the Vibhaṅga.

418. Finally the testimony of a single mendicant, which is the weakest of all. Nonetheless, the procedure is the same.

are not exhibited in the training, you should draw the conclusion: 'Clearly this is not the word of the Buddha. It has been incorrectly memorized by that senior mendicant.' And so you should discard it. If they do fit in the discourse and are exhibited in the training, you should draw the conclusion: 'Clearly this is the word of the Buddha. It has been correctly memorized by that senior mendicant.' You should remember it. This is the fourth great reference.

These are the four great references."⁴¹⁹ 4.11.15

And while staying at the Ānanda Shrine, too, the Buddha often gave this Dhamma talk to the mendicants: 4.12.1

"Such is ethics, such is immersion, such is wisdom. When immersion is imbued with ethics it's very fruitful and beneficial. When wisdom is imbued with immersion it's very fruitful and beneficial. When the mind is imbued with wisdom it is rightly freed from the defilements, namely, the defilements of sensuality, desire to be reborn, and ignorance." 4.12.2

23. On Cunda the Smith

When the Buddha had stayed in Bhoga City as long as he pleased, he addressed Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, let's go to Pāvā."⁴²⁰ 4.13.1

419. The parallel at AN 4.180:9.11 omits *dhāreyyāthā*, which I take to be the correct reading. See my note on *dhāreyyāthā* at DN 16:4.8.13.

420. Pāvā, a town of the Mallas, has more significance for this narrative than appears at first sight. It was, according to Buddhist texts, the place where Mahāvira had recently died, plunging the Jains into chaos. (The Jains, however, say this was another Pāvā, east of Nālandā.) Pāvā became associated with especially ascetic monks: thirty Pāvā monks became awakened on hearing a particularly strong discourse (SN 15.13); Mahākassapa heard the news of the Buddha's passing at Pāvā; and monks from Pāvā allied with monks of "Avanti and the south" arguing for strict Vinaya in the Second Council (Kd 22:1.7.11.1).

- 4.13.3 “Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants arrived at Pāvā,⁴²¹ where he stayed in Cunda the smith’s mango grove.⁴²²
- 4.14.1 Cunda heard that the Buddha had arrived and was staying in his mango grove. Then he went to the Buddha, bowed, and sat down to one side. The Buddha educated, encouraged, fired up, and inspired him with a Dhamma talk.⁴²³ Then Cunda said to the Buddha, “Sir, would the Buddha, together with the mendicant Saṅgha, please accept tomorrow’s meal from me?” The Buddha consented with silence.
- 4.16.1 Then, knowing that the Buddha had consented, Cunda rose from his seat, bowed, and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on his right, before leaving.
- 4.17.1 And when the night had passed Cunda had delicious fresh and cooked foods prepared in his own home, and plenty of pork on the turn. Then he had the Buddha informed of the time, saying,⁴²⁴ “Sir, it’s time. The meal is ready.”
- 4.18.1 Then the Buddha robed up in the morning and, taking his bowl and robe, went to the home of Cunda together with the mendicant Saṅgha, where he sat down on the seat spread out and addressed Cunda, “Cunda, please serve me with the pork on the turn that

421. This passage also at Ud 8.5.

422. Cunda was apparently a metal-worker, which was an advanced form of technological craftsmanship.

423. This is, according to the commentary, preserved as the other discourse taught to Cunda, which deals with proper asceticism (Sn̐p 1.5).

424. The exact meaning of *sūkaramaddava* is unclear. *Sūkara* is “pig”, but some Chinese translations suggest the sense “mushroom”; and it is true that there are several names of plants or plant dishes that begin with *sūkara* or other animals. At Dh̐p 377, flowers are described as *maddava*, meaning “overripe, withering on the vine”. It is a common practice to allow meat to sit for a while to become tender and “high” for extra flavor when cooked. But this can lead to a proliferation of dangerous bacteria unless properly cooked, and such seems to have been the case here. In any case, this disputed term is marginal in a consideration of meat-eating in early Buddhism, which is discussed more fully elsewhere.

you've prepared.⁴²⁵ And serve the mendicant Saṅgha with the other foods."

"Yes, sir," replied Cunda, and did as he was asked. 4.18.5

Then the Buddha addressed Cunda, "Cunda, any pork on the turn that's left over, you should bury it in a pit. I don't see anyone in this world—with its gods, Māras, and divinities, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its gods and humans—who could properly digest it except the Realized One." 4.19.1

"Yes, sir," replied Cunda. He did as he was asked, then came back to the Buddha, bowed, and sat down to one side. Then the Buddha educated, encouraged, fired up, and inspired him with a Dhamma talk, after which he rose from his seat and left. 4.19.4

After the Buddha had eaten Cunda's meal, he fell severely ill with bloody dysentery, struck by dreadful pains, close to death.⁴²⁶ But he endured unbothered, with mindfulness and situational awareness. Then he addressed Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, let's go to Kusinārā." 4.20.1

"Yes, sir," Ānanda replied. 4.20.5

I've heard that after eating⁴²⁷
the meal of Cunda the smith,
the attentive one fell severely ill,
with pains, close to death. 4.20.6

A severe sickness struck the Teacher
who had eaten the pork on the turn. 4.20.10

While still purging the Buddha said:
"I'll go to the citadel of Kusinārā."

425. If the Buddha knew the meal was dangerous, why ask to be served it? This is even more striking in light of the fact that it is a Vinaya offense to request fine food, including meat, and nowhere else is such a request recorded (Bu Pc 39:2.10.1). Such narrative ambiguities serve to escalate a sense of wonder.

426. The Buddha's illness is sometimes diagnosed as mesenteric infarction. The Buddha's body rejects the world of conditioned existence entirely.

427. The commentary says that these verses were added by the elders at the Council.

24. Bringing a Drink

- 4.21.1 Then the Buddha left the road and went to the root of a certain tree, where he addressed Ānanda, “Go on then, Ānanda, fold my outer robe in four and spread it out for me. I am tired and will sit down.”⁴²⁸
- 4.21.3 “Yes, sir,” replied Ānanda, and did as he was asked. The Buddha sat down on the seat spread out.
- 4.22.1 When he was seated he said to Venerable Ānanda, “Go on then, Ānanda, fetch me some water. I am thirsty and will drink.”⁴²⁹
- 4.22.3 When he said this, Venerable Ānanda said to the Buddha, “Sir, just now around five hundred carts have passed by. The shallow water has been churned up by their wheels, and it flows cloudy and murky. The Kakudhā River is not far away, with clear, sweet, cool water, clean, with smooth banks, delightful. There the Buddha can drink and cool his limbs.”⁴³⁰
- 4.23.1 For a second time, the Buddha asked Ānanda for a drink, and for a second time Ānanda suggested going to the Kakudhā River.
- 4.24.1 And for a third time, the Buddha said to Ānanda, “Go on then, Ānanda, fetch me some water. I am thirsty and will drink.”
- 4.24.3 “Yes, sir,” replied Ānanda. Taking his bowl he went to the river.⁴³¹ Now, though the shallow water in that creek had been churned up by wheels, and flowed cloudy and murky, when Ānanda approached it flowed transparent, clear, and unclouded.
- 4.25.1 Then Ānanda thought, “Oh lord, how incredible, how amazing! The Realized One has such psychic power and might! For though the shallow water in that creek had been churned up by wheels, and flowed cloudy and murky, when I approached it flowed transparent,

428. The *saṅghāṭi* (“outer robe” or “cloak”) is double-layered, and served both for warmth and as bedding. The Buddha has not recovered fully from his illness.

429. The Buddha was an exemplary patient. He did not complain, but made his needs known clearly to his carer.

430. It would seem that, since the Buddha was enduring his illness without complaint and with dignity, Ānanda did not fully realize how weak he has become.

431. The bowl (*patta*) was used both for eating and drinking.

clear, and unclouded.” Gathering a bowl of drinking water he went back to the Buddha, and said to him, “It’s incredible, sir, it’s amazing! The Realized One has such psychic power and might! Just now, though the shallow water in that creek had been churned up by wheels, and flowed cloudy and murky, when I approached it flowed transparent, clear, and unclouded. Drink the water, Blessed One! Drink the water, Holy One!” So the Buddha drank the water.

25. On Pukkusa the Malla

Now at that time Pukkusa the Malla, a disciple of Āḷāra Kālāma, was traveling along the road from Kusinārā to Pāvā.⁴³² He saw the Buddha sitting at the root of a certain tree. He went up to him, bowed, sat down to one side, and said, “It’s incredible, sir, it’s amazing! Those who have gone forth remain in such peaceful meditations. 4.26.1

Once it so happened that Āḷāra Kālāma, while traveling along a road, left the road and sat at the root of a nearby tree for the day’s meditation. Then around five hundred carts passed by right beside Āḷāra Kālāma.⁴³³ Then a certain person coming behind those carts went up to Āḷāra Kālāma and said to him: ‘Sir, didn’t you see the five hundred carts pass by?’⁴³⁴ 4.27.1

‘No, respectable sir, I didn’t see them.’ 4.27.5

‘But sir, didn’t you hear a sound?’ 4.27.6

‘No, respectable sir, I didn’t hear a sound.’ 4.27.7

‘But sir, were you asleep?’ 4.27.8

‘No, respectable sir, I wasn’t asleep.’ 4.27.9

‘But sir, were you conscious?’ 4.27.10

432. Pukkusa is not elsewhere mentioned. The reference to Āḷāra Kālāma recalls the narrative of the bodhisatta’s practices before awakening. There are several details that indicate the stories of the first part and the last part of the Buddha’s life were unified by such callbacks. We meet the Malla clan later on.

433. *Nisraya* in the sense of “near” occurs at Śatapathabrāhmaṇa 3.1.2.17.

434. In deep meditation the senses cease to function.

- 4.27.11 ‘Yes, respectable sir.’ ‘So, sir, while conscious and awake you neither saw nor heard a sound as five hundred carts passed by right beside you? Why sir, even your outer robe is covered with dust!’⁴³⁵
- 4.27.14 ‘Yes, respectable sir.’
- 4.27.15 Then that person thought: ‘Oh lord, how incredible, how amazing! Those who have gone forth remain in such peaceful meditations, in that, while conscious and awake he neither saw nor heard a sound as five hundred carts passed by right next to him.’ And after declaring his lofty confidence in Ālāra Kālāma, he left.”
- 4.28.1 “What do you think, Pukkusa? Which is harder and more challenging to do while conscious and awake: to neither see nor hear a sound as five hundred carts pass by right next to you? Or to neither see nor hear a sound as the heavens are raining and pouring, lightning’s flashing, and thunder’s cracking?”
- 4.29.1 “What do five hundred carts matter, or six hundred, or seven hundred, or eight hundred, or nine hundred, or a thousand, or even a hundred thousand carts? It’s far harder and more challenging to neither see nor hear a sound as the heavens are raining and pouring, lightning’s flashing, and thunder’s cracking!”
- 4.30.1 “This one time, Pukkusa, I was staying near Ātumā in a threshing-hut.⁴³⁶ At that time the heavens were raining and pouring, lightning was flashing, and thunder was cracking. And not far from the threshing-hut two farmers who were brothers were killed, as well as four oxen. Then a large crowd came from Ātumā to the place where that happened.
- 4.31.1 Now at that time I came out of the threshing-hut and was walking mindfully in the open near the door of the hut. Then having left that crowd, a certain person approached me, bowed, and stood to one side. I said to them, ‘Why, respectable sir, has this crowd gathered?’
- 4.32.2 ‘Just now, sir, the heavens were raining and pouring, lightning was flashing, and thunder was cracking. And two farmers who were

435. As were Mahāpajāpati’s limbs (AN 8.51).

436. A nearby town where the Buddha had stayed previously (Kd 1:37.4.2).

brothers were killed, as well as four oxen. Then this crowd gathered here. But sir, where were you?’

‘I was right here, respectable sir.’ 4.32.5

‘But sir, did you see?’ 4.32.6

‘No, respectable sir, I didn’t see anything.’ 4.32.7

‘But sir, didn’t you hear a sound?’ 4.32.8

‘No, respectable sir, I didn’t hear a sound.’ 4.32.9

‘But sir, were you asleep?’ 4.32.10

‘No, respectable sir, I wasn’t asleep.’ 4.32.11

‘But sir, were you conscious?’ 4.32.12

‘Yes, respectable sir.’ 4.32.13

‘So, sir, while conscious and awake you neither saw nor heard a sound as the heavens were raining and pouring, lightning was flashing, and thunder was cracking?’ 4.32.14

‘Yes, respectable sir.’ 4.32.15

Then that person thought: ‘Oh lord, how incredible, how amazing! Those who have gone forth remain in such peaceful meditations, in that, while conscious and awake he neither saw nor heard a sound as the heavens were raining and pouring, lightning was flashing, and thunder was cracking.’ And after declaring their lofty confidence in me, they bowed and respectfully circled me, keeping me on their right, before leaving.” 4.33.1

When he said this, Pukkusa said to him, “Any confidence I had in Ālāra Kālāma I whisk away as in a strong wind, or glide away as down a swift stream. Excellent, sir! Excellent! As if he were righting the overturned, or revealing the hidden, or pointing out the path to the lost, or lighting a lamp in the dark so people with clear eyes can see what’s there, the Buddha has made the teaching clear in many ways. I go for refuge to the Buddha, to the teaching, and to the mendicant Saṅgha. From this day forth, may the Buddha remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.” 4.34.1

- 4.35.1 Then Pukkusa addressed a certain man, “Go on then, lad, fetch me a pair of ready to wear garments the color of mountain gold.”⁴³⁷
- 4.35.3 “Yes, sir,” replied that man, and did as he was asked. Then Pukkusa brought the garments to the Buddha, “Sir, please accept this pair of ready to wear garments the color of mountain gold from me out of sympathy.”
- 4.35.6 “Well then, Pukkusa, clothe me in one, and Ānanda in the other.”
- 4.35.7 “Yes, sir,” replied Pukkusa, and did so.
- 4.36.1 Then the Buddha educated, encouraged, fired up, and inspired Pukkusa the Malla with a Dhamma talk, after which he got up from his seat, bowed, and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on his right, before leaving.
- 4.37.1 Then, not long after Pukkusa had left, Ānanda placed the pair of garments the color of mountain gold by the Buddha’s body. But when placed by the Buddha’s body they seemed to lose their sheen. Then Ānanda said to the Buddha, “It’s incredible, sir, it’s amazing, how pure and bright is the color of the Realized One’s skin. When this pair of ready to wear garments the color of mountain gold is placed by the Buddha’s body they seem to lose their sheen.”
- 4.37.6 “That’s so true, Ānanda, that’s so true! There are two times when the color of the Realized One’s skin becomes extra pure and bright. What two? The night when a Realized One awakens to the supreme perfect awakening; and the night he becomes fully extinguished in the element of extinguishment with no residue.”⁴³⁸ These are the two times when the color of the Realized One’s skin becomes extra pure and bright.
- 4.38.4 Today, Ānanda, in the last watch of the night, between a pair of sal trees in the sal forest of the Mallas at Upavattana near Kusinārā,

437. *Singīvaṇṇa*, or else *siṅgīsuvaṇṇa* (AN 3.70:38.3), is gold from a mountain peak (*siṅgī*). Kauṭilya mentions a form of gold that is *śṛṅgaśūktija*, “occurring on mount Śūkti” (Arthaśāstra 2.13.3). The commentary to that passage says it had the color of red arsenic, so it would have been a rose gold color.

438. Closing the narrative circle with the story of awakening.

shall be the Realized One's full extinguishment. Come, Ānanda, let's go to the Kakudhā River."

"Yes, sir," Ānanda replied.

4.38.6

A pair of garments the color of mountain gold⁴³⁹
was presented by Pukkusa;
when the Teacher was clothed with them,
his snow gold skin glowed bright.

4.38.7

Then the Buddha together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants went to the Kakudhā River. He plunged into the river and bathed and drank. And when he had emerged, he went to the mango grove, where he addressed Venerable Cundaka,⁴⁴⁰ "Go on then, Cundaka, fold my outer robe in four and spread it out for me. I am tired and will lie down."

4.39.1

"Yes, sir," replied Cundaka, and did as he was asked. And then the Buddha laid down in the lion's posture—on the right side, placing one foot on top of the other—mindful and aware, and focused on

4.40.1

439. The commentary says this verse was added by the senior monks at the Council.

440. The monk Cundaka makes an abrupt appearance here; this is the only mention of this name. The commentary to this passage calls him *cunda*, while the gloss to the parallel passage at Ud 8.5:14.3 has *cundaka* throughout. The diminutive ending *-ka* is perhaps meant to differentiate him from the smith Cunda. There are various Cundas whose connection is unclear. Mahācunda was one of the great disciples (MN 8, MN 118, AN 6.17), who later brought the Dhamma to the land of the Cetīs (AN 6.46, AN 10.24). He once stayed with Channa and Sāriputta (MN 144:4.1, SN 35.87:1.2); the commentaries say he was in fact Sāriputta's younger brother. They also identify him with the "novice Cunda" who reported the deaths of Sāriputta (SN 47.13:1.3) and Mahāvira (DN 29:2.1, MN 104:3.1), explaining that the title "novice" was a nickname that persisted from the time he ordained as a young novice. It is unclear whether the commentaries take the Cundaka of this passage to be the same person, but he is here performing a similar role as carer adjacent to the Buddha's death. Later there appears a Cūlacunda (Tha Ap 52:13.3). Thus there may have been one person known by different names, or several people whose stories have become conflated.

the time of getting up. But Cundaka sat down right there in front of the Buddha.

- 4.41.1 Having gone to Kakudhā Creek,⁴⁴¹
 whose water was transparent, sweet, and clear,
 the Teacher, being tired, plunged in,
 the Realized One, without compare in the world.
- 4.41.5 And after bathing and drinking the Teacher emerged.
 Before the group of mendicants, in the middle,
 the Buddha,
 the Teacher
 who rolled forth the present dispensation,⁴⁴²
 the great seer went to the mango grove.
- 4.41.9 He addressed the mendicant named Cundaka:
 “Spread out my folded robe so I can lie down.”
 The evolved one urged Cunda,
 who quickly spread the folded robe.
 The Teacher lay down so tired,
 while Cunda sat there before him.

- 4.42.1 Then the Buddha said to Venerable Ānanda:
- 4.42.2 “Now it may happen, Ānanda, that someone may give rise to regret in Cunda the smith: ‘It’s your loss, respected Cunda, it’s your misfortune, in that the Realized One was fully quenched after eating his last almsmeal from you.’⁴⁴³ You should dispel remorse in Cunda the smith like this: ‘You’re fortunate, respected Cunda, you’re so very fortunate, in that the Realized One was fully quenched after eating his last almsmeal from you. I have heard and learned this in the presence of the Buddha.’

441. These verses were also added at the Council according to the commentary.

442. Adopt PTS and BJT reading *satthā pavattā*.

443. The text addresses Cunda with the respectful *āvuso*.

There are two almsmeal offerings that have identical fruit and result, and are more fruitful and beneficial than other almsmeal offerings.⁴⁴⁴ What two? The almsmeal after eating which a Realized One awakens to the supreme perfect awakening; and the almsmeal after eating which he becomes fully extinguished in the element of extinguishment with no residue. These two almsmeal offerings have identical fruit and result, and are more fruitful and beneficial than other almsmeal offerings. 4.42.8

You've accumulated a deed that leads to long life, beauty, happiness, fame, heaven, and sovereignty.⁴⁴⁵ That's how you should dispel remorse in Cunda the smith." 4.42.12

Then, understanding this matter, on that occasion the Buddha expressed this heartfelt sentiment: 4.43.1

"A giver's merit grows;⁴⁴⁶
enmity doesn't build up when you have self-control.
A skillful person gives up bad things—
with the end of greed, hate, and delusion,
they're quenched." 4.43.2

The fourth recitation section.

26. The Pair of Sal Trees

Then the Buddha said to Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, let's go to the far shore of the Golden River, and on to the sal forest of the Mallas at Upavattana near Kusinārā."⁴⁴⁷ 5.1.1

"Yes, sir," Ānanda replied. And that's where they went. Then the Buddha addressed Ānanda, "Go on then, Ānanda, set up a cot for 5.1.3

444. Again, the narrative circle.

445. The text uses *āyasmā* here for Cunda, as does the Sanskrit, whereas it is normally reserved for mendicants (see below, DN 16:6.2.1).

446. This became a point of discussion in later Buddhism: can it be that the merit of a gift grows after it is given?

447. Known today as Kushinagar, it is a popular site for pilgrims, with many ancient stupas, Buddha images, and a peaceful park for meditation.

me between the twin sal trees, with my head to the north. I am tired and will lie down.”

5.1.6 “Yes, sir,” replied Ānanda, and did as he was asked. And then the Buddha laid down in the lion’s posture—on the right side, placing one foot on top of the other—mindful and aware.⁴⁴⁸

5.2.1 Now at that time the twin sal trees were in full blossom with flowers out of season.⁴⁴⁹ They sprinkled and bestrewed the Realized One’s body in honor of the Realized One. And the flowers of the heavenly Flame Tree fell from the sky, and they too sprinkled and bestrewed the Realized One’s body in honor of the Realized One. And heavenly sandalwood powder fell from the sky, and it too sprinkled and bestrewed the Realized One’s body in honor of the Realized One. And heavenly music played in midair in honor of the Realized One. And heavenly choirs sang in midair in honor of the Realized One.

5.3.1 Then the Buddha pointed out to Ānanda what was happening, adding: “That’s not the full extent of how the Realized One is honored, respected, revered, venerated, and esteemed. Any monk or nun or male or female lay follower who practices in line with the teaching, practicing properly, living in line with the teaching—they honor, respect, revere, venerate, and esteem the Realized One with the highest honor.⁴⁵⁰ So Ānanda, you should train like this: ‘We shall practice in line with the teaching, practicing properly, living in line with the teaching.’”⁴⁵¹

448. Normally when the Buddha lies down, his mind is focused on getting up. But now he knows that he will not rise again.

449. Sal trees blossom in April/May. This detail agrees with the Buddha’s final extinguishment in December/January, rather than in May (Vesak) as is currently celebrated (see note to DN 16:3.9.3).

450. This calls back to the description of the fourfold assembly in the Māra section above (DN 16:3.7.4).

451. This kind of narrative elevation is characteristic of the Buddha’s teaching. He did not try to deny or eliminate any belief in the miraculous, or in the power of devotion, but rather to show that such things were of limited worth compared with practice.

27. The Monk Upavāṇa

Now at that time Venerable Upavāṇa was standing in front of the Buddha fanning him.⁴⁵² Then the Buddha made him move, “Move over, mendicant, don’t stand in front of me.” 5.4.1

Ānanda thought, “This Venerable Upavāṇa has been the Buddha’s attendant for a long time, close to him, living in his presence.⁴⁵³ Yet in his final hour the Buddha makes him move, saying: ‘Move over, mendicant, don’t stand in front of me.’ What is the cause, what is the reason for this?” 5.4.4

Then Ānanda said to the Buddha, “This Venerable Upavāṇa has been the Buddha’s attendant for a long time, close to him, living in his presence. Yet in his final hour the Buddha makes him move, saying: ‘Move over, mendicant, don’t stand in front of me.’ What is the cause, sir, what is the reason for this?” 5.5.1

“Most of the deities from ten solar systems have gathered to see the Realized One. For twelve leagues all around this sal grove there’s no spot, not even a fraction of a hair’s tip, that’s not crowded full of illustrious deities.⁴⁵⁴ The deities are complaining: ‘We’ve come such a long way to see the Realized One! Only rarely do Realized Ones arise in the world, perfected ones, fully awakened Buddhas. This very day, in the last watch of the night, the Realized One will be fully extinguished. And this illustrious mendicant is standing in front of the Buddha blocking the view. We won’t get to see the Realized One in his final hour!’” 5.5.7

“But sir, what kind of deities are you thinking of?” 5.6.1

“There are, Ānanda, deities—both in space and on the earth—who are aware of the earth. With hair disheveled and arms raised, 5.6.2

452. Like Cundaka above, Upavāṇa shares the duties of an attendant with Ānanda; at DN 29:41.1 he is also fanning the Buddha. At AN 5.166, Ānanda goes to Upavāṇa for support when he feels he has disappointed the Buddha.

453. In SN 7.13 Upavāṇa fetched hot water and molasses for the Buddha, an event he remembered in his own verses at Thag 2.33.

454. For this usage of *phuṭṭo*, see AN 3.56:1.3.

they fall down like their feet were chopped off, rolling back and forth, lamenting:⁴⁵⁵ ‘Too soon the Blessed One will be fully extinguished! Too soon the Holy One will be fully extinguished! Too soon the Eye of the World will vanish!’⁴⁵⁶

5.6.6 But the deities who are free of desire endure, mindful and aware, thinking: ‘Conditions are impermanent. How could it possibly be otherwise?’⁴⁵⁷

28. The Four Inspiring Places

5.7.1 “Previously, sir, when mendicants had completed the rainy season residence in various districts they came to see the Realized One.⁴⁵⁸ We got to see the esteemed mendicants, and to pay homage to them.⁴⁵⁹ But when the Buddha has passed, we won’t get to see the esteemed mendicants or to pay homage to them.”

455. Elsewhere, *pathaviṣaṇṇī* refers to those who develop a form of meditation where they are “percipient of earth” (AN 10.6:1.2). Here, however, it simply means those deities who are aware of events on the ground. | Read *chinnampādam viya papatanti*.

456. The Buddha as “eye” evokes the common (eg. Rig Veda 1.164.14, 5.40.8, 5.59.5, 10.10.9) Vedic image of the Sun as the “eye of all” (*viśvacakṣāḥ*, 7.63.1), the “eye” for “eyes to see” (10.158.4), moving as an unaging wheel through the sky (1.164.14). See Snp 3.9:11.1 = MN 98:7.23. | Pali has *cakkhum loke* (“eye in the world”), Sanskrit has *cakṣur lokasya* (“eye of the world”).

457. These two reactions—grief and equanimity—are depicted often in Buddhist art and narrative. They stimulated the two poles of development of the Buddhist community. The devotional tradition, feeling the need for an emotional connection with the Teacher, developed art, story, and doctrines to, as it were, keep him alive, resulting in the Jātakas and the Bodhisattva doctrine. A cooler, rational tradition developed a comprehensive system analyzing the impermanence of “conditions”, leading to the Abhidhamma.

458. As for example at MN 24:2.1.

459. *Manobhāvanīya* is explained in the commentaries as “those who, when seen, cause the mind to grow in what is skillful.”

“Ānanda, a faithful gentleman should go to see these four inspiring places.⁴⁶⁰ What four? Thinking: ‘Here the Realized One was born!’—that is an inspiring place.⁴⁶¹ Thinking: ‘Here the Realized One became awakened as a supreme fully awakened Buddha!’—that is an inspiring place.⁴⁶² Thinking: ‘Here the supreme Wheel of Dhamma was rolled forth by the Realized One!’—that is an inspiring place.⁴⁶³ Thinking: ‘Here the Realized One was fully quenched in the element of extinguishment with no residue!’—that is an inspiring place.⁴⁶⁴ These are the four inspiring places that a faithful gentleman should go to see.

460. These four sites are the primary destinations of modern Buddhist pilgrims in India. | *Samvejaniya* is “stirring, provoking inspiration or urgency” such as when seeing an astonishing, disturbing, or amazing sight.

461. Lumbini in modern Nepal, which today is a well-maintained and quiet place for devotion and meditation. The site is marked with an Ashokan pillar dated perhaps 150 years after this time. On the pillar is inscribed in Brahmi characters *hida bhagavaṃ jāte ti*, which is a direct quote in Māgadhi of the Pali phrase here, *idha tathāgato jāto ti*. (*Tathāgata* “realized one” is how the Buddha referred to himself, while *bhagavā* “blessed one” is how his followers referred to him.) This is the oldest direct quote from the early canon preserved in the archaeological record.

462. Bodhgaya in modern Bihar, which is called Uruvelā in the Pali texts. It is a bustling center for pilgrims from all over the Buddhist world, at the center of which is the great stupa next to the Bodhi tree.

463. Isipatana is modern Sarnath, in the northern part of Varanasi on the Ganges. In the temple next to the park, the first sermon is recited every night. | Note the passive voice, whereas the parallel at AN 4.118 is active.

464. The phrase *nibbānadhātuyā parinibbuto*, “fully quenched in the element of extinguishment” shows how the Pali uses two roots simultaneously for Nibbāna. The better-known term, *nibbāna* (Sanskrit *nirvāṇa*), is from the root *vā* (“to blow”), with the basic sense of going out through being deprived of air. The past participle form *nibbuta* (Sanskrit *nirvr̥ta*), from the root *var* (“to check or restrain”), has the basic sense of freedom from obstacles and constrictions. Generally, the Pali treats *nibbuta* as the past participle form of *nibbāna*, and for the most part the difference is purely verbal. Yet I believe the ambiguity is deliberate, as each captures a slightly different nuance of Nibbāna. “Quenched” means both to go out like a flame and to be satisfied like a thirst. This positive feel appears in Sanskrit passages using *nirvr̥ta*, such as Manusmṛti 1.54, where it describes the blissful absorption of all beings into the great divinity. By using

- 5.8.8 Faithful monks, nuns, laymen, and laywomen will come, and think: ‘Here the Realized One was born!’ and ‘Here the Realized One became awakened as a supreme fully awakened Buddha!’ and ‘Here the supreme Wheel of Dhamma was rolled forth by the Realized One!’ and ‘Here the Realized One was fully quenched in the element of extinguishment with no residue!’ Anyone who passes away while on pilgrimage to these shrines will, when their body breaks up, after death, be reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.”

29. Ānanda’s Questions

- 5.9.1 “Sir, how do we proceed when it comes to ladies?”⁴⁶⁵
 5.9.2 “Without looking, Ānanda.”⁴⁶⁶
 5.9.3 “But when looking, how to proceed?”⁴⁶⁷
 5.9.4 “Without chatting, Ānanda.”⁴⁶⁸
 5.9.5 “But when chatting, how to proceed?”⁴⁶⁹

“extinguishment” for *nibbāna* and “quenched” for *nibbuta* I hope to express this subtle distinction, or at least to alert the reader that it exists.

465. This passage is absent from the Sanskrit parallel and it is probably a late interpolation. Ānanda was handsome, and many stories of his encounters with women are preserved, for example at Bu Pc 41:1.1.5.

466. As it stands, this appears to contradict MN 152:2.10, where the Buddha ridicules the idea that sense restraint implies not seeing. The commentary, however, explains it as not looking at a woman who is standing in the doorway of a monk’s hut, so as not to give rise to lust. Thus it restricts this apparently general rule to an unusually intimate encounter.

467. The verb changes from *paṭipajjāma* (first person plural) to *paṭipajjitabbam* (future passive participle), a shift that mirrors the following passage regarding the funeral proceedings. There, the shift to future passive participle indicates that the subject is the lay folk who carry out the funeral, whereas here that does not apply. This suggests that this passage has been derived from that later passage.

468. The commentary refers to AN 5.55:6.5, which speaks of chatting alone in private with a woman, a circumstance also dealt with in Bu Pc 45.

469. Ānanda does not hesitate to let the Buddha know he has no intention of following his advice.

"Be mindful, Ānanda."⁴⁷⁰

5.9.6

"Sir, how do we proceed when it comes to the Realized One's corpse?"⁴⁷¹

5.10.1

"Don't get involved in the rites for venerating the Realized One's corpse, Ānanda."⁴⁷² Please, Ānanda, you must all strive and practice for your heart's goal! Meditate diligent, keen, and resolute for your heart's goal!⁴⁷³ There are astute aristocrats, brahmins, and householders who are devoted to the Realized One. They will perform the rites for venerating the Realized One's corpse."

5.10.2

"But sir, how to proceed when it comes to the Realized One's corpse?"

5.11.1

"Proceed in the same way as they do for the corpse of a wheel-turning monarch."

5.11.2

"But how do they proceed with a wheel-turning monarch's corpse?"

5.11.3

"They wrap a wheel-turning monarch's corpse with unworn cloth, then with uncarded cotton, then again with unworn cloth. In this way they wrap the corpse with five hundred double-layers. Then they place it in an iron casket filled with oil and close it up with another casket. Then, having built a funeral pyre out of all kinds of aromatics, they cremate the corpse."⁴⁷⁴ They build a monument for the wheel-turning monarch at the crossroads.⁴⁷⁵ That's how they proceed with

5.11.4

470. The commentary says, quoting SN 35.127:1.6, that when a woman has sincere motivations, one should speak while thinking of them as a mother, a sister, or a daughter.

471. "Corpse" is *sarīra*.

472. For *abyāvaṭā* ("don't get involved"), compare *samaṇena bhavitabbaṃ abyāvaṭena* ("a monastic shouldn't get involved" (in domestic matters)) at Bu Ss 5:1.3.34.

473. Read *sadatthe* ("own goal") rather than *sārattthe* ("essential goal").

474. An iron case was also used for Queen Bhaddā's body at AN 5.50:1.6. The second iron case does not "enclose" the first; rather it "crooks" (*paṭikujjati*) like a lid to "close it up".

475. This is a rare mention of the *thūpa* ("sepulchral monument") that became a major feature of the Buddhist landscape. Buddhist monuments were round in shape, which was apparently a characteristic of the lands around Magadha.

a wheel-turning monarch's corpse. Proceed in the same way with the Realized One's corpse.⁴⁷⁶ A monument for the Realized One is to be built at the crossroads. When someone there lifts up garlands or fragrance or powder, or bows, or inspires confidence in their heart, that will be for their lasting welfare and happiness.

30. Individuals Worthy of a Monument

5.12.1 Ānanda, these four are worthy of a monument. What four? A Realized One, a perfected one, a fully awakened Buddha; an independent Buddha; a disciple of a Realized One; and a wheel-turning monarch.

5.12.4 And for what reason is a Realized One worthy of a monument? So that many people will inspire confidence in their hearts, thinking: 'This is the monument for that Blessed One, perfected and fully awakened!' And having done so, when their body breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. It is for this reason that a Realized One is worthy of a monument.

5.12.8 And for what reason is an independent Buddha worthy of a monument?⁴⁷⁷ So that many people will inspire confidence in their hearts, thinking: 'This is the monument for that independent Buddha!' And having done so, when their body breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. It is for this reason that an independent Buddha is worthy of a monument.

Śatāpathabrāhmaṇa 13.8.1.5 says that the correct form of such a monument was square, and that round monuments were built by godless "easterners".

476. Here the Buddha is said to be explicitly instructing his followers to adopt the building of monuments from the local customs.

477. "Independent Buddhas" are sages who discover the Dhamma and are awakened independently, but who do not themselves go on to found a dispensation or establish a monastic order. Text has *paccekasambuddho* rather than the usual *paccekabuddho*.

And for what reason is a Realized One's disciple worthy of a monument?⁴⁷⁸ So that many people will inspire confidence in their hearts, thinking: "This is the monument for that Blessed One's disciple!" And having done so, when their body breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. It is for this reason that a Realized One's disciple is worthy of a monument. 5.12.12

And for what reason is a wheel-turning monarch worthy of a monument? So that many people will inspire confidence in their hearts, thinking: "This is the monument for that just and principled king!"⁴⁷⁹ And having done so, when their body breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. It is for this reason that a wheel-turning monarch is worthy of a monument. 5.12.16

These four are worthy of a monument." 5.12.20

31. Ānanda's Incredible Qualities

Then Venerable Ānanda entered a building, and stood there leaning against the door-jamb and crying,⁴⁸⁰ "Oh! I'm still only a trainee with work left to do; and my Teacher is about to be fully extinguished, he who is so kind to me!"⁴⁸¹ 5.13.1

Then the Buddha said to the mendicants, "Mendicants, where is Ānanda?" 5.13.3

"Sir, Ānanda has entered a dwelling, and stands there leaning against the door-jamb and crying: 'Oh! I'm still only a trainee with work left to do; and my Teacher is about to be fully extinguished, he who is so kind to me!'" 5.13.5

478. This refers to the "eight individuals" who make up the "Saṅgha of disciples", namely those who have achieved the four stages of awakening and those on the path.

479. In contrast with Ajātasattu.

480. Like Queen Subhaddā, wife of Mahāsudassana, at DN 17:2.8.7 and DN 17:2.12.1. | *Kapisīsa* is door-jamb, not lintel. | For *vihāra* ("building") the commentary has "pavilion" (*maṇḍalamāla*), which may have been a temporary construction for the occasion (compare MN 92:4.6).

481. At this point Ānanda was a stream-enterer.

- 5.13.7 So the Buddha addressed one of the monks, “Please, monk, in my name tell Ānanda that the Teacher summons him.”
- 5.13.10 “Yes, sir,” that monk replied. He went to Ānanda and said to him, “Reverend Ānanda, the Teacher summons you.”
- 5.14.1 “Yes, reverend,” Ānanda replied. He went to the Buddha, bowed, and sat down to one side. The Buddha said to him:
- 5.14.2 “Enough, Ānanda! Do not grieve, do not lament. Did I not prepare for this when I explained that⁴⁸² we must be parted and separated from all we hold dear and beloved? How could it possibly be so that what is born, created, conditioned, and liable to wear out should not wear out, even the Realized One’s body? For a long time, Ānanda, you’ve treated the Realized One with deeds of body, speech, and mind that are loving, beneficial, pleasant, undivided, and limitless.⁴⁸³ You have done good deeds, Ānanda. Devote yourself to meditation, and you will soon be free of defilements.”⁴⁸⁴
- 5.15.1 Then the Buddha said to the mendicants:
- 5.15.2 “Those who were perfected ones, fully awakened Buddhas in the past also had attendants, who at best were like Ānanda is for me.⁴⁸⁵ Those who will be perfected ones, fully awakened Buddhas in the future will also have attendants, who at best will be like Ānanda is for me. Ānanda is astute, he is intelligent. He knows the time for monks, nuns, laymen, laywomen, royal ministers, monastics of other religions and their disciples to visit the Realized One.”⁴⁸⁶

482. When admonishing Ānanda, the Buddha first gently but firmly restrains him, then gives words of support and encouragement.

483. The phrase “undivided and limitless” (*advayena appamāṇena*) normally describes *kasiṇa* meditation (AN 10.25:1.3); here it is also found in the Sanskrit: *ānanda maitreṇa kāyakarmaṇā hitena sukhenādvayenāpramāṇena*.

484. On the eve of the First Council—in about six months time—Ānanda devoted himself to meditation and achieved arahantship.

485. The same is said regarding the chief disciples Sāriputta and Moggallāna at SN 47.14:2.4 and regarding assemblies of deities at DN 20:4.3.

486. *Tittha*, literally “ford”, is a path to salvation, used as a term for a non-Buddhist “religion”. *Titthakara* is a “religious founder” (literally “ford-maker”); *titthiya* is a “monastic of (another) religion” (for example at Bu NP 22:1.2.5); *titthiyasāvaka* is a “disciple of a monastic of (another) religion”.

There are these four incredible and amazing things about 5.16.1
 Ānanda.⁴⁸⁷ What four? If an assembly of monks goes to see Ānanda,
 they're uplifted by seeing him and uplifted by hearing him speak.
 And when he falls silent, they've never had enough. If an assembly
 of nuns ... laymen ... or laywomen goes to see Ānanda, they're
 uplifted by seeing him and uplifted by hearing him speak. And
 when he falls silent, they've never had enough. These are the four
 incredible and amazing things about Ānanda.

There are these four incredible and amazing things about a wheel- 5.16.16
 turning monarch.⁴⁸⁸ What four? If an assembly of aristocrats goes
 to see a wheel-turning monarch, they're uplifted by seeing him and
 uplifted by hearing him speak. And when he falls silent, they've
 never had enough. If an assembly of brahmins ... householders ...
 or ascetics goes to see a wheel-turning monarch, they're uplifted by
 seeing him and uplifted by hearing him speak. And when he falls
 silent, they've never had enough.

In the same way, there are those four incredible and amazing 5.16.26
 things about Ānanda."

32. Teaching the Discourse on Mahāsudassana

When he said this, Venerable Ānanda said to the Buddha: 5.17.1

"Sir, please don't be fully extinguished in this little hamlet, this 5.17.2
 jungle hamlet, this branch hamlet. There are other great cities such
 as Campā, Rājagaha, Sāvattthī, Sāketa, Kosambī, and Varanasi.⁴⁸⁹ Let

487. As at AN 4.130:6.4. Ānanda was in awe of the "incredible and amazing" qualities of the Buddha, and spoke of them often. Here, when Ānanda is at his most vulnerable, the Buddha turns the teaching around, pointing out that Ānanda is incredible and amazing too.

488. This anticipates the story to follow.

489. Campā, Rājagaha, Sāvattthī, and Kosambī were the capitals of Aṅga, Magadha, Kosala, and Vaccha respectively. Sāketa was the former capital of Kosala. Varanasi was formerly the capital of Kāśi, but at this time was contested by Kosala and Magadha, and had recently been won from Ajātasattu (SN 3.14, SN 3.15).

the Buddha be fully extinguished there. There are many well-to-do aristocrats, brahmins, and householders there who are devoted to the Buddha. They will perform the rites of venerating the Realized One's corpse."

5.17.8 "Don't say that Ānanda! Don't say that this is a little hamlet, a jungle hamlet, a branch hamlet.

5.18.1 Once upon a time, there was a king named Mahāsudassana who was a wheel-turning monarch, a just and principled king. His dominion extended to all four sides, he achieved stability in the country, and he possessed the seven treasures.⁴⁹⁰ His capital was this Kusinārā, which at the time was named Kusāvātī.⁴⁹¹ It stretched for twelve leagues from east to west, and seven leagues from north to south.⁴⁹² The royal capital of Kusāvātī was successful and prosperous, populous and full of people, with plenty of food. It was just like Āḷakamandā, the royal capital of the gods, which is successful and prosperous, populous and full of spirits, with plenty of food.⁴⁹³ Kusāvātī was never free of ten sounds by day or night, namely: the sound of elephants, horses, chariots, drums, clay drums, arched harps, singing, horns, gongs, and handbells; and the cry: 'Eat, drink, be merry!' as the tenth.

490. This story is also found in DN 17. It seems that the Pali tradition extracted the story and greatly expanded it in an independent long discourse, whereas the Sanskrit tradition kept it at a more moderate length within the Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra itself.

491. Kusāvātī features in the Kusajāṭaka (Ja 531), where the ugly but wise prince Kusa, son of the legendary Okkāka, wins the hand of the radiant Pabhāvātī. The Rāmāyaṇa also tells the story of a Kusa, son of Rāma, who ruled the city of Kusāvātī, although this city was located far to the south in the Vindhya ranges. Both stories are united by the detail that *kusa* grass, a prominent feature of Vedic ritual, ensured the kingly lineage.

492. A "league" (*yojana*) is usually estimated at around fourteen kilometers (see MN 24:14.11). By way of comparison, even at its greatest extent under Ashoka, Pāṭaliputta was less than a league per side, so the dimensions of Kusāvātī here are strictly legendary.

493. According to DN 32, Āḷakamandā was one of the many cities of Kuvera in Uttarakuru.

Go, Ānanda, into Kusinārā and inform the Mallas: ‘This very day, 5.19.1
Vāseṭṭhas, in the last watch of the night, the Realized One will be
fully extinguished.’⁴⁹⁴ Come forth, Vāseṭṭhas! Come forth, Vāse-
ṭṭhas! Don’t regret it later, thinking: “The Realized One became
fully extinguished in our own village district, but we didn’t get a
chance to see him in his final hour.”’”

“Yes, sir,” replied Ānanda. Then he robed up and, taking his bowl 5.19.6
and robe, entered Kusinārā with a companion.⁴⁹⁵

33. The Mallas Pay Homage

Now at that time the Mallas of Kusinārā were sitting together at 5.20.1
the town hall on some business.⁴⁹⁶ Ānanda went up to them, and
announced: “This very day, Vāseṭṭhas, in the last watch of the night,
the Realized One will be fully extinguished. Come forth, Vāseṭṭhas!
Come forth, Vāseṭṭhas! Don’t regret it later, thinking: ‘The Realized
One became fully extinguished in our own village district, but we
didn’t get a chance to see him in his final hour.’”

When they heard what Ānanda had to say, the Mallas, their 5.21.1
sons, daughters-in-law, and wives became distraught, saddened, and
grief-stricken. And some, with hair disheveled and arms raised,
falling down like their feet were chopped off, rolling back and forth,
lamented, “Too soon the Blessed One will be fully extinguished!
Too soon the Holy One will be fully extinguished! Too soon the
Eye of the World will vanish!”

494. Vāseṭṭha is a Vedic priestly clan. The Mallas adopted the name of their priest’s lineage, which was the normal custom for initiated *khattiya*s. Other examples in the Pali are Saccaka who is called Aggivessana (MN 35:4.2), and the Buddha and his family who are called Gotama.

495. *Attadutiyo* “with self as second” is also at MN 146:4.6 where Nandaka visits the nuns. Sanskrit has *bhikṣuṇā paścācchramaṇena* (“with a mendicant as accompanying ascetic”). It was apparently evening (the “wrong time”, *vikāla*), when it is inappropriate for a monk to be wandering the town alone.

496. Evidently the Mallas, like the Vajjis, met frequently.

5.21.3 Then the Mallas, their sons, daughters-in-law, and wives, distraught, saddened, and grief-stricken went to the Mallian sal grove at Upavattana and approached Ānanda.

5.22.1 Then Ānanda thought, “If I have the Mallas pay homage to the Buddha one by one, they won’t be finished before first light. I’d better separate them family by family and then have them pay homage, saying: ‘Sir, the Malla named so-and-so with children, wives, retinue, and ministers bows with his head to your feet.’” And so that’s what he did. So by this means Ānanda got the Mallas to finish paying homage to the Buddha in the first watch of the night.

34. On Subhadda the Wanderer

5.23.1 Now at that time a wanderer named Subhadda was residing near Kusinārā.⁴⁹⁷ He heard that on that very day, in the last watch of the night, will be the full extinguishment of the ascetic Gotama. He thought: “I have heard that brahmins of the past who were elderly and senior, the tutors of tutors, said: ‘Only rarely do Realized Ones arise in the world, perfected ones, fully awakened Buddhas.’ And this very day, in the last watch of the night, will be the full extinguishment of the ascetic Gotama. This state of uncertainty has come up in me. I am quite confident that the Buddha is capable of teaching me so that I can give up this state of uncertainty.”

5.24.1 Then Subhadda went to the Mallian sal grove at Upavattana, approached Ānanda, and said to him, “Worthy Ānanda, I have heard that brahmins of the past who were elderly and senior, the tutors of tutors, said: ‘Only rarely do Realized Ones arise in the world, perfected ones, fully awakened Buddhas.’ And this very day, in the last watch of the night, will be the full extinguishment of the ascetic

497. This is the second Subhadda we have met in this discourse, the first being a deceased devotee of Nātika (DN 16:2.6.13). The corrupt monk who, after the Buddha’s death, urges the rejection of the Vinaya rules is another person of the same name (DN 16:6.20.1). The Mahāsudassanasutta also features a Queen Subhaddā (DN 17:2.5.9).

Gotama. This state of uncertainty has come up in me. I am quite confident that the Buddha is capable of teaching me so that I can give up this state of uncertainty. Worthy Ānanda, please let me see the ascetic Gotama.”

When he had spoken, Ānanda said, “Enough, Reverend Subhadda, do not trouble the Realized One. He is tired.” 5.24.8

For a second time ... For a third time, Subhadda asked Ānanda, and a third time Ānanda refused. 5.24.10

The Buddha heard that discussion between Ānanda and Subhadda. He said to Ānanda, “Enough, Ānanda, don’t obstruct Subhadda; let him see the Realized One. For whatever he asks me, he will only be looking to understand, not to trouble me. And he will quickly understand any answer I give to his question.” 5.25.1

So Ānanda said to the wanderer Subhadda, “Go, Reverend Subhadda, the Buddha is making time for you.” 5.25.6

Then the wanderer Subhadda went up to the Buddha, and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to the Buddha: 5.26.1

“Worthy Gotama, there are those ascetics and brahmins who lead an order and a community, and tutor a community. They’re well-known and famous religious founders, deemed holy by many people. Namely: Pūraṇa Kassapa, the bamboo-staffed ascetic Gosāla, Ajita of the hair blanket, Pakudha Kaccāyana, Sañjaya Belatṭhiputta, and the Jain ascetic of the Ñātika clan. According to their own claims, did all of them have direct knowledge, or none of them, or only some?”⁴⁹⁸ 5.26.2

“Enough, Subhadda, let that be.⁴⁹⁹ I shall teach you the Dhamma. Listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.” 5.26.5

“Yes, sir,” Subhadda replied. The Buddha said this: 5.26.9

498. While some such as Mahāvira the Ñātika (MN 14:17.2) and Pūraṇa Kassapa (AN 9.38:2.1) claimed to have direct knowledge, others such as Ajita Kesakambala denied that such knowledge was possible (DN 2:23.2).

499. The Buddha responded the same way when asked this question by the brahmin Piṅgalakoccha (MN 30:2.6), and to a similar question at AN 9.38:3.2.

5.27.1 “Subhadda, in whatever teaching and training the noble eightfold path is not found, there is no ascetic found, no second ascetic, no third ascetic, and no fourth ascetic.⁵⁰⁰ In whatever teaching and training the noble eightfold path is found, there is an ascetic found, a second ascetic, a third ascetic, and a fourth ascetic.⁵⁰¹ In this teaching and training the noble eightfold path is found. Only here is there an ascetic, here a second ascetic, here a third ascetic, and here a fourth ascetic. Other sects are empty of ascetics.

5.27.4 Were these mendicants to practice well, the world would not be empty of perfected ones.⁵⁰²

5.27.5 I was twenty-nine years of age, Subhadda,⁵⁰³
 when I went forth to discover what is skillful.⁵⁰⁴
 It’s been over fifty years
 since I went forth.
 Teacher of the references
 for the systematic teaching:⁵⁰⁵
 outside of here there is no ascetic,

5.27.11 no second ascetic, no third ascetic, and no fourth ascetic. Other sects are empty of ascetics. Were these mendicants to practice well, the world would not be empty of perfected ones.”

500. The four ascetics are defined at AN 4.241:1.1 as those on the four paths.

501. While many aspects of the eightfold path are shared with others, some details may be missing (such as not-self or Nibbāna), while others are added (such as the belief in the efficacy of rituals, an eternal soul, or a creator god).

502. The Buddha points to the mendicants who have gathered there.

503. This is the only place in the early texts where the Buddha identifies his age when going forth.

504. Detailed in such suttas as MN 36.

505. This verse appears to be corrupt. The sense can be restored through two extra lines in the Sanskrit: “Ethics, immersion, conduct, and knowledge, and unification of mind have been developed by me, teacher of the references for the noble teaching.” | For *padesavattī*, the Sanskrit has *pradeśavaktā*, where *vaktā* means “speaker” and *pradeśa* has the sense “pointing out”. I think it means, “I am the one who taught the four great references (*mahāpadesa*)”.

When he had spoken, Subhadda said to the Buddha, “Excellent, 5.28.1
 sir! Excellent! As if he were righting the overturned, or revealing the
 hidden, or pointing out the path to the lost, or lighting a lamp in the
 dark so people with clear eyes can see what’s there, the Buddha has
 made the teaching clear in many ways. I go for refuge to the Buddha,
 to the teaching, and to the mendicant Saṅgha. Sir, may I receive the
 going forth, the ordination in the Buddha’s presence?”

“Subhadda, if someone formerly ordained in another sect wishes 5.29.1
 to take the going forth, the ordination in this teaching and training,
 they must spend four months on probation. When four months
 have passed, if the mendicants are satisfied, they’ll give the going
 forth, the ordination into monkhood. However, I have recognized
 individual differences in this matter.”

“Sir, if four months probation are required in such a case, I’ll 5.29.3
 spend four years on probation. When four years have passed, if
 the mendicants are satisfied, let them give me the going forth, the
 ordination into monkhood.”

Then the Buddha said to Ānanda, “Well then, Ānanda, give Sub- 5.29.4
 hadda the going forth.”

“Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. 5.29.6

Then Subhadda said to Ānanda, “You’re so fortunate, Reverend 5.30.1
 Ānanda, so very fortunate, to be anointed here in the Teacher’s pres-
 ence as his pupil!” And the wanderer Subhadda received the going
 forth, the ordination in the Buddha’s presence. Not long after his
 ordination, Venerable Subhadda, living alone, withdrawn, diligent,
 keen, and resolute, soon realized the supreme culmination of the
 spiritual path in this very life. He lived having achieved with his own
 insight the goal for which gentlemen rightly go forth from the lay
 life to homelessness.

He understood: “Rebirth is ended; the spiritual journey has been 5.30.6
 completed; what had to be done has been done; there is nothing

further for this place.” And Venerable Subhadda became one of the perfected. He was the last personal disciple of the Buddha.⁵⁰⁶

The fifth recitation section.

35. The Buddha’s Last Words

6.1.1 Then the Buddha addressed Venerable Ānanda:

6.1.2 “Now, Ānanda, some of you might think: ‘The teacher’s dispensation has passed. Now we have no Teacher.’ But you should not see it like this. The teaching and training that I have taught and pointed out for you shall be your Teacher after my passing.⁵⁰⁷

6.2.1 After my passing, mendicants ought not address each other as ‘reverend’, as they do today.⁵⁰⁸ A more senior mendicant ought to address a more junior mendicant by name or clan, or by saying ‘reverend’. A more junior mendicant ought to address a more senior mendicant using ‘sir’ or ‘venerable’.⁵⁰⁹

6.3.1 If it wishes, after my passing the Saṅgha may abolish the lesser and minor training rules.⁵¹⁰

506. The commentary says this line was added at the Council.

507. This is similar to the idea of the Four Great references, and sets the scene for the First Council at which the teachings were recited. | *Paññatto* here means “pointed out” rather than “laid down”, as can be seen from DN 9:33.21, where the same phrase refers to the four noble truths.

508. *Āvuso* is from the root *āyu* (“age”) and thus has a respectful sense and does not mean “friend” as it is often translated. Like *bhante*, it is an indeclinable vocative of address that may be used with or without the name (see eg. MN 5:31.2).

509. I render *bhante* as “sir” when it stands alone and “honorable” when it prefixes a name. | Unlike *bhante*, *āyasmā* (“venerable”) is declinable, so it is used in parts of speech other than direct address. It is from the same root as *āvuso* but more Sanskritic and hence elevated in tone. The difference between *āyasmā* and *āvuso* is like that between the English “governor” and “guv’nor” or “my lord” and “m’lud”.

510. These are not defined here, and the senior monks at the First Council were unable to agree on them (Kd 21:1.9.3). Nonetheless, the Pali Vinaya consistently labels the Pācittiya rules as “lesser” (*khuddaka*; Bu Pc 92:2.2.22, Bi Pc 96:2.2.22, Pvr 1.1:219.3), which would make the Pātiesanīyas “minor”

After my passing, give the divine punishment to the mendicant Channa.”⁵¹¹ 6.4.1

“But sir, what is the divine punishment?” 6.4.2

“Channa may say what he likes, but the mendicants should not correct, advise, or instruct him.”⁵¹² 6.4.3

Then the Buddha said to the mendicants, “Perhaps even a single mendicant has doubt or uncertainty regarding the Buddha, the teaching, the Saṅgha, the path, or the practice. So ask, mendicants! Don’t regret it later, thinking: ‘We were in the Teacher’s presence and we weren’t able to ask the Buddha a question.’” 6.5.1

When this was said, the mendicants kept silent. 6.5.4

For a second time ... For a third time the Buddha addressed the mendicants: “Perhaps even a single mendicant has doubt or uncertainty regarding the Buddha, the teaching, the Saṅgha, the path, or the practice. So ask, mendicants! Don’t regret it later, thinking: ‘We were in the Teacher’s presence and we weren’t able to ask the Buddha a question.’” 6.6.1

For a third time, the mendicants kept silent. Then the Buddha said to the mendicants, 6.6.5

“Mendicants, perhaps you don’t ask out of respect for the Teacher. So let a friend tell a friend.” 6.6.7

When this was said, the mendicants kept silent. 6.6.8

Then Venerable Ānanda said to the Buddha, “It’s incredible, sir, it’s amazing! I am quite confident that there is not even a single 6.6.9

(*anukhuddaka*). The Sekhiya rules are also “minor”, but they were not at this point reckoned among the training rules for recitation.

511. “Divine punishment” is *brahmadaṇḍa*. Channa features often in the Vinaya as a monk who refuses correction and acts disrespectfully. The Saṅgha had already imposed an act of “ejection” (*ukkehpanīyakamma*) on him due to his persistent bad behavior, but that was still not enough (Kd 1:25.1.1). The *brahmadaṇḍa* was imposed at the First Council (Kd 1:1.12.1), upon which Channa finally saw the error of his ways. *Brahmadaṇḍa* is encountered in a different sense at DN 3:1.23.21.

512. *Vattabba* in such contexts means “advise, correct” rather than more generally “speak to”. Thus the *brahmadaṇḍa* is not the “silent treatment”.

mendicant in this Saṅgha who has doubt or uncertainty regarding the Buddha, the teaching, the Saṅgha, the path, or the practice.”

6.6.11 “Ānanda, you speak out of faith. But the Realized One knows that there is not even a single mendicant in this Saṅgha who has doubt or uncertainty regarding the Buddha, the teaching, the Saṅgha, the path, or the practice. Even the last of these five hundred mendicants is a stream-enterer, not liable to be reborn in the underworld, assured, destined for awakening.”

6.7.1 Then the Buddha said to the mendicants: “Come now, mendicants, I say to you all: ‘Conditions fall apart. Persist with diligence.’”

6.7.4 These were the Realized One’s last words.⁵¹³

36. Fully Quenched

6.8.1 Then the Buddha entered the first absorption. Emerging from that, he entered the second absorption. Emerging from that, he successively entered into and emerged from the third absorption, the fourth absorption, the dimension of infinite space, the dimension of infinite consciousness, the dimension of nothingness, and the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. Then he entered the cessation of perception and feeling.⁵¹⁴

6.8.2 Then Venerable Ānanda said to Venerable Anuruddha, “Honorable Anuruddha, has the Buddha become fully quenched?”⁵¹⁵

6.8.4 “No, Reverend Ānanda. He has entered the cessation of perception and feeling.”

6.9.1 Then the Buddha emerged from the cessation of perception and feeling and entered the dimension of neither perception nor non-

513. The commentary says this line was added at the Council.

514. Even on his deathbed, the Buddha retains mastery over his mind.

515. Ānanda’s question is prompted by the fact that it is very difficult to tell the difference between one who is dead and who has attained cessation (MN 43:25.1). Anuruddha can answer due to his mastery of psychic powers. | Note that Ānanda and Anuruddha have immediately adopted the forms of address recommended by the Buddha above.

perception. Emerging from that, he successively entered into and emerged from the dimension of nothingness, the dimension of infinite consciousness, the dimension of infinite space, the fourth absorption, the third absorption, the second absorption, and the first absorption. Emerging from that, he successively entered into and emerged from the second absorption and the third absorption. Then he entered the fourth absorption. Emerging from that the Buddha immediately became fully extinguished.

When the Buddha was fully quenched, along with the full extinguishment there was a great earthquake, awe-inspiring and hair-raising, and thunder cracked the sky. When the Buddha was fully quenched, the divinity Sahampati spoke this verse: 6.10.1

“All creatures in this world⁵¹⁶ 6.10.3
must lay down this bag of bones.⁵¹⁷
For even a Teacher such as this,
unrivaled in the world,
the Realized One, attained to power,⁵¹⁸
the Buddha was fully quenched.”

When the Buddha was fully quenched, Sakka, lord of gods, spoke this verse: 6.10.9

“Oh! Conditions are impermanent,⁵¹⁹ 6.10.10
their nature is to rise and fall;
having arisen, they cease;
their settling is blissful.”

When the Buddha was fully quenched, Venerable Anuruddha spoke this verse: 6.10.14

516. Each of these characters reveal something of themselves in their verses. Sahampati, as a royal deity, emphasizes the universal nature of the teaching and the grandeur of the Buddha.

517. “Bag of bones” is a loose rendering of *samussaya*.

518. The ten powers of a Realized One are detailed at AN 10.21 and MN 12:9.1.

519. Less creative than Brahmā, Sakka repeats a famous verse spoken by the Buddha at SN 15.20:8.1 and DN 17:2.17.5.

- 6.10.15 “There was no more breathing⁵²⁰
for the unaffected one of steady heart.
Imperturbable, committed to peace,
the sage has done his time.
- 6.10.19 He put up with painful feelings
without flinching.
The liberation of his heart
was like the extinguishing of a lamp.”
- 6.10.23 When the Buddha was fully quenched, Venerable Ānanda spoke
this verse:
- 6.10.24 “Then there was terror!⁵²¹
Then they had goosebumps!
When the Buddha, endowed with all fine qualities,
became fully quenched.”
- 6.10.28 When the Buddha was fully quenched, some of the mendicants
there who were not free of desire, with arms raised, falling down
like their feet were chopped off, rolling back and forth, lamented:
“Too soon the Blessed One has become fully quenched! Too soon
the Holy One has become fully quenched! Too soon the Eye of
the World has vanished!”⁵²² But the mendicants who were free
of desire endured, mindful and aware, thinking, “Conditions are
impermanent. How could it possibly be otherwise?”
- 6.11.1 Then Anuruddha addressed the mendicants: “Enough, reverends,
do not grieve or lament. Did the Buddha not prepare us for this when

520. Anuruddha was a reclusive meditator who specialized in mindfulness of breathing. Here he remarks on the fact that, since breathing ceases in the fourth absorption (SN 36.11:2.19), the Buddha’s breathing had already stopped before he died.

521. Ānanda has the most emotional reaction. While Anuruddha speaks only of peace, Ānanda empathizes with those who were distraught.

522. Text omits “with hair disheveled” (*kese pakiriya*) when describing the shaven-headed monks.

he explained that we must be parted and separated from all we hold dear and beloved? How could it possibly be so that what is born, created, conditioned, and liable to wear out should not wear out? The deities are complaining.”

“But sir, what kind of deities are you thinking of?” 6.11.7

“There are, Ānanda, deities—both in space and on the earth— 6.11.8
who are aware of the earth. With hair disheveled and arms raised, they fall down like their feet were chopped off, rolling back and forth, lamenting: ‘Too soon the Blessed One has become fully quenched! Too soon the Holy One has become fully quenched! Too soon the Eye of the World has vanished!’ But the deities who are free of desire endure, mindful and aware, thinking: ‘Conditions are impermanent. How could it possibly be otherwise?’”

Ānanda and Anuruddha spent the rest of the night talking about 6.11.14
Dhamma.

Then Anuruddha said to Ānanda, “Go, Ānanda, into Kusinārā 6.12.1
and inform the Mallas: ‘Vāsetṭhas, the Buddha has become fully quenched. Please come at your convenience.’”

“Yes, sir,” replied Ānanda. Then, in the morning, he robed up and, 6.12.5
taking his bowl and robe, entered Kusinārā with a companion.

Now at that time the Mallas of Kusinārā were sitting together at 6.12.6
the town hall still on the same business.⁵²³ Ānanda went up to them, and announced, “Vāsetṭhas, the Buddha has become fully quenched. Please come at your convenience.”

When they heard what Ānanda had to say, the Mallas, their 6.12.10
sons, daughters-in-law, and wives became distraught, saddened, and grief-stricken. And some, with hair disheveled and arms raised, falling down like their feet were chopped off, rolling back and forth, lamented, “Too soon the Blessed One has become fully quenched!

523. “Still on the same business” (*teneva karaṇīyena*) calls back to DN 16:5.20.1, where they were said to be “on some business” (*kenacideva karaṇīyena*). They had been discussing all night.

Too soon the Holy One has become fully quenched! Too soon the Eye of the World has vanished!”

37. The Rites of Venerating the Buddha’s Corpse

- 6.13.1 Then the Mallas ordered their men, “So then, lads, collect fragrances and garlands, and all the musical instruments in Kusinārā.”
- 6.13.3 Then—taking those fragrances and garlands, all the musical instruments, and five hundred pairs of garments—they went to the Mallian sal grove at Upavattana and approached the Buddha’s corpse. They spent the day honoring, respecting, revering, and venerating the Buddha’s corpse with dance and song and music and garlands and fragrances, and making awnings and setting up pavilions.⁵²⁴
- 6.13.4 Then they thought, “It’s too late to cremate the Buddha’s corpse today. Let’s do it tomorrow.” But they spent the next day the same way, and so too the third, fourth, fifth, and sixth days.⁵²⁵
- 6.14.1 Then on the seventh day they thought, “Honoring, respecting, revering, and venerating the Buddha’s corpse with dance and song and music and garlands and fragrances, let us carry it to the south of the town, and cremate it there outside the town.”
- 6.14.3 Now at that time eight of the leading Mallas, having bathed their heads and dressed in unworn clothes, said,⁵²⁶ “We shall lift the Buddha’s corpse.” But they were unable to do so.
- 6.14.5 The Mallas said to Anuruddha, “What is the cause, Honorable Anuruddha, what is the reason why these eight Mallian chiefs are unable to lift the Buddha’s corpse?”
- 6.14.8 “Vāsetṭhas, you have one plan, but the deities have a different one.”
- 6.15.1 “But sir, what is the deities’ plan?”

524. An uplifting response to tragedy, full of beauty and celebration.

525. It seem unlikely that everyone simply forgot. It was probably the custom to wait seven days before the cremation.

526. “Unworn” is *ahata*, as at DN 14:1.33.9 and Kd 1:1.6.2.

“You plan to carry the Buddha’s corpse to the south of the town while venerating it with dance and song and music and garlands and fragrances, and cremate it there outside the town. The deities plan to carry the Buddha’s corpse to the north of the town while venerating it with heavenly dance and song and music and garlands and fragrances. Then they plan to enter the town by the northern gate, carry it through the center of the town, leave by the eastern gate, and cremate it there at the Mallian shrine named Coronation.”⁵²⁷ 6.15.2

“Sir, let it be as the deities plan.” 6.15.6

Now at that time the whole of Kusinārā was covered knee-deep with the flowers of the Flame Tree, without gaps even on the filth and rubbish heaps.⁵²⁸ Then the deities and the Mallas of Kusinārā carried the Buddha’s corpse to the north of the town while venerating it with heavenly and human dance and song and music and garlands and fragrances. Then they entered the town by the northern gate, carried it through the center of the town, left by the eastern gate, and deposited the corpse there at the Mallian shrine named Coronation. 6.16.1

Then the Mallas said to Ānanda, “Honorable Ānanda, how do we proceed when it comes to the Realized One’s corpse?” 6.17.1

“Proceed in the same way as they do for the corpse of a wheel-turning monarch.” 6.17.3

“But how do they proceed with a wheel-turning monarch’s corpse?” 6.17.4

“They wrap a wheel-turning monarch’s corpse with unworn cloth, then with uncarded cotton, then again with unworn cloth. In this way they wrap the corpse with five hundred double-layers. Then they place it in an iron casket filled with oil and close it up with another casket. Then, having built a funeral pyre out of all kinds of aromatics, they cremate the corpse. They build a monument for the wheel-turning monarch at the crossroads. That’s how they proceed 6.17.5

527. “Coronation” is *makuṭabandhana*, “the binding of the crown”. The commentary says there was, fittingly, an auspicious decorative royal hall there; perhaps too the name was felt to pun with *muktabandhana*, “freedom from ties”.

528. I think *sandhi* here means “covered without gaps”.

with a wheel-turning monarch's corpse. Proceed in the same way with the Realized One's corpse. A monument for the Realized One is to be built at the crossroads. When someone there lifts up garlands or fragrance or powder, or bows, or inspires confidence in their heart, that will be for their lasting welfare and happiness."

6.18.1 Then the Mallas ordered their men, "So then, lads, collect uncarded cotton."

6.18.3 So the Mallas wrapped the Buddha's corpse, and placed it in an iron casket filled with oil. Then, having built a funeral pyre out of all kinds of aromatics, they lifted the corpse on to the pyre.

38. Mahākassapa's Arrival

6.19.1 Now at that time Venerable Mahākassapa was traveling along the road from Pāvā to Kusinārā together with a large Saṅgha of five hundred mendicants.⁵²⁹ Then he left the road and sat at the root of a tree.

6.19.3 Now at that time a certain Ājīvaka ascetic had picked up a Flame Tree flower in Kusinārā and was traveling along the road to Pāvā.⁵³⁰ Mahākassapa saw him coming off in the distance and said to him, "Reverend, might you know about our Teacher?"

6.19.6 "Yes, reverend. Seven days ago the ascetic Gotama was fully quenched. From there I picked up this Flame Tree flower." Some of the mendicants there who were not free of desire, with arms raised, falling down like their feet were chopped off, rolling back and forth, lamented, "Too soon the Blessed One has become fully quenched! Too soon the Holy One has become fully quenched! Too soon the

529. With the passing of Sāriputta and Moggallāna, Mahākassapa was the most senior of the remaining leading mendicants. As a solitary recluse, it was unusual for him to be travelling with such a large group, or with anyone at all really. He was to cite the events depicted here at the start of the First Council (Kd 1:1.1.1).

530. A follower of the Bamboo-staffed Ascetic Gosāla (DN 2:19.1). | This may be an inspiration for the so-called "Flower Sermon", a medieval Zen story that depicts the Buddha holding up a flower and Mahakassapa smiling.

Eye of the World has vanished!” But the mendicants who were free of desire endured, mindful and aware, thinking, “Conditions are impermanent. How could it possibly be otherwise?”

Now at that time a monk named Subhadda, who had gone forth when old, was sitting in that assembly. He said to those mendicants, “Enough, reverends, do not grieve or lament. We’re well rid of that Great Ascetic. And we are harried:⁵³¹ ‘This is allowable for you; this is not allowable for you.’ Well, now we shall do what we want and not do what we don’t want.” 6.20.1

Then Venerable Mahākassapa addressed the mendicants, “Enough, reverends, do not grieve or lament. Did the Buddha not prepare us for this when he explained that we must be parted and separated from all we hold dear and beloved? How could it possibly be so that what is born, created, conditioned, and liable to wear out should not wear out, even the Realized One’s body?” 6.20.6

Now at that time four of the leading Mallas, having bathed their heads and dressed in unworn clothes, said, “We shall light the Buddha’s funeral pyre.” But they were unable to do so. 6.21.1

The Mallas said to Anuruddha, “What is the cause, Venerable Anuruddha, what is the reason why these four Mallian chiefs are unable to light the Buddha’s funeral pyre?” 6.21.3

“Vāsetṭhas, the deities have a different plan.” 6.21.6

“But sir, what is the deities’ plan?” 6.21.7

“The deities’ plan is this: Venerable Mahākassapa is traveling along the road from Pāvā to Kusinārā together with a large Saṅgha of five hundred mendicants. The Buddha’s funeral pyre shall not burn until he bows with his head to the Buddha’s feet.” 6.21.8

“Sir, let it be as the deities plan.” 6.21.11

Then Venerable Mahākassapa arrived at the Mallian shrine named Coronation at Kusinārā and approached the Buddha’s funeral pyre. Arranging his robe over one shoulder and raising his joined palms, he respectfully circled the Buddha three times, keeping him on his 6.22.1

531. Compare Bu Pc 72. The syntax is clumsy here, perhaps deliberately so.

right, and bowed with his head to the Buddha's feet. And the five hundred mendicants did likewise. And when Mahākassapa and the five hundred mendicants bowed the Buddha's funeral pyre burst into flames all by itself.

6.23.1 And when the Buddha's corpse was cremated no ash or soot was found from outer or inner skin, flesh, sinews, or synovial fluid. Only the relics remained.⁵³² It's like when ghee or oil blaze and burn, and neither ashes nor soot are found. In the same way, when the Buddha's corpse was cremated no ash or soot was found from outer or inner skin, flesh, sinews, or synovial fluid. Only the relics remained. And of those five hundred pairs of garments only two were not burnt: the innermost and the outermost. But when the Buddha's corpse was consumed the funeral pyre was extinguished by a stream of water that appeared in the sky,⁵³³ by water dripping from the sal trees, and by the Mallas' fragrant water.

6.23.10 Then the Mallas made a cage of spears for the Buddha's relics in the town hall and surrounded it with a buttress of bows. For seven days they honored, respected, revered, and venerated them with dance and song and music and garlands and fragrances.

39. Distributing the Relics

6.24.1 King Ajātasattu of Magadha, son of the princess of Videha, heard⁵³⁴ that the Buddha had become fully quenched at Kusinārā. He sent an envoy to the Mallas of Kusinārā: "The Buddha was an aristocrat

532. Here *sarirāṇeva* is plural and so must mean "relics", whereas previously it was singular, "corpse".

533. As when he was born (DN 14:1.28.1).

534. Ajātasattu would have learned of the news from spies. It is a 600 km round trip to Rājagaha and back, which a mounted messenger could make in fourteen days.

and so am I. I too deserve a share of the Buddha's relics. I will build a monument for them and conduct a memorial service."⁵³⁵

The Licchavis of Vesālī also heard that the Buddha had become 6.24.5
fully quenched at Kusinārā. They sent an envoy to the Mallas of Kusinārā: "The Buddha was an aristocrat and so are we. We too deserve a share of the Buddha's relics. We will build a monument for them and conduct a memorial service."

The Sakyans of Kapilavatthu also heard that the Buddha had be- 6.24.9
come fully quenched at Kusinārā. They sent an envoy to the Mallas of Kusinārā: "The Buddha was our foremost relative. We too deserve a share of the Buddha's relics. We will build a monument for them and conduct a memorial service."

The Bulis of Allakappa also heard⁵³⁶ that the Buddha had become 6.24.13
fully quenched at Kusinārā. They sent an envoy to the Mallas of Kusinārā: "The Buddha was an aristocrat and so are we. We too deserve a share of the Buddha's relics. We will build a monument for them and conduct a memorial service."

The Koliyans of Rāmagāma also heard⁵³⁷ that the Buddha had 6.24.17
become fully quenched at Kusinārā. They sent an envoy to the Mallas of Kusinārā: "The Buddha was an aristocrat and so are we. We too deserve a share of the Buddha's relics. We will build a monument for them and conduct a memorial service."

The brahmin of Veṭhadīpa also heard⁵³⁸ that the Buddha had 6.24.21
become fully quenched at Kusinārā. He sent an envoy to the Mallas of Kusinārā: "The Buddha was an aristocrat and I am a brahmin. I too deserve a share of the Buddha's relics. I will build a monument for them and conduct a memorial service."

535. A bold move, considering that his designs on the Vajjis were no secret. Perhaps he was seeking a pretext for war. The justification for taking a share of relics is caste, rather than practice of the Dhamma.

536. Both the tribe and the town are exceedingly obscure, mentioned nowhere else in early texts. They must have been a small clan nearby.

537. The Koliyans were south-eastern neighbors of the Sakyans, and several of their towns and people feature in the early texts.

538. This brahmin is mentioned nowhere else.

- 6.24.25 The Mallas of Pāvā also heard that the Buddha had become fully quenched at Kusinārā. They sent an envoy to the Mallas of Kusinārā: “The Buddha was an aristocrat and so are we. We too deserve a share of the Buddha’s relics. We will build a monument for them and conduct a memorial service.”
- 6.25.1 When they had spoken, the Mallas of Kusinārā said to those various groups: “The Buddha was fully quenched in our village district. We will not give away a share of his relics.”⁵³⁹
- 6.25.3 Then Doṇa the brahmin said to those various groups:⁵⁴⁰
- 6.25.4 “Hear, worthy sirs, a single word from me.
Our Buddha’s teaching was acceptance.
It would not be good to fight over⁵⁴¹
a share of the supreme individual’s relics.
- 6.25.8 Let us make eight portions, worthy sirs,
rejoicing in unity and harmony.
Let there be monuments far and wide,⁵⁴²
so many folk may gain faith in the Clear-eyed One!”

539. *Dassāma* (“we shall give”) is the future second plural of *dadati*.

540. The brahmin Doṇa appears suddenly in the narrative, a reminder that there were many more people than the ones who are mentioned. The suttas record two encounters with a brahmin of this name: one is the wondrous story of seeing the Buddhas footprints (AN 4.36), while the other discusses the five kinds of brahmin (AN 5.192).

541. The fear of war was justified and the resolution achieved by Doṇa probably marks the last time these parties achieved a diplomatic outcome. The relative peace that had lasted most of the Buddha’s life was crumbling. We hear of war or threats of war between the Kosalans and the Magadhans, the Magadhans and the Vajjis, the Sakyans and the Koliyans, the Kosalans and the Mallas, and the Kosalans and the Sakyans. It is probably because of the latter two conflicts that Viḍḍabha—Pasenadi’s son and the newly crowned king of Kosala—did not send an emissary to the funeral. By sparking conflicts with former allies the Sakyans and Mallas, Viḍḍabha undid the successes of his father and fatally weakened the Kosalan Empire. When the dust cleared a few decades later, all these lands had been consumed by Magadha.

542. Thus begins the practice of establishing Buddhism by interring relics in a stupa.

"Well then, brahmin, you yourself should fairly divide the Buddha's relics in eight portions." 6.25.12

"Yes, worthy sirs," replied Doṇa to those various groups. He divided the relics as asked and said to them, "Worthy sirs, please give me the urn, and I shall build a monument for it and conduct a memorial service." So they gave Doṇa the urn. 6.25.13

The Moriyas of Pippalivana heard⁵⁴³ that the Buddha had become fully quenched at Kusinārā. They sent an envoy to the Mallas of Kusinārā: "The Buddha was an aristocrat, and so are we. We too deserve a share of the Buddha's relics. We will build a monument for them and conduct a memorial service." 6.26.1

"There is no portion of the Buddha's relics left, they have already been portioned out. Here, take the embers." So they took the embers. 6.26.5

40. Venerating the Relics

Then King Ajātasattu of Magadha,⁵⁴⁴ the Licchavis of Vesālī, the Sakyans of Kapilavatthu, the Bulis of Allakappa, the Koliyans of Rāmagāma, the brahmin of Veṭṭhadīpa, the Mallas of Pāvā, the Mallas of Kusinārā, the brahmin Doṇa, and the Moriyas of Pippalivana built monuments for them and conducted memorial services. Thus there were eight monuments for the relics, a ninth for the urn, and a tenth for the embers. That is how it was in the old days.⁵⁴⁵ 6.27.1

543. The Moriyas were a minor clan of the region, unmentioned outside of this passage, but their obscurity was not to last long. About a century after these events, Chandragupta the Moriyān, having won the Magadhan crown from the Nandas, proceeded to rout the Greeks in the west. His empire, which covered most of northern India, was further expanded to the south by his son Bindusara and grandson Ashoka, under whom the Mauryan Empire became the greatest of all Indian empires. Thus Ajātasattu's expansionist dreams were ultimately fulfilled beyond his imagining.

544. The commentary says this summary was added at the Council.

545. The commentary says this line was added at the Third Council, which was held about 150 years after the Buddha under Ashoka. The Buddha's life was already fading into legend.

- 6.28.1 There were eight shares
 of the Clear-eyed One's relics.⁵⁴⁶
Seven were worshiped in the Black Plum Tree Land.
But one share of the most excellent of men
was worshiped in Rāmagāma by a dragon king.
- 6.28.5 One tooth is venerated by the gods of the Third
 Heaven,⁵⁴⁷
and one is worshiped in the city of Gandhāra;
another one in the realm of the Kālīṅga King,
and one is worshiped by a dragon king.
- 6.28.9 Through their glory this rich earth
is adorned with the best of offerings.⁵⁴⁸
Thus the Clear-eyed One's corpse
is well honored by the honorable.
- 6.28.13 It's venerated by lords of gods, dragons, and fairies;⁵⁴⁹
and likewise venerated by the finest lords of men.

546. According to the commentary, the remainder of the text was added by the monks of Sri Lanka. Note, however, that this verse and the next are fairly similar to those in the Sanskrit text. Since that is a northern text, it seems unlikely these verses were composed in Sri Lanka.

547. The *tidiva* was the realm of Indra/Sakka (DN 21:1.12.22, DN 30:2.27.12, Thag 10.1:8.4), as it was from the time of the Vedas (Rig Veda 9.113.9, Atharva Veda 10.9.5, 17.1.10). In Buddhist cosmology, this agrees with the fact that Sakka's realm is the third of the heavens (after the earth gods and the four great kings). Thus the Third Heaven is the heaven of the Thirty-Three. Both ideas spring from an old association of Indra, or divinity generally, with the number three. Agni Purāṇa lists *tridiva* as a synonym for "heaven", as does Amarakośa 1.1.11. Kṣīrasvāmin clarifies that three here means "third", while also adding that some connect it with the Brahmā realm (Amarakośodghāṭana 1.1.6; see SN 7.18:4.2).

548. "Offering" is *āyāga*.

549. The context requires that this line lists three kinds of celestial beings, in contrast with humans in the next line, yet *nara* in Pali normally refers to a human. Monier-Williams, however, acknowledges that Sanskrit *nara* may refer to a class of beings allied to the *gandharva* and *kinnara*.

Honor it with cupped palms when you get the chance,
for a Buddha is rare even in a hundred eons.

Altogether forty even teeth,
and the body hair and head hair,
were carried off individually by gods
across the universe.

6.28.17

DN 17

King Mahāsudassana

Mahāsudassanasutta

- 1.1.1 SO I HAVE HEARD. At one time the Buddha was staying between a pair of sal trees in the sal forest of the Mallas at Upavattana near Kusinārā at the time of his full extinguishment.⁵⁵⁰
- 1.2.1 Then Venerable Ānanda went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him, “Sir, please don’t be fully extinguished in this little hamlet, this jungle hamlet, this branch hamlet. There are other great cities such as Campā, Rājagaha, Sāvattihī, Sāketa, Kosambī, and Varanasi. Let the Buddha be fully extinguished there. There are many well-to-do aristocrats, brahmins, and householders there who are devoted to the Buddha. They will perform the rites of venerating the Realized One’s corpse.”
- 1.3.1 “Don’t say that, Ānanda! Don’t say that this is a little hamlet, a jungle hamlet, a branch hamlet.

1. The Capital City of Kusāvati

- 1.3.4 Once upon a time, there was a king named Mahāsudassana whose dominion extended to all four sides, and who achieved stability in

550. Picking up the story of the Buddha’s past life as King Mahāsudassana from DN 16:5.17.1.

the country. His capital was this Kusinārā, which at the time was named Kusāvati. It stretched for twelve leagues from east to west, and seven leagues from north to south. The royal capital of Kusāvati was successful and prosperous, populous and full of people, with plenty of food. It was just like Ālakamandā, the royal capital of the gods, which is successful and prosperous, populous and full of spirits, with plenty of food.

Kusāvati was never free of ten sounds by day or night, namely: 1.3.10 the sound of elephants, horses, chariots, drums, clay drums, arched harps, singing, horns, gongs, and handbells; and the cry, 'Eat, drink, be merry!' as the tenth.

Kusāvati was encircled by seven ramparts:⁵⁵¹ one made of gold, 1.4.1 one made of silver, one made of beryl, one made of crystal, one made of ruby, one made of emerald, and one made of all precious things.

It had four gates, made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal. At each 1.5.1 gate there were seven pillars, three fathoms deep and four fathoms high,⁵⁵² made of gold, silver, beryl, crystal, ruby, emerald, and all precious things.

It was surrounded by seven rows of palm trees, made of gold, 1.6.1 silver, beryl, crystal, ruby, emerald, and all precious things. The golden palms had trunks of gold, and leaves and fruits of silver. The silver palms had trunks of silver, and leaves and fruits of gold. The beryl palms had trunks of beryl, and leaves and fruits of crystal. The crystal palms had trunks of crystal, and leaves and fruits of beryl. The ruby palms had trunks of ruby, and leaves and fruits of emerald. The emerald palms had trunks of emerald, and leaves and fruits of ruby. The palms of all precious things had trunks of all precious things, and leaves and fruits of all precious things. When those rows of palm trees were blown by the wind they sounded graceful, tantalizing,

551. From here we leave DN 16 behind and with it any semblance of realism. Some of these details are shared with SN 22.96, which however does not mention the name Mahāsudassana.

552. Readings vary. The Sanskrit text has *saptapauruṣā ardhacaturthapauruṣāś ca nikhātā*.

sensuous, lovely, and intoxicating, like a quintet made up of skilled musicians who had practiced well and kept excellent rhythm. And any addicts, carousers, or drunkards in Kusāvātī at that time were entertained by that sound.⁵⁵³

2. The Seven Treasures

2.1. The Wheel-Treasure

1.7.1 King Mahāsudassana possessed seven treasures and four blessings. What seven?

1.7.3 On a fifteenth day sabbath, King Mahāsudassana had bathed his head and gone upstairs in the royal longhouse to observe the sabbath.⁵⁵⁴ And the heavenly wheel-treasure appeared to him, with a thousand spokes, with rim and hub, complete in every detail.⁵⁵⁵ Seeing this, the king thought, ‘I have heard that when the heavenly wheel-treasure appears to a king in this way, he becomes a wheel-turning monarch. Am I then a wheel-turning monarch?’

1.8.1 Then King Mahāsudassana, rising from his seat and arranging his robe over one shoulder, took a ceremonial vase in his left hand and

553. I think the point is that they listened to the music rather than doing bad things.

554. This is specific instance, so I use past tense. Where it is an abstract description of a legendary past, I use the present tense to denote an eternal or mythic present.

555. The wheel is firstly the sun and secondly the wheel of the chariots that drove the Indo-Europeans in their conquests. It is the manifestation of unstoppable power. The solar imagery is reflected in the name Mahāsudassana (“Great Splendor”). The whole story reflects the Indo-European dream of universal domination.

besprinkled the wheel-treasure with his right hand, saying:⁵⁵⁶ ‘Roll forth, O wheel-treasure! Triumph, O wheel-treasure!’

Then the wheel-treasure rolled toward the east. And the king 1.8.3 followed it together with his army of four divisions. In whatever place the wheel-treasure stood still, there the king came to stay together with his army.⁵⁵⁷

And any opposing rulers of the eastern quarter came to him and 1.9.1 said, ‘Come, Great King! Welcome, Great King! We are yours, Great King, instruct us.’

The king said, ‘Do not kill living creatures. Do not steal. Do 1.9.3 not commit sexual misconduct. Do not lie. Do not drink liquor. Maintain the current level of taxation.’⁵⁵⁸ And so the opposing rulers of the eastern quarter became his vassals.

Then the wheel-treasure, having plunged into the eastern ocean 1.10.1 and emerged again, rolled toward the south. ...⁵⁵⁹

Having plunged into the southern ocean and emerged again, it 1.10.2 rolled toward the west. ...

Having plunged into the western ocean and emerged again, it 1.10.3 rolled toward the north, followed by the king together with his army of four divisions. In whatever place the wheel-treasure stood still, there the king came to stay together with his army.

556. Many of the details in this myth echo the Brahmanical horse sacrifice. Since the horse was the primary source of Indo-European dominion, its sacrifice served to authorize the power of a king. It was a costly and dangerous rite that was attempted only by the greatest of sovereigns. | *Bhīṅkāra* (“ceremonial vase”) and *abbhukkirati* (“besprinkled”) are elevated terms.

557. In the horse sacrifice, the horse is released for a year, while the king follows it with his army, claiming any land that it wanders on as his.

558. Read *bhuñjati* at MN 98:10.30 with *yathābhuttaṇca bhuñjatha* at DN 17:1.9.4, DN 26:6.7, and MN 129:35.7. These have sometimes been rendered “eat”, “enjoy”, or “govern”. But compare the archaic English “use” meaning “the benefit or profit of lands”. Thus *yathābhuttaṇca bhuñjatha* means “use as has been used”, i.e. “maintain the current level of taxation”.

559. The Wheel plunges into the seas, while the sacrificial horse is born in the western and eastern seas (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 10.6.4.1).

- 1.10.5 And any opposing rulers of the northern quarter came to him and said, ‘Come, Great King! Welcome, Great King! We are yours, Great King, instruct us.’
- 1.10.7 The king said, ‘Do not kill living creatures. Do not steal. Do not commit sexual misconduct. Do not lie. Do not drink liquor. Maintain the current level of taxation.’ And so the opposing rulers of the northern quarter became his vassals.⁵⁶⁰
- 1.11.1 And then the wheel-treasure, having triumphed over this land surrounded by ocean, returned to the royal capital. There it stood still by the gate to the royal compound at the High Court as if fixed to an axle, illuminating the royal compound.⁵⁶¹ Such is the wheel-treasure that appeared to King Mahāsudassana.

2.2. The Elephant-Treasure

- 1.12.1 Next, the elephant-treasure appeared to King Mahāsudassana. It was an all-white sky-walker with psychic power, touching the ground in seven places, a king of elephants named Sabbath.⁵⁶² Seeing him, the king was impressed, ‘This would truly be a fine elephant vehicle, if he would submit to taming.’ Then the elephant-treasure submitted to taming, as if he was a fine thoroughbred elephant that had been tamed for a long time.

560. Historically, India has usually been divided into squabbling realms, but from an early age there was a dream of a unified and peaceful continent.

561. “At the High Court” is uncertain. Read *aḍḍa* (variants *attha*, *aṭṭa*) which in Sanskrit has the senses “solve, infer, argue, discern”. The commentary interprets *aḍḍakaraṇa* as the “place of judgment” i.e. the court, which is clearly the case here (see also SN 3.7:1.5, MN 89:13.3). The affix *-pamukha* here does not mean “entrance”. Rather, it describes the attributes of a wheel-turning monarch in the sense of “finest” (eg. DN 17:2.5.1).

562. The white elephant is a symbol of royalty to this day. The description anticipates the elephant Indra acquired in later legends, Airāvata the “cloudy”, white and huge and moving through the sky. | For *sattappatiṭṭho*, the commentary has *susanṭhitaṅgapaccaṅga* (“well-grounded on each and every limb”), a sense confirmed by the Mūlasarvāstivāda Bhāṣajyavastu which has *saptāṅgaḥ supraṭiṣṭhito* (“well-established on seven limbs”). The subcommentary lists the four feet, trunk, tail, and penis (*varaṅga*).

Once it so happened that King Mahāsudassana, testing that same 1.12.6
elephant-treasure, mounted him in the morning and traversed the
land surrounded by ocean before returning to the royal capital in
time for breakfast. Such is the elephant-treasure that appeared to
King Mahāsudassana.

2.3. The Horse-Treasure

Next, the horse-treasure appeared to King Mahāsudassana. It was an 1.13.1
all-white sky-walker with psychic power, with head of black and mane
like woven reeds, a royal steed named Thundercloud.⁵⁶³ Seeing him,
the king was impressed, ‘This would truly be a fine horse vehicle, if
he would submit to taming.’ Then the horse-treasure submitted to
taming, as if he was a fine thoroughbred horse that had been tamed
for a long time.

Once it so happened that King Mahāsudassana, testing that same 1.13.6
horse-treasure, mounted him in the morning and traversed the land
surrounded by ocean before returning to the royal capital in time for
breakfast. Such is the horse-treasure that appeared to King Mahāsu-
dassana.

2.4. The Jewel-Treasure

Next, the jewel-treasure appeared to King Mahāsudassana. It was 1.14.1
a beryl gem that was naturally lustrous, eight-faceted, well-worked,
transparent, clear, and unclouded, endowed with all good qualities.
And the radiance of that jewel spread all-round for a league.

Once it so happened that King Mahāsudassana, testing that same 1.14.4
jewel-treasure, mobilized his army of four divisions and, with the
jewel hoisted on his banner, set out in the dark of the night. Then

563. The sacrificial horse is likewise white with black head or forequarters. It is identified with the sun, thus being a “sky-walker”. “Thundercloud” (*valāhaka*; Sanskrit *balāhaka*) is the name of one of the four horses of Kṛṣṇa’s chariot in the Mahābhārata. The description here also recalls the Vedic sacred horse Uccaiḥśravas.

the villagers around them set off to work, thinking that it was day. Such is the jewel-treasure that appeared to King Mahāsudassana.

2.5. The Woman-Treasure

- 1.15.1 Next, the woman-treasure appeared to King Mahāsudassana. She was attractive, good-looking, lovely, of surpassing beauty. She was neither too tall nor too short; neither too thin nor too fat; neither too dark nor too light. She outdid human beauty without reaching heavenly beauty. And her touch was like a tuft of cotton-wool or kapok. When it was cool her limbs were warm, and when it was warm her limbs were cool. The fragrance of sandal floated from her body, and lotus from her mouth. She got up before the king and went to bed after him, and was obliging, behaving nicely and speaking politely. The woman-treasure did not betray the wheel-turning monarch even in thought, still less in deed. Such is the woman-treasure that appeared to King Mahāsudassana.

2.6. The Householder-Treasure

- 1.16.1 Next, the householder-treasure appeared to King Mahāsudassana. The power of clairvoyance manifested in him as a result of past deeds, by which he sees treasure troves, both owned and ownerless.
- 1.16.3 He approached the king and said, ‘Relax, Your Majesty. I will take care of the treasury.’
- 1.16.5 Once it so happened that the wheel-turning monarch, testing that same householder-treasure, boarded a boat and sailed to the middle of the Ganges River. Then he said to the householder-treasure, ‘Householder, I need gold, both coined and uncoined.’
- 1.16.7 ‘Well then, Great King, draw the boat up to one shore.’
- 1.16.8 ‘It’s right here, householder, that I need gold, both coined and uncoined.’
- 1.16.9 Then that householder-treasure, immersing both hands in the water, pulled up a pot full of gold, both coined and uncoined, and

said to the king, ‘Is this sufficient, Great King? Has enough been done, Great King, enough offered?’

The king said, ‘That is sufficient, householder. Enough has been done, enough offered.’ 1.16.11

Such is the householder-treasure that appeared to King Mahāsudassana. 1.16.13

2.7. The Commander-Treasure

Next, the commander-treasure appeared to King Mahāsudassana. 1.18.1
He is astute, competent, intelligent, and capable regarding who should be ushered in to the king’s presence, who should be ushered out, and who should be kept by his side.⁵⁶⁴

He approached the king and said, ‘Relax, Your Majesty. I shall issue instructions.’ 1.18.3

Such is the commander-treasure that appeared to King Mahāsudassana. 1.18.5

These are the seven treasures possessed by King Mahāsudassana. 1.18.6

3. The Four Blessings

King Mahāsudassana possessed four blessings. And what are the four blessings? 1.18.8

He was attractive, good-looking, lovely, of surpassing beauty, more so than other humans. This is the first blessing. 1.18.10

Furthermore, he was long-lived, more so than other humans. This is the second blessing. 1.19.1

564. The “commander” (*pariṇāyaka*) is mostly found in Buddhist texts of this context, and is not a regular term of governance. This passage shows that he was responsible for management of the realm, while below he appears as commander of the army (DN 17:2.8.2). Elsewhere he is said to excel in strategy (AN 5.134:2.5).

1.20.1 Furthermore, he was rarely ill or unwell, and his stomach digested well, being neither too hot nor too cold, more so than other humans. This is the third blessing.

1.21.1 Furthermore, he was as dear and beloved to the brahmins and householders as a father is to his children. And the brahmins and householders were as dear to the king as children are to their father.

1.21.7 Once it so happened that King Mahāsudassana went with his army of four divisions to visit a park. Then the brahmins and householders went up to him and said, ‘Slow down, Your Majesty, so we may see you longer!’ And the king addressed his charioteer, ‘Drive slowly, charioteer, so I can see the brahmins and householders longer!’ This is the fourth blessing.

1.21.13 These are the four blessings possessed by King Mahāsudassana.

4. Lotus Ponds in the Palace of Principle

1.22.1 Then King Mahāsudassana thought, ‘Why don’t I have lotus ponds built between the palms, at intervals of a hundred bow lengths?’

1.22.3 So that’s what he did. The lotus ponds were lined with tiles of four colors, made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal.

1.22.6 And four flights of stairs of four colors descended into each lotus pond, made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal. The golden stairs had posts of gold, and banisters and finials of silver. The silver stairs had posts of silver, and banisters and finials of gold. The beryl stairs had posts of beryl, and banisters and finials of crystal. The crystal stairs had posts of crystal, and banisters and finials of beryl. Those lotus ponds were surrounded by two balustrades, made of gold and silver. The golden balustrades had posts of gold, and banisters and finials of silver. The silver balustrades had posts of silver, and banisters and finials of gold.

1.23.1 Then King Mahāsudassana thought, ‘Why don’t I plant flowers in the lotus ponds such as blue water lilies, and lotuses of pink, yellow, and white, blooming all year round, and accessible to the public?’ So that’s what he did.

Then King Mahāsudassana thought, ‘Why don’t I appoint bath attendants to help bathe the people who come to bathe in the lotus ponds?’ So that’s what he did. 1.23.4

Then King Mahāsudassana thought, ‘Why don’t I set up charities on the banks of the lotus ponds, so that those in need of food, drink, clothes, vehicles, beds, women, coined gold, or uncoined gold can get what they need?’⁵⁶⁵ So that’s what he did. 1.23.7

Then the brahmins and householders came to the king bringing abundant wealth and said,⁵⁶⁶ ‘Your Majesty, this abundant wealth is specially for you alone; may Your Majesty accept it!’ 1.24.1

‘There’s enough raised for me through regular taxes. Let this be for you; and here, take even more!’ 1.24.3

When the king turned them down, they withdrew to one side to think up a plan, ‘It wouldn’t be proper for us to take this abundant wealth back to our own homes. Why don’t we build a home for King Mahāsudassana?’ 1.24.4

They went up to the king and said, ‘We shall have a home built for you, Your Majesty!’ King Mahāsudassana consented with silence. 1.24.7

And then Sakka, lord of gods, knowing the king’s train of thought, addressed the godling Vissakamma, ‘Come, dear Vissakamma, build a palace named Principle as a home for King Mahāsudassana.’⁵⁶⁷ 1.25.1

‘Yes, lord,’ replied Vissakamma. Then, as easily as a strong person would extend or contract their arm, he vanished from the gods of the thirty-three and appeared in front of King Mahāsudassana. 1.25.3

Vissakamma said to the king, ‘I shall build a palace named Principle as a home for you, Your Majesty.’ King Mahāsudassana consented with silence. 1.25.4

And so that’s what Vissakamma did. 1.25.7

565. The jarring inclusion of “women” (*itthi*) in this list probably refers to state-sponsored prostitution.

566. As at DN 5:19.1.

567. The palace is named “Principle” (*dhamma*) in recognition of the king being subject to a higher law. Normally I translate *pāsāda* as “stilt longhouse” but here something grander is meant.

- 1.25.8 The Palace of Principle stretched for a league from east to west, and half a league from north to south. It was lined with tiles of four colors, three fathoms high, made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal.
- 1.26.1 It had 84,000 pillars of four colors, made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal. It was covered with panels of four colors, made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal.
- 1.26.5 It had twenty-four staircases of four colors, made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal. The golden stairs had posts of gold, and banisters and finials of silver. The silver stairs had posts of silver, and banisters and finials of gold. The beryl stairs had posts of beryl, and banisters and finials of crystal. The crystal stairs had posts of crystal, and banisters and finials of beryl.
- 1.26.11 It had 84,000 chambers of four colors,⁵⁶⁸ made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal. In each chamber a couch was spread: in the golden chamber a couch of silver; in the silver chamber a couch of gold; in the beryl chamber a couch of ivory; in the crystal chamber a couch of hardwood. At the door of the golden chamber stood a palm tree of silver, with trunk of silver, and leaves and fruits of gold. At the door of the silver chamber stood a palm tree of gold, with trunk of gold, and leaves and fruits of silver. At the door of the beryl chamber stood a palm tree of crystal, with trunk of crystal, and leaves and fruits of beryl. At the door of the crystal chamber stood a palm tree of beryl, with trunk of beryl, and leaves and fruits of crystal.
- 1.27.1 Then King Mahāsudassana thought, ‘Why don’t I build a grove of golden palm trees at the door to the Chamber of the Grand Tower, where I can sit for the day?’ So that’s what he did.
- 1.28.1 The Palace of Principle was surrounded by two balustrades, made of gold and silver. The golden balustrades had posts of gold, and banisters and finials of silver. The silver balustrades had posts of silver, and banisters and finials of gold.
- 1.29.1 The Palace of Principle was surrounded by two nets of bells, made of gold and silver. The golden net had bells of silver, and the silver net

568. For *kūṭāgāra* as “chamber” see MN 37:8.10.

had bells of gold. When those nets of bells were blown by the wind they sounded graceful, tantalizing, sensuous, lovely, and intoxicating, like a quintet made up of skilled musicians who had practiced well and kept excellent rhythm. And any addicts, carousers, or drunkards in Kusāvati at that time were entertained by that sound. When it was finished, the palace was hard to look at, dazzling to the eyes. It was like how in the last month of the rainy season, in autumn, when the heavens are sunny and cloudless, as the sun is rising to the firmament, it is hard to look at, dazzling to the eyes.

Then King Mahāsudassana thought, ‘Why don’t I build a lotus pond named Principle in front of the palace?’ So that’s what he did. The Lotus Pond of Principle stretched for a league from east to west, and half a league from north to south. It was lined with tiles of four colors, made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal. 1.30.1

It had twenty-four staircases of four colors, made of gold, silver, beryl, and crystal. The golden stairs had posts of gold, and banisters and finials of silver. The silver stairs had posts of silver, and banisters and finials of gold. The beryl stairs had posts of beryl, and banisters and finials of crystal. The crystal stairs had posts of crystal, and banisters and finials of beryl. 1.31.1

It was surrounded by two balustrades, made of gold and silver. The golden balustrades had posts of gold, and banisters and finials of silver. The silver balustrades had posts of silver, and banisters and finials of gold. 1.31.7

It was surrounded by seven rows of palm trees, made of gold, silver, beryl, crystal, ruby, emerald, and all precious things. The golden palms had trunks of gold, and leaves and fruits of silver. The silver palms had trunks of silver, and leaves and fruits of gold. The beryl palms had trunks of beryl, and leaves and fruits of crystal. The crystal palms had trunks of crystal, and leaves and fruits of beryl. The ruby palms had trunks of ruby, and leaves and fruits of emerald. The emerald palms had trunks of emerald, and leaves and fruits of ruby. The palms of all precious things had trunks of all precious things, and leaves and fruits of all precious things. When those rows of palm 1.32.1

trees were blown by the wind they sounded graceful, tantalizing, sensuous, lovely, and intoxicating, like a quintet made up of skilled musicians who had practiced well and kept excellent rhythm. And any addicts, carousers, or drunkards in Kusāvati at that time were entertained by that sound.

- 1.33.1 When the palace and its lotus pond were finished, King Mahāsu-dassana served those who were deemed true ascetics and brahmins with all they desired. Then he ascended the Palace of Principle.

The first recitation section.

5. Attaining Absorption

- 2.1.1 Then King Mahāsu-dassana thought, ‘Of what deed of mine is this the fruit and result, that I am now so mighty and powerful?’
- 2.1.3 Then King Mahāsu-dassana thought, ‘It is the fruit and result of three kinds of deeds:⁵⁶⁹ giving, self-control, and restraint.’
- 2.2.1 Then he went to the Chamber of the Grand Tower, stood at the door, and expressed this heartfelt sentiment: ‘Stop here, sensual, malicious, and cruel thoughts—⁵⁷⁰ no further!’
- 2.3.1 Then he entered the Chamber of the Grand Tower and sat on the golden couch. Quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unskillful qualities, he entered and remained in the first absorption, which has the rapture and bliss born of seclusion, while placing the mind and keeping it connected.⁵⁷¹ As the placing of the mind and keeping it connected were stilled, he entered and remained in the second absorption, which has the rapture and bliss born of immersion, with internal clarity and mind at one, without placing the mind and keeping it connected. And with the fading away of rapture, he entered and remained in the third absorption, where he

569. Thus denying the doctrine of Pūraṇa Kassapa at DN 2:17.5. This is the recognition, at least partially, of right view.

570. These are the three factors of right thought. The king skillfully uses a transition in physical space to set up his intention to meditate.

571. Here as in DN 1, *jhāna* is not a uniquely Buddhist practice.

meditated with equanimity, mindful and aware, experiencing for themselves the bliss of which the noble ones declare, ‘Equanimous and mindful, one meditates in bliss.’ With the giving up of pleasure and pain, and the disappearance of former happiness and sadness, he entered and remained in the fourth absorption, without pleasure or pain, with pure equanimity and mindfulness.

Then King Mahāsudassana left the Chamber of the Grand Tower 2.4.1 and entered the golden chamber, where he sat on the golden couch. He meditated spreading a heart full of love to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way he spread a heart full of love above, below, across, everywhere, all around, to everyone in the world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will. He meditated spreading a heart full of compassion ... He meditated spreading a heart full of rejoicing ... He meditated spreading a heart full of equanimity to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, he spread a heart full of equanimity to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will.

6. Of All Cities

King Mahāsudassana had 84,000 cities, with the royal capital of Ku- 2.5.1 sāvatī the foremost. He had 84,000 palaces, with the Palace of Principle the foremost.⁵⁷² He had 84,000 chambers, with the Chamber of the Grand Tower the foremost.⁵⁷³ He had 84,000 couches made of gold, silver, ivory, and hardwood. They were spread with woollen

572. “Palace” is *pāsāda*, literally “stilt longhouse”.

573. “Chamber” is *kūṭāgāra*, literally “building with peaked roof”. Normally this means “bungalow”, but in a similar description at MN 37:8.9 we hear of a “palace” with a hundred “towers” (*niyyūha*), each of which has seven hundred “chambers”. Thus the *kūṭāgāra* must be a structure many of which can belong to a palace, namely “chamber”, while *viyūha* (spelled *byūha* at SN 22.96:3.4) must have the same meaning as *niyyūha*, i.e. “tower”.

covers—shag-piled, pure white, or embroidered with flowers—and spread with a fine deer hide, with a canopy above and red pillows at both ends.⁵⁷⁴ He had 84,000 bull elephants with gold adornments and banners, covered with snow gold netting, with the royal bull elephant named Sabbath foremost. He had 84,000 horses with gold adornments and banners, covered with snow gold netting, with the royal steed named Thundercloud foremost. He had 84,000 chariots upholstered with the hide of lions, tigers, and leopards, and cream rugs, with gold adornments and banners, covered with snow gold netting, with the chariot named Triumph foremost.⁵⁷⁵ He had 84,000 jewels, with the jewel-treasure foremost. He had 84,000 women, with Queen Subhaddā foremost. He had 84,000 householders, with the householder-treasure foremost. He had 84,000 aristocrat vassals, with the commander-treasure foremost. He had 84,000 milk-cows with silken halter and bronze pails.⁵⁷⁶ He had 8,400,000 cloths of delicate linen, cotton, silk, and wool. He had 84,000 servings of food, which were presented to him as offerings at daybreak and dusk.

2.6.1 Now at that time his 84,000 royal elephants came to attend on him at daybreak and dusk. Then King Mahāsudassana thought, ‘What if instead half of the elephants took turns to attend on me at the end of each century?’⁵⁷⁷ He instructed the commander-treasure to do this, and so it was done.

7. The Visit of Queen Subhaddā

2.7.1 Then, after many years, many hundred years, many thousand years had passed, Queen Subhaddā thought, ‘It is long since I have seen the king. Why don’t I go to see him?’

574. This segment breaks the expected pattern of “foremost” things.

575. Not the British car of the same name. The chariot is the source of victory in battle.

576. Read *dukūlasandanāni*, where *dukūla* is “fine cloth, silk” and *sandana* is “cord, tether”.

577. An odd detail. Maybe the sound of the elephants disturbed his meditation?

So the queen addressed the ladies of the harem, ‘Come, bathe your heads and dress in yellow. It is long since we saw the king, and we shall go to see him.’ 2.7.3

‘Yes, ma’am,’ replied the ladies of the harem. They did as she asked and returned to the queen. 2.7.6

Then the queen addressed the commander-treasure, ‘Dear commander-treasure, please ready the army of four divisions. It is long since we saw the king, and we shall go to see him.’ 2.8.1

‘Yes, my queen,’ he replied, and did as he was asked. He informed the queen, ‘My queen, the army of four divisions is ready, please go at your convenience.’ 2.8.3

Then Queen Subhaddā together with the ladies of the harem went with the army to the Palace of Principle. She ascended the palace and went to the Chamber of the Grand Tower, where she stood leaning against a door-post.⁵⁷⁸ 2.8.6

Hearing them, the king thought, ‘What’s that, it sounds like a big crowd!’ Coming out of the chamber he saw Queen Subhaddā leaning against a door-post and said to her, ‘Please stay there, my queen, don’t enter in here.’⁵⁷⁹ 2.8.8

Then he addressed a certain man, ‘Come, my man, bring the golden couch from the Chamber of the Grand Tower and set it up in the golden palm grove.’ 2.9.1

‘Yes, Your Majesty,’ that man replied, and did as he was asked. The king laid down in the lion’s posture—on the right side, placing one foot on top of the other—mindful and aware. 2.9.3

Then Queen Subhaddā thought, ‘The king’s faculties are so very clear, and the complexion of his skin is pure and bright. Let him not pass away!’ She said to him,⁵⁸⁰ ‘Your Majesty, you have 84,000 cities, 2.10.1

578. Like Ānanda at DN 16:5.13.1.

579. He makes it clear that this will not be an intimate visit.

580. The aorist is not past tense, as it is governed by *mā*.

with the royal capital of Kusāvati foremost. Arouse desire for these! Take an interest in life!’⁵⁸¹

2.10.5 And she likewise urged the king to live on by taking an interest in all his possessions as described above.

2.11.1 When the queen had spoken, the king said to her, ‘For a long time, my queen, you have spoken to me with words that are welcome, desirable, agreeable, and pleasant. And yet in my final hour, your words are unwelcome, undesirable, disagreeable, and unpleasant!’⁵⁸²

2.11.4 ‘So how then, Your Majesty, am I to speak to you?’

2.11.5 ‘Like this, my queen: “Your Majesty, we must be parted and separated from all we hold dear and beloved. Don’t pass away with concerns. Such concern is suffering, and it’s criticized.”⁵⁸³ Your Majesty, you have 84,000 cities, with the royal capital of Kusāvati foremost. Give up desire for these! Take no interest in life!”’ And so on for all the king’s possessions.

2.12.1 When the king had spoken, Queen Subhaddā cried and burst out in tears.⁵⁸⁴ Wiping away her tears, the queen said to the king: ‘Your Majesty, we must be parted and separated from all we hold dear and beloved. Don’t pass away with concerns. Such concern is suffering, and it’s criticized. Your Majesty, you have 84,000 cities, with the royal capital of Kusāvati foremost. Give up desire for these! Take no interest in life!’ And she continued, listing all the king’s possessions.

581. “Desire” is *chanda*, the first of the four bases of psychic power, which in DN 16:3.3.1 are said to lead to long life. By urging him to live long, she inverts the Mahāparinibbānasutta where Ānanda fails to do the same.

582. Implying that Ānanda was right to not beg the Buddha to live long.

583. At AN 6.16:2.2 this advice is given by Nakula’s mother.

584. Like Ānanda at DN 16:5.13.1.

8. Rebirth in the Realm of Divinity

Not long after that, King Mahāsudassana passed away. And the feeling he had close to death was like a householder or their child falling asleep after eating a satisfying meal.⁵⁸⁵ 2.13.1

When he passed away King Mahāsudassana was reborn in a good place, a realm of divinity. Ānanda, King Mahāsudassana played children's games for 84,000 years. He ruled as viceroy for 84,000 years. He ruled as king for 84,000 years. He led the spiritual life as a layman in the Palace of Principle for 84,000 years. And having developed the four divine meditations, when his body broke up, after death, he was reborn in a good place, a realm of divinity. 2.13.3

Now, Ānanda, you might think: 'Surely King Mahāsudassana must have been someone else at that time?' But you should not see it like that. I myself was King Mahāsudassana at that time.⁵⁸⁶ 2.14.1

Mine were the 84,000 cities, with the royal capital of Kusāvati foremost. And mine were all the other possessions. 2.14.4

Of those 84,000 cities, I only stayed in one, the capital Kusāvati. Of those 84,000 palaces, I only dwelt in one, the Palace of Principle. Of those 84,000 chambers, I only dwelt in the Chamber of the Grand Tower. Of those 84,000 couches, I only used one, made of gold or silver or ivory or heartwood. Of those 84,000 bull elephants, I only rode one, the royal bull elephant named Sabbath. Of those 84,000 horses, I only rode one, the royal horse named Thundercloud. Of those 84,000 chariots, I only rode one, the chariot named Triumph. Of those 84,000 women, I was only served by one, an aristocrat maiden or a coquette.⁵⁸⁷ Of those 8,400,000,000 cloths, I only wore 2.15.1

585. This contrasts with the Buddha's last meal at DN 16:4.20.1, which caused sickness and distress. The Buddha was rejecting existence entirely, whereas Mahāsudassana was continuing in a pleasant form of conditioned existence.

586. After DN 5:21.16, this is the second Jātaka in the Dīghanikāya.

587. Readings here and at SN 22.96:4.8 are confused, and further complicated at Tha Ap 411:4.1. I read *velāsikā* due to the passage's similarity DN 23:15.4, where a "coquette" is also serving a royal. I believe the variant *velāmikā* is a ghost word contaminated from AN 9.20:4.1.

one pair, made of delicate linen, cotton, silk, or wool. Of those 84,000 servings of food, I only had one, eating at most a cup of rice with suitable sauce.

2.16.1 See, Ānanda! All those conditioned phenomena have passed, ceased, and perished. So impermanent are conditions, so unstable are conditions, so unreliable are conditions. This is quite enough for you to become disillusioned, dispassionate, and freed regarding all conditions.

2.17.1 Six times, Ānanda, I recall having laid down my body at this place. And the seventh time was as a wheel-turning monarch, a just and principled king, at which time my dominion extended to all four sides, I achieved stability in the country, and I possessed the seven treasures. But Ānanda, I do not see any place in this world with its gods, Māras, and divinities, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its gods and humans where the Realized One would lay down his body for the eighth time.”

2.17.3 That is what the Buddha said. Then the Holy One, the Teacher, went on to say:

2.17.5 “Oh! Conditions are impermanent,
their nature is to rise and fall;
having arisen, they cease;
their settling is such bliss.”

DN 18

With Janavasabha

Janavasabhasutta

1. Declaring the Rebirths of People From Ñātika and Elsewhere

SO I HAVE HEARD. At one time the Buddha was staying at Ñātika in 1.1
the brick house.⁵⁸⁸

Now at that time the Buddha was explaining the rebirths of devo- 1.3
tees all over the nations; the Kāsis and Kosalans, Vajjis and Mallas,
Cetis and Vacchas, Kurus and Pañcālas, Macchas and Sūrasenas.⁵⁸⁹

“This one was reborn here, while that one was reborn there. 1.4

588. This picks up from the events of DN 16:2.5.1, which however discusses only the Ñātikans (who are reckoned among the Vajjis). Like DN 17, it bears many signs of a late sutta. The overall theme is the presence of a cosmic order where the liberating teaching of the Buddha is reconciled with the requirements of worldly power.

589. This list of ten nations is unique. The omission of the Aṅgas and Magadhans is noted below. The more famous list of “sixteen nations” adds Avanti and Assaka in the south, and Gandhāra and Kamboja in the north-west (eg. AN 3.70:28.3). The Buddha did not visit these lands, which explains why they are omitted.

- 1.5 Over fifty devotees in Ñātika have passed away having ended the five lower fetters. They’ve been reborn spontaneously, and will be extinguished there, not liable to return from that world.⁵⁹⁰
- 1.6 More than ninety devotees in Ñātika have passed away having ended three fetters, and weakened greed, hate, and delusion. They’re once-returners, who will come back to this world once only, then make an end of suffering.
- 1.7 More than five hundred devotees in Ñātika have passed away having ended three fetters. They’re stream-enterers, not liable to be reborn in the underworld, assured, destined for awakening.”
- 2.1 When the devotees of Ñātika heard about the Buddha’s answers to those questions, they became uplifted and overjoyed, full of rapture and happiness.
- 3.1 Venerable Ānanda heard of the Buddha’s statements and the Ñātikans’ happiness.

2. Ānanda’s Suggestion

- 4.1 Then Venerable Ānanda thought, “But there were also Magadhan devotees—many, and of long standing too—who have passed away.⁵⁹¹ You’d think that Āṅga and Magadha were empty of devotees who have passed away! But they too had confidence in the Buddha, the teaching, and the Saṅgha, and had fulfilled their ethics. The Buddha hasn’t declared their passing. It would be good to do so,

590. “Devotees” is *paricāraka*, which normally means “servant”. It is not in the relevant passages of DN 16. This sense is found in only a couple of other places, both late (Snp 5.18:1.2, Kd 1:22.14.8).

591. Bearing in mind that none of the nations were actually mentioned in the relevant Mahāparinibbānasutta passage, this whole introduction is framed to emphasize the importance of Magadha to Buddhism, especially given the problematic character of Ajātasattu. In the decades following the Buddha’s death, the Buddhist community adapted to a new political landscape which for a time saw the entirety of Buddhism contained within the sprawling Magadhan empire.

for many people would gain confidence, and so be reborn in a good place.

That King Seniya Bimbisāra of Magadha was a just and principled 4.7 king who benefited the brahmins and householders, and people of town and country.⁵⁹² People still sing his praises: ‘That just and principled king, who made us so happy, has passed away. Life was good under his dominion.’⁵⁹³ He too had confidence in the Buddha, the teaching, and the Saṅgha, and had fulfilled his ethics. People say: ‘Until his dying day, King Bimbisāra sang the Buddha’s praises!’⁵⁹⁴ The Buddha hasn’t declared his passing. It would be good to do so, for many people would gain confidence, and so be reborn in a good place.

Besides, the Buddha was awakened in Magadha;⁵⁹⁵ so why hasn’t 4.15 he declared the rebirth of the Magadhan devotees? If he fails to do so, they will be disheartened.”

After pondering the fate of the Magadhan devotees alone in pri- 5.1 vate, Ānanda rose at the crack of dawn and went to the Buddha. He bowed, sat down to one side, and told the Buddha of his concerns, finishing by saying, “Why hasn’t the Buddha declared the rebirth of the Magadhan devotees? If he fails to do so, they will be disheartened.” Then Ānanda, after making this suggestion regarding

592. As we know from DN 2, Bimbisāra had recently been murdered by Ajātasattu.

593. A not-so-subtle hint of the changes under Ajātasattu. The passing of Bimbisāra signifies the crumbling of the social order that prevailed in the Buddha’s lifetime, bringing with it the immediate threat of war and chaos. This sutta establishes a timeless order that persists while worldly conditions fluctuate.

594. Elsewhere the suttas say that Bimbisāra went for refuge (DN 4:6.33), while the Vinaya says he was in fact a stream-enterer (Kd 1:22.9.1), which is confirmed below. The Jains, however, claim him as one of their own but say he went to hell for committing suicide. Like his son Ajātasattu, it is likely that he frequented several teachers in his realm.

595. Near the town of Uruvelā on the bank of the Nerañjarā River at the place known today as Bodhgaya.

the Magadhan devotees, rose from his seat, bowed, and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on his right, before leaving.⁵⁹⁶

- 7.1 Soon after Ānanda had left, the Buddha robed up in the morning and, taking his bowl and robe, entered Nātika for alms. He wandered for alms in Nātika. After the meal, on his return from almsround, he washed his feet and entered the brick house. He paid attention, applied the mind, and concentrated wholeheartedly on the fate of Magadhan devotees, and sat down on the seat spread out, thinking,⁵⁹⁷ “I shall know their destiny, where they are reborn in the next life.” And he saw where they had been reborn.
- 7.6 Then in the late afternoon, the Buddha came out of retreat. Emerging from the brick house, he sat down on the seat spread out in the shade of the porch.
- 8.1 Then Venerable Ānanda went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him, “Sir, you look so serene; your face seems to shine owing to the clarity of your faculties. Have you been abiding in a peaceful meditation today, sir?”
- 9.1 The Buddha then recounted what had happened since speaking to Ānanda, revealing that he had seen the destiny of the Magadhan devotees. He continued:

3. Janavasabha the Spirit

- 9.5 “Then, Ānanda, an invisible spirit called out: ‘I am Janavasabha, Blessed One! I am Janavasabha, Holy One!’ Ānanda, do you recall having previously heard such a name as Janavasabha?”⁵⁹⁸

596. “Suggestion” is *parikatham*, which elsewhere occurs in the Vinaya (Kd 7:1.5.16) and the Abhidhamma Vibhaṅga (Vb 17:43.2) in the sense of “hint”.

597. Normally *aṭṭhim katvā manasikatvā sabbaṃ cetasā samannāharitvā* describes listening to Dhamma. This whole process seems unusually laborious.

598. *Nāmadheyyam* means “name (borne by someone or something)”, not “one who bears the name” (MN 50:22.1).

“No, worthy sir. But when I heard the word, I got goosebumps! 9.9
I thought, ‘This must be no ordinary spirit to bear such an exalted
name as Janavasabha.’”⁵⁹⁹

“After making himself heard while invisible, Ānanda, an excep- 10.1
tionally beautiful spirit appeared in front of me.⁶⁰⁰ And for a second
time he called out: ‘I am Bimbisāra, Blessed One! I am Bimbisāra,
Holy One! This is the seventh time I am reborn in the company
of the Great King Vessavaṇa. When I pass away from here, I can
become a king of men.’⁶⁰¹

Seven from here, seven from there— 10.6
fourteen transmigrations in all.⁶⁰²
I remember these lives
where I lived before.

For a long time I’ve known that I won’t be reborn in the under- 10.10
world, but that I still hope to become a once-returner.”⁶⁰³

‘It’s incredible and amazing that you, the venerable spirit 10.11
Janavasabha, should say:

“For a long time I’ve been aware that I won’t be reborn in the 10.12
underworld” and also “But I still hope to become a once-returner.”
But from what source do you know that you’ve achieved such a high
distinction?”⁶⁰⁴

599. *Janavasabha* is “chief of men”, spelled *janesabha* at DN 20:10.10 and DN 32:10.9. The synonym *narāsabha* is an occasional poetic epithet of the Buddha (Sn 3.11:6.2, Sn 5.1:21.3, SN 11.3:14.2). In Sanskrit we find *puruṣaṣabha* in the same sense.

600. *Uḷāravaṇṇa* describes beautiful people at MN 96:7.8.

601. Read *ito*. I think this implies what is stated more explicitly in Anuruddha’s partly parallel verses at Thag 16.9:23.1: after each of seven rebirths under Vessavaṇa he can become a king of men. This explains the name Janavasabha.

602. It is rare to see *samsāra* used as a countable noun, but see Thag 2.48:2.2.

603. As a stream-enterer he is freed from any lower rebirths, yet he still aspires to a higher realization.

604. In this idiom, the verb for “aware” varies between *sañjānāti*, *jānāti*, *pajānāti*, and *sampajānāti*.

- 11.1 ‘None other than the Blessed One’s instruction! None other than the Holy One’s instruction!’⁶⁰⁵ From the day I had absolute devotion to the Buddha I have known that I won’t be reborn in the underworld, but that I still hope to become a once-returner. Just now, sir, I had been sent out by the great king Vessavaṇa to the great king Virūlhaka’s presence on some business, and on the way I saw the Buddha giving his attention to the fate of the Magadhan devotees. But it comes as no surprise that I have heard and learned the fate of the Magadhan devotees in the presence of the great king Vessavaṇa as he was speaking to his assembly. It occurred to me, “I shall see the Buddha and inform him of this.” These are the two reasons I’ve come to see the Buddha.

4. The Council of the Gods

- 12.1 Sir, it was more than a few days ago—on the fifteenth day sabbath on the full moon day at the entry to the rainy season—when all the gods of the thirty-three were sitting together in the Hall of Clear Right.⁶⁰⁶ A large assembly of gods was sitting all around, and the four great kings were seated at the four quarters.⁶⁰⁷
- 12.3 The Great King Dhataratṭha was seated to the east, facing west, in front of his gods. The Great King Virūlhaka was seated to the south, facing north, in front of his gods. The Great King Virūpakka was seated to the west, facing east, in front of his gods. The Great King Vessavaṇa was seated to the north, facing south, in front of his gods. When the gods of the thirty-three have a gathering like this, that is how they are seated. After that come our seats.

605. Compare SN 1.50:5.1 and SN 2.24:6.1.

606. It is not just the Vajjis and the Buddhist Saṅgha who meet frequently in a hall to discuss business, but the gods as well. Here we get a rare glimpse into how the heavens work, or more to the point, how depictions of heavenly proceedings act as a template for how things should be on earth.

607. The thirty-three and the Four Great Kings are both present; the heavenly realms are not shut off from one another.

Sir, those gods who had been recently reborn in the company of 12.9
the thirty-three after leading the spiritual life under the Buddha out-
shone the other gods in beauty and glory. The gods of the thirty-three
became uplifted and overjoyed at that, full of rapture and happiness,
saying, “The heavenly hosts swell, while the titan hosts dwindle!”

Seeing the joy of those gods, Sakka, lord of gods, celebrated with 13.1
these verses:

“The gods rejoice— 13.2
the thirty-three with their Lord—
revering the Realized One,
and the clear rightness of the teaching;⁶⁰⁸

and seeing the new gods, 13.6
so beautiful and glorious,
who have come here after leading
the spiritual life under the Buddha!

They outshine the others 13.10
in beauty, glory, and lifespan.
Here are the distinguished disciples
of he whose wisdom is vast.

Seeing this, they delight— 13.14
the thirty-three with their Lord—
revering the Realized One,

608. In the Suttas, *sudhamma* (“clear right”) is used in two main contexts: as the name of the hall of the gods, and in this expression (it is also a personal name). Both are found in this Sutta, suggesting they have the same meaning. *Dhammassa ca sudhammatam* echoes Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 14.2.2.29, *dharmāsi sudharmeti* (“You are a well-supporting support”). This is a ritual invocation of the Sun as that which supports everything here in this world. In Pali, it is something we are frequently urged to “behold” (eg. Thag 4.2:4.2), suggesting the metaphorical link with the Sun’s brilliance is not entirely lost. And as the hall of the gods, the sense of the “Sun” is also fitting. The idea is that the Sun is regular and lawful, and by shedding its light on all of us, it is a clear visible manifestation of what is right and just.

and the clear rightness of the teaching.”

13.18 The gods of the thirty-three became even more uplifted and overjoyed at that, saying: “The heavenly hosts swell, while the titan hosts dwindle!”

14.1 Then the gods of the thirty-three, having considered and deliberated on the matter for which they were seated together in the Hall of Clear Right, advised and instructed the four great kings on the subject. Each one, having been advised, stood at his own seat without leaving.⁶⁰⁹

14.3 The Kings were instructed,
and heeded good advice.
With clear and peaceful minds,
they stood by their own seats.

15.1 Then in the northern quarter a magnificent light arose and radiance appeared, surpassing the glory of the gods.⁶¹⁰ Then Sakka, lord of gods, addressed the gods of the thirty-three, “As indicated by the signs—light arising and radiance appearing—The Divinity will appear. For this is the harbinger for the appearance of the Divinity, namely light arising and radiance appearing.”

15.4 As indicated by the signs,
The Divinity will appear.
For this is the sign of the Divinity:
a light vast and great.

609. For *vipakkamati* compare MN 127:11.1.

610. Compare DN 11:80.12.

5. On Sanaṅkumāra

Then the gods of the thirty-three sat in their own seats, saying, “We shall find out what has caused that light, and only when we have realized it shall we go to it.”⁶¹¹ And the four great kings did likewise. 16.1

Hearing that, the gods of the thirty-three agreed in unison, “We shall find out what has caused that light, and only when we have realized it shall we go to it.” 16.5

When the divinity Sanaṅkumāra appears to the gods of the thirty-three, he does so after manifesting a solid incarnation.⁶¹² For a Divinity’s normal appearance is imperceptible in the visual range of the gods of the thirty-three.⁶¹³ When the divinity Sanaṅkumāra appears to the gods of the thirty-three, he outshines the other gods in beauty and glory, as a golden statue outshines the human form.⁶¹⁴ 17.1

When the divinity Sanaṅkumāra appears to the gods of the thirty-three, not a single god in that assembly greets him by bowing down or rising up or inviting him to a seat. They all sit silently on their couches with their cupped palms raised, thinking, “Now the divinity Sanaṅkumāra will sit on the couch of whatever god he chooses.” And the god on whose couch the Divinity sits is overjoyed and brimming with happiness, like a king on the day of his coronation. 17.6

Then the divinity Sanaṅkumāra manifested a solid incarnation, taking on the appearance of the youth Pañcasikha, and appeared to the gods of the thirty-three.⁶¹⁵ Rising into the air, he sat cross-legged in the sky, like a strong man might sit cross-legged on a well- 18.3

611. For *vipāko bhavissati* in discerning the results of signs, compare DN 1:1.24.2.

612. See AN 3.127:2.3.

613. This phrase is also at DN 19:16.8, but apart from that the words *pakativanna* (“normal appearance”), *anabhisambhavanīya* (“imperceptible”), and *cakkhupatha* (“visual range”) are all unique in the early texts.

614. For the unique term “human form” (*mānusaṃ viggahaṃ*) compare the Vinaya phrase *manussaviggahaṃ* (Bu Pj 3:2.49.1).

615. Also appearing in DN 21:1.8.3, DN 20:10.11, and SN 35.119, Pañcasikha (“Five-Crest”) was a handsome and virile deity of the *gandhabbas*.

appointed couch or on level ground. Seeing the joy of those gods, the divinity Sanañkumāra celebrated with these verses:

18.7 “The gods rejoice—
 the thirty-three with their Lord—
 revering the Realized One,
 and the clear rightness of the teaching;

18.11 and seeing the new gods,
 so beautiful and glorious,
 who have come here after leading
 the spiritual life under the Buddha!

18.15 They outshine the others
 in beauty, glory, and lifespan.
 Here are the distinguished disciples
 of he whose wisdom is vast.

18.19 Seeing this, they delight—
 the thirty-three with their Lord—
 revering the Realized One,
 and the clear rightness of the teaching!”

19.1 That is the topic on which the divinity Sanañkumāra spoke.⁶¹⁶
And while he was speaking on that topic, his voice had eight qualities:
it was clear, comprehensible, charming, audible, lucid, undistorted,
deep, and resonant.⁶¹⁷ He makes sure his voice is intelligible as
far as the assembly goes, but the sound doesn’t extend outside the
assembly. When someone has a voice like this, they’re said to have
the voice of the Divinity.

20.1 Then the divinity Sanañkumāra, having manifested thirty-three
life-forms, sat down on the couches of each of the gods of the thirty-
three and addressed them, “What do the good gods of the thirty-

616. *Bhāsitttha* is 3rd singular aorist middle voice.

617. Compare MN 91:21.4.

three think? How the Buddha has acted for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans!⁶¹⁸ For consider those who have gone for refuge to the Buddha, the teaching, and the Saṅgha, and have fulfilled their ethics. When their bodies break up, after death, some are reborn in the company of the gods who control what is created by others, some with the gods who love to create, some with the joyful gods, some with the gods of Yama, some with the gods of the thirty-three, and some with the gods of the four great kings.⁶¹⁹ And at the very least they swell the hosts of the centaurs.”

That is the topic on which the divinity Sanaṅkumāra spoke. And 21.1
hearing the sound of the Divinity speaking on that topic, the gods
fancied, “The one sitting on my couch is the only one speaking.”

When one is speaking,
all the forms speak.

21.4

When one sits in silence,
they all remain silent.

618. Everything Sanaṅkumāra says is just a bit off. Here he adopts an idiom commonly used by the Buddha, but in third person rather than the Buddha's second person; and he asks only rhetorically, where the Buddha engages with his audience. If it were only this one example it would mean nothing, but similar changes happen throughout. I believe this is a subtle literary device that tells two narratives to two audiences. To potential converts it sounds like Sanaṅkumāra is giving a ringing and learned endorsement of Buddhism, while to knowledgeable Buddhists he appears as less than well versed in the teachings. I note these eccentric wordings as we proceed.

619. The sutta began by recounting those who have achieved various stages of awakening. But escape from rebirth threatens the gods; this potentially fraught relationship is played out in MN 49. Sanaṅkumāra is preempting such arguments by pointing out that many of the Buddha's followers are reborn among the gods and do not escape transmigration, at least not for now. This is no trivial metaphysical argument. In order for Buddhism to prevail, it must show that its radical soteriology is compatible with worldly prosperity, lest it face opposition from kings and other temporal powers. The gods act as proxies to demonstrate the appropriate behavior for terrestrial kings. This is why the leading character is Bimbisāra/Janavasabha, who straddles the two realms.

21.8 But those gods imagine—
the thirty-three with their Lord—
that the one on their seat
is the only one to speak.

22.1 Next the divinity Sanañkumāra merged into one corporeal form. Then he sat on the couch of Sakka, lord of gods, and addressed the gods of the thirty-three:⁶²⁰

6. Developing the Bases of Psychic Power

22.3 “What do the good gods of the thirty-three think? How well described by the Blessed One—who knows and sees, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha—are the four bases of psychic power! They are taught for the amplification, burgeoning, and transformation of psychic power.⁶²¹ What four? It’s when a mendicant develops the basis of psychic power that has immersion due to enthusiasm, and active effort. They develop the basis of psychic power that has immersion due to energy, and active effort. They develop the basis of psychic power that has immersion due to mental development, and active effort. They develop the basis of psychic power that has immersion due to inquiry, and active effort. These are the four bases

620. Sanañkumāra begins sharing the Buddha’s teaching with the gods, starting with the bases of psychic power that featured prominently in DN 16. Here, however, he focuses on the worldly dimensions of psychic powers, ignoring the liberating dimension that was central to the Buddha. This sets the pattern for the teachings to follow, except for the very last. | “Corporeal form” is *attā* in its old sense of “body”. Compare Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 1.2.3, “He divided this corporeal form (*ātman*) into three ...”.

621. *Yāva supaññattā*, which is also at MN 51:4.3, is a variation of the common exclamation *yāva subhāsita*. The phrase *iddhipahutāya iddhivisavitāya iddhivikubbanatāya* is unique. The Paṭisambhidāmagga draws on this passage to explain *vikubbana* both as a general term for development of psychic powers (Ps 3.2:4.3) and as specific kind of psychic power, namely the transformation of one’s apparent form as demonstrated by Sanañkumāra (Ps 3.2:15.1).

of psychic power taught by the Buddha for the amplification, burgeoning, and transformation of psychic power.

All the ascetics and brahmins in the past, future, or present who wield the many kinds of psychic power do so by developing and cultivating these four bases of psychic power. Gentlemen, do you see such psychic might and power in me?" 22.10

"Yes, Great Divinity." 22.14

"I too became so mighty and powerful by developing and cultivating these four bases of psychic power." 22.15

That is the topic on which the divinity Saṇāṅkumāra spoke. And having spoken about that, he addressed the gods of the thirty-three: 23.1

7. The Three Openings

"What do the good gods of the thirty-three think? How well understood by the Buddha are the three opportunities for achieving happiness!⁶²² What three? 23.4

First, take someone who lives mixed up with sensual pleasures and unskillful qualities.⁶²³ After some time they hear the teaching of the noble ones, rationally apply the mind to how it applies to them, and practice in line with the teaching. They live aloof from sensual pleasures and unskillful qualities.⁶²⁴ That gives rise to pleasure, and more than pleasure, happiness,⁶²⁵ like the joy that's born from gladness. This is the first opportunity for achieving happiness. 23.6

Next, take someone whose coarse physical, verbal, and mental processes have not died down.⁶²⁶ After some time they hear the 24.1

622. These "three opportunities" are not found elsewhere.

623. This unique term is the reverse of the phrase that begins the first *jhāna*. The passage, however, speaks only of lifestyle rather than deep meditation.

624. "Aloof" (*asaṃsaṭṭha*) is a synonym of "secluded" (*vivicca*). The *jhāna* formulas are extremely stable and it is rare to find them played with like this.

625. Since *jhāna* arises from pleasure, it cannot be meant here.

626. "Coarse physical, verbal, and mental processes" (*oḷārikā kāyasāṅkhārā ... vacīsāṅkhārā ... cittasāṅkhārā*) is another unique term. They are probably to be identified with the three "processes" of MN 44:14.2.

teaching of the noble ones, rationally apply the mind to how it applies to them, and practice in line with the teaching. Their coarse physical, verbal, and mental processes die down. That gives rise to pleasure, and more than pleasure, happiness, like the joy that's born from gladness. This is the second opportunity for achieving happiness.

25.1 Next, take someone who doesn't truly understand what is skillful and what is unskillful,⁶²⁷ what is blameworthy and what is blameless, what should be cultivated and what should not be cultivated, what is inferior and what is superior, and what has a portion of dark or bright. After some time they hear the teaching of the noble ones, rationally apply the mind to how it applies to them, and practice in line with the teaching. They truly understand what is skillful and what is unskillful, and so on. Knowing and seeing like this, ignorance is given up and knowledge arises. That gives rise to pleasure, and more than pleasure, happiness, like the joy that's born from gladness. This is the third opportunity for achieving happiness.

25.11 These are the three opportunities for achieving happiness that have been understood by the Buddha.”

26.1 That is the topic on which the divinity Sanañkumāra spoke. And having spoken about that, he addressed the gods of the thirty-three:

8. Mindfulness Meditation

26.4 “What do the good gods of the thirty-three think? How well described by the Buddha are the four kinds of mindfulness meditation! They are taught for achieving what is skillful.⁶²⁸ What four?

26.6 It's when a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body internally—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. As they meditate in this way, they become

627. This builds off DN 1:2.24.1, but the full phrase is only here and DN 19:7.2.

628. Normally *satipaṭṭhāna* is taught “in order to purify sentient beings, to get past sorrow and crying, to make an end of pain and sadness, to end the cycle of suffering, and to realize extinguishment” (eg. DN 22:1.7). Here, in yet another unique phrasing, a more humble goal is sought.

rightly immersed in that, and rightly serene. Then they give rise to knowledge and vision of other people's bodies externally.⁶²⁹

They meditate observing an aspect of feelings internally ... Then they give rise to knowledge and vision of other people's feelings externally. 26.9

They meditate observing an aspect of the mind internally ... Then they give rise to knowledge and vision of other people's minds externally. 26.11

They meditate observing an aspect of principles internally—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. As they meditate in this way, they become rightly immersed in that, and rightly serene. Then they give rise to knowledge and vision of other people's principles externally. 26.13

These are the four kinds of mindfulness meditation taught by the Buddha for achieving what is skillful.” 26.16

That is the topic on which the divinity Sanaṅkumāra spoke. And having spoken about that, he addressed the gods of the thirty-three: 27.1

9. Seven Prerequisites of Immersion

“What do the good gods of the thirty-three think? How well described by the Buddha are the seven prerequisites of immersion for the development and fulfillment of right immersion!⁶³⁰ What seven? Right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, and right mindfulness. Unification of mind with these seven factors as prerequisites is called noble right immersion ‘with its vital conditions’ and also ‘with its prerequisites’ 27.4

Right view produces right purpose. Right purpose produces right speech. Right speech produces right action. Right action produces 27.8

629. Again the liberating dimension is ignored in favor of worldly psychic abilities. This is another unique formulation.

630. Also found at AN 7.45:1.1. At MN 44:12.4 the four right efforts are said to be the “prerequisites of immersion”. Here at last Sanaṅkumāra introduces the liberating dimension of the path as a whole.

right livelihood. Right livelihood produces right effort. Right effort produces right mindfulness. Right mindfulness produces right immersion. Right immersion produces right knowledge. Right knowledge produces right freedom.⁶³¹

27.9 If anything should be rightly described as ‘a teaching that’s well explained by the Buddha, apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves; and the doors to freedom from death are flung open,’ it’s this.⁶³² For the teaching is well explained by the Buddha—apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves—and the doors to freedom from death are flung open.

27.12 Whoever has experiential confidence in the Buddha, the teaching, and the Saṅgha, and has the ethical conduct loved by the noble ones; and whoever is spontaneously reborn, and is trained in the teaching; more than 2,400,000 such Magadhan devotees have passed away having ended three fetters. They’re stream-enterers, not liable to be reborn in the underworld, assured, destined for awakening.⁶³³ And there are once-returners here, too.

27.14 And as for the rest of folk,⁶³⁴

631. Also at SN 45.1, etc.

632. To the standard passage on the qualities of the Dhamma, Sanañkumāra clumsily tacks on the line spoken by the Buddha when he was persuaded by Brahmā to teach (SN 6.1:10.1, DN 14:3.7.13, MN 26:21.6, MN 85:45.6).

633. Finally the question is answered, although the number of deaths is obviously exaggerated. We cannot estimate the population size at the time with any confidence. But we know that Pāṭaliputta under Ashoka covered about 25 km², which suggests a population somewhere around 250,000. Probably there were a few million people in the whole of Magadha.

634. The commentary identifies these as non-returners, but this is unlikely as *puññābhāga* (“share of merit”) indicates those who do good for the sake of a good rebirth rather than liberation (AN 6.63:30.2). There would have been countless more of such good folk than stream-enterers, whereas the number of non-returners, as indicated by the count of the *Ñātikans*, would have been small, not “countless”. This verse is also at SN 6.13:7.1, where the commentary says nothing of non-returners.

who I think have shared in merit—
 I couldn't even number them,
 for fear of speaking falsely.”

That is the topic on which the divinity Sanaṅkumāra spoke. And 28.1
 while he was speaking on that topic, this thought came to the great
 king Vessavaṇa, “Oh lord, how incredible, how amazing! That there
 should be such a magnificent Teacher, and such a magnificent exposi-
 tion of the teaching! And that such achievements of high distinction
 should be made known!”

And then the divinity Sanaṅkumāra, knowing the great king Ve- 28.3
 ssavaṇa's train of thought, said to him, “What does Great King Ve-
 ssavaṇa think? In the past, too, there was such a magnificent Teacher,
 and such a magnificent exposition of the teaching! And such achieve-
 ments of high distinction were made known!⁶³⁵ In the future, too,
 there will be such a magnificent Teacher, and such a magnificent ex-
 position of the teaching! And such achievements of high distinction
 will be made known!”

That, sir, is the topic on which the divinity Sanaṅkumāra spoke to 29.1
 the gods of the thirty-three. And the great king Vessavaṇa, having
 heard and learned it in the presence of the Divinity as he was speaking
 on that topic, informed his own assembly.’”⁶³⁶

And the spirit Janavasabha, having heard and learned it in the 29.2
 presence of the great king Vessavaṇa as he was speaking on that topic
 to his own assembly, informed the Buddha. And the Buddha, having
 heard and learned it in the presence of the spirit Janavasabha, and also
 from his own direct knowledge, informed Venerable Ānanda. And
 Venerable Ānanda, having heard and learned it in the presence of the

635. Sanaṅkumāra lives longer than the lesser gods so he has a broader per-
 spective. He emphasizes the long-term stability of cosmic order, which prevails
 through the crises that afflict the short-lived kingdoms of men.

636. Astonishingly, this sutta traces its textual lineage directly to Brahmā, ex-
 actly like the Brahmanical texts (eg. Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 6.5.4). Of course,
 Brahmā gets his teaching from the Buddha, but this is clearly copying the Brah-
 manical model.

Buddha, informed the monks, nuns, laymen, and laywomen.⁶³⁷ And that's how this spiritual life has become successful and prosperous, extensive, popular, widespread, and fully revealed among gods and humans.⁶³⁸

637. Here Ānanda plays a key role as the linchpin of the oral tradition. It is likely that not just the Mahāparinibbānasutta itself, but all these suttas of this cycle were composed by Ānanda or his students.

638. With this unique ending, there is no claim that this sutta was heard by the mendicants in the usual way. Rather it makes its purpose explicit, to act as a means to widely propagate the Dhamma. The Mahāparinibbānasutta also speaks of the spread of the Dhamma, and the Janavasabhasutta indicates some of the means by which that was achieved in the decades following the Buddha's death; in particular, by allying itself with the ascendant power of Magadha.

DN 19

The Great Steward

Mahāgovindasutta

SO I HAVE HEARD. At one time the Buddha was staying near Rā- 1.1
jagaha, on the Vulture’s Peak Mountain.

Then, late at night, the centaur Pañcasikha, lighting up the entire 1.3
Vulture’s Peak, went up to the Buddha, bowed, stood to one side,
and said to him,⁶³⁹ “Sir, I would tell you of what I heard and learned
directly from the gods of the thirty-three.”

“Tell me, Pañcasikha,” said the Buddha. 1.5

1. The Council of the Gods

“Sir, it was more than a few days ago—on the fifteenth day sabbath 2.1
on the full moon day at the invitation to admonish held at the end of
the rainy season—when all the gods of the thirty-three were sitting
together in the Hall of Clear Right.⁶⁴⁰ A large assembly of gods was

639. We were introduced to Pañcasikha in DN 18, which is similar to the current sutta in many other details as well. Thus this sutta can be considered as a distant cousin to the Mahāparinibbāna cycle.

640. The council of gods described by Janavasabha at DN 18:12.1, while otherwise similar, took place at the entry to a rainy season, whereas this one is at the end of a rainy season. This cannot have been the Buddha’s last rains, for he was already in Vajji by then.

sitting all around, and the four great kings were seated at the four quarters.

2.3 The Great King Dhataratṭha was seated to the east, facing west, in front of his gods. The Great King Virūlhaka was seated to the south, facing north, in front of his gods. The Great King Virūpakka was seated to the west, facing east, in front of his gods. The Great King Vessavaṇa was seated to the north, facing south, in front of his gods.

2.7 When the gods of the thirty-three have a gathering like this, that is how they are seated. After that come our seats.

3.1 Sir, those gods who had been recently reborn in the company of the thirty-three after leading the spiritual life under the Buddha outshine the other gods in beauty and glory. The gods of the thirty-three became uplifted and overjoyed at that, full of rapture and happiness, saying, ‘The heavenly hosts swell, while the titan hosts dwindle!’

3.4 Seeing the joy of those gods, Sakka, lord of gods, celebrated with these verses:

3.5 ‘The gods rejoice—
the thirty-three with their Lord—
revering the Realized One,
and the clear rightness of the teaching;

3.9 and seeing the new gods,
so beautiful and glorious,
who have come here after leading
the spiritual life under the Buddha!

3.13 They outshine the others
in beauty, glory, and lifespan.
Here are the distinguished disciples
of he whose wisdom is vast.

3.17 Seeing this, they delight—
the thirty-three with their Lord—
revering the Realized One,

and the clear rightness of the teaching!’

The gods of the thirty-three became even more uplifted and over- 3.21
joyed at that, full of rapture and happiness, saying, ‘The heavenly
hosts swell, while the titan hosts dwindle!’

2. Eight Genuine Praises

Seeing the joy of those gods, Sakka, lord of gods, addressed them, 4.1
‘Gentlemen, would you like to hear eight genuine praises of the Bud-
dha?’⁶⁴¹

‘Indeed we would, sir.’ 4.3

Then Sakka proffered these eight genuine praises of the Bud- 4.4
dha:⁶⁴²

‘What do the good gods of the thirty-three think?’⁶⁴³ How the 5.1
Buddha has acted for the welfare and happiness of the people, out
of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of
gods and humans! I don’t see any Teacher, past or present, who has
such sympathy for the world, apart from the Buddha.

Also, the Buddha has explained the teaching well—apparent in 6.1
the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant,
so that sensible people can know it for themselves. I don’t see any
Teacher, past or present, who explains such a relevant teaching, apart
from the Buddha.

Also, the Buddha has well described what is skillful and what is un- 7.1
skillful,⁶⁴⁴ what is blameworthy and what is blameless, what should
be cultivated and what should not be cultivated, what is inferior and
what is superior, and what has a portion of dark or bright. I don’t
see any Teacher, past or present, who so clearly describes all these
things, apart from the Buddha.

641. For “genuine praise” (*yathābhucce vaṇṇe*), see DN 1:1.28.1.

642. This set of eight is not found elsewhere. | “Proffered” is *payirudāhāsi*, a unique term in early texts.

643. Sakka adopts the same rhetorical style as Sanaikumāra (DN 18:20.2).

644. Compare DN 18:25.1.

- 8.1 Also, the Buddha has well described the practice that leads to extinguishment for his disciples. And extinguishment converges with the practice,⁶⁴⁵ as the waters of the Ganges join together and converge with the waters of the Yamunā.⁶⁴⁶ I don't see any Teacher, past or present, who so clearly describes the practice that leads to extinguishment for his disciples, apart from the Buddha.
- 9.1 Also, possessions and popularity have accrued to the Buddha, so much that you'd think it would thrill even the aristocrats. But he takes his food free of vanity.⁶⁴⁷ I don't see any Teacher, past or present, who takes their food so free of vanity, apart from the Buddha.
- 10.1 Also, the Buddha has gained companions, both trainees who are practicing, and those with defilements ended who have completed their journey.⁶⁴⁸ The Buddha is committed to the joy of solitude, but doesn't send them away.⁶⁴⁹ I don't see any Teacher, past or present, so committed to the joy of solitude, apart from the Buddha.
- 11.1 Also, the Buddha does as he says, and says as he does, thus: he does as he says, and says as he does.⁶⁵⁰ I don't see any Teacher, past or present, who so practices in line with the teaching, apart from the Buddha.
- 12.1 Also, the Buddha has gone beyond doubt and got rid of indecision. He has achieved all he wished for regarding the fundamental goal of the spiritual life.⁶⁵¹ I don't see any Teacher, past or present, who has achieved these things, apart from the Buddha.'

645. *Paṭipadā* is instrumental.

646. I don't think this idea is found elsewhere in quite this way. Normally it is said that the path leads to Nibbāna like the rivers lead to the ocean (eg. SN 45.114:1.1).

647. This item is unique.

648. Another unique item.

649. This is normally true, but in some cases the Buddha left a badly-behaved community (MN 48), dismissed misbehaving monks (eg. AN 8.10:2.2), or even dismissed a large community (MN 67). | The "joy of solitude" is *ekārāmatam*.

650. Also at DN 29:29.5, AN 4.23:4.1, and Iti 112:5.1.

651. *Pariyositasāṅkappo* ("achieved all he wished for") is a synonym of the more common *paripunṇasāṅkappo* (eg. MN 29:2.5).

These are the eight genuine praises of the Buddha proffered by Sakka. Hearing them, the gods of the thirty-three became even more uplifted and overjoyed. 12.3

Then some gods thought, ‘If only four fully awakened Buddhas might arise in the world and teach the Dhamma, just like the Blessed One! That would be for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans!’ 13.1

Other gods thought, ‘Let alone four fully awakened Buddhas; if only three fully awakened Buddhas, or two fully awakened Buddhas might arise in the world and teach the Dhamma, just like the Blessed One! That would be for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans!’ 13.4

When they said this, Sakka said, ‘It is impossible, gentlemen, for two perfected ones, fully awakened Buddhas to arise in the same solar system at the same time.’⁶⁵² May that Blessed One be healthy and well, and remain with us for a long time!’⁶⁵³ That would be for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans!’ 14.1

Then the gods of the thirty-three, having considered and deliberated on the matter for which they were seated together in the Hall of Clear Right, advised and instructed the four great kings on the subject. Each one, having been advised, stood at his own seat without leaving. 14.5

The Kings were instructed,
and heeded good advice. 14.7
With clear and peaceful minds,
they stood by their own seats.

652. This impossibility is also at AN 1.277:1.1 and MN 115:14.1. | “In one solar system” (*ekissā lokadhātuyā*): a single *lokadhātu* encompasses a single terrestrial world with a single moon and sun.

653. It is not common to wish for the Buddha’s long life, but we do find this sentiment expressed in a conversation between Sāriputta and Ānanda (SN 21.2:3.5).

15.1 Then in the northern quarter a magnificent light arose and radiance appeared, surpassing the glory of the gods. Then Sakka, lord of gods, addressed the gods of the thirty-three, ‘As indicated by the signs—light arising and radiance appearing—the Divinity will appear. For this is the harbinger for the appearance of the Divinity, namely light arising and radiance appearing.’

15.5 As indicated by the signs,
the Divinity will appear.
For this is the sign of the Divinity:
a light vast and great.

3. On Sanaṅkumāra

16.1 Then the gods of the thirty-three sat in their own seats, saying, ‘We shall find out what has caused that light, and only when we have realized it shall we go to it.’ And the four great kings did likewise. Hearing that, the gods of the thirty-three agreed in unison, ‘We shall find out what has caused that light, and only when we have realized it shall we go to it.’

16.7 When the divinity Sanaṅkumāra appears to the gods of the thirty-three, he does so after manifesting in a solid life-form. For a Divinity’s normal appearance is imperceptible in the visual range of the gods of the thirty-three. When the divinity Sanaṅkumāra appears to the gods of the thirty-three, he outshines the other gods in beauty and glory, as a golden statue outshines the human form. When the divinity Sanaṅkumāra appears to the gods of the thirty-three, not a single god in that assembly greets him by bowing down or rising up or inviting him to a seat. They all sit silently on their couches with their cupped palms raised, thinking, ‘Now the divinity Sanaṅkumāra will sit on the couch of whatever god he chooses.’ And the god on whose couch the Divinity sits is overjoyed and brimming with happiness, like a king on the day of his coronation.

Seeing the joy of those gods, the divinity Sanañkumāra celebrated 17.3
with these verses:

“The gods rejoice— 17.4
the thirty-three with their Lord—
revering the Realized One,
and the clear rightness of the teaching;

and seeing the new gods, 17.8
so beautiful and glorious,
who have come here after leading
the spiritual life under the Buddha!

They outshine the others 17.12
in beauty, glory, and lifespan.
Here are the distinguished disciples
of he whose wisdom is vast.

Seeing this, they delight— 17.16
the thirty-three with their Lord—
revering the Realized One,
and the clear rightness of the teaching!’

That is the topic on which the divinity Sanañkumāra spoke. And 18.1
while he was speaking on that topic, his voice had eight qualities:
it was clear, comprehensible, charming, audible, lucid, undistorted,
deep, and resonant. He makes sure his voice is intelligible as far as the
assembly goes, but the sound doesn’t extend outside the assembly.
When someone has a voice like this, they’re said to have the voice of
the Divinity.

Then the gods of the thirty-three said to the divinity Sanañkumāra, 19.1
‘Good, Great Divinity! Having appraised this, we rejoice.’⁶⁵⁴ And

654. “Having appraised” (*sañkhāya*) is glossed by the commentary with “having known” (*jānitvā*). Compare the discussion on “judgmentalism” at DN 1:1.3.1.

there are the eight genuine praises of the Buddha spoken by Sakka—
having appraised them, too, we rejoice.’

4. Eight Genuine Praises

19.6 Then the Divinity said to Sakka, ‘It would be good, lord of gods, if I
could also hear the eight genuine praises of the Buddha.’

19.8 Saying, ‘Yes, Great Divinity,’ Sakka repeated the eight genuine
praises for him.

28.1 Hearing them, the divinity Sanaṅkumāra was uplifted and over-
joyed, full of rapture and happiness. Then the divinity Sanaṅkumāra
manifested in a solid life-form, taking on the appearance of the youth
Pañcasikha, and appeared to the gods of the thirty-three. Rising into
the air, he sat cross-legged in the sky, like a strong man might sit
cross-legged on a well-appointed couch or on level ground. There
he addressed the gods of the thirty-three:

5. The Story of the Steward

28.8 ‘What do the gods of the thirty-three think about the extent of the
Buddha’s great wisdom?

29.1 Once upon a time, there was a king named Disampati.⁶⁵⁵ He had
a brahmin high priest named the Steward.⁶⁵⁶ Disampati’s son was
the prince named Reṇu,⁶⁵⁷ while the Steward’s son was the student

655. Disampati means “head of the directions”, i.e. king of all the land. He and
his story are found nowhere else in the early texts.

656. “Steward” is Govinda, literally “lord of cows”. The “high priest” (*purohita*)
was a hereditary office, a learned ritualist and adviser attached to a specific family.
For royal families the post could be highly contested. The closeness of the role
is shown in that aristocratic families could be referred to by the lineage of the
high priest.

657. While the current sutta does not explicitly identify their realm, *Dīpavaṃsa*
iii 40 records Disampati and Reṇu as kings of Kāśi. This fits with the geographical
layout depicted in this sutta, with Kāśi at the center. The story, then, depicts the
establishment of Brahmanical kings across India from Kāśi.

named Jotipāla.⁶⁵⁸ There were Reṇu the prince, Jotipāla the student, and six other aristocrats; these eight became friends.

In due course the brahmin Steward passed away. At his passing, 29.6
King Disampati lamented, “At a time when I have relinquished all my
duties to the brahmin Steward and amuse myself, supplied and pro-
vided with the five kinds of sensual stimulation, he passes away!”⁶⁵⁹

When he said this, Prince Reṇu said to him, “Your Majesty, don’t 29.9
lament too much at the Steward’s passing. He has a son named
Jotipāla, who is even more astute and expert than his father. He
should manage the affairs that were managed by his father.”

“Is that so, my prince?” 29.13

“That is so, Your Majesty.” 29.14

6. The Story of the Great Steward

So King Disampati addressed one of his men, “Please, my man, go 30.1
to the student Jotipāla, and say to him, ‘Best wishes, Jotipāla! You
are summoned by King Disampati; he wants to see you.’”

“Yes, Your Majesty,” replied that man, and did as he was asked. 30.4
Then Jotipāla went to the king and exchanged greetings with him.

When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat 30.7
down to one side, and the king said to him, “May you, Jotipāla,
manage my affairs—please don’t turn me down! I shall appoint you
to your father’s position, and anoint you as Steward.”⁶⁶⁰

“Yes, worthy sir,” replied Jotipāla. 30.10

658. Jotipāla means “guardian of the sacred flame”, i.e. someone who maintains the Vedic fire ritual (see below at DN 19:47.26). There was another Jotipāla in the time of Buddha Kassapa at MN 81:6.2, and another who was a religious founder of the past (AN 6.54:18.1, AN 7.73:2.5). Despite the popularity of the name in Pali, it does not seem to appear in Sanskrit sources. Given that it appears in Pali only in legendary contexts, it is probably a vocational epithet.

659. The king’s only care, it seems, is not for the passing of his friend, but that he no longer gets to indulge in whatever he wants.

660. This shows that Govinda is an office rather than a personal name.

31.1 So the king anointed him as Steward and appointed him to his father's position. After his appointment, the Steward Jotipāla managed both the affairs that his father had managed, and other affairs that his father had not managed.⁶⁶¹ He organized both the works that his father had organized, and other works that his father had not organized. When people noticed this they said, "The brahmin is indeed a Steward, a Great Steward!" And that's how the student Jotipāla came to be known as the Great Steward.

6.1. Dividing the Realm

32.1 Then the Great Steward went to the six aristocrats and said, "King Disampati is old, elderly and senior, advanced in years, and has reached the final stage of life. Who knows how long he has to live? It's likely that when he passes away the king-makers will anoint Prince Reṇu as king. Come, sirs, go to Prince Reṇu and say, 'Prince Reṇu, we are your friends, dear, beloved, and cherished. We have shared your joys and sorrows. King Disampati is old, elderly and senior, advanced in years, and has reached the final stage of life. Who knows how long he has to live? It's likely that when he passes away the king-makers will anoint you as king. If you should gain kingship, share it with us.'"

33.1 "Yes, worthy sir," replied the six aristocrats. They went to Prince Reṇu and put the proposal to him.

33.7 The prince replied, "Who else, sirs, in my realm ought to prosper if not you?⁶⁶² If I gain kingship, I will share it with you all."

34.1 In due course King Disampati passed away. At his passing, the king-makers anointed Prince Reṇu as king. But after being anointed, King Reṇu amused himself, supplied and provided with the five kinds of sensual stimulation.

661. Following the Mahāsaṅgīti reading rather than the PTS (*nānusāsi ... nānusāsati*). It seems required by the context that he does more than his father.

662. Following PTS reading *sukhaṃ edheyyātha*.

Then the Great Steward went to the six aristocrats and said, “King Disampati has passed away. But after being anointed, King Reṇu amused himself, supplied and provided with the five kinds of sensual stimulation. Who knows the intoxicating power of sensual pleasures? Come, sirs, go to King Reṇu and say, ‘Worthy sir, King Disampati has passed away, and you have been anointed as king. Do you remember what you said?’” 34.4

“Yes, worthy sir,” replied the six aristocrats. They went to King Reṇu and said, “Worthy sir, King Disampati has passed away, and you have been anointed as king. Do you remember what you said?” 34.10

“I remember, sirs. Who is able to neatly divide into seven equal parts this great land, so broad in the north and narrow as the front of a cart in the south?”⁶⁶³ 34.12

“Who else, sir, if not the Great Steward?” 34.14

So King Reṇu addressed one of his men, “Please, my man, go to the brahmin Great Steward and say that King Reṇu summons him.” 35.1

“Yes, Your Majesty,” replied that man, and did as he was asked. Then the Great Steward went to the king and exchanged greetings with him. 35.4

When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and the king said to him, “Come, let the good Steward neatly divide into seven equal parts this great land, so broad in the north and narrow as the front of a cart in the south.” 35.7

663. The meaning of *śakaṭamukhaṃ* (“front of a cart”) is clarified by comparison with the parallels. T 8 is identical (其界廣闊。正南南隅，其界狹略，猶如車形), while DA 3 expresses a similar idea more briefly (此閭浮提地，內廣外狹). The Mahāvastu (Mvu 85.17) confirms this sense with *dakṣiṇena saṃkṣiptā śakaṭamukhasaṃsthitāḥ*. These appear to demonstrate a knowledge of the shape of the Indian subcontinent. Below it says that each of the kingdoms is shaped like the front of a cart, just as India is as a whole.

35.9 “Yes, worthy sir,” replied the Great Steward, and did as he was asked. All were arranged like the fronts of carts,⁶⁶⁴ and right in the middle was King Reṇu’s nation.⁶⁶⁵

36.3 Dantapura for the Kālīṅgas;⁶⁶⁶
Potana for the Assakas;⁶⁶⁷
Māhissatī for the Avantīs;⁶⁶⁸
Roruka for the Sovīras;⁶⁶⁹

36.7 Mithilā for the Videhas;⁶⁷⁰
Campā was laid out for the Aṅgas;⁶⁷¹

664. Neither Rhys Davids nor Walshe translate this line, but it receives an extensive discussion in the commentary. It says that six kingdoms were arranged around Reṇu’s kingdom in the middle, like an umbrella (*vitānasadisam*).

665. The verses tell the realms starting with the rising sun at Kālīṅga in the east and proceeding clockwise (*padakkhiṇā*) until the circle is complete with Aṅga on the Kālīṅga border. Thus the original center was probably the last place on the list, Kāsi, which is indeed geographically central.

666. Kālīṅga was a coastal realm in modern Odisha and Andhra Pradesh. There is no consensus on the exact location of Dantapura.

667. Assaka stretched from Kālīṅga’s western border across the interior. Potana is modern Bodhan in Telangana state.

668. *Mahesaya* of the Pali editions is a variant spelling for *māhissatī*; Mahāvastu has *māhiṣmatī*. It is in present-day Madhya Pradesh, on the banks of Narmada River, and is perhaps to be identified with modern Maheshwar.

669. Sovira was on the lower Indus, and Roruka is identified with modern Rohri in Sindh province, Pakistan. It is implausible that they received Aryan culture from Kāsi.

670. Mithilā was the capital of Videha, to the north east of the Vajjian federation, nestled against the Himalayas. Mithilā was a dominant kingdom before the Buddha, its king Janaka featuring prominently in early Upaniṣads. It features rarely in the suttas (MN 91, Thig 6.2, Thig 13.4) and had apparently declined in importance. Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 1.4.1.10–19 depicts its origins in terms of the spread of fire-worship from the west by its founding king Māthava Videgha with his priest Gotama Rāhūgaṇa.

671. Campā is modern Champapuri near Bhagalpur in Bihar state, not far from West Bengal. Aṅga lay between the Chandan river to the west and the Rajmahal hills to the east. In the centuries before the Buddha it expanded its dominion to the sea on the south-east and Magadha in the west. But with the Kālīṅgas

and Varanasi for the Kāsis:⁶⁷²
these were laid out by the Steward.

Then those six aristocrats were delighted with their respective 36.11
gains, having achieved all they wished for, “We have received exactly
what we wanted, what we wished for, what we desired, what we
yearned for.”

Sattabhū and Brahmadatta,⁶⁷³ 36.13
Vessabhū and Bharata,⁶⁷⁴
Reṇu and the two Dhātaraṭṭhas:
these were the seven Bhāratas.⁶⁷⁵

The first recitation section is complete.

pushing back from the coast and the rise of Bimbisāra in Magadha, they were pushed back to their ancestral lands and fell under Magadhan dominion.

672. Varanasi, one of the oldest cities in the world, was the capital of the Kāśī kingdom. It lost its status as an independent kingdom shortly before the Buddha, when it was taken over by Kosala. It appears in countless Buddhist stories of the past as the dominant city of the region in what appears to be a timeless and ageless past. However, despite its great antiquity, it is a historical settlement, of which the discovered remains date back to perhaps 1200 BCE; it was a capital city from perhaps 800 BCE.

673. The names of the aristocrat kings—most of which are difficult to identify from other sources—are listed in an abruptly-inserted verse. The names are missing from the parallels in Mahāvastu and DA 3, but T 8 appears to have the same list of names in the same order, except with Reṇu at the start. Rhys Davids proposes to assign each one to a kingdom as listed in the same order. This seems to work for the first four names, as Ja 424, invoking this sutta, identifies Bharata as king of Sovira. But it falls apart with Reṇu, who as we have seen, belongs in Kāśī rather than Videha.

674. “Bharata” is the name of an individual king, while they are collectively known as “Bhāratas” (with a long initial ā due to secondary derivation). Ja 424, invoking this sutta, identifies Bharata as king of Sovira.

675. Here *bhāratā* means “kings of India” or perhaps, if read together with the preceding verses, “kingdoms of India”. India was called Bhārata after the legendary King Bharata of Hastināpura (Delhi), founder of the Lunar dynasty, conqueror of India, and sire of the warring tribes of the Mahābhārata. His story is told in the Saṃbhavapara of the Mahābhārata. The name represents the success of Vedic culture across the subcontinent.

6.2. A Good Reputation

- 37.1 Then the six aristocrats approached the Great Steward and said, “Steward, just as you are King Reṇu’s friend, dear, beloved, and cherished, you are also our friend. Would you manage our affairs? Please don’t turn us down!”
- 37.5 “Yes, worthy sirs,” replied the Great Steward. Then the Great Steward managed the realms of the seven kings. And he taught seven well-to-do brahmins, and seven hundred bathed initiates to recite the hymns.
- 38.1 After some time he got this good reputation, “The Great Steward sees the Divinity in person! The Great Steward discusses, converses, and consults with the Divinity in person!”⁶⁷⁶
- 38.3 The Great Steward thought, “I have the reputation of seeing the Divinity in person, and discussing with him in person. But I don’t. I have heard that brahmins of the past who were elderly and senior, the tutors of tutors, said: ‘Whoever goes on retreat for the four months of the rainy season and practices the absorption on compassion sees the Divinity and discusses with him.’⁶⁷⁷ Why don’t I do that?”
- 39.1 So the Great Steward went to King Reṇu and told him of the situation, saying, “Sir, I wish to go on retreat for the four months of the rainy season and practice the absorption on compassion. No one should approach me, except the one who serves my meal.”
- 39.9 “Please do so, Steward, at your convenience.”
- 40.1 Then the Great Steward went to the six aristocrats to put the same proposal, and received the same reply.
- 41.1 He also went to the seven well-to-do brahmins and seven hundred bathed initiates and put to them the same proposal, adding, “Sirs,

676. In spiritual circles, such rumors spread like wildfire in an Australian summer.

677. The ancient Brahmanical teachers are invoked to justify the Buddhist rains retreat. | Compassion is one of the “meditations of Brahmā” (*brahmavihāra*). Normally the suttas speak of the absorptions (*jhāna*) and of the meditation on compassion (*karuṇā*), but the idea of an “absorption on compassion” is unique to this sutta.

rehearse the hymns in detail as you have learned and memorized them, and teach each other how to recite.”

And they too said, “Please do so, Steward, at your convenience.” 41.9

Then the Great Steward went to his forty equal wives to put the same proposal to them, and received the same reply. 42.1

Then the Great Steward had a new ceremonial hall built to the east of his citadel, where he went on retreat for the four months of the rainy season and practiced the absorption on compassion.⁶⁷⁸ 43.1

And no one approached him except the one who served his meals.

But then, when the four months had passed, the Great Steward became dissatisfied and anxious, “I have heard that brahmins of the past said that whoever goes on retreat for the four months of the rainy season and practices the absorption on compassion sees the Divinity and discusses with him. But I neither see the Divinity nor discuss with him.” 43.3

6.3. A Discussion With the Divinity

And then the divinity Sanaṅkumāra, knowing the Great Steward’s train of thought, as easily as a strong person would extend or contract their arm, vanished from the realm of divinity and reappeared in the Great Steward’s presence. At that, the Great Steward became frightened, scared, his hair standing on end, as he had never seen such a sight before. So he addressed the divinity Sanaṅkumāra in verse: 44.1

“Who might you be, sir,
so beautiful, glorious, majestic?
Not knowing, I ask—
how am I to know who you are?” 44.4

“In the realm of divinity they know me
as ‘The Eternal Youth.’ 44.8

678. Compare MN 51:10.3, where the same construction is a site for the sacrifice.

All the gods know me thus,
and so you should know me, Steward.”

44.12 “A Divinity deserves a seat and water,
foot-salve, and sweet cakes.
Sir, I ask you to please accept
these gifts of hospitality.”

44.16 “I accept the gifts of hospitality
of which you speak.
I grant you the opportunity
to ask whatever you desire—
about welfare and benefit in this life,
or happiness in lives to come.”

45.1 Then the Great Steward thought, “the divinity Sanaṅkumāra has
granted me an opportunity. Should I ask him about what is beneficial
for this life or lives to come?”

45.4 Then he thought, “I’m skilled in what is beneficial for this life, and
others even ask me about it. Why don’t I ask the Divinity about the
benefit that specifically applies to lives to come?” So he addressed
the divinity Sanaṅkumāra in verse:

45.8 “I’m in doubt, so I ask the Divinity—
who is free of doubt—
about things one may learn from another.
Standing on what, training in what
may a mortal reach the deathless realm of divinity?”⁶⁷⁹

45.12 “He among mankind, O brahmin, has given up pos-
sessiveness,⁶⁸⁰

679. “Deathless” from a Brahmanical perspective, but very much within the realm of *saṃsāra* from a Buddhist perspective.

680. *Brahme* is the normal vocative for *brahmā*. However in verse it is sometimes used as vocative for *brāhmaṇa* (eg. Snp 5.1:7.3, Snp 5.19:3.4).

at one, compassionate,
 free of putrefaction, and refraining from sex.
 Standing on that, training in that
 a mortal may reach the deathless realm of divinity.”

“Sir, I understand what ‘giving up possessiveness’ means.⁶⁸¹ It’s 46.1
 when someone gives up a large or small fortune, and a large or small
 family circle. They shave off hair and beard, dress in ocher robes, and
 go forth from the lay life to homelessness. That’s how I understand
 ‘giving up possessiveness’.

Sir, I understand what ‘at one’ means.⁶⁸² It’s when someone fre- 46.4
 quents a secluded lodging—a wilderness, the root of a tree, a hill, a
 ravine, a mountain cave, a charnel ground, a forest, the open air, a
 heap of straw. That’s how I understand ‘at one’.

Sir, I understand what ‘compassionate’ means. It’s when someone 46.7
 meditates spreading a heart full of compassion to one direction, and
 to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way
 above, below, across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full
 of compassion to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless,
 free of enmity and ill will. That’s how I understand ‘compassionate’.

But I don’t understand what you say about putrefaction.⁶⁸³ 46.10

What among mankind, O the Divinity, is putrefaction? 46.11
 I don’t understand, so tell me, attentive one:
 wrapped in what do people stink,
 headed for hell, shut out of the realm of divinity?”

“Anger, lies, cheating, and treachery, 46.15
 miserliness, vanity, jealousy,

681. These factors are explained as a summary of the Gradual Training.

682. “At one” (*ekodibhūta* or more commonly *ekodibhāva*) normally describes deep meditation, and is part of the formula for the second *jhāna*. Here it is explained as equivalent to “seclusion” (*viveka*).

683. “Putrefaction” (*āmagandha*) is the smell of (moral) decay or corruption (AN 3.128, Snp 2.2).

desire, stinginess, harassing others,⁶⁸⁴
 greed, hate, vanity, and delusion—
 those bound to such things
 are not devoid of putrefaction;
 they're headed for hell,
 shut out of the realm of divinity.”

- 46.21 “As I understand what you say about putrefaction, it’s not easy
 to quell while living at home.⁶⁸⁵ I shall go forth from the lay life to
 homelessness!”
 46.23 “Please do so, Steward, at your convenience.”

6.4. Informing King Reṇu

- 47.1 So the Great Steward went to King Reṇu and said, “Worthy sir, please
 now find another high priest to manage the affairs of state for you. I
 wish to go forth from the lay life to homelessness. As I understand
 what the Divinity says about putrefaction, it’s not easy to quell while
 living at home. I shall go forth from the lay life to homelessness.

 47.6 I announce to King Reṇu,
 the lord of the land:
 you must learn how to rule,
 for I no longer care for my ministry.”

 47.10 “If you’re lacking any pleasures,
 I’ll supply them for you.
 I’ll protect you from any harm,
 for I command the nation’s army.
 You are my father, I am your son!⁶⁸⁶

684. “Desire” is *icchā*. PTS reads *vicikicchā* (“doubt”), but this must be incorrect
 as the commentary explains it as “craving” (*taṇhā*).

685. “Easy to quell” (*sunimmadaya*) is unique to this passage.

686. As noted in the comment to DN 16:5.19.2, kingly clans adopted the lineage
 name of the high priest (*purohita*) during initiation.

O Steward, please don't leave!"

"I'm lacking no pleasures, 47.16
and no one is harming me.
I've heard a non-human voice,
so I no longer care for lay life."

"What was that non-human like? 47.20
What did he say to you,
hearing which you would abandon
our house and all our people?"

"Before entering this retreat, 47.24
I only liked to sacrifice.
I kindled the sacred flame,
strewn about with kusa grass.

But then the Divinity the Eternal Youth 47.28
appeared to me from the realm of divinity.
He answered my question,
hearing which I no longer care for lay life."

"I have faith, O Steward, 47.32
in that of which you speak.
Having heard a non-human voice,
what else could you do?

We will follow your example, 47.36
Steward, be my Teacher!
Like a gem of beryl—
flawless, immaculate, beautiful—
that's how pure we shall live,
in the Steward's dispensation.

If the Steward is going forth from the lay life to homelessness, we 47.42
shall do so too. Your destiny shall be ours."

6.5. Informing the Six Aristocrats

48.1 Then the Great Steward went to the six aristocrats and said, “Good fellows, please now find another high priest to manage the affairs of state for you. I wish to go forth from the lay life to homelessness. As I understand what the Divinity says about putrefaction, it’s not easy to quell while living at home. I shall go forth from the lay life to homelessness!”

49.1 Then the six aristocrats withdrew to one side and thought up a plan, “These brahmins are greedy for wealth. Why don’t we bestow him with wealth?”⁶⁸⁷

49.4 They returned to the Great Steward and said, “In these seven kingdoms there is abundant wealth. We’ll get you as much as you want.”

49.6 “Enough, sirs. I already have abundant wealth, owing to my lords. Giving up all that, I shall go forth.”

49.10 Then the six aristocrats withdrew to one side and thought up a plan, “These brahmins are greedy for women. Why don’t we bestow him with women?”

49.13 They returned to the Great Steward and said, “In these seven kingdoms there are many women. We’ll get you as many as you want.”

49.15 “Enough, sirs. I already have forty equal wives. Giving up all them, I shall go forth.”

50.1 “If the Steward is going forth from the lay life to homelessness, we shall do so too. Your destiny shall be ours.”

50.2 “If you all give up sensual pleasures,
to which ordinary people are attached,
exert yourselves, being strong,
and possessing the power of patience.

50.6 This path is the straight path,
this path is supreme.

687. This is a rare use of the verb *sikkhati* in the sense “bestow, present”.

Guarded by the good, the true teaching⁶⁸⁸
leads to rebirth in the realm of divinity.”⁶⁸⁹

“Well then, sir, please wait for seven years. When seven years have 51.1
passed, we shall go forth with you. Your destiny shall be ours.”

“Seven years is too long, sirs. I cannot wait that long. Who knows 51.3
what will happen to the living? We are headed for lives to come.
We must be thoughtful and wake up! We must do what’s good and
lead the spiritual life, for no one born can escape death.”⁶⁹⁰ I shall go
forth.”

“Well then, sir, please wait for six years, five years, four years, three 52.1
years, two years, one year, seven months, six months, five months,
four months, three months, two months, one month, or even a fort-
night. When a fortnight has passed, we shall go forth. Your destiny
shall be ours.”

“A fortnight is too long, sirs. I cannot wait that long. Who knows 55.1
what will happen to the living? We are headed for lives to come. We
must be thoughtful and wake up! We must do what’s good and lead
the spiritual life, for no one born can escape death. As I understand
what the Divinity says about putrefaction, it’s not easy to quell while
living at home. I shall go forth from the lay life to homelessness.”

“Well then, sir, please wait for a week, so that we can instruct our 55.6
sons and brothers in kingship. When a week has passed, we shall go
forth. Your destiny shall be ours.”

“A week is not too long, sirs. I will wait that long.” 55.7

688. “True teaching” (*saddhamma*) normally describes the Buddha’s teaching.

689. “Leads to rebirth in the Brahmā realm” (*brahmalokūpapattiya*), just as the
teaching of Āḷāra Kālāma, based on the even more refined formless meditations,
leads to rebirth in the dimension of nothingness (MN 36:14.14).

690. Echoing the ancient hermit Araka at AN 7.74:2.2, who said life is evanes-
cent like a dewdrop.

6.6. Informing the Brahmins

- 56.1 Then the Great Steward also went to the seven well-to-do brahmins and seven hundred bathed initiates and said, “Good fellows, please now find another tutor to teach you to recite the hymns. I wish to go forth from the lay life to homelessness. As I understand what the Divinity says about putrefaction, it’s not easy to quell while living at home. I shall go forth from the lay life to homelessness.”
- 56.6 “Please don’t go forth from the lay life to homelessness! The life of one gone forth is of little influence or profit, whereas the life of a brahmin is of great influence and profit.”
- 56.9 “Please, good fellows, don’t say that. Who has greater influence and profit than myself? For now I am like a king to kings, like the Divinity to brahmins, like a deity to householders. Giving up all that, I shall go forth. As I understand what the Divinity says about putrefaction, it’s not easy to quell while living at home. I shall go forth from the lay life to homelessness.”
- 56.15 “If the Steward is going forth from the lay life to homelessness, we shall do so too. Your destiny shall be ours.”

6.7. Informing the Wives

- 57.1 Then the Great Steward went to his forty equal wives and said, “Ladies, please do whatever you wish, whether returning to your own families, or finding another husband. I wish to go forth from the lay life to homelessness. As I understand what the Divinity says about putrefaction, it’s not easy to quell while living at home. I shall go forth from the lay life to homelessness.”
- 57.6 “You are the only family we want! You are the only husband we want! If you are going forth from the lay life to homelessness, we shall do so too. Your destiny shall be ours.”⁶⁹¹

691. It is regarded as normal that women should renounce.

6.8. The Great Steward Goes Forth

When a week had passed, the Great Steward shaved off his hair and beard, dressed in ocher robes, and went forth from the lay life to homelessness. And when he had gone forth, the seven anointed aristocrat kings, the seven brahmins with seven hundred initiates, the forty equal wives, and many thousands of aristocrats, brahmins, householders, and many harem women shaved off their hair and beards, dressed in ocher robes, and went forth from the lay life to homelessness.⁶⁹² 58.1

Escorted by that assembly, the Great Steward wandered on tour among the villages, towns, and capital cities. And at that time, whenever he arrived at a village or town, he was like a king to kings, like the Divinity to brahmins, like a deity to householders. And whenever people sneezed or tripped over they'd say: "Homage to the Great Steward! Homage to the high priest for the seven!" 58.3

And the Great Steward meditated spreading a heart full of love to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, he spread a heart full of love to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will.⁶⁹³ He meditated spreading a heart full of compassion ... rejoicing ... equanimity to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, he spread a heart full of equanimity to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will. And he taught his disciples the path to rebirth in the company of Divinity.⁶⁹⁴ 59.1

692. Compare with the mass renunciation under Vipassī (DN 14:2.16.6).

693. His meditation expands from compassion to include all four of the *brahmavihāras*.

694. The *Aṅguttara* (eg. AN 6.54:13.9) uses "path" (*magga*) instead of "Dhamma" here. Compare the Bodhisatta's rejection of his former teachers, whose *dhamma* only led to rebirth in a high realm, not to escape from rebirth (MN 26:15.35).

60.1 Those of his disciples who completely understood the Great Steward's instructions, at the breaking up of the body, after death, were reborn in the realm of divinity. Of those disciples who only partly understood the Great Steward's instructions, some were reborn in the company of the gods who control what is created by others, while some were reborn in the company of the gods who love to create, or the joyful gods, or the gods of Yama, or the gods of the thirty-three, or the gods of the four great kings. And at the very least they swelled the hosts of the centaurs.

60.10 And so the going forth of all those gentlemen was not in vain, was not barren, but was fruitful and fertile.'

60.11 Do you remember this, Blessed One?"

61.1 "I remember, Pañcasikha. I myself was the brahmin Great Steward at that time.⁶⁹⁵ And I taught those disciples the path to rebirth in the company of Divinity. But that spiritual path of mine doesn't lead to disillusionment, dispassion, cessation, peace, insight, awakening, and extinguishment. It only leads as far as rebirth in the realm of divinity.⁶⁹⁶

61.5 But this spiritual path does lead to disillusionment, dispassion, cessation, peace, insight, awakening, and extinguishment. And what is the spiritual path that leads to extinguishment? It is simply this noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion. This is the spiritual path that leads to disillusion-

695. This is the third and final Jātaka in the Dīghanikāya, after DN 5 and DN 17.

696. According to the doctrine of the "perfections" (*pāramī*), which emerged around two to four centuries after the Buddha's passing, the practices he undertook in past lives laid the foundation for awakening in this life. Here, however, the Buddha states that his former practices did not lead to awakening. Rather, since they were based on the wrong view of eternal bliss in the Brahmā realm, they only led to a good rebirth so long as that kamma lasted. It is the eightfold path, which the Buddha discovered in his final life, which leads to awakening. The same saying in a similar context is found at MN 83:21.7.

ment, dispassion, cessation, peace, insight, awakening, and extinguishment.

Those of my disciples who completely understand my instructions 62.1
realize the undefiled freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom. And
they live having realized it with their own insight in this very life due
to the ending of defilements.

Of those disciples who only partly understand my instructions, 62.2
some, with the ending of the five lower fetters, become reborn spontaneously. They are extinguished there, and are not liable to return from that world.

Some, with the ending of three fetters, and the weakening of greed, 62.3
hate, and delusion, become once-returners. They come back to this world once only, then make an end of suffering.

And some, with the ending of three fetters, become stream- 62.4
enterers, not liable to be reborn in the underworld, assured, destined for awakening.

And so the going forth of all those gentlemen was not in vain, was 62.5
not barren, but was fruitful and fertile.”

That is what the Buddha said. Delighted, the centaur Pañcasikha 62.6
approved and agreed with what the Buddha said. He bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on his right, before vanishing right there.

DN 20

The Great Congregation

Mahāsamayasutta

- 1.1 SO I HAVE HEARD. At one time the Buddha was staying in the land of the Sakyans, in the Great Wood near Kapilavatthu, together with a large Saṅgha of five hundred mendicants, all of whom were perfected ones. And most of the deities from ten solar systems had gathered to see the Buddha and the Saṅgha of mendicants.⁶⁹⁷
- 2.1 Then four deities of the pure abodes, aware of what was happening, thought:⁶⁹⁸ “Why don’t we go to the Buddha and each recite a verse in his presence?”
- 3.1 Then, as easily as a strong person would extend or contract their arm, they vanished from the Pure Abodes and reappeared in front of the Buddha. They bowed to the Buddha and stood to one side. Standing to one side, one deity spoke this verse in the Buddha’s presence:
- 3.4 “There’s a great congregation in the woods,”⁶⁹⁹

697. This discourse gives an extensive account of divine beings. Some are familiar from elsewhere in the Pali texts, others found in various Brahmanical sources, while still others occur only here. For the names we can compare the edition of the Sanskrit text by Waldschmidt and Sander and available on SuttaCentral as SF 140.

698. The Pure Abodes are inhabited entirely by non-returners.

699. “Great congregation” is *mahāsamaya*.

where heavenly hosts have assembled.
We've come to this righteous congregation
to see the invincible Saṅgha!"

Then another deity spoke this verse in the Buddha's presence: 3.8

"The mendicants there are immersed in samādhi,
they've straightened their own minds.
Like a charioteer holding the reins,
the astute ones protect their senses."

Then another deity spoke this verse in the Buddha's presence: 3.13

"They snapped the post and snapped the cross-bar,
unstirred, they tore out Indra's pillar.⁷⁰⁰
They live pure and immaculate,
the young giants tamed by the Clear-eyed One."⁷⁰¹

Then another deity spoke this verse in the Buddha's presence: 3.18

"Anyone who has gone to the Buddha for refuge
won't go to a plane of loss.
After giving up this human body,
they swell the heavenly host."⁷⁰²

700. A village (Bu Pj 2:3.8) or royal compound (Bu Pc 83:1.3.56.1) was marked with a "boundary-post" (*indakhila*). It symbolized a fixed and immovable point, either in a good sense (SN 56.39:4.1) or, as here, an obstacle. The Sanskrit *indrakīla* is a two-foot long iron bolt securing a fort, presumably fixed in the ground (Arthaśāstra 2.3.26), or else a mountain in the Himalayas. The warrior Arjuna, journeying beyond the Gandhamādana, is stopped at the Indrakīla mountain by Sakra/Indra disguised as a brahmin ascetic, at whose urging Arjuna undertakes asceticism in order to gain the power he would need (Mahābhārata 3.3.37). The symbolic sense of "stopping" relates to the Pali sense of immovability, and suggests that the underlying metaphor is the irresistible power represented by Indra. | For Mahāsaṅgīti's *ūhacca manejā* read *ūhacca-m-anejā*.

701. *Nāga* can refer to a class of semi-divine beings in a powerful serpentine form ("dragon"); a large and powerful snake, especially a king cobra; a bull elephant; or any powerful and mighty being ("giant").

702. The discourse up to here is also found at SN 1.37.

1. The Gathering of Deities

4.1 Then the Buddha said to the mendicants:

4.2 “Mendicants, most of the deities from ten solar systems have gathered to see the Realized One and the mendicant Saṅgha. Those who were perfected ones, fully awakened Buddhas in the past also had gatherings of deities that were at best like the gathering for me now.⁷⁰³ Those who will be perfected ones, fully awakened Buddhas in the future will also have gatherings of deities that will be at best like the gathering for me now. I shall declare the names of the heavenly hosts; I shall extol the names of the heavenly hosts; I shall teach the names of the heavenly hosts. Listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.”

4.9 “Yes, sir,” they replied.

4.10 The Buddha said this:

5.1 “I invoke a paean of praise!⁷⁰⁴

Where the earth-gods dwell,
there, in mountain caves,
resolute and composed,

5.5 dwell many like lonely lions,
who have mastered their fears.⁷⁰⁵

703. This recalls DN 14:1.10.1, where the relative sizes of the mendicant congregations of different Buddhas are tallied. That sutta, in another point of similarity, also featured a conversation with deities of the Pure Abodes.

704. “Paeon of praise” is *siloka*, a rare case where this means “verse (of praise)” rather than “fame, renown”. *Siloka* is also a poetic metre, the most common form in Pali. | *Anukassāmi* is present tense from the root *kass*, “to draw (up), to drag”. Compare Sanskrit *anukarṣa* in the sense “invoking, summoning by incantation”.

705. This gives a hint as to one of the purposes of this sutta. Living alone in remote forests can be terrifying. Such places were widely believed to be haunted by all manner of supernatural creatures, not all of them friendly. While for an arahant this posed no threat, there would have been then, as there are today, many young or aspiring meditators who faced such challenges with trepidation. These verses offer succor, surrounding them with powerful, albeit invisible, allies.

Their minds are bright and pure,
clear and undisturbed.”

Over five hundred were known 5.9
in the wood at Kapilavatthu.
Consequently, the Teacher addressed
the disciples who love the teaching:

“The heavenly hosts have come forth; 5.13
mendicants, you should be aware of them.”
Those monks grew keen,
hearing the Buddha’s instruction.

Knowledge manifested in them, 6.1
seeing those non-human beings.
Some saw a hundred,
a thousand, even seventy thousand,

while some saw a hundred thousand 6.5
non-human beings.
But some saw an endless number
spread out in every direction.

And all that was known 6.9
and distinguished by the Clear-eyed One.
Consequently, the Teacher addressed
the disciples who love the teaching:

“The heavenly hosts have come forth; 6.13
mendicants, you should be aware of them.
I shall extol them for you,
with lyrics in proper order.

- 7.1 There are seven thousand spirits,⁷⁰⁶
earth-gods of Kapilavatthu.
They're powerful and brilliant,
so beautiful and glorious.
Rejoicing, they've come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.
- 7.7 From the Himalayas there are six thousand
spirits of different colors.⁷⁰⁷
They're powerful and brilliant,
so beautiful and glorious.
Rejoicing, they've come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.
- 7.13 From Mount Sātā there are three thousand⁷⁰⁸
spirits of different colors.
They're powerful and brilliant,
so beautiful and glorious.
Rejoicing, they've come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.
- 7.19 And thus there are sixteen thousand
spirits of different colors.
They're powerful and brilliant,
so beautiful and glorious.
Rejoicing, they've come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

706. "Spirit" is *yakkha*. In later legend they appear as monstrous figures, but in the suttas they are ambiguous and may often be friendly to the Dhamma. Early statues of *yakkhas* at Madhurā (circa 100 BCE) depict noble and powerful kings, not ogres. *Yakkha* is also sometimes used more generally in the sense of an individual or deity.

707. Colorful like the nymphs of MN 50:25.6 or Susīma's gods at SN 2.29:7.1.

708. Mount Sātā is unidentified, but according to the commentary it was in the middle region.

- From Vessāmitta's mountain there are five hundred⁷⁰⁹ 8.1
spirits of different colors.
They're powerful and brilliant,
so beautiful and glorious.
Rejoicing, they've come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.
- And there's Kumbhīra of Rājagaha,⁷¹⁰ 8.7
whose home is on Mount Vepulla.⁷¹¹
Attended by more than
a hundred thousand spirits,
Kumbhīra of Rājagaha
also came to the meeting in the wood.
- King Dhataratṭha rules⁷¹² 9.1
the eastern quarter.
Lord of the centaurs,⁷¹³
he's a great king, glorious.
- And he has many mighty sons 9.5

709. Vessāmitta ("friend of all") is the name of a Vedic hermit. Legend has it that he was a *khattiya* who earned brahminhood due to his intense austerities in the remote Himalayas. Perhaps this is a mountain named for him, although I can find no trace of it in Sanskrit.

710. *Kumbhīra* means "crocodile".

711. For this mountain, see SN 15.10:2.2, SN 15.20:2.3, and notes.

712. We met two human King Dhataratṭhas ("Strongrealm") in the Mahāgovindasutta.

713. "Centaur" is *gandhabba*. *Gandhabbas* are wild, sexual beings who, being first to yoke the horse (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 5.1.4.8) and riding the steed called "Racer" (*vājin*, 10.6.4.1), "take the reins" from Indra (Rig Veda 1.163.2) as his charioteer Mātali. It is likely the Sanskrit *gandharva* stems from the same root as the Greek *kentauro*, and the ultimate origin of the idea comes from the proto-Indo-Europeans, who rode the horse, creating a potent entity that was invincible in battle. At Sanchi Stupa No. 2 there are images of men and women riding centaurs, although this may be a later Greek borrowing.

all of them named Indra.⁷¹⁴
 They're powerful and brilliant,
 so beautiful and glorious.
 Rejoicing, they've come forth
 to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

9.11 King Virūlhaka rules⁷¹⁵
 the southern quarter.
 Lord of the gnomes,⁷¹⁶
 he's a great king, glorious.

9.15 And he has many mighty sons
 all of them named Indra.
 They're powerful and brilliant,
 so beautiful and glorious.
 Rejoicing, they've come forth
 to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

9.21 King Virūpakkha rules⁷¹⁷
 the western quarter.
 Lord of the dragons,
 he's a great king, glorious.

9.25 And he has many mighty sons
 all of them named Indra.

714. By implication, they are renowned as being powerful as Indra, the king of gods who in Pali is more commonly called Sakka. It is also a nod to the multiplicity of divinities in the Vedic system, where one becomes many and many become one.

715. *Virūlhaka* is "growth"; he was probably a god of the fertile crops. In the Pali it is spelled Virūlha here due to the meter.

716. "Gnomes" is *kumbhaṇḍa* (Sanskrit *kuṣmāṇḍa*), "pumpkin-belly", a race of lesser deities often depicted as pot-bellied, ugly and misshapen. But see SN 19.10 for another interpretation.

717. One of the "royal snake families" at AN 4.67:3.2. His name means "multiple eyes" (*virūpa-akkha*) for the false eyes on a cobra's hood.

They're powerful and brilliant,
 so beautiful and glorious.
 Rejoicing, they've come forth
 to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

King Kuvera rules⁷¹⁸ 9.31
 the northern quarter.
 Lord of spirits,
 he's a great king, glorious.

And he has many mighty sons 9.35
 all of them named Indra.
 They're powerful and brilliant,
 so beautiful and glorious.
 Rejoicing, they've come forth
 to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

Dhatarat̥ṭha in the east, 9.41
 Virūlhaka to the south,
 Virūpakkha to the west,
 and Kuvera in the north.

These four great kings,⁷¹⁹ 9.45

718. Also known as Vessavaṇa (DN 32:7.43, Snp 2.14:6.1), which means “Son of the Renowned” from his father Viśrava. These two names appear together elsewhere in contemporary literature (Atharvaveda 8,10.28c, Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 13.4.3.10), where, although the passages are obscure, he appears to be associated with wickedness, concealment, and theft. Although a god of wealth (*dhanada*), the name Kuvera is explained by lexicographers as “deformed”. Probably he was originally a god of the underground, blessed with the earth’s riches, yet deformed by its great pressure.

719. The following verses are a treasure-trove of ancient Indian mythology, recording the names of deities otherwise lost to history. Many of the names are obscure and variant readings are recorded in manuscripts and noted in the commentary. My spellings follow Ānandajoti’s translation, *The Discourse on the Great Convention*, unless there is a reason to change. I try to identify the deities as best as I can, but many of them remain speculative.

all around in the four quarters,
stood there dazzling
in the wood at Kapilavatthu.

10.1 Their deceitful heathens came,⁷²⁰
so treacherous and crafty—
the deceivers Kuṭeṇḍu, Viṭeṇḍu,⁷²¹
with Viṭucca and Viṭuṭa.⁷²²

10.5 And Candana and Kāmasetṭha,⁷²³
Kinnughaṇḍu and Nighaṇḍu,
Panāda and Opamañña,⁷²⁴
and Mātali, the god's equerry.⁷²⁵

720. These deities are called *dāsa*, which normally means “slave” in Pali. But here, it seems, we have a singular instance of the old Vedic meaning, an uncivilized foe. The *dāsas* Vṛtra, Namuci, and Vṛṣaśipra are described as “deceivers” (*māyin*, Rig Veda 1.53.7; 2.11.10; 7.99.4; 10.73.7). This epithet is also used of the closely related *dasyu* (Rig Veda 1.33.10; 4.16.9; 8.14.14; 10.73.5; see note on DN 5:11.5). Such beings are said to be “godless” since they oppose the Vedic deities (Rig Veda 2.19.7; 3.31.19; 7.1.10; 10.11.6; 10.138.4, etc.), so we can translate as “heathen”.

721. I am not able to identify any of these names with confidence, but perhaps *kuṭeṇḍu* and *viṭeṇḍu* could be traced to *indu* (“moon”), thus “crooked moon” and “defective moon”. Compare *khaṇḍendu*, a later term for Śiva as the crescent moon.

722. The Sanskrit names are *kiṭi*, *vikiṭi*, *bhr̥gu*, and *bhr̥kuṭi*. Only *bhr̥gu* is attested in the Vedas, but he was a sage, not a “crafty heathen”.

723. Candana appears in MN 134:6.4, SN 2.15, and SN 40.11:1.1, and together with Kāmasetṭha in DN 32:10.4. *Candana* means “sandalwood”, although the name of the god might also relate to its root “shining”. | *Kāmasetṭha* means “Chief of Sex”, i.e. “Eros”; he does not seem to appear in a Brahmanical context.

724. Panāda (“roarer”) was the name of an ancient king who performed the horse sacrifice (Thag 2.22:1.1, DN 26:26.1). In Ja 265 he is said to have been the son of Vessavaṇa (Kuvera). | Opamañña is a descendant of the ascended sage Upamanyu (“zealous one”; see note on MN 99:10.3).

725. Mātali is the charioteer of Sakka (i.e. Indra; SN 11.6:1.5, MN 83:14.1, etc.), a role he plays throughout Brahmanical literature as well. He appears here as one of the centaur lords, and is father to the centaur Sikhaṇḍi, Pañcasikha's rival in love DN 21:1.6.8. | A *sūta* was a high-ranking officer attending the king,

- Cittasena the centaur came too,⁷²⁶ 10.9
 and the kings Nala and Janesabha.⁷²⁷
 Pañcasikha came too, with⁷²⁸
 Timbaru and Suriyavaccasā.
- These and other kings there were, 10.13
 the centaurs with their kings.
 Rejoicing, they've come forth
 to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.
- Then came the dragons of Nābhasa lake,⁷²⁹ 11.1
 and those from Vesālī with those from Takkasilā.⁷³⁰
 The Kambalas and Assataras came⁷³¹
 and those from Payāga with their kin.⁷³²

close in meaning to the (admittedly obscure) military term “equerry”, in contrast with the regular charioteer, *sārathi*.

726. The *gandharva* Citrasena (“Brightspear”) appears in the Sanskrit Purāṇas as a friend of Arjuna in various adventures.

727. *Nala* means “reed”. There was a King Nala of Vidarbha whose love for his Queen Damayantī is celebrated in the Mahābhārata. | Janesabha is an alternate spelling of Janavasabha (DN 18).

728. In DN 21 we shall learn of how the centaur Pañcasikha (“Fivecrest”) wooed Timbaru’s daughter Suriyavaccasā (“Sunshine”).

729. Read *nābhasa*, which means “celestial, heavenly”. The commentary says this was the name of a lake, which agrees with the legend that a Nābhasa was a son of Nala (“reed”) and father of Puṇḍarika (“lotus”). The Sanskrit here, however, has *sahabhūm nāgo*.

730. *Vesālā* is from the adjectival form *vesālā* (“of Vesālī”). | Pali *taccha* can represent Sanskrit *takṣa*, and the Sanskrit does indeed have *takṣakaḥ* here, so Tacchaka is probably “of Takṣasilā”. This famous city, normally spelled Takkasilā in Pali, is Taxila in West Pakistan, an ancient center of learning.

731. These *nāgas* are frequently mentioned together in Sanskrit literature such as the Mahābhārata (1.31.1a, 2.9.9a, 5.101.9c), where they are also said to come from Pāyāga (3.83.72a: *prayāgaṁ sapraṭiṣṭhānaṁ kambalāśvatarau*).

732. Payāga (modern Prayagraj, formerly Allahabad) is the sacred ford at the confluence of the Ganges and the Yamunā beside Kosambī (see Bu Pj 1:4.18).

- 11.5 Those from Yamunā, and the Dhataratṭha⁷³³
 dragons came, so glorious.
 And Erāvaṇa the great dragon
 also came to the meeting in the wood.
- 11.9 Those who seize the dragon kings by force—⁷³⁴
 Heavenly, twice-born birds with piercing vision—⁷³⁵
 swoop down to the wood from the sky;
 their name is ‘Rainbow Phoenix.’⁷³⁶
- 11.13 But the dragon kings remained fearless,
 for the Buddha kept them safe from the phoenixes.
 Wooing each other with gentle words,⁷³⁷

733. The Dhataratṭha and Erāvaṇa *nāgas* also appear frequently in Sanskrit literature, and often in association with other deities in our text as part of a loose cluster of divinities (eg. Harivamśa 3.112–117). Erāvaṇa also appears at Snp 2.14:5.1. Here he is a *nāga* as in “dragon”, but later tradition saw him as a *nāga* as in “elephant”, in which role he became the mighty mount of Indra/Sakka.

734. The enmity between snakes and birds is legendary (Ja 518), its origins related in the story of Suparṇa and Kadrū, mother of dragons (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 3.6.2). It is rooted as much in the common sight of birds attacking snakes as it is in the cosmic opposition between the solar and the chthonic, the forces of light in the sky and darkness beneath the earth.

735. Birds are called “twice-born”, once from the mother, once from the egg. “Twice-born” is also an epithet of brahmins (Thig 15.1:31.3).

736. The *suparṇa* (Sanskrit *suparṇa*, “bright-feathered”), later *garuḍa* (Sanskrit *garuḍa*, “devourer”), is to the eagle as the *nāga* is to the cobra. He has been falsely compared with the loathsome harpy; but his golden wings, closeness to the sun (eg. Rig Veda 5.47.3), and role as bearer of the nectar of immortality (RV 4.26.4, 8.100.8) show that he is the Indian phoenix, the golden eagle of the sun. As the brother of the Dawn (Aruṇa, Matsya Purāṇa 174.47), his golden wings at sunset “devour” the sun. He disappears in darkness only to be born again the next day, just as the European phoenix combusts itself and is born anew. Thus he is both the older and the younger brother of Aruṇa, for which came first, sunrise or sunset?

737. *Upavhayati* occurs only here and SN 7.9:4.3 in Pali. It is a Vedic term for invoking or calling up blessings in a whisper.

the dragons and phoenixes
took the Buddha as refuge.⁷³⁸

Defeated by Vajirahattha,⁷³⁹ 12.1
the titans live in the ocean.
They're brothers of Vāsava,⁷⁴⁰
powerful and glorious.

There's the terrifying Kālakañjas,⁷⁴¹ 12.5
the Dānava and Ghasa titans,⁷⁴²

738. The Buddha reconciles even such inveterate enemies. In the Buddhist view, all of these beings have their place in the great pattern of nature.

739. *Vajirahattha* ("thunderbolt-in-hand") is a synonym of *vajirapāṇi* (DN 3:1.21.3, MN 35:14.1). It is a frequent epithet of Sakka in the Vedas (eg. Rig Veda 1.173.10a *indro vajrahastah*), an identification confirmed by the commentary here.

740. Vāsava is another epithet of Sakka (see below, DN 20:14.9), meaning "endowed with wealth" (*vasu*; see for example Rig Veda 1.9.9a *indram vasupatim* "Indra, lord of wealth"). The Buddhist explanation of his name SN 11.13:9.1, rather, plays on the word *āvasatha* and calls him the "giver of a guesthouse". Later Brahmanical texts enumerated eight Vasus, with Indra as their lord, who are reckoned among the thirty-three. | Sakka's wife is the demon (*asura*) princess Sujā, daughter of Vepacitti, hence they are his "brothers", technically in-laws (SN 11.12:6.1).

741. The Kālakañja is the lowest class of titans (DN 24:1.7.19). Legend has it that they tried to build a fire altar of bricks (i.e. a mountain) to ascend to the heavens and contest with the gods (Taittiriya Brāhmaṇa 1.1.2.4–6, alluded to at Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 2.1.2.13). Three are mentioned as being godlike at Atharvaveda 6.80.2. The Mahābhārata (eg. 4.44.9) says they are Dānavas, an association supported in the next line. They seem to be associated with the ferocious Kālakeyas, children of Kālā. But a common Sanskrit spelling is *kālakhañja*, where *khañja* means "lame". This calls to mind the lame smith-god Hephaestus, who also ascended to heaven. *Kāla* ("black") then would be the black metal iron (cf. English "blacksmith"), yielding the sense "iron-lamed".

742. The Dānavas are a prominent group of *asuras* otherwise unattested in early Pali. The name stems from "rivers, waters" after their mother Danū. | Ghasa ("devourer") is occasionally mentioned as the name of a *rakṣasa* (Rāmāyaṇa 5.22.36a *praghasā nāma rākṣasī*). The commentary treats them as a single class of arrow-wielding *asuras*.

Vepacitti and Sucitti,⁷⁴³
Pahārāda with Namuci,⁷⁴⁴

12.9 and Bali's hundred sons,⁷⁴⁵
all named after Virocana.⁷⁴⁶
Bali's army armed themselves
and went to the auspicious Rāhu, saying:⁷⁴⁷
'Now is the time, sir,
for the meeting of mendicants in the wood.'

743. Vepacitti means "wise thinker", Sucitti means "good thinker". Vepacitti was the lord of the *asuras* and Sakka's counterpart. Their relationship was complicated (SN 11.23). Brahmanical literature regards him as the eldest son of Danū and hence chief of the Dānavas. The Sanskrit form is *vipracitti*, but in Buddhist texts it is incorrectly Sanskritized to *vemacitra*. Vepacitti's fame matches Sucitti's obscurity, for he does not seem to appear elsewhere.

744. Pahārāda the ocean-loving *asura* lord appears in AN 8.19. His name (Sanskrit *prahlāda*) means "mirth". Later Brahmanical legends say he was a righteous son of the wicked Hiranyakaśipu, who hated him for his devotion to Viṣṇu. | The story goes that when Namuci stole the soma from Indra, Indra's vengeance was frustrated by his vow not to harm him with anything wet or dry, in the dark or the light (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 12.7.3.1). Indra's ingenious solution was to dismember him with foam (Rig Veda 8.14.13) at dawn. Namuci's name is explained as *na-muci*, "not letting go" (the waters). In Buddhism, Namuci is a name of Māra, although here Māra appears separately below.

745. According to legend, Bali was the grandson of Pahārāda and son of Virocana. His hundred sons were dread warriors (Bhāgavata Purāṇa 8.10.30). The word *bali* also refers to a kind of sacrificial offering, but the roots of the term are obscure.

746. *Virocana* was their grandfather. He was another adversary of Indra, despite which they were both said to have sought knowledge from Prajāpati, but Virocana misunderstood since he saw only the surface meaning (Chāndogya Upaniṣad 8.7.2–8.5). Here he is associated with Rāhu, while Gaṇeśa Purāṇa 2.29 says he was granted a crown by the sun which he then lost. These details hint at a connection with the eclipse, in which case *virocana* would be the rays that emanate during a solar eclipse.

747. Rāhu is the mighty *asura* who "seizes" the moon (SN 2.9) or the sun (SN 2.10) to create an eclipse. He is the son of Vepacitti. It is strange to see him described as "auspicious" (*bhadda*), as he is a black planet and a force of darkness.

- The gods of water and earth,
and fire and wind came there.⁷⁴⁸ 13.1
- The gods of Varuṇa and Varuṇa's offspring,⁷⁴⁹
and Soma together with Yasa.⁷⁵⁰
- A host of the gods of love⁷⁵¹
and compassion came, so glorious. 13.5
- These ten hosts of gods
shone in all different colors.
- They're powerful and brilliant,
so beautiful and glorious. 13.9

748. These four are normally treated in the suttas as physical properties. Each of them is worshiped in the Rig Veda as a deity, and the Upaniṣads list them together along with other elements (eg. Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 4.4.5). I am not aware of any earlier contexts that group the four together systematically as deities in this way.

749. Varuṇa is invoked frequently in the Vedas, and in the suttas he is associated with other leading deities such as Indra and Soma (DN 13:25.2, DN 32:10.2, SN 11.3:5.1). As one of the twelve children of Aditi he stood for a calendar month, and grew a wide and sometimes baffling array of associations—the oceans, water, the sky (at night), and justice. Vedic Varuṇa was the god of command, the king of tough rule. He was identified with the aristocrats, while his partner Mitra was the brahmins (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 4.1.4).

750. *Soma* is the divine nectar that filled the ancient proto-Indo-Europeans with vitality. Its biological identity is disputed, but may have been ephedra. It is associated with the moon, hence the connection with Varuṇa as the night sky. | *Yasa* means “fame, glory”; so far as I know it is not personified in early Brahmanical texts, and rarely later. The connection between these two is illuminated by such passages as Rig Veda 7.85.3. To uphold Indra and Varuṇa in battle, there is an offering of Soma, which is described as *svayaśasaḥ*, “Self-Glorious”, i.e. the state of being high on speed, if speed were a god.

751. In the Vedas, Mitra (“friend”) is almost always paired with Varuṇa, and the appearance of Mettā (“friendliness”) here echoes that closeness. He was the god of alliances. | *Karuṇā* in the sense of “compassion” does not occur at all in pre-Buddhist Sanskrit. It is probably introduced here as companion to Mettā by association with Mitra. The Sanskrit here, however, is *maitrī varuṇikā*. From a Buddhist point of view, these are deities reborn due to the development of *jhāna* based on love and compassion.

Rejoicing, they’ve come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

14.1

The Vishnu and Sahali gods,⁷⁵²
and the unequaled pair of twins.⁷⁵³
The gods living on the moon came,
with the Moon before them.

14.5

The gods living on the sun came,
with the Sun before them.
And with the stars before them
came the languid gods of clouds.

14.9

And Vāsava came, the greatest of the Vasus,⁷⁵⁴
who is Sakka the Able, Purindada the Firstgiver.⁷⁵⁵
These ten hosts of gods
shone in all different colors.

14.13

They’re powerful and brilliant,
so beautiful and glorious.

752. *Veṇhu* (variant *veṇḍu*) is the Pali spelling of Sanskrit *viṣṇu*, who appears only here and at SN 2.12. In the Rig Veda he was a solar god who made three great strides (said to encompass the earth, the sky, and the heavens). | A deity named Sahali (“with plow”) appears at SN 2.30:3.1 where he praises Makkhali Gosāla, but I cannot trace him anywhere else.

753. *Yama* often refers to a god who guards the paths to the land of the dead (SN 1.33:10.3, MN 130:5.1), lord of the Yāma gods. Here, however, it refers to “twins” who in the Vedas are often identified with the Aśvins (the twin horses yoked to the chariot). In the Vedas, it seems *asama* (“unequaled”) is used as an epithet only, although the commentary says it is a name. | In Pali these lines lack a verb, while the Sanskrit supplies *āgataś* (“come”) instead of *asamā*, so perhaps we should read “the pair of Twins came”.

754. Vāsava is above at DN 20:12.3.

755. *Purandara* (“Fortbreaker”) is another epithet of Sakka or Indra (eg. Rig Veda 1.102.7). The Buddha reforms it to *Purindada* (“Firstgiver”) at SN 11.12:2.1. But Indra’s generosity is long renowned, eg. Rig Veda 1.10.6c: “He is the able one, and he will be able for us—Indra who distributes the goods” (*śakra uta naḥ śakad indro vasu dayamānaḥ*).

Rejoicing, they've come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

Then came the Sahabhū gods,⁷⁵⁶ 15.1
blazing like a crested flame;
and the Ariṭṭhakas and Rojas too,⁷⁵⁷
and the gods hued blue as flax.

The Varuṇas and Sahadhammas,⁷⁵⁸ 15.5
the Accutas and Anejakas,⁷⁵⁹
the Sūleyyas and Ruciras all came,⁷⁶⁰
as did the Vāsavanesi gods.⁷⁶¹
These ten hosts of gods
shone in all different colors.

They're powerful and brilliant, 15.11
so beautiful and glorious.
Rejoicing, they've come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

The Samānas, Mahāsamānas,⁷⁶² 16.1
Mānusas, and Mānusuttamas all came,⁷⁶³
and the gods depraved by play,⁷⁶⁴

756. Sanskrit has *sabhikā*. Most of the deities in the following verses do not seem to be met with elsewhere. The Sanskrit forms are often quite different but equally untraceable.

757. Their names might mean “Unhurt” and “Hurter”. The Sanskrit implausibly has *romā* (“Romans”).

758. For Varuṇa see above (DN 20:13.3). | Sahadhamma means “who share the same duty”.

759. The “Unfallen” and the “Unshakeable”.

760. The Sūleyyas might be “spear (or trident) bearers”; *śūli* is a name of Shiva. | Rucira means “brilliant, beautiful”.

761. *Vāsavanesi* means “seekers of Vāsava”.

762. “Equals” and “Great Equals”.

763. “Humans” and “Superhumans”, but here perhaps “Descendants of Manu”.

764. As per DN 1:2.7.2.

and those who are malevolent.⁷⁶⁵

- 16.5 Then came the gods of Mercury,⁷⁶⁶
and those who live on Mars.⁷⁶⁷
The Pāragas and Mahāpāragas came,⁷⁶⁸
such glorious gods.
These ten hosts of gods
shone in all different colors.

- 16.11 They're powerful and brilliant,
so beautiful and glorious.
Rejoicing, they've come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

- 17.1 The gods of Venus, the newborn Sun,
and the Dawn⁷⁶⁹

765. DN 12.10.2.

766. *Hari* means “yellow, green” and is the astrological color of the planet *budha* (“Mercury”). It came to have the general meaning of “sacred, holy” and was an epithet for various deities, which in the Rig Veda included Indra and Vishnu. However the astrological connection is suggested by the references to Mars and Venus below.

767. “Dwellers in the Red Place (= planet),” i.e. “Martians”.

768. *Pāraga* means “one who has crossed over”.

769. These deities represent the three lights that announce a new day: the morning star, the newborn sun, and the aura of the dawn. | *Sukka* (“Bright”) is the name of the planet Venus, the morning star. | *Aruṇa* is the dawn, a major Vedic deity signifying the arising of consciousness and order. | *Karambha* means “porridge”, which was offered to the sun under the name Pūṣan (Rig Veda 3.52.7, 6.56.1; Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 4.2.5.22; Kauṣītaki Brāhmaṇa 6.8.18; Maitrāyaṇī Saṃhitā 3.10.6; Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 5.15.1). Hence he became known as *karambhād*, “porridge-eater”. Apparently the sun lost its teeth and could only eat porridge (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 1.7.4.8). Being toothless like a baby, and lacking the risen sun’s “teeth” (i.e. “rays”), he probably represents the “newborn sun”. Compare for example Rig Veda 10.35, where Pūṣan is invoked, along with many other deities, in a hymn to the dawn.

came along with those from Saturn.⁷⁷⁰
 And the gods of the white globe came⁷⁷¹
 leading the brilliant gods.⁷⁷²

The Sadāmattas and Hāragajas,⁷⁷³
 and assorted glorious ones;⁷⁷⁴
 Pajjuna came thundering,⁷⁷⁵
 he who rains on all quarters.

17.5

These ten hosts of gods
 shone in all different colors.
 They're powerful and brilliant,
 so beautiful and glorious.
 Rejoicing, they've come forth
 to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.

17.9

770. Mahāsaṅgīti has *veghanasā*, for which the Buddha Jayanthi variant *vekhanasa* is preferable. We meet a wanderer of that name in MN 80, and in Sanskrit *vaikhānasa* is a general term for ascetics; but this meaning seems unlikely in context. The astrologer Varāhamitra names it a constellation (Bṛhat-saṃhitā 47.62), but that is much later. The Sanskrit here is *nilakavāsini* ("Dwellers in the Blue"), which pairs well with *lohitavāsino* above. *Nilavāsa* is a name for Saturn, whose color is blue.

771. *Odātagayha* is probably "white planet", i.e. the sun. Sanskrit has *avadātakesā* ("white-haired"). Compare the description of solar gods Sūrya at Rig Veda 1.50.8 as *śociṣkeṣaṃ vicakṣaṇa* ("flame-haired, brilliant") and Varuṇa at Rig Veda 8.41.9 as *śvetā vicakṣaṇā* ("white, brilliant").

772. Sanskrit has *pītakavāsini*, "dwellers in the yellow", either Mercury or Jupiter.

773. The *sadāmatta* ("everdrunk") gods appear in some later Buddhist texts, alongside the *māyādharas* (or *mālādharas*), but they don't seem to appear in a Vedic context. | I cannot find any reference to the *hāragaja* gods. Sanskrit has *hāritakā*, perhaps "sons of Haritī" (the *yakkhīnī*; but see below, DN 20:20.12).

774. "Assorted" is *missaka*, not elsewhere attested as a name of gods.

775. Pajjuna (Sanskrit *parjanya*) is a Vedic god of thunderstorms closely associated with Indra/Sakka. His daughters appear in SN 1.39 and SN 1.40. Sanskrit has instead *śuddhakā rucikā* ("pure, bright").

- 18.1 The Khemiyas from the realms of Tusita and Yama,⁷⁷⁶
and the glorious Kaṭṭhakas came;⁷⁷⁷
the Lambitakas, Lāmasettḥas,⁷⁷⁸
those called the Shining, and those Yonder.⁷⁷⁹
The gods who love to create came too,
and those who control what is created by others.
- 18.7 These ten hosts of gods
shone in all different colors.
They're powerful and brilliant,
so beautiful and glorious.
Rejoicing, they've come forth
to the meeting of mendicants in the wood.
- 19.1 These sixty hosts of gods
shone in all different colors.
They came organized by name,
these and others likewise, thinking:

776. The gods of Tusita and Yama are normal parts of the Buddhist cosmology. Neither *khemiya* nor the Sanskrit *kṣemaka* appear to be the names of gods elsewhere, and the commentary explains that they dwell in both the Tusita and Yama realms.

777. The commentary acknowledges the variant readings *kaṭṭhakā* (from “stick” or “plowed”) and *kathakā* (“reciters”), while Sanskrit has *kṛṣṇuktās* (“reciters of the black”). Perhaps related to Sanskrit *kāṭhaka*, a recension of the Black Yajur Veda taught by the sage Kaṭha.

778. Perhaps from *lamba* (“hang, droop”) in reference to deities of the sunset (cp. Mahābhārata 4.31.4c *sūrye vilambati*). Sanskrit has *lumbinī lumbiniśreṣṭhā*, which is perhaps normalized to mean “of Lumbini”.

779. “Shining” (*joti*) is used widely of many gods, including the Sun and Indra. | The commentary derives *āsavā* from *āsa* (“wish”) not *āsava* (“defilement”), explaining that they achieved their status due to desire (*chandavasena*). This agrees with the Sanskrit *svāśiṣā* (“well-wish, prayer”), i.e. words of wishing or blessing uttered over the sacrifice (see Rig Veda 10.44.5; cp. 8.44.23). However, I think it's more likely this stems from the common Vedic idiom of describing heavenly bodies as “yonder”, an idiom closely connected to the shining sun. The masculine nominative singular form is *asau*, and the Pali *taddhita* construction *āsavā* would mean “those who are yonder”.

‘They who have shed rebirth, the kindly ones,⁷⁸⁰ 19.5
the undefiled ones who have crossed the flood—
let us see them,

with the dragon who brought them across,
who like the Moon has overcome darkness.’

Subrahmā and Paramatta came,⁷⁸¹ 20.1
with sons of those powerful ones.
Sanañkumāra and Tissa⁷⁸²
also came to the meeting in the wood.

Of a thousand realms of divinity, 20.5
the Great Divinity stands forth.⁷⁸³
He has arisen, brilliant,
his formidable body so glorious.

Ten Gods Almighty came there,⁷⁸⁴ 20.9
each one of them wielding power,
and in the middle of them came

780. *Pavuttiṭṭha* (“shed”), from *pavasati* (“stay away”), seems to be unique in the Pali in this sense. Commentary glosses *vigata*, “disappeared”. | The first part of this verse, according to the commentary, addresses the Saṅgha as a group in the singular, but I translate in plural for clarity.

781. Subrahmā appears as a godling at SN 2.17, but given his company this is likely the “independent divinity” of SN 6.6–8. | Paramatta appears only here in Pali. In Brahmanical texts it is a common term for the highest conception of Brahman as the “supreme soul” (*paramātman*) of the cosmos. This term came into common usage later, but is found occasionally in earlier texts such as Maitrāyaṇi Saṃhitā 2.9.1.

782. Sanañkumāra makes regular guest appearances in the suttas (DN 3, DN 18, DN 19, DN 27, SN 6.11, AN 11.10). | Tissa is a common name, meaning “born under the star Sirius”. Perhaps this is the former monk of that name who was reborn in the Brahman realm (AN 6.34).

783. The moniker “Great Brahman” (*mahābrahman*) is here used of an individual, but sometimes it is a class of leading Brahmanas.

784. “God Almighty” (*issara*) is a Brahman god to whom the creation of the world is falsely attributed (DN 24:2.14.3, MN 101:22.5, AN 3.61:1.6).

Hārīta with his following.”⁷⁸⁵

21.1 When they had all come forth—
the gods with their Lord, and the divinities—
Māra’s army came forth too:
see the stupidity of the Dark Lord!

21.5 “Come, seize them and bind them,” he said,
“let them be bound by desire!
Surround them on all sides,
don’t let any escape!”

21.9 And so there the great general,
the Dark Lord sent forth his army.
He struck the ground with his fist
to make a horrifying sound

21.13 like a monsoon cloud,
thundering and flashing.
But then turned back,
furious, out of control.

22.1 And all that was known
and distinguished by the Clear-eyed One.
Consequently, the Teacher addressed
the disciples who love the teaching:

22.5 “Māra’s army has arrived;
mendicants, you should be aware of them.”
Those monks grew keen,
hearing the Buddha’s instruction.
The army fled from those free of passion,
and not a single hair was stirred!

785. Sanskrit has *hārītī*, the name of the fabled *yakkhiṇī* of Madhurā converted by the Buddha.

“All triumphant in battle,
so fearless and glorious.
They rejoice with all the spirits,
the disciples renowned among men.”

22.11

DN 21

Sakka's Questions

Sakkapañhasutta

- 1.1.1 SO I HAVE HEARD.⁷⁸⁶ At one time the Buddha was staying in the land of the Magadhans, where east of Rājagaha there is a brahmin village named Ambasaṇḍā, north of which, on Mount VEDIYAKA, is Indra's hill cave.⁷⁸⁷
- 1.1.3 Now at that time Sakka, the lord of gods, grew eager to see the Buddha. He thought, "Where is the Blessed One at present, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha?"
- 1.1.6 Seeing that the Buddha was at Indra's hill cave, he addressed the gods of the thirty-three, "Good fellows, the Buddha is staying in the land of the Magadhans at Indra's hill cave. What if we were to

786. This late sutta exhibits considerable literary sophistication. The A-plot concerns Sakka's rejection of his violent past and embrace of the Dhamma, while the B-plot concerns Pañcasikha's more modest growth from a libertine to a married man. This draws on such precedents as Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 3.2.4.4, where the centaur is urged to win his woman by seduction rather than force. | This discourse is quoted by name and a passage discussed at SN 22.4. In addition, the dialogue at MN 37 picks up directly where this leaves off and may be considered a sequel. A Sanskrit parallel published by Ernst Waldschmidt in 1979 is available on SuttaCentral as SF 241. A different discourse of the same name is found at SN 35.118.

787. Rhys Davids follows the commentary in translating this "the cave of Indra's Sāl Tree". However the Sanskrit *yāvaccailaguhāyām* supports "hill cave".

go and see that Blessed One, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha?"

"Yes, lord," replied the gods.

1.1.10

Then Sakka addressed the centaur Pañcasikha,⁷⁸⁸ "Dear Pañcasikha, the Buddha is staying in the land of the Magadhans at Indra's hill cave. What if we were to go and see that Blessed One, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha?"

1.2.1

"Yes, lord," replied the centaur Pañcasikha. Taking his arched harp made from the pale timber of wood-apple, he went as Sakka's attendant.⁷⁸⁹

1.2.4

Then Sakka went at the head of a retinue consisting of the gods of the thirty-three and the godling centaur Pañcasikha.⁷⁹⁰ As easily

1.2.5

788. Introduced in a minor role in DN 18, DN 19, and DN 20, Pañcasikha gets his moment to shine in this sutta. Outside of the Dīghanikāya, he appears only in SN 35.119. His name means "Fivecrest", evidently in reference to his impressive hairdo; a nymph or group of nymphs bore the synonymous name Pañcacūḍā, "Five Topknots". The centaur (*gandhabba*) was a wild rogue of music, dancing, and sex. He must be tamed, and here this is achieved through the power of love and filial respect. A less diplomatic approach is taken in Atharvaveda 4.37.7, where the *gandharva* with his "egg-crest" (*śikhaṇḍino*) is threatened with castration.

789. The "arched harp" (*viṇa*) was a stringed instrument held in the lap, whose form is clear from representations in ancient Indian sculptures in Bharhut, Amarāvati, and Pawāyā, as well as the coins of Samudragupta. The strings, typically seven in number, were attached to the base of the soundbox and passed through holes in the parchment resonator to be tied with cords to the curved neck (these parts are listed at SN 35.246:4.17). It accompanied song or dance, and was played equally by men and women. It is not the modern Indian instrument called *veena*, which is a lute or stick zither, but rather is similar to the Burmese *saung*. | *Gandhabbas* are closely associated with music (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 3.2.4). Māra's harp is described in the same way (SN 4.23:10.7), and tradition says they were in fact the same instrument.

790. In the Buddhist hierarchy of divinity, *gandhabbas* occupy a more humble place than the gods of the thirty-three, yet here Pañcasikha appears with them in a position of honor. In DN 19:28.3 we saw that the even more exalted Brahmā takes the form of Pañcasikha. This fluidity is characteristic of old Vedic cosmology, where there is no clear hierarchy of divinity. The formalized hierarchies in Buddhism and Hinduism are a later conception.

as a strong person would extend or contract their arm, he vanished from the heaven of the gods of the thirty-three and landed on Mount VEDIYAKA north of Ambasaṇḍā.

1.3.1 Now at that time a dazzling light appeared over Mount VEDIYAKA and Ambasaṇḍā, as happens through the glory of the gods. People in the villages round about, terrified, shocked, and awestruck, said, “Mount VEDIYAKA must be on fire today, blazing and burning! Oh why has such a dazzling light appeared over Mount VEDIYAKA and Ambasaṇḍā?”

1.4.1 Then Sakka addressed the centaur Pañcasikha, “My dear Pañcasikha, it is hard for one like me to get near the Realized Ones while they are on retreat practicing absorption, enjoying absorption.⁷⁹¹ But if you were to charm the Buddha first, then I could go to see him.”

1.4.4 “Yes, lord,” replied the centaur Pañcasikha. Taking his arched harp made from the pale timber of wood-apple, he went to Indra’s hill cave. When he had drawn near, he stood to one side, thinking, “This is neither too far nor too near; and he’ll hear my voice.”

1. Pañcasikha’s Song

1.4.8 Standing to one side, Pañcasikha played his arched harp, and sang these verses on the Buddha, the teaching, the Saṅgha, the perfected ones, and sensual love.⁷⁹²

791. We will learn later of how Sakka’s appearance could be too disturbing for the Buddha while on retreat (DN 21:1.10.13). Pañcasikha, on the other hand, would appear alone, without a retinue. Note, however, that on subsequent occasions Sakka showed no such reticence, either because he was already a stream-enterer or because the Buddha was not in solitary retreat.

792. The idea that the Buddha would be wooed by a love song seems like an absurd conceit, until you take into account the centaurs’ dangerous reputation as inveterate lechers. Pañcasikha wants to show that he is maturing and finally seeking a commitment in a respectable marriage.

“O Bhaddā Suriyavaccasā, my Darling Sunshine,⁷⁹³ 1.5.1
I pay homage to your father Timbaru,⁷⁹⁴
through whom was born a lady so fine,
to fill me with a joy I never knew.

As sweet as a breeze to one who's sweating, 1.5.5
or when thirsty, a sweet and cooling drink,
so dear are you, Aṅgīrasi, to me—⁷⁹⁵
just like the teaching is to all the saints!⁷⁹⁶

Like a cure when you're struck by fever dire, 1.5.9
or food to ease the hunger pain,
come on, Bhaddā, please put out my fire,⁷⁹⁷
quench me like water on a flame.

As elephants burning in the heat of summer, 1.5.13

793. Suriyavaccasā (“Sunshine”) accords with the Vedic conception of the wife as the Sun (Sūryā, Rīg Veda 10.85) who takes as husband Soma, the moon. She appears in Atharvaveda 8.10.27, which invokes the *gandharvas* with their female counterpart the “nymphs” (Pali *accharā*, Sanskrit *apsaras*).

794. In Sanskrit literature, Timbaru (Sanskrit *tumburu*, “coriander”) was an elder *gandharva* musician in the courts of Indra and Kuvera. According to Rāmāyaṇa 3.4, he was cursed with a monstrous form by Kuvera due to an inappropriate lust for the nymph Rambhā. Upon his defeat at the hands of Rāma he was restored to his former status. Pañcasikha would have wanted to avoid a similar fate. Rather than Suriyavaccasā, the Sanskrit literature mentions his daughters Manuvantī and Sukeśī; the latter name (“fair-hair”) evokes the streaming rays of the sun (Vāyupurāṇa 69.49 = Brahmandapurāṇa 2.7.13).

795. *Aṅgīrasi* means “shining one” and is etymologically linked with *agni* (“fire”). Suriyavaccasā earned the name due to both her radiant nature and her family connections: her father Timbaru was a son of Kaśyapa, who was (according to certain lineages) brother of Aṅgīras, from whom the Aṅgīrasas were descended. In the Arthavaveda—the only early non-Buddhist source for a nymph named Suriyavaccasā—*aṅgīrasi* is associated with witchcraft (Atharvaveda 12.5.52). *Aṅgīrasa* is also a patronymic of the Buddha (DN 32:3.14).

796. “Saints” is *arahantā*, which I normally translate as “perfected ones”.

797. *Parinibbāpaya*, “please quench me”. Pañcasikha subverts imagery employed by the Buddha—quenching thirst, cooling breezes, extinguished flames—to erotic effect.

sink down in a lotus pond to rest,
so cool, full of petals and of pollen—
that's how I would plunge into your breast.

1.5.17 Like elephants bursting bonds in rutting season,⁷⁹⁸
beating off the pricks of lance and pikes—
I just don't understand what is the reason
I'm so crazy for your shapely thighs!

1.5.21 For you, my heart is full of passion,
I'm in a besotted state of mind.
There is no going back, I'm just not able,
I'm like a fish that's hooked up on the line.

1.5.25 Come on, my Bhaddā, hold me, fair of thighs!
Embrace me, maid of captivating eyes!
Take me in your arms, my lovely lady,
that's all I'd ever want or could desire.

1.5.29 Ah, then my desire was such a small thing,
my sweet, with your curling wavy hair;
now, like to arahants an offering,
it's grown so very much from there.

1.5.33 Whatever the merit I have forged
by giving to such perfected beings—
may that, my altogether gorgeous,
ripen in togetherness with you.⁷⁹⁹

798. Pañcasikha is showing off his literary skill. The same image, the elephant, illustrates opposing qualities, peaceful and violent. In these two sides of sensual desire, he reveals, unconsciously perhaps, the rapacious side of his own nature. For Pañcasikha, the elephant bursting its bonds illustrates his crazed devotion, whereas later it illustrates breaking free of desire (DN 21:1.12.45).

799. For how a married couple may stay together in this life and the next, see AN 4.55.

Whatever the merit I have forged 1.5.37
 in this vast territory,
 may that, my altogether gorgeous,
 ripen in togetherness with you.

As the Sakyan, absorbed, did meditate 1.5.41
 at one, alert, and mindful too,⁸⁰⁰
 the sage seeking the state free of death—⁸⁰¹
 so I, oh my Sunshine, seek for you!

And just like the sage would delight, 1.5.45
 once he had awakened to the truth,
 so I would delight, my fine lady,
 were I to become one with you.

If Sakka were to grant me one wish,⁸⁰² 1.5.49
 as Lord of the Thirty and Three,
 my Bhaddā, you're all I would wish for,
 so strong is the love in me.

Like a freshly blossoming sal tree 1.5.53
 is your father, my lady so wise.
 I pay homage to he, bowing humbly,
 whose daughter is of such a kind."

When Pañcasikha had spoken, the Buddha said to him, "Pañca- 1.6.1
 sikha, the sound of your strings blends well with the sound of your

800. *Nipaka* ("alert") is explained in the Pali tradition as "wise". The root *pāl*, rather, suggests the sense "on guard, alert", which is supported by such phrases as "mindfully alert and on guard" (*ārakkhasatino nipakkasatino*, AN 5.114:3.1), where *nipaka* parallels *ārakkha* ("guarding"). Likewise, the Vedic sense is "one who keeps watch, a protector" (Rig Veda 4.45.6, 10.44.4).

801. Pañcasikha is using the present participle *jigīsāno* in the historical present.

802. A *gandharva* wedding is a pure love-match, without the blessing of parents or priests (Manu 3.32). Here, however, Pañcasikha wants to do the right thing and get the father's blessing.

singing,⁸⁰³ so that neither overpowers the other. But when did you compose these verses on the Buddha, the teaching, the Saṅgha, the perfected ones, and sensual love?”⁸⁰⁴

1.6.5 “This one time, sir, when you were first awakened, you were staying in Uruvelā at the goatherd’s banyan tree on the bank of the Nerañjarā River. And at that time I was in love with Bhaddā Suriyavaccasā, who they call ‘Darling Sunshine’, the daughter of the centaur king Timbaru. But the sister desired another.⁸⁰⁵ It was the one named Sikhaṇḍī, the son of Mātali the chariot handler, who she loved.⁸⁰⁶ Since I couldn’t win that sister by any means, I took my arched harp to Timbaru’s home, where I played those verses.

1.7.10 When I finished, Suriyavaccasā said to me, ‘Good fellow, I have not personally seen the Buddha. But I did hear about him when I went to dance for the gods of the thirty-three in the Hall of Clear Right. Since you extol the Buddha, let us meet up today.’ And that’s when I met up with that sister. But we have not met since.”

2. The Approach of Sakka

1.8.1 Then Sakka, lord of gods, thought, “Pañcasikha is exchanging pleasures with the Buddha.”

1.8.3 So he addressed Pañcasikha, “My dear Pañcasikha, please bow to the Buddha for me, saying: ‘Sir, Sakka, lord of gods, with his ministers and retinue, bows with his head at your feet.’”

803. If Pañcasikha was seeking the Buddha’s approval for his love-match, he was doomed to disappointment, as the Buddha and his mendicants do not involve themselves in arranging marriages. The Buddha sidesteps the issue by politely complementing Pañcasikha on his musicianship.

804. “When did you compose” is also at MN 56:30.1.

805. “Sister” (*bhagini*) is a respectful term of address, but is normally used in a chaste sense. When Ratthapāla calls his wives “sister”, they faint in shock (MN 82:23.4).

806. Sikhaṇḍī (“egg-crested”) is the term for the centaur as seductive threat to women in Atharvaveda 4.37.7. It is also a poetic term for a peacock.

“Yes, lord,” replied Pañcasikha. He bowed to the Buddha and said, 1.8.6
“Sir, Sakka, lord of gods, with his ministers and retinue, bows with
his head at your feet.”

“So may Sakka with his ministers and retinue be happy, Pañca- 1.8.8
sikha,” said the Buddha, “for all want to be happy—whether gods,
humans, titans, dragons, centaurs, or any of the other diverse crea-
tures there may be.”

For that is how the Realized Ones salute such illustrious spirits. 1.8.10
And being saluted by the Buddha, Sakka entered Indra’s hill cave,
bowed to the Buddha, and stood to one side. And the gods of the
thirty-three did likewise, as did Pañcasikha.

And at that time the uneven places were evened out, the cramped 1.9.1
places were opened up, the darkness vanished in the cave and light
appeared, as happens through the glory of the gods.

Then the Buddha said to Sakka, “It’s incredible and amazing that 1.9.2
you, the venerable Kosiya, who has so many duties and so much to
do, should come here.”⁸⁰⁷

“For a long time I’ve wanted to come and see the Buddha, but I 1.9.4
wasn’t able, being prevented by my many duties and responsibilities
for the gods of the thirty-three. This one time, sir, the Buddha was
staying near Sāvattī in the *salaḷa* tree hut.⁸⁰⁸ Then I went to Sāvattī
to see the Buddha. But at that time the Buddha was sitting immersed
in some kind of meditation. And a divine maiden of Great King

807. It is rare for the Buddha to address a deity as “venerable” (*āyasmā*), a term usually reserved for monks. Moggallāna addresses Sakka as “the venerable Kosiya” at MN 37:10.6; Mahākassapa calls him Kosiya without honorific at Ud 3.7:3.12. | The word *kosiya* is explained by the commentaries as “owl”, which, if correct, would have been the totem for a clan of that name. It is, however, a patronymic: Rig Veda 1.10.11 has *indra kauśika* which means “Indra, son of Kuśika (or Kuśa)”. *Kuśa* grass is critical to the performance of Vedic rites, and the label probably initially implied “Brahmanized”, i.e. a king whose reign was authorized according to Vedic ritual. Kosiya is said to be a low class family name (Bu Pc 2:2.1.18).

808. For *salaḷa* see note on SN 52.8:1.1.

Vessavaṇa named Bhūjati was attending on the Buddha, standing there paying homage to him with cupped palms.⁸⁰⁹

1.10.2 So I said to her, ‘Sister, please bow to the Buddha for me, saying: “Sir, Sakka, lord of gods, with his ministers and retinue, bows with his head at your feet.”’

1.10.5 When I said this, she said to me, ‘It’s the wrong time to see the Buddha, as he’s in retreat.’

1.10.8 ‘Well then, sister, please convey my message when the Buddha emerges from that immersion. I hope that sister bowed to you? Do you remember what she said?’

1.10.12 “She did bow, lord of gods, and I remember what she said. I also remember that it was the sound of your chariot wheels that pulled me out of that immersion.”⁸¹⁰

1.11.1 “Sir, I have heard and learned this in the presence of the gods who were reborn in the host of the thirty-three before me: ‘When a Realized One arises in the world, perfected and fully awakened, the heavenly hosts swell, while the titan hosts dwindle.’ And I have seen this with my own eyes.

2.1. The Story of Gopikā

1.11.5 Right here in Kapilavatthu there was a Sakyan lady named Gopikā who had confidence in the Buddha, the teaching, and the Saṅgha, and had fulfilled her ethics.⁸¹¹ Losing her attachment to femininity, she developed masculinity. When her body broke up, after death, she was reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.⁸¹² In the company

809. A *paricārikā* is a maid attending on a nymph (MN 37:8.12). | Bhūjati (variant *bhuñjati*) does not seem to appear elsewhere.

810. Sakka pointedly ignores this, but perhaps his shame at disturbing the Buddha’s meditation explains his oblique method of gaining an audience.

811. This implies she was a stream-enterer.

812. In Buddhism, sex is mutable between lives and even within one life (Bu Pj 1:10.6.1). Later Buddhists sometimes held that the status of a male was preferable. Here this is not stated outright, but the narrative implies that she thought her station was improved when becoming a male. Notably, it is not

of the gods of the thirty-three she became one of my sons. There they knew him as the godling Gopaka.

Meanwhile three others, mendicants who had led the spiritual life under the Buddha, were reborn in the inferior centaur realm.⁸¹³ There they amused themselves, supplied and provided with the five kinds of sensual stimulation, and became my servants and attendants.

At that, Gopaka scolded them, 'Where on earth were you at, good fellows, when you heard the Buddha's teaching!⁸¹⁴ For while I was still a woman I had confidence in the Buddha, the teaching, and the Saṅgha, and had fulfilled my ethics. I lost my attachment to femininity and developed masculinity. When my body broke up, after death, I was reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. In the company of the gods of the thirty-three I became one of Sakka's sons. Here they know me as the godling Gopaka. But you, having led the spiritual life under the Buddha, were reborn in the inferior centaur realm. It is a sad sight indeed to see fellow practitioners reborn in the inferior centaur realm.'

the Buddha who says this, but Sakka, relaying the story of another deity. That the proponent was a woman, at least formerly, is a trope of Indian literature: a woman is the ideal misogynist (see eg. Ja 61 or Śivapurāṇa chapter 4). Here, though, the situation is nuanced, because despite her (presumed) inferior status, she has better rebirth than the monks she served.

813. The realm of centaurs is "inferior" because the centaurs are known for their ribald sexuality.

814. *Kutomukhā*, which occurs only in this sutta, contrasts with *sammukhā* ("in the presence of", "from the mouth of"). The commentary explains it as a rhetorical question, "Were you distracted or falling asleep?" Alternatively, it might mean "From whom did you learn the Buddha's teaching?" It recurs later in the verses. This is not the only such case: *duddiṭṭharūpaṃ* and *kāyaṃ brahmapurohitaṃ* are other examples of terms found nowhere else in the Pali canon, yet found here both in prose and in verse. Clearly one has been copied from the other; it seems to me that the rarity of these terms and the greater coherence of the verses suggests that the prose is a (somewhat altered) summary of the verses.

- 1.11.19 When scolded by Gopaka, two of those gods regained their memory right away. They went to the host of the priests of Divinity, but one god remained attached to sensual pleasures.⁸¹⁵
- 1.12.1 “I was a laywoman disciple of the Clear-eyed One,
and my name was Gopikā.
I was devoted to the Buddha and the teaching,
and I faithfully served the Saṅgha.
- 1.12.5 Because of the clear rightness of the Buddha’s teaching,
I’m now a mighty, dazzling son of Sakka,
reborn in the Third Heaven.
And here they know me as Gopaka.
- 1.12.9 Then I saw some mendicants who I’d seen before,
dwelling in the host of centaurs.
They were disciples of Gotama
when I used to be a human.
- 1.12.13 I served them with food and drink,
and clasped their feet in my own home.⁸¹⁶
Where on earth were these good fellows at
when they learned the Buddha’s teachings?

815. The commentary explains the verb “gained” (*paṭilabhimsu*) as serving dual roles here: “gaining” of “absorption mindfulness” (*jhānasatim*), upon which they “gain” rebirth in the Brahmā realm. However, the verses below speak of “recollecting” (*anussaram*) the Buddha’s teachings at this juncture. Compare Bu NP 23:1.1.20, where the king “remembered” his long-forgotten promise (*vissaritvā cirena satim paṭilabhitvā*). AN 4.191:2.24 speaks of the “arising of memory” (*satuppādo*) in a deity when reminded of Dhamma passages they once recited as a monk. | The phrase *kāyaṃ brahmapurohitam* is syntactically incongruous; I think it was clumsily copied from the verses below, where the required verb (*ajjhagam̐su*) is present. The commentary explains it as “a Minister of Brahmā’s body” (*brahmapurohitasarīram*), but in such contexts *kāya* usually means “host”.

816. When bowing, it is a special sign of devotion to touch the feet of the one revered (eg. MN 89:9.1).

For each must know for themselves the teaching 1.12.17
 so well-taught, realized by the Clear-eyed One.
 I was one who followed you,⁸¹⁷
 having heard the fine words of the noble ones.

I'm now a mighty, dazzling son of Sakka, 1.12.21
 reborn in the Third Heaven.
 But you followed the best of men,
 and led the supreme spiritual life,

but still you're born in this lesser realm, 1.12.25
 a rebirth unbefitting.
 It's a sad sight I see, good fellows,
 fellow practitioners in a lesser realm.

Reborn in the host of centaurs, 1.12.29
 only to wait upon the gods.
 Meanwhile, I dwelt in a house—⁸¹⁸
 but see my distinction now!

Having been a woman now I'm a male god, 1.12.33
 blessed with heavenly sensual pleasures.”
 Scolded by that disciple of Gotama,⁸¹⁹
 comprehending Gopaka,
 they were struck with urgency.

“Let's strive, let's try hard— 1.12.37
 we won't serve others any more!”
 Two of them roused up energy,
 recalling the Buddha's instructions.

817. Here Gopaka shifts from speaking about them in third person to speaking to them in second person.

818. I.e. she was a lay person.

819. Up until now, the verses have been spoken by Gopaka, but here a narrator appears.

- 1.12.41 Right away they became dispassionate,
seeing the drawbacks in sensual pleasures.
The fetters and bonds of sensual pleasures—
the ties of the Wicked One so hard to break—
- 1.12.45 they burst them like a bull elephant his ropes,
and passed right over the thirty-three.
The gods with Indra and the Progenitor
were all gathered in the Hall of Clear Right.
- 1.12.49 As they sat there, they passed over them,
the heroes desireless, practicing purity.
Seeing them, Vāsava was struck with urgency;⁸²⁰
the master of gods in the midst of the group said,
- 1.12.53 “These were born in the lesser centaur realm,
but now they pass us by!”
Heeding the speech of one so moved,
Gopaka addressed Vāsava,
- 1.12.57 “There is a Buddha, a lord of men, in the world.⁸²¹
Known as the Sakyan Sage,
he’s mastered the senses.⁸²²
Those sons of his lost their memory;⁸²³
but when scolded by me they gained it back.
- 1.12.61 Of the three, there is one who remains

820. Normally rebirth is described as passing away in one realm then being reborn in another. Yet here the gods of the thirty-three—in their traditional abode on Mount Meru—were watching them literally fly from one realm to another.

821. The truncated *janind’* is not vocative *janinda* for Sakka, but nominative *janindo* for the Buddha.

822. “Sakyan Sage” (*sakyamuni*) became a favorite epithet of the Buddha, but in early texts it appears only here and the Ratanasutta (Sn 2.1:4.2).

823. “Sons” in a spiritual sense.

dwelling in the host of centaurs.
But two, recollecting the path to awakening,
serene, spurn even the gods.

Such is the explanation of the teaching here:⁸²⁴ 1.12.65
not a single disciple doubts that.⁸²⁵
We venerate the Buddha, the victor, lord of men,
who has crossed the flood and cut off doubt.

They attained distinction to the extent 1.12.69
they understood the teaching here;
two of them distinguished
in the host of the priests of Divinity.”⁸²⁶

We have come here, dear sir, 1.12.73
to realize this same teaching.
If the Buddha would give me a chance,
I would ask a question, dear sir.”

Then it occurred to the Buddha, “For a long time now this spirit 1.13.1
has led a pure life. Any question he asks me will be beneficial, not
unbeneficial. And he will quickly understand any answer I give to
his question.”

So the Buddha addressed Sakka in verse: 1.13.4

“Ask me your question, Vāsava, 1.13.5

824. The commentary says, “In this dispensation the explanation of the teaching is such that because of it, disciples become endowed with such qualities” (*ettha sāsane evarūpā dhammappakāsanā, yāya sāvakā etehi guṇehi samannāgatā honti*). This explains the feminine *etādisi*; *pakasanā*, which is normally neuter, is feminine here. This use is fairly common in later texts (it occurs at the conclusion of the *Ṭikā* for this sutta).

825. *Kinkaṅkhati* is a unique term for “doubt”.

826. The end point of Gopaka’s speech is hard to determine, as there is no *-ti* to mark it. Various editions and translations either ignore the issue or end it in different places. The next line marks the beginning of Sakka’s direct speech to the Buddha, and I think it makes the best sense to assume that up to here he has been relating the story he was told.

whatever you want.
I'll solve each and every
question you have."

The first recitation section is complete.

- 2.1.1 Having been granted an opportunity by the Buddha, Sakka asked the first question.
- 2.1.2 "Good fellow, what fetters bind the gods, humans, titans, dragons, centaurs—and any of the other diverse creatures—so that, though they wish to be free of enmity, violence, hostility, and hate, they still have enmity, violence, hostility, and hate?"⁸²⁷
- 2.1.4 Such was Sakka's question to the Buddha. And the Buddha answered him:
- 2.1.6 "Lord of gods, the fetters of jealousy and stinginess bind the gods, humans, titans, dragons, centaurs—and any of the other diverse creatures—⁸²⁸ so that, though they wish to be free of enmity, violence, hostility, and hate, they still have enmity, violence, hostility, and hate."
- 2.1.8 Such was the Buddha's answer to Sakka. Delighted, Sakka approved and agreed with what the Buddha said, saying, "That's so true, Blessed One! That's so true, Holy One! Hearing the Buddha's answer, I've gone beyond doubt and got rid of indecision."
- 2.2.1 And then, having approved and agreed with what the Buddha said, Sakka asked another question:
- 2.2.2 "But good fellow, what is the source, origin, birthplace, and inception of jealousy and stinginess?"⁸²⁹ When what exists is there jealousy

827. This question hints at Sakka's own evolution from the battlegod of the Vedas to an acolyte of peace.

828. Jealousy is wanting what others have, while stinginess is not wanting to share what you have.

829. Compare with the side branch of dependent origination at DN 15:9.1, the origins of disputes at Snp 4.11, and the analysis of proliferation at MN 18. Note the constructive use of the "yes, and" method of questioning. Sakka finds wisdom due to his curiosity, neither being too-easily sated with a simple answer,

and stinginess? When what doesn't exist is there no jealousy and stinginess?"

"The liked and the disliked, lord of gods, are the source of jealousy and stinginess. When the liked and the disliked exist there is jealousy and stinginess. When the liked and the disliked don't exist there is no jealousy and stinginess." 2.2.5

"But good fellow, what is the source of what is liked and disliked?" 2.2.8

"Desire is the source of what is liked and disliked."⁸³⁰ 2.2.11

"But what is the source of desire?" 2.2.14

"Thought is the source of desire."⁸³¹ 2.2.17

"But what is the source of thought?" 2.2.20

"Judgments driven by the proliferation of perceptions are the source of thoughts."⁸³² 2.2.23

"But how does a mendicant fittingly practice for the cessation of judgments driven by the proliferation of perceptions?" 2.3.1

2.2. Meditation on Feelings

"Lord of gods, there are two kinds of happiness, I say: that which you should cultivate, and that which you should not cultivate. There are two kinds of sadness, I say: that which you should cultivate, and that which you should not cultivate. There are two kinds of equanimity, I say: that which you should cultivate, and that which you should not cultivate." 2.3.3

nor quibbling that the answer is inadequate, but building on the foundations of understanding.

830. Compare Snp 4.11:4.1.

831. Here we depart from the normal sequence, which is that feelings give rise to craving (*taṇhā*). In Snp 4.11:6.1 it is said that pleasure and pain give rise to desire, not thought.

832. "Judgments that emerge from the proliferation of perceptions" renders *papaṇcasaññāsaṅkhā*. Again the sequence departs from MN 18:16.1, which says that thoughts—which are normal and morally neutral psychological processes—give rise to "proliferation" (*papañca*), which is when craving and delusion cause thought to spin out of control. "Proliferation" then solidifies into "judgments" that fuel an individual's delusion of "self" persisting through time.

- 2.3.9 Why did I say that there are two kinds of happiness? Well, should you know of a happiness:⁸³³ ‘When I cultivate this kind of happiness, unskillful qualities grow, and skillful qualities decline.’ You should not cultivate that kind of happiness. Whereas, should you know of a happiness: ‘When I cultivate this kind of happiness, unskillful qualities decline, and skillful qualities grow.’ You should cultivate that kind of happiness. And that which is free of placing the mind and keeping it connected is better than that which still involves placing the mind and keeping it connected.⁸³⁴ That’s why I said there are two kinds of happiness.
- 2.3.17 Why did I say that there are two kinds of sadness? Well, should you know of a sadness: ‘When I cultivate this kind of sadness, unskillful qualities grow, and skillful qualities decline.’ You should not cultivate that kind of sadness. Whereas, should you know of a sadness: ‘When I cultivate this kind of sadness, unskillful qualities decline, and skillful qualities grow.’ You should cultivate that kind of sadness.⁸³⁵ And that which is free of placing the mind and keeping it connected is better than that which still involves placing the mind and keeping it connected.⁸³⁶ That’s why I said there are two kinds of sadness.
- 2.3.25 Why did I say that there are two kinds of equanimity? Well, should you know of an equanimity: ‘When I cultivate this kind of equanimity, unskillful qualities grow, and skillful qualities decline.’ You should not cultivate that kind of equanimity. Whereas, should you know of an equanimity: ‘When I cultivate this kind of equanimity, unskillful qualities decline, and skillful qualities grow.’ You should cultivate that kind of equanimity. And that which is free of placing the mind

833. *Jaññā* is 3rd singular optative (cp. AN 9.6:3.4).

834. That is, second *jhāna* is better than first *jhāna*.

835. Overwhelmingly, the suttas speak of happiness in the path to liberation. They do, however, also acknowledge that sometimes temporary states of sadness leading to disillusionment can spur a person on the path.

836. It is hard to know what the text is getting at here, as there is no “sadness” in any *jhāna*.

and keeping it connected is better than that which still involves placing the mind and keeping it connected. That's why I said there are two kinds of equanimity.

That's how a mendicant fittingly practices for the cessation of judgments driven by the proliferation of perceptions." 2.3.33

Such was the Buddha's answer to Sakka. Delighted, Sakka approved and agreed with what the Buddha said, saying, "That's so true, Blessed One! That's so true, Holy One! Hearing the Buddha's answer, I've gone beyond doubt and got rid of indecision." 2.3.34

2.3. Restraint in the Monastic Code

And then Sakka asked another question: 2.4.1

"But good fellow, how does a mendicant practice for restraint in the monastic code?" 2.4.2

"Lord of gods, I say that there are two kinds of bodily behavior:⁸³⁷ that which you should cultivate, and that which you should not cultivate. I say that there are two kinds of verbal behavior: that which you should cultivate, and that which you should not cultivate. There are two kinds of search, I say: that which you should cultivate, and that which you should not cultivate. 2.4.3

Why did I say that there are two kinds of bodily behavior? Well, should you know of a bodily behavior: 'When I cultivate this kind of bodily behavior, unskillful qualities grow, and skillful qualities decline.' You should not cultivate that kind of bodily conduct. Whereas, should you know of a bodily behavior: 'When I cultivate this kind of bodily behavior, unskillful qualities decline, and skillful qualities grow.' You should cultivate that kind of bodily conduct. That's why I said there are two kinds of bodily behavior. 2.4.9

Why did I say that there are two kinds of verbal behavior? Well, should you know of a kind of verbal behavior that it causes unskillful qualities to grow while skillful qualities decline, you should not 2.4.17

837. Here the Buddha emphasizes the psychological and spiritual underpinnings of the "monastic code" (*pātimokkha*).

cultivate it. Whereas, should you know of a kind of verbal behavior that it causes unskillful qualities to decline while skillful qualities grow, you should cultivate it. That's why I said there are two kinds of verbal behavior.

2.4.24 Why did I say that there are two kinds of search? Well, should you know of a kind of search that it causes unskillful qualities to grow while skillful qualities decline, you should not cultivate it.⁸³⁸ Whereas, should you know of a kind of search that it causes unskillful qualities to decline while skillful qualities grow, you should cultivate it. That's why I said there are two kinds of search.

2.4.31 That's how a mendicant practices for restraint in the monastic code.”

2.4.32 Such was the Buddha's answer to Sakka. Delighted, Sakka approved and agreed with what the Buddha said, saying, “That's so true, Blessed One! That's so true, Holy One! Hearing the Buddha's answer, I've gone beyond doubt and got rid of indecision.”

2.4. Sense Restraint

2.5.1 And then Sakka asked another question:

2.5.2 “But good fellow, how does a mendicant practice for restraint of the sense faculties?”

2.5.3 “Lord of gods, I say that there are two kinds of sight known by the eye: that which you should cultivate, and that which you should not cultivate. There are two kinds of sound known by the ear ... smells known by the nose ... tastes known by the tongue ... touches known by the body ... ideas known by the mind: that which you should cultivate, and that which you should not cultivate.”

2.5.15 When the Buddha said this, Sakka said to him:

838. The suttas frequently describe three kinds of search: for sensual pleasures, for continued existence, and for a spiritual path (eg. SN 45.161:7.3). The last search led the Buddha to awakening (MN 26:15.1).

“Sir, this is how I understand the detailed meaning of the Buddha’s brief statement:⁸³⁹ You should not cultivate the kind of sight known by the eye which causes unskillful qualities to grow while skillful qualities decline.⁸⁴⁰ And you should cultivate the kind of sight known by the eye which causes unskillful qualities to decline while skillful qualities grow. You should not cultivate the kind of sound, smell, taste, touch, or idea known by the mind which causes unskillful qualities to grow while skillful qualities decline. And you should cultivate the kind of idea known by the mind which causes unskillful qualities to decline while skillful qualities grow.” 2.5.16

Sir, that’s how I understand the detailed meaning of the Buddha’s brief statement. Hearing the Buddha’s answer, I’ve gone beyond doubt and got rid of indecision.” 2.5.25

And then Sakka asked another question: 2.6.1

“Good fellow, do all ascetics and brahmins have a single doctrine, ethics, desire, and attachment?”⁸⁴¹ 2.6.2

“No, lord of gods, they do not.” 2.6.3

“Why not?” 2.6.4

“The world has many and diverse elements. Whatever element sentient beings insist on in this world of many and diverse elements, they obstinately stick to it, insisting that:⁸⁴² ‘This is the only truth, anything else is futile.’ That’s why not all ascetics and brahmins have a single doctrine, ethics, desire, and attachment.” 2.6.5

839. Sakka switches his term of address for the Buddha from *mārisa* to the more respectful *bhante* here, then back to *mārisa* below. This passage is found at MN 114:24.5, where *bhante* is used, suggesting it was imported from there.

840. For a more detailed analysis of this, see MN 152.

841. The Pali *ekanta* (“single”) here is a little tricky; it could mean either “the same” or “of one goal”. The Sanskrit has just *eka* (*ekakāmā ekacchandāḥ*, “one desire, one wish”), while the commentary explains the first and last terms as “one goal” and the middle terms as “one”.

842. The Buddha points out that spiritual teachers, when faced with a world of experiential diversity, tend to prioritize their own experience or doctrine, dismissing others as less real or meaningful.

- 2.6.9 “Good fellow, have all ascetics and brahmins reached the ultimate end, the ultimate sanctuary from the yoke, the ultimate spiritual life, the ultimate goal?”⁸⁴³
- 2.6.10 “No, lord of gods, they have not.”
- 2.6.11 “Why not?”
- 2.6.12 “Those mendicants who are freed through the ending of craving have reached the ultimate end, the ultimate sanctuary from the yoke, the ultimate spiritual life, the ultimate goal.⁸⁴⁴ That’s why not all ascetics and brahmins have reached the ultimate end, the ultimate sanctuary from the yoke, the ultimate spiritual life, the ultimate goal.”
- 2.6.14 Such was the Buddha’s answer to Sakka. Delighted, Sakka approved and agreed with what the Buddha said, saying, “That’s so true, Blessed One! That’s so true, Holy One! Hearing the Buddha’s answer, I’ve gone beyond doubt and got rid of indecision.”⁸⁴⁵
- 2.6.18 And then Sakka, having approved and agreed with what the Buddha said, said to him,
- 2.7.1 “Turbulence, sir, is a disease, a boil, a dart. Turbulence drags a person to be regenerated in one state of existence or another.⁸⁴⁶ That’s why a person finds themselves in states high and low. Elsewhere, among other ascetics and brahmins, I wasn’t even given a chance to ask these questions that the Buddha has answered. The dart of doubt

843. *Yogakkhema* (“sanctuary from the yoke”) is a metaphor for Nibbāna that draws from the literal sense of *khema* as an oasis or sanctuary for men and beasts. After a hard day’s journey, a caravan would stop to rest, “unyoke” the draft animals, lay down the burden, and refresh themselves in the cool waters.

844. This passage is quoted by name by Hālidikāni at SN 22.4:1.4. The topic is picked up again in MN 31, where we see the extent to which Sakka has learned his lesson. | The text has “mendicants” here, but “ascetics and brahmins” immediately before and after. The quotation at SN 22.4:1.4 has “ascetics and brahmins”, so it is likely the text here is in error.

845. This is the final substantive question of the series. It is picked up in MN 37:2.2 where Sakka, in a subsequent visit, inquires further as to the nature of those who have realized the ultimate goal.

846. “Turbulence” is *ejā*, from a root meaning “motion, agitation”, and hence the opposite of the “imperturbable” (*aneja*) peace of the Buddha (SN 35.90).

and indecision has lain within me for a long time, but the Buddha has plucked it out.”

“Lord of gods, do you recall having asked this question of other ascetics and brahmins?”⁸⁴⁷ 2.7.5

“I do, sir.” 2.7.6

“If you wouldn’t mind, lord of gods, tell me how they answered.” 2.7.7

“It’s no trouble when someone such as the Blessed One is sitting here.” 2.7.8

“Well, speak then, lord of gods.” 2.7.9

“Sir, I approached those who I imagined were ascetics and brahmins living in the wilderness, in remote lodgings. But they were stumped by my question, and they even questioned me in return: ‘What is the venerable’s name?’ So I answered them: ‘Good fellow, I am Sakka, lord of gods.’ So they asked me another question: ‘But lord of gods, what deed brought you to this position?’ So I taught them the Dhamma as I had learned and memorized it. And they were pleased with just that much: ‘We have seen Sakka, lord of gods! And he answered our questions!’ Invariably, they become my disciples, I don’t become theirs. But sir, I am the Buddha’s disciple, a stream-enterer, not liable to be reborn in the underworld, assured, destined for awakening.” 2.7.10

2.5. On Feeling Happy

“Lord of gods, do you recall ever feeling such joy and happiness before?” 2.7.22

“I do, sir.” 2.7.23

“But how?” 2.7.24

“Once upon a time, sir, a battle was fought between the gods and the titans. In that battle the gods won and the titans lost. It occurred to me as victor, ‘Now the gods shall enjoy both the nectar 2.7.25

847. Compare Ajātasattu’s experience at DN 2:15.1.

of the gods and the nectar of the titans.⁸⁴⁸ But sir, that joy and happiness is in the sphere of the rod and the sword. It doesn't lead to disillusionment, dispassion, cessation, peace, insight, awakening, and extinguishment. But the joy and happiness I feel listening to the Buddha's teaching is not in the sphere of the rod and the sword. It does lead to disillusionment, dispassion, cessation, peace, insight, awakening, and extinguishment."⁸⁴⁹

2.8.1 "But lord of gods, what reason do you see for speaking of such joy and happiness?"

2.8.2 "I see six reasons to speak of such joy and happiness, sir.

2.8.3 While staying right here,
remaining in the godly form,
I have gained an extended life:⁸⁵⁰
know this, dear sir.

2.8.7 This is the first reason.

2.8.8 When I fall from the heavenly host,
leaving behind the non-human life,
I shall consciously go to a new womb,⁸⁵¹
wherever my mind delights.

2.8.12 This is the second reason.

2.8.13 Living happily under the guidance
of the one of unclouded wisdom,

848. "Nectar" is *ojā*, in Vedic texts called *soma* or *amṛta* ("ambrosia" of immortality). The battle over nectar by gods (*deva*) and demons (*asura*) is a very ancient element of Indo-European mythology.

849. Here Sakka makes a clean break from the violent delights he enjoyed in former (Vedic) times.

850. *Punarāyu* is a unique term. It probably means that Sakka can extend his current fortunate birth due to the merit of Dhamma.

851. To die "unconfused" or "consciously" is said to be a benefit of Dhamma practice (eg. AN 5.215:2.3).

I shall practice systematically,⁸⁵²
aware and mindful.

This is the third reason. 2.8.17

And if awakening should arise 2.8.18
as I practice systematically,
I shall live as one who understands,
and my end shall come right there.⁸⁵³

This is the fourth reason. 2.8.22

When I fall from the human realm, 2.8.23
leaving behind the human life,
I shall become a god again,
supreme in the heaven realm.⁸⁵⁴

This is the fifth reason. 2.8.27

They are the finest of gods, 2.8.28
the glorious Akaniṭṭhas.
So long as my final life goes on,⁸⁵⁵
there my home will be.

This is the sixth reason. 2.8.32

Seeing these six reasons I speak of such joy and happiness. 2.8.33

852. "Systematically" (or "according to method", *nāyena*) recalls *nāyapaṭipanno* as a description of the noble ones. It means practicing according with the noble eightfold path, a "method" that yields definite results.

853. This refers to the possibility of achieving perfection (*arahattā*).

854. That is, after passing away as Sakka and being reborn as a human, he will subsequently return to the heaven realm.

855. He predicts that his final life will be in this high realm that is inhabited by non-returners (AN 9.12:6.7).

- 2.9.1 My wishes unfulfilled,
 doubting and indecisive,
 I wandered for such a long time,
 in search of the Realized One.
- 2.9.5 I imagined that ascetics
 living in seclusion
 must surely be awakened,
 so I went to sit near them.
- 2.9.9 ‘How is there success?
 How is there failure?’
 But they were stumped by such questions
 about the path and practice.
- 2.9.13 And when they found out that I
 was Sakka, come from the gods,
 they questioned me instead about
 the deed that brought me to this state.
- 2.9.17 I taught them the Dhamma
 as I had learned it among men.
 They were delighted with that, saying:
 ‘We’ve seen Vāsava!’
- 2.9.21 Now since I’ve seen the Buddha,
 who helps us overcome doubt,
 today, free of fear,
 I pay homage to the awakened one.
- 2.9.25 Destroyer of the dart of craving,
 the Buddha is unrivaled.
 I bow to the great hero,
 the Buddha, Kinsman of the Sun.

In the same way that divinity ought be revered⁸⁵⁶ 2.9.29
by we gods, dear sir,⁸⁵⁷
today we shall revere you—
come, let us revere you ourselves!⁸⁵⁸

You alone are the Awakened! 2.9.33
You are the Teacher supreme!
In the world with its gods,
you have no rival.”

Then Sakka addressed the centaur Pañcasikha, “Dear Pañcasikha, 2.10.1
you were very helpful to me, since you first charmed the Buddha,
after which I went to see him. I shall appoint you to your father’s
position—you shall be king of the centaurs. And I give you Bhaddā
Suriyavaccasā, for she loves you very much.”⁸⁵⁹

Then Sakka, touching the ground with his hand, expressed this 2.10.5
heartfelt sentiment three times:⁸⁶⁰

“Homage to him, the blessed one, the perfected one, the fully 2.10.6
awakened Buddha!

Homage to him, the blessed one, the perfected one, the fully 2.10.7
awakened Buddha!

Homage to him, the blessed one, the perfected one, the fully 2.10.8
awakened Buddha!”

And while this discourse was being spoken, the stainless, immacu- 2.10.9
late vision of the Dhamma arose in Sakka, lord of gods: “Everything

856. *Karomasi* is middle imperative 1st plural, “we should do”, glossed by the commentary as “we should pay homage” (*namakkāraṃ karoma*).

857. *Samam* is an indeclinable in the sense “likewise”.

858. *Sāmaṃ* is an indeclinable in the sense “oneself, personally, one’s own”.

859. A *gandharva* wedding must be a mutual love match.

860. “Touching the ground with his hand” is a unique gesture in the early Pali, immortalized in later legend when the Buddha touches the ground to invoke the Earth Goddess as witness of his striving.

that is liable to arise is liable to cease.” And also for another 80,000 deities.⁸⁶¹

- 2.10.12 Such were the questions Sakka was invited to ask, and which were answered by the Buddha. And that’s why the name of this discussion is “Sakka’s Questions”.

861. Sakka is also said to have been accompanied by 80,000 deities at SN 40.10:4.4. This is one of many indications that this is a late discourse, several of which have been touched on above: late or unique terminology; fancy literary styles; adoption of doctrinal passages from elsewhere in a sometimes clumsy fashion; and so on. In determining whether a sutta is late or early, we do not rely on a single definitive reason, but on a cluster of independent criteria which taken together are most easily explained in terms of historical development.

DN 22

The Longer Discourse on Mindfulness Meditation

Mahāsatipaṭṭhānasutta

SO I HAVE HEARD.⁸⁶² At one time the Buddha was staying in the 1.1
land of the Kurus, near the Kuru town named Kammāsadamma.
There the Buddha addressed the mendicants, “Mendicants!”

“Venerable sir,” they replied. The Buddha said this: 1.5

“Mendicants, the four kinds of mindfulness meditation are the 1.7
path to convergence. They are in order to purify sentient beings, to
get past sorrow and crying, to make an end of pain and sadness, to
discover the system, and to realize extinguishment.”⁸⁶³

862. This discourse is copied from MN 10. The section on the four noble truths has been expanded with material mostly drawn from MN 141. These discourses are the most influential texts for modern Theravada meditation, prompting countless modern commentaries. Comparative study of the several parallel versions reveals that this discourse, while comprised almost entirely of early material, was compiled in this form as one of the latest texts in the Pali suttas (see SN 47.18 and note). | While mindfulness is always useful (SN 46.53:15.4), the “establishment of mindfulness” (*satipaṭṭhāna*) refers especially to a conscious development of contemplative practices based on mindfulness, i.e. “mindfulness meditation”.

863. The phrase *ekāyano maggo* (“path to convergence”) is given multiple meanings in commentaries and ancient Chinese translations. Outside of *satipaṭṭhāna*,

- 1.8 What four? It's when a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world.⁸⁶⁴ They meditate observing an aspect of feelings—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world.⁸⁶⁵ They meditate observing an aspect of the mind—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world.⁸⁶⁶ They meditate observing an aspect of principles—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world.⁸⁶⁷

it is used in only one context in Pali, where it means to “come together with” (MN 12:37.5). At SN 47.18:3.4 the phrase is spoken by Brahmā, which suggests it was a Brahmanical term. Yājñavalkya—in a core passage full of details shared with the suttas—uses it for a place where things unite or converge (Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.4.11; in the same sense also at Chāndogya Upaniṣad 7.5.2; Mahābhārata 14.19.1–2). Thus *satipaṭṭhāna* leads to everything “coming together as one”. In other words, as seventh factor of the noble eightfold path, it leads to *samādhi*, the eighth factor (SN 45.1:3.9; see also MN 44:12.3). *Ekāyana* is also a name for a certain Sanskrit scripture (in a list of texts at Chāndogya Upaniṣad 7.1.2, 7.1.4, 7.2.1, 7.7.1; Puruṣottamasamhitā 1.10; Praśnasamhitā 2.38). Now, the latter text discusses the *ekāyana* as *nivṛtti*, “renunciation”, which is, in fact, introduced to the Vedic system by Yājñavalkya in the above-cited passage. Thus as a scripture it probably originally referred to that very passage exemplifying the Upaniṣadic teachings, which are otherwise omitted from the Chāndogya list.

864. The idiom *kāye kāyānupassī*, literally “observes a body in the body” refers to focusing on a specific aspect of embodied experience, such as the breath, the postures, etc. | “Keen” (or “ardent”, *ātāpi*) implies effort, while “aware” (*sampajāno*) is the wisdom of understanding situation and context. | “Covetousness and displeasure” (*abhiññhādomanassam*) are the strong forms of desire and aversion that are overcome by sense restraint in preparation for meditation.

865. “Feelings” (*vedanā*) are the basic tones of pleasant, painful, or neutral, not the complexes we call “emotions”.

866. “Mind” (*citta*) is simple awareness. In meditation contexts, “mind” is often similar in meaning to *samādhi*.

867. “Principles” (*dhammā*) are the natural “systems” of cause and effect that underlie the “teachings”. The renderings “mind objects” or “mental qualities” are incorrect, as many of the things spoken of in this section are neither mind objects nor mental qualities. “Phenomena” is a possible translation, but the

1. Observing the Body

1.1. Mindfulness of Breathing

And how does a mendicant meditate observing an aspect of the body? 2.1

It's when a mendicant—gone to a wilderness, or to the root of a tree, or to an empty hut—sits down cross-legged, sets their body straight, and brings mindfulness to the present.⁸⁶⁸ Just mindful, they breathe in. Mindful, they breathe out.⁸⁶⁹ 2.2

Breathing in heavily they know: 'I'm breathing in heavily.' Breathing out heavily they know: 'I'm breathing out heavily.'⁸⁷⁰ 2.4

Breathing in lightly they know: 'I'm breathing in lightly.' Breathing out lightly they know: 'I'm breathing out lightly.'⁸⁷¹ 2.5

They practice like this: 'I'll breathe in experiencing the whole body.' They practice like this: 'I'll breathe out experiencing the whole body.'⁸⁷² 2.6

emphasis is not on the “appearance” of things, but on the “principles” governing their conditional relations.

868. The context here—a mendicant gone to the forest—establishes that this practice takes place in the wider context of the Gradual Training. Indeed, this whole sutta can be understood as an expansion of this phrase, mentioned briefly at DN 2:67.3.

869. The most fundamental meditation instruction in Buddhism. Notice how the Buddha phrases it: not “concentrate on the breath” as an object, but rather “breathing” as an activity to which one brings mindfulness.

870. The stages of breath meditation are not meant to be done deliberately, but to be observed and understood as the natural process of deepening meditation. When starting out, the breath is somewhat rough and coarse.

871. Over time, the breath becomes more subtle and soft.

872. Contextually the idiom “whole body” (*sabbakāya*) here refers to the breath, marking the fuller and more continuous awareness that arises with tranquility. Some practitioners, however, interpret it as the “whole physical body”, broadening awareness to encompass the movement and settling of energies throughout the body.

- 2.7 They practice like this: ‘I’ll breathe in stilling the physical process.’ They practice like this: ‘I’ll breathe out stilling the physical process.’⁸⁷³
- 2.8 It’s like a deft lathe-turner or lathe-turner’s apprentice. When drawing a long pull they know: ‘I’m drawing a long pull,’ and when drawing a short pull they know: ‘I’m drawing a short pull.’
- 2.11 And so they meditate observing an aspect of the body internally, externally, and both internally and externally.⁸⁷⁴ With respect to the body, they meditate observing the liability to originate, to vanish, and to originate and vanish.⁸⁷⁵ Or mindfulness is established that the body exists, to the extent necessary for knowledge and mindfulness. They meditate independent, not grasping at anything in the world.⁸⁷⁶
- 2.14 That’s how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body.

1.2. The Postures

- 3.1 Furthermore, when a mendicant is walking they know: ‘I am walking.’ When standing they know: ‘I am standing.’ When sitting they know:

873. The “physical process” (*kāyaśaṅkhāraṃ*) is the breath (SN 41.6:1.8).

874. “Internally” is one’s own body, “externally” the bodies of others, or external physical phenomena. This distinction is applied broadly in Buddhist meditation, but it is more relevant in some contexts than others. In the case of the breath, one is focusing on one’s own breath, but when contemplating, say, a dead body, or the material elements, there is more of an external dimension. Starting with “me” in here and the “world” out there, this practice dissolves this distinction so that we see we are of the same nature as everything else.

875. This is the *vipassanā* (“insight” or “discernment”) dimension of meditation, observing not just the rise and fall of phenomena, but also their conditioned “nature” as being “liable” (*-dhamma*) to impermanence. The meaning of this passage is explained at SN 47.42. Apart from these passages, *vipassanā* in *satipaṭṭhāna* pertains specially to the observation of principles.

876. Mindfulness meditation leads to a range of knowledges as detailed by Anuruddha at SN 52.6 and SN 52.11–24. An arahant is “independent” of any attachment (eg. MN 143), but *satipaṭṭhāna* is also taught to give up dependency on views of the past and future (DN 29:40.1).

‘I am sitting.’ And when lying down they know: ‘I am lying down.’⁸⁷⁷
 Whatever posture their body is in, they know it.

And so they meditate observing an aspect of the body internally, 3.3
 externally, and both internally and externally. They meditate observ-
 ing, with respect to the body, the liability to originate, to vanish, and
 to originate and vanish. Or mindfulness is established that the body
 exists, to the extent necessary for knowledge and mindfulness. They
 meditate independent, not grasping at anything in the world.

That too is how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of 3.6
 the body.

1.3. Situational Awareness

Furthermore, a mendicant acts with situational awareness when 4.1
 going out and coming back; when looking ahead and aside; when
 bending and extending the limbs; when bearing the outer robe,
 bowl, and robes; when eating, drinking, chewing, and tasting; when
 urinating and defecating; when walking, standing, sitting, sleeping,
 waking, speaking, and keeping silent.⁸⁷⁸

And so they meditate observing an aspect of the body internally 4.2

...

That too is how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of 4.3
 the body.

877. In early Pali, this practice is found only in the two Satipaṭṭhānasuttas and the closely related Kāyagatāsatisutta (MN 119). It is practiced by developing a reflexive awareness of one’s posture and activity as it proceeds, often assisted by moving slowly and carefully.

878. “Situational awareness” (*sampajañña*) understands the context and purpose of activities. The main examples here illustrate the activities of daily monastic life: leaving the monastery on almsround, restraint while in the town, care wearing the robes, then mindfully eating and going to the toilet.

1.4. Focusing on the Repulsive

- 5.1 Furthermore, a mendicant examines their own body, up from the soles of the feet and down from the tips of the hairs, wrapped in skin and full of many kinds of filth.⁸⁷⁹ ‘In this body there is head hair, body hair, nails, teeth, skin, flesh, sinews, bones, bone marrow, kidneys, heart, liver, diaphragm, spleen, lungs, intestines, mesentery, undigested food, feces, bile, phlegm, pus, blood, sweat, fat, tears, grease, saliva, snot, synovial fluid, urine.’⁸⁸⁰
- 5.3 It’s as if there were a bag with openings at both ends, filled with various kinds of grains, such as fine rice, wheat, mung beans, peas, sesame, and ordinary rice. And a person with clear eyes were to open it and examine the contents: ‘These grains are fine rice, these are wheat, these are mung beans, these are peas, these are sesame, and these are ordinary rice.’⁸⁸¹
- 5.6 And so they meditate observing an aspect of the body internally
...
- 5.7 That too is how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body.

1.5. Focusing on the Elements

- 6.1 Furthermore, a mendicant examines their own body, whatever its placement or posture, according to the elements:⁸⁸² ‘In this body

879. This practice is intended to counter sexual desire and obsession. The primary focus is on one’s own body, rather than another’s body, although that can be brought in also. By focusing on aspects of our body that we normally prefer to ignore, we move toward a healthy sense of acceptance and neutrality toward our body.

880. Thirty-one parts are mentioned in early texts, later expanded to thirty-two with the addition of the “brain” (*matthaluṅga*).

881. The “bag with openings at both ends” is the body. Not all the varieties of grains and beans can be positively identified.

882. While meditation on the elements is commonly taught in early texts, this phrase is found only in the two Satipatthānasuttas and the Kāyagatāsatisutta. Detailed instructions are found in such suttas as MN 28 and MN 140. This

there is the earth element, the water element, the fire element, and the air element.⁸⁸³

It's as if a deft butcher or butcher's apprentice were to kill a cow 6.3
and sit down at the crossroads with the meat cut into chops.⁸⁸⁴

And so they meditate observing an aspect of the body internally 6.6

...

That too is how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of 6.7
the body.

1.6. The Charnel Ground Contemplations

Furthermore, suppose a mendicant were to see a corpse discarded in 7.1
a charnel ground. And it had been dead for one, two, or three days,
bloated, livid, and festering.⁸⁸⁵ They'd compare it with their own
body:⁸⁸⁶ 'This body is also of that same nature, that same kind, and
cannot go beyond that.' And so they meditate observing an aspect
of the body internally ...

That too is how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of 7.5
the body.

meditation works in any posture, whereas breath meditation is best done sitting, to allow the breath to become still.

883. The "elements" are the four states of matter as represented by their primary material example and their dominant property: earth as a solid with the property of resisting or upholding; water as a liquid with the property of binding; air as a gas with the property of movement; and fire ("heat" or "energy") as plasma with the property of transformation.

884. This gruesome image shows that butchery of cows was a normal feature of ancient Indian life.

885. Cremation was expensive and not available to everyone. Bodies might be left in the charnel ground for a variety of reasons, such as local customs, lack of funds, or in cases of inauspicious death such as murder or execution. This is still seen in some places today, and monastics occasionally take the opportunity to practice meditation beside a corpse. However the wording of the Pali sounds like an imaginative exercise.

886. The observed corpse is not gendered. The purpose is not to become repulsed by an objectified other, but to understand the mortality of one's own body.

- 8.1 Furthermore, suppose they were to see a corpse discarded in a charnel ground being devoured by crows, hawks, vultures, herons, hounds, tigers, leopards, jackals, and many kinds of little creatures. They'd compare it with their own body: 'This body is also of that same nature, that same kind, and cannot go beyond that.' And so they meditate observing an aspect of the body internally ...
- 8.5 That too is how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body.
- 9.1 Furthermore, suppose they were to see a corpse discarded in a charnel ground, a skeleton with flesh and blood, held together by sinews ...
- 9.2 A skeleton without flesh but smeared with blood, and held together by sinews ...
- 9.3 A skeleton rid of flesh and blood, held together by sinews ...
- 9.4 Bones rid of sinews scattered in every direction. Here a hand-bone, there a foot-bone, here an ankle bone, there a shin-bone, here a thigh-bone, there a hip-bone, here a rib-bone, there a back-bone, here an arm-bone, there a neck-bone, here a jaw-bone, there a tooth, here the skull. ...
- 10.1 White bones, the color of shells ...
- 10.2 Decrepit bones, heaped in a pile ...
- 10.3 Bones rotted and crumbled to powder.⁸⁸⁷ They'd compare it with their own body: 'This body is also of that same nature, that same kind, and cannot go beyond that.' And so they meditate observing an aspect of the body internally, externally, and both internally and externally. With respect to the body, they meditate observing the liability to originate, to vanish, and to originate and vanish. Or mindfulness is established that the body exists, to the extent necessary for knowledge and mindfulness. They meditate independent, not grasping at anything in the world.

887. It takes decades for bones to rot to powder, again suggesting it is an imaginative contemplation.

That too is how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of 10.9
the body.

2. Observing the Feelings

And how does a mendicant meditate observing an aspect of feel- 11.1
ings?⁸⁸⁸

It's when a mendicant who feels a pleasant feeling knows: 'I feel a 11.2
pleasant feeling.'⁸⁸⁹

When they feel a painful feeling, they know: 'I feel a painful feel- 11.3
ing.'

When they feel a neutral feeling, they know: 'I feel a neutral 11.4
feeling.'

When they feel a pleasant feeling of the flesh, they know: 'I feel a 11.5
pleasant feeling of the flesh.'⁸⁹⁰

When they feel a pleasant feeling not of the flesh, they know: 'I 11.6
feel a pleasant feeling not of the flesh.'⁸⁹¹

When they feel a painful feeling of the flesh, they know: 'I feel a 11.7
painful feeling of the flesh.'

When they feel a painful feeling not of the flesh, they know: 'I 11.8
feel a painful feeling not of the flesh.'⁸⁹²

When they feel a neutral feeling of the flesh, they know: 'I feel a 11.9
neutral feeling of the flesh.'

888. Literally "a feeling among the feelings"; the practice shows that the mediator contemplates specific feelings as they occur.

889. Pali employs direct quotes to indicate reflexive awareness: you feel the feeling and you know that you feel the feeling. It does not mean that you have to literally say "I feel a pleasant feeling", although some adopt that as a meditation method.

890. Feelings "of the flesh" (*sāmisā*) are associated with the body and sensual desires (SN 36.31:4.1).

891. Feelings "not of the flesh" (*nirāmisā*) are associated with renunciation and especially with the *jhānas* and liberation (SN 36.31:5.1).

892. This would include the feelings of loss, doubt, and dejection that can occur during the spiritual path (see MN 44:28.6).

- 11.10 When they feel a neutral feeling not of the flesh, they know: ‘I feel a neutral feeling not of the flesh.’⁸⁹³
- 11.11 And so they meditate observing an aspect of feelings internally, externally, and both internally and externally. With respect to feelings, they meditate observing the liability to originate, to vanish, and to originate and vanish. Or mindfulness is established that feelings exist, to the extent necessary for knowledge and mindfulness. They meditate independent, not grasping at anything in the world.
- 11.14 That’s how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of feelings.

3. Observing the Mind

- 12.1 And how does a mendicant meditate observing an aspect of the mind?
- 12.2 It’s when a mendicant understands mind with greed as ‘mind with greed,’⁸⁹⁴ and mind without greed as ‘mind without greed.’ They understand mind with hate as ‘mind with hate,’ and mind without hate as ‘mind without hate.’ They understand mind with delusion as ‘mind with delusion,’ and mind without delusion as ‘mind without delusion.’ They know constricted mind as ‘constricted mind,’⁸⁹⁵ and scattered mind as ‘scattered mind.’ They know expansive mind as ‘expansive mind,’⁸⁹⁶ and unexpansive mind as ‘unexpansive mind.’ They know mind that is not supreme as ‘mind that is not supreme,’

893. The feeling of the fourth *jhāna* and higher liberations (SN 36.31:8.2).

894. In Buddhist theory, awareness of the presence or absence of qualities such as greed is explained on three levels. There is the simple happenstance of whether greed is present at that time or not. Then there is the mind freed of greed through the power of absorption. Finally there is the liberation from greed which comes with full awakening.

895. The mind is “constricted internally” due to dullness and “scattered externally” due to the distractions of desire (SN 51.20:18.1).

896. The following terms “expansive” (*mahaggata*), “supreme” (*anuttara*), “immersed” (*samāhita*), and “freed” (*vimutta*) all refer to states of absorption and/or awakening.

and mind that is supreme as ‘mind that is supreme.’ They know mind immersed in samādhi as ‘mind immersed in samādhi,’ and mind not immersed in samādhi as ‘mind not immersed in samādhi.’ They know freed mind as ‘freed mind,’ and unfreed mind as ‘unfreed mind.’

And so they meditate observing an aspect of the mind internally, 12.18
externally, and both internally and externally. With respect to the
mind, they meditate observing the liability to originate, to vanish,
and to originate and vanish. Or mindfulness is established that the
mind exists, to the extent necessary for knowledge and mindfulness.
They meditate independent, not grasping at anything in the world.

That’s how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the 12.21
mind.

4. Observing Principles

4.1. The Hindrances

And how does a mendicant meditate observing an aspect of princi- 13.1
ples?

It’s when a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of princi- 13.2
ples with respect to the five hindrances.⁸⁹⁷ And how does a mendi-
cant meditate observing an aspect of principles with respect to the
five hindrances?

It’s when a mendicant who has sensual desire in them under- 13.4
stands: ‘I have sensual desire in me.’ When they don’t have sensual
desire in them, they understand: ‘I don’t have sensual desire in me.’
They understand how sensual desire arises; how, when it’s already
arisen, it’s given up; and how, once it’s given up, it doesn’t arise again
in the future.⁸⁹⁸

897. The *Satipaṭṭhānavibhaṅga* of the Pali *Abhidhamma* only mentions the hindrances and awakening factors in this section (Vb 7). This, together with a range of other evidence, suggests that this was the original content of the observation of principles.

898. Here causality is introduced. In the contemplation of mind, the meditator was aware of the presence or absence of desire in the mind. Now they look

- 13.5 When they have ill will in them, they understand: ‘I have ill will in me.’ When they don’t have ill will in them, they understand: ‘I don’t have ill will in me.’ They understand how ill will arises; how, when it’s already arisen, it’s given up; and how, once it’s given up, it doesn’t arise again in the future.
- 13.6 When they have dullness and drowsiness in them, they understand: ‘I have dullness and drowsiness in me.’ When they don’t have dullness and drowsiness in them, they understand: ‘I don’t have dullness and drowsiness in me.’ They understand how dullness and drowsiness arise; how, when they’ve already arisen, they’re given up; and how, once they’re given up, they don’t arise again in the future.⁸⁹⁹
- 13.7 When they have restlessness and remorse in them, they understand: ‘I have restlessness and remorse in me.’ When they don’t have restlessness and remorse in them, they understand: ‘I don’t have restlessness and remorse in me.’ They understand how restlessness and remorse arise; how, when they’ve already arisen, they’re given up; and how, once they’re given up, they don’t arise again in the future.
- 13.8 When they have doubt in them, they understand: ‘I have doubt in me.’ When they don’t have doubt in them, they understand: ‘I don’t have doubt in me.’ They understand how doubt arises; how, when it’s already arisen, it’s given up; and how, once it’s given up, it doesn’t arise again in the future.
- 13.9 And so they meditate observing an aspect of principles internally, externally, and both internally and externally. They meditate observing the principles as liable to originate, as liable to fall, and as liable to both originate and vanish. Or mindfulness is established that prin-

deeper, investigating the cause of desire and understanding how to be free of it forever. This contemplation of the “principles” of cause and effect is the distinctive feature of this section.

899. The Buddhist schools debated whether this included physical tiredness or not. The Theravada argued that it was purely a mental laziness, as even the Buddha got sleepy.

ciples exist, to the extent necessary for knowledge and mindfulness. They meditate independent, not grasping at anything in the world.

That's how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles with respect to the five hindrances. 13.12

4.2. The Aggregates

Furthermore, a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles with respect to the five grasping aggregates. And how does a mendicant meditate observing an aspect of principles with respect to the five grasping aggregates? 14.1

It's when a mendicant contemplates: 'Such is form, such is the origin of form, such is the disappearance of form.'⁹⁰⁰ Such is feeling, such is the origin of feeling, such is the disappearance of feeling. Such is perception, such is the origin of perception, such is the disappearance of perception.'⁹⁰¹ Such are choices, such is the origin of choices, such is the disappearance of choices.'⁹⁰² Such is consciousness, such is the origin of consciousness, such is the disappearance of consciousness.' And so they meditate observing an aspect of principles internally ... 14.3

That's how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles with respect to the five grasping aggregates. 14.12

900. "Form" (*rūpa*) is one's own body and the external material world experienced through the senses. More subtly, it represents the "appearance" of physical phenomena, even when experienced solely in the mind as color, visions, etc.

901. "Perception" (*saññā*) is the recognition or interpretation of experience in terms of meaningful wholes. We see, for example, "color" yet we perceive a "person". In the Vinaya we find many examples where a person perceived things in one way, yet they turned out to be something else.

902. In the five aggregates, *saṅkhārā* is a synonym for "volition" (*cetanā*). The traditions later used it as a catch-all category for everything that does not fit in the other aggregates. In the suttas, however, the purpose of the aggregates is not to classify everything that exists, but to contemplate aspects of experience that we tend to identify as a "self".

4.3. The Sense Fields

- 15.1 Furthermore, a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles with respect to the six interior and exterior sense fields. And how does a mendicant meditate observing an aspect of principles with respect to the six interior and exterior sense fields?
- 15.3 It's when a mendicant understands the eye, sights, and the fetter that arises dependent on both of these. They understand how the fetter that has not arisen comes to arise; how the arisen fetter comes to be abandoned; and how the abandoned fetter comes to not rise again in the future.⁹⁰³
- 15.4 They understand the ear, sounds, and the fetter ...
- 15.5 They understand the nose, smells, and the fetter ...
- 15.6 They understand the tongue, tastes, and the fetter ...
- 15.7 They understand the body, touches, and the fetter ...
- 15.8 They understand the mind, ideas, and the fetter that arises dependent on both of these. They understand how the fetter that has not arisen comes to arise; how the arisen fetter comes to be abandoned; and how the abandoned fetter comes to not rise again in the future.
- 15.9 And so they meditate observing an aspect of principles internally ...
- 15.12 That's how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles with respect to the six interior and exterior sense fields.

4.4. The Awakening Factors

- 16.1 Furthermore, a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles with respect to the seven awakening factors.⁹⁰⁴ And how does a mendicant meditate observing an aspect of principles with respect to the seven awakening factors?

903. At SN 35.232:3.2 the “fetter that arises dependent on both” is identified as “desire and lust” (*chandarāga*).

904. These seven factors that lead to awakening (*bojjhaṅgā*, SN 46.5) are commonly presented in opposition to the five hindrances (eg. SN 46.2, SN 46.23, SN 46.55).

It's when a mendicant who has the awakening factor of mindfulness in them understands: 'I have the awakening factor of mindfulness in me.' When they don't have the awakening factor of mindfulness in them, they understand: 'I don't have the awakening factor of mindfulness in me.' They understand how the awakening factor of mindfulness that has not arisen comes to arise; and how the awakening factor of mindfulness that has arisen becomes fully developed.⁹⁰⁵ 16.3

When they have the awakening factor of investigation of principles ...⁹⁰⁶ energy ... rapture ... tranquility ... immersion ... equanimity in them, they understand: 'I have the awakening factor of equanimity in me.' When they don't have the awakening factor of equanimity in them, they understand: 'I don't have the awakening factor of equanimity in me.' They understand how the awakening factor of equanimity that has not arisen comes to arise; and how the awakening factor of equanimity that has arisen becomes fully developed. 16.4

And so they meditate observing an aspect of principles internally, externally, and both internally and externally. They meditate observing, with respect to the principles, the liability to originate, to vanish, and to originate and vanish. Or mindfulness is established that principles exist, to the extent necessary for knowledge and mindfulness. They meditate independent, not grasping at anything in the world. 16.10

That's how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles with respect to the seven awakening factors. 16.13

4.5. The Truths

Furthermore, a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles with respect to the four noble truths.⁹⁰⁷ And how does a 17.1

905. "Mindfulness" includes the recollection of the teachings (SN 46.3:1.8) as well as mindfulness meditation.

906. Likewise, this includes the inquiry into *dhammas* as "teachings" as well as "phenomena" or "principles".

907. Due to their development of the two wings of *samatha* and *vipassanā* meditation as described in this sutta, practiced in the context of the teaching and

mendicant meditate observing an aspect of principles with respect to the four noble truths?

- 17.3 It's when a mendicant truly understands: 'This is suffering' ... 'This is the origin of suffering' ... 'This is the cessation of suffering' ... 'This is the practice that leads to the cessation of suffering.'

The first recitation section is complete.

4.5.1. The Truth of Suffering

- 18.1 And what is the noble truth of suffering?⁹⁰⁸
- 18.2 Rebirth is suffering; old age is suffering; death is suffering; sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress are suffering; being coupled with the disliked is suffering; separation from the liked is suffering; not getting what you wish for is suffering. In brief, the five grasping aggregates are suffering.
- 18.3 And what is rebirth? The rebirth, inception, conception, regeneration, manifestation of the aggregates, and acquisition of the sense fields of the various sentient beings in the various orders of sentient beings.⁹⁰⁹ This is called rebirth.
- 18.6 And what is old age? The old age, decrepitude, broken teeth, grey hair, wrinkly skin, diminished vitality, and failing faculties of the various sentient beings in the various orders of sentient beings. This is called old age.
- 18.9 And what is death? The passing away, passing on, disintegration, demise, mortality, death, decease, breaking up of the aggregates, laying to rest of the corpse, and cutting off of the life faculty of the various sentient beings in the various orders of sentient beings. This is called death.

training as a whole, the meditator realizes the four noble truths at the moment of stream-entry.

908. The sutta now proceeds in analytical fashion, digging deeper into the details of the four noble truths. The fundamental definitions were taught in the Buddha's first sermon (SN 56.11:4.1).

909. As at DN 15.4.3, *jāti* is invariably defined as the rebirth of beings, not as simple arising. The same applies to old age and death.

And what is sorrow? The sorrow, sorrowing, state of sorrow, 18.12
inner sorrow, inner deep sorrow in someone who has undergone
misfortune, who has experienced suffering.⁹¹⁰ This is called sorrow.

And what is lamentation? The wail, lament, wailing, lamenting, 18.15
state of wailing and lamentation in someone who has undergone mis-
fortune, who has experienced suffering. This is called lamentation.

And what is pain? Physical pain, physical unpleasantness, the 18.18
painful, unpleasant feeling that's born from physical contact.⁹¹¹ This
is called pain.

And what is sadness?⁹¹² Mental pain, mental displeasure, the 18.21
painful, unpleasant feeling that's born from mind contact. This is
called sadness.

And what is distress? The stress, distress, state of stress and distress 18.24
in someone who has undergone misfortune, who has experienced
suffering. This is called distress.

And what is meant by 'being coupled with the disliked is suffer- 18.27
ing'? There are sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas,
which are unlikable, undesirable, and disagreeable. And there are
those who want to harm, injure, disturb, and threaten you. The com-
ing together with these, the joining, inclusion, mixing with them:
this is what is meant by 'being coupled with the disliked is suffering'.

And what is meant by 'separation from the liked is suffering'? 18.30
There are sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas, which are
likable, desirable, and agreeable. And there are those who want to
help, benefit, comfort, and protect you: mother and father, brother
and sister, friends and colleagues, relatives and kin. The division from

910. In this and following definitions we mainly find mere verbal variations of the basic term.

911. *Dukkha* ("pain", "suffering") is here restricted to physical pain. Elsewhere it may be any kind of painful feeling, while in the four noble truths it is suffering of any sort, including subtle forms of existential suffering.

912. *Domanassa* normally means "sadness", but sometimes it contrasts with desire, in which case it is a form of aversion.

these, the disconnection, segregation, and parting from them:⁹¹³ this is what is meant by ‘separation from the liked is suffering’.

18.33 And what is meant by ‘not getting what you wish for is suffering’? In sentient beings who are liable to be reborn, such a wish arises: ‘Oh, if only we were not liable to be reborn! If only rebirth would not come to us!’⁹¹⁴ But you can’t get that by wishing. This is what is meant by ‘not getting what you wish for is suffering’. In sentient beings who are liable to grow old ... fall ill ... die ... experience sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress, such a wish arises: ‘Oh, if only we were not liable to experience sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress! If only sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress would not come to us!’ But you can’t get that by wishing. This is what is meant by ‘not getting what you wish for is suffering’.

18.48 And what is meant by ‘in brief, the five grasping aggregates are suffering’? They are the grasping aggregates that consist of form, feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness. This is what is meant by ‘in brief, the five grasping aggregates are suffering’.

18.51 This is called the noble truth of suffering.

4.5.2. *The Origin of Suffering*

19.1 And what is the noble truth of the origin of suffering?

19.2 It’s the craving that leads to future lives, mixed up with relishing and greed, taking pleasure there wherever it alights. That is, craving for sensual pleasures, craving for continued existence, and craving for nonexistence.

19.4 But where does that craving arise and where does it settle? Whatever in the world seems nice and pleasant, it is there that craving arises and settles.

913. *Piya* often refers to those who are dear and beloved, but as shown here it can also mean simply anything that is liked.

914. This is an example of “painful feeling not of the flesh”. The Buddha is here denying the efficacy of prayer, invocation, or magic spells.

And what in the world seems nice and pleasant? The eye in the world seems nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.⁹¹⁵ The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind in the world seems nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.

Sights ... sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas in the world seem nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.

Eye consciousness ...⁹¹⁶ ear consciousness ... nose consciousness ... tongue consciousness ... body consciousness ... mind consciousness in the world seems nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.

Eye contact ...⁹¹⁷ ear contact ... nose contact ... tongue contact ... body contact ... mind contact in the world seems nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.

Feeling born of eye contact ... feeling born of ear contact ... feeling born of nose contact ... feeling born of tongue contact ... feeling born of body contact ... feeling born of mind contact in the world seems nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.

Perception of sights ...⁹¹⁸ perception of sounds ... perception of smells ... perception of tastes ... perception of touches ... perception of ideas in the world seems nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.

915. The following list of properties that relate to the senses gradually moves from the more basic to the more sophisticated.

916. "Eye consciousness" is aware only of "light"; it sees colors but does not interpret them.

917. "Contact" or "stimulus" happens when the sense base, the sense object, and the sense consciousness all occur together.

918. "Perception" interprets the "light" that is seen, organizing it in meaningful wholes. For example, the eye sees the color white, while perception recognizes that it is "white", and further, that that white color is in fact a "wall".

- 19.43 Intention regarding sights ...⁹¹⁹ intention regarding sounds ... intention regarding smells ... intention regarding tastes ... intention regarding touches ... intention regarding ideas in the world seems nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.
- 19.49 Craving for sights ... craving for sounds ... craving for smells ... craving for tastes ... craving for touches ... craving for ideas in the world seems nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.
- 19.55 Thoughts about sights ...⁹²⁰ thoughts about sounds ... thoughts about smells ... thoughts about tastes ... thoughts about touches ... thoughts about ideas in the world seem nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.
- 19.61 Considerations regarding sights ...⁹²¹ considerations regarding sounds ... considerations regarding smells ... considerations regarding tastes ... considerations regarding touches ... considerations regarding ideas in the world seem nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving arises and settles.
- 19.67 This is called the noble truth of the origin of suffering.

4.5.3. The Cessation of Suffering

- 20.1 And what is the noble truth of the cessation of suffering?
- 20.2 It's the fading away and cessation of that very same craving with no residue left behind; giving it away, letting it go, releasing it, and not clinging to it.
- 20.3 Whatever in the world seems nice and pleasant, it is there that craving is given up and ceases.
- 20.5 And what in the world seems nice and pleasant? The eye in the world seems nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving is given up and ceases. ...

919. To continue the example, once the light has been interpreted by perception as a "wall", we then make the choice to walk around it rather than through it. Choices therefore depend on perceptions.

920. "Thought" is *vitakka*.

921. "Consideration" is *vicāra*, a more sustained exercise of thought.

Considerations regarding ideas in the world seem nice and pleasant, and it is there that craving is given up and ceases. 20.60

This is called the noble truth of the cessation of suffering. 20.66

4.5.4. *The Path*

And what is the noble truth of the practice that leads to the cessation of suffering?⁹²² 21.1

It is simply this noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion.⁹²³ 21.2

And what is right view?⁹²⁴ Knowing about suffering, the origin of suffering, the cessation of suffering, and the practice that leads to the cessation of suffering.⁹²⁵ This is called right view. 21.4

And what is right purpose?⁹²⁶ Purposes of renunciation, good will, and harmlessness.⁹²⁷ This is called right purpose. 21.7

922. From here we have the standard definitions of the items of the noble eightfold path (SN 45.8:3.2, MN 141:24.1).

923. Mindfulness is not a path in and of itself, but rather is the seventh factor of the eightfold path.

924. “View” (*diṭṭhi*, Sanskrit *dṛṣṭi*) is “seeing” and hence a term for “understanding” (Aitareya Upaniṣad 3.2). In Buddhism, it means a particular way of seeing or perspective, a theory or view through which one makes sense of the world. By itself it is neutral, although “views” in plural sometimes stands for the thicket of wrong views.

925. The fourth noble truth is the path, while the first path factor is the noble truths. These two teachings are different perspectives on the same *dhamma*. Ignorance is described in the opposite way (MN 9:64.1–66.7, SN 12.2:14.2).

926. *Saṅkappa* is normally a synonym of *vitakka* in the suttas, hence it may be rendered “thought” (SN 14.8:3.3, MN 60:24.2). It is, however, not just verbalized thought, but the direction in which one applies the mind, hence “intention” (MN 41:14.3), “resolve”, or “purpose”. It has a directionality to it: in Rig Veda 10.164.5 it is the “evil intent” wished upon those who we hate, whereas in Atharva Veda 3.25.2 it is a quality of the arrow of love. For this reason, I usually render it as “purpose”. This factor is the emotional counterpart of right view, ensuring that the path is motivated by love and compassion.

927. *Abyāpāda* is “non-ill-will” or simply “good will”.

- 21.10 And what is right speech?⁹²⁸ Refraining from lying, backbiting, harsh speech, and talking nonsense. This is called right speech.
- 21.13 And what is right action? Refraining from killing living creatures, stealing, and sexual misconduct.⁹²⁹ This is called right action.
- 21.16 And what is right livelihood? It's when a noble disciple gives up wrong livelihood and earns a living by right livelihood.⁹³⁰ This is called right livelihood.
- 21.19 And what is right effort?⁹³¹ It's when a mendicant generates enthusiasm, tries, makes an effort, exerts the mind, and strives so that bad, unskillful qualities don't arise. They generate enthusiasm, try, make an effort, exert the mind, and strive so that bad, unskillful qualities that have arisen are given up. They generate enthusiasm, try, make an effort, exert the mind, and strive so that skillful qualities arise. They generate enthusiasm, try, make an effort, exert the mind, and strive so that skillful qualities that have arisen remain, are not lost, but increase, mature, and are fully developed. This is called right effort.
- 21.25 And what is right mindfulness?⁹³² It's when a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. They meditate observing an aspect of feelings—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. They meditate observing an aspect of the mind—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. They meditate observing an aspect of principles—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. This is called right mindfulness.

928. The factors of speech and action are defined in detail under the gradual training at MN 27:13.4, and under the ten pathways of skillful deeds at MN 41:12.4.

929. The first three of the five precepts. | “Sexual misconduct” is the betrayal of trust or otherwise causing harm in a sexual relationship.

930. Wrong livelihood is defined at MN 117:29.2 and AN 5.177:1.3, and in detail for renunciates at DN 2:56.1.

931. Expanded to a full *samyutta* at SN 49.

932. Detailed especially in SN 47 and MN 10.

And what is right immersion?⁹³³ It's when a mendicant, quite 21.31
 secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unskillful qualities,
 enters and remains in the first absorption, which has the rapture
 and bliss born of seclusion, while placing the mind and keeping it
 connected.⁹³⁴ As the placing of the mind and keeping it connected
 are stilled, they enter and remain in the second absorption, which
 has the rapture and bliss born of immersion, with internal clarity and
 mind at one, without placing the mind and keeping it connected.⁹³⁵
 And with the fading away of rapture, they enter and remain in the
 third absorption, where they meditate with equanimity, mindful
 and aware, experiencing for themselves the bliss of which the noble

933. "Immersion" (*samādhī*) is treated in SN 53 and throughout the Suttas, eg. SN 12.23:2.15, MN 44:12.2 and notes. The primary sense is the mind "collected" or "immersed" inside itself, with a secondary connotation of radiant illumination. | Before the Buddha, we find *samādhī* and related terms in the sense of gathering kindling for the fire. The past participle *samāhita* occurs in the sense "collected, contained", as the essence of waters are "contained" in the Sun (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 5.1.2.7). Certain Upaniṣadic usages presage the Buddhist sense, though expressed in a mystical form designed to be as obscure as possible. A realized sage, being "collected", sees only the self in the self and is free from evil, having become one with Divinity (Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 4.4.24). For such a one, the whole world is "contained" in the space within the heart—earth and sky, fire and wind, sun and moon, all beings and all desires (Chāndogya Upaniṣad 8.1.3–5). The hidden Self, finer than the finest, larger than the largest, may only be discerned by one who is peaceful and "collected" (Kaṭha Upaniṣad 2.24).

934. *Jhāna* is a state of "elevated consciousness" (*adhicitta*), so all the terms have an elevated sense. | The plural form indicates that "sensual pleasures" includes sense experience, which the meditator can turn away from since they no longer have any desire for it. | The "unskillful qualities" are the five hindrances. | The "rapture and bliss born of seclusion" is the happiness of abandoning the hindrances and freedom from sense impingement. | "Placing the mind and keeping it connected" (*vitakka, vicāra*) uses terms that mean "thought" in coarse consciousness, but which in "elevated consciousness" refer to the subtle function of applying the mind to the meditation.

935. Each *jhāna* begins as the least refined aspect of the previous *jhāna* ends. This is not consciously directed, but describes the natural process of settling. The meditator is now fully confident and no longer needs to apply their mind: it is simply still and fully unified.

ones declare, ‘Equanimous and mindful, one meditates in bliss.’⁹³⁶ With the giving up of pleasure and pain and the disappearance of former happiness and sadness, they enter and remain in the fourth absorption, without pleasure or pain, with pure equanimity and mindfulness. This is called right immersion.

21.37 This is called the noble truth of the practice that leads to the cessation of suffering.

21.38 And so they meditate observing an aspect of principles internally, externally, and both internally and externally. They meditate observing, with respect to the principles, the liability to originate, to vanish, and to originate and vanish. Or mindfulness is established that principles exist, to the extent necessary for knowledge and mindfulness. They meditate independent, not grasping at anything in the world.

21.41 That’s how a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles with respect to the four noble truths.

22.1 Anyone who develops these four kinds of mindfulness meditation in this way for seven years can expect one of two results:⁹³⁷ enlightenment in this very life, or if there’s residue left behind, non-return.

22.3 Let alone seven years,⁹³⁸ anyone who develops these four kinds of mindfulness meditation in this way for six years ... five years ... four years ... three years ... two years ... one year ... seven months ... six months ... five months ... four months ... three months ... two months ... one month ... a fortnight ... Let alone a fortnight, anyone who develops these four kinds of mindfulness meditation in this way for seven days can expect one of two results: enlightenment in this very life, or if there’s residue left behind, non-return.

936. The emotional response to bliss matures from the subtle thrill of rapture to the poise of equanimity. Mindfulness is present in all states of deep meditation, but with equanimity it becomes prominent.

937. The emphasis is on “develop in this way” (*evam bhāveyya*), that is, with the full practice including deep absorption as the culmination of the path as a whole.

938. A similar promise of results in at most seven years is found at DN 25:22.9, MN 10:46.3, and MN 85:59.3; and at most ten years at AN 10.46:7.3.

‘The four kinds of mindfulness meditation are the path to convergence. They are in order to purify sentient beings, to get past sorrow and crying, to make an end of pain and sadness, to discover the system, and to realize extinguishment.’ That’s what I said, and this is why I said it.” 22.24

That is what the Buddha said. Satisfied, the mendicants approved what the Buddha said. 22.26

DN 23

With Pāyāsi

Pāyāsisutta

- 1.1 SO I HAVE HEARD. At one time Venerable Kassapa the Prince was wandering in the land of the Kosalans together with a large Saṅgha of five hundred mendicants when he arrived at a Kosalan citadel named Setavyā.⁹³⁹ He stayed in the rosewood grove to the north of Setavyā.⁹⁴⁰
- 1.4 Now at that time the chieftain Pāyāsi was living in Setavyā. It was a crown property given by King Pasenadi of Kosala, teeming with living creatures, full of hay, wood, water, and grain, a royal park endowed to a brahmin.⁹⁴¹

939. Kumārakassapa was ordained at twenty (Kd 1:75.1.1). He features in the Vammikasutta (MN 23), and his verses are collected in the Theragāthā (Thag 2.41). He was declared the foremost of those with brilliant speech (AN 1.217), apparently on the basis of this discourse. | The Pāyāsisutta is the only major Buddhist text that has a Jain parallel, Paesi-kahāṇayam, a similar dialogue between Paesi and Keśin in Setavyā.

940. Setavyā was north-east of Sāvattī.

941. Pāyāsi was a *khattiya* yet he receives a *brahmadeyya*. The sense of *brahmadeyya* as a donation to brahmins is well attested in inscriptions, so I think this is likely a mistake in the text, rather than evidence that the practice was not for brahmins only.

1. On Pāyāsi

Now at that time Pāyāsi had the following harmful misconception: 2.1
 “There is no afterlife. No beings are reborn spontaneously. There’s no fruit or result of good and bad deeds.”⁹⁴²

The brahmins and householders of Setavyā heard, “It seems the 2.3
 ascetic Kassapa the Prince—a disciple of the ascetic Gotama—is staying in the rosewood grove to the north of Setavyā. He has this good reputation: ‘He is astute, competent, intelligent, learned, a brilliant speaker, eloquent, mature, a perfected one.’ It’s good to see such perfected ones.” Then, exiting Setavyā, they formed into companies and headed north to the grove.

Now at that time the chieftain Pāyāsi had retired to the upper floor 3.1
 of his stilt longhouse for his midday nap. He saw the brahmins and householders heading north toward the grove, and addressed his butler, “My butler, why are the brahmins and householders heading north toward the grove?”

“The ascetic Kassapa the Prince—a disciple of the ascetic Go- 3.5
 tama—is staying in the rosewood grove to the north of Setavyā. He has this good reputation: ‘He is astute, competent, intelligent, learned, a brilliant speaker, eloquent, mature, a perfected one.’ They’re going to see that Kassapa the Prince.”

“Well then, go to the brahmins and householders and say to them: 3.9
 ‘Worthy sir, the chieftain Pāyāsi asks you to wait, as he will also go to see the ascetic Kassapa the Prince.’ Before Kassapa the Prince persuades those foolish and incompetent brahmins and householders that there is an afterlife, there are beings reborn spontaneously, and there is a fruit or result of good and bad deeds—for none of these things are true!”

“Yes, worthy sir,” replied the butler, and did as he was asked. 3.15

Then Pāyāsi escorted by the brahmins and householders, went 4.1
 up to Kassapa the Prince, and exchanged greetings with him. When

942. This is wrong view per MN 117:5.1.

the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side. Before sitting down to one side, some of the brahmins and householders of Setavyā bowed, some exchanged greetings and polite conversation, some held up their cupped palms toward Kassapa the Prince, some announced their name and clan, while some kept silent.

2. Nihilism

- 5.1 Seated to one side, the chieftain Pāyāsi said to Venerable Kassapa the Prince, “Worthy Kassapa, this is my doctrine and view: ‘There is no afterlife. No beings are reborn spontaneously. There’s no fruit or result of good and bad deeds.’”
- 5.4 “Chieftain, may I never see or hear of anyone holding such a doctrine or view!⁹⁴³ For how on earth can anyone say such a thing?

2.1. The Simile of the Moon and Sun

- 5.8 Well then, chieftain, I’ll ask you about this in return, and you can answer as you like. What do you think, chieftain? Are the moon and sun in this world or the other world? Are they gods or humans?”
- 5.11 “They are in the other world, worthy Kassapa, and they are gods, not humans.”⁹⁴⁴

943. This idiom recurs at AN 6.38:1.5 where, as here, it refers to a well-known view and cannot mean that they have never heard of it. There the text and commentary read *māham*, which with the aorist is prohibitive not negatory. It is an idiom expressing dislike.

944. While the world “down here” is bogged down in its messy and ephemeral issues, the heavenly bodies proceed in their serene, glorious, stately indifference. Ignoring gravity, self-luminous, and apparently eternal, they operate according to what appears to be an entirely different set of rules, a “meta-physics”. What Newton did in physics the Buddha did in spirituality: show that the heavens, despite appearances, operate with the same set of conditioned rules as apply down here.

“By this method it ought to be proven that⁹⁴⁵ there is an afterlife, 5.12
there are beings reborn spontaneously, and there is a fruit or result
of good and bad deeds.”

“Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I think that there 6.1
is no afterlife, no beings are reborn spontaneously, and there’s no
fruit or result of good and bad deeds.”

“Is there a method by which you can prove what you say?” 6.3

“There is, worthy Kassapa.” 6.5

“How, exactly, chieftain?” 6.7

“Well, I have friends and colleagues, relatives and kin who kill liv- 6.8
ing creatures, steal, and commit sexual misconduct. They use speech
that’s false, backbiting, harsh, or nonsensical. And they’re covetous,
malicious, with wrong view. Some time later they become sick, suf-
fering, gravely ill. When I know that they will not recover from their
illness, I go to them and say, ‘Worthy sir, there are some ascetics and
brahmins who have this doctrine and view: “Those who kill living
creatures, steal, and commit sexual misconduct; use speech that’s
false, backbiting, harsh, or nonsensical; and are covetous, malicious,
and have wrong view—when their body breaks up, after death, are
reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell.” You
do all these things. If what those ascetics and brahmins say is true,
when your body breaks up, after death, you’ll be reborn in a place of
loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell. If that happens, worthy sir,
come and tell me that there is an afterlife, there are beings reborn
spontaneously, and there is a fruit or result of good and bad deeds.
I trust you and believe you. Anything you see will be just as if I’ve
seen it for myself.’⁹⁴⁶ They agree to this. But they don’t come back to
tell me, nor do they send a messenger. This is the method by which

945. Kassapa’s argument here doesn’t directly establish his conclusion. It is possible that gods exist on an entirely separate plane that has nothing to do with kamma and rebirth.

946. This is still a major factor in shaping belief. People will reject the opinions of experts and believe people that they know.

I prove that there is no afterlife, no beings are reborn spontaneously, and there's no fruit or result of good and bad deeds.”⁹⁴⁷

2.2. The Simile of the Bandit

7.1 “Well then, chieftain, I’ll ask you about this in return, and you can answer as you like. What do you think, chieftain? Suppose they were to arrest a bandit, a criminal and present him to you, saying, ‘Sir, this is a bandit, a criminal. Punish him as you will.’ Then you’d say to them, ‘Well then, my men, tie this man’s arms tightly behind his back with a strong rope. Shave his head and march him from street to street and square to square to the beating of a harsh drum. Then take him out the south gate and there, at the place of execution to the south of the city, chop off his head.’ Saying, ‘Good,’ they’d do as they were told, sitting him down at the place of execution. Could that bandit get the executioners to wait, saying, ‘Please, good executioners! I have friends and colleagues, relatives and kin in such-and-such village or town. Wait until I’ve visited them, then I’ll come back’? Or would they just chop off his head as he prattled on?”⁹⁴⁸

7.13 “They’d just chop off his head.”

7.14 “So even a human bandit couldn’t get his human executioners to stay his execution. What then of your friends and colleagues, relatives and kin who are reborn in a lower realm after doing bad things? Could they get the wardens of hell to wait, saying, ‘Please, good wardens of hell! Wait until I’ve gone to the chieftain Pāyāsi to tell him that there is an afterlife, there are beings reborn spontaneously, and there is a fruit or result of good and bad deeds’? By

947. Compare Jaiminiya Brāhmaṇa 1.42, where Varuṇa asphyxiated his son Bṛghu in order to send him on a journey to the “other world”, inducing a near-death experience. Bṛghu saw men cutting other men to pieces and eating them, and other sights both horrifying and beautiful, all the while wondering if what he saw was real, before his breath was returned to him.

948. Follow PTS reading *uddassetvā*, which at MN 82:11.9 has the sense “visit”.

this method, too, it ought to be proven that⁹⁴⁹ there is an afterlife, there are beings reborn spontaneously, and there is a fruit or result of good and bad deeds.”

“Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I think that there is no afterlife.” 8.1

“Is there a method by which you can prove what you say?” 8.3

“There is, worthy Kassapa.” 8.5

“How, exactly, chieftain?” 8.7

“Well, I have friends and colleagues, relatives and kin who refrain from killing living creatures, stealing, and sexual misconduct. They refrain from speech that’s false, backbiting, harsh, or nonsensical. And they’re content, kind-hearted, with right view. Some time later they become sick, suffering, gravely ill. When I know that they will not recover from their illness, I go to them and say, ‘Worthy sir, there are some ascetics and brahmins who have this doctrine and view: “Those who refrain from killing living creatures, stealing, and sexual misconduct; who refrain from speech that’s false, backbiting, harsh, or nonsensical; and are content, kind-hearted, with right view—when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.” You do all these things. If what those ascetics and brahmins say is true, when your body breaks up, after death, you’ll be reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. If that happens, worthy sir, come and tell me that there is an afterlife. I trust you and believe you. Anything you see will be just as if I’ve seen it for myself.’ They agree to this. But they don’t come back to tell me, nor do they send

 8.8

949. Kassapa, however, has not established the existence of an afterlife, he has merely refuted Pāyāsi’s argument. Per Occam’s razor, the burden of proof lies on the one who wishes to establish the existence of the afterlife, not on the one who denies it. His arguments, however, become more persuasive if they are understood as building on the initial agreement on the divinity of the sun and moon. He knows that Pāyāsi accepts some form of other world, even if he says otherwise, so the argument hinges on whether Pāyāsi’s methods are sufficient to *disprove* the kind of other world that Kassapa proposes, i.e. one driven by kamma.

a messenger. This is the method by which I prove that there is no afterlife.”

2.3. The Simile of the Sewer

9.1 “Well then, chieftain, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said. Suppose there were a man sunk over his head in a sewer. Then you were to order someone to pull him out of the sewer, and they’d agree to do so. Then you’d tell them to carefully scrape the dung off that man’s body with bamboo scrapers, and they’d agree to do so. Then you’d tell them to carefully scrub that man’s body down with pale clay three times, and they’d do so. Then you’d tell them to smear that man’s body with oil, and carefully wash him down with fine paste three times, and they’d do so. Then you’d tell them to dress that man’s hair and beard, and they’d do so. Then you’d tell them to provide that man with costly garlands, makeup, and clothes, and they’d do so. Then you’d tell them to bring that man up to the stilt longhouse and set him up with the five kinds of sensual stimulation, and they’d do so.

9.25 What do you think, chieftain? Now that man is nicely bathed and anointed, with hair and beard dressed, bedecked with garlands and bracelets, dressed in white, supplied and provided with the five kinds of sensual stimulation upstairs in the royal longhouse. Would he want to plunge back into that sewer again?”

9.27 “No, worthy Kassapa. Why is that? Because that sewer is filthy, stinking, disgusting, and repulsive, and it’s regarded as such.”

9.30 “In the same way, chieftain, to the gods, human beings are filthy, stinking, disgusting, and repulsive, and are regarded as such. The smell of humans reaches the gods even a hundred leagues away.⁹⁵⁰ What then of your friends and colleagues, relatives and kin who are reborn in a higher realm after doing good things? Will they come

950. Follow PTS reading *ubbāhati*. Cf. AN 3.93:6.4 for the sense “transport”.

back to tell you that there is an afterlife? By this method, too, it ought to be proven that there is an afterlife.”

“Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I think that there is no afterlife.” 10.1

“Can you prove it?” 10.3

“I can.” 10.4

“How, exactly, chieftain?” 10.5

“Well, I have friends and colleagues, relatives and kin who refrain from killing living creatures and so on. Some time later they become sick, suffering, gravely ill. When I know that they will not recover from their illness, I go to them and say, ‘Worthy sir, there are some ascetics and brahmins who have this doctrine and view: “Those who refrain from killing living creatures and so on are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm, in the company of the gods of the thirty-three.” You do all these things. If what those ascetics and brahmins say is true, when your body breaks up, after death, you’ll be reborn in the company of the gods of the thirty-three. If that happens, worthy sir, come and tell me that there is an afterlife. I trust you and believe you. Anything you see will be just as if I’ve seen it for myself.’ They agree to this. But they don’t come back to tell me, nor do they send a messenger. This is how I prove that there is no afterlife.” 10.6

2.4. The Simile of the gods of the thirty-three

“Well then, chieftain, I’ll ask you about this in return, and you can answer as you like. A hundred human years are equivalent to one day and night for the gods of the thirty-three. Thirty such days make a month, and twelve months make a year. The gods of the thirty-three have a lifespan of a thousand such years.⁹⁵¹ Now, as to your friends who are reborn in the company of the gods of the thirty-three after doing good things. If they think, ‘First I’ll amuse myself for two or three days, supplied and provided with the five kinds of heavenly sensual stimulation. Then I’ll go back to Pāyāsi and tell him that

951. 36,000,000 years.

there is an afterlife.’ Would they come back to tell you that there is an afterlife?”

- 11.9 “No, worthy Kassapa. For I would be long dead by then.⁹⁵² But worthy Kassapa, who has told you that the gods of the thirty-three exist, or that they have such a long lifespan? I don’t believe you.”⁹⁵³

2.5. Blind From Birth

- 11.16 “Chieftain, suppose there was a person blind from birth. They couldn’t see sights that are dark or bright, or blue, yellow, red, or magenta. They couldn’t see even and uneven ground, or the stars, or the moon and sun. They’d say, ‘There’s no such thing as dark and bright sights, and no one who sees them. There’s no such thing as blue, yellow, red, magenta, even and uneven ground, stars, moon and sun, and no one who sees these things. I don’t know it or see it, therefore it doesn’t exist.’ Would they be speaking rightly?”
- 11.28 “No, worthy Kassapa. There are such things as dark and bright sights, and one who sees them. And those other things are real, too, as is the one who sees them. So it’s not right to say this: ‘I don’t know it or see it, therefore it doesn’t exist.’”
- 11.36 “In the same way, chieftain, when you tell me you don’t believe me you seem like the blind man in the simile. You can’t see the other world the way you think, with the eye of the flesh.⁹⁵⁴ There are ascetics and brahmins who live in the wilderness, frequenting remote lodgings in the wilderness and the forest. Meditating diligent, keen, and resolute, they purify the heavenly eye, the power of

952. This recognizes the relativity of time.

953. Pāyāsi makes a good point; he only relies on sources that he knows he can trust.

954. Kassapa establishes the empirical method by which these truths are known. Science extends knowledge by means of external instruments, while meditation extends the scope of consciousness. A non-scientist cannot understand how a scientist establishes their conclusions, and can only rely on trust in the scientific establishment. Likewise a non-meditator cannot understand the capacity of expanded consciousness.

clairvoyance. With clairvoyance that is purified and superhuman, they see this world and the other world, and sentient beings who are spontaneously reborn. That's how to see the other world, not how you think, with the eye of the flesh. By this method, too, it ought to be proven that there is an afterlife."

"Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I think that there is no afterlife." 12.1

"Can you prove it?" 12.3

"I can." 12.4

"How, exactly, chieftain?" 12.5

"Well, I see ascetics and brahmins who are ethical, of good character, who want to live and don't want to die, who want to be happy and recoil from pain. I think to myself, 'If those ascetics and brahmins knew that things were going to be better for them after death, they'd drink poison, take their lives, hang themselves, or throw themselves off a cliff. They mustn't know that things are going to be better for them after death. That's why they are ethical, of good character, wanting to live and not wanting to die, wanting to be happy and recoiling from pain.' This is the method by which I prove that there is no afterlife." 12.6

2.6. The Simile of the Pregnant Woman

"Well then, chieftain, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said. 13.1

Once upon a time, a certain brahmin had two wives. One had a son ten or twelve years of age, while the other was pregnant and about to give birth. Then the brahmin passed away. 13.3

So the youth said to his mother's co-wife, 'Madam, all the money, grain, silver, and gold is mine, and you get nothing. Transfer to me my father's inheritance.' 13.6

- 13.10 But the brahmin lady said, ‘Wait, my dear, until I give birth. If it’s a boy, one portion shall be his. If it’s a girl, she will be your reward.’⁹⁵⁵
- 13.14 But for a second time, and a third time, the youth insisted that the entire inheritance must be his.
- 13.26 So the brahmin lady took a knife, went to her bedroom, and sliced open her belly, thinking,⁹⁵⁶ ‘Until I give birth—whether it’s a boy or a girl!’⁹⁵⁷ She destroyed her own life and that of the fetus, as well as any wealth.
- 13.29 Being foolish and incompetent, she sought an inheritance irrationally and fell to ruin and disaster. In the same way, chieftain, being foolish and incompetent, you’re seeking the other world irrationally and will fall to ruin and disaster,⁹⁵⁸ just like that brahmin lady. Good ascetics and brahmins don’t force what is unripe to ripen; rather, they wait for it to ripen. For the life of astute ascetics and brahmins is beneficial. So long as they remain, good ascetics and brahmins brim with merit, and act for the welfare and happiness of the people, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, and happiness of gods and humans. By this method, too, it ought to be proven that there is an afterlife.”
- 14.1 “Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I think that there is no afterlife.”
- 14.3 “Can you prove it?”
- 14.4 “I can.”
- 14.5 “How, exactly, chieftain?”
- 14.6 “Suppose they were to arrest a bandit, a criminal and present him to me, saying, ‘Sir, this is a bandit, a criminal. Punish him as you will.’

955. The commentary explains *opabhoggā* (“reward”) as *pādapariçārikā* (“wife”).

956. Read *opāṭesi*.

957. Prefer Mahāsaṅgīti reading *yāva vijāyāmi* over PTS *yāva jānāmi* (“until I know”); it echoes *yāva vijāyāmi* above. The phrase is not fully coherent, which is understandable given the circumstances.

958. “Irrationally” is *ayoniso*, literally “not sourcewise”. This passage gives a nice real world example of what it means: the means employed are unrelated to the end sought.

I say to them, ‘Well then, worthy sir, place this man in a pot while he’s still alive. Close up the mouth, bind it up with damp leather, and seal it with a thick coat of damp clay. Then lift it up on a stove and light the fire.’⁹⁵⁹ They agree, and do what I ask. When we know that that man has passed away, we lift down the pot and break it open, uncover the mouth, and slowly peek inside, thinking, ‘Hopefully we’ll see his soul escaping.’⁹⁶⁰ But we don’t see his soul escaping. This is how I prove that there is no afterlife.”

2.7. The Simile of the Dream

“Well then, chieftain, I’ll ask you about this in return, and you can answer as you like. Do you recall ever having a midday nap and seeing delightful parks, woods, meadows, and lotus ponds in a dream?”⁹⁶¹ 15.1

“I do, worthy Kassapa.” 15.3

“At that time were you guarded by hunchbacks, dwarves, coquettes, and maidens?”⁹⁶² 15.4

“I was.” 15.5

“But did they see your soul entering or leaving?”⁹⁶³ 15.6

“No they did not.” 15.7

“So if they couldn’t even see your soul entering or leaving while you were still alive, how could you see the soul of a dead man? By this method, too, it ought to be proven that there is an afterlife, there are beings reborn spontaneously, and there is a fruit or result of good and bad deeds.” 15.8

959. Pāyāsi’s experiments were cruel, but no more so than many recorded in recent history.

960. We assume that a soul must be immaterial and invisible, but clearly this was not always the case at the time. From DN 1 we know that there was an almost inexhaustible variety of views about the self or soul.

961. This echoes Upaniṣadic discussions of the nature of the dream state and its relation to death. See for example Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.1.18, which says one might become a brahmin or king in a dream.

962. *Velāsikā* (“coquette”) is literally “party girl”.

963. Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 4.3.19 describes the soul returning to the body like a tired hawk returning to the nest.

- 16.1 “Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I think that there is no afterlife.”
- 16.3 “Can you prove it?”
- 16.4 “I can.”
- 16.5 “How, exactly, chieftain?”
- 16.6 “Suppose they were to arrest a bandit, a criminal and present him to me, saying, ‘Sir, this is a bandit, a criminal. Punish him as you will.’ I say to them, ‘Well then, worthy sir, weigh this man with scales while he’s still alive. Then strangle him with a bowstring, and when he’s dead, weigh him again.’⁹⁶⁴ They agree, and do what I ask. So long as they are alive, they’re lighter, softer, more flexible. But when they die they become heavier, stiffer, less flexible.⁹⁶⁵ This is how I prove that there is no afterlife.”

2.8. The Simile of the Hot Iron Ball

- 17.1 “Well then, chieftain, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said. Suppose a person was to heat an iron ball all day until it was burning, blazing, and glowing, and then they weigh it with scales. After some time, when it had cooled and become quenched, they’d weigh it again. When would that iron ball be lighter, softer, and more workable—when it’s burning or when it’s cool?”⁹⁶⁶
- 17.6 “So long as the iron ball is full of heat and air—burning, blazing, and glowing—it’s lighter, softer, and more workable. But when it

964. Aside from the cruelty, this echoes the dictum attributed to Galileo: “Measure what is measurable, and make measurable what is not so.” Given sufficient precision, this method could be effective in testing for the existence for a physical soul that has mass.

965. A dead body will, if anything, weigh less due to excretion and dehydration.

966. The misconception that iron is lighter when heated is repeated elsewhere (eg. SN 51.22:4.1). In fact, assuming there are no chemical reactions, it will be very slightly heavier due to relativistic effects, yet less dense and hence more buoyant. These changes are too small to be detected by Pāyāsi’s methods, though.

lacks heat and air—cooled and quenched—it’s heavier, stiffer, and less workable.”

“In the same way, so long as this body is full of life and warmth and consciousness it’s lighter, softer, and more flexible. But when it lacks life and warmth and consciousness it’s heavier, stiffer, and less flexible. By this method, too, it ought to be proven that there is an afterlife.” 17.8

“Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I think that there is no afterlife.” 18.1

“Can you prove it?” 18.3

“I can.” 18.4

“How, exactly, chieftain?” 18.5

“Suppose they were to arrest a bandit, a criminal and present him to me, saying, ‘Sir, this is a bandit, a criminal. Punish him as you will.’ I say to them, ‘Well then, worthy sir, take this man’s life without damaging his outer skin, inner skin, flesh, sinews, bones, or marrow. Hopefully we’ll see his soul escaping.’ They agree, and do what I ask. When he’s nearly dead, I tell them to⁹⁶⁷ lay him on his back in hope of seeing his soul escape. They do so. But we don’t see his soul escaping. I tell them to lay him bent over, to lay him on his side, to lay him on the other side; to stand him upright, to stand him upside down; to strike him with fists, stones, rods, and swords; and to give him a good shaking in hope of seeing his soul escape. They do all these things. But we don’t see his soul escaping. For him the eye itself is present, and so are those sights. Yet he does not experience that sense-field.⁹⁶⁸ The ear itself is present, and so are those sounds. Yet he does not experience that sense-field. The nose itself is present, and so are those smells. Yet he does not experience that sense-field. The tongue itself is present, and so are those tastes. Yet he does not experience that sense-field. The body itself is present, and so are

967. The commentary explains *āmato* as *addhamato* (“half-dead”).

968. At AN 9.37 this rather abrupt insertion more aptly describes a deep meditation.

those touches. Yet he does not experience that sense-field. This is how I prove that there is no afterlife.”

2.9. The Simile of the Horn Blower

19.1 “Well then, chieftain, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said.

19.3 Once upon a time, a certain horn blower took his horn and traveled to a borderland,⁹⁶⁹ where he went to a certain village. Standing in the middle of the village, he sounded his horn three times, then placed it on the ground and sat down to one side.

19.5 Then the people of the borderland thought, ‘Oh my, what is making this sound, so arousing, sensuous, intoxicating, infatuating, and captivating?’ They gathered around the horn blower and said, ‘Oh my, what is making this sound, so arousing, sensuous, intoxicating, infatuating, and captivating?’

19.9 ‘The sound is made by this, which is called a horn.’

19.10 They laid that horn on its back, saying, ‘Speak, good horn! Speak, good horn!’ But still the horn made no sound.

19.13 Then they lay the horn bent over, they lay it on its side, they lay it on its other side; they stood it upright, they stood it upside down; they struck it with fists, stones, rods, and swords; and they gave it a good shake, saying, ‘Speak, good horn! Speak, good horn!’ But still the horn made no sound.

19.16 So the horn blower thought, ‘How foolish are these borderland folk! For how on earth can they seek the sound of a horn so irrationally?’ And as they looked on, he picked up the horn, sounded it three times, and took it away with him.

19.19 Then the people of the borderland thought, ‘So, it seems, when what is called a horn is accompanied by a person, effort, and wind, it makes a sound. But when these things are absent it makes no sound.’

969. Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.4.8 employs the same metaphor in the search for the soul.

In the same way, so long as this body is full of life and warmth and consciousness it walks back and forth, stands, sits, and lies down. It sees sights with the eye, hears sounds with the ear, smells odors with the nose, tastes flavors with the tongue, encounters touches with the body, and knows ideas with the mind. But when it lacks life and warmth and consciousness it does none of these things. By this method, too, it ought to be proven that there is an afterlife.” 19.21

“Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I think that there is no afterlife.” 20.1

“Can you prove it?” 20.3

“I can.” 20.4

“How, exactly, chieftain?” 20.5

“Suppose they were to arrest a bandit, a criminal and present him to me, saying, ‘Sir, this is a bandit, a criminal. Punish him as you will.’ I say to them, ‘Well then, worthy sir, cut open this man’s outer skin. Hopefully we might see his soul.’ They cut open his outer skin, but we see no soul. I say to them, ‘Well then, worthy sir, cut open his inner skin, flesh, sinews, bones, or marrow. Hopefully we’ll see his soul.’ They do so, but we see no soul. This is how I prove that there is no afterlife.” 20.6

2.10. The Simile of the Fire-Worshiping Matted-Hair Ascetic

“Well then, chieftain, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said. 21.1

Once upon a time, a certain fire-worshiping matted-hair ascetic settled in a leaf hut in a wilderness region.⁹⁷⁰ Then a caravan came out from a certain country. It stayed for one night not far from that 21.3

970. Such “matted-hair ascetics” are apparently the “forest hermits” (*vānaprastha*) whose lifestyle Kauṭilya describes as “celibacy, sleeping on the ground, wearing matted hair and antelope skin, offering daily fire sacrifice, bathing, venerating gods, ancestors, and guests, and eating forest produce” (Arthaśāstra 1.3.11, Olivelle’s translation).

ascetic's hermitage, and then moved on. The ascetic thought, 'Why don't I go to that caravan's campsite? Hopefully I'll find something useful there.'

21.8 So he went, and he saw a little baby boy abandoned there. When he saw this he thought, 'It's not proper for me to look on while a human being dies. Why don't I bring this boy back to my hermitage, nurse him, provide for him, and raise him?' So that's what he did.

21.13 When the boy was ten or twelve years old, the ascetic had some business come up in the country. So he said to the boy, 'My dear, I wish to go to the country. Serve the sacred flame. Do not extinguish it. But if you should extinguish it, here is the hatchet, the firewood, and the bundle of drill-sticks. Light the fire and serve it.' And having instructed the boy, the ascetic went to the country.

21.20 But the boy was so engrossed in his play, the fire went out. He thought, 'My father told me to serve the sacred flame. Why don't I light it again and serve it?'

21.27 So he chopped the bundle of drill-sticks with the hatchet, thinking, 'Hopefully I'll get a fire!' But he still got no fire.

21.30 He split the bundle of drill-sticks into two, three, four, five, ten, or a hundred parts. He chopped them into splinters, pounded them in a mortar, and swept them away in a strong wind, thinking, 'Hopefully I'll get a fire!' But he still got no fire.

21.33 Then the matted-hair ascetic, having concluded his business in the country, returned to his own hermitage, and said to the boy, 'I trust, my dear, that the fire didn't go out?' And the boy told him what had happened. Then the ascetic thought, 'How foolish is this boy, how incompetent! For how on earth can he seek a fire so irrationally?'

21.49 So while the boy looked on, he took a bundle of fire-sticks, lit the fire, and said, 'Dear boy, this is how to light a fire. Not the foolish and incompetent way you sought it so irrationally.' In the same way, chieftain, being foolish and incompetent, you seek the other world

irrationally.⁹⁷¹ Let go of this harmful misconception, chieftain, let go of it! Don't create lasting harm and suffering for yourself!"

"Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I'm not able to let go of that harmful misconception. King Pasenadi of Kosala knows my views, and so do foreign kings. If I let go of this harmful misconception, there will be some who say to me, 'How foolish is the chieftain Pāyāsi, how incompetent, that he should hold on to a mistake!' I shall carry on with this view out of anger, contempt, and spite!"⁹⁷² 22.1

2.11. The Simile of the Two Caravan Leaders

"Well then, chieftain, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said. 23.1

Once upon a time, a large caravan of a thousand wagons traveled from a country in the east to the west.⁹⁷³ Wherever they went they quickly used up the grass, wood, water, and the green foliage. Now, that caravan had two leaders, each in charge of five hundred wagons. They thought, 'This is a large caravan of a thousand wagons. Wherever we go we quickly use up the grass, wood, water, and the green foliage.'⁹⁷⁴ Why don't we split the caravan in two halves?' So that's what they did. 23.3

One caravan leader, having prepared much grass, wood, and water, started the caravan. After two or three days' journey he saw a dark man with red eyes coming the other way in a donkey cart with muddy wheels. He was armored with a quiver and wreathed with yellow 23.12

971. Accept PTS reading *gavesasi*.

972. Pāyāsi honestly acknowledges the role of social conformity and shame in shaping views.

973. Although this became the first story of the Jātaka collection (Ja 1), here it is not a Jātaka, as it is not framed as a past life of the Buddha.

974. While the places are not specified, the journey from "east to west" across desolate lands suggests they may have been venturing from the rich plains of the Ganges west across the Thar Desert of Rajasthan.

lotus, his clothes and hair all wet. Seeing him, he said,⁹⁷⁵ ‘Worthy sir, where do you come from?’

23.15 ‘From such-and-such country.’

23.16 ‘And where are you going?’

23.17 ‘To the country named such-and-such.’

23.18 ‘But has there been much rain in the desert up ahead?’

23.19 ‘Indeed there has, worthy sir. The tracks are sprinkled with water, and there is much grass, wood, and water. Discard your grass, wood, and water. Your wagons will move swiftly when lightly-laden, so don’t tire your draught teams.’

23.21 So the caravan leader addressed his drivers, ‘This man says that there has been much rain in the desert up ahead. He advises us to discard the grass, wood, and water. The wagons will move swiftly when lightly-laden, and won’t tire our draught teams. So let’s discard the grass, wood, and water and restart the caravan with lightly-laden wagons.’

23.26 ‘Yes, worthy sir,’ the drivers replied, and that’s what they did.

23.27 But in the caravan’s first campsite they saw no grass, wood, or water. And in the second, third, fourth, fifth, sixth, and seventh campsites they saw no grass, wood, or water. And all fell to ruin and disaster. And the men and beasts in that caravan were all devoured by that non-human spirit.⁹⁷⁶ Only their bones were left over.

23.37 Now, when the second caravan leader knew that the first caravan was well underway, he prepared much grass, wood, and water and started the caravan. After two or three days’ journey he saw a dark man with red eyes coming the other way in a donkey cart with muddy wheels. He was armored with a quiver and wreathed with yellow lotus, his clothes and hair all wet. Seeing him, he said, ‘Worthy sir, where do you come from?’

975. Read with PTS *gadrabharathena* (“donkey cart”) for *bhadrena rathena* (“fine cart”).

976. The obviously suspicious stranger depicts the genuine dangers of trade in unknown regions, warning the traveler of raiding tribes as well as supernatural creatures.

- ‘From such-and-such a country.’ 23.41
- ‘And where are you going?’ 23.42
- ‘To the country named such-and-such.’ 23.43
- ‘But has there been much rain in the desert up ahead?’ 23.44
- ‘Indeed there has, worthy sir. The tracks are sprinkled with water, and there is much grass, wood, and water. Discard your grass, wood, and water. Your wagons will move swiftly when lightly-laden, so don’t tire your draught teams.’ 23.45
- So the caravan leader addressed his drivers, ‘This man says that there has been much rain in the desert up ahead. He advises us to discard the grass, wood, and water. The wagons will move swiftly when lightly-laden, and won’t tire our draught teams. But this person is neither our friend nor relative. How can we proceed out of trust in him?’⁹⁷⁷ We shouldn’t discard any grass, wood, or water, but continue with our goods as laden. We shall not discard any old stock.’ 23.47
- ‘Yes, worthy sir,’ the drivers replied, and they restarted the caravan with the goods as laden. 23.54
- And in the caravan’s first campsite they saw no grass, wood, or water. And in the second, third, fourth, fifth, sixth, and seventh campsites they saw no grass, wood, or water. And they saw the other caravan that had come to ruin. And they saw the bones of the men and beasts who had been devoured by that non-human spirit. 23.55
- So the caravan leader addressed his drivers, ‘This caravan came to ruin, as happens when guided by a foolish caravan leader. Well then, worthy sir, discard any of our merchandise that’s of little value, and take what’s valuable from this caravan.’ 23.64
- ‘Yes, worthy sir’ replied the drivers, and that’s what they did. They crossed over the desert safely, as happens when guided by an astute caravan leader. 23.67
- In the same way, chieftain, being foolish and incompetent, you will come to ruin seeking the other world irrationally, like the first caravan leader. And those who think you’re worth listening to and 23.68

977. Again the criteria that only those who are known may be trusted.

trusting will also come to ruin, like the drivers. Let go of this harmful misconception, chieftain, let go of it! Don't create lasting harm and suffering for yourself!"

- 24.1 "Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I'm not able to let go of that harmful misconception. King Pasenadi of Kosala knows my views, and so do foreign kings. I shall carry on with this view out of anger, contempt, and spite!"

2.12. The Simile of the Dung-Carrier

- 25.1 "Well then, chieftain, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said.

- 25.3 Once upon a time, a certain swineherd went from his own village to another village. There he saw a large pile of dry dung abandoned. He thought, 'This pile of dry dung can serve as food for my pigs. Why don't I carry it off?' So he spread out his upper robe, shoveled the dry dung onto it, tied it up into a parcel, lifted it on to his head, and went on his way. While on his way a large storm out of season poured down. Smeared with leaking, oozing dung down to his fingernails, he kept on carrying the load of dung.

- 25.11 When people saw him they said, 'Have you gone mad, lad? Have you lost your mind? For how on earth can you, smeared with leaking, oozing dung down to your fingernails, keep on carrying that load of dung?'

- 25.13 'You're the mad ones, lads! You're the ones who've lost your minds! For this will serve as food for my pigs.'

- 25.14 In the same way, chieftain, you seem like the dung carrier in the simile. Let go of this harmful misconception, chieftain, let go of it! Don't create lasting harm and suffering for yourself!"

- 26.1 "Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I'm not able to let go of that harmful misconception. King Pasenadi of Kosala knows my views, and so do foreign kings. I shall carry on with this view out of anger, contempt, and spite!"

2.13. The Simile of the Gamblers

“Well then, chieftain, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile 27.1
some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said.

Once upon a time, two gamblers were playing with seed dice. 27.3
One gambler, every time they took a bad hand, swallowed the losing
seed.⁹⁷⁸

The second gambler saw him, and said, ‘Well, dear, you’ve won it 27.5
all! Give me the seed dice, I will roll them.’⁹⁷⁹

‘Yes, dear,’ the gambler replied, and gave them. 27.7

Then the gambler soaked the seed dice in poison and said to the 27.8
other, ‘Come, dear, let’s play seed dice.’

‘Yes, dear,’ the other gambler replied. 27.10

And for a second time the gamblers played with seed dice. And 27.11
for the second time, every time they took a bad hand, that gambler
swallowed the losing seed.

The second gambler saw him, and said, 27.13

‘The man swallows the dice without realizing 27.14
they’re smeared with most terrible venom.

Swallow, you damn cheat, swallow!

Soon you’ll know the bitter fruit!’

In the same way, chieftain, you seem like the gambler in the simile. 27.18
Let go of this harmful misconception, chieftain, let go of it! Don’t
create lasting harm and suffering for yourself!”

“Even though the worthy Kassapa says this, still I’m not able to let 28.1
go of that harmful misconception. King Pasenadi of Kosala knows

978. The ancient Indian game of dice involved casting *vibhītaka* seeds (also known as “bedda nuts”, from *Terminalia bellirica*) in a hollow, from which the players would take a handful. A number divisible by four was “perfect” (*kaṭa*), so the fifth seed meant a “losing” hand (*kali*; cf. *apaṇṇaka* in MN 60 and notes).

979. *Pajohissāmi* is related to Sanskrit *juhōti*, usually used in the sense “to offer as libation”, a meaning accepted by the commentary here. More likely it simply means to “roll out” (like pouring a sacrifice) by analogy.

my views, and so do foreign kings. I shall carry on with this view out of anger, contempt, and spite!”

2.14. The Simile of the Man Who Carried Hemp

29.1 “Well then, chieftain, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said.

29.3 Once upon a time, the inhabitants of a certain country emigrated. Then one friend said to another, ‘Come, dear, let’s go to that country. Hopefully we’ll get some riches there!’

29.6 ‘Yes, dear,’ the other replied.

29.7 They went to that country, and to a certain deserted village. There they saw a pile of abandoned sunn hemp. Seeing it, one friend said to the other,⁹⁸⁰ ‘This is a pile of abandoned sunn hemp. Well then, dear, you make up a load of hemp, and I’ll make one too. Let’s both take a load of hemp and go on.’

29.9 ‘Yes, dear,’ he said. Carrying their loads of hemp they went to another deserted village.

29.10 There they saw much sunn hemp thread abandoned. Seeing it, one friend said to the other, ‘This pile of abandoned sunn hemp thread is just what we wanted the hemp for! Well then, dear, let’s abandon our loads of hemp, and both take a load of hemp thread and go on.’

29.13 ‘I’ve already carried this load of hemp a long way, and it’s well tied up. It’s good enough for me, you understand.’⁹⁸¹ So one friend abandoned their load of hemp and picked up a load of hemp thread.

29.15 They went to another deserted village. There they saw much sunn hemp cloth abandoned. Seeing it, one friend said to the other, ‘This pile of abandoned sunn hemp cloth is just what we wanted the hemp and hemp thread for! Well then, dear, let’s abandon our loads, and both take a load of hemp cloth and go on.’

980. *Gāmapaṭṭaṃ* (variants *-padaṃ*, *-paddhanam*, *-pattham*, *pajjam*) is explained by the commentary as an abandoned village site.

981. The sunk cost fallacy.

‘I’ve already carried this load of hemp a long way, and it’s well tied up. It’s good enough for me, you understand.’ So one friend abandoned their load of hemp thread and picked up a load of hemp cloth. 29.19

They went to another deserted village. There they saw a pile of flax, and by turn, linen thread, linen cloth, cotton, cotton thread, cotton cloth, iron, copper, tin, lead, silver, and gold abandoned. Seeing it, one friend said to the other, ‘This pile of gold is just what we wanted all those other things for! Well then, dear, let’s abandon our loads, and both take a load of gold and go on.’ 29.21

‘I’ve already carried this load of hemp a long way, and it’s well tied up. It’s good enough for me, you understand.’ So one friend abandoned their load of silver and picked up a load of gold. 29.36

Then they returned to their own village. When one friend returned with a load of sunn hemp, they didn’t please their parents, their partners and children, or their friends and colleagues. And they got no pleasure and happiness on that account. But when the other friend returned with a load of gold, they pleased their parents, their partners and children, and their friends and colleagues. And they got much pleasure and happiness on that account. 29.38

In the same way, chieftain, you seem like the hemp-carrier in the simile. Let go of this harmful misconception, chieftain, let go of it! Don’t create lasting harm and suffering for yourself!” 29.41

3. Going for Refuge

“I was delighted and satisfied with your very first simile, worthy Kassapa!⁹⁸² Nevertheless, I wanted to hear your various solutions to the problem, so I thought I’d oppose you in this way. Excellent, worthy Kassapa! Excellent! As if he were righting the overturned, or revealing the hidden, or pointing out the path to the lost, or lighting a lamp in the dark so people with clear eyes can see what’s there, the 30.1

982. Say what you will about Pāyāsi, he had character.

worthy Kassapa has made the teaching clear in many ways. I go for refuge to the worthy Gotama, to the teaching, and to the mendicant Saṅgha. From this day forth, may the worthy Kassapa remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.

- 30.7 Worthy Kassapa, I wish to perform a great sacrifice. Please instruct me so it will be for my lasting welfare and happiness.”⁹⁸³

4. On Sacrifice

- 31.1 “Chieftain, take the kind of sacrifice where cattle, goats and sheep, chickens and pigs, and various kinds of creatures are slaughtered. And the recipients have wrong view, wrong purpose, wrong speech, wrong action, wrong livelihood, wrong effort, wrong mindfulness, and wrong immersion. That kind of sacrifice is not very fruitful or beneficial or dazzling or bountiful.

- 31.2 Suppose a farmer was to enter a wood taking seed and plough. And on that barren field, that barren ground, with uncleared stumps he sowed seeds that were broken, spoiled, weather-damaged, infertile, and ill kept. And the heavens don’t provide enough rain when needed. Would those seeds grow, increase, and mature, and would the farmer get abundant fruit?”

- 31.6 “No, worthy Kassapa.”

- 31.7 “In the same way, chieftain, take the kind of sacrifice where cattle, goats and sheep, chickens and pigs, and various kinds of creatures are slaughtered. And the recipients have wrong view, wrong purpose, wrong speech, wrong action, wrong livelihood, wrong effort, wrong mindfulness, and wrong immersion. That kind of sacrifice is not very fruitful or beneficial or dazzling or bountiful.

- 31.8 But take the kind of sacrifice where cattle, goats and sheep, chickens and pigs, and various kinds of creatures are not slaughtered. And the recipients have right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right

983. Compare DN 5:4.5.

immersion. That kind of sacrifice is very fruitful and beneficial and dazzling and bountiful.

Suppose a farmer was to enter a wood taking seed and plough. 31.9
And on that fertile field, that fertile ground, with well-cleared stumps he sowed seeds that were intact, unspoiled, not weather-damaged, fertile, and well kept. And the heavens provide plenty of rain when needed. Would those seeds grow, increase, and mature, and would the farmer get abundant fruit?”

“Yes, worthy Kassapa.” 31.13

“In the same way, chieftain, take the kind of sacrifice where cattle, 31.14
goats and sheep, chickens and pigs, and various kinds of creatures are not slaughtered. And the recipients have right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion. That kind of sacrifice is very fruitful and beneficial and dazzling and bountiful.”

5. On the Student Uttara

Then the chieftain Pāyāsi set up an offering for ascetics and brahmins, 32.1
for paupers, vagrants, supplicants, and beggars. At that offering such food as sour gruel with false black pepper was given, and rough clothes with knotted fringes.⁹⁸⁴ Now, it was a student named Uttara who organized that offering.

When the offering was over he referred to it like this, “Through 32.4
this offering may I be together with the chieftain Pāyāsi in this world, but not in the next.”

Pāyāsi heard of this, so he summoned Uttara and said, “Is it really 32.6
true, dear Uttara, that you referred to the offering in this way?”

“Yes, worthy sir.” 32.12

“But why? Don’t we who seek merit expect some result from the 32.13
offering?”

984. *Bilaṅga* is allowed with other medicinal fruits at Kd 6:6.1.4. It is Sanskrit *viḍaṅga*, identified as *embelia ribes* or “false black pepper”. | For *guḷavālakāni*, *guḷa* is “ball”, *vāla* is “tail”; compare *macchavāḷaka* (“fish-tailed”) at Kd 15:29.4.2.

- 32.16 “At your offering such food as sour gruel with false black pepper was given, which you wouldn’t even want to touch with your foot, much less eat. And also rough clothes with knotted fringes, which you also wouldn’t want to touch with your foot, much less wear. Worthy sir, you’re dear and beloved to me. But how can I reconcile one so dear with something so disagreeable?”
- 32.18 “Well then, dear Uttara, set up an offering with the same kind of food that I eat, and the same kind of clothes that I wear.”
- 32.20 “Yes, worthy sir,” replied Uttara, and did so.
- 32.22 So the chieftain Pāyāsi gave gifts carelessly, thoughtlessly, not with his own hands, giving the dregs. When his body broke up, after death, he was reborn in company with the gods of the four great kings, in an empty palace of sirisa wood.⁹⁸⁵ But the student Uttara who organized the offering gave gifts carefully, thoughtfully, with his own hands, not giving the dregs. When his body broke up, after death, he was reborn in company with the gods of the thirty-three.

6. The Godling Pāyāsi

- 33.1 Now at that time Venerable Gavampati would often go to that empty sirisa palace for the day’s meditation.⁹⁸⁶ Then the godling Pāyāsi went up to him, bowed, and stood to one side. Gavampati said to him, “Who are you, reverend?”
- 33.4 “Sir, I am the chieftain Pāyāsi.”
- 33.5 “Didn’t you have the view that there is no afterlife, no beings are reborn spontaneously, and there’s no fruit or result of good and bad deeds?”
- 33.7 “It’s true, sir, I did have such a view. But Master Kassapa the Prince dissuaded me from that harmful misconception.”

985. Cp. AN 5.147, AN 9.20.

986. Gavampati also appears in SN 56.30; see note there for a detailed discussion. | *Divāvihāra* is the “day’s meditation”, while *divāseyya* is “siesta”.

“But the student named Uttara who organized that offering for you—where has he been reborn?” 33.10

“Sir, Uttara gave gifts carefully, thoughtfully, with his own hands, not giving the dregs. When his body broke up, after death, he was reborn in company with the gods of the thirty-three. But I gave gifts carelessly, thoughtlessly, not with my own hands, giving the dregs. When my body broke up, after death, I was reborn in company with the gods of the four great kings, in an empty sirisa palace. 33.11

So, sir, when you’ve returned to the human realm, please announce this: ‘Give gifts carefully, thoughtfully, with your own hands, not giving the dregs. The chieftain Pāyāsi gave gifts carelessly, thoughtlessly, not with his own hands, giving the dregs. When his body broke up, after death, he was reborn in company with the gods of the four great kings, in an empty palace of sirisa. But the student Uttara who organized the offering gave gifts carefully, thoughtfully, with his own hands, not giving the dregs. When his body broke up, after death, he was reborn in company with the gods of the thirty-three.’” 33.13

So when Venerable Gavampati returned to the human realm he made that announcement. 34.1

Colophon

The Translator

Bhikkhu Sujato was born as Anthony Aidan Best on 4/11/1966 in Perth, Western Australia. He grew up in the pleasant suburbs of Mt Lawley and Attadale alongside his sister Nicola, who was the good child. His mother, Margaret Lorraine Huntsman née Pinder, said “he’ll either be a priest or a poet”, while his father, Anthony Thomas Best, advised him to “never do anything for money”. He attended Aquinas College, a Catholic school, where he decided to become an atheist. At the University of WA he studied philosophy, aiming to learn what he wanted to do with his life. Finding that what he wanted to do was play guitar, he dropped out. His main band was named Martha’s Vineyard, which achieved modest success in the indie circuit.

A seemingly random encounter with a roadside joey took him to Thailand, where he entered his first meditation retreat at Wat Ram Poeng, Chiang Mai in 1992. Feeling the call to the Buddha’s path, he took full ordination in Wat Pa Nanachat in 1994, where his teachers were Ajahn Pasanno and Ajahn Jayasaro. In 1997 he returned to Perth to study with Ajahn Brahm at Bodhinyana Monastery.

He spent several years practicing in seclusion in Malaysia and Thailand before establishing Santi Forest Monastery in Bundanoon, NSW, in 2003. There he was instrumental in supporting the establishment of the Theravada bhikkhuni order in Australia and advocating for women’s rights. He continues to teach in Australia and globally,

with a special concern for the moral implications of climate change and other forms of environmental destruction. He has published a series of books of original and groundbreaking research on early Buddhism.

In 2005 he founded SuttaCentral together with Rod Bucknell and John Kelly. In 2015, seeing the need for a complete, accurate, plain English translation of the Pali texts, he undertook the task, spending nearly three years in isolation on the isle of Qi Mei off the coast of the nation of Taiwan. He completed the four main Nikāyas in 2018, and the early books of the Khuddaka Nikāya were complete by 2021. All this work is dedicated to the public domain and is entirely free of copyright encumbrance.

In 2019 he returned to Sydney where he established Lokanta Vihara (The Monastery at the End of the World).

Creation Process

Primary source was the digital Mahāsaṅgīti edition of the Pali Tipiṭaka. Translated from the Pali, with reference to several English translations, especially those of Bhikkhu Bodhi. Older translations by Maurice Walshe and T.W. and C.A.F. Rhys Davids were also consulted.

The Translation

This translation was part of a project to translate the four Pali Nikāyas with the following aims: plain, approachable English; consistent terminology; accurate rendition of the Pali; free of copyright. It was made during 2016–2018 while Bhikkhu Sujato was staying in Qimei, Taiwan.

About SuttaCentral

SuttaCentral publishes early Buddhist texts. Since 2005 we have provided root texts in Pali, Chinese, Sanskrit, Tibetan, and other languages, parallels between these texts, and translations in many modern languages. Building on the work of generations of scholars, we offer our contribution freely.

SuttaCentral is driven by volunteer contributions, and in addition we employ professional developers. We offer a sponsorship program for high quality translations from the original languages. Financial support for SuttaCentral is handled by the SuttaCentral Development Trust, a charitable trust registered in Australia.

About Bilara

“Bilara” means “cat” in Pali, and it is the name of our Computer Assisted Translation (CAT) software. Bilara is a web app that enables translators to translate early Buddhist texts into their own language. These translations are published on SuttaCentral with the root text and translation side by side.

About SuttaCentral Editions

The SuttaCentral Editions project makes high quality books from selected Bilara translations. These are published in formats including HTML, EPUB, PDF, and print.

You are welcome to print any of our Editions.