

Linked Discourses

Bhikkhu Sujato

LINKED DISCOURSES

A plain translation of the Saṃyutta Nikāya



translated and introduced by

BHIKKHU SUJATO

VOLUME 4

SN 35–44

THE GROUP OF LINKED DISCOURSES
BEGINNING WITH THE SIX SENSE FIELDS

SAḬĀYATANAVA G G A SĀMYUTTA

Linked Discourses is a translation of the Saṃyuttanikāya by Bhikkhu Sujato.

Creative Commons Zero (CC0)

To the extent possible under law, Bhikkhu Sujato has waived all copyright and related or neighboring rights to *Linked Discourses*.

This work is published from Australia.

This translation is an expression of an ancient spiritual text that has been passed down by the Buddhist tradition for the benefit of all sentient beings. It is dedicated to the public domain via Creative Commons Zero (CC0). You are encouraged to copy, reproduce, adapt, alter, or otherwise make use of this translation. The translator respectfully requests that any use be in accordance with the values and principles of the Buddhist community.

Web publication date 2018

This edition 2026-07-29 12:23:16

Publication type paperback

Edition ed5

Number of volumes 5

Publication ISBN 978-1-76132-086-6

Volume ISBN 978-1-76132-090-3

Publication URL <https://suttacentral.net/editions/sn/en/sujato>

Source URL <https://github.com/suttacentral/bilara-data/tree/published/translation/en/sujato/sutta/sn>

Publication number scpub4

Map of Jambudipa is by Jonas David Mitja Lang, and is released by him under Creative Commons Zero (CC0).

Published by SuttaCentral

*SuttaCentral,
c/o Alwis & Alwis Pty Ltd
Kaurua Country,
Suite 12,
198 Greenhill Road,
Eastwood,
SA 5063,
Australia*

Contents

The Group of Linked Discourses Beginning With the Six Sense Fields

LINKED DISCOURSES ON THE SIX SENSE FIELDS

THE FIRST FIFTY

The Chapter on Impermanence

SN 35.1	The Interior as Impermanent (<i>Ajjhattānīccasutta</i>)	4
SN 35.2	The Interior as Suffering (<i>Ajjhattadukkhasutta</i>)	6
SN 35.3	The Interior as Not-Self (<i>Ajjhattānattasutta</i>)	6
SN 35.4	The Exterior as Impermanent (<i>Bāhirānīccasutta</i>)	7
SN 35.5	The Exterior as Suffering (<i>Bāhiradukkhasutta</i>)	7
SN 35.6	The Exterior as Not-Self (<i>Bāhirānattasutta</i>)	8
SN 35.7	The Interior as Impermanent in the Three Times (<i>Ajjhattānīccātītānāgatasutta</i>)	8
SN 35.8	The Interior as Suffering in the Three Times (<i>Ajjhattadukkhātītānāgatasutta</i>)	8
SN 35.9	The Interior as Not-Self in the Three Times (<i>Ajjhattānattātītānāgatasutta</i>)	9
SN 35.10	The Exterior as Impermanent in the Three Times (<i>Bāhirānīccātītānāgatasutta</i>)	9

SN 35.11	The Exterior as Suffering in the Three Times (<i>Bāhiradukkhātītānāgatasutta</i>)	9
SN 35.12	The Exterior as Not-Self in the Three Times (<i>Bāhirānattātītānāgatasutta</i>)	10

The Chapter on Pairs

SN 35.13	Before My Awakening (Interior) (<i>Paṭhamapubbesambodhasutta</i>)	11
SN 35.14	Before My Awakening (Exterior) (<i>Dutiyapubbesambodhasutta</i>)	12
SN 35.15	In Search of Gratification (Interior) (<i>Paṭhamaassādapariyesanasutta</i>)	12
SN 35.16	In Search of Gratification (Exterior) (<i>Dutiyaassādapariyesanasutta</i>)	13
SN 35.17	If There Were No Gratification (Interior) (<i>Paṭhamanoceassādasutta</i>)	13
SN 35.18	If There Were No Gratification (Exterior) (<i>Dutiyanoceassādasutta</i>)	14
SN 35.19	Taking Pleasure (Interior) (<i>Paṭhamābhinandasutta</i>)	14
SN 35.20	Taking Pleasure (Exterior) (<i>Dutiyaābhinandasutta</i>)	15
SN 35.21	The Arising of Suffering (Interior) (<i>Paṭhamadukkhuppādasutta</i>)	15
SN 35.22	The Arising of Suffering (Exterior) (<i>Dutiyadukkhuppādasutta</i>)	16

The Chapter on the All

SN 35.23	All (<i>Sabbasutta</i>)	17
SN 35.24	Giving Up (<i>Pahānasutta</i>)	18
SN 35.25	Giving Up By Direct Knowledge and Complete Understanding (<i>Abhiññāpariññāpahānasutta</i>)	18

SN 35.26	Without Completely Understanding (1st) (<i>Paṭhamaaparijānānasutta</i>)	19
SN 35.27	Without Completely Understanding (2nd) (<i>Dutiyaaparijānānasutta</i>)	20
SN 35.28	Burning (<i>Ādittasutta</i>)	22
SN 35.29	Overcome (<i>Addhabhūtasutta</i>)	24
SN 35.30	The Practice Fit for Uprooting (<i>Samugghātasārūppasutta</i>)	25
SN 35.31	The Practice Conducive to Uprooting (1st) (<i>Paṭhamasamugghātasappāyasutta</i>)	26
SN 35.32	The Practice Conducive to Uprooting (2nd) (<i>Dutiyasamugghātasappāyasutta</i>)	27

The Chapter on Liable to Be Reborn

SN 35.33–42	Ten on Liable to Be Reborn, Etc. (<i>Jātidhammāsutta</i>)	30
-------------	--	----

The Chapter on All is Impermanent

SN 35.43–51	Nine on Impermanence, Etc. (<i>Aniccādisuttanavaka</i>)	32
SN 35.52	Contaminated (<i>Upasatṭhasutta</i>)	33

THE SECOND FIFTY

The Chapter on Ignorance

SN 35.53	Giving Up Ignorance (<i>Avijjāpahānasutta</i>)	35
SN 35.54	Giving Up Fetters (<i>Samyojanappahānasutta</i>)	36
SN 35.55	Uprooting the Fetters (<i>Samyojanasamugghātasutta</i>)	36
SN 35.56	Giving Up Defilements (<i>Āsavapahānasutta</i>)	36
SN 35.57	Uprooting Defilements (<i>Āsavasamugghātasutta</i>)	37
SN 35.58	Giving Up Tendencies (<i>Anusayapahānasutta</i>)	37

SN 35.59	Uprooting Tendencies (<i>Anusayasamugghātasutta</i>)	37
SN 35.60	The Complete Understanding of All Grasping (<i>Sabbupādānapariññāsutta</i>)	37
SN 35.61	The Depletion of All Fuel for Grasping (1st) (<i>Paṭhamasabbupādānapariyādānasutta</i>)	38
SN 35.62	The Depletion of All Fuel for Grasping (2nd) (<i>Dutiyasabbupādānapariyādānasutta</i>)	39

The Chapter with Migajāla

SN 35.63	With Migajāla (1st) (<i>Paṭhamamigajālasutta</i>)	41
SN 35.64	With Migajāla (2nd) (<i>Dutiyamigajālasutta</i>)	42
SN 35.65	Samiddhi's Question About Māra (<i>Paṭhamasamiddhimārapañhāsutta</i>)	44
SN 35.66	Samiddhi's Question About a Sentient Being (<i>Samiddhisattapañhāsutta</i>)	45
SN 35.67	Samiddhi's Question About Suffering (<i>Samiddhidukkhapañhāsutta</i>)	45
SN 35.68	Samiddhi's Question About the World (<i>Samiddhilokapañhāsutta</i>)	45
SN 35.69	Upasena and the Viper (<i>Upasenaāsivisasutta</i>)	46
SN 35.70	Upavāṇa on What is Apparent in the Present Life (<i>Upavāṇasandiṭṭhikasutta</i>)	47
SN 35.71	Six Fields of Contact (1st) (<i>Paṭhamachaphassāyatanasutta</i>)	49
SN 35.72	Six Fields of Contact (2nd) (<i>Dutiyachaphassāyatanasutta</i>)	50
SN 35.73	Six Fields of Contact (3rd) (<i>Tatiyachaphassāyatanasutta</i>)	51

The Chapter on Sick

SN 35.74	Sick (1st) (<i>Paṭhamagilānasutta</i>)	53
----------	--	----

SN 35.75	Sick (2nd) (<i>Dutiyaḡilānasutta</i>)	55
SN 35.76	With Rādhā on Impermanence (<i>Rādhānīccasutta</i>)	57
SN 35.77	With Rādhā on Suffering (<i>Rādhādukkhasutta</i>)	57
SN 35.78	With Rādhā on Not-Self (<i>Rādhānattasutta</i>)	58
SN 35.79	Giving Up Ignorance (1st) (<i>Paṭhamaavijjāpahānasutta</i>)	58
SN 35.80	Giving Up Ignorance (2nd) (<i>Dutiyaavijjāpahānasutta</i>)	59
SN 35.81	Several Mendicants (<i>Sambahulaḡhikkhusutta</i>)	60
SN 35.82	A Question On the World (<i>Lokaḡaṇhāsutta</i>)	61
SN 35.83	Phaḡḡa's Question (<i>Phaḡḡanaḡaṇhāsutta</i>)	62

The Chapter with Channa

SN 35.84	Liable to Wear Out (<i>Palokadhammasutta</i>)	63
SN 35.85	The World is Empty (<i>Suññatalokasutta</i>)	64
SN 35.86	A Teaching In Brief (<i>Samkhittadhammasutta</i>)	64
SN 35.87	With Channa (<i>Channasutta</i>)	66
SN 35.88	With Puṇṇa (<i>Puṇṇasutta</i>)	70
SN 35.89	With Bāhiya (<i>Bāhiyasutta</i>)	73
SN 35.90	Turbulence (1st) (<i>Paṭhamaejāsutta</i>)	75
SN 35.91	Turbulence (2nd) (<i>Dutiyaejāsutta</i>)	76
SN 35.92	A Duality (1st) (<i>Paṭhamadvayasutta</i>)	77
SN 35.93	A Duality (2nd) (<i>Dutiadvayasutta</i>)	79

The Chapter on the Sixes

SN 35.94	Untamed, Unguarded (<i>Adantaaguttasutta</i>)	81
SN 35.95	Mālunkyaputta (<i>Mālunkyaputtasutta</i>)	84
SN 35.96	Liable to Decline (<i>Parihānadhammasutta</i>)	90
SN 35.97	One Who Lives Negligently (<i>Pamādavīhārisutta</i>)	92

SN 35.98	Restraint (<i>Samvarasutta</i>)	93
SN 35.99	Immersion (<i>Samādhisutta</i>)	94
SN 35.100	Retreat (<i>Paṭisallānasutta</i>)	95
SN 35.101	It's Not Yours (1st) (<i>Paṭhamanatumhākasutta</i>)	95
SN 35.102	It's Not Yours (2nd) (<i>Dutiyanatumhākasutta</i>)	96
SN 35.103	About Uddaka (<i>Udakasutta</i>)	97

THE THIRD FIFTY

The Chapter on Sanctuary

SN 35.104	Sanctuary from the Yoke (<i>Yogakkhemisutta</i>)	101
SN 35.105	Because of Grasping (<i>Upādāyasutta</i>)	102
SN 35.106	The Origin of Suffering (<i>Dukkhasamudayasutta</i>)	103
SN 35.107	The Origin of the World (<i>Lokasamudayasutta</i>)	104
SN 35.108	I'm Better (<i>Seyyohamasmisutta</i>)	105
SN 35.109	Things That Tighten Fetters (<i>Saṇḍiyojanīyasutta</i>)	106
SN 35.110	Things That Fuel Grasping (<i>Upādānīyasutta</i>)	107
SN 35.111	Complete Understanding of the Interior (<i>Ajjhattikāyatanaparijānanasutta</i>)	107
SN 35.112	Complete Understanding of the Exterior (<i>Bāhirāyatanaparijānanasutta</i>)	108
SN 35.113	Listening In (<i>Upassutisutta</i>)	108

The Chapter on the World and the Kinds of Sensual Stimulation

SN 35.114	Māra's Snare (1st) (<i>Paṭhamamārapāsasutta</i>)	110
SN 35.115	Māra's Snare (2nd) (<i>Dutiyaṃmārapāsasutta</i>)	111
SN 35.116	Traveling to the End of the World (<i>Lokantagamanasutta</i>)	112

SN 35.117	The Kinds of Sensual Stimulation (<i>Kāmaguṇasutta</i>)	115
SN 35.118	The Question of Sakka (<i>Sakkapañhasutta</i>)	117
SN 35.119	The Question of Pañcasikha (<i>Pañcasikhasutta</i>)	118
SN 35.120	Sāriputta and the Protégé (<i>Sāriputtasaddhivihārikasutta</i>)	119
SN 35.121	Advice to Rāhula (<i>Rāhulovādasutta</i>)	121
SN 35.122	Things That Tighten Fetters (<i>Samyojaniyadhammasutta</i>)	124
SN 35.123	Things That Fuel Grasping (<i>Upādāniyadhammasutta</i>)	124

The Chapter on Householders

SN 35.124	At Vesālī (<i>Vesālīsutta</i>)	126
SN 35.125	In the Land of the Vajjis (<i>Vajjisutta</i>)	127
SN 35.126	At Nālandā (<i>Nālandasutta</i>)	128
SN 35.127	With Bhāradvāja (<i>Bhāradvājasutta</i>)	128
SN 35.128	With Soṇa (<i>Soṇasutta</i>)	131
SN 35.129	With Ghosita (<i>Ghositasutta</i>)	132
SN 35.130	With Hālidikāni (<i>Hālidikānisutta</i>)	133
SN 35.131	Nakula's Father (<i>Nakulapītusutta</i>)	134
SN 35.132	With Lohicca (<i>Lohiccasutta</i>)	135
SN 35.133	Verahaccāni (<i>Verahaccānisutta</i>)	140

The Chapter at Devadaha

SN 35.134	At Devadaha (<i>Devadahāsutta</i>)	143
SN 35.135	Opportunity (<i>Khaṇasutta</i>)	144
SN 35.136	Liking Sights (1st) (<i>Paṭhamarūpārāmasutta</i>)	145
SN 35.137	Liking Sights (2nd) (<i>Dutiyarūpārāmasutta</i>)	147
SN 35.138	Not Yours (1st) (<i>Paṭhamanatumhākasutta</i>)	147
SN 35.139	Not Yours (2nd) (<i>Dutiyatanatumhākasutta</i>)	148

SN 35.140	Interior and Cause Are Impermanent (<i>Ajjhattaaniccahetusutta</i>)	148
SN 35.141	Interior and Cause Are Suffering (<i>Ajjhattadukkhahehetusutta</i>)	149
SN 35.142	Interior and Cause Are Not-Self (<i>Ajjhattānattahetusutta</i>)	149
SN 35.143	Exterior and Cause Are Impermanent (<i>Bāhirāniccahetusutta</i>)	150
SN 35.144	Exterior and Cause Are Suffering (<i>Bāhiradukkhahehetusutta</i>)	150
SN 35.145	Exterior and Cause Are Not-Self (<i>Bāhirānattahetusutta</i>)	151
<i>The Chapter on the Old and the New</i>		
SN 35.146	The Cessation of Deeds (<i>Kammanirodhasutta</i>)	152
SN 35.147	The Impermanent as Conducive to Extinguishment (<i>Aniccanibbānasappāyasutta</i>)	153
SN 35.148	The Suffering as Conducive to Extinguishment (<i>Dukkhanibbānasappāyasutta</i>)	154
SN 35.149	Not-Self as Conducive to Extinguishment (<i>Anattanibbānasappāyasutta</i>)	154
SN 35.150	A Practice Conducive to Extinguishment (<i>Nibbānasappāyapaṭipadāsutta</i>)	155
SN 35.151	A Resident Pupil (<i>Antevāsikasutta</i>)	156
SN 35.152	What's the Goal of the Spiritual Life? (<i>Kimatthiyabrahmacariyasutta</i>)	158
SN 35.153	Is There a Method? (<i>Atthinukhopariyāyasutta</i>)	158
SN 35.154	Endowed With Faculties (<i>Indriyasampannasutta</i>)	160

SN 35.155	A Dhamma Speaker (<i>Dhammakathikapucchasutta</i>)	161
-----------	---	-----

THE FOURTH FIFTY

The Chapter on the End of Relishing

SN 35.156	The Interior and the End of Relishing (<i>Ajjhattanandikkhayasutta</i>)	164
SN 35.157	The Exterior and the End of Relishing (<i>Bāhiraanandikkhayasutta</i>)	165
SN 35.158	Focus, the Interior, and the End of Relishing (<i>Ajjhattaaniccanandikkhayasutta</i>)	165
SN 35.159	Focus, the Exterior, and the End of Relishing (<i>Bāhiraanicanandikkhayasutta</i>)	166
SN 35.160	On Immersion at Jivaka's Mango Grove (<i>Jivakambavanasamādhisutta</i>)	166
SN 35.161	On Retreat at Jivaka's Mango Grove (<i>Jivakambavanapaṭisallānasutta</i>)	167
SN 35.162	With Koṭṭhita on Impermanence (<i>Koṭṭhikaanicasutta</i>)	168
SN 35.163	With Koṭṭhita on Suffering (<i>Koṭṭhikadukkkhasutta</i>)	168
SN 35.164	With Koṭṭhita on Not-Self (<i>Koṭṭhikaanattasutta</i>)	169
SN 35.165	Giving Up Wrong View (<i>Micchādiṭṭhipahānasutta</i>)	170
SN 35.166	Giving Up Substantialist View (<i>Sakkāyadiṭṭhipahānasutta</i>)	170
SN 35.167	Giving Up Theory of Self (<i>Attānudiṭṭhipahānasutta</i>)	171

The Chapter on Sixty Abbreviated Texts

SN 35.168	Desire for the Impermanent Interior (<i>Ajjhattaaniccachandasutta</i>)	172
SN 35.169	Greed for the Impermanent Interior (<i>Ajjhattaaniccarāgasutta</i>)	172
SN 35.170	Desire and Greed for the Impermanent Interior (<i>Ajjhattaaniccachandarāgasutta</i>)	173
SN 35.171–173	Desire, Etc. for the Suffering Interior (<i>Dukkhachandādisutta</i>)	173
SN 35.174–176	Desire, Etc. for the Not-Self Interior (<i>Anattachandādisutta</i>)	173
SN 35.177–179	Desire, Etc. for the Impermanent Exterior (<i>Bāhirāniccachandādisutta</i>)	173
SN 35.180–182	Desire, Etc. for the Suffering Exterior (<i>Bāhiradukkhachandādisutta</i>)	174
SN 35.183–185	Desire, Etc. for the Not-Self Exterior (<i>Bāhirānattachandādisutta</i>)	174
SN 35.186	The Interior Was Impermanent in the Past (<i>Ajjhattātītānīccasutta</i>)	174
SN 35.187	The Interior Will Be Impermanent in the Future (<i>Ajjhattānāgatānīccasutta</i>)	175
SN 35.188	The Interior is Impermanent in the Present (<i>Ajjhattapaccuppannānīccasutta</i>)	175
SN 35.189–191	The Interior as Suffering in the Three Times (<i>Ajjhattātītādīdukkhasutta</i>)	175
SN 35.192–194	The Interior as Not-Self in the Three Times (<i>Ajjhattātītāḍīanattasutta</i>)	175
SN 35.195–197	The Exterior as Impermanent in the Three Times (<i>Bāhirātītāḍīanīccasutta</i>)	176
SN 35.198–200	The Exterior as Suffering in the Three Times (<i>Bāhirātītādīdukkhasutta</i>)	176

SN 35.201–203	The Exterior as Not-Self in the Three Times (<i>Bāhirātītāḍianattasutta</i>)	176
SN 35.204	The Interior and What's Impermanent in the Past (<i>Ajjhattātīṭayadaniccasutta</i>)	176
SN 35.205	The Interior and What's Impermanent in the Future (<i>Ajjhattānāgatayadaniccasutta</i>)	177
SN 35.206	The Interior and What's Impermanent in the Present (<i>Ajjhattapaccuppannayadaniccasutta</i>)	177
SN 35.207–209	The Interior and What's Suffering in the Three Times (<i>Ajjhattātītāḍiyamdukkhasutta</i>)	177
SN 35.210–212	The Interior and What's Not-Self in the Three Times (<i>Ajjhattātītāḍiyadanattasutta</i>)	178
SN 35.213–215	The Exterior and What's Impermanent in the Three Times (<i>Bāhirātītāḍiyadaniccasutta</i>)	178
SN 35.216–218	The Exterior and What's Suffering in the Three Times (<i>Bāhirātītāḍiyamdukkhasutta</i>)	178
SN 35.219–221	The Exterior and What's Not-Self in the Three Times (<i>Bāhirātītāḍiyadanattasutta</i>)	179
SN 35.222	The Interior as Impermanent (<i>Ajjhattāyatanaanicasutta</i>)	179
SN 35.223	The Interior as Suffering (<i>Ajjhattāyatanadukkkhasutta</i>)	179
SN 35.224	The Interior as Not-Self (<i>Ajjhattāyatanaanattasutta</i>)	180
SN 35.225	The Exterior as Impermanent (<i>Bāhirāyatanaanicasutta</i>)	180
SN 35.226	The Exterior as Suffering (<i>Bāhirāyatanadukkkhasutta</i>)	180

SN 35.227	The Exterior as Not-Self (<i>Bāhirāyatanaanattasutta</i>)	181
-----------	--	-----

The Chapter on the Ocean

SN 35.228	The Ocean (1st) (<i>Paṭhamasamuddasutta</i>)	182
SN 35.229	The Ocean (2nd) (<i>Dutiyasamuddasutta</i>)	183
SN 35.230	The Simile of the Angler (<i>Bālīsikopamasutta</i>)	184
SN 35.231	The Simile of the Latex-Producing Tree (<i>Khīrarukkhopamasutta</i>)	185
SN 35.232	With Koṭṭhita (<i>Koṭṭhikasutta</i>)	187
SN 35.233	With Kāmabhū (<i>Kāmabhūsutta</i>)	189
SN 35.234	With Udāyī (<i>Udāyīsutta</i>)	190
SN 35.235	The Exposition on Burning (<i>Ādittapariyāyasutta</i>)	192
SN 35.236	The Simile of Hands and Feet (1st) (<i>Paṭhamahatthapādopamasutta</i>)	194
SN 35.237	The Simile of Hands and Feet (2nd) (<i>Dutiyahatthapādopamasutta</i>)	195

The Chapter on the Simile of the Vipers

SN 35.238	The Simile of the Vipers (<i>Āsīvisopamasutta</i>)	196
SN 35.239	The Simile of the Chariot (<i>Rathopamasutta</i>)	198
SN 35.240	The Simile of the Tortoise (<i>Kummopamasutta</i>)	200
SN 35.241	The Simile of the Tree Trunk (1st) (<i>Paṭhamadārukkhandhopamasutta</i>)	202
SN 35.242	The Simile of the Tree Trunk (2nd) (<i>Dutiyadārukkhandhopamasutta</i>)	204
SN 35.243	The Explanation on the Festering (<i>Avassutapariyāyasutta</i>)	205
SN 35.244	Entailing Suffering (<i>Dukkhadhammasutta</i>)	209

SN 35.245	The Simile of the Parrot Tree (<i>Kimsukopamasutta</i>)	213
SN 35.246	The Simile of the Harp (<i>Vīṇopamasutta</i>)	216
SN 35.247	The Simile of Six Animals (<i>Chappāṇakopamasutta</i>)	219
SN 35.248	The Sheaf of Barley (<i>Yavakalāpisutta</i>)	222

LINKED DISCOURSES ON FEELINGS

The Chapter with Verses

SN 36.1	Immersion (<i>Samādhisutta</i>)	226
SN 36.2	Pleasure (<i>Sukhasutta</i>)	227
SN 36.3	Giving Up (<i>Pahānasutta</i>)	227
SN 36.4	The Abyss (<i>Pātālasutta</i>)	229
SN 36.5	Should Be Seen (<i>Daṭṭhabbasutta</i>)	230
SN 36.6	An Arrow (<i>Sallasutta</i>)	231
SN 36.7	The Infirmary (1st) (<i>Paṭhamagelaññasutta</i>)	234
SN 36.8	The Infirmary (2nd) (<i>Dutiyagelaññasutta</i>)	237
SN 36.9	Impermanent (<i>Aniccasutta</i>)	238
SN 36.10	Rooted in Contact (<i>Phassamūlakasutta</i>)	239

The Chapter on In Private

SN 36.11	In Private (<i>Rahogatasutta</i>)	240
SN 36.12	In the Atmosphere (1st) (<i>Paṭhamaākāśasutta</i>)	242
SN 36.13	In the Atmosphere (2nd) (<i>Dutiyaākāśasutta</i>)	243
SN 36.14	A Guest House (<i>Agārasutta</i>)	244
SN 36.15	With Ānanda (1st) (<i>Paṭhamaānandasutta</i>)	244
SN 36.16	With Ānanda (2nd) (<i>Dutiyaānandasutta</i>)	246
SN 36.17	With Several Mendicants (1st) (<i>Paṭhamasambahulasutta</i>)	246
SN 36.18	With Several Mendicants (2nd) (<i>Dutiyasambahulasutta</i>)	247

SN 36.19	With Pañcakaṅga (<i>Pañcakaṅgasutta</i>)	248
SN 36.20	A Mendicant (<i>Bhikkhusutta</i>)	253
<i>The Chapter on the Explanation of the Hundred and Eight</i>		
SN 36.21	With Sivaka (<i>Sivakasutta</i>)	254
SN 36.22	The Explanation of the Hundred and Eight (<i>Aṭṭhasatasutta</i>)	256
SN 36.23	With a Mendicant (<i>Aññatarabhikkhusutta</i>)	257
SN 36.24	Before (<i>Pubbasutta</i>)	258
SN 36.25	Knowledge (<i>Ñāṇasutta</i>)	259
SN 36.26	With Several Mendicants (<i>Sambahulabhikkhusutta</i>)	259
SN 36.27	Ascetics and Brahmins (1st) (<i>Paṭṭhamasamaṇabrāhmaṇasutta</i>)	260
SN 36.28	Ascetics and Brahmins (2nd) (<i>Dutiyasamaṇabrāhmaṇasutta</i>)	260
SN 36.29	Ascetics and Brahmins (3rd) (<i>Tatiyasamaṇabrāhmaṇasutta</i>)	261
SN 36.30	Plain Version (<i>Suddhikasutta</i>)	261
SN 36.31	Not of the Flesh (<i>Nirāmisasutta</i>)	261

LINKED DISCOURSES ON FEMALES

First Chapter of Abbreviated Texts

SN 37.1	A Lady (<i>Mātugāmasutta</i>)	266
SN 37.2	A Man (<i>Purisasutta</i>)	267
SN 37.3	Particular Suffering (<i>Āveṇikadukkhassutta</i>)	267
SN 37.4	Three Qualities (<i>Tīhidhammehisutta</i>)	269
SN 37.5	Irritable (<i>Kodhanasutta</i>)	269
SN 37.6	Acrimony (<i>Upanāhīsutta</i>)	270
SN 37.7	Jealous (<i>Issukīsutta</i>)	270
SN 37.8	Stingy (<i>Maccharīsutta</i>)	270

SN 37.9	Adultery (<i>Aticārīsutta</i>)	270
SN 37.10	Unethical (<i>Dussīlasutta</i>)	271
SN 37.11	Unlearned (<i>Appassutasutta</i>)	271
SN 37.12	Lazy (<i>Kusītasutta</i>)	271
SN 37.13	Unmindful (<i>Muṭṭhassatisutta</i>)	271
SN 37.14	Five Threats (<i>Pañcaverasutta</i>)	272

Second Chapter of Abbreviated Texts

SN 37.15	Loving (<i>Akkodhanasutta</i>)	273
SN 37.16	Free of Acrimony (<i>Anupanāhīsutta</i>)	274
SN 37.17	Free of Jealousy (<i>Anissukīsutta</i>)	274
SN 37.18	Free of Stinginess (<i>Amaccharīsutta</i>)	274
SN 37.19	Not Adulterous (<i>Anaticārīsutta</i>)	274
SN 37.20	Ethical (<i>Susīlasutta</i>)	275
SN 37.21	Very Learned (<i>Bahussutasutta</i>)	275
SN 37.22	Energetic (<i>Āradhaviṛiyasutta</i>)	275
SN 37.23	Mindful (<i>Upaṭṭhitassatisutta</i>)	275
SN 37.24	Five Precepts (<i>Pañcasīlasutta</i>)	275

The Chapter on Powers

SN 37.25	Assured (<i>Visāradasutta</i>)	277
SN 37.26	Under Her Thumb (<i>Pasayhasutta</i>)	277
SN 37.27	Mastered (<i>Abhibhuyyasutta</i>)	278
SN 37.28	One (<i>Ekasutta</i>)	278
SN 37.29	In That Respect (<i>Āṅgasutta</i>)	278
SN 37.30	They Send Her Away (<i>Nāsentsisutta</i>)	279
SN 37.31	Cause (<i>Hetusutta</i>)	280
SN 37.32	Things (<i>Ṭhānasutta</i>)	280
SN 37.33	Living With Self-Assurance (<i>Pañcasīlavisāradasutta</i>)	282
SN 37.34	Growth (<i>Vaḍḍhisutta</i>)	282

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH JAMBUKHĀDAKA

The Chapter with Jambukhādaka

SN 38.1	A Question About Extinguishment (<i>Nibbānapañhāsutta</i>)	284
SN 38.2	A Question About Perfection (<i>Arahattapañhāsutta</i>)	285
SN 38.3	Principled Speech (<i>Dhammavādīpañhāsutta</i>)	286
SN 38.4	What's the Goal? (<i>Kimatthiyasutta</i>)	287
SN 38.5	Solace (<i>Assāsappattasutta</i>)	287
SN 38.6	Ultimate Solace (<i>Paramassāsappattasutta</i>)	288
SN 38.7	A Question About Feeling (<i>Vedanāpañhāsutta</i>)	288
SN 38.8	A Question About Defilements (<i>Āsavapañhāsutta</i>)	289
SN 38.9	A Question About Ignorance (<i>Avijjāpañhāsutta</i>)	289
SN 38.10	A Question About Craving (<i>Taṇhāpañhāsutta</i>)	290
SN 38.11	A Question About Floods (<i>Oghapañhāsutta</i>)	290
SN 38.12	A Question About Grasping (<i>Upādānapañhāsutta</i>)	291
SN 38.13	A Question About States of Existence (<i>Bhavapañhāsutta</i>)	291
SN 38.14	A Question About Suffering (<i>Dukkhapañhāsutta</i>)	291
SN 38.15	A Question About Substantial Reality (<i>Sakkāyapañhāsutta</i>)	292
SN 38.16	A Question About What's Hard to Do (<i>Dukkarapañhāsutta</i>)	292

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH SĀMAṆḌAKA

The Chapter with Sāmaṇḍaka

SN 39.1–15	With Sāmaṇḍaka on Extinguishment (<i>Sāmaṇḍakasutta</i>)	295
SN 39.16	Hard to Do (<i>Dukkarasutta</i>)	296

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH MOGGALLĀNA

The Chapter with Moggallāna

SN 40.1	A Question About the First Absorption (<i>Paṭhamajhānapaṇhāsutta</i>)	298
SN 40.2	A Question About the Second Absorption (<i>Dutiyajhānapaṇhāsutta</i>)	299
SN 40.3	A Question About the Third Absorption (<i>Tatiyajhānapaṇhāsutta</i>)	300
SN 40.4	A Question About the Fourth Absorption (<i>Catutthajhānapaṇhāsutta</i>)	300
SN 40.5	A Question About the Dimension of Infinite Space (<i>Ākāśaṇācāyatanapaṇhāsutta</i>)	301
SN 40.6	A Question About the Dimension of Infinite Consciousness (<i>Viññāṇaṇcāyatanapaṇhāsutta</i>)	302
SN 40.7	A Question About the Dimension of Nothingness (<i>Ākiñcaṇṇāyatanapaṇhāsutta</i>)	303
SN 40.8	A Question About the Dimension of Neither Perception Nor Non-Perception (<i>Nevasaṇṇānāsaṇṇāyatanapaṇhāsutta</i>)	303
SN 40.9	A Question About the Signless (<i>Animittapaṇhāsutta</i>)	304
SN 40.10	With Sakka (<i>Sakkasutta</i>)	305
SN 40.11	With Candana, Etc. (<i>Candanasutta</i>)	308

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH CITTA THE HOUSEHOLDER

The Chapter with Citta

SN 41.1	The Fetter (<i>Samyojanasutta</i>)	310
SN 41.2	With Isidatta (1st) (<i>Paṭhamaisidattasutta</i>)	312
SN 41.3	With Isidatta (2nd) (<i>Dutiyaisidattasutta</i>)	314
SN 41.4	Mahaka's Demonstration (<i>Mahakapāṭihāriyasutta</i>)	317
SN 41.5	With Kāmaabhū (1st) (<i>Paṭhamakāmabhūsutta</i>)	319
SN 41.6	With Kāmaabhū (2nd) (<i>Dutiyakāmabhūsutta</i>)	322
SN 41.7	With Godatta (<i>Godattasutta</i>)	325
SN 41.8	The Jain Ascetic of the Nātika Clan (<i>Nigaṇṭhanāṭaputtasutta</i>)	328
SN 41.9	With Kassapa, the Naked Ascetic (<i>Acelakassapasutta</i>)	330
SN 41.10	Seeing the Sick (<i>Gilānadassanasutta</i>)	333

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH CHIEFS

The Chapter on Chiefs

SN 42.1	Fury (<i>Caṇḍasutta</i>)	336
SN 42.2	With Tālapuṭa (<i>Tālapuṭasutta</i>)	337
SN 42.3	A Warrior (<i>Yodhājīvasutta</i>)	339
SN 42.4	An Elephant Marshal (<i>Haṭṭhārohasutta</i>)	341
SN 42.5	A Cavalryman (<i>Assārohasutta</i>)	341
SN 42.6	With Asibandhaka's Son (<i>Asibandhakaputtasutta</i>)	342
SN 42.7	The Simile of the Field (<i>Khettūpamasutta</i>)	345
SN 42.8	A Horn Blower (<i>Saṅkhadhamasutta</i>)	347
SN 42.9	Families (<i>Kulasutta</i>)	351
SN 42.10	With Maṇicūḷaka (<i>Maṇicūḷakasutta</i>)	354
SN 42.11	With Bhadraka (<i>Bhadrakasutta</i>)	355

SN 42.12	With Rāsiya (<i>Rāsiyasutta</i>)	358
SN 42.13	With Pāṭaliya (<i>Pāṭaliyasutta</i>)	366

LINKED DISCOURSES ON THE UNCONDITIONED

Chapter One

SN 43.1	Mindfulness of the Body (<i>Kāyagatāsatisutta</i>)	379
SN 43.2	Serenity and Discernment (<i>Samathavipassanāsutta</i>)	380
SN 43.3	Placing the Mind and Keeping it Connected (<i>Savitakkasavicārasutta</i>)	381
SN 43.4	Emptiness Immersion (<i>Suññatasamādhisutta</i>)	381
SN 43.5	Mindfulness Meditation (<i>Satipaṭṭhānasutta</i>)	382
SN 43.6	Right Efforts (<i>Sammappadhānasutta</i>)	382
SN 43.7	Bases of Psychic Power (<i>Iddhipādasutta</i>)	382
SN 43.8	Faculties (<i>Indriyasutta</i>)	383
SN 43.9	Powers (<i>Balasutta</i>)	383
SN 43.10	Awakening Factors (<i>Bojjhaṅgasutta</i>)	383
SN 43.11	The Path (<i>Maggaṅgasutta</i>)	384

Chapter Two

SN 43.12	The Unconditioned (<i>Asaṅkhatasutta</i>)	385
SN 43.13	Uninclined (<i>Anatasutta</i>)	387
SN 43.14–43	Undefined, Etc. (<i>Anāsavādisutta</i>)	387
SN 43.44	The Final Haven (<i>Parāyanasutta</i>)	389

LINKED DISCOURSES ON THE UNDECLARED

The Chapter on the Undeclared Points

SN 44.1	With Khemā (<i>Khemāsutta</i>)	392
SN 44.2	With Anurādha (<i>Anurādhasutta</i>)	396
SN 44.3	With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (1st) (<i>Paṭhamasāriputtakotṭhikasutta</i>)	399

SN 44.4	With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (2nd) (<i>Dutiyasāriputtakotṭhikasutta</i>)	400
SN 44.5	With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (3rd) (<i>Tatīyasāriputtakotṭhikasutta</i>)	401
SN 44.6	With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (4th) (<i>Catutthasāriputtakotṭhikasutta</i>)	401
SN 44.7	With Moggallāna (<i>Moggallānasutta</i>)	404
SN 44.8	With Vacchagotta (<i>Vacchagottasutta</i>)	406
SN 44.9	The Debating Hall (<i>Kutūhalasālāsutta</i>)	407
SN 44.10	With Ānanda (<i>Ānandasutta</i>)	409
SN 44.11	With Sabhiya Kaccāna (<i>Sabhiyakaccānasutta</i>)	410
Colophon		412

The Group of Linked Discourses Beginning With the Six Sense Fields

LINKED DISCOURSES ON THE SIX SENSE FIELDS

THE FIRST FIFTY

The Chapter on Impermanence

SN 35.1

The Interior as Impermanent

Ajjhattānīccasutta

- 1.1 So I have heard.¹ At one time the Buddha was staying near Sāvattthī in Jeta’s Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika’s monastery. There the Buddha addressed the mendicants, “Mendicants!”

1. The “interior” aspects of the sense fields are the sensory organs starting with the “eye”, as opposed to the sense stimuli starting with “sights”, which are “exterior” (*bāhira*). | *Ajjhatika/bāhira* (“interior/exterior”) are used for the senses because they refer to inner and outer aspects of a thing, in this case, the individual. The similar pair *ajjhatta/bahiddha* (“internal/external” or “inside/outside”) indicates the relation of two things to each other (see SN 35.69:1.4). Thus a house may have its interior painted white and exterior painted blue (*ajjhatika/bāhira*), while a chair might be inside the house or outside of it (*ajjhatta/bahiddha*). This agrees with Vedic usage. For *bahirdhā*, Chāndogya Upaniṣad 3.12.7 mentions “what is outside a person”; it’s also someone who is “outside” the sacrifice (eg. Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 1.9.2.2). *Bāhya* is used in philosophical contexts, where it sometimes contrasts with *ādhyātmika* (Māṇḍūkya Upaniṣad Kārikā 2.38), but more commonly *antara*: “the body is exterior, the womb interior” (ŚB 6.6.2.16); “eyes are interior, ears exterior” (ŚB 13.4.4.8). Sages aspire to transcend this duality: “As a man embraced by a woman he loves is oblivious to everything within or without, so this person embraced by the self consisting of knowledge is oblivious to everything within or without” (Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 4.3.21, Olivelle translation). See also note on SN 35.4:1.5.

- “Venerable sir,” they replied. The Buddha said this: 1.5
- “Mendicants, the eye is impermanent.² What’s impermanent is 2.1
suffering. What’s suffering is not-self. And what’s not-self should be
truly seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am
not this, this is not my self.’
- The ear is impermanent. ... 2.5
- The nose is impermanent. ... 2.7
- The tongue is impermanent. ...³ 2.9
- The body is impermanent. ... 2.13
- The mind is impermanent. What’s impermanent is suffering. 2.15
What’s suffering is not-self. And what’s not-self should be truly
seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not
this, this is not my self.’
- Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the 2.19
eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. Being disillusioned, desire
fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re
freed, they know they’re freed.

2. This section gives a series of basic teachings with systematic variations. These can be understood as meditation instructions. The various templates and their usage patterns are mapped in the concordances appended to Bhikkhu Bodhi’s *Connected Discourses*.

3. Right from this first discourse, the teachings on the six senses are highly abbreviated in the Pali. A standard pattern, which is used in the next several discourses, is to give the first and last items in full, while the middle ones are abbreviated. However, in this discourse, while the “ear” and “nose” have been abbreviated, the Pali gives the “tongue” in full, then abbreviates “body”, then tells the “mind” in full. This pattern recurs throughout this Saṃyutta (eg. SN 35.7:1.10, SN 35.13:1.15, SN 35.25:1.6) and elsewhere in this collection (SN 44.7:4.1). Often, the pattern is even more extreme, as the “ear” and “nose” and sometimes “body” are omitted entirely, while the “tongue” is given in full (SN 35.26:1.6, SN 35.27:1.4). This only applies to the interior “tongue”, not to the exterior “taste”. As to why this odd pattern appears, I think it is because “tongue” (*jivhā*) is the only term among the twelve that is feminine. Feminine declensions in Pali are quite different to masculine and neuter. Perhaps these passages are spelled out in full to ensure the correct forms are used. In any case, I do not attempt to represent this in my translation, but use the standard pattern.

- 2.21 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.2

The Interior as Suffering

Ajjhattadukkhassutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, the eye is suffering. What’s suffering is not-self. And what’s not-self should be truly seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’
- 1.4 The ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are suffering. What’s suffering is not-self. And what’s not-self should be truly seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’
- 1.11 Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.3

The Interior as Not-Self

Ajjhattānattassutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, the eye is not-self. And what’s not-self should be truly seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’
- 1.3 The ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are not-self. And what’s not-self should be truly seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’
- 1.9 Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.4

The Exterior as Impermanent

Bāhirāniccasutta

“Mendicants, sights are impermanent. What’s impermanent is suffering. 1.1
What’s suffering is not-self. And what’s not-self should be truly
seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not
this, this is not my self.’

Sounds,⁴ smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are impermanent.
What’s impermanent is suffering. What’s suffering is not-self. And
what’s not-self should be truly seen with right understanding like
this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with 1.13
sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas. Being disillusioned,
desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When
they’re freed, they know they’re freed.

They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has 1.15
been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing
further for this place.’”

SN 35.5

The Exterior as Suffering

Bāhiradukkhasutta

“Mendicants, sights are suffering. What’s suffering is not-self. And 1.1
what’s not-self should be truly seen with right understanding like
this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’ ...”

4. “Sounds” are mentioned as “exterior” (*bāhya*) in Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 1.5
2.4.7, as opposed to the Divinity that has neither interior nor exterior (2.5.19).
This anticipates the Buddhist association of *bāhira* with sense objects. This
particular passage is full of echoes with Buddhism.

SN 35.6

The Exterior as Not-Self

Bāhirānattasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, sights are not-self. And what’s not-self should be truly seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’ ...”

SN 35.7

The Interior as Impermanent in the Three Times

Ajjhattāniccātītānāgatasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, the eye of the past and future is impermanent, let alone the present.
- 1.3 Seeing this, a learned noble disciple is not concerned with the eye of the past, they don’t look forward to enjoying the eye in the future, and they practice for disillusionment, dispassion, and cessation regarding the eye in the present.
- 1.6 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind of the past and future is impermanent, let alone the present.
- 1.16 Seeing this, a learned noble disciple doesn’t worry about the mind of the past, they don’t look forward to enjoying the mind in the future, and they practice for disillusionment, dispassion, and cessation regarding the mind in the present.”

SN 35.8

The Interior as Suffering in the Three Times

Ajjhattadukkhātītānāgatasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, the eye of the past and future is suffering, let alone the present.

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple is not concerned with the 1.3
eye of the past, they don't look forward to enjoying the eye in the fu-
ture, and they practice for disillusionment, dispassion, and cessation
regarding the eye in the present. ...”

SN 35.9

The Interior as Not-Self in the Three Times

Ajjhattānattātītānāgatasutta

“Mendicants, the eye of the past and future is not-self, let alone the 1.1
present.

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple is not concerned with the 1.3
eye of the past, they don't look forward to enjoying the eye in the fu-
ture, and they practice for disillusionment, dispassion, and cessation
regarding the eye in the present. ...”

SN 35.10

The Exterior as Impermanent in the Three Times

Bāhirāniccātītānāgatasutta

“Mendicants, sights of the past and future are impermanent, let alone 1.1
the present. ...”

SN 35.11

The Exterior as Suffering in the Three Times

Bāhiradukkhātītānāgatasutta

“Mendicants, sights of the past and future are suffering, let alone the 1.1
present. ...”

SN 35.12

The Exterior as Not-Self in the Three Times

Bāhirānattātītānāgatasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, sights of the past and future are not-self, let alone the present. ...”

The Chapter on Pairs

SN 35.13

Before My Awakening (Interior)

Paṭhamapubbesambodhasutta

At Sāvattḥī.

1.1

“Mendicants, before my awakening—when I was still unawakened but intent on awakening—I thought: ‘What’s the gratification, the drawback, and the escape when it comes to the eye ... ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... and mind?’

Then it occurred to me: ‘The pleasure and happiness that arise from the eye: this is its gratification. That the eye is impermanent, suffering, and perishable: this is its drawback. Removing and giving up desire and greed for the eye: this is its escape.

1.9

The pleasure and happiness that arise from the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind: this is its gratification. That the mind is impermanent, suffering, and perishable: this is its drawback. Removing and giving up desire and greed for the mind: this is its escape.’

1.13

As long as I didn’t truly understand these six interior sense fields’ gratification, drawback, and escape in this way for what they are, I didn’t announce my supreme perfect awakening in this world with its gods, Māras, and divinities, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its gods and humans.

2.1

But when I did truly understand these six interior sense fields’ gratification, drawback, and escape in this way for what they are,

2.2

I announced my supreme perfect awakening in this world with its gods, Māras, and divinities, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its gods and humans.

- 2.3 Knowledge and vision arose in me: ‘My freedom is unshakable; this is my last rebirth; now there’ll be no more future lives.’”

SN 35.14

Before My Awakening (Exterior)

Dutiyapubbesambodhasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, before my awakening—when I was still unawakened but intent on awakening—I thought: ‘What’s the gratification, the drawback, and the escape when it comes to sights ... sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... and ideas?’ ...”

SN 35.15

In Search of Gratification (Interior)

Paṭhamaassādapariyesanasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I went in search of the eye’s gratification, and I found it. I’ve seen clearly with wisdom the full extent of the eye’s gratification. I went in search of the eye’s drawback, and I found it. I’ve seen clearly with wisdom the full extent of the eye’s drawback. I went in search of escape from the eye, and I found it. I’ve seen clearly with wisdom the full extent of escape from the eye.
- 1.10 I went in search of the ear’s ... nose’s ... tongue’s ... body’s ...⁵ mind’s gratification, and I found it. I’ve seen clearly with wisdom the full extent of the mind’s gratification. I went in search of the mind’s drawback, and I found it. I’ve seen clearly with wisdom the full extent of the mind’s drawback. I went in search of escape from

5. *kāya* omitted by mistake, presumably.

the mind, and I found it. I've seen clearly with wisdom the full extent of escape from the mind.

As long as I didn't truly understand these six interior sense fields' gratification, drawback, and escape for what they are, I didn't announce my supreme perfect awakening ...

But when I did truly understand ...

Knowledge and vision arose in me: 'My freedom is unshakable; this is my last rebirth; now there'll be no more future lives.'

SN 35.16

In Search of Gratification (Exterior)

Dutiyaassādapariyesanasutta

"Mendicants, I went in search of the gratification of sights, and I found it. ..."

SN 35.17

If There Were No Gratification (Interior)

Paṭhamanoceassādasutta

"Mendicants, if there were no gratification in the eye, sentient beings wouldn't be aroused by it. But since there is gratification in the eye, sentient beings are aroused by it. If the eye had no drawback, sentient beings wouldn't grow disillusioned with it. But since the eye has a drawback, sentient beings do grow disillusioned with it. If there were no escape from the eye, sentient beings wouldn't escape from it. But since there is an escape from the eye, sentient beings do escape from it.

If there were no gratification in the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, sentient beings wouldn't be aroused by it. But since there is gratification in the mind, sentient beings are aroused by it. If the mind had no drawback, sentient beings wouldn't grow disillusioned

with it. But since the mind has a drawback, sentient beings do grow disillusioned with it. If there were no escape from the mind, sentient beings wouldn't escape from it. But since there is an escape from the mind, sentient beings do escape from it.

2.1 As long as sentient beings don't truly understand these six interior sense fields' gratification, drawback, and escape for what they are, they haven't escaped from this world—with its gods, Māras, and divinities, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its gods and humans—and they don't live detached, liberated, with mind free of boundaries.

2.2 But when sentient beings truly understand these six interior sense fields' gratification, drawback, and escape for what they are, they've escaped from this world—with its gods, Māras, and divinities, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its gods and humans—and they live detached, liberated, with mind free of boundaries.”

SN 35.18

If There Were No Gratification (Exterior)

Dutiyañoceassādasutta

1.1 “Mendicants, if there were no gratification in sights, sentient beings wouldn't be aroused by them. ...”

SN 35.19

Taking Pleasure (Interior)

Paṭhamābhinandasutta

1.1 “Mendicants, if you take pleasure in the eye, you take pleasure in suffering. If you take pleasure in suffering, you're not free from suffering, I say.

If you take pleasure in the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 1.3
mind, you take pleasure in suffering. If you take pleasure in suffering,
you're not free from suffering, I say.

If you don't take pleasure in the eye, you don't take pleasure in 2.1
suffering. If you don't take pleasure in suffering, you're free from
suffering, I say.

If you don't take pleasure in the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 2.3
mind, you don't take pleasure in suffering. If you don't take pleasure
in suffering, you're free from suffering, I say."

SN 35.20

Taking Pleasure (Exterior)

Dutiyābhinandasutta

"Mendicants, if you take pleasure in sights, you take pleasure in suffer- 1.1
ing. If you take pleasure in suffering, you're not free from suffering, I
say. ..."

SN 35.21

The Arising of Suffering (Interior)

Paṭhamadukkhuppādasutta

"Mendicants, the arising, continuation, and manifestation and re- 1.1
generation of the eye is the arising of suffering, the continuation
of diseases, and the manifestation of old age and death. The aris-
ing, continuation, and manifestation and regeneration of the ear ...
nose ... tongue ... body ... and mind is the arising of suffering, the
continuation of diseases, and the manifestation of old age and death.

The cessation, settling, and disappearance of the eye is the ces- 2.1
sation of suffering, the settling of diseases, and the disappearance of
old age and death. The cessation, settling, and disappearance of the

ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind is the cessation of suffering, the settling of diseases, and the disappearance of old age and death.”

SN 35.22

The Arising of Suffering (Exterior)

Dutiyadukkhuppādasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, the arising, continuation, and manifestation and regeneration of sights is the arising of suffering, the continuation of diseases, and the manifestation of old age and death. The arising, continuation, and manifestation and regeneration of sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas is the arising of suffering, the continuation of diseases, and the manifestation of old age and death.
- 2.1 The cessation, settling, and disappearance of sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas is the cessation of suffering, the settling of diseases, and the disappearance of old age and death.”

The Chapter on the All

SN 35.23

All

Sabbasutta

At Sāvatthī.

1.1

“Mendicants, I will teach you the all.⁶ Listen ...

1.2

And what is the all? It’s just the eye and sights, the ear and sounds, the nose and smells, the tongue and tastes, the body and touches, and the mind and ideas. This is called the all.

1.4

Mendicants, suppose someone was to say:⁷ ‘I’ll deny this all and describe another all.’ They’d have no grounds for that claim, they’d be stumped by questions, and, in addition, they’d get frustrated. Why is that? Because they’re out of their element.”⁸

1.7

6. While most teaching templates are shared between the six senses and the aggregates, only the six senses are declared to be the “all”. This is because the six senses cover the entirety of experience, whereas the aggregates select the aspects most prominently grasped as self. For context, see SN 35.28 and notes.

7. The “someone” would be a philosopher of the Upaniṣads, for whom the metaphysical notion of “all” is crucial. The same phrasing is used of the rejection of the “duality” of the senses; see SN 35.92 and notes.

8. The brahmins of the Upaniṣads show off their rhetorical prowess through elevated debates. These debates, however, are exceedingly specialized, making sense only for those steeped in Vedic culture and ritual.

SN 35.24

Giving Up

Pahānasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you the principle for giving up the all. Listen ...
- 1.3 And what is the principle for giving up the all? The eye should be given up. Sights should be given up. Eye consciousness should be given up. Eye contact should be given up. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact should also be given up.
- 1.5 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind should be given up. Ideas should be given up. Mind consciousness should be given up. Mind contact should be given up. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact should be given up.
- 1.9 This is the principle for giving up the all.”

SN 35.25

Giving Up By Direct Knowledge and Complete Understanding

Abhiññāpariññāpahānasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you the principle for giving up the all by direct knowledge and complete understanding. Listen ...
- 1.3 And what is the principle for giving up the all by direct knowledge and complete understanding? The eye should be given up by direct knowledge and complete understanding. Sights should be given up by direct knowledge and complete understanding. Eye consciousness should be given up by direct knowledge and complete understanding. Eye contact should be given up by direct knowledge and complete understanding. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feel-

ing that arises dependent on eye contact should be given up by direct knowledge and complete understanding.

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind should be given up 1.5
by direct knowledge and complete understanding. Ideas should be given up by direct knowledge and complete understanding. Mind consciousness should be given up by direct knowledge and complete understanding. Mind contact should be given up by direct knowledge and complete understanding. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact should be given up by direct knowledge and complete understanding.

This is the principle for giving up the all by direct knowledge and 1.9
complete understanding.”

SN 35.26

Without Completely Understanding (1st)

Paṭhamaaparijānanasutta

“Mendicants, without directly knowing and completely understand- 1.1
ing the all, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can’t end suffering. And what is the all, without directly knowing and completely understanding which, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can’t end suffering?”⁹

Without directly knowing and completely understanding the eye, 1.3
without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can’t end suffering. Without directly knowing and completely understanding sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact ... painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can’t end suffering.

Without directly knowing and completely understanding the ear 1.8
... the nose ... the tongue ... the body ... the mind, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can’t end suffering. Without directly

9. MS edition omits *sabbam* by mistake; it is found in PTS and BJT editions, and is included in the mirror passage below (SN 35.26:2.2).

knowing and completely understanding ideas ... mind consciousness ... mind contact ... painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can't end suffering.

- 1.19 This is the all, without directly knowing and completely understanding which, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can't end suffering.
- 2.1 By directly knowing and completely understanding the all, having dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering. And what is the all, directly knowing and completely understanding which, having dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering?
- 2.3 By directly knowing and completely understanding the eye ... the ear ... the nose ... the tongue ... the body ... the mind, having dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering. By directly knowing and completely understanding ideas ... mind consciousness ... mind contact ... painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact, having dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering.
- 2.19 This is the all, directly knowing and completely understanding which, having dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering."

SN 35.27

Without Completely Understanding (2nd)

Dutiyaaparijānanasutta

- 1.1 "Mendicants, without directly knowing and completely understanding the all, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can't end suffering. And what is the all, without directly knowing and completely understanding which, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can't end suffering?

The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and things knowable by eye consciousness.¹⁰ 1.3

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 1.4

The mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and things knowable by mind consciousness. 1.6

This is the all, without directly knowing and completely understanding which, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can't end suffering. 1.7

By directly knowing and completely understanding the all, having dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering. And what is the all, directly knowing and completely understanding which, having dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering? 2.1

The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and things knowable by eye consciousness. 2.3

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 2.4

The mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and things knowable by mind consciousness. 2.6

This is the all, directly knowing and completely understanding which, having dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering.” 2.7

10. The phrase “eye, sights, eye consciousness, and things knowable by eye consciousness” appears redundant, as “sights” (*rūpa*) are precisely what is “knowable by eye consciousness”. Where the phrase occurs elsewhere, *rūpa* may appear (MN 112:10.2, SN 35.65:2.1, SN 35.68:1.3) or it may not (MN 144:9.1, SN 35.87:7.1). Bodhi summarizes the commentary’s explanations, which he describes as “contrived” (*Middle Length Discourses*, note 1080, and *Connected Discourses* note 12 on book 4). At least one Chinese parallel omits *rūpa* here, thus avoiding the redundancy (MA 187 at T i 732c19). It is likely the original passage did not include *rūpa* and it was added in an old editorial oversight.

SN 35.28

Burning

Ādittasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Gayā on Gayā Head together with a thousand mendicants.¹¹ There the Buddha addressed the mendicants:
- 1.3 “Mendicants, all is burning.¹² And what is the all that is burning?
- 1.5 The eye is burning. Sights are burning. Eye consciousness is burning. Eye contact is burning. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also burning. Burning with what?¹³ Burning with the fires of greed, hate, and delusion. Burning with rebirth, old age, and death, with sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress.¹⁴

11. This is the famous “third sermon”. After the Buddha’s awakening at Uruvelā, he went to Varanasi to teach the five mendicants (SN 56.11), then returned to Uruvelā, where he stayed with and ultimately converted a community of dreadlocked fire-worshipping ascetics led by three Kassapa brothers. The elaborate narrative prominently features the ascetics’ reverence for fire, over which the Buddha wielded mastery. They took ordination, then he taught this discourse (Kd 1:15.1.1).

12. The Buddha starts with the uncommon term *āditta*, which refers to a current state (“is burning”, “has been set on fire”), avoiding the use of *aggi* (Sanskrit *agni*), which would evoke the deity of that name. | References to *agni*, to *sarva* (“all”), and to Agni as all, are legion in Vedic texts. Since all sacrifices are Agni (4.5.1.13), Agni is all the gods (1.6.2.8, 3.1.3.1, 3.4.1.19, 4.6.3.2), or is the Self of all the gods (14.3.2.5). Fire consumes all, so all food is of Agni (10.1.4.13). But the direct inspiration for this discourse is probably the famous “Honey Lore”. Situated just after the revelation that the true Self is infinite consciousness, this passage identifies all aspects of being, including fire, as “honey”, since they partake of the immortal, the divine, and the “all” (Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.5). Likewise, after his teaching that the aggregates, including all forms of consciousness, are “not self” (SN 22.59), the Buddha inverts the message of the Honey Lore, pointing out that “all” we experience is on fire.

13. Or perhaps, “Set on fire by what?”

14. These “three fires” are also at AN 7.47 and Iti 93. | Only after establishing that the senses are “burning” does the Buddha complete his inversion of Vedic values: it is fire itself which, far from being a benevolent deity, is aflame with

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 1.8

The mind is burning. Ideas are burning. Mind consciousness is burning. Mind contact is burning. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also burning. Burning with what? Burning with the fires of greed, hate, and delusion. Burning with rebirth, old age, and death, with sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress, I say. 1.11

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact. 1.14

They grow disillusioned with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact. 1.15

Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they're freed. When they're freed, they know they're freed. 1.16

They understand: 'Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.'" 1.17

That is what the Buddha said. Satisfied, the mendicants approved what the Buddha said. And while this discourse was being spoken, the minds of the thousand mendicants were freed from defilements by not grasping. 2.1

greed, hate, and delusion. This had to wait until the Buddha was sure in his students, for it has the unpalatable implication that the god himself is subject to such flaws. After all, the ritual is performed with verses of desire (*chandās*) in order to secure worldly prosperity (Sn̐ 1.2) or an eternity in heaven (SN 42.6:2.1); it is carried out by means of sacrificial violence (MN 51:10.7, AN 4.39, SN 3.9); and it is based on a delusional way of seeing the world, the blind leading the blind (MN 95:13.23).

SN 35.29

Overcome

Addhabhūtasutta

- 1.1 SO I HAVE HEARD. At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the squirrels' feeding ground. There the Buddha addressed the mendicants:
- 1.4 "Mendicants, all is overcome.¹⁵ And what is the all that is overcome?
- 1.6 The eye is overcome. Sight is overcome. Eye consciousness is overcome. Eye contact is overcome. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also overcome. Overcome by what? Overcome by the fires of greed, hate, and delusion. Overcome by rebirth, old age, and death, by sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress, I say.
- 1.9 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is overcome. Ideas are overcome. Mind consciousness is overcome. Mind contact is overcome. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises conditioned by mind contact is also overcome. Overcome by what? Overcome by greed, hate, and delusion. Overcome by rebirth, old age, and death, by sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress, I say.
- 1.16 Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact.
- 1.17 They grow disillusioned with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they're freed. When they're freed, they know they're freed.

15. Here "overcome" (*addhabhūta*), like *āditṭa* in the previous discourse, is a term for suffering (see MN 101:23.2).

They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has 1.19
been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing
further for this place.’”

SN 35.30

The Practice Fit for Uprooting

Samugghātasārūppasutta

“Mendicants, I will teach you the practice fit for uprooting all con- 1.1
ceiving.¹⁶ Listen and apply your mind well, I will speak. ...

And what is the practice fit for uprooting all conceiving? 1.3

It’s when a mendicant does not conceive anything to be the eye, 1.4
does not conceive it in the eye, does not conceive it as the eye, and
does not conceive that ‘the eye is mine.’ They don’t conceive anything
to be sights, they don’t conceive it in sights, they don’t conceive it
as sights, and they don’t conceive that ‘sights are mine.’ They don’t
conceive eye consciousness ... eye contact ... They don’t conceive
anything to be the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises
dependent on eye contact. They don’t conceive it in that, they don’t
conceive it as that, and they don’t conceive that ‘that is mine.’

They don’t conceive anything to be the ear ... nose ... tongue ... 1.9
body ... mind ... They don’t conceive anything to be the pleasant,
painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact.
They don’t conceive it in that, they don’t conceive it as that, and they
don’t conceive that ‘that is mine.’

They don’t conceive anything to be all, they don’t conceive it in 1.19
all, they don’t conceive it as all, and they don’t conceive that ‘all is
mine.’ Not conceiving, they don’t grasp at anything in the world. Not
grasping, they’re not anxious. Not being anxious, they personally
become extinguished.

16. “Conceiving” is thinking in terms of self. This is discussed in detail in MN 1,
the phrasing of which is echoed here.

1.22 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’

1.23 This is the practice fit for uprooting all conceiving.”

SN 35.31

The Practice Conducive to Uprooting (1st)

Paṭhamasamugghātasappāyasutta

1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you the practice that’s conducive to uprooting all conceiving.¹⁷ Listen ...

1.3 And what is the practice that’s conducive to uprooting all conceiving? It’s when a mendicant does not conceive anything to be the eye, does not conceive it in the eye, does not conceive it as the eye, and does not conceive that ‘the eye is mine.’ They don’t conceive anything to be sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact. And they don’t conceive anything to be the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact. They don’t conceive it in that, they don’t conceive it as that, and they don’t conceive that ‘that is mine.’

1.7 For whatever you conceive it to be, whatever you conceive it in, whatever you conceive it as, and whatever you conceive to be ‘mine’: that becomes something else. The world is attached to being, taking pleasure only in being, yet it becomes something else.¹⁸

1.9 They don’t conceive anything to be the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... They don’t conceive anything to be the pleasant,

17. “Conducive to” (*sappāya*) is a synonym of “fit for” (*sāruppa*) in the previous discourse.

18. *Bhava* means “existence” or “being”, not “becoming”. Those who are “attached to being” are not attached to “becoming” something else; that would be *vibhavataṇhā*, “craving for nonexistence”. They are attached to a state of eternal existence, to continuing to exist in another life (*bhavataṇhā*). They conceive this to be an eternal self, but their conceiving is ultimately derived from sense experience, which is always changing.

painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact. They don't conceive it in that, they don't conceive it as that, and they don't conceive that 'that is mine.'

For whatever you conceive it to be, whatever you conceive it in, 1.19
whatever you conceive it as, and whatever you conceive to be 'mine':
that becomes something else. The world is attached to being, taking
pleasure only in being, yet it becomes something else.

As far as the aggregates, elements, and sense fields extend, they 1.21
don't conceive anything to be that, they don't conceive it in that,
they don't conceive it as that, and they don't conceive that 'that is
mine.' Not conceiving, they don't grasp at anything in the world. Not
grasping, they're not anxious. Not being anxious, they personally
become extinguished.

They understand: 'Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has 1.24
been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing
further for this place.'

This is the practice that's conducive to uprooting all conceiving." 1.25

SN 35.32

The Practice Conducive to Uprooting (2nd)

Dutiyasamugghātasappāyasutta

"Mendicants, I will teach you the practice that's conducive to uproot- 1.1
ing all conceiving. Listen ...

And what is the practice that's conducive to uprooting all conceiv- 1.3
ing?

What do you think, mendicants? Is the eye permanent or imper- 2.1
manent?"

"Impermanent, sir." 3.1

"But if it's impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?" 4.1

"Suffering, sir." 5.1

"But if it's impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be 6.1
regarded thus: 'This is mine, I am this, this is my self'?"

- 7.1 “No, sir.”
- 8.1 “Are sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact ...
- 10.1 The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact: is that permanent or impermanent?”
- 11.1 “Impermanent, sir.”
- 12.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 13.1 “Suffering, sir.”
- 14.1 “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”
- 15.1 “No, sir.” ...
- 16.1 “Is the ear ... nose ... tongue ...
- 20.1 body ... mind ...
- 22.1 The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact: is that permanent or impermanent?”
- 23.1 “Impermanent, sir.”
- 24.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 25.1 “Suffering, sir.”
- 26.1 “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”
- 27.1 “No, sir.”
- 28.1 “Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact.
- 28.3 They grow disillusioned with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... They grow disillusioned with the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact.
- 28.6 Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed.
- 28.7 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is noth-

ing further for this place.’ This is the practice that’s conducive to uprooting all conceiving.”

The Chapter on Liable to Be Reborn

SN 35.33–42

Ten on Liable to Be Reborn, Etc.

Jātidhammāsutta

- 1.1 At Sāvatthī.
- 1.3 “Mendicants, all is liable to be reborn. And what is the all that is liable to be reborn? The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are liable to be reborn. And the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also liable to be reborn.
- 1.10 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... The mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact are liable to be reborn. And the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also liable to be reborn.
- 1.18 Seeing this a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’”
 - 1.1 “Mendicants, all is liable to grow old. ...”
 - 1.1 “Mendicants, all is liable to fall sick. ...”
 - 1.1 “Mendicants, all is liable to die. ...”
 - 1.1 “Mendicants, all is liable to sorrow. ...”
 - 1.1 “Mendicants, all is liable to corruption. ...”
 - 1.1 “Mendicants, all is liable to end. ...”
 - 1.1 “Mendicants, all is liable to fall. ...”

“Mendicants, all is liable to originate. ...”	1.1
“Mendicants, all is liable to cease. ...”	1.1

The Chapter on All is Impermanent

SN 35.43–51

Nine on Impermanence, Etc.

Aniccādisuttanavaka

1.1 At Sāvatthī.

1.3 “Mendicants, all is impermanent. And what is the all that is impermanent? The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are impermanent. And the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also impermanent.

1.7 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... The mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact are impermanent. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also impermanent.

1.12 Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned ...

1.17 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’”

1.1 “Mendicants, all is suffering. ...”

1.1 “Mendicants, all is not-self. ...”

1.1 “Mendicants, all is to be directly known. ...”

1.1 “Mendicants, all is to be completely understood. ...”

1.1 “Mendicants, all is to be given up. ...”

“Mendicants, all is to be realized. . .” 1.1

“Mendicants, all is to be directly known and completely understood. . .” 1.1

“Mendicants, all is harried. . .” 1.1

SN 35.52

Contaminated

Upassatṭhasutta

“Mendicants, all is contaminated.¹⁹ And what is the all that is contaminated? The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are contaminated. And the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises conditioned by eye contact is also contaminated. 1.1

The ear . . . nose . . . tongue . . . body . . . 1.5

The mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact are contaminated. And the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises conditioned by mind contact is also contaminated. 1.8

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned . . . 1.10

They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’” 1.15

19. The root sense of *upassatṭha* (“contaminated”) is something that has been poured upon, or on which something has been let loose (AN 5.192:8.2). Cf. Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 1.3.6: “They contaminated (*upāsrjan*) those gods with evil”, the evil being “unfit” (*apratirūpaṃ*) sights, sounds, etc.

THE SECOND FIFTY

The Chapter on Ignorance

SN 35.53

Giving Up Ignorance

Avijjāpahānasutta

At Sāvattthī.

1.1

Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him: 1.2

“Sir, how does one know and see so as to give up ignorance and give rise to knowledge?” 1.3

“Mendicant, knowing and seeing the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact as impermanent, ignorance is given up and knowledge arises. And also knowing and seeing the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact as impermanent, ignorance is given up and knowledge arises. 2.1

Knowing and seeing the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 2.6

Knowing and seeing the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact as impermanent, ignorance is given up and knowledge arises. And also knowing and seeing the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact as impermanent, ignorance is given up and knowledge arises. 2.10

That’s how to know and see so as to give up ignorance and give rise to knowledge.” 2.15

SN 35.54

Giving Up Fetters

Samyojanappahānasutta

- 1.1 “Sir, how does one know and see so that the fetters are given up?”²⁰
- 1.2 “Mendicant, knowing and seeing the eye as impermanent, the fetters are given up ...”

SN 35.55

Uprooting the Fetters

Samyojanasamugghātasutta

- 1.1 “Sir, how does one know and see so that the fetters are uprooted?”
- 1.2 “Mendicant, knowing and seeing the eye as not-self, the fetters are uprooted ...”²¹

SN 35.56

Giving Up Defilements

Āsavapahānasutta

- 1.1 “Sir, how does one know and see so that the defilements are given up?”
...²²

20. The five lower (SN 45.179) and higher (SN 45.180) fetters.

21. Throughout this section, only *anicca* and *anattā* are mentioned. Parallel passages with *dukkha* may have been lost to abbreviation. Each of the characteristics includes the others, but they are taught according to the inclination of the meditator.

22. The “defilements” (*āsava*) are listed at SN 45.163.

SN 35.57

Uprooting Defilements

Āsavaśamugghātasutta

“Sir, how does one know and see so that the defilements are uprooted?” 1.1

...

SN 35.58

Giving Up Tendencies

Anusayapahānasutta

“Sir, how does one know and see so that the underlying tendencies 1.1
are given up?” ...²³

SN 35.59

Uprooting Tendencies

Anusayasamugghātasutta

“Sir, how does one know and see so that the underlying tendencies 1.1
are uprooted?” ...

SN 35.60

The Complete Understanding of All Grasping

Sabbupādānapariññāsutta

“Mendicants, I will teach you the principle for the complete under- 1.1
standing of all grasping.²⁴ Listen ...

And what is the principle for the complete understanding of all 1.3
grasping?

23. The “underlying tendencies” (*anusaya*) are enumerated at SN 45.175.

24. The four kinds of grasping are listed at SN 12.2:6.3.

- 1.4 Eye consciousness arises dependent on the eye and sights. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling.
- 1.6 Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, eye contact, and feeling. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they're freed. When they are liberated, they understand: 'I have completely understood grasping.'
- 1.8 Ear consciousness arises dependent on the ear and sounds. ...
- 1.9 Nose consciousness arises dependent on the nose and smells. ...
- 1.10 Tongue consciousness arises dependent on the tongue and tastes. ...
- 1.11 Body consciousness arises dependent on the body and touches. ...
- 1.12 Mind consciousness arises dependent on the mind and ideas. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling.
- 1.14 Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, mind contact, and feeling. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they're freed. When they are liberated, they understand: 'I have completely understood grasping.'
- 1.16 This is the principle for the complete understanding of all grasping."

SN 35.61

The Depletion of All Fuel for Grasping (1st)

Paṭhamasabbupādānapariyādānasutta

- 1.1 "Mendicants, I will teach you the principle for depleting all fuel for grasping.²⁵ Listen ...
- 1.3 And what is the principle for depleting all fuel for grasping?

25. *Upādāna* has the primary meaning of "grasping", and secondarily "fuel" (SN 12.52). Here the usage with *pariyādāna* ("depletion") shows the metaphor of "fuel" is active; you can't "deplete grasping".

Eye consciousness arises dependent on the eye and sights. The 1.4
meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling.

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the 1.6
eye, sights, eye consciousness, eye contact, and feeling. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they're freed. When they are liberated, they understand: 'I have completely depleted fuel for grasping.'

Ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 1.8

Mind consciousness arises dependent on the mind and ideas. The 1.9
meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling.

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the 1.11
mind, ideas, mind consciousness, mind contact, and feeling. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they're freed. When they are liberated, they understand: 'I have completely depleted fuel for grasping.'

'This is the principle for depleting all fuel for grasping.' 1.13

SN 35.62

The Depletion of All Fuel for Grasping (2nd)

Dutiyasabbupādānapariyādānasutta

"Mendicants, I will teach you the principle for depleting all fuel for 1.1
grasping. Listen ...

And what is the principle for depleting all fuel for grasping? 1.3

What do you think, mendicants? Is the eye permanent or imper- 2.1
manent?"

"Impermanent, sir." 3.1

"But if it's impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?" 4.1

"Suffering, sir." 5.1

"But if it's impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be 6.1
regarded thus: 'This is mine, I am this, this is my self'?"

"No, sir." 7.1

"Sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact ... 8.1

- 12.1 The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact: is that permanent or impermanent?”
- 13.1 “Impermanent, sir.” ...
- 14.1 “Ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... ideas ... mind consciousness ... mind contact ... The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact: is that permanent or impermanent?”
- 15.1 “Impermanent, sir.”
- 16.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 17.1 “Suffering, sir.”
- 18.1 “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self?’”
- 19.1 “No, sir.”
- 20.1 “Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact.
- 20.3 They grow disillusioned with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ...
- 20.4 They grow disillusioned with the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed.
- 20.7 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’
- 20.8 This is the principle for depleting all fuel for grasping.”

The Chapter with Migajāla

SN 35.63

With Migajāla (1st)

Paṭhamamigajālasutta

At Sāvattthī.

1.1

Then Venerable Migajāla went up to the Buddha ...²⁶ and said to him: 1.2

“Sir, they speak of one who lives alone.²⁷ How is one who lives alone defined? And how is living with a partner defined?”²⁸ 1.4

“Migajāla, there are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, this gives rise to relishing. When there’s relishing there’s lust. When there’s lust there is yoking. A mendicant who is fettered by relishing is said to live with a partner. 2.1

There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... 2.7

There are ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing.²⁹ If a mendicant approves, 2.8

26. Migajāla’s verses are at Thag 6.8.

27. “One who lives alone” (*ekavihārī*) is also mentioned at SN 21.10:1.5 and Thag 10.2.

28. “Partner” is *dutiya* (“second”), a companion or spouse.

29. MS omits *mano* here in error. It is included in the following round in this Sutta, and in both rounds of the next Sutta. *Mano* is found in the PTS and BJT editions, which I follow here.

welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, this gives rise to relishing. When there's relishing there's lust. When there's lust there is yoking. A mendicant who is fettered by relishing is said to live with a partner.

2.14 A mendicant who lives like this is said to live with a partner, even if they frequent remote lodgings in the wilderness and the forest that are quiet and still, far from the madding crowd, remote from human settlements, and fit for retreat. Why is that? For craving is their partner, and they haven't given it up. That's why they're said to live with a partner.

3.1 There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, relishing ceases. When there's no relishing there's no lust. When there's no lust there's no yoking. A mendicant who is not fettered by relishing is said to live alone.

3.7 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ...

3.8 There are ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, relishing ceases. When there's no relishing there's no lust. When there's no lust there's no yoking.

3.13 A mendicant who is not fettered by relishing is said to live alone. A mendicant who lives like this is said to live alone, even if they live within a village crowded by monks, nuns, laymen, and laywomen; by rulers and their chief ministers, and monastics of other religions and their disciples. Why is that? For craving is their partner, and they have given it up. That's why they're said to live alone."

SN 35.64

With Migajāla (2nd)

Dutiya migajālasutta

1.1 Then Venerable Migajāla went up to the Buddha ... and said to him:

“Sir, may the Buddha please teach me Dhamma in brief. When I’ve heard it, I’ll live alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute.”³⁰ 1.3

“Migajāla, there are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keep clinging to them, this gives rise to relishing. Relishing is the origin of suffering, I say. 2.1

There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, this gives rise to relishing. Relishing is the origin of suffering, I say. 2.5

There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn’t approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, relishing ceases. When relishing ceases, suffering ceases, I say. 3.1

There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn’t approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, relishing ceases. When relishing ceases, suffering ceases, I say.” 3.4

And then Venerable Migajāla approved and agreed with what the Buddha said. He got up from his seat, bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on his right, before leaving. 4.1

Then Migajāla, living alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute, soon realized the supreme culmination of the spiritual path in this very life. He lived having achieved with his own insight the goal for which gentlemen rightly go forth from the lay life to homelessness. 4.2

30. Despite the Buddha’s reservations in the previous discourse, it is normal for mendicants to withdraw into retreat for dedicated practice. Here, it seems, Migajāla determines to practice living alone in both ways, as he was taught in the previous Sutta.

- 4.3 He understood: “Rebirth is ended; the spiritual journey has been completed; what had to be done has been done; there is nothing further for this place.” And Migajāla became one of the perfected.

SN 35.65

Samiddhi’s Question About Māra

Paṭhamasamiddhimārapañhāsutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the squirrels’ feeding ground. Then Venerable Samiddhi went up to the Buddha . . .³¹ and said to him:
- 1.4 “Sir, they speak of this thing called ‘Māra.’ How do we define Māra or what is known as Māra?”³²
- 2.1 “Samiddhi, where there is the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and things knowable by eye consciousness, there is Māra or what is known as Māra.
- 2.2 Where there is the ear, sounds, ear consciousness, and things knowable by ear consciousness, there is Māra or what is known as Māra.
- 2.3 Where there is the nose, smells, nose consciousness, and things knowable by nose consciousness, there is Māra or what is known as Māra.
- 2.4 Where there is the tongue, tastes, tongue consciousness, and things knowable by tongue consciousness, there is Māra or what is known as Māra.
- 2.5 Where there is the body, touches, body consciousness, and things knowable by body consciousness, there is Māra or what is known as Māra.
- 2.6 Where there is the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and things knowable by mind consciousness, there is Māra or what is known as Māra.

31. For Samiddhi, see note on SN 1.20:1.3.

32. This phrasing is distinctive of this series of discourses (up to SN 35.68).

Where there is no eye, no sights, no eye consciousness, and no 3.1
things knowable by eye consciousness, there is no Māra or what is
known as Māra.

Where there is no ear ... no nose ... no tongue ... no body ... 3.2

Where there is no mind, no ideas, no mind consciousness, and no 3.6
things knowable by mind consciousness, there is no Māra or what is
known as Māra.”

SN 35.66

Samiddhi's Question About a Sentient Being

Samiddhisattapañhāsutta

“Sir, they speak of this thing called a ‘sentient being’. How do we 1.1
define a sentient being or what is known as a sentient being?” ...

SN 35.67

Samiddhi's Question About Suffering

Samiddhidukkhapañhāsutta

“Sir, they speak of this thing called ‘suffering’. How do we define 1.1
suffering or what is known as suffering?” ...

SN 35.68

Samiddhi's Question About the World

Samiddhilokapañhāsutta

“Sir, they speak of this thing called ‘the world’. How do we define the 1.1
world or what is known as the world?”³³

33. The parallel at SA 230 has, “As for the world, why is it called the world?”
(世間者，云何名世。

- 1.3 “Samiddhi, where there is the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and things knowable by eye consciousness, there is the world or what is known as the world. Where there is the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... Where there is the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and things knowable by mind consciousness, there is the world or what is known as the world.
- 2.1 Where there is no eye, no sights, no eye consciousness, and no things knowable by eye consciousness, there is no world or what is known as the world. Where there is no ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... Where there is no mind, no ideas, no mind consciousness, and no things knowable by mind consciousness, there is no world or what is known as the world.”

SN 35.69

Upasena and the Viper

Upasenaāśīvisasutta

- 1.1 At one time the venerables Sāriputta and Upasena were staying near Rājagaha in the Cool Grove, under the Cobra’s Hood Grotto.³⁴ Now at that time a viper fell on Upasena’s body. He addressed the mendicants, “Come, reverends, lift this body onto a cot and carry it outside³⁵ before it’s scattered right here like a handful of hay.”
- 2.1 When he said this, Sāriputta said to him, “But we don’t see any impairment in your body or deterioration of your faculties. Yet you

34. The commentary says this was Upasena son of Vaṅgantā, Sāriputta’s younger brother. When newly ordained, he made the mistake of ordaining students too early (Kd 1:31.3.2), but later developed an impressive following (Bu NP 15:1.1.9), leading the Buddha to declare him the foremost of those who were “impressive all around” (AN 1.213). His song of triumph is recorded at Ud 4.9, while his verses at Thag 10.6 focus on contentment and humility.

35. This illustrates the difference between *bāhira* (“exterior”) and *bahiddha* (“external, outside”). *Bāhira* is the outside of an organism or a single thing (such as an altar), whereas *bahiddha* is something outside a point of reference or removed past a boundary. That is, interior/exterior are two aspects of a single thing, whereas inside/outside are two distinct things.

say: ‘Come, reverends, lift this body onto a cot and carry it outside before it’s scattered right here like a handful of hay.’”

“Reverend Sāriputta, there may be an impairment in body or 2.7
deterioration of faculties for someone who thinks: ‘I am the eye’ or
‘the eye is mine.’ Or ‘I am the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ...’ Or
‘I am the mind’ or ‘the mind is mine.’

But I don’t think like that. So why would there be an impairment 2.12
in my body or deterioration of my faculties?”

“That must be because Venerable Upasena has long ago totally 3.1
eradicated I-making, mine-making, and the underlying tendency to
conceit.

That’s why it doesn’t occur to you: ‘I am the eye’ or ‘the eye is 3.2
mine.’ Or ‘I am the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ...’ Or ‘I am the
mind’ or ‘the mind is mine.’”

Then those mendicants lifted Upasena’s body onto a cot and car- 3.6
ried it outside. And his body was scattered right there like a handful
of hay.

SN 35.70

Upavāṇa on What is Apparent in the Present Life

Upavāṇasandiṭṭhikasutta

Then Venerable Upavāṇa went up to the Buddha ...³⁶ and said to 1.1
him:

“Sir, they speak of ‘a teaching apparent in the present life.’³⁷ In 1.3
what way is the teaching apparent in the present life, immediately
effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can
know it for themselves?”

36. For Upavāṇa, see SN 7.13:1.3.

37. “Apparent in this very life” (*sandiṭṭhika*) is one of the fundamental characteristics of the Dhamma, which are recited in the Pali *itipi so* formula to this day.

- 2.1 “Upavāṇa, take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. They experience both the sight and the desire for the sight. There is desire for sights in them, and they understand that. Since this is so, this is how the teaching is apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.
- 3.1 Next, take a mendicant who hears ... smells ... tastes ... touches ...
- 4.1 Next, take a mendicant who knows an idea with their mind. They experience both the idea and the desire for the idea. There is desire for ideas in them, and they understand that. Since this is so, this is how the teaching is apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.
- 5.1 Take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. They experience the sight but no desire for the sight. There is no desire for sights in them, and they understand that. Since this is so, this is how the teaching is apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.
- 6.1 Next, take a mendicant who hears ... smells ... tastes ... touches ...
- 7.1 Next, take a mendicant who knows an idea with their mind. They experience the idea but no desire for the idea. There is no desire for ideas in them, and they understand that. Since this is so, this is how the teaching is apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.”

SN 35.71

Six Fields of Contact (1st)

Paṭhamachaphassāyatanasutta

“Mendicants, anyone who doesn’t truly understand the six fields of contact’s origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape has not completed the spiritual journey and is far from this teaching and training.” 1.1

When he said this, one of the mendicants said to the Buddha, 2.1
 “Here, sir, I’m discouraged.³⁸ For I don’t truly understand the six fields of contact’s origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape.”

“What do you think, mendicant? Do you regard the eye like this: 3.1
 ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”

“No, sir.” 4.1

“Good, mendicant! And regarding the eye, you will truly see 5.1
 clearly with right wisdom that: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’³⁹ Just this is the end of suffering.

Do you regard the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 5.3

Do you regard the mind like this: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is 7.1
 my self’?”

“No, sir.” 8.1

“Good, mendicant! And regarding the mind, you will truly see 9.1
 clearly with right wisdom that: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’ Just this is the end of suffering.”

38. Commentary traces *anassasam* (variant *anassāsim*) to $\sqrt{nas}$ (perish), which Digital Pali Dictionary rejects as “unviable”. It is, rather, the present participle of *na assasati*, “discouraged, unconsolated”.

39. The Buddha encourages with the future tense, rather than the optative “should”. This is an example of his knowledge of where all paths leads.

SN 35.72

Six Fields of Contact (2nd)

Dutiyaachaphassāyatanasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, anyone who doesn’t truly understand the six fields of contact’s origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape has not completed the spiritual journey and is far from this teaching and training.”
- 2.1 When he said this, one of the mendicants said to the Buddha, “Here, sir, I’m discouraged, really discouraged. For I don’t truly understand the six fields of contact’s origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape.”
- 3.1 “What do you think, mendicant? Do you regard the eye like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self’?”
- 4.1 “Yes, sir.”
- 5.1 “Good, mendicant! And regarding the eye, you will truly see clearly with right wisdom that: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’ In this way you will give up the first field of contact, so that there are no more future lives.
- 6.1 Do you regard the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ...
- 9.1 Do you regard the mind like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self’?”
- 10.1 “Yes, sir.”
- 11.1 “Good, mendicant! And regarding the mind, you will truly see clearly with right wisdom that: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’ In this way you will give up the sixth field of contact, so that there are no more future lives.”

SN 35.73

Six Fields of Contact (3rd)

Tatīyachaphassāyatana-sutta

“Mendicants, anyone who doesn’t truly understand the six fields of contact’s origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape has not completed the spiritual journey and is far from this teaching and training.” 1.1

When he said this, one of the mendicants said to the Buddha, 2.1
 “Here, sir, I’m discouraged, really discouraged. For I don’t truly understand the six fields of contact’s origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape.”

“What do you think, mendicant? Is the eye permanent or impermanent?” 3.1

“Impermanent, sir.” 4.1

“But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 5.1

“Suffering, sir.” 6.1

“But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?” 7.1

“No, sir.” 8.1

“Is the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind permanent or impermanent?” 9.1

“Impermanent, sir.” 10.1

“But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 11.1

“Suffering, sir.” 12.1

“But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?” 13.1

“No, sir.” 14.1

“Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed. 15.1

- 15.3 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’”

The Chapter on Sick

SN 35.74

Sick (1st)

Paṭhamagilānasutta

At Sāvattḥī.

1.1

Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha, and said to him, “Sir, 1.2
in such-and-such monastery there’s a mendicant who is junior and
not well-known. He’s sick, suffering, gravely ill. Please go to him out
of sympathy.”

When the Buddha heard that the mendicant was junior and ill, 2.1
understanding that he was not well-known, he went to him. That
mendicant saw the Buddha coming off in the distance and stirred in
his cot.

The Buddha said to that monk, “It’s all right, mendicant, don’t get 2.4
up. There are some seats spread out, I will sit there.”

He sat down on the seat spread out and said to the mendicant, “I 2.7
hope you’re keeping well, mendicant, I hope you’re all right. I hope
your pain is fading, not growing; that its fading is evident, not its
growing.”

“Sir, I’m not keeping well, I’m not getting by. My pain is terrible 3.1
and growing, not fading; its growing is evident, not its fading.”

“I hope you don’t have any remorse or regret?” 4.1

“Indeed, sir, I have no little remorse and regret.” 5.1

- 6.1 “I hope you have no reason to blame yourself when it comes to ethical conduct?”
- 7.1 “No sir, I have no reason to blame myself when it comes to ethical conduct.”
- 8.1 “In that case, mendicant, why do you have remorse and regret?”
- 9.1 “Because I understand that the Buddha has not taught the Dhamma merely for the sake of ethical purity.”
- 10.1 “If that is so, what then do you understand to be the purpose of teaching the Dhamma?”
- 11.1 “I understand that the Buddha has taught the Dhamma for the purpose of the fading away of greed.”⁴⁰
- 12.1 “Good, good, mendicant! It’s good that you understand that I’ve taught the Dhamma for the purpose of the fading away of greed. For that is indeed the purpose. What do you think, mendicant? Is the eye permanent or impermanent?”
- 13.1 “Impermanent, sir.” ...
- 14.1 “Is the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind permanent or impermanent?”
- 15.1 “Impermanent, sir.”
- 16.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 17.1 “Suffering, sir.”
- 18.1 “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”
- 19.1 “No, sir.”
- 20.1 “Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed.

40. The expression *rāgavirāga* plays on two senses of the word. The root sense of *rāga* is “dye” or “color”, especially red (cf. *rajaka*, MN 56:27.14). From there it took on the sense “greed, lust, passion” which dominates in Pali. Thus *rāgavirāga* is both the “fading of color” and the “dispassion of passion”. It is a term for the quelling of harmful emotions (AN 2.31).

They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended ... there is nothing further 20.3
for this place.’”

That is what the Buddha said. Satisfied, that mendicant approved 21.1
what the Buddha said. And while this discourse was being spoken,
the stainless, immaculate vision of the Dhamma arose in that mendi-
cant:

“Everything that is liable to arise is liable to cease.” 21.4

SN 35.75

Sick (2nd)

Dutiyagilānasutta

Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha ... and asked him, “Sir, in 1.1
such-and-such monastery there’s a mendicant who is junior and not
well-known. He’s sick, suffering, gravely ill. Please go to him out of
sympathy.”

When the Buddha heard that the mendicant was junior and ill, 2.1
understanding that he was not well-known, he went to him. That
mendicant saw the Buddha coming off in the distance and stirred in
his cot.

Then the Buddha said to that monk, “It’s all right, mendicant, 2.4
don’t get up. There are some seats spread out, I will sit there.”

He sat down on the seat spread out and said to the mendicant, “I 2.7
hope you’re keeping well, mendicant, I hope you’re all right. I hope
your pain is fading, not growing; that its fading is evident, not its
growing.”

“Sir, I’m not keeping well, I’m not getting by. ... 3.1

I have no reason to blame myself when it comes to ethical con- 3.2
duct.”

“In that case, mendicant, why do you have remorse and regret?” 4.1

“Because I understand that the Buddha has not taught the 5.1
Dhamma merely for the sake of ethical purity.”

- 6.1 “If that is so, what then do you understand to be the goal of teaching the Dhamma?”
- 7.1 “I understand that the Buddha has taught the Dhamma for the goal of complete extinguishment without grasping fuel.”⁴¹
- 8.1 “Good, good, mendicant! It’s good that you understand that I’ve taught the Dhamma for the goal of complete extinguishment with no fuel for grasping. For that is indeed the goal.
- 9.1 What do you think, mendicant? Is the eye permanent or impermanent?”
- 10.1 “Impermanent, sir.” ...
- 11.1 “Is the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... mind consciousness ... mind contact ... The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact: is that permanent or impermanent?”
- 12.1 “Impermanent, sir.”
- 13.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 14.1 “Suffering, sir.”
- 15.1 “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”
- 16.1 “No, sir.”
- 17.1 “Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye ... ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... mind consciousness ... mind contact ... They grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed.
- 17.7 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’”

41. Here both sides of the *upādāna* metaphor are alive: Nibbāna is the freedom of letting go all grasping at attachments; and it is the extinguishment of fuel that ignites the fire of suffering.

That is what the Buddha said. Satisfied, that mendicant approved 18.1
 what the Buddha said. And while this discourse was being spoken,
 the mind of that mendicant was freed from defilements by not grasp-
 ing.

SN 35.76

With Rādhā on Impermanence

Rādhaaniccasutta

Then Venerable Rādhā went up to the Buddha ... and said to him, 1.1
 “Sir, may the Buddha please teach me Dhamma in brief. When I’ve
 heard it, I’ll live alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute.”

“Rādhā, you should give up desire for what is impermanent. And 1.4
 what is impermanent?⁴² The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and
 eye contact are impermanent. And the pleasant, painful, or neutral
 feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also impermanent.
 You should give up desire for it.

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... The mind, ideas, mind 1.9
 consciousness, and mind contact are impermanent. And the pleas-
 ant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact
 is also impermanent. You should give up desire for it.

You should give up desire for what is impermanent.” 1.16

SN 35.77

With Rādhā on Suffering

Rādhadukkhasutta

“Rādhā, you should give up desire for what is suffering. ...” 1.1

42. The following discourses have a brief question at this point, whereas the MS edition repeats the phrase “you should give up desire”. I follow the shorter version, found here in PTS and Bodhi.

SN 35.78

With Rādhā on Not-Self

Rādhaanattasutta

- 1.1 “Rādhā, you should give up desire for what is not-self. ...”

SN 35.79

Giving Up Ignorance (1st)

Paṭhamaavijjāpahānasutta

- 1.1 Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha ... and said to him:
- 1.3 “Sir, is there one thing such that by giving it up a mendicant gives up ignorance and gives rise to knowledge?”
- 2.1 “There is, mendicant.”
- 3.1 “But what is that one thing?”
- 4.1 “Ignorance is one thing such that by giving it up a mendicant gives up ignorance and gives rise to knowledge.”⁴³
- 5.1 “But how does a mendicant know and see so as to give up ignorance and give rise to knowledge?”
- 6.1 “When a mendicant knows and sees the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact as impermanent, ignorance is given up and knowledge arises. And also knowing and seeing the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact as impermanent, ignorance is given up and knowledge arises. ...
- 6.3 Knowing and seeing the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact as impermanent, ignorance is given up and knowledge arises. And also knowing and seeing the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact as impermanent, ignorance is given up and knowledge arises.

43. This emphasizes ignorance as the root defilement. That is not to say, however, that ignorance is unconditioned, as it is conditioned by the five hindrances which obstruct wisdom (AN 10.61).

That's how a mendicant knows and sees so as to give up ignorance 6.5
and give rise to knowledge."

SN 35.80

Giving Up Ignorance (2nd)

Dutiyaavijjāpahānasutta

Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha ... and asked him, "Sir, 1.1
is there one thing such that by giving it up a mendicant gives up
ignorance and gives rise to knowledge?"

"There is, mendicant." 2.1

"But what is that one thing?" 3.1

"Ignorance is one thing such that by giving it up a mendicant gives 4.1
up ignorance and gives rise to knowledge."

"But how does a mendicant know and see so as to give up igno- 5.1
rance and give rise to knowledge?"

"Take a mendicant who has heard: 'Nothing is worth insisting on.'⁴⁴ When a mendicant has heard that nothing is worth insisting
on, they directly know all things. Directly knowing all things, they
completely understand all things. Completely understanding all
things, they see all signs as other. They see the eye, sights,⁴⁵ eye con-
sciousness, and eye contact as other. And they also see the pleasant,
painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact as
other. ...

They see the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact 6.9
as other. And they also see the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling
that arises dependent on mind contact as other. That's how a men-

44. "Nothing is worth insisting on" (*sabbe dhammā nālaṃ abhinivesāyā*) occurs several times (see especially MN 37:3.2 and note). "Insistence" (*abhinivesa*) is a name for defilements that have become rigidly stuck, particularly the dogmatic insistence that one is correct and everyone else is wrong.

45. *Aññāto* means "as other". Like *parato* ("as alien"), it is a term for not-self. | "All signs" are the features of experience that the mind hooks on to as desirable, as permanent, or as Self.

dicant knows and sees so as to give up ignorance and give rise to knowledge.”

SN 35.81

Several Mendicants

Sambahulabhikkhusutta

- 1.1 Then several mendicants went up to the Buddha ... and asked him, “Sir, sometimes wanderers of other religions ask us: ‘Reverends, what’s the goal of leading the spiritual life under the ascetic Gotama?’ We answer them like this: ‘The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha is to completely understand suffering.’⁴⁶
- 1.6 Answering this way, we trust that we repeat what the Buddha has said, and don’t misrepresent him with an untruth. We trust our explanation is in line with the teaching, and that there are no legitimate grounds for rebuttal or criticism.”
- 2.1 “Indeed, in answering this way you repeat what I’ve said, and don’t misrepresent me with an untruth. Your explanation is in line with the teaching, and there are no legitimate grounds for rebuttal or criticism. For the goal of leading the spiritual life under me is to completely understand suffering.
- 2.3 If wanderers of other religions were to ask you: ‘Reverends, what is that suffering?’ You should answer them: ‘Reverends, the eye is suffering. The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha is to completely understand this. Sights ... Eye consciousness ... Eye contact ... The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also suffering. The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha is to completely understand this.

46. The “complete understanding” of suffering is part of the complex relating to the full realization of the four noble truths, the others being giving up the cause; realizing the cessation; and developing the path. Thus by mentioning “complete understanding”, all four are implied.

Ear ... Nose ... Tongue ... Body ... Mind ... The pleasant, 2.10
painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is
also suffering. The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha
is to completely understand this.

This is that suffering. The goal of leading the spiritual life under 2.13
the Buddha is to completely understand this.’ When questioned by
wanderers of other religions, that’s how you should answer them.”

SN 35.82

A Question On the World

Lokapañhāsutta

Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha ... and said to him: 1.1

“Sir, they speak of this thing called ‘the world’. How is the world 2.1
defined?”

“It wears away, mendicant, that’s why it’s called ‘the world.’⁴⁷ And 2.3
what is wearing away? The eye is wearing away. Sights ... eye con-
sciousness ... eye contact is wearing away. The painful, pleasant, or
neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also wearing
away.

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... The mind ... ideas ... 2.7
mind consciousness ... mind contact is wearing away. The painful,
pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is
also wearing away.

It wears away, mendicant, that’s why it’s called ‘the world.’ 2.9

47. The Pali puns *lujjati* (“wear away”) with *loka* (“world”). Normally *lujjati* is “fall apart, disintegrate” (see SN 22.93), but where it puns with “world” (here and SN 35.84) I translate as “wear away”, which is justified by the use at AN 3.132:1.7. This pun might seem obvious to “world-weary” folks of today, but it is the deliberate opposite of *loka*’s underlying sense. It originally referred to “light”, especially the bright lights of the heavens, hence “cosmos” and “world” generally. See note on MN 7:19.6 for details.

SN 35.83

Phaggunā's Question

Phaggunapanāhāsutta

- 1.1 And then Venerable Phaggunā went up to the Buddha ... and said to him:
- 2.1 “Sir, suppose someone were to describe the Buddhas of the past who have become fully quenched, cut off proliferation, cut off the course, finished off the cycle, and passed beyond all suffering. Does the eye exist by which they could be described?⁴⁸
- 2.2 Does the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body exist ...? Does the mind exist by which they could be described?”
- 3.1 “Phaggunā, suppose someone were to describe the Buddhas of the past who have become fully quenched, cut off proliferation, cut off the course, finished off the cycle, and passed beyond all suffering. The eye does not exist by which they could be described.
- 3.2 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body does not exist ... The mind does not exist by which they could be described.”

48. Cited at Kv 1.6:95.3 with slight change. | This is the only doctrinal context where we find *vaṭuma* (“course”). The commentary explains it as the “course of craving”. However, in Buddhist Sanskrit we find the phrases *chinnaṃ vartmaṃ na vartati* (Mahāvastu 2.416) and *chinnaṃ vartma na pravartate* (Nidāna Saṃyukta 11.6), which recall the Pali phrase *vaṭṭaṃ vattati* (DN 15:22.6), where *vaṭṭa* occurs in the next word of the current passage. This suggests that the sense is, rather, the “course of transmigration”, as in the later Sanskrit phrase *saṃsāravartmani*.

The Chapter with Channa

SN 35.84

Liabile to Wear Out

Palokadhammasutta

At Sāvattthī. 1.1

Then Venerable Ānanda went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down 1.2
to one side, and said to him:

“Sir, they speak of this thing called ‘the world’. How is the world 2.1
defined?”

“Ānanda, that which is liable to wear out is called the world in the 2.3
training of the Noble One.⁴⁹ And what is liable to wear out? The eye
is liable to wear out. Sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact is
liable to wear out. The painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises
dependent on eye contact is also liable to wear out.

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... The mind ... ideas ... mind 2.6
consciousness ... mind contact is liable to wear out. The painful,
pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is
also liable to wear out.

That which is liable to wear out is called the world in the training 2.8
of the Noble One.”

49. *Paloka* (“wear out”) is a noun form of *palujjati*. See notes at SN 22.93:1.2
and SN 35.82:2.3.

SN 35.85

The World is Empty

Suññatalokasutta

- 1.1 And then Venerable Ānanda ... said to the Buddha:
- 1.2 “Sir, they say that ‘the world is empty’. What does the saying ‘the world is empty’ refer to?”
- 1.4 “Ānanda, they say that ‘the world is empty’ because it’s empty of self or what belongs to self.⁵⁰ And what is empty of self or what belongs to self? The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are empty of self or what belongs to self. ...
- 1.8 The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also empty of self or what belongs to self. They say that ‘the world is empty’ because it’s empty of self or what belongs to self.”

SN 35.86

A Teaching In Brief

Samkhittadhammasutta

- 1.1 Seated to one side, Venerable Ānanda said to the Buddha:
- 1.2 “Sir, may the Buddha please teach me Dhamma in brief. When I’ve heard it, I’ll live alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute.”
- 2.1 “What do you think, Ānanda? Is the eye permanent or impermanent?”
- 3.1 “Impermanent, sir.”
- 4.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 5.1 “Suffering, sir.”

50. “Emptiness” in early Buddhism is primarily a meditation approach for realizing not-self (SN 41.7:4.3 = MN 43:33.3 = MN 106:7.2; Snp 5.16:4.1). For a more expansive treatment, see MN 121.

- “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?” 6.1
- “No, sir.” 7.1
- “Are sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact ... 8.1
- The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact: is that permanent or impermanent?” 10.2
- “Impermanent, sir.” 11.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 12.1
- “Suffering, sir.” 13.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?” 14.1
- “No, sir.” ... 15.1
- “Is the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... 16.1
- The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact: is that permanent or impermanent?” 18.1
- “Impermanent, sir.” 19.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 20.1
- “Suffering, sir.” 21.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?” 22.1
- “No, sir.” 23.1
- “Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact. 24.1
- They grow disillusioned with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact. 24.2
- Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed. 24.3
- They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’” 24.4

SN 35.87

With Channa

Channasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the squirrels' feeding ground.⁵¹
- 1.2 Now at that time the venerables Sāriputta, Mahācunda, and Channa were staying on the Vulture's Peak Mountain.⁵² Now at that time Venerable Channa was sick, suffering, gravely ill.
- 1.4 Then in the late afternoon, Venerable Sāriputta came out of retreat, went to Venerable Mahācunda and said to him, "Come, Reverend Cunda, let's go to see Venerable Channa and ask about his illness."
- 1.6 "Yes, reverend," replied Mahācunda.
- 2.1 And then Sāriputta and Mahācunda went to see Channa and sat down on the seats spread out. Sāriputta said to Channa: "I hope you're keeping well, Reverend Channa, I hope you're all right. I hope your pain is fading, not growing; that its fading is evident, not its growing."
- 3.1 "Reverend Sāriputta, I'm not keeping well, I'm not getting by. My pain is terrible and growing, not fading; its growing is evident, not its fading. The winds piercing my head are so severe, it feels like a strong man drilling into my head with a sharp point. The pain in my head is so severe, it feels like a strong man tightening a strong leather strap around my head. The winds slicing my belly are so severe, like a deft butcher or their apprentice were slicing open a cow's belly with a sharp meat cleaver. The burning in my body is so severe, it feels like two strong men grabbing a weaker man by the arms to burn and

51. This discourse recurs at MN 144. In the Majjhima Nikāya, as here in the Saṃyutta, it is immediately followed by the Puṇṇovādasutta (MN 145, SN 35.88).

52. For Mahācunda, see note on MN 8:2.1. | This Channa only appears only in this discourse. He is obviously not the same person as the Buddha's former charioteer who was famously admonished on the Buddha's deathbed (DN 16:6.4.1).

scorch him on a pit of glowing coals. I'm not keeping well, I'm not getting by. My pain is terrible and growing, not fading; its growing is evident, not its fading.

Reverend Sāriputta, I shall commit suicide. I don't wish to live."⁵³ 3.10

"Please don't commit suicide! Venerable Channa, keep going! 4.1
We want you to keep going.

If you don't have any suitable food, we'll find it for you. If you 4.3
don't have suitable medicine, we'll find it for you. If you don't have a
capable carer, we'll find one for you.

Please don't commit suicide! Venerable Channa, keep going! We 4.6
want you to keep going."

"Reverend Sāriputta, it's not that I don't have suitable food; I do 5.1
have suitable food. It's not that I don't have suitable medicine; I do
have suitable medicine. It's not that I don't have a capable carer; I do
have a capable carer.

Moreover, for a long time now I have served the Teacher with 5.7
love, not without love. For it is proper for a disciple to serve the
Teacher with love, not without love. You should remember this:
"The mendicant Channa will commit suicide blamelessly."

"I'd like to ask Venerable Channa about a certain point, if you'd 6.1
take the time to answer."

"Ask, Reverend Sāriputta. When I've heard it I'll know." 6.2

"Reverend Channa, do you regard the eye, eye consciousness, and 7.1
things knowable by eye consciousness in this way: 'This is mine, I
am this, this is my self'?

Do you regard the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, mind 7.2
consciousness, and things knowable by mind consciousness in this
way: 'This is mine, I am this, this is my self'?"

"Reverend Sāriputta, I regard the eye, eye consciousness, and 8.1
things knowable by eye consciousness in this way: 'This is not mine,
I am not this, this is not my self.'

53. See note on SN 4.23:2.3.

- 8.2 I regard the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, mind consciousness, and things knowable by mind consciousness in this way: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self’”
- 9.1 “Reverend Channa, what have you seen, what have you directly known in these things that you regard them in this way: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self?’”
- 10.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, after seeing cessation, after directly knowing cessation in these things I regard them in this way: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self’”
- 11.1 When he said this, Venerable Mahācunda said to Venerable Channa, “So, Reverend Channa, you should regularly apply your mind well to this instruction of the Buddha:⁵⁴
- 11.3 ‘For the dependent there is agitation. For the independent there’s no agitation.⁵⁵ When there’s no agitation, there is tranquility. When there is tranquility, there’s no inclination.⁵⁶ When there’s no inclination, there’s no coming and going. When there’s no coming and going, there’s no passing away and reappearing. When there’s no passing away and reappearing, there’s no this life or the next or between the two.⁵⁷ Just this is the end of suffering.’”

54. Mahācunda is about to quote a phrase that appears at Ud 8.4.

55. The “dependent” is the world of conditions. The “independent” is Nibbāna. | “Agitation” is *calita*, otherwise “shaking, trembling”.

56. “Inclination” is *nati*, from a root meaning “to bend”. Sometimes used in the sense of a “inclination of mind” (MN 19:6.1), here it refers to the mind inclining to rebirth, and is explained by the commentary as “craving”. Compare the English idiom, “one is bent on destruction”.

57. Vedic cosmology speaks of a tripartite world: the earth, the heavens, and the “midspace” (*antarikṣa*), namely the atmosphere. The gods journey through the midspace to earth for the sacrifice, bringing bounty for mortals (eg. Rig Veda 7.45). Later, the process of rebirth was conceived of as a path of cosmological ascent returning to the world of the gods or the fathers (eg. Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 5.10.1). For the suttas, rebirth is likewise seen as a process of moving between states, like a person leaving a house, walking down the street, and entering another house (DN 2:96.1). | The Suttas routinely accept the reality of an in-between state after death and before rebirth. See eg. SN 12.11:1.3, SN 44.9:6.4, SN 46.3:9.5.

And when the venerables Sāriputta and Mahācunda had given 12.1
Venerable Channa this advice they rose from their seats and left. Not
long after those venerables had left, Venerable Channa committed
suicide.

Then Sāriputta went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one 13.1
side, and said to him, “Sir, Venerable Channa has committed suicide.
Where has he been reborn in his next life?”

“Sāriputta, didn’t the mendicant Channa declare his blameless- 13.4
ness to you personally?”

“Sir, there is a Vajjian village named Pubbajira.⁵⁸ There Channa 13.5
had families who were friendly, intimate, and hospitable.”⁵⁹

“The mendicant Channa did indeed have such families. But, Sā- 13.7
riputta, this is not enough for me to call someone ‘blameworthy’.
When someone lays down this body and takes up another body, I
call them ‘blameworthy’. But the mendicant Channa did no such
thing.”⁶⁰

You should remember this: “The mendicant Channa committed 13.11
suicide blamelessly.”⁶¹

58. There are several variant spellings of this name, which does not seem to appear elsewhere.

59. The text plays with homonyms of *upavajja* as “blameworthy” (Sanskrit *upavadya*) and as “hospitable” (commentary: *upasaṅkamitabba*, Sanskrit *upavrajya*).

60. The Buddha confirms that Channa was an arahant.

61. Suicide generally is condemned in Buddhism as the taking of a human life. But from this and similar incidents (SN 4.23, SN 22.87) it is widely accepted that suicide in the final throes of a terminal illness is allowable for arahants, as they are incapable of committing a blameworthy act. The suttas, however, can also be read to support the reverse reading: the reason it is allowable for arahants is because it is not blameworthy. The underlying logic would be that ending life is normally bad because life is valuable, but at such a point life no longer has any value. Obviously this is a complex issue that cannot be resolved by a few short scriptural passages, but a Buddhist would be motivated by compassion and understanding for those going through such terrible suffering.

With Puṇṇa

Puṇṇasutta

- 1.1 And then Venerable Puṇṇa went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:⁶²
- 1.2 “Sir, may the Buddha please teach me Dhamma in brief. When I’ve heard it, I’ll live alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute.”
- 2.1 “Puṇṇa, there are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, this gives rise to relishing. Relishing is the origin of suffering, I say.
- 2.5 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... There are ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, this gives rise to relishing. Relishing is the origin of suffering, I say.
- 3.1 There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn’t approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, relishing ceases. When relishing ceases, suffering ceases, I say. ...
- 3.4 There are ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn’t approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, relishing ceases. When relishing ceases, suffering ceases, I say.
- 4.1 Puṇṇa, now that I’ve given you this brief advice, what country will you live in?”

62. This sutta recurs at MN 145, with slight differences in the opening and closing. In addition to two discourse parallels in Chinese, the popularity of this narrative is attested by its appearance in later texts such as the *Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya* and the *Divyāvadāna*, as well as in artworks (see Anālayo, *Comparative Study*, vol. ii, p. 828). | This Puṇṇa is to be distinguished from the Koliyan ascetic of MN 57 and the son of Mantāṇī of MN 23. His only other appearance is his Theragāthā verse at Thag 1.70.

“Sir, there’s a country named Sunāparanta; I will live there.”⁶³ 4.2

“The people of Sunāparanta are wild and rough, Puṇṇa. If they 5.1
abuse and insult you, what will you think of them?”

“If they abuse and insult me, I will think: ‘These people of Su- 6.1
nāparanta are gracious, truly gracious, since they don’t hit me with
their fists.’ That’s what I’ll think, Blessed One. That’s what I’ll think,
Holy One.”

“But if they do hit you with their fists, what will you think of them 7.1
then?”

“If they hit me with their fists, I’ll think: ‘These people of Sunā- 8.1
paranta are gracious, truly gracious, since they don’t throw stones at
me.’ That’s what I’ll think, Blessed One. That’s what I’ll think, Holy
One.”

“But if they do throw stones at you, what will you think of them 9.1
then?”

“If they throw stones at me, I’ll think: ‘These people of Sunā- 10.1
paranta are gracious, truly gracious, since they don’t beat me with a
club.’ That’s what I’ll think, Blessed One. That’s what I’ll think, Holy
One.”

“But if they do beat you with a club, what will you think of them 11.1
then?”

“If they beat me with a club, I’ll think: ‘These people of Sunā- 12.1
paranta are gracious, truly gracious, since they don’t stab me with
a knife.’ That’s what I’ll think, Blessed One. That’s what I’ll think,
Holy One.”

“But if they do stab you with a knife, what will you think of them 13.1
then?”

63. The commentary says that Puṇṇa was in fact born in Sunāparanta, specifically the trading port of Suppāraka, which is modern Nallasopara north of Mumbai on India’s west coast. Sunāparanta is otherwise known as Aparanta (“Far West”, Bv 29:17.2). Puṇṇa’s choice was far-sighted, as from the time of Ashoka, Suppāraka became a major trading center with ports in India and lands west as far as Mesopotamia, Egypt, Eastern Africa, and Rome. A fabulous tale of such trading voyages is told in Ja 463.

- 14.1 “If they stab me with a knife, I’ll think: ‘These people of Sunāparanta are gracious, truly gracious, since they don’t take my life with a sharp knife.’ That’s what I’ll think, Blessed One. That’s what I’ll think, Holy One.”
- 15.1 “But if they do take your life with a sharp knife, what will you think of them then?”
- 16.1 “If they take my life with a sharp knife, I’ll think: ‘There are disciples of the Buddha who looked for a suicide weapon because they were horrified, repelled, and disgusted with the body and with life. And I have found this without looking!’⁶⁴ That’s what I’ll think, Blessed One. That’s what I’ll think, Holy One.”
- 17.1 “Good, good Puṇṇa! Having such self-control and peacefulness, you will be quite capable of living in Sunāparanta. Now, Puṇṇa, go at your convenience.”
- 18.1 And then Puṇṇa welcomed and agreed with the Buddha’s words. He got up from his seat, bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on his right. Then he set his lodgings in order and, taking his bowl and robe, set out for Sunāparanta.
- 18.2 Traveling stage by stage, he arrived at Sunāparanta, and stayed there. Within that rainy season he confirmed around five hundred male and five hundred female lay followers. And within that same

64. This is in reference to the notorious story of Migalaṇḍika in Bu Pj 3, told more briefly in SN 54.9. Several monks, meditating improperly on the unattractiveness of the body, sought death as the way out. In response, the Buddha taught mindfulness of breathing, which is “peaceful and sublime, a deliciously pleasant meditation.” | The idiomatic phrase *satthahāraka* is difficult. The obvious reading is to take *sattha* as “knife”, the meaning it has in the preceding sentence. However, that yields the sense “knife-bringer”, “assassin”, whereas the use of *idam* in MN 145:5.32 shows it must be neuter, i.e. it is a thing not a person. Richard Gombrich suggests we read *sattha* here as equivalent to Sanskrit *śvasita*, “breathing, life” (see Brahmalī’s note on Bu Pj 3:2.49.1), yielding the sense “life-taker”, “breath-stealer”, “deadly weapon”. This agrees with the Vinaya commentary, which explains, “What does it take? Life.” (*Kim harati? Jīvitam*). Since this idiom is only used in the context of suicide, I call it “suicide weapon”, and the verbal form “commit suicide”.

rainy season he realized the three knowledges. And within that same rainy season he became fully extinguished.

Then several mendicants went up to the Buddha ... and asked 19.1
him, “Sir, the gentleman named Puṇṇa, who was advised in brief by
the Buddha, has passed away. Where has he been reborn in his next
life?”

“Mendicants, Puṇṇa was astute. He practiced in line with the 20.1
teaching, and did not trouble me about the teachings. Puṇṇa has
become completely quenched.”

SN 35.89

With Bāhiya

Bāhiyasutta

Then Venerable Bāhiya went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to 1.1
one side, and said to him:⁶⁵

“Sir, may the Buddha please teach me Dhamma in brief. When 1.2
I’ve heard it, I’ll live alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute.”

“What do you think, Bāhiya? Is the eye permanent or imper- 2.1
manent?”

“Impermanent, sir.” 3.1

“But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 4.1

“Suffering, sir.” 5.1

“But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be 6.1
regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”

“No, sir.” 7.1

“Are sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact ... 8.1

The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on 9.4
mind contact: is that permanent or impermanent?”

65. A monk called Bāhiya appears in a similar discourse at SN 47.15. In both cases he is said to become an arahant. It may be that these are different versions of the same event. The Bāhiya Dārucīriya famed from Ud 1.10 must be a different person, since he died immediately.

- 10.1 “Impermanent, sir.”
- 11.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 12.1 “Suffering, sir.”
- 13.1 “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”
- 14.1 “No, sir.”
- 15.1 “Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact.
- 15.2 They grow disillusioned with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact.
- 15.3 Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed.
- 15.4 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’”
- 16.1 And then Venerable Bāhiya approved and agreed with what the Buddha said. He got up from his seat, bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on his right, before leaving.
- 16.2 Then Bāhiya, living alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute, soon realized the supreme culmination of the spiritual path in this very life. He lived having achieved with his own insight the goal for which gentlemen rightly go forth from the lay life to homelessness.
- 16.3 He understood: “Rebirth is ended; the spiritual journey has been completed; what had to be done has been done; there is nothing further for this place.” And Venerable Bāhiya became one of the perfected.

SN 35.90

Turbulence (1st)

Paṭhamaejāsutta

“Mendicants, turbulence is a disease, a boil, a dart. That’s why the 1.1
Realized One lives unperturbed, with dart drawn out.

Now, a mendicant might wish: ‘May I live unperturbed, with dart 1.3
drawn out.’⁶⁶

So let them not conceive anything to be the eye, let them not 1.4
conceive it in the eye, let them not conceive it as the eye, let them
not conceive that ‘the eye is mine.’ Let them not conceive sights ...
eye consciousness ... eye contact ... Let them not conceive anything
to be the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on
eye contact. Let them not conceive it in that, let them not conceive
it as that, and let them not conceive that ‘that is mine.’

Let them not conceive anything to be the ear ... nose ... tongue 2.1
... body ... mind ... ideas ... mind consciousness ... mind contact
... Let them not conceive anything to be the pleasant, painful, or
neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact. Let them not
conceive it in that, let them not conceive it as that, and let them not
conceive that ‘that is mine.’

Let them not conceive anything to be all, let them not conceive it 3.7
in all, let them not conceive it as all, let them not conceive that ‘all is
mine.’

Not conceiving, they don’t grasp at anything in the world. Not 4.1
grasping, they’re not anxious. Not being anxious, they personally
become extinguished.

They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has 4.3
been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing
further for this place.’”

66. The fourth absorption is called “imperturbable” due to its freedom from the reactivity of pleasure and pain. This discourse, however, deals with the ultimate imperturbability of the perfected one.

SN 35.91

Turbulence (2nd)

Dutiyaējāsutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, turbulence is a disease, a boil, a dart. That’s why the Realized One lives unperturbed, with dart drawn out.
- 1.3 Now, a mendicant might wish: ‘May I live unperturbed, with dart drawn out.’
- 1.4 So let them not conceive anything to be the eye, let them not conceive it in the eye, let them not conceive it as the eye, let them not conceive that ‘the eye is mine.’ Let them not conceive sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact ... Let them not conceive anything to be the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact. Let them not conceive it in that, let them not conceive it as that, and let them not conceive that ‘that is mine.’ For whatever you conceive it to be, whatever you conceive it in, whatever you conceive it as, and whatever you conceive to be ‘mine’: that becomes something else. The world is attached to being, taking pleasure only in being, yet it becomes something else.
- 2.1 Let them not conceive anything to be the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ...
- 3.1 Let them not conceive anything to be the mind ... mind consciousness ... mind contact ... Let them not conceive anything to be the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact. Let them not conceive it in that, let them not conceive it as that, and let them not conceive that ‘that is mine.’ For whatever you conceive it to be, whatever you conceive it in, whatever you conceive it as, and whatever you conceive to be ‘mine’: that becomes something else. The world is attached to being, taking pleasure only in being, yet it becomes something else.
- 4.1 As far as the aggregates, elements, and sense fields extend, they don’t conceive anything to be that, they don’t conceive it in that,

they don't conceive it as that, and they don't conceive that 'that is mine.'

Not conceiving, they don't grasp at anything in the world. Not grasping, they're not anxious. Not being anxious, they personally become extinguished. 4.2

They understand: 'Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.' 4.4

SN 35.92

A Duality (1st)

Paṭhamadvayasutta

"Mendicants, I will teach you a duality.⁶⁷ Listen ... 1.1

And what is a duality? It's just the eye and sights, the ear and sounds, the nose and smells, the tongue and tastes, the body and touches, and the mind and ideas. This is called a duality. 1.3

Mendicants, suppose someone was to say: 'I'll deny this duality and describe another duality.' They'd have no grounds for that 2.1

67. In this discourse and the next, the Buddha discusses the structure of sense activity as the duality of interior and exterior. From the sparse hints in the discourses themselves, it seems he is critiquing the doctrine of infinite, non-dual consciousness taught by Yājñavalkya especially in *Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad* 2.4 = 4.5 and 4.3.23–32.

claim,⁶⁸ they'd be stumped by questions, and, in addition, they'd get frustrated. Why is that? Because they're out of their element."

68. The same "duality" is described as the (sentient) body and "external" name and form, which are essential for contact through the six senses (SN 12.19:1.3). | Compare Yājñavalkya's culminating philosophy: "For when there is a duality, as it were, then one sees the other; one smells, tastes, hears, greets, thinks of, touches, and cognizes the other. But when this All has become the Self, how and what would one see? How and what would one smell, taste, greet, hear, think, touch, or cognize? By what would one cognize that which cognizes this All? This Self is not that, not that! ... By what would one cognize the cognizer?" (Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.4.14 = 4.5.15; readings vary). According to the Buddha, the dualistic structure of experience is primary; the mind functions as a duality. If one asserts, with Yājñavalkya, that "there is no second reality here that he could see as something distinct and separate from himself" (BU 4.3.23), how can one then assert that the primordial person split in two to make man and woman (BU 1.4.3); or that there is a duality of truth and falsehood (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 1.1.1.4)? Yājñavalkya denies the duality of self and other implicit in the structure of the senses, yet asserts the dualities of truth and falsehood, mortality and immortality, and man and woman. The implication is that such an assertion is incoherent, for to make such an assertion relies on the duality of speech and the senses. For all his "nondual" talk, Yājñavalkya ends up asserting one axis of duality, namely the eternal survival of the soul (as at SN 12.15:2.1) against the transience of worldly things. While there is no *necessary* correspondence between the dualities of interior/exterior and eternalism/annihilationism, those who focus on the inner consciousness, which appears to the unwary as ever-present, tend to fall into eternalism, while those who focus on the ephemeral material world of the exterior senses tend to be annihilationists. Epistemology shapes metaphysics.

SN 35.93

A Duality (2nd)

Dutiyadvayasutta

“Mendicants, consciousness originates dependent on a duality.⁶⁹ And 1.1
what is that duality?

Eye consciousness arises dependent on the eye and sights. The eye 1.3
is impermanent, decaying, and perishing. Sights are impermanent,
decaying, and perishing. So this duality is tottering and toppling;
it’s impermanent, decaying, and perishing. Eye consciousness is
impermanent, decaying, and perishing. And the causes and reasons
that give rise to eye consciousness are also impermanent, decaying,
and perishing. But since eye consciousness has arisen dependent on
conditions that are impermanent, how could it be permanent?

The meeting, coming together, and joining together of these three 1.10
things is called eye contact.⁷⁰ Eye contact is also impermanent, de-
caying, and perishing. And the causes and reasons that give rise
to eye contact are also impermanent, decaying, and perishing. But
since eye contact has arisen dependent on conditions that are imper-
manent, how could it be permanent?

Contacted one feels; contacted one intends; contacted one per- 1.14
ceives.⁷¹ So these things too are tottering and toppling; they’re im-
permanent, decaying, and perishing.

69. Yājñavalkya taught that the ultimate Self was “this great reality, infinite, un-
bounded, a sheer mass of consciousness” (*idaṃ mahadbhūtam anantam apāraṃ
vijñānaghana eva*, Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.4.12). It arises as an individuated
self from the mass of particularized elements making up the world, but for the
realized being it returns to its essential oneness with Divinity. Thus Yājñavalkya
spoke of the “uncognized cognizer”, the eternal and changeless core of aware-
ness at the heart of the ephemeral world of changing illusions. Rejecting this,
the Buddha asserts that consciousness, far from being an eternal or mysterious
essence, is dependent on the dualistic structure of experience.

70. Compare the subtly different usage at MN 28:8.2.

71. The three aggregates of feeling, choices (*saṅkhārā*, here expressed as *ceteti*,
“intends”), and perception are dependent on contact.

- 2.1 Ear consciousness ... Nose consciousness ... Tongue consciousness ... Body consciousness ...
- 3.1 Mind consciousness arises dependent on the mind and ideas. The mind is impermanent, decaying, and perishing. Ideas are impermanent, decaying, and perishing. So this duality is tottering and toppling; it's impermanent, decaying, and perishing. Mind consciousness is impermanent, decaying, and perishing. And the causes and reasons that give rise to mind consciousness are also impermanent, decaying, and perishing. But since mind consciousness has arisen dependent on conditions that are impermanent, how could it be permanent?
- 3.8 The meeting, coming together, and joining together of these three things is called mind contact. Mind contact is also impermanent, decaying, and perishing. And the causes and reasons that give rise to mind contact are also impermanent, decaying, and perishing. But since mind contact has arisen dependent on conditions that are impermanent, how could it be permanent?
- 3.12 Contacted one feels; contacted one intends; contacted one perceives. So these things too are tottering and toppling; they're impermanent, decaying, and perishing.
- 3.14 This is how consciousness originates dependent on a duality."

The Chapter on the Sixes

SN 35.94

Untamed, Unguarded

Adantaaguttasutta

At Sāvattthī. 1.1

“Mendicants, these six fields of contact bring suffering when they’re untamed, unguarded, unprotected, and unrestrained. What six? 1.2

The field of eye contact brings suffering when it’s untamed, un- 1.4
guarded, unprotected, and unrestrained.

The field of ear contact ... nose contact ... tongue contact ... 1.5
body contact ...

The field of mind contact brings suffering when it’s untamed, 1.6
unguarded, unprotected, and unrestrained.

These six fields of contact bring suffering when they’re untamed, 1.7
unguarded, unprotected, and unrestrained.

These six fields of contact bring happiness when they’re well 2.1
tamed, well guarded, well protected, and well restrained. What six?

The field of eye contact brings happiness when it’s well tamed, 2.3
well guarded, well protected, and well restrained.

The field of ear contact ... nose contact ... tongue contact ... 2.4
body contact ...

The field of mind contact brings happiness when it’s well tamed, 2.5
well guarded, well protected, and well restrained.

- 2.6 These six fields of contact bring happiness when they're well tamed, well guarded, well protected, and well restrained.”
- 2.7 That is what the Buddha said. Then the Holy One, the Teacher, went on to say:
- 3.1 “Mendicants, it's just the six fields of contact that lead the unrestrained to suffering. Those who understand how to restrain them live with faith as partner, not festering.
- 4.1 When you've seen pleasant sights⁷² and unpleasant ones, too, dispel all manner of desire for the pleasant, without hating what you don't like.
- 5.1 When you've heard sounds both liked and disliked, don't fall under the thrall of sounds you like, dispel hate for the unliked, and don't hurt your mind by thinking of what you don't like.
- 6.1 When you've smelled a pleasant, fragrant scent, and one that's foul and unpleasant, dispel aversion for the unpleasant, while not yielding to desire for the pleasant.
- 7.1 When you've enjoyed a sweet, delicious taste,⁷³ and sometimes those that are bitter, don't be attached to enjoying sweet tastes, and don't despise the bitter.
- 8.1 Don't be intoxicated by a pleasant touch,

72. This series of verses resembles those attributed to Vardhamāna (Mahāvīra) at Isibhāsiyāim 29. The same series of verses also contains parallels to Snp 5.2:3.1, SN 1.6:3.1, and DN 2:29.4 = MN 56:12.2.

73. Following PTS reading *sāditāṇca*.

and don't tremble at a painful touch.
 Look with equanimity at the duality
 of pleasant and painful contacts,⁷⁴
 without favoring or opposing anything.

People generally let their perceptions proliferate;⁷⁵ 9.1
 perceiving and proliferating, they are attracted.⁷⁶
 Casting aside all mental constructions of the domestic
 life,⁷⁷
 wander intent on renunciation.

When the mind is well developed like this 10.1
 regarding the six,
 it doesn't waver at contacts at all.
 Mendicants, those who have mastered greed and hate
 go beyond birth and death."

74. The mention of "duality" links this to the preceding two discourses.

75. For "proliferation" see MN 18.

76. "Attraction" (*upāya*, verb form *upeti*, here spelled *upayanti*) is the initial stage in the process of becoming attached (eg. SN 12.15:2.5).

77. This unusual use of *manomayaṃ* (normally "mind-made", here "mental construction") parallels *vitakkam* at Thag 21.1:6.2.

SN 35.95

Mālunkyaputta

Mālukyaputtasutta

- 1.1 Then Venerable Mālunkyaputta went up to the Buddha ... and asked him,⁷⁸ “Sir, may the Buddha please teach me Dhamma in brief. When I’ve heard it, I’ll live alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute.”
- 2.1 “Well now, Mālunkyaputta, what are we to say to the young monks, when even an old man like you, elderly and senior, advanced in years, having reached the final stage of life, asks for brief advice?”
- 3.1 “Sir, even though I’m an old man, elderly and senior, may the Buddha please teach me Dhamma in brief! May the Holy One please teach me in brief! Hopefully I can understand the meaning of what the Buddha says. Hopefully I can be an heir of the Buddha’s teaching!”
- 4.1 “What do you think, Mālunkyaputta? Do you have any desire or greed or fondness for sights known by the eye that are unseen, unseen before, and which you neither see nor think might be seen?”⁷⁹
- 4.3 “No, sir.”
- 5.1 “Do you have any desire or greed or affection for sounds known by the ear ...
- 6.1 smells known by the nose ...

78. Mālunkyaputta was, according to Pali commentaries, the son of the lady Mālunkyā of Kosala. Alternatively, Sanskrit dictionaries give *māluka* as the name of a people or a mixed caste, although I have not been able to trace any further details. His conversion is not recorded as he appears always as a monk. MN 63 and MN 64 depict him as somewhat of a fool, but it seems that he persisted, and late in life sought teachings in meditation and ultimately realized arahantship, of which we have two different accounts (here and AN 4.257). The latter contains an extensive set of verses attributed to him, which are repeated at Thag 16.5. A second set of his verses are at Thag 6.5.

79. The commentary explains “unseen, unseen before” as not seen in this life or past lives. This is possible, although *aditṭhapubba* (and its parallels) are elsewhere used for the simple past in this life (eg. DN 16:2.17.3, SN 35.245:6.1; *assutapubba* at MN 12:50.6).

- tastes known by the tongue ... 7.1
- touches known by the body ... 8.1
- ideas known by the mind that are unknown, unknown before, and 9.1
which you neither know nor think might be known?"
- "No, sir." 9.2
- "In that case, when it comes to things that ought be seen, heard, 10.1
thought, and known: in the seen will be merely the seen; in the heard
will be merely the heard; in the thought will be merely the thought;
in the known will be merely the known.⁸⁰ When this is the case,
you won't be 'by that'.⁸¹ When you're not 'by that', you won't be 'in
that'.⁸² When you're not 'in that', you won't be in this life or the next
or in between the two. Just this is the end of suffering."

80. For the "epistemic tetrad", see MN 1:19.1. This teaching is famous from the brief instructions for Bāhiya at Ud 1.10:8.2 | This set of four overlaps but does not map neatly on to the six senses, which lack an equivalent for "thought"; this is the only place in the Suttas that connects them. Rather, they emphasize the means by which spiritual truths are known. The missing items smell, taste, and touch are not normally means of learning spiritual truths, unlike the "seen" (a holy person, a dream, etc.), the "heard" (the words of a teacher or oral tradition), the "thought" (philosophical contemplation), and the "known" (reflective or meditative understanding). | The expression "merely" (*matta*) suggests that these things are seen simply as they are, without being proliferated by conceit, or assumed to be absolute sources of truth.

81. Whereas the six senses primarily stimulate an *emotional* response of desire, the epistemic tetrad is concerned with the creation of self-identity, responding to the Upaniṣadic idea that these are the means by which the Self is realized. | "By that" suggests that one assumes a Self from the tetrad, eg. by hearing about it, or deducing it from reasoning, etc. The instrumental case draws on Yājñavalkya: "By the seeing, hearing, thinking, and knowing of the Self, all this is known" (*ātmano vā are darśanena śravaṇena matyā vijñānenedaṃ sarvaṃ viditaṃ*, Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.4.5).

82. Once the Self has been derived from the tetrad, one conceives Self in relation to it. Specifically, this rejects the imperishable Self posited by Yājñavalkya, which sees but cannot be seen. This again echoes Yājñavalkya, in a variant passage of the previous, although he is using the locative case in an absolute sense: "When the Self is seen, heard, thought, and known, all this is known." (*ātmani khalv are dṛṣṭe śrute mate vijñāta idaṃ sarvaṃ viditaṃ*, Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 4.5.6).

11.1 “This is how I understand the detailed meaning of the Buddha’s brief statement:

12.1 ‘When you see a sight, mindfulness is lost
as you focus on a pleasant feature.
Experiencing it with a mind full of desire,
you keep clinging to it.

13.1 Many feelings grow
arising from sights.
The mind is damaged
by covetousness and cruelty.
Heaping up suffering like this,
you’re said to be far from extinguishment.

14.1 When you hear a sound, mindfulness is lost
as you focus on a pleasant feature.
Experiencing it with a mind full of desire,
you keep clinging to it.

15.1 Many feelings grow
arising from sounds.
The mind is damaged
by covetousness and cruelty.
Heaping up suffering like this,
you’re said to be far from extinguishment.

16.1 When you smell an odor, mindfulness is lost
as you focus on a pleasant feature.
Experiencing it with a mind full of desire,
you keep clinging to it.

17.1 Many feelings grow
arising from smells.
The mind is damaged
by covetousness and cruelty.

Heaping up suffering like this,
you're said to be far from extinguishment.

When you enjoy a taste, mindfulness is lost 18.1
as you focus on a pleasant feature.
Experiencing it with a mind full of desire,
you keep clinging to it.

Many feelings grow 19.1
arising from tastes.
The mind is damaged
by covetousness and cruelty.
Heaping up suffering like this,
you're said to be far from extinguishment.

When you sense a touch, mindfulness is lost 20.1
as you focus on a pleasant feature.
Experiencing it with a mind full of desire,
you keep clinging to it.

Many feelings grow 21.1
arising from touches.
The mind is damaged
by covetousness and cruelty.
Heaping up suffering like this,
you're said to be far from extinguishment.

When you know an idea, mindfulness is lost 22.1
as you focus on a pleasant feature.
Experiencing it with a mind full of desire,
you keep clinging to it.

Many feelings grow 23.1
arising from ideas.
The mind is damaged

by covetousness and cruelty.
 Heaping up suffering like this,
 you're said to be far from extinguishment.

- 24.1 There's no desire for sights
 when you see a sight with mindfulness.
 Experiencing it with a mind free of desire,
 you don't keep clinging to it.
- 25.1 Even as you see a sight
 and get familiar with how it feels,
 you wear away, you don't heap up:
 that's how to live mindfully.
 Eroding suffering like this,
 you're said to be in the presence of extinguishment.
- 26.1 There's no desire for sounds
 when you hear a sound with mindfulness.
 Experiencing it with a mind free of desire,
 you don't keep clinging to it.
- 27.1 Even as you hear a sound
 and get familiar with how it feels,
 you wear away, you don't heap up:
 that's how to live mindfully.
 Eroding suffering like this,
 you're said to be in the presence of extinguishment.
- 28.1 There's no desire for odors
 when you smell an odor with mindfulness.
 Experiencing it with a mind free of desire,
 you don't keep clinging to it.
- 29.1 Even as you smell an odor
 and get familiar with how it feels,

you wear away, you don't heap up:
 that's how to live mindfully.
 Eroding suffering like this,
 you're said to be in the presence of extinguishment.

There's no desire for tastes 30.1
 when you enjoy a taste with mindfulness.
 Experiencing it with a mind free of desire,
 you don't keep clinging to it.

Even as you savor a taste 31.1
 and get familiar with how it feels,
 you wear away, you don't heap up:
 that's how to live mindfully.
 Eroding suffering like this,
 you're said to be in the presence of extinguishment.

There's no desire for touches 32.1
 when you sense a touch with mindfulness.
 Experiencing it with a mind free of desire,
 you don't keep clinging to it.

Even as you sense a touch 33.1
 and get familiar with how it feels,
 you wear away, you don't heap up:
 that's how to live mindfully.
 Eroding suffering like this,
 you're said to be in the presence of extinguishment.

There's no desire for ideas 34.1
 when you know an idea with mindfulness.
 Experiencing it with a mind free of desire,
 you don't keep clinging to it.

Even as you know an idea 35.1

and get familiar with how it feels,
 you wear away, you don't heap up:
 that's how to live mindfully.
 Eroding suffering like this,
 you're said to be in the presence of extinguishment.'

36.1 That's how I understand the detailed meaning of the Buddha's brief statement."

36.2 "Good, good, Mālun̄kyaputta! It's good that you understand the detailed meaning of what I've said in brief like this." And he repeated the verses in full.

41.1 "This is how to see the detailed meaning of what I said in brief."

42.1 And then Venerable Mālun̄kyaputta approved and agreed with what the Buddha said. He got up from his seat, bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on his right, before leaving. Then Mālun̄kyaputta, living alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute, soon realized the supreme culmination of the spiritual path in this very life. He lived having achieved with his own insight the goal for which gentlemen rightly go forth from the lay life to homelessness.

42.3 He understood: "Rebirth is ended; the spiritual journey has been completed; what had to be done has been done; there is nothing further for this place." And Venerable Mālun̄kyaputta became one of the perfected.

SN 35.96

Liable to Decline

Parihānadhammasutta

1.1 "Mendicants, I will teach you who is liable to decline, who is not liable to decline, and the six fields of mastery.⁸³ Listen ...

83. This topic is addressed in several discourses, including AN 6.62 and AN 10.55. A stream-enterer is not liable to decline (AN 6.97).

And how is someone liable to decline? When a mendicant sees a sight with their eyes, bad, unskillful phenomena arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. Suppose that mendicant tolerates them and doesn't give them up, dispel them, eliminate them, and obliterate them. They should understand: 'My skillful qualities are declining. For this is what the Buddha calls decline.' 1.3

Furthermore, when a mendicant hears a sound ... smells an odor ... tastes a flavor ... encounters a touch ... knows an idea with their mind, bad, unskillful phenomena arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. If that mendicant tolerates them and doesn't give them up, dispel them, eliminate them, and obliterate them, they should understand: 'My skillful qualities are declining. For this is what the Buddha calls decline.' That's how someone is liable to decline. 2.1

And how is someone not liable to decline? When a mendicant sees a sight with their eyes, bad, unskillful phenomena arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. Suppose that mendicant doesn't tolerate them but gives them up, dispels them, eliminates them, and obliterates them. They should understand: 'My skillful qualities are not declining. For this is what the Buddha calls non-decline.' 3.1

Furthermore, when a mendicant hears a sound ... smells an odor ... tastes a flavor ... encounters a touch ... knows an idea with their mind, bad, unskillful phenomena arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. Suppose that mendicant doesn't tolerate them but gives them up, dispels them, eliminates them, and obliterates them. They should understand: 'My skillful qualities are not declining. For this is what the Buddha calls non-decline.' That's how someone is not liable to decline. 4.1

And what are the six fields of mastery? When a mendicant sees a sight with their eyes, bad, unskillful phenomena don't arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. They should understand: 'This sense field has been mastered. For this is what the Buddha calls a field of mastery.' ... Furthermore, when a mendicant knows an idea 5.1

with their mind, bad, unskillful phenomena don't arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. They should understand: "This sense field has been mastered. For this is what the Buddha calls a field of mastery.' These are the six fields of mastery."

SN 35.97

One Who Lives Negligently

Pamādavihārīsutta

- 1.1 "Mendicants, I will teach you who lives negligently and who lives diligently.⁸⁴ Listen ...
- 1.3 And how does someone live negligently?
- 1.4 When you live with the eye faculty unrestrained, your mind becomes polluted when it comes to sights known by the eye. When the mind is polluted, there's no joy.⁸⁵ When there's no joy, there's no rapture. When there's no rapture, there's no tranquility. When there's no tranquility, there's suffering. When one is suffering, the mind does not become immersed in samādhi. When the mind is not immersed in samādhi, principles do not become clear.⁸⁶ Because principles have not become clear, you're reckoned to live negligently.
- 1.12 When you live with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind faculty unrestrained, your mind becomes polluted when it comes to ideas known by the mind. When the mind is polluted, there's no joy. When there's no joy, there's no rapture. When there's no rapture, there's no tranquility. When there's no tranquility, there's suffering. When one is suffering, the mind does not become immersed in samādhi. When the mind is not immersed in samādhi, principles do

84. "Negligence" (*pamāda*) is from a root meaning to be mad or drunk. It's often used in an ethical context, but here the Buddha extends it throughout the path.

85. The discourse links "negligence" with the process of mental uplifting that leads to *samādhi* (see SN 12.23:3.11).

86. "Principles" (*dharmā*) such as the four noble truths, dependent origination, etc.

not become clear. Because principles have not become clear, you're reckoned to live negligently.

That's how someone lives negligently. 1.23

And how does someone live diligently? 2.1

When you live with the eye faculty restrained, your mind doesn't become polluted when it comes to sights known by the eye. When the mind isn't polluted, joy springs up. Being joyful, rapture springs up. When the mind is full of rapture, the body becomes tranquil. When the body is tranquil, one feels bliss. And when blissful, the mind becomes immersed in samādhi. When the mind is immersed in samādhi, principles become clear. Because principles have become clear, you're reckoned to live diligently. 2.2

When you live with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind faculty restrained, your mind doesn't become polluted when it comes to ideas known by the mind. When the mind isn't polluted, joy springs up. Being joyful, rapture springs up. When the mind is full of rapture, the body becomes tranquil. When the body is tranquil, one feels bliss. And when blissful, the mind becomes immersed in samādhi. When the mind is immersed in samādhi, principles become clear. Because principles have become clear, you're reckoned to live diligently. 2.10

That's how someone lives diligently." 2.20

SN 35.98

Restraint

Saṃvarasutta

"Mendicants, I will teach you who is restrained and who is unrestrained. Listen ... 1.1

And how is someone unrestrained? 1.3

There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, they should understand: 'My 1.4

skillful qualities are declining. For this is what the Buddha calls decline.’

- 1.8 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, they should understand: ‘My skillful qualities are declining. For this is what the Buddha calls decline.’

1.13 This is how someone is unrestrained.

2.1 And how is someone restrained?

2.2 There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn’t approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, they should understand: ‘My skillful qualities are not declining. For this is what the Buddha calls non-decline.’

2.6 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn’t approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, they should understand: ‘My skillful qualities are not declining. For this is what the Buddha calls non-decline.’

2.11 This is how someone is restrained.”

SN 35.99

Immersion

Samādhisutta

1.1 “Mendicants, develop immersion.⁸⁷ A mendicant who has immersion truly understands. What do they truly understand?

1.4 They truly understand that the eye is impermanent. They truly understand that sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact ... the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is impermanent. ...

87. For parallels see SN 22.5:1.4 and note. This discourse connects with the previous, which also emphasized the role of immersion in seeing the truth.

They truly understand that the mind is impermanent. They truly 1.9
understand that ideas ... mind consciousness ... mind contact ...
the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on
mind contact is impermanent.

Mendicants, develop immersion. A mendicant who has immer- 1.14
sion truly understands.”

SN 35.100

Retreat

Paṭisallānasutta

“Mendicants, meditate in retreat.⁸⁸ A mendicant in retreat truly un- 1.1
derstands. What do they truly understand?

They truly understand that the eye is impermanent. They truly 1.4
understand that sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact ... the
pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind
contact is impermanent.

Mendicants, meditate in retreat. A mendicant in retreat truly 1.9
understands.”

SN 35.101

It's Not Yours (1st)

Paṭhamanatumhākasutta

“Mendicants, give up what's not yours. Giving it up will be for your 1.1
welfare and happiness. And what isn't yours?

The eye isn't yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare 1.4
and happiness. Sights ... Eye consciousness ... Eye contact ... The
pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye
contact isn't yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare
and happiness.

88. See SN 22.6:1.2 and note.

- 2.1 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ...
- 3.1 The mind isn't yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness. Ideas ... Mind consciousness ... Mind contact ... The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact isn't yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness.
- 4.1 Suppose a person was to carry off the grass, sticks, branches, and leaves in this Jeta's Grove, or burn them, or do what they want with them. Would you think: 'This person is carrying us off, burning us, or doing what they want with us'?"
- 5.1 "No, sir. Why is that? Because to us that's neither self nor belonging to self."
- 8.1 "In the same way, the eye isn't yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness. ...
- 8.7 The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact isn't yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness."

SN 35.102

It's Not Yours (2nd)

Dutiyanatumhākasutta

- 1.1 "Mendicants, give up what's not yours. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness. And what isn't yours?"
- 1.4 The eye isn't yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness. Sights ... Eye consciousness ... Eye contact ...
- 1.16 The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact isn't yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness.
- 1.19 Give up what's not yours. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness."

SN 35.103

About Uddaka

Uddakasutta

“Mendicants, Uddaka son of Rāma used to say:⁸⁹

1.1

‘Hereupon, ever the knowledge master!⁹⁰

1.2

Hereupon, ever the conqueror of all!

Hereupon, ever the undug⁹¹

89. Uddaka was the second Brahmanical sage under whom the Bodhisatta practiced before awakening (MN 26:16.1). Another of his enigmatic sayings is found at DN 29:16.8. When the Bodhisatta began his study, he first learned to recite the scriptures, and in these two passages we find examples of what those scriptures were. While no teachings attributed to Uddaka have been found in the Vedic corpus, chapter 23 of the Jain *Isibhāsiyāim*—a collection of sayings of various sages, including Buddhists and Vedists—is attributed to a certain Rāmaputta, who is likely the same person.

90. I have not been able to trace this quote. It is verse, albeit unmetrical. | The initial *idaṃ* (neuter) is an exclamatory particle disconnected from the nouns (masculine). It is an idiom of the Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa (eg. 3.6.1.5, 3.7.1.2, 3.8.2.15), where it serves to highlight a dramatic statement or gesture; the text’s opening uses this idiom to announce a transformed or realized self-identity (1.1.1.4: “Hereupon, I enter from untruth to truth!”; 1.1.1.6: “Hereupon, I become he who I am”). Compare the use of *ayaṃ* (“here”) at MN 77:4.8 or *idaṃ* at SN 16.8:3.2, DN 9:5.6. Repeated initial pronouns are employed as a rhetorical device in some Vedic verses (eg. Rig Veda 6.65.4–5). | A similar phrasing is employed by Brahmā Sahampati at SN 6.13:5.1, where it emphasizes direct experience. | In early Sanskrit and Pali, *jātu* usually has the sense “ever” (or perhaps “absolutely” per the commentary’s *ekamsena*; see too Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 2.2.2.20, 14.6.8.1). | *Vedagū* is not attested in Brahmanical texts, but it is perhaps a contraction of Sanskrit *vedapārāga* in the sense “one versed in the Vedas” (such as Yājñavalkya, Mahābhārata 1.113.40). Given that Buddhist literature assumes it was a term of the brahmins, the Buddha may have learned it from this very passage.

91. The terms “dug” (*palikhata* = Ardhamāgadhi *paḍighāta*) and “boil” (*ganḍa*), neither of which are particularly common, are used by Uddaka multiple times in *Isibhāsiyāim* 23. It is remarkable that, although so few of Uddaka’s teachings are preserved, they share this striking language. Probably these were terms used

boil's root was dug out by me!⁹²

1.6 Even though Uddaka son of Rāma was no knowledge master, he said 'I'm a knowledge master.' Though he was no conqueror of all, he said 'I'm conqueror of all.' And though the boil's root was not dug out, he said 'I've dug out the boil's root.'⁹³

1.7 A mendicant might rightly say here:

1.8 'Hereupon, ever the knowledge master!
Hereupon, ever the conqueror of all!
Hereupon, ever the undug
boil's root is dug out!'

2.1 And how is someone a knowledge master? It's when a mendicant truly understands the six fields of contact's origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape. That's how a mendicant is a knowledge master.

3.1 And how is a mendicant a conqueror of all? It's when a mendicant comes to be freed by not grasping after truly understanding the six fields of contact's origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape. That's how a mendicant is a conqueror of all.

4.1 And how has a mendicant dug out the undug boil's root? 'Boil' is a term for this body made up of the four principal states, produced by mother and father, built up from rice and porridge, liable

by Uddaka himself; and perhaps "boil", like "knowledge master", was adapted by the Buddha from this passage.

92. *Gaṇḍamūla* ("boil's root") is also at Thag 4.10:4.1. | *Palikhaṇim* is first person aorist. In a characteristic touch of Vedic subtlety, Uddaka conceals the subject of the verse, only revealing that he is speaking of himself with the very final letter of the verse.

93. *Isibhāsiyāim* 23 has rather a different tenor, as there Uddaka is depicted as lamenting the presence of the boils etc., and determining to practice "knowledge, vision, and good conduct" to bring an end to the beginningless course of transmigration (SN 15.1:1.7 and note). The story of the Bodhisatta's studentship implies that Uddaka knew he was yet to attain the highest meditation that he taught (MN 26:16.9, etc.).

to impermanence, to wearing away and erosion, to breaking up and destruction.⁹⁴ ‘Boil’s root’ is a term for craving. It’s when a mendicant has given up craving, cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, obliterated it, so it’s unable to arise in the future. That’s how a mendicant has dug out the undug boil’s root.

Uddaka son of Rāma used to say: 5.1

‘Hereupon, ever the knowledge master! 5.2
Hereupon, ever the conqueror of all!
Hereupon, ever the undug
boil’s root is dug out!’

Even though Uddaka son of Rāma was no knowledge master, he 5.6
said ‘I’m a knowledge master.’ Though he was no conqueror of all,
he said ‘I’m conqueror of all.’ And though the boil’s root was not dug
out, he said ‘I’ve dug out the boil’s root.’

A mendicant might rightly say here: 5.7

‘Hereupon, ever the knowledge master! 5.8
Hereupon, ever the conqueror of all!
Hereupon, ever the undug
boil’s root is dug out!’”

94. Also at AN 9.15:2.1. Elsewhere, “boil” is a term for sensual pleasures (AN 6.23) or for suffering (SN 22.122:1.4).

THE THIRD FIFTY

The Chapter on Sanctuary

SN 35.104

Sanctuary from the Yoke

Yogakkhemisutta

At Sāvattthī.

1.1

“Mendicants, I will teach you an exposition of the teaching, an explanation of one who has found sanctuary from the yoke.⁹⁵ Listen

1.2

...

And what is an exposition of the teaching, an explanation of one who has found sanctuary from the yoke?

1.4

There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. The Realized One has given these up, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, and obliterated them, so they are unable to arise in the future. He teaches yoking oneself to meditation for giving them up. That’s why the Realized One is called one who has found sanctuary from the yoke. ...⁹⁶

1.5

There are ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. The Realized One has given these up, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump,

1.8

95. For “sanctuary from the yoke”, see note on SN 7.11:6.2.

96. The duality between *yoga* (“yoke”) as “harness, fetter” and as “commitment to practice” is crucial to this sutta. The Buddha is not teaching nihilism, he is teaching us to “yoke” ourselves to the right cause.

and obliterated them, so they are unable to arise in the future. He teaches yoking oneself to meditation for giving them up. That's why the Realized One is called one who has found sanctuary from the yoke.

- 1.11 This is an exposition of the teaching, an explanation of one who has found sanctuary from the yoke.”

SN 35.105

Because of Grasping

Upādāyasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, when what exists, because of grasping what, do pleasure and pain arise in oneself?”
- 2.1 “Our teachings are rooted in the Buddha. ...”
- 3.1 “Mendicants, when there’s an eye, because of grasping the eye, pleasure and pain arise in oneself. ... When there’s a mind, because of grasping the mind, pleasure and pain arise in oneself.
- 3.3 What do you think, mendicants? Is the eye permanent or impermanent?”
- 4.1 “Impermanent, sir.”
- 5.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 6.1 “Suffering, sir.”
- 7.1 “But by not grasping what’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, would pleasure and pain arise in oneself?”
- 8.1 “No, sir.” ...
- 9.1 “Is the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind permanent or impermanent?”
- 16.1 “Impermanent, sir.”
- 17.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 18.1 “Suffering, sir.”
- 19.1 “But by not grasping what’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, would pleasure and pain arise in oneself?”
- 20.1 “No, sir.”

“Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed. 21.1

They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’” 21.3

SN 35.106

The Origin of Suffering

Dukkhasamudayasutta

“Mendicants, I will teach you the origin and disappearance of suffering. Listen ... 1.1

And what, mendicants, is the origin of suffering? Eye consciousness arises dependent on the eye and sights. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. This is the origin of suffering ... 1.3

Mind consciousness arises dependent on the mind and ideas. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. This is the origin of suffering. 1.11

And what is the disappearance of suffering? Eye consciousness arises dependent on the eye and sights. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. When that craving fades away and ceases with no residue left behind, grasping ceases. When grasping ceases, continued existence ceases. When continued existence ceases, rebirth ceases. When rebirth ceases, old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress cease. That is how this entire mass of suffering ceases. This is the disappearance of suffering. ... 2.1

Mind consciousness arises dependent on the mind and ideas. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. When that craving 2.12

fades away and ceases with no residue left behind, grasping ceases. When grasping ceases, continued existence ceases. When continued existence ceases, rebirth ceases. When rebirth ceases, old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress cease. That is how this entire mass of suffering ceases. This is the disappearance of suffering.”

SN 35.107

The Origin of the World

Lokasamudayasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you the origin and disappearance of the world. Listen ...
- 1.3 And what, mendicants, is the origin of the world? Eye consciousness arises dependent on the eye and sights. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. Craving is a requirement for grasping. Grasping is a requirement for continued existence. Continued existence is a requirement for rebirth. Rebirth is a requirement for old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress to come to be. This is the origin of the world. ...
- 1.13 Mind consciousness arises dependent on the mind and ideas. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. Craving is a requirement for grasping. Grasping is a requirement for continued existence. Continued existence is a requirement for rebirth. Rebirth is a requirement for old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress to come to be. This is the origin of the world.
- 2.1 And what is the disappearance of the world? Eye consciousness arises dependent on the eye and sights. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. When that craving fades away and ceases no residue left behind, grasping ceases. When grasping ceases, continued ex-

istence ceases. When continued existence ceases, rebirth ceases. When rebirth ceases, old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress cease. That is how this entire mass of suffering ceases. This is the disappearance of the world. ...

Mind consciousness arises dependent on the mind and ideas. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. When that craving fades away and ceases no residue left behind, grasping ceases. When grasping ceases ... That is how this entire mass of suffering ceases. This is the disappearance of the world.” 2.12

SN 35.108

I'm Better

Seyyohamasmisutta

“Mendicants, when what exists, because of grasping what and insisting on what, do people think ‘I’m better’ or ‘I’m equal’ or ‘I’m worse’?” 1.1

“Our teachings are rooted in the Buddha. ...” 2.1

“When there’s an eye, because of grasping the eye and insisting on the eye, people think ‘I’m better’ or ‘I’m equal’ or ‘I’m worse’. ...” 3.1

When there’s a mind, because of grasping the mind and insisting on the mind, people think ‘I’m better’ or ‘I’m equal’ or ‘I’m worse’. 3.3

What do you think, mendicants? Is the eye permanent or impermanent?” 3.4

“Impermanent, sir.” 4.1

“But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 5.1

“Suffering, sir.” 6.1

“But by not grasping what’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, would people think ‘I’m better’ or ‘I’m equal’ or ‘I’m worse’?” 7.1

“No, sir.” ... 8.1

“Is the mind permanent or impermanent?” 10.1

“Impermanent, sir.” 11.1

- 12.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”
- 13.1 “Suffering, sir.”
- 14.1 “But by not grasping what’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, would people think ‘I’m better’ or ‘I’m equal’ or ‘I’m worse’?”
- 15.1 “No, sir.”
- 16.1 “Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed.
- 16.3 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.109

Things That Tighten Fetters

Samyojanīyasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you the things that tighten the fetters, and the fetter.⁹⁷ Listen ...
- 1.3 What are the things that tighten the fetters? And what is the fetter? The eye is something that tightens the fetters. The desire and greed for it is the fetter.
- 1.6 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is something that tightens the fetters. The desire and greed for it is the fetter. These are called the things that tighten the fetters, and this is the fetter.”

97. This discourse and the next parallel SN 22.120–21.

SN 35.110

Things That Fuel Grasping

Upādāṇiyasutta

“Mendicants, I will teach you the things that fuel grasping, and the grasping. Listen ... 1.1

What are the things that fuel grasping? And what is the grasping? 1.3
The eye is something that fuels grasping. The desire and greed for it is the grasping.

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is something that 1.6
fuels grasping. The desire and greed for it is the grasping. These are called the things that fuel grasping, and this is the grasping.”

SN 35.111

Complete Understanding of the Interior

Ajjhattikāyatanaparijānanasutta

“Mendicants, without directly knowing and completely understand- 1.1
ing the eye, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can’t end suffering.⁹⁸

Without directly knowing and completely understanding the ear 1.2
... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, without dispassion for it and giving it up, you can’t end suffering.

By directly knowing and completely understanding the eye, hav- 1.7
ing dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering.

By directly knowing and completely understanding the ear ... 1.8
nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, having dispassion for it and giving it up, you can end suffering.”

98. This is similar to SN 35.26, as is the next discourse.

SN 35.112

Complete Understanding of the Exterior

Bāhirāyatanaparijānanasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, without directly knowing and completely understanding sights ... sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas, without dispassion for them and giving them up, you can’t end suffering.
- 1.7 By directly knowing and completely understanding sights ... sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas, having dispassion for them and giving them up, you can end suffering.”

SN 35.113

Listening In

Upassutisutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying at Nātika in the brick house.⁹⁹ Then while the Buddha was in private retreat he spoke this exposition of the teaching:
- 1.3 “Eye consciousness arises dependent on the eye and sights. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. Craving is a requirement for grasping. Grasping is a requirement for continued existence. Continued existence is a requirement for rebirth. Rebirth is a requirement for old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress to come to be. That is how this entire mass of suffering originates.
- 1.11 Ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ...
- 1.12 Mind consciousness arises dependent on the mind and ideas. The meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. Craving is a requirement for grasping. Grasping is a requirement for continued existence.

99. This is the same as SN 12.45; see there for notes.

Continued existence is a requirement for rebirth. Rebirth is a requirement for old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress to come to be. That is how this entire mass of suffering originates.

Eye consciousness arises dependent on the eye and sights. The 2.1
meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. When that craving fades away and ceases no residue left behind, grasping ceases. When grasping ceases, continued existence ceases. When continued existence ceases, rebirth ceases. When rebirth ceases, old age and death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress cease. That is how this entire mass of suffering ceases.

Ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 2.9

Mind consciousness arises dependent on the mind and ideas. The 2.10
meeting of the three is contact. Contact is a requirement for feeling. Feeling is a requirement for craving. When that craving fades away and ceases no residue left behind, grasping ceases. When grasping ceases ... That is how this entire mass of suffering ceases."

Now at that time a certain monk was standing listening in on the 3.1
Buddha. The Buddha saw him and said, "Monk, did you hear that exposition of the teaching?"

"Yes, sir." 3.5

"Learn that exposition of the teaching, memorize it, and remember it. That exposition of the teaching is beneficial and relevant to the fundamentals of the spiritual life." 3.6

The Chapter on the World and the Kinds of Sensual Stimulation

SN 35.114

Māra's Snare (1st)

Paṭhamamārapāśasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, there are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, they’re called a mendicant trapped in Māra’s lair, fallen under Māra’s sway, and caught in Māra’s snare. They’re bound by Māra’s bonds, and the Wicked One can do with them what he wants.
- 2.1 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ...
- 3.1 There are ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keep clinging to them, they’re called a mendicant trapped in Māra’s lair, fallen under Māra’s sway, and caught in Māra’s snare. They’re bound by Māra, and the Wicked One can do with them what he wants.
- 4.1 There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn’t approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, they’re called a men-

dicant not trapped in Māra's lair, not fallen under Māra's sway, and released from Māra's snare. They're free from Māra's bonds, and the Wicked One cannot do with them what he wants.

There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... 5.1

There are ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, they're called a mendicant not trapped in Māra's lair, not fallen under Māra's sway, and released from Māra's snare. They're free from Māra's bonds, and the Wicked One cannot do with them what he wants." 6.1

SN 35.115

Māra's Snare (2nd)

Dutiyamārapāsasutta

"Mendicants, there are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, they're called a mendicant who is bound in sights known by the eye. They're trapped in Māra's lair, fallen under Māra's sway, and caught in Māra's snare. They're bound by Māra's bonds, and the Wicked One can do with them what he wants. 1.1

There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, they're called a mendicant who is bound in ideas known by the mind. They're trapped in Māra's lair, fallen under Māra's sway, and caught in Māra's snare. They're bound by Māra's bonds, and the Wicked One can do with them what he wants. 2.1

There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, they're called a mendicant who is freed from sights known by the eye. They're not trapped 3.1

in Māra’s lair, not fallen under Māra’s sway, and released from Māra’s snare. They’re free from Māra’s bonds, and the Wicked One cannot do with them what he wants.

- 4.1 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn’t approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, they’re called a mendicant who is freed from ideas known by the mind. They’re not trapped in Māra’s lair, not fallen under Māra’s sway, and released from Māra’s snare. They’re free from Māra’s bonds, and the Wicked One cannot do with them what he wants.”

SN 35.116

Traveling to the End of the World

Lokantagamanasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I say it’s not possible to know or see or reach the end of the world by traveling.¹⁰⁰ But I also say there’s no making an end of suffering without reaching the end of the world.”
- 1.3 When he had spoken, the Blessed One rose from his seat and entered his dwelling.
- 1.4 Soon after the Buddha left, those mendicants considered, “The Buddha gave this brief summary recital, then entered his dwelling without explaining the meaning in detail. ... Who can explain in detail the meaning of this brief summary recital given by the Buddha?”
- 2.1 Then those mendicants thought, “This Venerable Ānanda is praised by the Buddha and esteemed by his sensible spiritual companions. He is capable of explaining in detail the meaning of this

100. The “end of the world” is taught to brahmin cosmologists at AN 9.38, and illustrated with the parable of Rohitassa at SN 2.26 = AN 4.45. | I use both “world” and “cosmos” for *loka*. As this discourse shows, the exact meaning is highly mutable and context-specific.

brief summary recital given by the Buddha. Let's go to him, and ask him about this matter."

Then those mendicants went to Ānanda and exchanged greetings 3.1
with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, they sat down to one side. They told him what had happened, and said, "May Venerable Ānanda please explain this."

"Reverends, suppose there was a person in need of heartwood. 5.1
And while wandering in search of heartwood he'd come across a large tree standing with heartwood. But he'd pass over the roots and trunk, imagining that the heartwood should be sought in the branches and leaves.

Such is the consequence for the venerables. Though you were 5.2
face to face with the Buddha, you bypassed him, imagining that you should ask me about this matter. For he is the Buddha, the one who knows and sees. He is vision, he is knowledge, he is the manifestation of principle, he is the manifestation of divinity. He is the preacher, the proclaimer, the elucidator of meaning, the bestower of freedom from death, the lord of truth, the Realized One. That was the time to approach the Buddha and ask about this matter. You should have remembered it in line with the Buddha's answer."

"Certainly he is the Buddha, the one who knows and sees. He 6.1
is vision, he is knowledge, he is the manifestation of principle, he is the manifestation of divinity. He is the preacher, the proclaimer, the elucidator of meaning, the bestower of freedom from death, the lord of truth, the Realized One. That was the time to approach the Buddha and ask about this matter. We should have remembered it in line with the Buddha's answer.

Still, Venerable Ānanda is praised by the Buddha and esteemed by 6.5
his sensible spiritual companions. You are capable of explaining in detail the meaning of this brief summary recital given by the Buddha. Please explain this, if it's no trouble."

"Then listen and apply your mind well, I will speak." 7.1

"Yes, reverend," they replied. Ānanda said this: 7.2

- 8.1 “Reverends, the Buddha gave this brief summary recital, then entered his dwelling without explaining the meaning in detail:
- 8.2 ‘Mendicants, I say it’s not possible to know or see or reach the end of the world by traveling. But I also say there’s no making an end of suffering without reaching the end of the world.’
- 8.4 This is how I understand the detailed meaning of this summary recital.
- 8.5 Whatever in the world through which you perceive the world and conceive the world is called the world in the training of the Noble One. And through what in the world do you perceive the world and conceive the world?
- 8.8 Through the eye in the world you perceive the world and conceive the world. Through the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind in the world you perceive the world and conceive the world.
- 8.14 Whatever in the world through which you perceive the world and conceive the world is called the world in the training of the Noble One.
- 8.16 Reverends, the Buddha gave this brief summary, then entered his dwelling without explaining the meaning in detail:
- 8.17 ‘Mendicants, I say it’s not possible to know or see or reach the end of the world by traveling. But I also say there’s no making an end of suffering without reaching the end of the world.’
- 8.19 That is how I understand the detailed meaning of this summary.
- 8.20 If you wish, you may go to the Buddha and ask him about this. You should remember it in line with the Buddha’s answer.”
- 9.1 “Yes, reverend,” replied those mendicants. Then they rose from their seats and went to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and told him what had happened.
- 10.1 Then they said, “And Ānanda explained the meaning to us in this manner, with these words and phrases.”
- 11.1 “Mendicants, Ānanda is astute, he has great wisdom. If you came to me and asked this question, I would answer it in exactly the same way as Ānanda. That is what it means, and that’s how you should remember it.”

SN 35.117

The Kinds of Sensual Stimulation

Kāmaguṇasutta

“Mendicants, before my awakening—when I was still unawakened 1.1
but intent on awakening—I thought: ‘My mind might often stray
toward the five kinds of sensual stimulation that I formerly experi-
enced—which have passed, ceased, and perished—or to those in
the present, or in the future a little.’¹⁰¹

Then it occurred to me: ‘In my own way I should practice dili- 1.3
gence, mindfulness, and protecting the mind regarding the five kinds
of sensual stimulation that I formerly experienced—which have
passed, ceased, and perished.’¹⁰²

So, mendicants, your minds might also often stray toward the 1.5
five kinds of sensual stimulation that you formerly experienced—
which have passed, ceased, and perished—or to those in the present,
or in the future a little. So in your own way you should practice
diligence, mindfulness, and protecting the mind regarding the five
kinds of sensual stimulation that you formerly experienced—which
have passed, ceased, and perished.

So you should understand that dimension where the eye ceases 1.7
and perception of sights fades away.¹⁰³ You should understand that
dimension where the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ceases
and perception of ideas fades away.”

When he had spoken, the Blessed One rose from his seat and 1.10
entered his dwelling.

101. This phrasing is unique, suggesting that worrying about the future “a little” was a particular scenario encountered by the Bodhisatta.

102. *Attarūpa* (“in my own way”) is also at AN 4.117:1.1 and DN 27:3.3. Commentary glosses, “in conformity with one’s own nature,” with the secondary sense, “for one’s own benefit”. | Compare *attakāmarūpa* at MN 31:3.5.

103. The “dimension” (*āyatana*) is Nibbāna. | This passage shares with MN 105:11.2 and Snp 5.8:6.7 the unusual form *se*, which here is the singular “that”. | For the concluding verb, accept the variant *virajjati* from PTS and BJT.

- 2.1 Soon after the Buddha left, those mendicants considered, “The Buddha gave this brief summary, then entered his dwelling without explaining the meaning in detail. ... Who can explain in detail the meaning of this brief summary given by the Buddha?”
- 3.1 Then those mendicants thought, “This Venerable Ānanda is praised by the Buddha and esteemed by his sensible spiritual companions. He is capable of explaining in detail the meaning of this brief summary given by the Buddha. Let’s go to him, and ask him about this matter.”
- 4.1 Then those mendicants went to Ānanda, and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, they sat down to one side. They told him what had happened, and said, “May Venerable Ānanda please explain this.”
- 6.1 “Reverends, suppose there was a person in need of heartwood.
... ”
- 6.2 “Please explain this, if it’s no trouble.”
- 7.1 “Then listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.”
- 7.2 “Yes, reverend,” they replied. Ānanda said this:
- 8.1 “Reverends, the Buddha gave this brief summary, then entered his dwelling without explaining the meaning in detail:
- 8.2 ‘So you should understand that dimension where the eye ceases and perception of sights fades away. You should understand that dimension where the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ceases and perception of ideas fades away.’
- 8.4 And this is how I understand the detailed meaning of this summary.
- 8.5 The Buddha was referring to the cessation of the six sense fields when he said:¹⁰⁴ ‘So you should understand that dimension where the eye ceases and perception of sights fades away. You should un-

104. Concern for the past, present, and future is connected with experience—recalling it, enjoying it, or longing for it. One desires the future so that one’s senses can continue to enjoy pleasures. A perfected one no longer generates senses to sate their desires.

derstand that dimension where the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ceases and perception of ideas fades away.’

The Buddha gave this brief summary, then entered his dwelling 8.8 without explaining the meaning in detail. And this is how I understand the detailed meaning of this summary.

If you wish, you may go to the Buddha and ask him about this. 8.12 You should remember it in line with the Buddha’s answer.”

“Yes, reverend,” replied those mendicants. Then they rose from 9.1 their seats and went to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and told him what had happened.

Then they said, “And Ānanda explained the meaning to us in this 10.1 manner, with these words and phrases.”

“Mendicants, Ānanda is astute, he has great wisdom. If you came 11.1 to me and asked this question, I would answer it in exactly the same way as Ānanda. That is what it means, and that’s how you should remember it.”

SN 35.118

The Question of Sakka

Sakkapañhasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha, on the Vulture’s 1.1 Peak Mountain.¹⁰⁵ And then Sakka, lord of gods, went up to the Buddha, bowed, stood to one side, and said to him:

“What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient 1.3 beings are not fully extinguished in this very life? What is the cause, what is the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life?”

“Lord of gods, there are sights known by the eye, which are likable, 2.1 desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, their consciousness

105. A long discourse of this name is at DN 21; see too the next discourse.

has that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant with fuel for grasping does not become extinguished.

- 3.1 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, their consciousness has that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant with fuel for grasping does not become extinguished. That's the cause, that's the reason why some sentient beings are not fully extinguished in this very life.
- 4.1 There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, their consciousness doesn't have that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant free of grasping becomes extinguished.
- 5.1 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, their consciousness doesn't have that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant free of grasping becomes extinguished. That's the cause, that's the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life."

SN 35.119

The Question of Pañcasikha

Pañcasikhasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha, on the Vulture's Peak Mountain.¹⁰⁶ And then the centaur Pañcasikha went up to the Buddha, bowed, stood to one side, and said to him:

106. For Pañcasikha, see DN 21 and notes there. This question is uncharacteristic of the sensualist Pañcasikha, and it's likely this discourse is an artificial construct, suggested by the fact that the previous discourse is "The Question of Sakka".

“What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are not fully extinguished in this very life? What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life?” 1.3

“Pañcasikha, there are sights known by the eye ... 1.5

ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, their consciousness has that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant with fuel for grasping does not become extinguished. That’s the cause, that’s the reason why some sentient beings are not fully extinguished in this very life. 1.6

There are sights known by the eye ... 2.1

ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn’t approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, their consciousness doesn’t have that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant free of grasping becomes extinguished. That’s the cause, that’s the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life.” 2.2

SN 35.120

Sāriputta and the Protégé

Sāriputtasaddhivihārikasutta

At one time Venerable Sāriputta was staying near Sāvattī in Jeta’s Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika’s monastery.¹⁰⁷ Then a certain mendicant went up to Venerable Sāriputta, and exchanged greetings with him. 1.1

When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to him, “Reverend Sāriputta, a mendicant 1.3

107. This discourse situates the six senses within the path of practice known as the “Gradual Training”, set out in full at DN 2.

protégé of mine has resigned the training and returned to a lesser life.”¹⁰⁸

- 2.1 “That’s how it is, reverend, when someone doesn’t guard the sense doors, eats too much, and is not committed to wakefulness. It is quite impossible for such a mendicant to maintain the full and pure spiritual life for the rest of their life. But it is quite possible for a mendicant to maintain the full and pure spiritual life for the rest of their life if they guard the sense doors, eat in moderation, and are committed to wakefulness.
- 3.1 And how does someone guard the sense doors? When a mendicant sees a sight with the eyes, they don’t get caught up in the features and details. If the faculty of sight were left unrestrained, bad unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure would become overwhelming. For this reason, they practice restraint, protecting the faculty of sight, and achieving its restraint. When they hear a sound with their ears ... When they smell an odor with their nose ... When they taste a flavor with their tongue ... When they feel a touch with their body ... When they know an idea with their mind, they don’t get caught up in the features and details. If the faculty of mind were left unrestrained, bad unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure would become overwhelming. For this reason, they practice restraint, protecting the faculty of mind, and achieving its restraint. That’s how someone guards the sense doors.
- 4.1 And how does someone eat in moderation? It’s when a mendicant reflects rationally on the food that they eat: ‘Not for fun, indulgence, adornment, or decoration, but only to sustain this body, to avoid harm, and to support spiritual practice. In this way, I shall put an end to old discomfort and not give rise to new discomfort, and I will have the means to keep going, blamelessness, and a comfortable abiding.’ That’s how someone eats in moderation.

108. The *saddhivihārika* (“protégé”) was a resident student ordained under the protection and guidance of a mentor (*upajjhāya*).

And how is someone committed to wakefulness? It's when a mendicant practices walking and sitting meditation by day, purifying their mind from obstacles. In the first watch of the night, they continue to practice walking and sitting meditation. In the middle watch, they lie down in the lion's posture—on the right side, placing one foot on top of the other—mindful and aware, and focused on the time of getting up. In the last watch, they get up and continue to practice walking and sitting meditation, purifying their mind from obstacles. That's how someone is committed to wakefulness. 5.1

So you should train like this: 'We will guard the sense doors, eat in moderation, and be committed to wakefulness.' That's how you should train." 5.7

SN 35.121

Advice to Rāhula

Rāhulovādasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying near Sāvattthī in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's monastery.¹⁰⁹ 1.1

Then as he was in private retreat this thought came to his mind, "The qualities that ripen in freedom have ripened in Rāhula."¹¹⁰ Why don't I lead him further to the ending of defilements?" 1.2

Then the Buddha robed up in the morning and, taking his bowl and robe, wandered for alms in Sāvattthī. After the meal, on his return 1.5

109. This discourse recurs at MN 147.

110. Five perceptions that ripen in freedom are taught at DN 33:2.1.139, but apart from that we do not encounter this idea in the discourses. | In SN 18.1–5, Rāhula requests a teaching so he can go on retreat. The teachings given there can be compared with the parallel, which says the Buddha first told Rāhula to teach the five aggregates, the six sense-spheres, and conditionality, and then to go on retreat and meditate on the same teachings (SA 200 at T ii 51a23). Only then did the Buddha consider him ready.

from almsround, he addressed Venerable Rāhula, “Rāhula, get your sitting cloth.¹¹¹ Let’s go to the Dark Forest for the day’s meditation.”

1.9 “Yes, sir,” replied Rāhula. Taking his sitting cloth he followed behind the Buddha.

2.1 Now at that time many thousands of deities followed the Buddha, thinking,¹¹² “Today the Buddha will lead Rāhula further to the ending of defilements!”

2.3 Then the Buddha plunged deep into the Dark Forest and sat at the root of a tree on the seat spread out. Rāhula bowed to the Buddha and sat down to one side. The Buddha said to him:

3.1 “What do you think, Rāhula? Is the eye permanent or impermanent?”

4.1 “Impermanent, sir.”

5.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”

6.1 “Suffering, sir.”

7.1 “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”

8.1 “No, sir.”

9.1 “Are sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact permanent or impermanent?”

14.1 “Impermanent, sir.” ...

15.1 “Anything included in feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness that arises dependent on eye contact: is that permanent or impermanent?”

16.1 “Impermanent, sir.”

17.1 “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?”

18.1 “Suffering, sir.”

19.1 “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”

111. The sitting cloth was a standard requisite of monastics (Bu Pc 89). Regularly featured in the texts of the Sarvāstivāda schools, it is rarely mentioned in the Pali suttas (but see DN 16:3.1.3).

112. The presence of thousands of deities, which is unique to this discourse, is not mentioned in the Chinese parallel, and is obviously a later addition.

- “No, sir.” 20.1
- “Is the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind permanent or impermanent?” 21.1
- “Impermanent, sir.” 34.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 35.1
- “Suffering, sir.” 36.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?” 37.1
- “No, sir.” 38.1
- “Are ideas ... mind consciousness ... mind contact permanent or impermanent?” 39.1
- “Impermanent, sir.” ... 44.1
- “Anything included in feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness that arises dependent on mind contact: is that permanent or impermanent?” 45.1
- “Impermanent, sir.” 46.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 47.1
- “Suffering, sir.” 48.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?” 49.1
- “No, sir.” 50.1
- “Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact. And they grow disillusioned with anything included in feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness that arises dependent on eye contact. 51.1
- They grow disillusioned with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... 51.2
- They grow disillusioned with the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact. And they grow disillusioned with anything included in feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness that arises dependent on mind contact. 52.1
- Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed. 52.2

52.3 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’”

53.1 That is what the Buddha said. Satisfied, Venerable Rāhula approved what the Buddha said. And while this discourse was being spoken, Rāhula’s mind was freed from defilements by not grasping.

53.4 And the stainless, immaculate vision of the Dhamma arose in those thousands of deities:

53.5 “Everything that is liable to arise is liable to cease.”

SN 35.122

Things That Tighten Fetters

Samyojaniyadhammasutta

1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you the things that tighten the fetters, and the fetter. Listen ...

1.3 What are the things that tighten the fetters? And what is the fetter? There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. These are called the things that tighten the fetters. The desire and greed for them is the fetter.

1.7 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... thoughts known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. These are called the things that tighten the fetters. The desire and greed for them is the fetter.”

SN 35.123

Things That Fuel Grasping

Upādāṇiyadhammasutta

1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you the things that fuel grasping, and the grasping. Listen ...

What are the things that fuel grasping? And what is the grasping? 1.3
 There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. These are called the things that fuel grasping. The desire and greed for them is the grasping.

There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known 1.7
 by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. These are called the things that fuel grasping. The desire and greed for them is the grasping."

The Chapter on Householders

SN 35.124

At Vesālī

Vesālīsutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Vesālī, at the Great Wood, in the hall with the peaked roof. Then the householder Ugga of Vesālī went up to the Buddha, sat down to one side, and said to him:¹¹³
- 1.3 “What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are not fully extinguished in this very life? What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life?”
- 2.1 “Householder, there are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, their consciousness has that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant with fuel for grasping does not become extinguished.
- 2.4 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual,

113. Ugga was the foremost in giving nice things (AN 1.253), a quality exemplified at AN 5.44. This Ugga (“of Vesālī”) and the Uggata of the next discourse (“of Elephant Village” near Vesālī) are both said to have eight excellent qualities (AN 8.21, AN 8.22).

and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, their consciousness has that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant with fuel for grasping does not become extinguished.

That's the cause, that's the reason why some sentient beings are not fully extinguished in this very life. 2.8

There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, their consciousness doesn't have that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant free of grasping becomes extinguished. 3.1

There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, their consciousness doesn't have that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant free of grasping becomes extinguished. 3.4

That's the cause, that's the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life." 3.8

SN 35.125

In the Land of the Vajjis

Vajjīsutta

At one time the Buddha was staying in the land of the Vajjis at Elephant Village. Then the householder Uggata of Elephant Village went up to the Buddha, sat down to one side, and said to him:¹¹⁴ 1.1

"What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are not fully extinguished in this very life? What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life?" ... 1.3

(Tell in full as in the previous discourse.)

114. At AN 1.254 and AN 6.126 he is called Uggata, which I adopt for clarity over text's Ugga here.

SN 35.126

At NāḶandā

NāḶandasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near NāḶandā in Pāvārika’s Mango Grove.
- 1.2 Then the householder Upāli went up to the Buddha ... and asked him,¹¹⁵ “What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are not fully extinguished in this very life? What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life?” ...
(Tell in full as in SN 35.124.)

SN 35.127

With Bhāradvāja

Bhāradvājasutta

- 1.1 At one time Venerable Bhāradvāja the Alms-Gatherer was staying near Kosambī in Ghosita’s monastery.¹¹⁶ Then King Udena went up to Bhāradvāja the Alms-Gatherer and exchanged greetings with him.¹¹⁷ When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to him:
- 1.4 “Worthy Bhāradvāja, there are these young monks who are youthful, with pristine black hair, blessed with youth, in the prime of life; and they’ve never played around with sensual pleasures. What is the

115. Upāli’s conversion is related at MN 56.

116. Bhāradvāja the Alms-Gatherer declares enlightenment at SN 48.49, resulting in him being praised as the foremost in roaring a lion’s roar (AN 1.195). He was noted for his austere lifestyle (Ud 4.6), which he explained in his verses at Thag 2.2. He and Moggallāna once egged each other on to win a psychic power contest, for which he was reprimanded by the Buddha (Kd 15:8.1.1).

117. Udena of Kosambī features in Ud 7.1, a key event in the so-called “Kosambi cycle”.

cause, what is the reason why they practice the full and pure spiritual life as long as they live, maintaining it for a long time?”

“Great king, this has been stated by the Blessed One, who knows 1.5
and sees, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha:¹¹⁸

‘Please, monks, think of women your mother’s age as your mother. 1.6
Think of women your sister’s age as your sister. And think of women
your daughter’s age as your daughter.’¹¹⁹

This is a cause, Great King, this is a reason why these young monks 1.7
practice the full and pure spiritual life as long as they live, maintaining
it for a long time.”

“But worthy Bhāradvāja, the mind is wanton. Sometimes 2.1
thoughts of desire come up even for women your mother’s age, your
sister’s age, or your daughter’s age. Is there another cause, another
reason why these young monks live the full and pure spiritual life
for their entire life?”

“Great king, this has been stated by the Blessed One, who knows 3.1
and sees, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha:

‘Please, monks, examine your own body up from the soles of the 3.2
feet and down from the tips of the hairs, wrapped in skin and full
of many kinds of filth.¹²⁰ In this body there is head hair, body hair,
nails, teeth, skin, flesh, sinews, bones, bone marrow, kidneys, heart,
liver, diaphragm, spleen, lungs, intestines, mesentery, undigested
food, feces, bile, phlegm, pus, blood, sweat, fat, tears, grease, saliva,
snot, synovial fluid, urine.’

This is also a cause, Great King, this is a reason why these young 3.4
monks live the full and pure spiritual life for their entire life, main-
taining it for a long time.”

118. Despite the claim here, this saying is not spoken by the Buddha in the Pali. Perhaps the original discourse was lost.

119. A healthy monastic life cannot be lived in fear and loathing of the opposite sex. A positive emotional connection is grounded in *mettā*, derived ultimately from the experience of familial love, just as a mother’s cherishing of her child is the basis for universal love (Sn̐ 1.8:7.1).

120. The perception of kindness, cherishing, and love is established regarding the opposite sex, while detachment is cultivated for one’s own body.

- 3.5 “This is easy to do for those mendicants who have developed their physical endurance, ethics, mind, and wisdom.¹²¹ But it’s hard to do for those mendicants who have not developed their physical endurance, ethics, mind, and wisdom. Sometimes I plan to focus on something as ugly, but only its beauty comes to mind. Is there another cause, another reason why these young monks live the full and pure spiritual life for their entire life?”
- 4.1 “Great king, this has been stated by the Blessed One, who knows and sees, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha:
- 4.2 ‘Please, monks, live with sense doors guarded. When you see a sight with your eyes, don’t get caught up in the features and details. If the faculty of sight were left unrestrained, bad unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure would become overwhelming. For this reason, practice restraint, protect the faculty of sight, and achieve its restraint. When you hear a sound with your ears ... When you smell an odor with your nose ... When you taste a flavor with your tongue ... When you feel a touch with your body ... When you know an idea with your mind, don’t get caught up in the features and details. If the faculty of mind were left unrestrained, bad unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure would become overwhelming. For this reason, practice restraint, protect the faculty of mind, and achieve its restraint.’
- 4.11 This is also a cause, Great King, this is a reason why these young monks practice the full and pure spiritual life as long as they live, maintaining it for a long time.”
- 5.1 “It’s incredible, worthy Bhāradvāja, it’s amazing! How well this was said by the Buddha! This is the real cause, this is the reason why these young monks practice the full and pure spiritual life as long as they live, maintaining it for a long time.¹²²

121. For “physical endurance”, see MN 36:7.2.

122. With *esova* (“this is the real”), the king shows that he was unpersuaded by the other practices, but is convinced by this one, which agrees with his experience.

For sometimes I too enter the harem with unprotected body, 5.4
speech, mind, mindfulness, and sense faculties. At those times powerful
thoughts of desire get the better of me.¹²³ But sometimes I
enter the harem with protected body, speech, mind, mindfulness,
and sense faculties. At those times such thoughts of desire don't get
the better of me.

Excellent, worthy Bhāradvāja! Excellent! As if he were righting 5.6
the overturned, or revealing the hidden, or pointing out the path
to the lost, or lighting a lamp in the dark so people with clear eyes
can see what's there, the worthy Bhāradvāja has made the teaching
clear in many ways. I go for refuge to the Buddha, to the teaching,
and to the mendicant Saṅgha. From this day forth, may the worthy
Bhāradvāja remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge
for life."

SN 35.128

With Soṇa

Soṇasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha in the Bamboo 1.1
Grove, the squirrels' feeding ground.

Then the householder Soṇa went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat 1.2
down to one side, and said to him:¹²⁴

"What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient 1.3
beings are not fully extinguished in this very life? What is the cause,
sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished
in this very life?" ...

(Tell in full as in SN 35.118.)

123. The *antepura* is the "inner sanctum", sometimes the enclosed area of the
"royal compound" (DN 14:2.2.10), but here the women's apartments or "harem".

124. The householder Soṇa appears also in SN 22.49 and SN 22.50.

SN 35.129

With Ghosita

Ghositasutta

- 1.1 At one time Venerable Ānanda was staying near Kosambī in Ghosita's monastery. Then the householder Ghosita went up to Venerable Ānanda, and said to him:
- 1.3 "Honorable Ānanda, they speak of 'the diversity of elements'.¹²⁵ In what way did the Buddha speak of the diversity of elements?"
- 1.5 "Householder, the eye element is found, as are agreeable sights, and eye consciousness. Pleasant feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as pleasant. The eye element is found, as are disagreeable sights, and eye consciousness. Painful feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as painful. The eye element is found, as are sights that are a basis for equanimity, and eye consciousness.¹²⁶ Neutral feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as neutral.
- 1.11 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind element is found, as are agreeable ideas, and mind consciousness. Pleasant feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as pleasant. The mind element is found, as are disagreeable ideas, and mind consciousness. Painful feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as painful. The mind element is found, as are ideas that are a basis for equanimity, and mind consciousness. Neutral feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as neutral.
- 1.23 This is how the Buddha spoke of the diversity of elements."

125. Detailed in SN 14.1–10.

126. Adopt PTS reading *rūpā ca upekkhāvedaniyā*. MS *manāpā* here is surely a mistake.

SN 35.130

With Hāliddikāni

Hāliddikānisutta

At one time Venerable Mahākaccāna was staying in the land of the 1.1
Avantis near Kuraraghara on Steep Mountain.¹²⁷

Then the householder Hāliddikāni went up to Venerable Mahā- 1.2
kaccāna ... and asked him, “Sir, this was said by the Buddha: ‘Diversity of elements gives rise to diversity of contacts, and diversity of contacts gives rise to diversity of feelings.’ How does diversity of elements give rise to diversity of contacts, and diversity of contacts gives rise to diversity of feelings?”

“Householder, it’s when a mendicant sees a sight with their eyes 1.6
and understands it to be agreeable. There is eye consciousness; and pleasant feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as pleasant.¹²⁸ Then they see a sight and understand it to be disagreeable. There is eye consciousness; and painful feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as painful. Then they see a sight and understand it to be a basis for equanimity. There is eye consciousness; and neutral feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as neutral.

Furthermore, a mendicant hears a sound with their ears ... smells 2.1
an odor with their nose ... tastes a flavor with their tongue ... encounters a touch with their body ... knows an idea with their mind and understands it to be agreeable. There is mind consciousness; and pleasant feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as pleasant. Then they know an idea and understand it to be disagreeable. There is mind consciousness; and painful feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as painful. Then they know an idea and understand it to be a basis for equanimity. Neutral feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as neutral.

127. See notes on SN 22.3:1.2 and SN 35.132.

128. For the syntax of this sentence, see Bodhi’s note in *Connected Discourses*.

- 2.11 That's how diversity of elements gives rise to diversity of contacts, and diversity of contacts gives rise to diversity of feelings."

SN 35.131

Nakula's Father

Nakulapitusutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying in the land of the Bhaggas at Crocodile's Bellow, in the deer park at Bhesakaḷā's Wood.
- 1.2 Then the householder Nakula's father went up to the Buddha ... and asked him, "What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are not fully extinguished in this very life? What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life?"¹²⁹
- 1.5 "Householder, there are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, their consciousness has that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant with fuel for grasping does not become extinguished. There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, their consciousness has that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant with fuel for grasping does not become extinguished. That's the cause, that's the reason why some sentient beings are not fully extinguished in this very life.
- 2.1 There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, their consciousness doesn't have that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant free of grasping becomes extinguished. There are sounds ... smells ...

129. The remainder of the text is identical to SN 35.118.

tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, their consciousness doesn't have that as support and fuel for grasping. A mendicant free of grasping becomes extinguished. That's the cause, that's the reason why some sentient beings are fully extinguished in this very life."

SN 35.132

With Lohicca

Lohiccasutta

At one time Venerable Mahākaccāna was staying in the land of the 1.1
Avantis in a wilderness hut near Makkarakāṭa.¹³⁰

Then several students, pupils of the brahmin Lohicca, approached 1.2
Mahākaccāna's wilderness hut while collecting firewood. They
walked and wandered all around the hut, making a colossal racket and
all kinds of jeers:¹³¹ "These shavelings, fake ascetics, primitives, black
spawn from the feet of our kinsman, the Lord! They're honored,

130. Mahākaccāna was the first major Buddhist figure in the region, and evidently his presence challenged the local brahmins. The fact that he was a brahmin by birth was salt on the wound, prompting a jibe by the callow students.

131. A certain brahmin Lohicca also appears in DN 12. But since this discourse is set far away in Avantī after the Buddha's passing, and since in both cases he is said to have taken refuge, it seems likely these are different people. | The term *seleyyaka* (variant *selissaka*) is unique and its meaning unclear. The commentary explains it as a kind of game like leapfrog, but contextually the sense "jeer" is more cohesive. Perhaps it is related to Sanskrit *śālaka*, "jester, buffon".

respected, revered, venerated, and esteemed by so-called inheritors of Vedic culture.”¹³²

1.4 Then Mahākaccāna left his dwelling and said to those young students, “Young students, stop being so noisy. I will speak to you on the teaching.”

1.7 When this was said, the young students fell silent. Then Mahākaccāna recited these verses for them:¹³³

2.1 “For the brahmins of old, ethics were the highest;
they remembered the ancient legends.¹³⁴
Their sense doors were guarded, well protected,
and they had mastered anger.

132. *Bharataka* here is unique and its sense debatable. The commentary says they were local householders; but the context is the intrusion of Buddhism into territory dominated by Vedic ritualism. In the Rig Veda, the Bharatas were the clan ruled by King Sudās, who, blessed by Agni, the “fire of the Bharatas”, and allied with the Vāsiṣṭhas, overcame the armies of ten kings to dominate the Aryan coalition. Wijesekera has argued that *bhara* in this context originally meant the “booty” or “plunder” gained by raiding villages and towns (*Buddhist and Vedic Studies*, ch. 19). A *bhārata* was a descendant of the tribe, and with their cultural ascendance became a term for all Vedists. Later it became generalized; the Jain Triṣaṣṭiśālākāpuruṣacaritra of the 12th century says that Bhāratakas include all Indians, whether Aryan or not (3.29). The Pali form *bharataka* could here be simply a variation of *bhārata* in the sense “Aryan”, but the suffix *-ka* is often diminutive if not contemptuous (eg. *samaṇaka*, *muṇḍaka*). Compare Rig Veda 3.53.24, which appears to criticize false Bhāratas as betrayers of Vedic culture.

133. Similar accounts of pure, meditative Brahmins of the past and their present fallen state are at Snp 2.7 and DN 27:22.1. Buddhists argued that the *real* brahmins lived much like Buddhist mendicants.

134. *Purāṇa* (“ancient”) is familiar as the name for the class of lengthy scriptures that gather legends and other forms of the traditional knowledge. As we have them today, they have undergone extensive development, but they draw on ancient sources. In Pali these are normally called *itihāsa* (“testaments”; see note on MN 91:2.1), and elsewhere we find *purāṇa* in this sense only in the late canon (Mil 5.3.7:6.1). However, pre-Buddhist texts refer to *itihāsa* along with *purāṇa* (Atharva Veda 15.6.10, Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 11.5.6.8, Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.4.10, Chāndogya Upaniṣad 3.4.1). Given the context, it is likely this is the meaning here.

Those brahmins who remembered 3.1
 the ancient legends
 enjoyed virtue and absorption.

But these have lost their way. 4.1
 Saying, ‘We must pray’,¹³⁵
 they live out of balance, judging by clan.
 Mastered by anger, they take up many arms,¹³⁶
 indifferent to those with craving and without.¹³⁷

All is vain for someone 5.1
 who doesn’t guard the sense doors,
 like the wealth a person finds in a dream.
 Fasting, sleeping on bare ground,¹³⁸
 bathing at daybreak, the three Vedas,¹³⁹

rough hides, dreadlocks, and mud,¹⁴⁰ 6.1

135. *Japāmase* is middle plural imperative. The sense is that they prioritize recitation as their core duty while neglecting conduct.

136. The true brahmin does not take up arms (Sn̥p 3.9:42.2, Dh̥p 406).

137. PTS and BJT read *virajjhamānā tasathāvaresu* (“attacking both the strong and the weak”). This appears to be a normalization, as the commentary supports MS *virajjamānā sataṇhātāṇhesu*. The point is that in their rage they did not even spare holy men.

138. Compare the longer description of Vedic rites at MN 51:10.3. | “Fasting” (*anāsakā*) was undertaken in preparation for the ritual (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 9.5.1.6). | The *thaṇḍila* (Sanskrit *sthaṇḍila*) was the ground cleared behind the fire altar (Chāndogya Upaniṣad 5.2.7, Śāṅkhāyana Āraṇyaka 9.8). The sponsor, having performed the ritual, lies on the bare ground or on a hide. If he sees a woman in his dreams, he knows his wish will be fulfilled.

139. *Pāto sinānaṃ* (“bathing at daybreak”) is recorded as a Brahmanical practice also at SN 7.21:1.5; bathing three times is one of the austere practices (MN 12:45.12; cf. Kd 1:20.15.1). A brahmin was to bathe at dawn and evening before reciting the Gāyatrī (Manu 4.93, Garuḍa Purāṇa 229).

140. The hide was typically that of the black antelope. | “Mud” seems out of place, as we have already seen they are concerned with bathing, and going unwashed was a Jain practice. But perhaps it is deliberately incoherent.

hymns, precepts and observances,
 and fervent austerities,
 fawning, bent staffs,¹⁴¹
 and sipping water.¹⁴²
 These emblems of the brahmins
 are only used to generate profits.¹⁴³

7.1 A mind that's serene,
 clear and undisturbed,
 kind to all creatures:
 that's the path to attainment of divinity!"

8.1 Then those young students, offended and upset, went to the brahmin Lohicca and said to him, "Please, master, you should know this. The ascetic Mahākaccāna condemns and rejects outright the hymns of the brahmins!"

8.3 When they said this, Lohicca was offended and upset. Then he thought, "But it wouldn't be appropriate for me to abuse or insult the ascetic Mahākaccāna solely because of what I've heard from these young students. Why don't I go and ask him about it?"

9.1 Then the brahmin Lohicca together with those young students went to Venerable Mahākaccāna and exchanged greetings with him.

9.2 When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to him, "Master Kaccāna, did several young pupils of mine come by here collecting firewood?"

9.4 "They did, brahmin."

9.5 "But did you have some discussion with them?"

9.6 "I did."

9.7 "But what kind of discussion did you have with them?"

141. "Fawning" (*kuhana*) is using dissembling and blandishments to obtain favor from the wealthy.

142. Before and after rituals and meal, a little water was cupped in the hand and sipped.

143. See Bodhi *Connected Discourses* for a note on this line.

“This is the discussion I had with these young students.” And he 9.8
repeated the verses in full.

“Worthy Kaccāna spoke of someone who doesn’t guard the sense 12.1
doors. How do you define someone who doesn’t guard the sense
doors?”

“Brahmin, take someone who sees a sight with their eyes. If it’s 12.3
pleasant they hold on to it, but if it’s unpleasant they dislike it. They
live with mindfulness of the body unestablished and their heart
stunted. And they don’t truly understand the freedom of heart and
freedom by wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease
without remainder.

When they hear a sound with their ears ... 12.5

When they smell an odor with their nose ... 12.6

When they taste a flavor with their tongue ... 12.7

When they feel a touch with their body ... 12.8

When they know an idea with their mind, if it’s pleasant they 12.9
hold on to it, but if it’s unpleasant they dislike it. They live with
mindfulness of the body unestablished and their heart stunted. And
they don’t truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by
wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without
remainder.

That’s how someone doesn’t guard the sense doors.” 12.11

“It’s incredible, worthy Kaccāna, it’s amazing! How accurately 12.12
you’ve explained someone whose sense doors are unguarded!

You also spoke of someone who does guard the sense doors. How 13.1
do you define someone who does guard the sense doors?”

“Brahmin, take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. If 13.3
it’s pleasant they don’t hold on to it, and if it’s unpleasant they don’t
dislike it. They live with mindfulness of the body established and
a limitless heart. And they truly understand the freedom of heart
and freedom by wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities
cease without remainder.

When they hear a sound with their ears ... 13.5

When they smell an odor with their nose ... 13.6

- 13.7 When they taste a flavor with their tongue ...
- 13.8 When they feel a touch with their body ...
- 13.9 When they know an idea with their mind, if it's pleasant they don't hold on to it, and if it's unpleasant they don't dislike it. They live with mindfulness of the body established and a limitless heart. And they truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without remainder.
- 13.11 That's how someone guards the sense doors."
- 14.1 "It's incredible, worthy Kaccāna, it's amazing! How accurately you've explained someone whose sense doors are guarded! Excellent, worthy Kaccāna! Excellent! As if he were righting the overturned, or revealing the hidden, or pointing out the path to the lost, or lighting a lamp in the dark so people with clear eyes can see what's there, the worthy Kaccāna has made the teaching clear in many ways. I go for refuge to the Buddha, to the teaching, and to the mendicant Saṅgha. From this day forth, may the worthy Kaccāna remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.
- 14.7 Please come to my family just as you go to the families of the lay followers in Makkarakāṭa. The brahmin boys and girls there will bow to you, rise in your presence, and give you a seat and water. That will be for their lasting welfare and happiness."

SN 35.133

Verahaccāni

Verahaccānisutta

- 1.1 At one time Venerable Udāyī was staying near Kāmaṇḍā in the brahmin Todeyya's mango grove.
- 1.2 Then a boy who was a pupil of the brahmin lady of the Verahaccāni clan went up to Udāyī and exchanged greetings with him.¹⁴⁴ When

144. It is unusual to see a female brahmin with a student. Below, she is referred to as the "tutor's wife" (*ācariyabhariyā*); compare Chāndogya Upaniṣad 4.10, where a tutor's wife (*ācāryajāyā*) discusses the education of the pupil with her

the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side. Udāyī educated, encouraged, fired up, and inspired that young student with a Dhamma talk.

Then that young student went to the brahmin lady of the Verahaccāni clan and said to her, “Please, madam, you should know this. The ascetic Udāyī teaches Dhamma that’s good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, meaningful and well-phrased. And he reveals a spiritual practice that’s entirely full and pure.” 1.5

“Then, young student, invite him in my name for tomorrow’s meal.” 2.1

“Yes, madam,” he replied. He went to Udāyī and said, “Would Worthy Udāyī please accept an offering of tomorrow’s meal from my tutor’s wife, the brahmin lady of the Verahaccāni clan?” Udāyī consented with silence. 2.2

Then when the night had passed, Udāyī robed up in the morning and, taking his bowl and robe, went to the brahmin lady’s home, and sat down on the seat spread out. Then the brahmin lady served and satisfied Udāyī with her own hands with delicious fresh and cooked foods. 2.5

When Udāyī had eaten and washed his hand and bowl, she put on a pair of slippers, sat on a high seat, covered her head, and said to him,¹⁴⁵ “Ascetic, preach the Dhamma.” 2.7

“There will be an occasion for that, sister,” he replied, then rose from his seat and left. 2.9

For a second time that young student went to Venerable Udāyī ... 3.1

husband. Verahaccāni is not an attested clan name, and Sanskrit *vairahatya* means “manslaughter”. Given that her husband is rather mysteriously absent, perhaps *verahaccāni* is a term for brahmin ladies whose husbands were murdered. Compare *nirvīrā*, a woman whose husband and children are dead. If so, it would seem that she did not merely survive her husband’s passing, but stepped into his role as teacher.

145. She adopts these as signifiers of status. Perhaps as a woman she felt the need to assert her status. Nonetheless, the rules of training forbid monastics from teaching someone wearing slippers (Bu Sk 61), sitting on a high seat (Bu Sk 69), or with head covered (Bu Sk 67).

- 3.4 And for a second time that young student went to the brahmin lady of the Verahaccāni clan ...
- 4.1 She said to him, “You keep praising the ascetic Udāyī like this. But when I asked him to preach the Dhamma he just said that there would be an occasion for that, and then he got up and left.”
- 4.3 “Madam, that’s because you put on a pair of slippers, sat on a high seat, and covered your head before inviting him to teach. For the good sirs respect the teaching.”
- 4.6 “Then, young student, invite him in my name for tomorrow’s meal.”
- 4.7 “Yes, madam,” he replied. ...
- 5.1 Then the brahmin lady served and satisfied Udāyī with her own hands with delicious fresh and cooked foods.
- 5.3 When Udāyī had eaten and washed his hand and bowl, she took off her slippers, sat on a low seat, uncovered her head, and said to him, “Sir, when what exists do the perfected ones assert that there is pleasure and pain? When what doesn’t exist do the perfected ones not declare that there is pleasure and pain?”
- 6.1 “Sister, when there’s an eye, the perfected ones assert that there is pleasure and pain. When there’s no eye, the perfected ones don’t declare that there is pleasure and pain. When there’s an ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, the perfected ones assert that there is pleasure and pain. When there’s no mind, the perfected ones don’t declare that there is pleasure and pain.”
- 7.1 When he said this, the brahmin lady said to Udāyī, “Excellent, sir! Excellent! As if he were righting the overturned, or revealing the hidden, or pointing out the path to the lost, or lighting a lamp in the dark so people with clear eyes can see what’s there, Master Udāyī has made the teaching clear in many ways. I go for refuge to the Buddha, to the teaching, and to the mendicant Saṅgha. From this day forth, may Master Udāyī remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.”

The Chapter at Devadaha

SN 35.134

At Devadaha

Devadahasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying in the land of the Sakyans, near the Sakyan town named Devadaha. There the Buddha addressed the mendicants: 1.1

“When it comes to the six fields of contact, mendicants, I don’t say that all mendicants have work to do with diligence, nor do I say that none of them have work to do with diligence. 1.3

I say that, when it comes to the six fields of contact, mendicants don’t have work to do with diligence if they are perfected, with defilements ended, having completed the spiritual journey, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, achieved their heart’s goal, utterly ended the fetter of continued existence, and become rightly freed through enlightenment. Why is that? 1.4

They’ve done their work with diligence, and are incapable of negligence. 1.6

I say that, when it comes to the six fields of contact, mendicants do have work to do with diligence if they are trainees, who haven’t achieved their heart’s desire, but live aspiring to the supreme sanctuary from the yoke. Why is that? 1.7

There are sights known by the eye that are pleasant and also those that are unpleasant. Though experiencing them again and again they 1.9

don't occupy the mind. Their energy is roused up and unflagging, their mindfulness is established and lucid, their body is tranquil and undisturbed, and their mind is immersed and unified in samādhi. Seeing this fruit of diligence, I say that those mendicants have work to do with diligence when it comes to the six fields of contact. ...

- 1.13 There are ideas known by the mind that are pleasant and also those that are unpleasant. Though experiencing them again and again they don't occupy the mind. Their energy is roused up and unflagging, their mindfulness is established and lucid, their body is tranquil and undisturbed, and their mind is immersed and unified in samādhi. Seeing this fruit of diligence, I say that those mendicants have work to do with diligence when it comes to the six fields of contact.”

SN 35.135

Opportunity

Khaṇasutta

- 1.1 “You’re fortunate, mendicants, so very fortunate, to have the opportunity to lead the spiritual life. I’ve seen the hell named ‘Related to the Six Fields of Contact.’¹⁴⁶ There, whatever sight you see with your eye is unlikable, not likable; undesirable, not desirable; unpleasant, not pleasant.
- 1.5 Whatever sound you hear ...
- 1.6 Whatever odor you smell ...
- 1.7 Whatever flavor you taste ...
- 1.8 Whatever touch you feel ...
- 1.9 Whatever idea you know with your mind is unlikable, not likable; undesirable, not desirable; unpleasant, not pleasant. You’re fortunate, mendicants, so very fortunate, to have the opportunity to lead

146. According to MN 50:22.2, this is a name for the Great Hell. It is, therefore, a literal name for hell, not a metaphor for hell as nothing more than sense experience. The hell called “The Mighty Fever” is described in similar terms at SN 56.43.

the spiritual life. I've seen the heaven called 'Related to the Six Fields of Contact'. There, whatever sight you see with your eye is likable, not unlikable; desirable, not undesirable; pleasant, not unpleasant.

Whatever sound ... odor ... flavor ... touch ... 1.14

Whatever idea you know with your mind is likable, not unlikable; 1.15
desirable, not undesirable; pleasant, not unpleasant. You're fortunate, mendicants, so very fortunate, to have the opportunity to lead the spiritual life."

SN 35.136

Liking Sights (1st)

Paṭhamarūpārāmasutta

"Mendicants, gods and humans like sights, they love them and enjoy 1.1
them. But when sights perish, fade away, and cease, gods and humans live in suffering.

Gods and humans like sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... 1.3
ideas, they love them and enjoy them. But when ideas perish, fade away, and cease, gods and humans live in suffering.

The Realized One has truly understood the origin, disappearance, 1.10
gratification, drawback, and escape of sights, so he doesn't like, love, or enjoy them. When sights perish, fade away, and cease, the Realized One lives happily.

The Realized One has truly understood the origin, disappearance, 1.12
gratification, drawback, and escape of sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas, so he doesn't like, love, or enjoy them. When ideas perish, fade away, and cease, the Realized One lives happily."

That is what the Buddha said. Then the Holy One, the Teacher, 1.18
went on to say:

"Sights, sounds, tastes, smells, 2.1
touches and ideas, the lot of them—
they're likable, desirable, and pleasurable

as long as you can say that they exist.¹⁴⁷

- 3.1 For all the world with its gods,
this is what they deem happiness.
And where they cease
is deemed as suffering for them.
- 4.1 The noble ones have seen that happiness
is the cessation of substantial reality.
This insight by those who see
contradicts the whole world.
- 5.1 What others say is happiness
the noble ones say is suffering.
What others say is suffering
the noble ones know as happiness.
- 6.1 See, this teaching is hard to understand,
it confuses the ignorant.
There is darkness for the shrouded;
blackness for those who don't see.
- 7.1 But the good are open;
like light for those who see.
Though close, they do not understand,
the seekers inexperienced in the teaching.¹⁴⁸
- 8.1 They're mired in desire for continued existence,
flowing along the stream of lives,

147. Notice the positive association of "exist" (*atthi*).

148. Bodhi translates "dullards", evidently reading *magā* ("beasts") and taking to mean "fools". However, I can't find support for this sense in Pali or Sanskrit. The commentary explains it as those inexperienced in knowing what is the path and what is not the path, apparently taking *maggā* as a truncation of *maggāmagga*. I read as a secondary derivative from *magga* in the old sense "seeking", with the *-a* suffix making it the agentive "seekers".

mired in Māra's dominion:
this teaching isn't easy for them to understand.

Who, apart from the noble ones, 9.1
is qualified to understand this state?
Having rightly understood this state,
the undefiled are fully extinguished.”

SN 35.137

Liking Sights (2nd)

Dutiyarūpārāmasutta

“Mendicants, gods and humans like sights, they love them and enjoy 1.1
them. But when sights perish, fade away, and cease, gods and humans
live in suffering. ...

The Realized One has truly understood the origin, disappearance, 1.9
gratification, drawback, and escape of sights, so he doesn't like, love,
or enjoy them. When sights perish, fade away, and cease, the Realized
One lives happily. ...”

SN 35.138

Not Yours (1st)

Paṭhamanatumhākasutta

“Mendicants, give up what's not yours. Giving it up will be for your 1.1
welfare and happiness. And what isn't yours? The eye isn't yours:
give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness.

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind isn't yours: give it 1.6
up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness.

Suppose a person was to carry off the grass, sticks, branches, and 1.10
leaves in this Jeta's Grove, or burn them, or do what they want with
them. Would you think: “This person is carrying us off, burning us,
or doing what they want with us'?”

- 1.12 “No, sir. Why is that? Because to us that’s neither self nor belonging to self.”
- 1.15 “In the same way, the eye isn’t yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness.
- 1.17 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind isn’t yours: give it up. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness.”

SN 35.139

Not Yours (2nd)

Dutiyanatumhākasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, give up what’s not yours. Giving it up will be for your welfare and happiness. And what isn’t yours? Sights aren’t yours: give them up. Giving them up will be for your welfare and happiness.
- 1.6 Sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas aren’t yours: give them up. Giving them up will be for your welfare and happiness.
- 1.12 Suppose a person was to carry off the grass, sticks, branches, and leaves in this Jeta’s Grove ...
- 1.13 In the same way, sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas aren’t yours: give them up. Giving them up will be for your welfare and happiness.”

SN 35.140

Interior and Cause Are Impermanent

Ajjhattaaniccahetusutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, the eye is impermanent.¹⁴⁹ The cause and reason that gives rise to the eye is also impermanent. Since the eye is produced by what is impermanent, how could it be permanent?
- 1.4 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is impermanent. The cause and reason that gives rise to the mind is also impermanent.

149. SN 35.140–145 parallel SN 22.18–20.

Since the mind is produced by what is impermanent, how could it be permanent?

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they're freed. When they're freed, they know they're freed. 1.10

They understand: 'Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.' 1.12

SN 35.141

Interior and Cause Are Suffering

Ajjhattadukkhahetusutta

"Mendicants, the eye is suffering. The cause and reason that gives rise to the eye is also suffering. Since the eye is produced by what is suffering, how could it be happiness? 1.1

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is suffering. The cause and reason that gives rise to the mind is also suffering. Since the mind is produced by what is suffering, how could it be happiness? 1.4

Seeing this ... They understand: '... there is nothing further for this place.' 1.10

SN 35.142

Interior and Cause Are Not-Self

Ajjhattānattahetusutta

"Mendicants, the eye is not-self. The cause and reason that gives rise to the eye is also not-self. Since the eye is produced by what is not-self, how could it be self? 1.1

- 1.4 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is not-self. The cause and reason that gives rise to the mind is also not-self. Since the mind is produced by what is not-self, how could it be self?
- 1.10 Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.143

Exterior and Cause Are Impermanent

Bāhirāniccahetusutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, sights are impermanent. The cause and reason that gives rise to sights is also impermanent. Since sights are produced by what is impermanent, how could they be permanent?
- 1.4 Sounds ...
- 1.5 Smells ...
- 1.6 Tastes ...
- 1.7 Touches ...
- 1.8 Ideas are impermanent. The cause and reason that gives rise to ideas is also impermanent. Since ideas are produced by what is impermanent, how could they be permanent?
- 1.11 Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.144

Exterior and Cause Are Suffering

Bāhiradukkhahetusutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, sights are suffering. The cause and reason that gives rise to sights is also suffering. Since sights are produced by what is suffering, how could they be happiness?
- 1.4 Sounds ...
- 1.5 Smells ...

Tastes ...	1.6
Touches ...	1.7
Ideas are suffering. The cause and reason that gives rise to ideas is also suffering. Since ideas are produced by what is suffering, how could they be happiness?	1.8
Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’”	1.11

SN 35.145

Exterior and Cause Are Not-Self

Bāhirānattahetusutta

“Mendicants, sights are not-self. The cause and reason that gives rise to sights is also not-self. Since sights are produced by what is not-self, how could they be self?	1.1
Sounds ...	1.4
Smells ...	1.5
Tastes ...	1.6
Touches ...	1.7
Ideas are not-self. The cause and reason that gives rise to ideas is also not-self. Since ideas are produced by what is not-self, how could they be self?	1.8
Seeing this ... Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed.	1.11
They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’”	1.13

The Chapter on the Old and the New

SN 35.146

The Cessation of Deeds

Kammanirodhasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you old deeds, new deeds, the cessation of deeds, and the practice that leads to the cessation of deeds. Listen and apply your mind well, I will speak. ...
- 1.3 And what is old deeds?
- 1.4 The eye is old deeds. It should be seen as produced by choices and intentions, as something to be felt.¹⁵⁰
- 1.5 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is old deeds. It should be seen as produced by choices and intentions, as something to be felt.
- 1.7 This is called old deeds.
- 1.8 And what is new deeds?
- 1.9 The deeds you currently perform by way of body, speech, and mind.
- 1.10 These are called new deeds.
- 1.11 And what is the cessation of deeds?

150. That is to say, the fact that the eye exists is because we were born into this life driven by the deeds in past lives.

When you experience freedom due to the cessation of deeds by body, speech, and mind. 1.12

This is called the cessation of deeds. 1.13

And what's the practice that leads to the cessation of deeds? 1.14

It is simply this noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion. 1.15

This is called the practice that leads to the cessation of deeds. 1.17

So, mendicants, I've taught you old deeds, new deeds, the cessation of deeds, and the practice that leads to the cessation of deeds. 1.18

Out of sympathy, I've done what a teacher should do who wants what's best for their disciples. Here are these roots of trees, and here are these empty huts. Practice absorption, mendicants! Don't be negligent! Don't regret it later! This is my instruction to you." 1.19

SN 35.147

The Impermanent as Conducive to Extinguishment

Aniccanibbānasappāyasutta

"Mendicants, I will teach you a practice that's conducive to extinguishment. Listen ... 1.1

And what is that practice that's conducive to extinguishment? 1.3

It's when a mendicant sees that the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are impermanent. And they see that the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also impermanent. 1.4

They see that the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, ideas, mind-consciousness, and mind contact are impermanent. And they see that the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also impermanent. 1.5

This is that practice that's conducive to extinguishment." 1.7

SN 35.148

The Suffering as Conducive to Extinguishment

Dukkhanibbānasappāyasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you a practice that’s conducive to extinguishment. Listen ...
- 1.3 And what is that practice that’s conducive to extinguishment?
- 1.4 It’s when a mendicant sees that the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are suffering. And they see that the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also suffering.
- 1.5 They see that the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, ideas, mind-consciousness, and mind contact are suffering. And they see that the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also suffering.
- 1.7 This is that practice that’s conducive to extinguishment.”

SN 35.149

Not-Self as Conducive to Extinguishment

Anattanibbānasappāyasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you a practice that’s conducive to extinguishment. Listen ...
- 1.3 And what is that practice that’s conducive to extinguishment?
- 1.4 It’s when a mendicant sees that the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are not-self. And they see that the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also not-self.
- 1.5 They see that the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, ideas, mind-consciousness, and mind contact are not-self. And they see that the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also not-self.
- 1.6 This is that practice that’s conducive to extinguishment.”

SN 35.150

A Practice Conducive to Extinguishment

Nibbānasappāyapaṭipadāsutta

- “Mendicants, I will teach you a practice that’s conducive to extinguishment. Listen ... 1.1
- And what is that practice that’s conducive to extinguishment? 1.3
- What do you think, mendicants? Is the eye permanent or impermanent?” 1.4
- “Impermanent, sir.” 2.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 3.1
- “Suffering, sir.” 4.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?” 5.1
- “No, sir.” 6.1
- “Are sights ... eye consciousness ... eye contact ... 7.1
- The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact: is that permanent or impermanent?” 9.3
- “Impermanent, sir.” 10.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 11.1
- “Suffering, sir.” 12.1
- “But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?” 13.1
- “No, sir.” 14.1
- “Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact. 15.1
- They grow disillusioned with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. ... 15.2
- They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’ 15.4

15.5 This is that practice that's conducive to extinguishment."

SN 35.151

A Resident Pupil

Antevāsikasutta

1.1 "Mendicants, this spiritual life is lived without a resident pupil and without a teaching master.¹⁵¹ A mendicant who lives with a resident pupil and a teaching master lives in suffering and discomfort. A mendicant who lives without a resident pupil and a teaching master lives in happiness and comfort.

1.4 And how does a mendicant who lives with a resident pupil and a teaching master live in suffering and discomfort?

1.5 When a mendicant sees a sight with their eyes, bad, unskillful phenomena arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. Those qualities reside within. Since they have bad unskillful qualities residing within,¹⁵² they're said to have a resident pupil. Those qualities master them. Since they're mastered by bad unskillful qualities,¹⁵³ they're said to have a teaching master.

2.1 Furthermore, when a mendicant hears ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... knows an idea with their mind, bad, unskillful phenomena arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. Those qualities reside within. Since they have bad unskillful qualities residing within, they're said to have a resident pupil. Those qualities master them. Since they're mastered by bad unskillful qualities,

151. The Vinaya establishes that a newly ordained monastic should live in dependence on a mentor (*uppaṃjhāya*) and/or a "tutor" (*ācariya*) for at least the first five years. If they considered qualified at that point they may be released from dependence. Here the Buddha plays with this idea, inverting the standard meaning.

152. The Buddha reveals the pun: the defilements "reside within" (*anto vasanti*) as a "resident pupil" (*antevāsi*) lives with the teacher.

153. The defilements "master" (*samudācaranti*) them like a "teaching master" (*ācariya*).

they're said to have a teaching master. That's how a mendicant who lives with a resident pupil and a teaching master lives in suffering and discomfort.

And how does a mendicant who lives without a resident pupil 4.1
and a teaching master live in happiness and comfort?

When a mendicant sees a sight with their eyes, bad, unskillful 4.2
phenomena don't arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. Those qualities don't reside within. Since they don't have bad unskillful qualities residing within, they're said to not have a resident pupil. Those qualities don't master them. Since they're not mastered by bad unskillful qualities, they're said to not have a teaching master.

Furthermore, when a mendicant hears ... smells ... tastes ... 5.1
touches ... knows an idea with their mind, bad, unskillful phenomena don't arise: memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters. Those qualities don't reside within. Since they don't have bad unskillful qualities residing within, they're said to not have a resident pupil. Those qualities don't master them. Since they're not mastered by bad unskillful qualities, they're said to not have a teaching master.

That's how a mendicant who lives without a resident pupil and a 6.6
teaching master lives in happiness and comfort.

This spiritual life is lived without a resident pupil and without a 6.7
teaching master. A mendicant who lives with a resident pupil and a teaching master lives in suffering and discomfort. A mendicant who lives without a resident pupil and a teaching master lives in happiness and comfort."

SN 35.152

What's the Goal of the Spiritual Life?

Kimatthiyabrahmacariyasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, if wanderers who follow another religion were to ask you: ‘Reverends, what’s the goal of leading the spiritual life under the ascetic Gotama?’
- 1.3 You should answer them: ‘The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha is to completely understand suffering.’
- 1.5 If wanderers of other religions were to ask you: ‘Reverends, what is that suffering?’
- 1.7 You should answer them: ‘The eye is suffering. The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha is to completely understand this. Sights ... Eye consciousness ... Eye contact ... The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also suffering. The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha is to completely understand this.
- 2.11 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also suffering. The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha is to completely understand this. This is that suffering. The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha is to completely understand this.’
- 2.18 When questioned by wanderers of other religions, that’s how you should answer them.”

SN 35.153

Is There a Method?

Atthinukhopariyāyasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, is there a method—apart from faith, endorsement, oral transmission, reasoned train of thought, or acceptance of a view after deliberation—that a mendicant can rely on to declare their

enlightenment? That is:¹⁵⁴ ‘I understand: “Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.”’”

“Our teachings are rooted in the Buddha. He is our guide and our refuge. Sir, may the Buddha himself please clarify the meaning of this. The mendicants will listen and remember it.” 1.3

“Well then, mendicants, listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.” 1.4

“Yes, sir,” they replied. The Buddha said this: 1.5

“There is a method—apart from faith, endorsement, oral transmission, reasoned train of thought, or acceptance of a view after deliberation—that a mendicant can rely on to declare their enlightenment. That is: ‘I understand: “Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.”’” 1.7

And what is that method? Take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. When they have greed, hate, and delusion in them, they understand ‘I have greed, hate, and delusion in me.’ When they don’t have greed, hate, and delusion in them, they understand ‘I don’t have greed, hate, and delusion in me.’ Since this is so, are these things understood by faith, endorsement, oral transmission, reasoned train of thought, or acceptance of a view after deliberation? 2.1

“No, sir.” 2.5

“Aren’t they understood by seeing them with wisdom?” 2.6

“Yes, sir.” 2.7

“This is a method—apart from faith, endorsement, oral transmission, reasoned train of thought, or acceptance of a view after deliberation—that a mendicant can rely on to declare their enlightenment. That is: ‘I understand: “Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.”’” 2.8

154. See note on SN 12.68:1.3.

3.1 Furthermore, a mendicant hears a sound ... smells an odor ... tastes a flavor ... encounters a touch ... knows an idea with their mind. When they have greed, hate, and delusion in them, they understand ‘I have greed, hate, and delusion in me.’ When they don’t have greed, hate, and delusion in them, they understand ‘I don’t have greed, hate, and delusion in me.’ Since this is so, are these things understood by faith, endorsement, oral transmission, reasoned train of thought, or acceptance of a view after deliberation?”

4.4 “No, sir.”

4.5 “Aren’t they understood by seeing them with wisdom?”

4.6 “Yes, sir.”

4.7 “This too is a method—apart from faith, endorsement, oral transmission, reasoned train of thought, or acceptance of a view after deliberation—that a mendicant can rely on to declare their enlightenment. That is: ‘I understand: “Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.”’”

SN 35.154

Endowed With Faculties

Indriyasampannasutta

1.1 Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha ... and asked him, “Sir, they speak of someone who is ‘accomplished in the faculties.’¹⁵⁵ How is someone accomplished in the faculties defined?”

2.1 “Mendicant, if someone meditates observing rise and fall in the eye faculty, they grow disillusioned with the eye faculty.

2.2 If they meditate observing rise and fall in the ear faculty ... nose faculty ... tongue faculty ... body faculty ... mind faculty, they grow disillusioned with the mind faculty.

155. In SN 48.19, “accomplished in the faculties” is defined as someone who has mastered the five spiritual faculties.

Being disillusioned, desire fades away. ... When they're freed, 2.4
they know they're freed.

They understand: 'Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has 2.5
been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing
further for this place.'

This is how someone who is accomplished in the faculties is de- 2.6
fined."

SN 35.155

A Dhamma Speaker

Dhammakathikapucchassutta

Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha ... and asked him, "Sir, 1.1
they speak of a 'Dhamma speaker'.¹⁵⁶ How is a Dhamma speaker
defined?"

"If a mendicant teaches Dhamma for disillusionment, dispassion, 2.1
and cessation regarding the eye, they're qualified to be called 'a men-
dicant who speaks on Dhamma'.

If they practice for disillusionment, dispassion, and cessation re- 2.2
garding the eye, they're qualified to be called 'a mendicant who prac-
tices in line with the teaching'.

If they're freed by not grasping by disillusionment, dispassion, and 2.3
cessation regarding the eye, they're qualified to be called 'a mendicant
who has attained extinguishment in this very life'.

If a mendicant teaches Dhamma for disillusionment with the 2.4
ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, for its fading away and
cessation, they're qualified to be called 'a mendicant who speaks on
Dhamma'.

If they practice for disillusionment, dispassion, and cessation re- 2.6
garding the mind, they're qualified to be called 'a mendicant who
practices in line with the teaching'.

156. As at SN 12.16 and SN 22.115.

- 2.7 If they're freed by not grasping by disillusionment, dispassion, and cessation regarding the mind, they're qualified to be called 'a mendicant who has attained extinguishment in this very life.'"

THE FOURTH FIFTY

The Chapter on the End of Relishing

SN 35.156

The Interior and the End of Relishing

Ajjhattanandikkhayasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, the eye really is impermanent. A mendicant sees that it is impermanent: that’s their right view.¹⁵⁷ Seeing rightly, they grow disillusioned. When relishing ends, greed ends. When greed ends, relishing ends.¹⁵⁸ When relishing and greed end, the mind is said to be well freed.
- 1.6 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind really is impermanent. A mendicant sees that it is impermanent: that’s their right view. Seeing rightly, they grow disillusioned. When relishing ends, greed ends. When greed ends, relishing ends. When relishing and greed end, the mind is said to be well freed.”

157. This discourse and the next are similar to SN 22.51.

158. “Relishing” (*nandi*) and “greed” (or “lust”, *rāga*) are similar in meaning, but with distinct stresses: “relishing” enjoys the object of desire, while “greed” is inflamed by passion for it.

SN 35.157

The Exterior and the End of Relishing

Bāhiraṇandikkhayasutta

“Mendicants, sights really are impermanent. A mendicant sees that 1.1
they are impermanent: that’s their right view. Seeing rightly, they
grow disillusioned. When relishing ends, greed ends. When greed
ends, relishing ends. When relishing and greed end, the mind is said
to be well freed.

Sounds ... Smells ... Tastes ... Touches ... Ideas really are imper- 1.6
manent. A mendicant sees that they are impermanent: that’s their
right view. Seeing rightly, they grow disillusioned. When relishing
ends, greed ends. When greed ends, relishing ends. When relishing
and greed end, the mind is said to be well freed.”

SN 35.158

Focus, the Interior, and the End of Relishing

Ajjhattaṇiccanandikkhayasutta

“Mendicants, rationally apply the mind to the eye. Truly see the 1.1
impermanence of the eye.¹⁵⁹ When a mendicant does this, they
grow disillusioned with the eye. When relishing ends, greed ends.
When greed ends, relishing ends. When relishing and greed end,
the mind is said to be well freed.

Rationally apply the mind to the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body 1.6
... mind. Truly see the impermanence of the mind. When a men-
dicant does this, they grow disillusioned with the mind. When rel-
ishing ends, greed ends. When greed ends, relishing ends. When
relishing and greed end, the mind is said to be well freed.”

159. Similar to SN 22.52.

SN 35.159

Focus, the Exterior, and the End of Relishing

Bāhiraaniccanandikkhayasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, rationally apply the mind to sights. Truly see the impermanence of sights. When a mendicant does this, they grow disillusioned with sights. When relishing ends, greed ends. When greed ends, relishing ends. When relishing and greed end, the mind is said to be well freed.
- 1.6 Rationally apply the mind to sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas. Truly see the impermanence of ideas. When a mendicant does this, they grow disillusioned with ideas. When relishing ends, greed ends. When greed ends, relishing ends. When relishing and greed end, the mind is said to be well freed.”

SN 35.160

On Immersion at Jīvaka’s Mango Grove

Jivakambavanasamādhisutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha in Jīvaka’s Mango Grove.¹⁶⁰ There the Buddha addressed the mendicants:
- 1.4 “Mendicants, develop immersion. For a mendicant with immersion, things become truly clear. And what becomes truly clear?
- 1.7 It becomes truly clear that the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are impermanent. And it also becomes truly clear that the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is impermanent.

160. This monastery belonged to the Buddha’s doctor, Jīvaka, who appears in DN 2. His story is told in Kd 8, where we learn that he was raised by Prince Abhaya of Magadha, a Jain (MN 58) who was also interested in the teachings of Pūraṇa Kassapa (SN 46.56). MN 55 on eating meat is addressed to him. | This discourse and the next are similar to SN 22.5–6.

It becomes truly clear that the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body 1.8
 ... mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact are imper-
 manent. And it also becomes truly clear that the painful, pleasant,
 or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is imper-
 manent.

Mendicants, develop immersion. For a mendicant with immer- 1.11
 sion, things become truly clear.”

SN 35.161

On Retreat at Jivaka's Mango Grove

Jīvakambavanapaṭisallānasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha in Jivaka's Mango 1.1
 Grove. There the Buddha addressed the mendicants:

“Mendicants, meditate in retreat. For a mendicant who meditates 1.3
 in retreat, things become truly clear. And what becomes truly clear?

It becomes truly clear that the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and 1.6
 eye contact are impermanent. And it also becomes truly clear that
 the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye
 contact is impermanent. ...

It becomes truly clear that the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, 1.7
 and mind contact are impermanent. And it also becomes truly clear
 that the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on
 mind contact is impermanent.

Mendicants, meditate in retreat. For a mendicant who meditates 1.11
 in retreat, things become truly clear.”

SN 35.162

With Koṭṭhita on Impermanence

Koṭṭhikaaniccasutta

- 1.1 Then Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita went up to the Buddha ... and asked him,¹⁶¹ “Sir, may the Buddha please teach me Dhamma in brief. When I’ve heard it, I’ll live alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute.”
- 2.1 “Koṭṭhita, you should give up desire for what is impermanent. And what is impermanent? The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are impermanent: you should give up desire for them. The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also impermanent: you should give up desire for it.
- 2.8 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... The mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact are impermanent: you should give up desire for them. The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also impermanent: you should give up desire for it.
- 2.18 Koṭṭhita, you should give up desire for what is impermanent.”

SN 35.163

With Koṭṭhita on Suffering

Koṭṭhikadukkhasutta

- 1.1 Then Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita ... said to the Buddha:¹⁶²
- 1.2 “Sir, may the Buddha please teach me Dhamma in brief. When I’ve heard it, I’ll live alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute.”
- 1.3 “Koṭṭhita, you should give up desire for what is suffering. And what is suffering?

161. For Mahākoṭṭhita, see note on SN 22.122:1.1. | This discourse parallels SN 22.137.

162. This discourse parallels SN 22.140.

The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are suffering: 1.5
 you should give up desire for them. The pleasant, painful, or neutral
 feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also suffering; you
 should give up desire for it.

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... The mind, ideas, mind 1.10
 consciousness, and mind contact are suffering: you should give up
 desire for them. The pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises
 dependent on mind contact is also suffering: you should give up
 desire for it.

Koṭṭhita, you should give up desire for what is suffering.” 1.16

SN 35.164

With Koṭṭhita on Not-Self

Koṭṭhikaanattasutta

“Koṭṭhita, you should give up desire for what is not-self.¹⁶³ And what 1.3
 is not-self?

The eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are not-self: 1.5
 you should give up desire for them. The pleasant, painful, or neutral
 feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also not-self: You
 should give up desire for it.

The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... The mind, ideas, mind 1.10
 consciousness, and mind contact ... The pleasant, painful, or neutral
 feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also not-self: you
 should give up desire for it.

Koṭṭhita, you should give up desire for what is not-self.” 1.16

163. This discourse parallels SN 22.143.

SN 35.165

Giving Up Wrong View

Micchādiṭṭhipahānasutta

- 1.1 Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha ... and said to him:
- 1.3 “Sir, how does one know and see so that wrong view is given up?”
- 2.1 “Mendicant, knowing and seeing the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact as impermanent, wrong view is given up. ...
- 2.5 And also knowing and seeing the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact as impermanent, wrong view is given up.
- 2.6 This is how to know and see so that wrong view is given up.”

SN 35.166

Giving Up Substantialist View

Sakkāyadiṭṭhipahānasutta

- 1.1 Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha ... and said to him:
- 1.3 “Sir, how does one know and see so that substantialist view is given up?”
- 1.4 “Mendicant, knowing and seeing the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact as suffering, substantialist view is given up. ...
- 1.8 And also knowing and seeing the pleasant, painful, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact as suffering, substantialist view is given up.
- 1.9 This is how to know and see so that substantialist view is given up.”

SN 35.167

Giving Up Theory of Self

Attānudiṭṭhipahānasutta

Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha ... and said to him: 1.1

“Sir, how does one know and see so that theory of self is given 1.3
up?”

“Mendicant, knowing and seeing the eye, sights, eye conscious- 1.4
ness, and eye contact as not-self, theory of self is given up. ...

And also knowing and seeing the pleasant, painful, or neutral 1.10
feeling that arises conditioned by mind contact as not-self, theory of
self is given up.”

The Chapter on Sixty Abbreviated Texts

SN 35.168

Desire for the Impermanent Interior

Ajjhattaaniccachandasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, you should give up desire for what is impermanent.¹⁶⁴
And what is impermanent?
- 1.3 The eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are impermanent: you
should give up desire for them. You should give up desire for what is
impermanent.”

SN 35.169

Greed for the Impermanent Interior

Ajjhattaaniccarāgasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, you should give up greed for what is impermanent. And
what is impermanent?
- 1.3 The eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are impermanent ...”

164. This chapter is titled *saṭṭhipeyyālavagga*, “The Chapter of Sixty Abbreviated Texts”. I follow MS, BJT, and Bodhi, which give the full count of sixty. The PTS edition, by combining each triad of discourses as one, numbers only 19 discourses up to 186. Its numbering remains out of sync for the remainder of this Saṃyutta.

SN 35.170

Desire and Greed for the Impermanent Interior

Ajjhattaaniccachandarāgasutta

“Mendicants, you should give up desire and greed for what is imper- 1.1
manent. And what is impermanent?

The eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are impermanent ...” 1.3

SN 35.171–173

Desire, Etc. for the Suffering Interior

Dukkhachandādisutta

“Mendicants, you should give up desire ... greed ... desire and greed 1.1
for what is suffering. And what is suffering?

The eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are suffering ...” 1.3

SN 35.174–176

Desire, Etc. for the Not-Self Interior

Anattachandādisutta

“Mendicants, you should give up desire ... greed ... desire and greed 1.1
for what is not-self. And what is not-self?

The eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are not-self ...” 1.3

SN 35.177–179

Desire, Etc. for the Impermanent Exterior

Bāhirāniccachandādisutta

“Mendicants, you should give up desire ... greed ... desire and greed 1.1
for what is impermanent. And what is impermanent?

- 1.3 Sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are impermanent
...”

SN 35.180–182

Desire, Etc. for the Suffering Exterior

Bāhiradukkhachandādisutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, you should give up desire ... greed ... desire and greed for what is suffering. And what is suffering?
1.3 Sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are suffering ...”

SN 35.183–185

Desire, Etc. for the Not-Self Exterior

Bāhirānattachandādisutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, you should give up desire ... greed ... desire and greed for what is not-self. And what is not-self?
1.3 Sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are not-self ...”

SN 35.186

The Interior Was Impermanent in the Past

Ajjhattātītāniccasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, in the past the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind were impermanent.
1.2 Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind. Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed.
1.4 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.187

The Interior Will Be Impermanent in the Future

Ajjhattānāgatānīccasutta

“Mendicants, in the future the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind 1.1
will be impermanent ...”

SN 35.188

The Interior is Impermanent in the Present

Ajjhattapaccuppannānīccasutta

“Mendicants, in the present the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind 1.1
are impermanent ...”

SN 35.189–191

The Interior as Suffering in the Three Times

Ajjhattātītādidukkhassutta

“Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present the eye, ear, nose, 1.1
tongue, body, and mind are suffering ...”

SN 35.192–194

The Interior as Not-Self in the Three Times

Ajjhattātītāḍānattasutta

“Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present the eye, ear, nose, 1.1
tongue, body, and mind are not-self ...”

SN 35.195–197

The Exterior as Impermanent in the Three Times

Bāhirātītādiāniccasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are impermanent ...”

SN 35.198–200

The Exterior as Suffering in the Three Times

Bāhirātītādidukkkhasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are suffering ...”

SN 35.201–203

The Exterior as Not-Self in the Three Times

Bāhirātītādiānattasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are not-self ...”

SN 35.204

The Interior and What’s Impermanent in the Past

Ajjhattātītayadaniccasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, in the past the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind were impermanent. What’s impermanent is suffering. What’s suffering is not-self. And what’s not-self should be truly seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’ ...”

SN 35.205

The Interior and What's Impermanent in the Future

Ajjhattānāgatayadaniccasutta

“Mendicants, in the future the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind 1.1
will be impermanent. What's impermanent is suffering. ...”

SN 35.206

The Interior and What's Impermanent in the Present

Ajjhattapaccuppannayadaniccasutta

“Mendicants, in the present the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind 1.1
are impermanent. What's impermanent is suffering. ...”

SN 35.207–209

The Interior and What's Suffering in the Three Times

Ajjhattātītādiyaṃdukkhasutta

“Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present the eye, ear, nose, 1.1
tongue, body, and mind are suffering. What's suffering is not-self ...”

SN 35.210–212

The Interior and What's Not-Self in the Three Times

Ajjhattātītādiyadanattasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are not-self. And what's not-self should be truly seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’ ...”

SN 35.213–215

The Exterior and What's Impermanent in the Three Times

Bāhirātītādiyadaniccasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are impermanent. What's impermanent is suffering. ...”

SN 35.216–218

The Exterior and What's Suffering in the Three Times

Bāhirātītādiyamdukkhasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are suffering. What's suffering is not-self ...”

SN 35.219–221

The Exterior and What's Not-Self in the Three Times

Bāhirātītādiyadanattasutta

“Mendicants, in the past ... future ... present sights, sounds, smells, 1.1
tastes, touches, and ideas are not-self. And what's not-self should be
truly seen with right understanding like this: ‘This is not mine, I am
not this, this is not my self’ ...”

SN 35.222

The Interior as Impermanent

Ajjhattāyatanaaniccasutta

“Mendicants, the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are imper- 1.1
manent.

Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for 1.2
this place.’”

SN 35.223

The Interior as Suffering

Ajjhattāyatanadukkhasutta

“Mendicants, the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are suffering. 1.1

Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for 1.2
this place.’”

SN 35.224

The Interior as Not-Self

Ajjhattāyatanaanattasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind are not-self.
- 1.2 Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.225

The Exterior as Impermanent

Bāhirāyatanaaniccasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are impermanent.
- 1.2 Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.226

The Exterior as Suffering

Bāhirāyatanadukkhassutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are suffering.
- 1.2 Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for this place.’”

SN 35.227

The Exterior as Not-Self

Bāhirāyatanaanattasutta

“Mendicants, sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas are 1.1
not-self.

Seeing this ... They understand: ‘... there is nothing further for 1.2
this place.’”

The Chapter on the Ocean

SN 35.228

The Ocean (1st)

Paṭhamasamuddasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, an unlearned ordinary person speaks of the ocean. But that’s not the ocean in the training of the Noble One. That’s just a large body of water, a large sea of water. For a person, the eye is an ocean, and its currents are made of sights.¹⁶⁵
- 2.1 Someone who can prevail over those currents is said to have crossed over the ocean of the eye, with its waves and whirlpools, its saltwater crocodiles and monsters.¹⁶⁶ Crossed over, gone to the far shore, the brahmin stands on solid ground.
- 2.3 For a person, the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is an ocean, and its currents are made of ideas. Someone who can prevail over those currents is said to have crossed over the ocean of the mind, with its waves and whirlpools, its saltwater crocodiles and monsters. Crossed over, gone to the far shore, the brahmin stands on solid ground.”
- 2.11 That is what the Buddha said. Then the Holy One, the Teacher, went on to say:

165. Compare Pañcaviṃśa Brāhmaṇa 6.4.7: “‘Hail to the ocean! Hail to the ocean’s eye!’ he says. For speech is truly the ocean, and mind is the ocean’s eye.”

166. Explained at Iti 109, AN 4.122, and MN 67.

“A knowledge master who’s crossed 3.1
 the ocean so hard to cross,
 with its saltwater crocodiles and monsters,
 its waves, whirlpools, and dangers;
 they’ve completed the spiritual journey and gone to
 the end of the world,
 they’re called ‘one who has gone beyond.’”

SN 35.229

The Ocean (2nd)

Dutiyasamuddasutta

“Mendicants, an unlearned ordinary person speaks of the ocean. But 1.1
 that’s not the ocean in the training of the Noble One. That’s just a
 large body of water, a large sea of water.

There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, 1.4
 agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. This is called the ocean
 in the training of the Noble One. And it’s here that this world—
 with its gods, Māras, and divinities, this population with its ascetics
 and brahmins, gods and humans—is for the most part sunk. It’s
 become tangled like string, knotted like a ball of thread, and matted
 like rushes and reeds, and it doesn’t escape the places of loss, the bad
 places, the underworld, transmigration.

There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known 2.1
 by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sen-
 sual, and arousing. This is called the ocean in the training of the
 Noble One. And it’s here that this world—with its gods, Māras, and
 divinities, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, gods and
 humans—is for the most part sunk. It’s become tangled like string,
 knotted like a ball of thread, and matted like rushes and reeds, and
 it doesn’t escape the places of loss, the bad places, the underworld,
 transmigration.

- 3.1 Those in whom greed, hate, and ignorance¹⁶⁷
 have faded away;
 have crossed the ocean so hard to cross,
 with its saltwater crocodiles and monsters,
 its waves and dangers.
- 4.1 They've slipped their chains, given up death, and have
 no attachments.
 They've given up suffering,
 so there are no more future lives.
 They've disappeared, and cannot be measured;
 and they've confounded the King of Death, I say."

SN 35.230

The Simile of the Angler

Bāḷisikopamasutta

- 1.1 "Mendicants, suppose an angler was to cast a baited hook into a deep lake. Seeing the bait, a fish would swallow it. And so the fish that swallowed the hook would meet with tragedy and disaster, and the angler can do what he wants with it.
- 2.1 In the same way, there are these six hooks in the world that mean tragedy and slaughter for living creatures. What six?
- 2.3 There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, they're called a mendicant who has swallowed Māra's hook. They've met with tragedy and disaster, and the Wicked One can do with them what he wants.
- 2.6 There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant approves, welcomes, and keeps clinging to them, they're called a mendicant who has swallowed Māra's hook.

167. The verses are also in Iti 69.

They've met with tragedy and disaster, and the Wicked One can do with them what he wants.

There are sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, they're called a mendicant who hasn't swallowed Māra's hook. They've broken the hook, destroyed it. They haven't met with tragedy and disaster, and the Wicked One cannot do with them what he wants. 4.1

There are sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. If a mendicant doesn't approve, welcome, and keep clinging to them, they're called a mendicant who hasn't swallowed Māra's hook. They've broken the hook, destroyed it. They haven't met with tragedy and disaster, and the Wicked One cannot do with them what he wants." 5.1

SN 35.231

The Simile of the Latex-Producing Tree

Khīrarukkhopamasutta

"Mendicants, take any monk or nun who, when it comes to sights known by the eye, still has greed, hate, and delusion, and has not given them up. If even trivial sights come into their range of vision they overcome their mind, let alone those that are compelling.¹⁶⁸ Why is that? Because they still have greed, hate, and delusion, and have not given them up. 1.1

When it comes to sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, they still have greed, hate, and delusion, and have not given them up. If even trivial thoughts come into the range of the mind they overcome their mind, let alone those that are compelling. 2.1

168. About a dozen discourses refer to a "monk or nun". It is probable that when discourses were taught, there would have normally been nuns present, just as there were random lay people listening in (SN 35.241:7.1).

Why is that? Because they still have greed, hate, and delusion, and have not given them up.

- 4.1 Suppose there was a latex-producing tree—such as a peepal, a banyan, a wavy leaf fig, or a cluster fig—that’s a tender young sapling.¹⁶⁹ If a man were to chop it here and there with a sharp axe, would latex come out?”

4.3 “Yes, sir.

4.4 Why is that? Because it still has latex.”

- 5.1 “In the same way, take any monk or nun who, when it comes to sights known by the eye, still has greed, hate, and delusion, and has not given them up. If even trivial sights come into their range of vision they overcome their mind, let alone those that are compelling. Why is that? Because they still have greed, hate, and delusion, and have not given them up.

- 6.1 When it comes to sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, they still have greed, hate, and delusion, and have not given them up. If even trivial thoughts come into the range of the mind they overcome their mind, let alone those that are compelling. Why is that? Because they still have greed, hate, and delusion, and have not given them up.

- 8.1 Take any monk or nun who, when it comes to sights known by the eye, has no greed, hate, and delusion left, and has given them up. If even compelling sights come into their range of vision they don’t overcome their mind, let alone those that are trivial. Why is that? Because they have no greed, hate, and delusion left, and have given them up.

- 9.1 When it comes to sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, they have no greed, hate, and delusion left, and have given them up. If even compelling ideas come into the range of the mind they don’t overcome their mind, let alone those that are

169. It is tempting to translate *khīra* (“milk”) here as “sap”, but the milky liquid exuded by these trees is a distinct substance called latex.

trivial. Why is that? Because they have no greed, hate, and delusion left, and have given them up.

Suppose there was a latex-producing tree—such as a peepal, a banyan, a wavy leaf fig, or a cluster fig—that’s dried up, withered, and decrepit. If a man were to chop it here and there with a sharp axe, would latex come out?” 9.4

“No, sir. Why is that? Because it has no latex left.” 9.6

“In the same way, take any monk or nun who, when it comes to sights known by the eye, has no greed, hate, and delusion left, and has given them up. If even compelling sights come into their range of vision they don’t overcome their mind, let alone those that are trivial. Why is that? Because they have no greed, hate, and delusion left, and have given them up. 10.1

When it comes to sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind, they have no greed, hate, and delusion left, and have given them up. If even compelling thoughts come into the range of the mind they don’t overcome their mind, let alone those that are trivial. Why is that? Because they have no greed, hate, and delusion left, and have given them up.” 11.1

SN 35.232

With Koṭṭhita

Koṭṭhikasutta

At one time Venerable Sāriputta and Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita were staying near Varanasi in the deer park at Isipatana. Then in the late afternoon, Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita came out of retreat, went to Venerable Sāriputta, and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to Sāriputta: 1.1

“Reverend Sāriputta, which is it? Is the eye the fetter of sights, or are sights the fetter of the eye? Is the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind the fetter of ideas, or are ideas the fetter of the mind?” 2.1

- 3.1 “Reverend Koṭṭhita, the eye is not the fetter of sights, nor are sights the fetter of the eye. The fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them. The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is not the fetter of ideas, nor are ideas the fetter of the mind. The fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them.
- 4.1 Suppose there was a black ox and a white ox yoked by a single harness or yoke. Would it be right to say that the black ox is the yoke of the white ox, or the white ox is the yoke of the black ox?”
- 4.4 “No, reverend.¹⁷⁰ The black ox is not the yoke of the white ox, nor is the white ox the yoke of the black ox. The yoke there is the single harness or yoke that they’re yoked by.”
- 5.1 “In the same way, the eye is not the fetter of sights, nor are sights the fetter of the eye. The fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them. The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is not the fetter of ideas, nor are ideas the fetter of the mind. The fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them.
- 6.1 If the eye were the fetter of sights, or if sights were the fetter of the eye, this living of the spiritual life for the complete ending of suffering would not be found. However, since this is not the case, but the fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them, this living of the spiritual life for the complete ending of suffering is found.
- 7.1 If the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind were the fetter of ideas, or if ideas were the fetter of the mind, this living of the spiritual life for the complete ending of suffering would not be found. However, since this is not the case, but the fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them, this living of the spiritual life for the complete ending of suffering is found.
- 9.1 This too is a way to understand how this is so.

170. The speaker is unclear in this passage, and should be treated according to the otherwise identical passage at SN 41.1:4.7.

The Buddha has an eye with which he sees a sight. But he has no 10.1
 desire and greed, for his mind is well freed. The Buddha has an ear
 ... nose ... tongue ... The Buddha has a body with which he senses
 touch. But he has no desire and greed, for his mind is well freed. The
 Buddha has a mind

with which he knows ideas. But he has no desire and greed, for 10.22
 his mind is well freed.

This too is a way to understand how the eye is not the fetter of 11.1
 sights, nor are sights the fetter of the eye. The fetter there is the
 desire and greed that arises from the pair of them. The ear ... nose
 ... tongue ... body ... mind is not the fetter of ideas, nor are ideas
 the fetter of the mind. The fetter there is the desire and greed that
 arises from the pair of them.”

SN 35.233

With Kāmabhū

Kāmaḥsutta

At one time the venerables Ānanda and Kāmabhū were staying near 1.1
 Kosambī in Ghosita’s monastery.¹⁷¹

Then in the late afternoon, Venerable Kāmabhū came out of re- 1.2
 treat, went to Venerable Ānanda, and exchanged greetings with
 him.¹⁷² When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he
 sat down to one side and said to Ānanda:

“Reverend Ānanda, which is it? Is the eye the fetter of sights, or 2.1
 are sights the fetter of the eye? Is the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body
 ... mind the fetter of ideas, or are ideas the fetter of the mind?”

“Reverend Kāmabhū, the eye is not the fetter of sights, nor are 3.1
 sights the fetter of the eye. The fetter there is the desire and greed
 that arises from the pair of them. The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body

171. See note at SN 12.68:1.1.

172. Kāmabhū discusses Dhamma with the wise layman Citta at SN 41.5 and
 SN 41.6.

... mind is not the fetter of ideas, nor are ideas the fetter of the mind. The fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them.

- 4.1 Suppose there was a black ox and a white ox yoked by a single harness or yoke. Would it be right to say that the black ox is the yoke of the white ox, or the white ox is the yoke of the black ox?”
- 4.4 “No, reverend. The black ox is not the yoke of the white ox, nor is the white ox the yoke of the black ox. The yoke there is the single harness or yoke that they’re yoked by.”
- 4.7 “In the same way, the eye is not the fetter of sights, nor are sights the fetter of the eye. The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is not the fetter of ideas, nor are ideas the fetter of the mind. The fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them.”

SN 35.234

With Udāyī

Udāyīsutta

- 1.1 At one time the venerables Ānanda and Udāyī were staying near Kosambī in Ghosita’s monastery.
- 1.2 Then in the late afternoon, Venerable Udāyī came out of retreat, went to Venerable Ānanda, and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to Ānanda:
- 2.1 “Reverend Ānanda, the Buddha has explained, opened, and revealed in many ways how this body is not-self. Is it possible to explain consciousness in the same way? To teach, assert, establish, clarify, analyze, and reveal how consciousness is not-self?”
- 3.1 “It is possible, Reverend Udāyī.
- 4.1 Does eye consciousness arise dependent on the eye and sights?”
- 4.2 “Yes, reverend.”

“If the cause and reason that gives rise to eye consciousness were to 4.3
totally and utterly cease without remainder, would eye consciousness
still be found?”

“No, reverend.” 4.4

“In this way, too, it can be understood how consciousness is not- 4.5
self.

Does ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind consciousness arise 5.1
dependent on the mind and ideas?”

“Yes, reverend.” 6.2

“If the cause and reason that gives rise to mind consciousness 6.3
were to totally and utterly cease without remainder, would mind
consciousness still be found?”

“No, reverend.” 6.4

“In this way, too, it can be understood how consciousness is not- 6.5
self.

Suppose there was a person in need of heartwood. Wandering 7.1
in search of heartwood, they’d take a sharp axe and enter a forest.
There they’d see a big banana trunk, straight and young and grown
unskewed. They’d cut it down at the base, cut off the root, cut off
the top, and unroll the coiled sheaths. But they wouldn’t even find
sapwood, much less heartwood.

In the same way, a mendicant sees these six fields of contact as 7.2
neither self nor belonging to self. So seeing, they don’t grasp any-
thing in the world.¹⁷³ Not grasping, they’re not anxious. Not being
anxious, they personally become extinguished.

They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has 7.5
been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing
further for this place.’”

173. Editions vary as to whether the participle should be the negative form here, which would mean “so not seeing [anything as self] ...”. However, in the previous line the negative is applied to the noun, “sees ... not self” rather than “does not see ... self”.

SN 35.235

The Exposition on Burning

Ādittapariyāyasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you an exposition of the teaching on burning. Listen ...
- 1.3 And what is the exposition of the teaching on burning?
- 1.4 You’d be better off mutilating your eye faculty with a red-hot iron nail, burning, blazing, and glowing, than getting caught up in the features by way of the details in sights known by the eye.¹⁷⁴ Should consciousness tied to gratification in the features or details continue to remain, and you were to die at that time, it’s possible you would go to one of two destinations: hell or the animal realm. I speak having seen this drawback.
- 2.1 You’d be better off mutilating your ear faculty with a sharp iron spike ...
- 3.1 You’d be better off mutilating your nose faculty with a sharp nail cutter ...
- 4.1 You’d be better off mutilating your tongue faculty with a sharp razor ...
- 5.1 You’d be better off mutilating your body faculty with a sharp spear, burning, blazing, and glowing, than getting caught up in the features by way of the details in touches known by the body. Should consciousness tied to gratification in the features or details continue to remain, and you were to die at that time, it’s possible you would go to one of two destinations: hell or the animal realm. I speak having seen this drawback.
- 6.1 You’d be better off sleeping. For I say that sleep is useless, fruitless, and folly for the living. But while you’re asleep you won’t fall under

174. In such contexts, *nimitta* and *anubyāñjana* are almost always treated as parallel synonyms. The separation of the two, with the instrumental *anubyāñjanaso*, is found only at MN 124:20–25.1 and other late texts.

the sway of such thoughts that would make you create a schism in the Saṅgha.¹⁷⁵ I speak having seen this drawback.

A learned noble disciple reflects on this: ‘Forget mutilating the eye faculty with a red-hot iron nail, burning, blazing, and glowing! I’d better focus on the fact that the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact are impermanent. And the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on eye contact is also impermanent. 7.1

Forget mutilating the ear faculty with a sharp iron spike, burning, blazing, and glowing! I’d better focus on the fact that the ear, sounds, ear consciousness, and ear contact are impermanent. And the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on ear contact is also impermanent. 8.1

Forget mutilating the nose faculty with a sharp nail cutter, burning, blazing, and glowing! I’d better focus on the fact that the nose, smells, nose consciousness, and nose contact are impermanent. And the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on nose contact is also impermanent. 9.1

Forget mutilating the tongue faculty with a sharp razor, burning, blazing, and glowing! I’d better focus on the fact that the tongue, tastes, tongue consciousness, and tongue contact are impermanent. And the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on tongue contact is also impermanent. 10.1

Forget mutilating the body faculty with a sharp spear, burning, blazing, and glowing! I’d better focus on the fact that the body, touches, body consciousness, and body contact are impermanent. And the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on body contact is also impermanent. 11.1

Forget sleeping! I’d better focus on the fact that the mind, ideas, mind consciousness, and mind contact are impermanent. And the 12.1

175. A schism in the Saṅgha is regarded as a heinous crime resulting in lower rebirth. It is a legal term in the Vinaya, which requires that a group of monastics who are maliciously promulgating what is against the Dhamma and Vinaya, carry out an *uposatha* procedure aiming to divide the Saṅgha.

painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact is also impermanent.’

- 13.1 Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with the eye, sights, eye consciousness, and eye contact. And they grow disillusioned with the painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises conditioned by eye contact. They grow disillusioned with the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind ... painful, pleasant, or neutral feeling that arises dependent on mind contact.
- 13.3 Being disillusioned, desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When they’re freed, they know they’re freed.
- 13.4 They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing further for this place.’
- 13.5 This is the exposition of the teaching on burning.”

SN 35.236

The Simile of Hands and Feet (1st)

Paṭhamahatthapādopamasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, when there are hands, picking up and putting down are found.¹⁷⁶ When there are feet, coming and going are found. When there are joints, contracting and extending are found. When there’s a belly, hunger and thirst are found.
- 1.5 In the same way, when there’s an eye, pleasure and pain arise internally conditioned by eye contact. When there’s an ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, pleasure and pain arise internally conditioned by mind contact.
- 2.1 When there are no hands, picking up and putting down aren’t found. When there are no feet, coming and going aren’t found.

176. According to the doctrine of kamma, we acquire our bodies with their faculties from our desire. It does not just happen to be the case that we have hands to pick things up; we have manifested rebirth with hands because we want to pick things up.

When there are no joints, contracting and extending aren't found.
When there's no belly, hunger and thirst aren't found.

In the same way, when there's no eye, pleasure and pain don't arise 2.5
internally conditioned by eye contact. When there's no ear ... nose
... tongue ... body ... mind, pleasure and pain don't arise internally
conditioned by mind contact."

SN 35.237

The Simile of Hands and Feet (2nd)

Dutiyahatthapādopamasutta

"Mendicants, when there are hands, there's picking up and putting 1.1
down. When there are feet, there's coming and going. When there
are joints, there's contracting and extending. When there's a belly,
there's hunger and thirst.

In the same way, when there's an eye, pleasure and pain arise in- 1.5
ternally conditioned by eye contact. When there's an ear ... nose ...
tongue ... body ... mind, pleasure and pain arise internally condi-
tioned by mind contact.

When there are no hands, there's no picking up and putting down. 2.1
When there are no feet, there's no coming and going. When there
are no joints, there's no contracting and extending. When there's no
belly, there's no hunger and thirst.

In the same way, when there's no eye, pleasure and pain don't arise 2.5
internally conditioned by eye contact. When there's no ear ... nose
... tongue ... body ... mind, pleasure and pain don't arise internally
conditioned by mind contact."

The Chapter on the Simile of the Vipers

SN 35.238

The Simile of the Vipers

Āsivisopamasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, suppose there were four venomous vipers of awesome might.¹⁷⁷ Then a person would come along who wants to live and doesn’t want to die, who wants to be happy and recoils from pain.
- 1.3 They’d say to him, ‘My man, here are four venomous vipers of awesome might. They must be periodically picked up, washed, fed, and put to sleep. But when one or other of these four venomous vipers gets angry with you, you’ll meet with death or deadly pain. So then, my man, do what has to be done.’
- 2.1 Then that man, terrified of those four venomous vipers, would flee this way or that.
- 2.2 They’d say to him, ‘My man, there are five deadly enemies chasing you, thinking: “When we catch sight of him, we’ll murder him right there!” So then, my man, do what has to be done.’
- 3.1 Then that man, terrified of those four venomous vipers and those five deadly enemies, would flee this way or that.

177. “Viper” is *āsivīsā*, “venom-fang”. | *Uggateja* (“awesome might”) is elsewhere used of the sun (SN 2.10:5.2) or the power of wisdom (Thag 19.1:5.1).

They'd say to him, 'My man, there's a sixth hidden killer chasing 3.2
you with a drawn sword, thinking: "When I catch sight of him, I'll
chop off his head right there!" So then, my man, do what has to be
done.'

Then that man, terrified of those four venomous vipers and those 4.1
five deadly enemies and the hidden killer, would flee this way or that.

He'd see an empty village. But whatever house he enters is vacant, 4.2
deserted, and empty. And whatever vessel he touches is vacant,
hollow, and empty.

They'd say to him, 'My man, there are bandits who raid villages, 4.5
and they're striking now. So then, my man, do what has to be done.'

Then that man, terrified of those four venomous vipers and those 5.1
five deadly enemies and the hidden killer and the bandits, would flee
this way or that.

He'd see a large deluge, whose near shore is dubious and perilous, 5.2
while the far shore is a sanctuary free of peril. But there's no ferryboat
or bridge for crossing over.

Then that man would think, 'Why don't I gather grass, sticks, 5.4
branches, and leaves and make a raft? Riding on the raft, and paddling
with my hands and feet, I can safely reach the far shore.'

And so that man did exactly that. Having crossed over and gone 6.1
to the far shore, the brahmin stands on solid ground.

I've made up this simile to make a point. And this is the point. 7.1

'Four venomous vipers of awesome might' is a term for the four 7.3
principal states: the elements of earth, water, fire, and air.

'Five deadly enemies' is a term for the five grasping aggregates, 8.1
that is: form, feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness.

'The sixth hidden killer with a drawn sword' is a term for relishing 9.1
and greed.

'Empty village' is a term for the six interior sense fields. If an astute, 10.1
competent, intelligent person investigates this in relation to the eye,
it appears vacant, hollow, and empty.¹⁷⁸ If an astute, competent,

178. *Nam* ("this") refers back to the village; cf. SN 35.243:5.2.

intelligent person investigates this in relation to the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind, it appears vacant, hollow, and empty.

- 11.1 ‘Bandits who raid villages’ is a term for the six exterior sense fields. The eye is struck by both agreeable and disagreeable sights. The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is struck by both agreeable and disagreeable ideas.
- 12.1 ‘Large deluge’ is a term for the four floods: the floods of sensual pleasures, desire to be reborn, views, and ignorance.
- 13.1 ‘The near shore that’s dubious and perilous’ is a term for substantial reality.
- 14.1 ‘The far shore, a sanctuary free of peril’ is a term for extinguishment.
- 15.1 ‘The raft’ is a term for the noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion.
- 16.1 ‘Paddling with hands and feet’ is a term for rousing energy.
- 17.1 ‘Crossed over, gone to the far shore, the brahmin stands on solid ground’ is a term for a perfected one.”

SN 35.239

The Simile of the Chariot

Rathopamasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, when a mendicant has three qualities they’re full of joy and happiness in this very life, and they have laid the groundwork for ending the defilements.¹⁷⁹ What three?
- 1.3 They guard the sense doors, eat in moderation, and are committed to wakefulness.
- 2.1 And how does a mendicant guard the sense doors?

179. Happiness is fundamental to the spiritual path, and not just in the attainment of deep meditations. | “And they have laid the groundwork” is *yonī cassa āraddhā*.

When a mendicant sees a sight with their eyes, they don't get caught up in the features and details. If the faculty of sight were left unrestrained, bad unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure would become overwhelming. For this reason, they practice restraint, protecting the faculty of sight, and achieving its restraint. 2.2

When they hear a sound with their ears ... 2.4

When they smell an odor with their nose ... 2.5

When they taste a flavor with their tongue ... 2.6

When they feel a touch with their body ... 2.7

When they know an idea with their mind, they don't get caught up in the features and details. If the faculty of mind were left unrestrained, bad unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure would become overwhelming. For this reason, they practice restraint, protecting the faculty of mind, and achieving its restraint. 2.8

Suppose a chariot stood harnessed to thoroughbreds at a level crossroads, with a goad ready. A deft horse trainer, a master charioteer, might mount the chariot, taking the reins in his right hand and goad in the left. He'd drive out and back wherever he wishes, whenever he wishes. 2.10

In the same way, a mendicant trains to protect, control, tame, and pacify these six senses. 2.11

That's how a mendicant guards the sense doors. 2.12

And how does a mendicant eat in moderation? 3.1

It's when a mendicant reflects rationally on the food that they eat: 'Not for fun, indulgence, adornment, or decoration, but only to sustain this body, to avoid harm, and to support spiritual practice. In this way, I shall put an end to old discomfort and not give rise to new discomfort, and I will have the means to keep going, blamelessness, and a comfortable abiding.' 3.2

It's like a person who puts ointment on a wound only so that it can heal; or who oils an axle only so that it can carry a load. 3.4

In the same way, a mendicant reflects rationally on the food that they eat: 'Not for fun, indulgence, adornment, or decoration, but only to sustain this body, to avoid harm, and to support spiritual 3.5

practice. In this way, I shall put an end to old discomfort and not give rise to new discomfort, and I will have the means to keep going, blamelessness, and a comfortable abiding.’

3.7 That’s how a mendicant eats in moderation.

4.1 And how is a mendicant committed to wakefulness?

4.2 It’s when a mendicant practices walking and sitting meditation by day, purifying their mind from obstacles. In the first watch of the night, they continue to practice walking and sitting meditation. In the middle watch, they lie down in the lion’s posture—on the right side, placing one foot on top of the other—mindful and aware, and focused on the time of getting up. In the last watch, they get up and continue to practice walking and sitting meditation, purifying their mind from obstacles.

4.6 This is how a mendicant is committed to wakefulness.

4.7 When a mendicant possesses these three qualities they’re full of joy and happiness in this very life, and they have laid the groundwork for ending the defilements.”

SN 35.240

The Simile of the Tortoise

Kummopamasutta

1.1 “Once upon a time, mendicants, a tortoise was grazing along the bank of a river in the afternoon. At the same time, a jackal was also hunting along the river bank. The tortoise saw the jackal off in the distance hunting, so it drew its limbs and neck inside its shell, and kept passive and silent.¹⁸⁰

1.5 But the jackal also saw the tortoise off in the distance grazing. So it went up to the tortoise and waited nearby, thinking, ‘When that

180. The verb for “drawing in” (*samodahati*) here is almost identical with that for immersion (*samādahati*). The turtle “draws in” its five limbs as a meditator draws the mind in from the senses.

tortoise sticks one or other of its limbs or neck out from its shell, I'll grab it right there, rip it out, and eat it!' ¹⁸¹

But when that tortoise didn't stick one or other of its limbs or neck out from its shell, the jackal left disappointed, since it couldn't find a vulnerability. 1.8

In the same way, Māra the Wicked is always waiting nearby, thinking: 'Hopefully I can find a vulnerability in the eye, ear, nose, tongue, body, or mind.' That's why you should live with sense doors guarded. 2.1

When you see a sight with your eyes, don't get caught up in the features and details. If the faculty of sight were left unrestrained, bad unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure would become overwhelming. For this reason, practice restraint, protecting the faculty of sight, and achieving its restraint. 2.6

When you hear a sound with your ears ... 2.8

When you smell an odor with your nose ... 2.9

When you taste a flavor with your tongue ... 2.10

When you feel a touch with your body ... 2.11

When you know an idea with your mind, don't get caught up in the features and details. If the faculty of mind were left unrestrained, bad unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure would become overwhelming. For this reason, practice restraint, protecting the faculty of mind, and achieving its restraint. 2.12

When you live with your sense doors guarded, Māra will leave you disappointed, since he can't find a vulnerability, just like the jackal left the tortoise. 2.14

A mendicant should collect their thoughts ¹⁸² as a tortoise draws its limbs into its shell. Independent, not disturbing others, quenched: they wouldn't blame anyone." 3.1

181. The verb *abhininnāmeti* ("sticks out") is the same as that used for "extending" the mind to higher knowledges based on *samādhi*.

182. The text is notable for the omission of the stock phrase saying the Buddha spoke the verse. Either the verse was added by redactors (lifted from SN 1.17:3.1), or else the stock phrase has been abbreviated away.

SN 35.241

The Simile of the Tree Trunk (1st)

Paṭhamadārukkhandhopamasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Kosambī on the bank of the Ganges River.¹⁸³
- 1.2 Seeing a large tree trunk being carried along by the current, he addressed the mendicants, “Mendicants, do you see that large tree trunk being carried along by the current of the Ganges River?”
- 1.5 “Yes, sir.”
- 1.6 “Mendicants, assume that that tree trunk doesn’t drift toward the near shore or the far shore, or sink in the middle, or get stranded on high ground. And assume that it doesn’t get taken by humans or non-humans or caught up in a whirlpool, and that it doesn’t rot away. In that case, that tree trunk will slant, slope, and incline toward the ocean. Why is that? Because the current of the Ganges River slants, slopes, and inclines toward the ocean.
- 2.1 In the same way, assume that you don’t drift toward the near shore or the far shore, or sink in the middle, or get stranded on high ground. And assume that you don’t get taken by humans or non-humans or caught up in a whirlpool, and that you don’t rot away. In that case, you will slant, slope, and incline toward extinguishment. Why is that? Because right view slants, slopes, and inclines toward extinguishment.”
- 2.6 When he said this, one of the mendicants said to the Buddha:
- 2.7 “But sir, what’s the near shore and what’s the far shore? What’s sinking in the middle? What’s getting stranded on high ground? What’s getting taken by humans or non-humans? What’s getting caught up in a whirlpool? And what’s rotting away?”
- 3.1 “‘The near shore’, mendicant, is a term for the six interior sense fields.
- 3.2 ‘The far shore’ is a term for the six exterior sense fields.

183. This appears to be a mistake, as Kosambī was in fact on the Yamunā river.

- ‘Sinking in the middle’ is a term for greed and relishing. 3.3
- ‘Stranded on high ground’ is a term for the conceit ‘I am’. 3.4
- And what’s getting taken by humans? It’s when someone mixes 4.1
closely with laypeople, sharing their joys and sorrows—happy when
they’re happy and sad when they’re sad—and getting themselves
involved in their business.¹⁸⁴ That’s called getting taken by humans.
- And what’s getting taken by non-humans? It’s when someone 5.1
leads the spiritual life wishing to be reborn in one of the orders of
gods: ‘By this precept or observance or fervent austerity or spiritual
practice, may I become one of the gods!’ That’s called getting taken
by non-humans. ‘Caught up in a whirlpool’ is a term for the five
kinds of sensual stimulation.
- And what’s rotting away? It’s when some person is unethical, of 6.1
bad qualities, filthy, with suspicious behavior, underhand, no true
ascetic or spiritual practitioner—though claiming to be one—rotten
inside, festering, and depraved. This is called ‘rotting away.’”
- Now at that time Nanda the cowherd was sitting not far from the 7.1
Buddha.¹⁸⁵ Then he said to the Buddha:
- “I won’t drift toward the near shore or the far shore, or sink in 7.3
the middle, or get stranded on high ground. And I won’t get taken
by humans or non-humans or caught up in a whirlpool, and I won’t
rot away. Sir, may I receive the going forth, the ordination in the
Buddha’s presence?”
- “Well then, Nanda, return the cows to their owners.” 7.5
- “Sir, the cows will go back by themselves, since they love their 7.6
calves.”
- “Still, Nanda, you should return them to their owners.” 7.7

184. Also at SN 22.3:8.2.

185. Nanda is one of the most common names in Pali, and it is not possible to identify this Nanda with any confidence. This episode stands as a reminder that the Buddha’s teachings were open, and many people from different backgrounds may have been listening, quite apart from the “mendicants” to whom the discourse is typically addressed. Note too that a man of such humble livelihood has no qualms in speaking directly to the Buddha.

- 7.8 Then Nanda, after returning the cows to their owners, went up to the Buddha and said to him, “Sir, I have delivered the cows to their owners. May I receive the going forth, the ordination in the Buddha’s presence?”
- 7.11 And the cowherd Nanda received the going forth, the ordination in the Buddha’s presence. Not long after his ordination, Venerable Nanda became one of the perfected.

SN 35.242

The Simile of the Tree Trunk (2nd)

Dutiyadārukkhandhopamasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Kimibilā on the bank of the Ganges River. Seeing a large tree trunk being carried along by the current, he addressed the mendicants: “Mendicants, do you see that large tree trunk being carried along by the current of the Ganges River?”
- 1.5 “Yes, sir,” they replied. ... When this was said, Venerable Kimbila said to the Buddha:
- 1.7 “But sir, what’s the near shore and what’s the far shore? What’s sinking in the middle? What’s getting stranded on high ground? What’s getting taken by humans or non-humans? What’s getting caught up in a whirlpool? And what’s rotting away?” ...
- 1.8 “And what, Kimbila, is rotting away? It’s when a mendicant has committed the kind of corrupt offense for which no rehabilitation is possible.¹⁸⁶ This is called ‘rotting away.’”

186. This refers to the *pārājika* offenses—sexual intercourse, murder, stealing, and lying about spiritual attainments—which entail immediate and permanent expulsion from the Saṅgha.

SN 35.243

The Explanation on the Festering

Avassutapariyāyasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying in the land of the Sakyans, 1.1
near Kapilavatthu in the Banyan Tree Monastery. Now at that time
a new town hall had recently been constructed for the Sakyans of
Kapilavatthu. It had not yet been occupied by an ascetic or brahmin
or any human at all.¹⁸⁷

Then the Sakyans of Kapilavatthu went up to the Buddha, bowed, 1.3
sat down to one side, and said to him, “Sir, a new town hall has
recently been constructed for the Sakyans of Kapilavatthu. It has
not yet been occupied by an ascetic or brahmin or any human at all.
May the Buddha be the first to use it, and only then will the Sakyans
of Kapilavatthu use it. That would be for the lasting welfare and
happiness of the Sakyans of Kapilavatthu.” The Buddha consented
with silence.

Knowing that the Buddha had consented, the Sakyans rose from 2.1
their seats, bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him
on their right. Then they went to the new town hall, where they
spread carpets all over, prepared seats, set up a water jar, and placed
an oil lamp. Then they went back to the Buddha and told him of
their preparations, saying, “Please, sir, come at your convenience.”

Then the Buddha robed up and, taking his bowl and robe, went to 2.4
the new town hall together with the Saṅgha of mendicants. Having
washed his feet, he entered the town hall and sat against the central
column facing east. The Saṅgha of mendicants also washed their
feet, entered the town hall, and sat against the west wall facing east,

187. The completion of a town hall was celebrated by a talk for the Sakyans at MN 53:2.1 and the Mallas at DN 33:1.2.1. Such halls were community meeting places that played a central role in civic society and communal decision-making in democratic republics such as the Mallas and the Sakyans. The Buddha's participation is a sign of his support for their civic and democratic process; he is not said to attend any comparable civic events for kings.

with the Buddha right in front of them. The Sakyans of Kapilavatthu also washed their feet, entered the town hall, and sat against the east wall facing west, with the Buddha right in front of them. The Buddha spent much of the night educating, encouraging, firing up, and inspiring the Sakyans with a Dhamma talk. Then he sent them off, saying, “The night is getting late, Gotamas.¹⁸⁸ Please go at your convenience.”

2.10 “Yes, sir,” replied the Sakyans. They got up from their seat, bowed and respectfully circled the Buddha, keeping him on their right, before leaving.

3.1 Then, not long after the Sakyans had left, the Buddha addressed Venerable Mahāmoggallāna, “Moggallāna, the Saṅgha of mendicants is rid of dullness and drowsiness. Give them some Dhamma talk as you feel inspired. My back is sore,¹⁸⁹ I’ll stretch it.”

3.6 “Yes, sir,” Mahāmoggallāna replied. And then the Buddha spread out his outer robe folded in four and laid down in the lion’s posture—on the right side, placing one foot on top of the other—mindful and aware, and focused on the time of getting up.

3.8 There Venerable Mahāmoggallāna addressed the mendicants: “Reverends, mendicants!”

3.10 “Reverend,” they replied. Venerable Mahāmoggallāna said this:

3.12 “I will teach you the explanation of the festering and the not festering.¹⁹⁰ Listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.”

3.14 “Yes, reverend,” they replied. Venerable Mahāmoggallāna said this:

4.1 “And how is someone festering?”

188. The Buddha refers to the Sakyans as “Gotamas” after the lineage of the family priest (*purohita*). Thus “Gotama” is not a personal name of the Buddha. In a similar context at DN 33:1.4.5, the Buddha refers to the Mallas after their priestly lineage, Vāsetṭha.

189. The Buddha’s bad back is mentioned several times in similar contexts, suggesting that such events took place in his old age. It serves as a reminder that freedom from attachment to the body does not mean one must forcefully endure pain.

190. “Festering” is *avassuta*, literally “that which has been flowed down into”.

Take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. If it's pleasant 4.2
they hold on to it, but if it's unpleasant they dislike it. They live with
mindfulness of the body unestablished and their heart stunted. And
they don't truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by
wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without
remainder.

They hear a sound ... smell an odor ... taste a flavor ... feel a touch 4.4
... know an idea with their mind. If it's pleasant they hold on to it,
but if it's unpleasant they dislike it. They live with mindfulness of
the body unestablished and their heart stunted. And they don't truly
understand the freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom where
those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without remainder.

This is called a mendicant who is festering when it comes to sights 4.7
known by the eye, sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas
known by the mind.

When a mendicant lives like this, if Māra comes at them through 4.10
the eye he finds a vulnerability and gets an opportunity. If Māra
comes at them through the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind
he finds a vulnerability and gets an opportunity.

Suppose there was a house made of reeds or straw that was dried 5.1
up, withered, and decrepit. If a person came to it with a burning
grass torch from the east, west, north, south, below, above, or from
anywhere, the fire would find a vulnerability, it would get an oppor-
tunity.

In the same way, when a mendicant lives like this, if Māra comes 5.9
at them through the eye he finds a vulnerability and gets an oppor-
tunity. If Māra comes at them through the ear ... nose ... tongue ...
body ... mind he finds a vulnerability and gets an opportunity.

When a mendicant lives like this, they're mastered by sights, 5.12
sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas, they don't master these
things.

This is called a mendicant who has been mastered by sights, 5.18
sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas. They're mastered, not
a master. Bad, unskillful qualities have mastered them, which are

corrupting, leading to future lives, hurtful, and resulting in suffering and future rebirth, old age, and death.

- 5.19 That's how someone is festering.
- 6.1 And how is someone not festering?
- 6.2 Take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. If it's pleasant they don't hold on to it, and if it's unpleasant they don't dislike it. They live with mindfulness of the body established and a limitless heart. And they truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without remainder.
- 6.4 They hear a sound ... smell an odor ... taste a flavor ... feel a touch ... know an idea with their mind. If it's pleasant they don't hold on to it, and if it's unpleasant they don't dislike it. They live with mindfulness of the body established and a limitless heart. And they truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without remainder.
- 6.7 This is called a mendicant who is not festering when it comes to sights known by the eye, sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind.
- 6.9 When a mendicant lives like this, if Māra comes at them through the eye he doesn't find a vulnerability or get an opportunity. If Māra comes at them through the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind he doesn't find a vulnerability or get an opportunity.
- 7.1 Suppose there was a bungalow or hall made of thick clay with its plaster still wet. If a person came to it with a burning grass torch from the east, west, north, south, below, above, or from anywhere, the fire wouldn't find a vulnerability, it would get no opportunity.
- 7.9 In the same way, when a mendicant lives like this, if Māra comes at them through the eye he doesn't find a vulnerability or get an opportunity. If Māra comes at them through the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind he doesn't find a vulnerability or get an opportunity.

When a mendicant lives like this, they master sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas, they're not mastered by these things. 7.11

This is called a mendicant who has mastered sights, sounds, smells, tastes, touches, and ideas. They're a master, not mastered. Bad, unskillful qualities have been mastered by them, which are corrupting, leading to future lives, hurtful, and resulting in suffering and future rebirth, old age, and death. 7.17

That's how someone is not festering." 7.18

Then the Buddha got up and said to Venerable Mahāmoggallāna: 8.1

"Good, good, Moggallāna! It's good that you've taught this explanation of the festering and the not festering." 8.2

That is what Venerable Mahāmoggallāna said, and the Teacher concurred. Satisfied, the mendicants approved what Mahāmoggallāna said. 9.1

SN 35.244

Entailing Suffering

Dukkhadhammasutta

"Mendicants, when a mendicant truly understands the origin and disappearance of all things that entail suffering, then they've seen sensual pleasures in such a way that they have no underlying tendency for desire, affection, infatuation, and passion for sensual pleasures. And they've awakened to a way of conduct and a way of living such that, when they live in that way, bad, unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure don't overwhelm them.¹⁹¹ 1.1

And how does a mendicant truly understand the origin and disappearance of all things that entail suffering? 2.1

'Such is form, such is the origin of form, such is the disappearance of form. Such is feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness, 2.2

191. Read *nanvāssavanti*.

such is the origin of consciousness, such is the disappearance of consciousness.’

2.7 That’s how a mendicant truly understands the origin and disappearance of all things that entail suffering.

3.1 And how has a mendicant seen sensual pleasures in such a way that they have no underlying tendency for desire, affection, infatuation, and passion for sensual pleasures?

3.2 Suppose there was a pit of glowing coals deeper than a man’s height, filled with glowing coals that neither flamed nor smoked. Then a person would come along who wants to live and doesn’t want to die, who wants to be happy and recoils from pain. Two strong men would grab each arm and drag them toward the pit of glowing coals. They’d writhe and struggle to and fro.¹⁹² Why is that? For that person knows, ‘If I fall in that pit of glowing coals, that will result in my death or deadly pain.’

3.5 In the same way, when a mendicant has seen sensual pleasures as like a pit of glowing coals, they have no underlying tendency for desire, affection, infatuation, and passion for sensual pleasures.

4.1 And how has a mendicant awakened to a way of conduct and a way of living such that, when they live in that way, bad, unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure don’t overwhelm them?

4.2 Suppose a person was to enter a thicket full of thorns. They’d have thorns before and behind, to the left and right, below and above. So they’d go forward mindfully and come back mindfully, thinking, ‘May I not get any thorns!’

4.3 In the same way, whatever in the world seems nice and pleasant is called a thorn in the training of the Noble One. Understanding that this is a thorn, they should understand restraint and lack of restraint.¹⁹³

5.1 And how is someone unrestrained?

192. Compare SN 12.63:5.2.

193. Read *taṃ kaṇṭako ti iti viditvā*, which is found at SN 35.247:1.6, and here in BJT edition.

Take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. If it's pleasant 5.2
they hold on to it, but if it's unpleasant they dislike it. They live with
mindfulness of the body unestablished and their heart stunted. And
they don't truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by
wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without
remainder.

They hear a sound ... smell an odor ... taste a flavor ... feel a touch 5.4
... know an idea with their mind. If it's pleasant they hold on to it,
but if it's unpleasant they dislike it. They live with mindfulness of
the body unestablished and their heart stunted. And they don't truly
understand the freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom where
those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without remainder.

This is how someone is unrestrained. 5.7

And how is someone restrained? 6.1

Take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. If it's pleasant 6.2
they don't hold on to it, and if it's unpleasant they don't dislike it.
They live with mindfulness of the body established and a limitless
heart. And they truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom
by wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without
remainder.

They hear a sound ... smell an odor ... taste a flavor ... feel a 6.4
touch ... know an idea with their mind. If it's pleasant they don't
hold on to it, and if it's unpleasant they don't dislike it. They live
with mindfulness of the body established and a limitless heart. And
they truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom
where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without remainder.

This is how someone is restrained. 6.7

Perhaps while that mendicant is conducting themselves and liv- 7.1
ing in this way, bad, unskillful memories and thoughts that tighten
the fetters arise every so often due to loss of mindfulness. Slowly
mindfulness arises, but then they quickly give up, dispel, eliminate,
and obliterate those thoughts.

- 8.1 Suppose there was an iron cauldron that had been heated all day, and a person let two or three drops of water fall onto it. Slowly the drops fall, but then they quickly dry up and evaporate.¹⁹⁴
- 8.2 In the same way, perhaps while that mendicant is conducting themselves and living in this way, bad, unskillful memories and thoughts that tighten the fetters arise every so often due to loss of mindfulness. Slowly mindfulness arises, but then they quickly give up, dispel, eliminate, and obliterate those thoughts.
- 8.3 This is how a mendicant has awakened to a way of conduct and a way of living such that, when they live in that way, bad, unskillful qualities of covetousness and displeasure don't overwhelm them.
- 8.4 While that mendicant conducts themselves in this way and lives in this way, it may be that rulers or their chief ministers, friends or colleagues, relatives or family would invite them to accept wealth, saying, 'Please, my man, why let these other robes torment you? Why follow the practice of shaving your head and carrying an alms bowl? Come, return to a lesser life, enjoy wealth, and make merit!' But it is quite impossible for a mendicant who conducts themselves in this way and lives in this way to resign the training and return to a lesser life.
- 9.1 Suppose that, although the Ganges River slants, slopes, and inclines to the east, a large crowd were to come along with a spade and basket, saying: 'We'll make this Ganges River slant, slope, and incline to the west!'
- 9.2 What do you think, mendicants? Would they still succeed?"
- 9.4 "No, sir. Why is that? The Ganges River slants, slopes, and inclines to the east. It's not easy to make it slant, slope, and incline to the west. That large crowd will eventually get weary and frustrated."
- 9.9 "In the same way, while that mendicant conducts themselves in this way and lives in this way, it may be that rulers or their chief ministers, friends or colleagues, relatives or family should invite them to accept wealth, saying, 'Please, my man, why let these other robes

194. This simile is also at MN 66:16.5, MN 152:9.9, and AN 7.74:7.1.

torment you? Why follow the practice of shaving your head and carrying an alms bowl? Come, return to a lesser life, enjoy wealth, and make merit!’ But it is quite impossible for a mendicant who conducts themselves in this way and lives in this way to resign the training and return to a lesser life.

Why is that? Because for a long time that mendicant’s mind has slanted, sloped, and inclined to seclusion. So it’s impossible for them to return to a lesser life.”¹⁹⁵ 9.14

SN 35.245

The Simile of the Parrot Tree

Kimsukopamasutta

Then one mendicant went up to another mendicant and asked, “Reverend, at what point is a mendicant’s vision well purified?” 1.1

“When a mendicant truly understands the origin and disappearance of the six fields of contact, at that point their vision is well purified.” 1.3

Not content with that answer, that mendicant went up to a series of other mendicants and received the following answers:¹⁹⁶ 2.1

“When a mendicant truly understands the origin and disappearance of the five grasping aggregates, at that point their vision is well purified.” 2.3

195. The expression “slants to seclusion” (*vikekaninna*) was adopted by Patañjali at Yogasūtra 4.26.

196. The mendicant’s dissatisfaction perhaps stems from the term “well purified” (*suvisuddha*). It is not a well-defined term, but is most prominently used to describe the Buddha’s own realization of the Dhamma (SN 56.11:10.1). There, he uses a longer phrase, saying his “knowledge and vision is well purified in three rounds and twelve aspects”, denoting arahantship. The answers given here, however, speak only of the vision of the truth, which normally means stream-entry, while the abandoning of defilements characteristic of arahantship is not mentioned. Thus it seems the questioner thought the term “well purified” in and of itself implied arahantship, while his respondents took it to mean stream-entry, only implying arahantship when expanded in the longer phrase.

- 3.3 “When a mendicant truly understands the origin and disappearance of the four principal states, at that point their vision is well purified.”
- 4.3 “When a mendicant truly understands that everything that is liable to arise is liable to cease, at that point their vision is well purified.”
- 5.1 Not content with any of those answers, that mendicant went up to the Buddha and told him what had happened. Then he said to him, “Sir, at what point is a mendicant’s vision well purified?”
- 6.1 “Mendicant, suppose a person had never seen a parrot tree before.¹⁹⁷ They’d go up to someone who had seen a parrot tree and ask them, ‘My man, what’s a parrot tree like?’¹⁹⁸
- 6.4 They’d say, ‘A parrot tree is blackish, like a charred stump.’ Now, at that time a parrot tree may well have been just as that person saw it.
- 7.1 Not content with that answer, that person would go up to a series of other people and receive the following answers: ‘A parrot tree is reddish, like a scrap of meat.’¹⁹⁹ ‘A parrot tree has flaking bark and burst pods, like a lebbeck tree.’²⁰⁰ ‘A parrot tree has luxuriant, shady

197. *Kimśuka* should be resolved *kim-suka* (“what parrot?”) rather than *kim-suka* (“what’s it?”), as shown by the Sanskrit spelling *kimśuka* (Rig Veda 10.85.20; the flowers adorning the wedding chariot). In *Ritusamhāra* 6.22, a poem sometimes attributed to Kalidasa, the comparison to a parrot is made explicit. In Pali it is also referred to as *palāsa*, in which case I use flame-of-the-forest. It is *Butea monosperma*, whose distinctive flower keels resemble the curled beak of a parrot. The simile is further drawn out in the *Kimśukopama Jātaka* (Ja 248).

198. The following are all accurate descriptions of the parrot tree. | Text here uses *bho purisa* (“worthy man”) as a form of address, where the reply just below uses *ambho purisa* (“my man”). Similarly, SN 35.244:8.5 has *bho purisa* where the parallel at SN 45.160:1.12 has *ambho purisa*. Now, *bho* is used as address only by brahmins, which does not apply in any of these cases. I conclude, then, that *bho purisa* is a false reading for *ambho purisa*.

199. The flowers can resemble scraps of meat. *Visuddhimagga* 196.5–15 tells of a foolish jackal who danced in joy on finding a meat-bearing tree.

200. The lebbeck or siris (Pali *sirisa*, *Albizia lebbeck*) has large seed pods. It was the awakening tree of Kakusandha (DN 14:1.8.4).

foliage, like a banyan.’ Now, at each of those times a parrot tree may well have been just as those people saw them.

In the same way, those true persons each answered according to what they were focused on when their vision was well purified. 7.16

Suppose there was a king’s frontier citadel with fortified embankments, ramparts, and arches, and six gates. And it has a gatekeeper who is astute, competent, and intelligent. He keeps strangers out and lets known people in. 8.1

A swift pair of messengers would arrive from the east and say to the gatekeeper, ‘Worthy man, where is the lord of the city?’ 8.3

They’d say, ‘There he is, sirs, seated at the central square.’ 8.5

Then that swift pair of messengers would deliver a message of truth to the lord of the city and depart the way they came. 8.7

A swift pair of messengers would come from the west ... north ... south ... deliver a message of truth to the lord of the city and depart the way they came. 8.8

I’ve made up this simile to make a point. And this is the point. 9.1

‘City’ is a term for this body made up of the four principal states, produced by mother and father, built up from rice and porridge, liable to impermanence, to wearing away and erosion, to breaking up and destruction. 9.3

‘Six gates’ is a term for the six interior sense fields. 9.4

‘Gatekeeper’ is a term for mindfulness. 9.5

‘A swift pair of messengers’ is a term for serenity and discernment. 9.6

‘The lord of the city’ is a term for consciousness. 9.7

‘The central square’ is a term for the four principal states: the elements of earth, water, fire, and air. 9.8

‘A message of truth’ is a term for extinguishment. 9.10

- 9.11 “The way they came’ is a term for the noble eightfold path, that is, right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion.”²⁰¹

SN 35.246

The Simile of the Harp

Vīṇopamasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, any monk or nun who has desire or greed or hate or delusion or aversion come up for sights known by the eye should shield their mind from them:²⁰² ‘This path is dangerous and perilous, thorny and tangled; it’s a wrong turn, a bad path, in poor condition.’²⁰³ This path is frequented by untrue persons, not by true persons. It’s not worthy of you.’ The mind should be shielded from this when it comes to sights known by the eye.
- 1.6 Any monk or nun who has desire or greed or hate or delusion or repulsion come up for sounds ... smells ... tastes ... touches ... ideas known by the mind should shield their mind against them: ‘This path is dangerous and perilous, thorny and tangled; it’s a wrong turn, a bad path, a sorry state. This path is frequented by untrue persons, not by true persons. It’s not worthy of you.’ The mind should be shielded from this when it comes to ideas known by the mind.
- 2.1 Suppose the crops have ripened, but the caretaker is negligent. If an ox fond of crops invades the crops they’d indulge themselves as much as they like.

201. The Buddha’s response, by omitting a statement on the ending of defilements, affirms the earlier replies, confirming that *suvisuddha* by itself indicates stream-entry.

202. The same five defilements are listed at MN 151:3.3.

203. “Poor condition” is *duhitika*, cf. Sanskrit *durhita* (Rig Veda 8.19.26; Atharva Veda 4.36.9). See too SN 42.9:2.1 and note, and the opposite *suhita* (“replete”) at MN 3:3.1, etc.

In the same way, when an unlearned ordinary person doesn't 2.3
exercise restraint when it comes to the six fields of contact, they
indulge themselves in the five kinds of sensual stimulation as much
as they like.

Suppose the crops have ripened, and the caretaker is diligent. If 3.1
an ox fond of crops invades the crops the caretaker would grab them
firmly by the muzzle. Then they'd grab them above the hump and
hold them fast there.²⁰⁴ Then they'd give them a good thrashing
before driving them away. For a second time, and even a third time,
the same thing might happen. As a result, no matter how often they
might stand or sit in a village or wilderness, that ox fond of crops
would never invade that crop again, remembering the beating they
got earlier.

In the same way, when a mendicant's mind is straightened up, 3.14
well straightened up when it comes to the six fields of contact, be-
comes stilled internally; it settles, unifies, and becomes immersed in
samādhi.²⁰⁵

Suppose a king or their chief minister had never heard the sound 4.1
of an arched harp.²⁰⁶ When he first hears the sound, he'd say, 'Oh
my, what is making this sound, so arousing, sensuous, intoxicating,
infatuating, and captivating?'

They'd say to him, 'That, sir, is an arched harp.' 4.5

He'd say, 'Go, worthy sir, fetch me that arched harp.' 4.7

204. The *ghaṭā* ("pot") is the prominent hump of a zebu bull, which is grabbed to this day by bull wranglers.

205. For "straightened up", accept MS reading *udujita*, resolved as *ud* + *√uj* + *ita*.

206. The "arched harp" (*vīṇa*) was a multi-stringed instrument held in the lap, whose form is clear from representations in ancient Indian sculptures in Bharhut, Amarāvati, and Pawāyā, as well as the coins of Samudragupta. The strings, typically seven in number, were attached to the base of the soundbox and passed through holes in the parchment resonator to be tied with cords to the curved neck. It accompanied song or dance, and was played equally by men and women. It is not the modern Indian instrument called *veena*, which is a lute or stick zither, but rather is similar to the Burmese *saung*.

- 4.9 So they'd fetch it and say, 'This, sir, is that arched harp.'
- 4.12 He'd say, 'I've had enough of that arched harp! Just fetch me the sound.'
- 4.14 They'd say, 'Sir, this arched harp is made of many components assembled together, which make a sound when they're played. That is, it depends on the soundbox, the leather resonator, the neck, the tuning cords, the strings, the plectrum, and a person to play it properly. That's how an arched harp is made of many components assembled together,²⁰⁷ which make a sound when they're played.'²⁰⁸
- 4.19 But he'd split that harp into ten pieces or a hundred pieces, then splinter it up. He'd burn the splinters with fire, and reduce them to ashes. Then he'd whisk away the ashes in a strong wind, or glide them down a swift stream.
- 4.22 Then he'd say, 'It seems that there's nothing to this thing called an arched harp or whatever's called an arched harp! But people waste their time with it, negligent and heedless!'
- 4.24 In the same way, a mendicant searches for form, feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness anywhere they might be reborn.²⁰⁹

207. Most of these were established by Ananda K. Coomaraswamy, "The Parts of a Vinā", *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, Vol. 50 (1930), pp. 244–253. "Soundbox" is *doṇi* ("tub"); "leather resonator" is *camma*, a piece of leather stretched over the soundbox to enhance the resonance; "neck" is *daṇḍa*, the curved arm or frame to which the strings were attached; "strings" is *tanṭiyo*; and "plectrum" is *koṇa*. The remaining part is variously spelled as *upavīṇe*, *upadhirāṇe*, *upadhārāṇe*, or *upaveṇaṃ*, suggesting an early corruption. The preponderance of plural forms nonetheless supports Coomaraswamy's revised understanding ("The Parts of a Vinā", *JAOS*, Vol. 57, No. 1 (March 1937), pp. 101–103) that this is Sanskrit *upavīṇa*, *upavāṇa*, or *upaveṇa* having the sense "bindings". This would be the "tuning cords" by which the strings are tied to the neck and which also serve for tuning.

208. Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 2.4.9 says you can only catch the sound of a harp by getting hold of the lute or player, using this as a metaphor for the search for the Self. DN 23:19.3 tells a similar parable, only with a horn. The Upaniṣad has both instruments.

209. The rare verb *samanvesati* is used in SN 4.23:10.4 and SN 22.87:11.5 of Māra "searching" for the consciousness of a deceased arahant.

As they search in this way, their ideas of ‘I’ or ‘mine’ or ‘I am’ are no more.”

SN 35.247

The Simile of Six Animals

Chappāṇakopamasutta

“Mendicants, suppose a person with wounded and festering limbs 1.1
was to enter a thicket of reeds. The kusa thorns would pierce their
feet, and the reed leaves would scratch their limbs. And that would
cause that person to experience even more pain and distress.

In the same way, some mendicant goes to a village or a wilderness 1.4
and gets scolded, ‘This venerable, acting like this, behaving like this,
is a filthy village thorn.’²¹⁰ Understanding that they’re a thorn, they
should understand restraint and lack of restraint.

And how is someone unrestrained? 2.1

Take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. If it’s pleasant 2.2
they hold on to it, but if it’s unpleasant they dislike it. They live with
mindfulness of the body unestablished and their heart stunted. And
they don’t truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by
wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without
remainder.

When they hear a sound with their ears ... 2.4

When they smell an odor with their nose ... 2.5

When they taste a flavor with their tongue ... 2.6

When they feel a touch with their body ... 2.7

When they know an idea with their mind, if it’s pleasant they 2.8
hold on to it, but if it’s unpleasant they dislike it. They live with
mindfulness of the body unestablished and their heart stunted. And
they don’t truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by

210. Manu 9.256–260 describes various “thorns” (i.e. “pests”) as thieves, etc. Kauṭilya’s Arthaśāstra devotes the entirety of book 4 to removing thorns to the realm.

wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without remainder.

3.1 Suppose a person was to catch six animals, with diverse territories and feeding grounds, and tie them up with a strong rope.²¹¹ They'd catch a snake,²¹² a dolphin,²¹³ a bird,²¹⁴ a dog,²¹⁵ a jackal,²¹⁶ and a monkey,²¹⁷ tie each up with a strong rope, then tie a knot in the middle and let them loose.

3.9 Then those six animals with different domains and ranges would each pull toward their own domain and range. The snake would pull one way, thinking 'I'm going into a termite mound!' The dolphin would pull another way, thinking 'I'm going into the water!' The bird would pull another way, thinking 'I'm flying into the atmosphere!' The dog would pull another way, thinking 'I'm going into the village!' The jackal would pull another way, thinking 'I'm going into the charnel ground!' The monkey would pull another way, thinking 'I'm going into the jungle!'²¹⁸ When those six animals became exhausted and worn out, the strongest of them would get their way, and they'd all have to submit to their control.

211. Each of the six animals is connected to the corresponding sense in some way.

212. *Ahi* ("snake") puns with *akkhi* ("eye"). Also, the cobra is famed for the false eyes on its hood.

213. *Susumāra* (literally "child-killer") may be either the Gangetic dolphin (MN 129:21.3) or the crocodile (Cp 27:1.3). Here it is probably the dolphin, which has residual eyesight and primarily relies on echolocation. This association may be reinforced by the blowhole appearing like a prominent ear.

214. A bird is notable for its beaked "nose".

215. Dogs are notoriously ravenous, thus standing for the tongue.

216. Jackals lurk around dead bodies.

217. The "monkey mind".

218. The termite mound is said to be the body (MN 23:4.1), to which the eye is attracted. | The dolphin follows its ear. | The bird flies to the sky like someone sniffing the air. | The dog goes to the village where the food is. | The jackal feeds on discarded bodies. | The monkey leaps from branch to branch in the jungle (SN 12.61:4.2).

In the same way, when a mendicant has not developed or cultivated mindfulness of the body, their eye pulls toward pleasant sights, but is put off by unpleasant sights. Their ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind pulls toward pleasant ideas, but is put off by unpleasant ideas. 3.12

This is how someone is unrestrained. 3.14

And how is someone restrained? 4.1

Take a mendicant who sees a sight with their eyes. If it's pleasant they don't hold on to it, and if it's unpleasant they don't dislike it. They live with mindfulness of the body established and a limitless heart. And they truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without remainder. 4.2

They hear a sound ... smell an odor ... taste a flavor ... feel a touch ... know an idea with their mind. If it's pleasant they don't hold on to it, and if it's unpleasant they don't dislike it. They live with mindfulness of the body established and a limitless heart. And they truly understand the freedom of heart and freedom by wisdom where those arisen bad, unskillful qualities cease without remainder. 4.4

Suppose a person was to catch six animals, with diverse territories and feeding grounds, and tie them up with a strong rope. They'd catch a snake, a dolphin, a bird, a dog, a jackal, and a monkey, tie each up with a strong rope, then tether them to a strong post or pillar. 5.1

Then those six animals with different domains and ranges would each pull toward their own domain and range. The snake would pull one way, thinking 'I'm going into a termite mound!' The dolphin would pull another way, thinking 'I'm going into the water!' The bird would pull another way, thinking 'I'm flying into the atmosphere!' The dog would pull another way, thinking 'I'm going into the village!' The jackal would pull another way, thinking 'I'm going into the charnel ground!' The monkey would pull another way, thinking 'I'm going into the jungle!' When those six animals became exhausted and worn out, they'd stand or sit or lie down right by that post or pillar. 5.9

- 5.12 In the same way, when a mendicant has developed and cultivated mindfulness of the body, their eye doesn't pull toward pleasant sights, and isn't put off by unpleasant sights. Their ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind doesn't pull toward pleasant ideas, and isn't put off by unpleasant ideas. This is how someone is restrained.
- 6.1 'A strong post or pillar' is a term for mindfulness of the body.
- 6.2 So you should train like this: 'We will develop mindfulness of the body. We'll cultivate it, make it our vehicle and our basis, keep it up, consolidate it, and properly implement it.' That's how you should train."

SN 35.248

The Sheaf of Barley

Yavakalāpisutta

- 1.1 "Mendicants, suppose a sheaf of barley was placed at a crossroads. Then six people would come along carrying flails, and start threshing the sheaf of barley. So that sheaf of barley would be thoroughly threshed by those six flails. Then a seventh person would come along carrying a flail, and they'd give the sheaf of barley a seventh threshing. So that sheaf of barley would be even more thoroughly threshed by that seventh flail.
- 1.8 In the same way, an unlearned ordinary person is struck in the eye by both pleasant and unpleasant sights. They're struck in the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind by both pleasant and unpleasant ideas. And if that unlearned ordinary person intends to be reborn in a new state of existence in the future, that futile person is even more thoroughly struck, like that sheaf of barley threshed by the seventh person.
- 2.1 Once upon a time, a battle was fought between the gods and the titans.²¹⁹ Then Vepacitti, lord of titans, addressed the titans, 'My

219. This war goes on so long as day replaces night (SN 11.1:2.1).

good fellows, if the titans defeat the gods in this battle, bind Sakka, the lord of gods, by his limbs and neck and bring him to my presence in the citadel of the titans.’

Meanwhile, Sakka, lord of gods, addressed the gods of the thirty-three, ‘My good fellows, if the gods defeat the titans in this battle, bind Vepacitti by his limbs and neck and bring him to my presence in the Hall of Clear Right of the gods.’ 2.4

In that battle the gods won and the titans lost. So the gods of the thirty-three bound Vepacitti by his limbs and neck and brought him to Sakka’s presence in the Hall of Clear Right of the gods. 2.6

And there Vepacitti remained bound by his limbs and neck. That is, until he thought, ‘It’s the gods who are principled, while the titans are unprincipled. Now I belong right here in the castle of the gods.’ Then he found himself freed from the bonds on his limbs and neck. He amused himself, supplied and provided with the five kinds of heavenly sensual stimulation. 2.8

But when he thought, ‘It’s the titans who are principled, while the gods are unprincipled. Now I will go over there to the citadel of the titans,’ he found himself bound by his limbs and neck, and the five kinds of heavenly sensual stimulation fell away. 2.12

That’s how subtly Vepacitti was bound. But the bonds of Māra are even more subtle than that. When you conceive, you’re bound by Māra. Not conceiving, you’re free from the Wicked One.²²⁰ 2.15

These are what is conceived: ‘I am’, ‘I am this’, ‘I will be’, ‘I will not be’, ‘I will have form’, ‘I will be formless’, ‘I will be percipient’, ‘I will be non-percipient’, ‘I will be neither percipient nor non-percipient.’ What is conceived is a disease, a boil, a dart. So mendicants, you should train yourselves like this: ‘We will live with a heart that does not conceive.’ 3.1

These are what is perturbed: ‘I am’, ‘I am this’, ‘I will be’, ‘I will not be’, ‘I will have form’, ‘I will be formless’, ‘I will be percipient’, ‘I will be 4.1

220. As at SN 22.64.

non-percipient’, ‘I will be neither percipient nor non-percipient.’²²¹

What is perturbed is a disease, a boil, a dart. So mendicants, you should train yourselves like this: ‘We will live with a heart free of perturbation.’

- 5.1 These are what is trembled: ‘I am’, ‘I am this’, ‘I will be’, ‘I will not be’, ‘I will have form’, ‘I will be formless’, ‘I will be percipient’, ‘I will be non-percipient’, ‘I will be neither percipient nor non-percipient.’ What is trembled is a disease, a boil, a dart. So mendicants, you should train yourselves like this: ‘We will live with a heart free of trembling.’

- 6.1 These are what is proliferated: ‘I am’, ‘I am this’, ‘I will be’, ‘I will not be’, ‘I will have form’, ‘I will be formless’, ‘I will be percipient’, ‘I will be non-percipient’, ‘I will be neither percipient nor non-percipient.’ What is proliferated is a disease, a boil, a dart. So mendicants, you should train yourselves like this: ‘We will live with a heart free of proliferation.’

- 7.1 These are states of conceit: ‘I am’, ‘I am this’, ‘I will be’, ‘I will not be’, ‘I will have form’, ‘I will be formless’, ‘I will be percipient’, ‘I will be non-percipient’, ‘I will be neither percipient nor non-percipient.’²²² The state of conceit is a disease, a boil, a dart. So mendicants, you should train yourselves like this: ‘We will live with a heart that has struck down conceit.’”

The Linked Discourses on the six sense fields are complete.

221. Such thoughts arise when the mind is perturbed; the same method applies to the following terms.

222. A “state of conceit” (*mānagata*) is conceit that has been solidified into a view.

LINKED DISCOURSES ON FEELINGS

The Chapter with Verses

SN 36.1

Immersion

Samādhisutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, there are these three feelings.²²³ What three?
- 1.3 Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling. These are the three feelings.
- 2.1 Stilled, aware,²²⁴
a mindful disciple of the Buddha
understands feelings,
the cause of feelings,
- 3.1 where they cease,
and the path that leads to their ending.
With the ending of feelings, a mendicant

223. “Feeling” (*vedanā*) is the affective or hedonic tone of experience. Each sense can trigger a response of pleasure, pain, or neither-pleasure-nor-pain. It is from the root *vid* (“know”), and is close in meaning to “experience”. For history, see note at SN 12.1:2.8.

224. The text is not explicit as to who speaks these verses. Nor, for that matter, does it say who spoke the prose; the context is elided, presumably because the editors thought it was obvious that it is the Buddha speaking. The same is true of the verses. Indeed, Iti 52 is otherwise identical to this discourse, except it indicates that the Buddha spoke both verse and prose. Whether the verses were added later is a separate matter, but clearly the text presents them as the Buddha’s words.

is hungerless, quenched.”²²⁵

SN 36.2

Pleasure

Sukhasutta

“Mendicants, there are these three feelings. What three? 1.1

Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling. These are the three feelings. 1.3

Whether it’s pleasant or painful, 2.1

as well as what’s neutral,

whatever there is that is felt

internally and externally:

having known, ‘this is suffering, 3.1

deceptive, breaking apart’,²²⁶

seeing feelings vanish with every contact,

that’s how they become free of desire for them.”

SN 36.3

Giving Up

Pahānasutta

“Mendicants, there are these three feelings. What three? 1.1

Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling. 1.3

The underlying tendency to greed should be given up when it 1.4
comes to pleasant feeling. The underlying tendency to aversion
should be given up when it comes to painful feeling. The underlying

225. By treating the feelings according to the four noble truths, the Buddha is implicitly situating all feelings as suffering.

226. *Mosadhamma* means “deceptive”; the commentary’s “perishable” is untenable.

tendency to ignorance should be given up when it comes to neutral feeling.²²⁷

- 1.5 When a mendicant has given up these underlying tendencies, they're called a mendicant without underlying tendencies, who sees rightly, has cut off craving, cast off the fetters, and by rightly comprehending conceit has made an end of suffering.

- 2.1 When you feel pleasure
without understanding feeling,
the underlying tendency to greed is there,
if you don't see the escape.

- 3.1 When you feel pain
without understanding feeling,
the underlying tendency to aversion is there,
if you don't see the escape.

- 4.1 As for that peaceful, neutral feeling:
he of vast wisdom has taught
that if you relish it,
you're still not released from suffering.

- 5.1 But when a mendicant is keen,
not neglecting situational awareness,
that astute person
understands all feelings.

- 6.1 Completely understanding feelings,
they're without defilements in this very life.
That knowledge master is firm in principle;
when their body breaks up, they can't be reckoned."

227. The feelings themselves are inherent to the functioning of the mind, so they remain so long as the mind remains. But how we respond to feelings is conditioned by underlying tendencies, which can be abandoned.

SN 36.4

The Abyss

Pātālasutta

“Mendicants, when an unlearned ordinary person says that there’s an abyss under the ocean,²²⁸ they’re speaking of something that doesn’t exist. 1.1

‘Abyss’ is a term for painful physical feelings. 1.5

When an unlearned ordinary person experiences painful physical feelings they sorrow and wail and lament, beating their breast and falling into confusion. They’re called an unlearned ordinary person who hasn’t stood up in the abyss and has found no footing. 1.6

When a learned noble disciple experiences painful physical feelings they don’t sorrow or wail or lament, beating their breast and falling into confusion. They’re called a learned noble disciple who has stood up in the abyss and found a footing. 1.8

If you can’t abide 2.1
those painful physical feelings
that arise and sap your vitality;
if you tremble at their touch,

weeping and wailing, 3.1
a weakling lacking strength—
you won’t stand up in the abyss
and find a footing.

228. While the Buddha routinely spoke of various heavenly or lower realms, he only uses the term *pātāla* (“abyss”) in metaphorical senses (SN 9.1:3.3, SN 1.44:1.4). Tālapuṭa refers to it as a place, but this is in a line of poetry referring to mythical dangers of the oceans (Thag 19.1:14.2). The “Abyss” in the Purāṇas is said to be the lowest of the seven nether realms, but it is no hell. Rather, it is the glorious, jewel-festooned city of the dragons, beneath which Viṣṇu dwells, and whose glories exceed even the heavens (Śiva Purāṇa 5.15; Agni Purāṇa 120.2; Nārada Purāṇa 1.3.38). Perhaps the Buddha rejected such a notion as incompatible with his cosmology.

- 4.1 If you can endure
those painful physical feelings
that arise and sap your vitality;
if you don't tremble at their touch—
you stand up in the abyss
and find a footing.”

SN 36.5

Should Be Seen

Datṭhabbasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, there are these three feelings. What three?
1.3 Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling.
1.4 Pleasant feeling should be seen as suffering. Painful feeling should
be seen as a dart. Neutral feeling should be seen as impermanent.
1.5 When a mendicant has seen these three feelings in this way, they're
called a mendicant who sees rightly, has cut off craving, cast off the
fetters, and by rightly comprehending conceit has made an end of
suffering.
- 2.1 A mendicant who sees pleasure as pain,
and suffering as a dart,
and that peaceful, neutral feeling
as impermanent
- 3.1 sees rightly;
they completely understand feelings.
Completely understanding feelings,
they're without defilements in this very life.
That knowledge master is firm in principle;
when their body breaks up, they can't be reckoned.”

SN 36.6

An Arrow

Sallasutta

“Mendicants, an unlearned ordinary person feels pleasant, painful, 1.1
and neutral feelings. A learned noble disciple also feels pleasant,
painful, and neutral feelings. What, then, is the difference between a
learned noble disciple and an ordinary unlearned person?”

“Our teachings are rooted in the Buddha. ...” 1.4

“When an unlearned ordinary person experiences painful physical 1.5
feelings they sorrow and wail and lament, beating their breast and
falling into confusion. They experience two feelings: physical and
mental.

It’s like a person who is struck with an arrow, only to be struck 1.8
with a second arrow. That person experiences the feeling of two
arrows.

In the same way, when an unlearned ordinary person experiences 1.11
painful physical feelings they sorrow and wail and lament, beating
their breast and falling into confusion. They experience two feelings:
physical and mental.

When they’re touched by painful feeling, they resist it. The un- 1.14
derlying tendency for aversion toward painful feeling underlies that.

When touched by painful feeling they look forward to enjoying 1.16
sensual pleasures. Why is that? Because an unlearned ordinary per-
son doesn’t understand any escape from painful feeling apart from
sensual pleasures. Since they look forward to enjoying sensual plea-
sures, the underlying tendency to greed for pleasant feeling underlies
that.

They don’t truly understand feelings’ origin, disappearance, gratifi- 1.20
cation, drawback, and escape. The underlying tendency to ignorance
about neutral feeling underlies that.

- 1.22 If they feel a pleasant feeling, they feel it attached. If they feel a painful feeling, they feel it attached. If they feel a neutral feeling, they feel it attached.
- 1.25 They're called an unlearned ordinary person who is attached to rebirth, old age, and death, to sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress. They are attached to suffering, I say.²²⁹
- 2.1 When a learned noble disciple experiences painful physical feelings they don't sorrow or wail or lament, beating their breast and falling into confusion. They experience one feeling: physical, not mental.
- 3.1 It's like a person who is struck with an arrow, but was not struck with a second arrow. That person would experience the feeling of one arrow.
- 3.4 In the same way, when a learned noble disciple experiences painful physical feelings they don't sorrow or wail or lament, beating their breast and falling into confusion. They experience one feeling: physical, not mental.
- 3.7 When they're touched by painful feeling, they don't resist it. There's no underlying tendency for aversion toward painful feeling underlying that.
- 3.9 When touched by painful feeling they don't look forward to enjoying sensual pleasures. Why is that? Because a learned noble disciple understands an escape from painful feeling apart from sensual pleasures. Since they don't look forward to enjoying sensual pleasures, there's no underlying tendency to greed for pleasant feeling underlying that.
- 3.13 They truly understand feelings' origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape. There's no underlying tendency to ignorance about neutral feeling underlying that.

229. The ablative *dukkhasmā* here is explained by the commentary as taking an instrumental sense, like the preceding terms.

If they feel a pleasant feeling, they feel it detached. If they feel a 3.15
painful feeling, they feel it detached. If they feel a neutral feeling,
they feel it detached.

They're called a learned noble disciple who is detached from re- 3.18
birth, old age, and death, from sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness,
and distress. They are detached from suffering, I say.

This is the difference between a learned noble disciple and an 3.19
unlearned ordinary person.

A wise and learned person does not not feel²³⁰ 4.1
the feeling of pleasure and pain.
This is the great difference of skill
between the attentive one and the ordinary.

A learned person who has appraised the teaching 5.1
discerns this world and the next.
Desirable things don't disturb their mind,
nor are they repelled by the undesirable.

Both favoring and opposing 6.1
are cleared and ended, and are no more.
Knowing the stainless, sorrowless state,
they who have gone beyond rebirth
understand rightly."

230. The text says they "do not feel" the feeling, thus directly contradicting the main theme of the discourse. Bodhi inserts "mental" to resolve this. The commentary does not notice this verse at all, as it only comments on "learned" after "appraised" in the next verse, suggesting that either the verse was inserted after the commentary, or that it posed no interpretive difficulties. The initial line is also metrically imperfect: as a *tutṭhubha*, the final syllable of *vedayati* should be long; perhaps it was originally the reflexive *vedayate*. It seems to me the line is corrupt, and the simplest emendation is to assume a double negative that was later omitted; the omission of the negative is attested elsewhere in Pali verse (eg. Snp 3.8:17.4). Or perhaps, without emending, the initial *na* should be distributed to both noun and verb.

SN 36.7

The Infirmary (1st)

Paṭhamagelaññasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Vesālī, at the Great Wood, in the hall with the peaked roof.²³¹
- 1.2 Then in the late afternoon, the Buddha came out of retreat and went to the infirmary, where he sat down on the seat spread out,²³² and addressed the mendicants:
- 2.1 “Mendicants, a mendicant should await their time mindful and aware.²³³ This is my instruction to you.
- 3.1 And how is a mendicant mindful?²³⁴ It’s when a mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world.²³⁵ They meditate observing an aspect of feelings ... They meditate observing an aspect of the mind ... They meditate observing an aspect of principles—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. That’s how a mendicant is mindful.

231. This discourse shows how a practitioner first develops the four kinds of mindfulness meditation for gaining immersion, along with practicing “situational awareness” (sometimes called “mindfulness in daily life”), before developing insight into the nature of feelings.

232. The “infirmary” (*gilānasālā*) is mentioned only in this discourse and the next, and in AN 5.121. The practice of visiting people when sick to give encouragement and support is still an important part of Buddhist culture.

233. The same treatment of being “mindful and aware” is at DN 16:2.12.2 and SN 47.2, and slightly differently at SN 47.35.

234. In the Gradual Training, the mendicant “establishes mindfulness” to begin meditation. Here this practice is expanded, and it is expanded even further in the Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta (MN 10 = DN 22) and the Satipaṭṭhāna Saṃyutta beginning with SN 47.1.

235. This marks the first appearance of the *satipaṭṭhāna* formula in the Saṃyutta. Despite the modern perception that *satipaṭṭhāna* is essentially the practice of insight, it appears nowhere in the great wisdom Saṃyuttas on dependent origination, the aggregates, the senses, or the elements. In the Suttas, *satipaṭṭhāna* is the support for immersion, with insight emerging from immersion.

And how is a mendicant aware? It's when a mendicant acts with situational awareness when going out and coming back; when looking ahead and aside; when bending and extending the limbs; when bearing the outer robe, bowl and robes; when eating, drinking, chewing, and tasting; when urinating and defecating; when walking, standing, sitting, sleeping, waking, speaking, and keeping silent. That's how a mendicant acts with situational awareness. A mendicant should await their time mindful and aware. This is my instruction to you. 4.1

While a mendicant is meditating like this—mindful, aware, diligent, keen, and resolute—if pleasant feelings arise, they understand: 'A pleasant feeling has arisen in me. That's dependent, not independent. Dependent on what? Dependent on my own body. But this body is impermanent, conditioned, dependently originated. So how could a pleasant feeling be permanent, since it has arisen dependent on a body that is impermanent, conditioned, and dependently originated?' They meditate observing impermanence, vanishing, dispassion, cessation, and letting go in the body and pleasant feeling. As they do so, they give up the underlying tendency to greed for the body and pleasant feeling. 5.1

While a mendicant is meditating like this—mindful, aware, diligent, keen, and resolute—if painful feelings arise, they understand: 'A painful feeling has arisen in me. That's dependent, not independent. Dependent on what? Dependent on my own body. But this body is impermanent, conditioned, dependently originated. So how could a painful feeling be permanent, since it has arisen dependent on a body that is impermanent, conditioned, and dependently originated?' They meditate observing impermanence, vanishing, dispassion, cessation, and letting go in the body and painful feeling. As they do so, they give up the underlying tendency to aversion toward the body and painful feeling. 6.1

While a mendicant is meditating like this—mindful, aware, diligent, keen, and resolute—if neutral feelings arise, they understand: 'A neutral feeling has arisen in me. That's dependent, not independent. Dependent on what? Dependent on my own body. But this 7.1

body is impermanent, conditioned, dependently originated. So how could a neutral feeling be permanent, since it has arisen dependent on a body that is impermanent, conditioned, and dependently originated?’ They meditate observing impermanence, vanishing, dispassion, cessation, and letting go in the body and neutral feeling. As they do so, they give up the underlying tendency to ignorance toward the body and neutral feeling.

- 8.1 If they feel a pleasant feeling, they understand that it’s impermanent, that they’re not attached to it, and that they don’t take pleasure in it. If they feel a painful feeling, they understand that it’s impermanent, that they’re not attached to it, and that they don’t take pleasure in it. If they feel a neutral feeling, they understand that it’s impermanent, that they’re not attached to it, and that they don’t take pleasure in it.
- 8.4 If they feel a pleasant feeling, they feel it detached. If they feel a painful feeling, they feel it detached. If they feel a neutral feeling, they feel it detached.
- 8.7 Feeling the end of the body draw close, they understand: ‘I feel the end of the body draw close.’ Feeling the end of life draw close, they understand: ‘I feel the end of life draw close.’ They understand: ‘When my body breaks up and my life has come to an end, everything that’s felt, since I no longer take pleasure in it, will become cool right here.’
- 9.1 Suppose an oil lamp depended on oil and a wick to burn. As the oil and the wick are used up, it would be extinguished due to not being fed.
- 9.3 In the same way, feeling the end of the body draw close, a mendicant understands: ‘I feel the end of the body draw close.’ Feeling the end of life draw close, a mendicant understands: ‘I feel the end of life draw close.’ They understand: ‘When my body breaks up and my life is over, everything that’s felt, since I no longer take pleasure in it, will become cool right here.’”

SN 36.8

The Infirmary (2nd)

Dutiyagelaṇṇasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying near Vesālī, at the Great Wood, 1.1
in the hall with the peaked roof.

Then in the late afternoon, the Buddha came out of retreat and 1.2
went to the infirmary, where he sat down on the seat spread out, and
addressed the mendicants:

“Mendicants, a mendicant should await their time mindful and 2.1
aware. This is my instruction to you.

And how is a mendicant mindful? It’s when a mendicant medi- 3.1
tates by observing an aspect of the body—keen, aware, and mindful,
rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. They meditate
observing an aspect of feelings ... They meditate observing an aspect
of the mind ... They meditate observing an aspect of principles—
keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for
the world. That’s how a mendicant is mindful.

And how is a mendicant aware? It’s when a mendicant acts with sit- 4.1
tuational awareness when going out and coming back; when looking
ahead and aside; when bending and extending the limbs; when bear-
ing the outer robe, bowl and robes; when eating, drinking, chewing,
and tasting; when urinating and defecating; when walking, standing,
sitting, sleeping, waking, speaking, and keeping silent. That’s how a
mendicant is aware.

A mendicant should await their time mindful and aware. This is 4.4
my instruction to you.

While a mendicant is meditating like this—mindful, aware, dili- 5.1
gent, keen, and resolute—if pleasant feelings arise, they understand:
‘A pleasant feeling has arisen in me. That’s dependent, not indepen-
dent. Dependent on what? Dependent on this very contact. But this
contact is impermanent, conditioned, dependently originated. So
how could a pleasant feeling be permanent, since it has arisen depen-

dent on contact that is impermanent, conditioned, and dependently originated?’ They meditate observing impermanence, vanishing, dispassion, cessation, and letting go in contact and pleasant feeling. As they do so, they give up the underlying tendency for greed for contact and pleasant feeling.

- 6.1 While a mendicant is meditating like this—mindful, aware, diligent, keen, and resolute—if painful feelings arise ... if neutral feelings arise, they understand: ‘A neutral feeling has arisen in me. That’s dependent, not independent. Dependent on what? Dependent on this very contact.’

(Tell in full as in the previous discourse.)

- 6.10 They understand: ‘When my body breaks up and my life is over, everything that’s felt, since I no longer take pleasure in it, will become cool right here.’

- 7.1 Suppose an oil lamp depended on oil and a wick to burn. As the oil and the wick are used up, it would be extinguished due to not being fed.

- 7.3 In the same way, feeling the end of the body draw close, a mendicant understands: ‘I feel the end of the body draw close.’ Feeling the end of life draw close, they understand: ‘I feel the end of life draw close.’ They understand: ‘When my body breaks up and my life is over, everything that’s felt, since I no longer take pleasure in it, will become cool right here.’”

SN 36.9

Impermanent

Aniccasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, these three feelings are impermanent, conditioned, dependently originated, liable to end, vanish, fade away, and cease. What three?

Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling. These are the three feelings 1.3
that are impermanent, conditioned, dependently originated, liable
to end, vanish, fade away, and cease.”

SN 36.10

Rooted in Contact

Phassamūlakasutta

“Mendicants, these three feelings are born, rooted, sourced, and de- 1.1
pendent on contact. What three?

Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling. 1.3

Pleasant feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced 1.4
as pleasant.²³⁶ With the cessation of that contact to be experienced
as pleasant, the corresponding pleasant feeling ceases and stops.
Painful feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as
painful. With the cessation of that contact to be experienced as
painful, the corresponding painful feeling ceases and stops. Neutral
feeling arises dependent on a contact to be experienced as neutral.
With the cessation of that contact to be experienced as neutral, the
corresponding neutral feeling ceases and stops.

When you rub two sticks together, heat is generated and fire is 1.10
produced. But when you part the sticks and lay them aside, any
corresponding heat ceases and stops.

In the same way, these three feelings are born, rooted, sourced, 1.11
and dependent on contact. The appropriate feeling arises dependent
on the corresponding contact. When the corresponding contact
ceases, the appropriate feeling ceases.”

236. That is to say, certain kinds of contact are prone to create pleasant feelings.
MN 140:19.4 treats these contacts in relation to the feelings experienced in
absorptions.

The Chapter on In Private

SN 36.11

In Private

Rahogatasutta

- 1.1 Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:
- 1.2 “Just now, sir, as I was in private retreat this thought came to mind. The Buddha has spoken of three feelings. Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling. These are the three feelings the Buddha has spoken of.
- 1.6 But the Buddha has also said: ‘Suffering includes whatever is felt.’ What was the Buddha referring to when he said this?”
- 2.1 “Good, good, mendicant!²³⁷ I have spoken of these three feelings. Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling. These are the three feelings I have spoken of.
- 2.5 But I have also said: ‘Suffering includes whatever is felt.’
- 2.7 When I said this I was referring to the impermanence of conditions, to the fact that conditions are liable to end, vanish, fade away, cease, and perish.

237. The Buddha praises the mendicant because he had the critical acumen to notice these apparently different explanations, and, rather than assuming they were contradictory, or just ignoring the problem, he asked the Buddha for clarification. Compare the Buddha’s quite different response at SN 36.19:5.1.

But I have also explained the progressive cessation of activities.²³⁸ 2.15
 For someone who has attained the first absorption, speech has ceased. For someone who has attained the second absorption, the placing of the mind and keeping it connected have ceased. For someone who has attained the third absorption, rapture has ceased. For someone who has attained the fourth absorption, breathing has ceased. For someone who has attained the dimension of infinite space, the perception of form has ceased. For someone who has attained the dimension of infinite consciousness, the perception of the dimension of infinite space has ceased. For someone who has attained the dimension of nothingness, the perception of the dimension of infinite consciousness has ceased. For someone who has attained the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, the perception of the dimension of nothingness has ceased. For someone who has attained the cessation of perception and feeling, perception and feeling have ceased. For a mendicant who has ended the defilements, greed, hate, and delusion have ceased.

And I have also explained the progressive settling of activities. For 2.26
 someone who has attained the first absorption, speech has stilled. For someone who has attained the second absorption, the placing of the mind and keeping it connected have stilled. . . . For someone who has attained the cessation of perception and feeling, perception and feeling have stilled. For a mendicant who has ended the defilements, greed, hate, and delusion have stilled.

238. The “progressive cessation of activities” (*anupubbasaṅkhārānaṃ nirodho*), and their “settling” (*vūpasama*) and “tranquilizing” (*passaddhi*) are only mentioned here, SN 36.15, and SN 36.17. Compare the nine “progressive cessations” of AN 9.31 and DN 33:3.2.82, but these go even further to full enlightenment, as in the “progressive cessation in a definitive sense” at AN 9.61. | “Activities” (*saṅkhārā*) are the conditioned phenomena that are active, being both produced by and productive of other conditions. Here they are the “processes” that are stilled in the course of meditation.

- 2.31 There are these six levels of tranquility.²³⁹ For someone who has attained the first absorption, speech has been tranquilized. For someone who has attained the second absorption, the placing of the mind and keeping it connected have been tranquilized. For someone who has attained the third absorption, rapture has been tranquilized. For someone who has attained the fourth absorption, breathing has been tranquilized. For someone who has attained the cessation of perception and feeling, perception and feeling have been tranquilized. For a mendicant who has ended the defilements, greed, hate, and delusion have been tranquilized.”

SN 36.12

In the Atmosphere (1st)

Paṭhamaākāsasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, various winds blow in the atmosphere. Winds blow from the east, the west, the north, and the south. There are winds that are dusty and dustless, cool and warm, weak and strong.
- 1.3 In the same way, various feelings arise in this body: pleasant, painful, and neutral feelings.²⁴⁰
- 2.1 There are many and various
winds that blow in the atmosphere.
From the east they come, also the west,
the north, and then the south.
- 3.1 They are dusty and dustless,
cool and sometimes warm,

239. This is the same at the corresponding point in SN 36.17:2.7, but at SN 36.15:1.22 it speaks of the “progressive tranquilizing of activities”.

240. In Indian philosophy, the energies, breaths, or life forces (Sanskrit *prāṇa*) in the body are connected with the sensations that are experienced moving about the body. A meditator becomes acutely aware of these when sitting still for long periods.

strong and weak;
these are the different gales that blow.

So too, in this body 4.1
feelings arise,
pleasant and painful,
and those that are neutral.

But when a mendicant is keen, 5.1
not neglecting situational awareness,
that astute person
understands all feelings.

Completely understanding feelings, 6.1
they're without defilements in this very life.
That knowledge master is firm in principle;
when their body breaks up, they can't be reckoned."

SN 36.13

In the Atmosphere (2nd)

Dutiyaākāśasutta

"Mendicants, various winds blow in the atmosphere. Winds blow 1.1
from the east, the west, the north, and the south. There are winds
that are dusty and dustless, cool and warm, weak and strong.

In the same way, various feelings arise in this body: pleasant, 1.3
painful, and neutral feelings."

SN 36.14

A Guest House

Agārasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, suppose there was a guest house. Lodgers come from the east, west, north, and south. Aristocrats, brahmins, peasants, and menials all stay there.
- 1.2 In the same way, various feelings arise in this body: pleasant, painful, and neutral feelings. Also pleasant, painful, and neutral feelings of the flesh arise.²⁴¹ Also pleasant, painful, and neutral feelings not of the flesh arise.”

SN 36.15

With Ānanda (1st)

Paṭhamaānandasutta

- 1.1 Then Venerable Ānanda went up to the Buddha ... sat down to one side, and said to him:
- 1.2 “Sir, what is feeling? What’s the origin of feeling? What’s the cessation of feeling? What’s the practice that leads to the cessation of feeling? And what is feeling’s gratification, drawback, and escape?”
- 1.4 “Ānanda, there are these three feelings: pleasant, painful, and neutral. These are called feelings.
- 1.7 Feeling originates from contact. When contact ceases, feeling ceases.
- 1.9 The practice that leads to the cessation of feelings is simply this noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion.
- 1.11 The pleasure and happiness that arise from feeling: this is its gratification.

241. These are defined at SN 36.31

That feeling is impermanent, suffering, and perishable: this is its drawback. 1.12

Removing and giving up desire and greed for feeling: this is its escape. 1.13

But I have also explained the progressive cessation of activities. 1.14
For someone who has attained the first absorption, speech has ceased. ... For someone who has attained the cessation of perception and feeling, perception and feeling have ceased. For a mendicant who has ended the defilements, greed, hate, and delusion have ceased.

And I have also explained the progressive settling of activities. For 1.18
someone who has attained the first absorption, speech has stilled. ... For someone who has attained the cessation of perception and feeling, perception and feeling have stilled. For a mendicant who has ended the defilements, greed, hate, and delusion have stilled.

And I have also explained the progressive tranquilizing of activities. 1.22
For someone who has attained the first absorption, speech has been tranquilized. ... For someone who has attained the dimension of infinite space, the perception of form has been tranquilized. For someone who has attained the dimension of infinite consciousness, the perception of the dimension of infinite space has been tranquilized. For someone who has attained the dimension of nothingness, the perception of the dimension of infinite consciousness has been tranquilized. For someone who has attained the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, the perception of the dimension of nothingness has been tranquilized. For someone who has attained the cessation of perception and feeling, perception and feeling have been tranquilized. For a mendicant who has ended the defilements, greed, hate, and delusion have been tranquilized.”

SN 36.16

With Ānanda (2nd)

Dutiyaānandasutta

- 1.1 Then Venerable Ānanda went up to the Buddha, bowed, and sat down to one side. The Buddha said to him, “Ānanda, what is feeling? What’s the origin of feeling? What’s the cessation of feeling? What’s the practice that leads to the cessation of feeling? And what is feeling’s gratification, drawback, and escape?”
- 1.4 “Our teachings are rooted in the Buddha. He is our guide and our refuge. Sir, may the Buddha himself please clarify the meaning of this. The mendicants will listen and remember it.”
- 1.5 “Well then, Ānanda, listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.”
- 1.6 “Yes, sir,” Ānanda replied. The Buddha said this:
- 1.8 “Ānanda, there are these three feelings: pleasant, painful, and neutral. These are called feelings. ...
- 1.12 For a mendicant who has ended the defilements, greed, hate, and delusion have been tranquilized.”

SN 36.17

With Several Mendicants (1st)

Paṭhamasambahulasutta

- 1.1 Then several mendicants went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:
- 1.2 “Sir, what is feeling? What’s the origin of feeling? What’s the cessation of feeling? What’s the practice that leads to the cessation of feeling? And what is feeling’s gratification, drawback, and escape?”
- 1.4 “Mendicants, there are these three feelings: pleasant, painful, and neutral. These are called feelings.
- 1.7 Feeling originates from contact. When contact ceases, feeling ceases.

The practice that leads to the cessation of feelings is simply this 1.9
noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech,
right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and
right immersion.

The pleasure and happiness that arise from feeling: this is its 1.11
gratification. That feeling is impermanent, suffering, and perishable:
this is its drawback. Removing and giving up desire and greed for
feeling: this is its escape.

But I have also explained the progressive cessation of activities. 2.1
... For someone who has attained the first absorption, speech has
ceased. ... For a mendicant who has ended the defilements, greed,
hate, and delusion have ceased. And I have also explained the pro-
gressive settling of activities. For someone who has attained the first
absorption, speech has stilled. ... For a mendicant who has ended
the defilements, greed, hate, and delusion have stilled. There are
these six levels of tranquility. For someone who has attained the first
absorption, speech has been tranquilized. For someone who has
attained the second absorption, the placing of the mind and keeping
it connected have been tranquilized. For someone who has attained
the third absorption, rapture has been tranquilized. For someone
who has attained the fourth absorption, breathing has been tranquil-
ized. For someone who has attained the cessation of perception and
feeling, perception and feeling have been tranquilized.

For a mendicant who has ended the defilements, greed, hate, and 2.13
delusion have been tranquilized.”

SN 36.18

With Several Mendicants (2nd)

Dutiyasambahulasutta

Then several mendicants went up to the Buddha ... The Buddha 1.1
said to them:

- 1.3 “Mendicants, what is feeling? What’s the origin of feeling? What’s the cessation of feeling? What’s the practice that leads to the cessation of feeling? And what is feeling’s gratification, drawback, and escape?”
- 1.5 “Our teachings are rooted in the Buddha. ...”
- 1.6 “Mendicants, there are these three feelings: pleasant, painful, and neutral. These are called feelings. ...”
(Tell in full as in the previous discourse.)

SN 36.19

With Pañcakaṅga

Pañcakaṅgasutta

- 1.1 Then the chamberlain Pañcakaṅga went up to Venerable Udāyī, bowed, sat down to one side, and asked him,²⁴² “Sir, how many feelings has the Buddha spoken of?”
- 1.3 “Chamberlain, the Buddha has spoken of three feelings: pleasant, painful, and neutral. The Buddha has spoken of these three feelings.”
- 1.6 When he said this, Pañcakaṅga said to Udāyī, “Sir, Udāyī, the Buddha hasn’t spoken of three feelings. He’s spoken of two feelings: pleasant and painful. The Buddha said that neutral feeling is included as a peaceful and subtle kind of pleasure.”

242. This discourse is also at MN 59, where it is called “Many Feelings”. | Pañcakaṅga features as a prominent devotee of the Buddha in MN 78, MN 127, and in a parallel to the current sutta at MN 59. As *thapati* (“chamberlain”) he was the ranking official under Pasenadi. Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 5.4.4.17–18 tells us that royal authority goes from the king, to the king’s brother, to the *thapati*, to the village head. Similarly, Atharva Veda 2.32.4a and 5.23.11a mention the *thapati* directly after the king. SN 55.6:15.1 shows the *thapati* was trusted with the most intimate and sensitive duties of the court. Elsewhere we learn that they shared the meal and carriage with the king, accompanying him on military campaigns (MN 89:18.1), while SN 55.6:1.4 shows them engaged in governing the provinces. Thus the *thapati* was the highest non-royal official in the court, entrusted with governing, advising, and security of the household. | There are several individuals called Udāyī, and it is not possible to distinguish them all.

For a second time, Udāyī said to him, “The Buddha hasn’t spoken 2.1
of two feelings, he’s spoken of three.”

For a second time, Pañcakaṅga said to Udāyī, “The Buddha hasn’t 2.6
spoken of three feelings, he’s spoken of two.”

And for a third time, Udāyī said to him, “The Buddha hasn’t spo- 3.1
ken of two feelings, he’s spoken of three.”

And for a third time, Pañcakaṅga said to Udāyī, “The Buddha 3.6
hasn’t spoken of three feelings, he’s spoken of two.”

But neither was able to persuade the other. 3.11

Venerable Ānanda heard this discussion between Udāyī and Pa- 3.12
ñcakaṅga. He went to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side,²⁴³
and informed the Buddha of all they had discussed.

“Ānanda, the explanation by the mendicant Udāyī, which the 5.1
chamberlain Pañcakaṅga didn’t agree with, was quite correct. But
the explanation by Pañcakaṅga, which Udāyī didn’t agree with, was
also quite correct.

In one explanation I’ve spoken of two feelings. In another ex- 5.3
planation I’ve spoken of three feelings, or five, six, eighteen, thirty-
six, or a hundred and eight feelings.²⁴⁴

I’ve explained the teaching in all these different ways. This be- 5.10
ing so, you can expect that those who don’t concede, approve, or
agree with what has been well spoken will fight, quarrel, and dispute,
continually wounding each other with barbed words.

I’ve explained the teaching in all these different ways. This being 5.12
so, you can expect that those who do concede, approve, or agree with
what has been well spoken will live in harmony, appreciating each
other, without dispute, blending like milk and water, and regarding
each other with kindly eyes.

243. The parallel passage at MN 59:4.2 includes *abhivādetvā* (“bowed”), which is missing here. In such cases translation requires judgment: should we read this as a deliberate elision meant to be filled in; or is it a mistake in the text that should be reflected in the translation?

244. These are all explained in SN 36.22.

- 6.1 There are these five kinds of sensual stimulation. What five? Sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. ... Touches known by the body, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. These are the five kinds of sensual stimulation. The pleasure and happiness that arise from these five kinds of sensual stimulation is called sensual pleasure. There are those who might say that this is the highest pleasure and happiness that sentient beings experience.²⁴⁵ But I don't grant them that. Why is that? Because there is another pleasure that is finer than that.²⁴⁶
- 7.1 And what is that pleasure? It's when a mendicant, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unskillful qualities, enters and remains in the first absorption, which has the rapture and bliss born of seclusion, while placing the mind and keeping it connected. This is a pleasure that is finer than that. There are those who might say that this is the highest pleasure and happiness that sentient beings experience. But I don't grant them that. Why is that? Because there is another pleasure that is finer than that.
- 8.1 And what is that pleasure? It's when, as the placing of the mind and keeping it connected are stilled, a mendicant enters and remains in the second absorption, which has the rapture and bliss born of immersion, with internal clarity and mind at one, without placing the mind and keeping it connected. This is a pleasure that is finer than that. There are those who might say that this is the highest pleasure and happiness that sentient beings experience. But I don't grant them that. Why is that? Because there is another pleasure that is finer than that.
- 9.1 And what is that pleasure? It's when, with the fading away of rapture, a mendicant enters and remains in the third absorption, where

245. The PTS reads *sattā* against MS *santam*; MS also has *sattā* at MN 59:7.1. The verb "experiences" requires a plural subject, which in this discourse might be the putative speakers. However, in MN 59 the putative speaker is singular, so the subject must be "sentient beings".

246. In discussing the path, the Buddha focuses on pleasure.

they meditate with equanimity, mindful and aware, experiencing for themselves the bliss of which the noble ones declare, ‘Equanimous and mindful, one meditates in bliss.’ This is a pleasure that is finer than that. There are those who might say that this is the highest pleasure and happiness that sentient beings experience. But I don’t grant them that. Why is that? Because there is another pleasure that is finer than that.

And what is that pleasure? It’s when, with the giving up of pleasure and pain and the disappearance of former happiness and sadness, a mendicant enters and remains in the fourth absorption, without pleasure or pain, with pure equanimity and mindfulness.²⁴⁷ This is a pleasure that is finer than that. There are those who might say that this is the highest pleasure and happiness that sentient beings experience. But I don’t grant them that. Why is that? Because there is another pleasure that is finer than that. 10.1

And what is that pleasure? It’s when a mendicant, going totally beyond perceptions of form, with the ending of perceptions of impingement, not focusing on perceptions of diversity, aware that ‘space is infinite’, enters and remains in the dimension of infinite space. This is a pleasure that is finer than that. There are those who might say that this is the highest pleasure and happiness that sentient beings experience. But I don’t grant them that. Why is that? Because there is another pleasure that is finer than that. 11.1

And what is that pleasure? It’s when a mendicant, going totally beyond the dimension of infinite space, aware that ‘consciousness is infinite’, enters and remains in the dimension of infinite consciousness. This is a pleasure that is finer than that. There are those who might say that this is the highest pleasure and happiness that sentient beings experience. But I don’t grant them that. Why is that? Because there is another pleasure that is finer than that. 12.1

247. This validates Pañcakaṅga’s view that neutral feeling can be reckoned as a subtle kind of pleasure.

- 13.1 And what is that pleasure? It's when a mendicant, going totally beyond the dimension of infinite consciousness, aware that 'there is nothing at all', enters and remains in the dimension of nothingness. This is a pleasure that is finer than that. There are those who might say that this is the highest pleasure and happiness that sentient beings experience. But I don't grant them that. Why is that? Because there is another pleasure that is finer than that.
- 14.1 And what is that pleasure? It's when a mendicant, going totally beyond the dimension of nothingness, enters and remains in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is a pleasure that is finer than that. There are those who might say that this is the highest pleasure and happiness that sentient beings experience. But I don't grant them that. Why is that? Because there is another pleasure that is finer than that.
- 15.1 And what is that pleasure? It's when a mendicant, going totally beyond the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, enters and remains in the cessation of perception and feeling. This is a pleasure that is finer than that.²⁴⁸
- 16.1 It's possible that wanderers of other religions might say: 'The ascetic Gotama spoke of the cessation of perception and feeling, and he includes it in happiness. What's up with that?'
- 16.4 When wanderers of other religions say this, you should say to them: 'Reverends, when the Buddha describes what's included in happiness, he's not just referring to pleasant feeling. The Realized One describes pleasure as included in happiness wherever it is found, and in whatever context.'

248. Since all feeling is conditioned, and what is conditioned is suffering, the cessation of feeling is reckoned as pleasurable.

SN 36.20

A Mendicant

Bhikkhusutta

“Mendicants, in one explanation I’ve spoken of two feelings. In an- 1.1
other explanation I’ve spoken of three feelings, or five, six, eighteen,
thirty-six, or a hundred and eight feelings.

I’ve taught the Dhamma with all these explanations. This being so, 1.2
you can expect that those who don’t concede, approve, or agree with
what has been well spoken will fight, quarrel, and dispute, continually
wounding each other with barbed words.

I’ve taught the Dhamma with all these explanations. This being 1.4
so, you can expect that those who do concede, approve, or agree with
what has been well spoken will live in harmony, appreciating each
other, without dispute, blending like milk and water, and regarding
each other with kindly eyes.

There are these five kinds of sensual stimulation. ... 2.1

It’s possible that wanderers of other religions might say: “The 2.2
ascetic Gotama spoke of the cessation of perception and feeling, and
he includes it in happiness. What’s up with that?”

Mendicants, when wanderers of other religions say this, you 2.5
should say to them: ‘Reverends, when the Buddha describes what’s
included in happiness, he’s not just referring to pleasant feeling. The
Realized One describes pleasure as included in happiness wherever
it is found, and in whatever context.’”

The Chapter on the Explanation of the Hundred and Eight

SN 36.21

With Sīvaka

Sīvakasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the squirrels’ feeding ground.
- 1.2 Then the wanderer Moliyasīvaka went up to the Buddha and exchanged greetings with him.²⁴⁹ When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to the Buddha:
- 1.4 “Worthy Gotama, there are some ascetics and brahmins who have this doctrine and view:²⁵⁰ ‘Everything this individual person experiences—pleasurable, painful, or neutral—is because of past deeds.’²⁵¹ What does the worthy Gotama say about this?”

249. Moliyasīvaka also appears in AN 6.47, where he also goes for refuge. His name means, “Tailor With a Topknot”.

250. Sīvaka is referring to the Jains.

251. The view that all experiences are caused by past kamma is consistently rejected in the Suttas (eg. AN 3.61:2.1, MN 101:2.5. This is reflected in the later Theravada commentaries, which describe five interacting *niyāmas*, or systems of natural law: seasons (*utu*), genetics (*bīja*), moral or immoral deeds (*kamma*), mind (*citta*), and principles of the teaching (*dhamma*). Nonetheless, the view

“Sīvaka, some feelings stem from bile disorders.”²⁵² You can know 2.1
 this from your own personal experience, and it is generally deemed
 to be true. Since this is so, the ascetics and brahmins whose view is
 that everything an individual person experiences is because of past
 deeds go beyond personal experience and beyond what is generally
 deemed to be true. So those ascetics and brahmins are wrong, I say.

Some feelings stem from phlegm disorders ... wind disorders 3.1
 ... their conjunction ... change in weather ...²⁵³ not taking care
 of yourself ...²⁵⁴ exertion ...²⁵⁵ Some feelings are the result of past
 deeds.²⁵⁶ You can know this from your own personal experience,

that all experiences are caused by kamma is extremely common among modern Buddhists, and is often heard even from learned scholars. This is a harmful misunderstanding, as it has led to discrimination against the poor and disabled in Buddhist countries. One point of confusion is that rebirth into a particular life is caused by kamma, so in that general sense, kamma is a necessary condition for having a life in which one can experience anything. But the feelings experienced in that life are caused by a variety of things, not necessarily by kamma. | Note the use of *purisapuggala* (“individual person”) as a Jain idiom. See MN 35:10.7 and note, and SN 22.22 and notes.

252. “Bile” (*pitta*), “phlegm” (*semha*), and “wind” (*vāta*) are the three *doṣa* (“impairments”) of *āyurveda* (Suśruta Saṃhitā 1.15; Caraka Saṃhitā 1.12). When unbalanced they impair the proper homeostasis of bodily functioning. They are comparable to the four “humors” (fluids) of old European medicine.

253. As I write, global atmospheric CO₂ is 428.29 ppm, and it has been 1.5☐ above average for three years. The grave health impacts of this “change in the weather” are attested in the CoP 30 Special Report by the World Health Organization: “climate change presents the most significant threat to human health of this century.”

254. *Parihāra* is looking after or taking care, so *visamaparihāra* is “imbalanced self-care”.

255. Such as ascetics who torment their bodies (MN 36:18.11).

256. In all cases, past deeds are a *necessary* condition for the mere fact of having a body in which one can experience these feelings. Only in this final case, however, is a specific deed or deeds the cause of this specific feeling. Even then, the past deed is not a *sufficient* condition, as it can only be effective when other conditions are conducive. The technical term for this kind of condition is *upanissaya* (or its contraction *upanisā*; see SN 12.23:2.1): it is both necessary and closely supportive.

and it is generally deemed to be true.²⁵⁷ Since this is so, the ascetics and brahmins whose view is that everything an individual person experiences is because of past deeds go beyond personal experience and beyond what is generally deemed to be true. So those ascetics and brahmins are wrong, I say.”

- 4.1 When he said this, the wanderer Moliyasivaka said to the Buddha, “Excellent, worthy Gotama! Excellent! ... From this day forth, may the worthy Gotama remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.”

- 5.1 “Bile, phlegm, and wind,
their conjunction, and the weather,
not taking care of yourself, exertion,
and the result of deeds is the eighth.”

SN 36.22

The Explanation of the Hundred and Eight

Aṭṭhasatasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you an exposition of the teaching on the hundred and eight. Listen ...
- 1.3 And what is the exposition of the teaching on the hundred and eight? Mendicants, in one explanation I’ve spoken of two feelings. In another explanation I’ve spoken of three feelings, or five, six, eighteen, thirty-six, or a hundred and eight feelings.
- 2.1 And what are the two feelings? Physical and mental. These are called the two feelings.
- 2.4 And what are the three feelings? Pleasant, painful, and neutral feelings. ...
- 2.7 And what are the five feelings? The faculties of pleasure, pain, happiness, sadness, and equanimity. ...²⁵⁸

257. “Generally deemed to be true” (*lokassa saccasammatam*), i.e. “common sense”.

258. Detailed at SN 48.31–40.

And what are the six feelings? Feeling born of eye contact ... ear 2.10
contact ... nose contact ... tongue contact ... body contact ... mind
contact. ...

And what are the eighteen feelings? There are six preoccupations 2.14
with happiness, six preoccupations with sadness, and six preoc-
cupations with equanimity. ...²⁵⁹

And what are the thirty-six feelings? Six kinds of domestic hap- 2.17
piness and six kinds of renunciate happiness. Six kinds of domestic
sadness and six kinds of renunciate sadness. Six kinds of domestic
equanimity and six kinds of renunciate equanimity. ...²⁶⁰

And what are the hundred and eight feelings? Thirty six feelings 2.20
in the past, future, and present. These are called the hundred and
eight feelings.

This is the exposition of the teaching on the hundred and eight.” 2.23

SN 36.23

With a Mendicant

Aññatarabhikkhusutta

Then a mendicant went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one 1.1
side, and said to him:

“Sir, what is feeling? What’s the origin of feeling? What’s the 1.2
practice that leads to the origin of feeling? What’s the cessation of
feeling? What’s the practice that leads to the cessation of feeling?
And what is feeling’s gratification, drawback, and escape?”

“Mendicant, there are these three feelings: pleasant, painful, and 2.1
neutral. These are called feelings.

Feeling originates from contact. Craving is the practice that leads 2.4
to the origin of feeling.

259. Also at MN 137:8.1, MN 140:10.1 and AN 3.61:12.1. Outside of this
context, *upavicāra* is only found in AN 6.52, where women are “preoccupied”
with adornments and thieves are “preoccupied” with a hiding place.

260. MN 137:9.1.

- 2.6 When contact ceases, feeling ceases. The practice that leads to the cessation of feelings is simply this noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion.
- 2.9 The pleasure and happiness that arise from feeling: this is its gratification.
- 2.10 That feeling is impermanent, suffering, and perishable: this is its drawback.
- 2.11 Removing and giving up desire and greed for feeling: this is its escape.”

SN 36.24

Before

Pubbasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, before my awakening—when I was still unawakened but intent on awakening—I thought:²⁶¹ ‘What is feeling? What’s the origin of feeling? What’s the practice that leads to the origin of feeling? What’s the cessation of feeling? What’s the practice that leads to the cessation of feeling? And what is feeling’s gratification, drawback, and escape?’
- 1.4 Then it occurred to me: “There are these three feelings: pleasant, painful, and neutral. These are called feelings. Feeling originates from contact. Craving is the practice that leads to the origin of feeling ... Removing and giving up desire and greed for feeling: this is its escape.”

261. In this discourse, the Buddha recalls his reflection on feeling as part of his path to awakening. In the next, he describes the awakening itself.

SN 36.25

Knowledge

Ñāṇasutta

“‘These are the feelings.’ Such was the vision, knowledge, wisdom, realization, and light that arose in me regarding teachings not learned before from another.²⁶²

‘This is the origin of feeling.’ ... 1.2

‘This is the practice that leads to the origin of feeling.’ ... 1.3

‘This is the cessation of feeling.’ ... 1.4

‘This is the practice that leads to the cessation of feeling.’ ... 1.5

‘This is the gratification of feeling.’ ... 1.6

‘This is the drawback of feeling.’ ... 1.7

‘This is the escape from feeling.’ Such was the vision, knowledge, wisdom, realization, and light that arose in me regarding teachings not learned before from another.” 1.8

SN 36.26

With Several Mendicants

Sambahulabhikkhusutta

Then several mendicants went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him: 1.1

“Sir, what is feeling? What’s the origin of feeling? What’s the practice that leads to the origin of feeling? What’s the cessation of feeling? What’s the practice that leads to the cessation of feeling? And what is feeling’s gratification, drawback, and escape?” 1.2

“Mendicants, there are these three feelings. pleasant, painful, and neutral. These are called feelings. 1.5

262. This is describing the night of the Buddha’s awakening, using the same phrasing found in the first discourse (SN 56.11). | PTS edition does not number this as a separate discourse, hence its numbering is one off from here to the end of the Samyutta.

- 1.8 Feeling originates from contact. Craving is the practice that leads to the origin of feeling.
- 1.10 When contact ceases, feeling ceases. . . .
- 1.11 Removing and giving up desire and greed for feeling: this is its escape.”

SN 36.27

Ascetics and Brahmins (1st)

Paṭhamasamaṇabrāhmaṇasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, there are these three feelings. What three? Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling.
- 1.4 There are ascetics and brahmins who don’t truly understand these three feelings’ gratification, drawback, and escape.²⁶³ I don’t deem them as true ascetics and brahmins. Those venerables don’t realize the goal of life as an ascetic or brahmin, and don’t live having realized it with their own insight in this very life.
- 1.6 There are ascetics and brahmins who do truly understand these three feelings’ gratification, drawback, and escape. I deem them as true ascetics and brahmins. Those venerables realize the goal of life as an ascetic or brahmin, and live having realized it with their own insight.”

SN 36.28

Ascetics and Brahmins (2nd)

Dutiyasamaṇabrāhmaṇasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, there are these three feelings. What three? Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling.

263. I follow the assessment in Bodhi, *Connected Discourses*, note 258, that the inclusion of *samudayañca atthaṅgamañca* here must be an editorial oversight.

There are ascetics and brahmins who don't truly understand these 1.4
three feelings' origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and
escape. ...

There are ascetics and brahmins who do truly understand ...” 1.5

SN 36.29

Ascetics and Brahmins (3rd)

Tatīyasamaṇabrāhmaṇasutta

“Mendicants, there are ascetics and brahmins who don't understand 1.1
feeling, its origin, its cessation, and the practice that leads to its
cessation. ...

There are ascetics and brahmins who do understand ...” 1.2

SN 36.30

Plain Version

Suddhikasutta

“Mendicants, there are these three feelings.²⁶⁴ What three? Pleasant, 1.1
painful, and neutral feelings. These are the three feelings.”

SN 36.31

Not of the Flesh

Nirāmisasutta

“Mendicants, there is rapture of the flesh, rapture not of the flesh, and 1.1
rapture even more spiritual than that not of the flesh.²⁶⁵

There is pleasure of the flesh, pleasure not of the flesh, and pleasure 1.2
even more spiritual than that not of the flesh.

264. The PTS edition counts this as the opening paragraph of the next discourse.

265. “Of the flesh” is *sāmiṣa*, used of a sacrifice where meat is included (Manu 4.131). This discourse offers a detailed analysis of this term.

- 1.3 There is equanimity of the flesh, equanimity not of the flesh, and equanimity even more spiritual than that not of the flesh.
- 1.4 There is liberation of the flesh, liberation not of the flesh, and liberation even more spiritual than that not of the flesh.
- 1.5 And what is rapture of the flesh? There are these five kinds of sensual stimulation. What five? Sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. Sounds ... Smells ... Tastes ... Touches known by the body, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. These are the five kinds of sensual stimulation. The rapture that arises from these five kinds of sensual stimulation is called rapture of the flesh.
- 2.1 And what is rapture not of the flesh? It's when a mendicant, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unskillful qualities, enters and remains in the first absorption, which has the rapture and bliss born of seclusion, while placing the mind and keeping it connected. As the placing of the mind and keeping it connected are stilled, they enter and remain in the second absorption, which has the rapture and bliss born of immersion, with internal clarity and mind at one, without placing the mind and keeping it connected. This is called rapture not of the flesh.
- 3.1 And what is rapture even more spiritual than that not of the flesh?²⁶⁶ When a mendicant who has ended the defilements reviews their mind free from greed, hate, and delusion, rapture arises. This is called rapture even more spiritual than that not of the flesh.
- 4.1 And what is pleasure of the flesh? Mendicants, there are these five kinds of sensual stimulation. What five? Sights known by the eye, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. Sounds ... Smells ... Tastes ... Touches known by the body, which are likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. These are the five kinds of sensual stimulation. The pleasure and happiness that arise from these five kinds of sensual stimulation is called pleasure of the flesh.

266. "Even more spiritual than that not of the flesh" is *nirāmisā nirāmisatarā*.

And what is pleasure not of the flesh? It's when a mendicant, quite 5.1
 secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unskillful qualities,
 enters and remains in the first absorption, which has the rapture
 and bliss born of seclusion, while placing the mind and keeping it
 connected. As the placing of the mind and keeping it connected are
 stilled, they enter and remain in the second absorption, which has
 the rapture and bliss born of immersion, with internal clarity and
 mind at one, without placing the mind and keeping it connected.
 And with the fading away of rapture, they enter and remain in the
 third absorption, where they meditate with equanimity, mindful and
 aware, experiencing for themselves the bliss of which the noble ones
 declare, 'Equanimous and mindful, one meditates in bliss.' This is
 called pleasure not of the flesh.

And what is pleasure even more spiritual than that not of the flesh? 6.1
 When a mendicant who has ended the defilements reviews their
 mind free from greed, hate, and delusion, pleasure and happiness
 arises. This is called pleasure even more spiritual than that not of the
 flesh.

And what is equanimity of the flesh? There are these five kinds of 7.1
 sensual stimulation. What five? Sights known by the eye, which are
 likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. Sounds
 ... Smells ... Tastes ... Touches known by the body, which are
 likable, desirable, agreeable, pleasant, sensual, and arousing. These
 are the five kinds of sensual stimulation. The equanimity that arises
 from these five kinds of sensual stimulation is called equanimity of
 the flesh.

And what is equanimity not of the flesh? It's when, with the 8.1
 giving up of pleasure and pain and the disappearance of former hap-
 piness and sadness, a mendicant enters and remains in the fourth
 absorption, without pleasure or pain, with pure equanimity and
 mindfulness. This is called equanimity not of the flesh.

And what is equanimity even more spiritual than that not of the 9.1
 flesh? When a mendicant who has ended the defilements reviews
 their mind free from greed, hate, and delusion, equanimity arises.

This is called equanimity even more spiritual than that not of the flesh.

10.1 And what is liberation of the flesh? Liberation connected with form is liberation of the flesh.²⁶⁷

11.1 And what is liberation not of the flesh? Liberation connected with the formless is liberation not of the flesh.

12.1 And what is liberation even more spiritual than that not of the flesh? When a mendicant who has ended the defilements reviews their mind free from greed, hate, and delusion, liberation arises. This is called liberation even more spiritual than that not of the flesh.”

The Linked Discourses on feelings are complete.

267. This shows that *sāmisa* is a relative term. Compared to other feelings, absorption is “not of the flesh”, but compared to other liberations, the four absorptions are “of the flesh”. The commentary explains that this is so because they are still based on “form”, namely the reflection or counterpart experienced as a light or vision in the mind.

LINKED DISCOURSES ON FEMALES

First Chapter of Abbreviated Texts

SN 37.1

A Lady

Mātugāmasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, when a lady has five factors she is extremely undesirable to a man.²⁶⁸ What five? She’s not attractive, wealthy, or ethical; she’s idle, and she doesn’t beget children. When a lady has these five factors she is extremely undesirable to a man.

268. *Mātugāma* literally means “motherkind” (cf. the archaic “motherkin”). It is a word for women in Pali, but it appears unique to Buddhist texts, and hence may be a technical or formal term (cf. *puggala*, SN 22.22:2.2). Grammatically it is always singular, but it sometimes takes a plural sense as a collective noun. In this sentence, for example, *mātugāma* is paired with “man” so it must be a singular “woman”, whereas at SN 37.3:1.1 it is paired with “men” in plural so it must be “womankind”. The commentary says it is any human woman, even one born that very day. As to the connotations of the term, “mother” is probably meant in an affectionate and respectful sense, perhaps to remind the monks not to fall into objectification (cf. SN 35.127:1.6). There are different patterns of usage in different texts. Throughout the Pātimokkha—the quintessential text for monks—*mātugāma* is used with *bhikkhu*, whereas *itthī* (“woman”) is used with *purisa* (“man”). But there is no corresponding male form, so *bhikkhunī* takes *purisa*. However, this distinction does not obtain in the Suttas, where *mātugāma* is used with *purisa*. Overall, I think *mātugāma* is respectful and slightly formal, so I use “lady” for *mātugāma* and “woman” for *itthī*.

When a lady has five factors she is extremely desirable to a man. 1.5
 What five? She's attractive, wealthy, and ethical; she's deft and tireless, and she begets children. When a lady has these five factors she is extremely desirable to a man."²⁶⁹

SN 37.2

A Man

Purisasutta

"Mendicants, when a man has five factors he is extremely undesirable 1.1
 to a lady. What five? He's not attractive, wealthy, or ethical; he's idle, and he doesn't beget children. When a man has these five factors he is extremely undesirable to a lady.

When a man has five factors he is extremely desirable to a lady. 1.5
 What five? He's attractive, wealthy, and ethical; he's deft and tireless, and he begets children. When a man has these five factors he is extremely desirable to a lady."

SN 37.3

Particular Suffering

Āveṇikadukkhassutta

"Mendicants, there are these five kinds of suffering that particularly 1.1
 apply to ladies. They're undergone by ladies and not by men."²⁷⁰
 What five?

269. As to why the Buddha should be listing the traits that make a woman desirable, your guess is as good as mine. The next discourse says the exact same thing with genders reversed, so perhaps the purpose was to subvert expectations. One noteworthy detail is that this leaves out questions of caste and family, in contrast with, say, Manu 3.5–19.

270. Here the Buddha expresses empathy for the lot of women in the culture of his times.

- 1.3 Firstly, a lady, while still young, goes to live with her husband's family and is separated from her relatives.²⁷¹ This is the first kind of suffering that particularly applies to ladies.
- 1.5 Furthermore, a lady undergoes the menstrual cycle.²⁷² This is the second kind of suffering that particularly applies to ladies.
- 1.7 Furthermore, a lady undergoes pregnancy. This is the third kind of suffering that particularly applies to ladies.
- 1.9 Furthermore, a lady gives birth. This is the fourth kind of suffering that particularly applies to ladies.
- 1.11 Furthermore, a lady provides services for a man.²⁷³ This is the fifth kind of suffering that particularly applies to ladies.
- 1.13 These are the five kinds of suffering that particularly apply to ladies. They're undergone by ladies and not by men."

271. An unmarried girl (*kumāribhūta*) under twenty was said to be not mature enough for full ordination (Bi Pc 71:1.11), which is the same age as for the monks. A *gihigatā* of just twelve, however, might be ordained. *Gihigatā* is explained as "gone to the place of a man" (*purisantaragatā*, Bi Pc 66:2.7); i.e. a girl who is married. This item precedes menstruation, which also suggests the age of twelve. The Hindu tradition says a girl should be given in marriage before puberty (Manu 9.89; Gautama 18.21; Vāśiṣṭha 17.70; Baudhāyana 4.1.11). If no suitable husband is found, three years after puberty she is free to choose her own (Manu 9.90; Gautama 18.20; Baudhāyana 4.10.14). Yama (*Vīramitrodaya Saṃskāra*, p. 773) says she may choose a husband after the age of twelve.

272. *Utu* is "season"; it includes the fortnight that begins with menstruation (see note on MN 38:26.2).

273. The mutual obligations of husbands and wives are mentioned from a Buddhist perspective at DN 31:30.1, where the wife is not said to "serve" the husband, but to be kind to him. A wife's "service" (*pāricariya*) was domestic and also sexual (Bu Ss 4:1.2.7). No Buddhist text, however, justifies the use of violence in marriage (as at Brhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 6.4.7). Manu 9.3 says a woman must always be subject to a man, whether father, husband, or son. Manu 9.11 lists a wife's duties such as managing household finances, cleaning, cooking, and housekeeping, as well as minor religious observances.

SN 37.4

Three Qualities

Tihidhammehisutta

“Mendicants, when ladies have three qualities, when their body breaks 1.1
up, after death, they are mostly reborn in a place of loss, a bad place,
the underworld, hell. What three?

A lady lives at home with heart full of the stain of stinginess in the 1.3
morning, jealousy in the afternoon, and sexual desire in the evening.

When ladies possess these three qualities, when their body breaks 1.6
up, after death, they are mostly reborn in a place of loss, a bad place,
the underworld, hell.”

SN 37.5

Irritable

Kodhanasutta

Then Venerable Anuruddha went up to the Buddha, sat down to one 1.1
side, and said to him:

“Sometimes, sir, with my clairvoyance that is purified and super- 1.2
human, I see that a female—when her body breaks up, after death—
is reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell. How
many qualities do ladies have so that they’re reborn in a place of loss,
a bad place, the underworld, hell?”

“Anuruddha, when ladies have five qualities, when their body 2.1
breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a place of loss, a bad place,
the underworld, hell. What five?

They’re faithless, shameless, imprudent, irritable, and witless. 2.3

When ladies possess these five qualities, when their body breaks 2.4
up, after death, they are reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the
underworld, hell.”

SN 37.6

Acrimony

Upanāhīsutta

- 1.1 “... They’re faithless, shameless, imprudent, acrimonious, and witless.
...”

SN 37.7

Jealous

Issukīsutta

- 1.1 “... They’re faithless, shameless, imprudent, jealous, and witless. ...”

SN 37.8

Stingy

Maccharīsutta

- 1.1 “... They’re faithless, shameless, imprudent, stingy, and witless. ...”

SN 37.9

Adultery

Aticārīsutta

- 1.1 “... They’re faithless, shameless, imprudent, adulterous, and witless.
...”

UNETHICAL

SN 37.10

Unethical

Dussīlasutta

“... They’re faithless, shameless, imprudent, unethical, and witless. 1.1
...”

SN 37.11

Unlearned

Appassutasutta

“... They’re faithless, shameless, imprudent, unlearned, and witless. 1.1
...”

SN 37.12

Lazy

Kusītasutta

“... They’re faithless, shameless, imprudent, lazy, and witless. ...” 1.1

SN 37.13

Unmindful

Muṭṭhassatisutta

“... They’re faithless, shameless, imprudent, unmindful, and witless. 1.1
...”

SN 37.14

Five Threats

Pañcaverasutta

- 1.1 “Anuruddha, when ladies have five qualities, when their body breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell. What five? They kill living creatures, steal, commit sexual misconduct, lie, and consume intoxicants of beer, wine, and liquor. When ladies possess these five qualities, when their body breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell.”

Second Chapter of Abbreviated Texts

SN 37.15

Loving

Akkodhanasutta

Then Venerable Anuruddha went up to the Buddha . . . and asked 1.1
him, “Sometimes, sir, with my clairvoyance that is purified and super-
human, I see that a female—when her body breaks up, after death—
is reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. How many qualities do
ladies have so that they’re reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm?”

“Anuruddha, when ladies have five qualities, when their body 2.1
breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a good place, a heavenly
realm. What five? They’re faithful, conscientious, prudent, loving,
and wise. When ladies possess these five qualities, when their body
breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a good place, a heavenly
realm.”

SN 37.16

Free of Acrimony

Anupanāhīsutta

- 1.1 “... They’re faithful, conscientious, prudent, free of acrimony, and wise. ...”

SN 37.17

Free of Jealousy

Anissukīsutta

- 1.1 “... They’re faithful, conscientious, prudent, free of jealousy, and wise. ...”

SN 37.18

Free of Stinginess

Amaccharīsutta

- 1.1 “... They’re faithful, conscientious, prudent, free of stinginess, and wise. ...”

SN 37.19

Not Adulterous

Anaticārīsutta

- 1.1 “... They’re faithful, conscientious, prudent, not adulterous, and wise. ...”

ETHICAL

SN 37.20

Ethical

Susīlasutta

“... They’re faithful, conscientious, prudent, ethical, and wise. ...” 1.1

SN 37.21

Very Learned

Bahussutasutta

“... They’re faithful, conscientious, prudent, learned, and wise. ...” 1.1

SN 37.22

Energetic

Āraddhavīriyasutta

“... They’re faithful, conscientious, prudent, energetic, and wise. ...” 1.1

SN 37.23

Mindful

Upaṭṭhitassatisutta

“... They’re faithful, conscientious, prudent, mindful, and wise. ...” 1.1

SN 37.24

Five Precepts

Pañcasīlasutta

“Anuruddha, when ladies have five qualities, when their body breaks 1.1
up, after death, they are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.

What five? They don't kill living creatures, steal, commit sexual misconduct, lie, or consume intoxicants of beer, wine, and liquor. When ladies possess these five qualities, when their body breaks up, after death, they are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm."

The Chapter on Powers

SN 37.25

Assured

Visāradasutta

“Mendicants, there are these five powers of a lady. What five? Attractiveness, wealth, relatives, children, and ethical behavior. These are the five powers of a lady. A lady living at home with these five qualities is self-assured.”²⁷⁴

SN 37.26

Under Her Thumb

Pasayhasutta

“Mendicants, there are these five powers of a lady. What five? Attractiveness, wealth, relatives, children, and ethical behavior. These are the five powers of a lady. A lady living at home with these five powers has her husband under her thumb.”²⁷⁵

274. “Self-assurance” is a quality of the Buddha (SN 7.18:6.4) and a virtuous layperson (AN 5.172).

275. “Under her thumb”, literally, “having vanquished her husband” (*sāmikaṃ pasayha*), like Indra’s wife Sujā (Rig Veda 10.159; see note at SN 11.12:6.1).

SN 37.27

Mastered

Abhibhuyyasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, there are these five powers of a lady. What five? Attractiveness, wealth, relatives, children, and ethical behavior. These are the five powers of a lady. A lady with these five powers lives having mastered her husband.”²⁷⁶

SN 37.28

One

Ekasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, by means of one power a man lives having mastered a lady. By means of what one power? When a lady has been mastered by the power of authority, her powers of attractiveness, wealth, relatives, children, and ethical behavior do not avail her.”²⁷⁷

SN 37.29

In That Respect

Āṅgasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, there are these five powers of a lady. What five?
 1.3 Attractiveness, wealth, relatives, children, and ethical behavior.
 1.4 A lady who has the power of attractiveness but not the power of wealth is incomplete in that respect. But when she has the power of attractiveness and the power of wealth she’s complete in that respect.

276. “Lives having mastered” is *abhibhuyya vattati* (cf. AN 7.63:7.3); Rig Veda 10.159.5 has *abhibhūvarī* in the same sense.

277. At AN 6.52:5.2, “authority” (or “sovereignty”) is said to be a woman’s ultimate goal. An aristocrat shares the same goal, thus a king wields the power of authority (*issariyabala*, AN 8.27:1.3).

A lady who has the powers of attractiveness and wealth, but not the power of relatives is incomplete in that respect. But when she has the powers of attractiveness, wealth, and relatives she's complete in that respect. 1.8

A lady who has the powers of attractiveness, wealth, and relatives, but not the power of children is incomplete in that respect. But when she has the powers of attractiveness, wealth, relatives, and children she's complete in that respect. 1.12

A lady who has the powers of attractiveness, wealth, relatives, and children, but not the power of ethical behavior is incomplete in that respect. But when she has the powers of attractiveness, wealth, relatives, children, and ethical behavior she's complete in that respect. 1.16

These are the five powers of a lady." 1.20

SN 37.30

They Send Her Away

Nāsentisutta

"Mendicants, there are these five powers of a lady. What five? 1.1

Attractiveness, wealth, relatives, children, and ethical behavior. 1.3

If a lady has the power of attractiveness but not that of ethical behavior, the family will send her away, they won't accommodate her. 1.4

If a lady has the powers of attractiveness and wealth but not that of ethical behavior, the family will send her away, they won't accommodate her. 1.5

If a lady has the powers of attractiveness, wealth, and relatives, but not that of ethical behavior, the family will send her away, they won't accommodate her. 1.6

If a lady has the powers of attractiveness, wealth, relatives, and children, but not that of ethical behavior, the family will send her away, they won't accommodate her. 1.7

- 1.8 If a lady has the power of ethical behavior but not that of attractiveness, the family will accommodate her, they won't send her away.
- 1.9 If a lady has the power of ethical behavior but not that of wealth, the family will accommodate her, they won't send her away.
- 1.10 If a lady has the power of ethical behavior but not that of relatives, the family will accommodate her, they won't send her away.
- 1.11 If a lady has the power of ethical behavior but not that of children, the family will accommodate her, they won't send her away.
- 1.12 These are the five powers of a lady."

SN 37.31

Cause

Hetusutta

- 1.1 "Mendicants, there are these five powers of a lady. What five? Attractiveness, wealth, relatives, children, and ethical behavior.
- 1.4 It is not because of the powers of attractiveness, wealth, relatives, or children that ladies, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. It is because of the power of ethical behavior that ladies, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.
- 1.6 These are the five powers of a lady."

SN 37.32

Things

Thānasutta

- 1.1 "Mendicants, there are five things that are hard to get for ladies who have not made merit. What five?
- 1.3 'May I be born into a suitable family!' This is the first thing.
- 1.5 'Having been born in a suitable family, may I marry into a suitable family!' This is the second thing.

‘Having been born in a suitable family and married into a suitable family, may I live at home without a co-wife!’²⁷⁸ This is the third thing. 1.7

‘Having been born in a suitable family, and married into a suitable family, and living at home without a co-wife, may I have children!’ This is the fourth thing. 1.9

‘Having been born in a suitable family, and married into a suitable family, and living at home without a co-wife, and having had children, may I live having mastered my husband!’ This is the fifth thing. 1.11

These are the five things that are hard to get for ladies who have not made merit. 1.13

There are five things that are easy to get for ladies who have made merit. What five? 2.1

‘May I be born into a suitable family!’ This is the first thing. 2.3

‘Having been born into a suitable family, may I marry into a suitable family!’ This is the second thing. 2.5

‘Having been born into a suitable family and married into a suitable family, may I live at home without a co-wife!’ This is the third thing. 2.7

‘Having been born into a suitable family, and married into a suitable family, and living at home without a co-wife, may I have children!’ This is the fourth thing. 2.9

‘Having been born into a suitable family, and married into a suitable family, and living at home without a co-wife, and having had children, may I live having mastered my husband!’ This is the fifth thing. 2.11

These are the five things that are easy to get for ladies who have made merit.” 2.13

278. AN 6.52:5.2 says a woman insists she be without a co-wife. In Rig Veda 10.159, Sujā performs oblations to gain the power of stripping luster from her co-wives and thus vanquishing them.

SN 37.33

Living With Self-Assurance

Pañcasīlavisāradasutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, a lady living at home with five qualities is self-assured. What five? She doesn’t kill living creatures, steal, commit sexual misconduct, lie, or consume intoxicants of beer, wine, and liquor. A lady living at home with these five qualities is self-assured.”

SN 37.34

Growth

Vaḍḍhīsutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, a female noble disciple who grows in five ways grows nobly, taking on what is essential and excellent in this life. What five? She grows in faith, ethics, learning, generosity, and wisdom. A female noble disciple who grows in these five ways grows nobly, taking on what is essential and excellent in this life.
- 2.1 When she grows in faith and ethics,
wisdom, and both generosity and learning—
a virtuous laywoman such as she
takes on what is essential for herself in this life.”

The Linked Discourses on ladies are complete.

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH
JAMBUKHĀDAKA

The Chapter with Jambukhādaka

SN 38.1

A Question About Extinguishment

Nibbānapañhāsutta

- 1.1 At one time Venerable Sāriputta was staying in the land of the Magadhans near the little village of Nālaka.²⁷⁹ Then the wanderer Jambukhādaka went up to Venerable Sāriputta and exchanged greetings with him.²⁸⁰ When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to Sāriputta:
- 2.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘extinguishment.’²⁸¹ What is extinguishment?”
- 2.3 “Reverend, the ending of greed, hate, and delusion is called extinguishment.”

279. Situated near Nālandā north of Rājagaha, this village is associated with Sāriputta; the commentary says it was his home town. He speaks there twice with the wanderer Sāmaṇḍakāni (AN 10.65, AN 10.66), and it was the site of his passing (SN 47.13).

280. Found only in this chapter, his name means “eater of black plums”, perhaps as an ascetic diet (cf. MN 12:52.1). With the exception of the final discourse, all the discourses of this chapter follow the same format, where Jambukhādaka asks for clarification of a central Dhamma term, making the chapter a handy guide to key vocabulary. Several of the terms are found in dependent origination; for explanations of these see SN 12.1 and SN 12.2.

281. *Nibbāna*, the going out of a flame, “quenching”.

“But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for realizing this 2.5
extinguishment?”

“There is, reverend.” 2.6

“Well, what is it?” 2.7

“It is simply this noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right 2.8
purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right
mindfulness, and right immersion. This is the path, the practice, for
realizing this extinguishment.”

“Reverend, this is a fine path, a fine practice, for realizing this 2.11
extinguishment. Just this much is enough for diligence.”

SN 38.2

A Question About Perfection

Arahattapañhāsutta

“Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘perfection.’ What 1.1
is perfection?”²⁸²

“Reverend, the ending of greed, hate, and delusion is called per- 1.3
fection.”

“But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for realizing this 1.5
perfection?”

“There is, reverend.” 1.6

“Well, what is it?” 1.7

“It is simply this noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right 1.8
purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right
mindfulness, and right immersion. This is the path, the practice, for
realizing this perfection.”

“Reverend, this is a fine path, a fine practice, for realizing this 1.11
perfection. Just this much is enough for diligence.”

282. *Arahatta*, the state of being an arahant.

SN 38.3

Principled Speech

Dhammavādīpañhāsutta

- 1.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, who in the world have principled speech? Who in the world practice well? Who are the holy ones in the world?”
- 1.2 “Reverend, those who teach principles for giving up greed, hate, and delusion have principled speech in the world.²⁸³ Those who practice for giving up greed, hate, and delusion are practicing well in the world. Those who have given up greed, hate, and delusion—so they’re cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated, and unable to arise in the future—are holy ones in the world.”²⁸⁴
- 2.1 “But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for giving up that greed, hate, and delusion?”
- 2.2 “There is, reverend.”
- 2.3 “Well, what is it?”
- 2.4 “It is simply this noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion. This is the path, this is the practice for giving up that greed, hate, and delusion.”
- 2.7 “This is a fine path, a fine practice, for giving up greed, hate, and delusion. Just this much is enough for diligence.”

283. “Those who teach principles” or “those who teach Dhamma” (*dhammavādino*).

284. “Holy One” (*sugata*) is a frequent epithet of the Buddha, or as here, for any arahant. Formally, it parallels “Realized One” (*tathāgata*), i.e. “one who has come to the state of truth”. *Sugata* therefore means “one who has come to the state of the good/happy/well”. These are past participles; the noun form of the same word is *sugati*, a “good place” or “heaven”. It is primarily associated with Buddhism (Agni Purāṇa 360.3); in later Sanskrit, followers of the Buddha were called *bauddha* or *saugata*.

SN 38.4

What's the Goal?

Kimatthiyasutta

“Reverend Sāriputta, what's the goal of leading the spiritual life under the ascetic Gotama?” 1.1

“The goal of leading the spiritual life under the Buddha is to completely understand suffering.” 1.2

“But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for completely understanding this suffering?” 1.3

“There is.” ... 1.4

SN 38.5

Solace

Assāsappattasutta

“Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘gaining solace.’²⁸⁵ At what point do you gain solace?” 1.1

“When a mendicant truly understands the six fields of contact's origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape, at that point they've gained solace.” 1.3

“But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for realizing this solace?” 1.4

“There is.” ... 1.5

285. “Solace” is *assāsa*, literally “breathing in”.

SN 38.6

Ultimate Solace

Paramassāsappattasutta

- 1.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘gaining ultimate solace’. At what point do you gain ultimate solace?”
- 1.3 “When a mendicant is freed by not grasping after truly understanding the six fields of contact’s origin, disappearance, gratification, drawback, and escape, at that point they’ve gained ultimate solace.”
- 1.4 “But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for realizing this ultimate solace?”
- 1.5 “There is.” ...

SN 38.7

A Question About Feeling

Vedanāpañhāsutta

- 1.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘feeling.’²⁸⁶ What is feeling?”
- 1.3 “Reverend, there are three feelings. What three? Pleasant, painful, and neutral feeling. These are the three feelings.”
- 1.7 “But reverend, is there a path and a practice for completely understanding these three feelings?”
- 1.8 “There is.” ...

286. SN 36.1:1.1.

SN 38.8

A Question About Defilements

Āsavapañhāsutta

“Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘defilement.’²⁸⁷ 1.1
What is defilement?”

“Reverend, there are three defilements. The defilements of sensu- 1.3
ality, desire to be reborn, and ignorance. These are the three defile-
ments.”

“But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for completely un- 1.6
derstanding these three defilements?”

“There is.” ... 1.7

SN 38.9

A Question About Ignorance

Avijjāpañhāsutta

“Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘ignorance.’ What 1.1
is ignorance?”

“Not knowing about suffering, the origin of suffering, the ces- 1.3
sation of suffering, and the practice that leads to the cessation of
suffering. This is called ignorance.”

“But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for giving up that 1.5
ignorance?”

“There is.” ... 1.6

287. “Defilements” (*āsava*) are the fundamental “pollutions” or “corruptions” that darken awareness, trapping people in transmigration. In practical application, *āsava* can mean the “discharge” from a sore (AN 3.27:2.4). The Jain Tattvārthasūtra 6.1–2 defines *āsrava* as the influx of deeds; these pollute the pure soul. | Note that the Pali *āsava* represents two distinct words, which are homonyms in Pali but differentiated in Sanskrit. The word here is Sanskrit *āsrava* (or *āśrava*), whereas Sanskrit *āsava* means “intoxicant”, a sense found elsewhere in Pali (Bu Pc 51:2.1.4).

SN 38.10

A Question About Craving

Tañhāpañhāsutta

- 1.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘craving.’ What is craving?”
- 1.3 “Reverend, there are these three cravings. Craving for sensual pleasures, craving for continued existence, and craving for nonexistence. These are the three cravings.”
- 1.6 “But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for completely understanding these cravings?”
- 1.7 “There is.” ...

SN 38.11

A Question About Floods

Oghapañhāsutta

- 1.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘a flood.’²⁸⁸ What is a flood?”
- 1.3 “Reverend, there are these four floods. The floods of sensuality, desire to be reborn, views, and ignorance. These are the four floods.”
- 1.6 “But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for completely understanding these floods?”
- 1.7 “There is.” ...

288. The Buddha lived and taught in the Gangetic plain, a region characterized by deadly and unpredictable flooding.

SN 38.12

A Question About Grasping

Upādānapañhāsutta

“Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘grasping’. What 1.1
is grasping?”

“Reverend, there are these four kinds of grasping. Grasping at 1.3
sensual pleasures, views, precepts and observances, and theories of
a self. These are the four kinds of grasping.”

“But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for completely un- 1.6
derstanding these four kinds of grasping?”

“There is.” ... 1.7

SN 38.13

A Question About States of Existence

Bhavapañhāsutta

“Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘continued ex- 1.1
istence’. What is continued existence?”

“Reverend, there are these three states of continued existence. 1.3
Existence in the sensual realm, the realm of luminous form, and the
formless realm. These are the three states of continued existence.”

“But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for completely un- 1.6
derstanding these three states of existence?”

“There is.” ... 1.7

SN 38.14

A Question About Suffering

Dukkhapañhāsutta

“Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘suffering’. What 1.1
is suffering?”

- 1.3 “Reverend, there are these three forms of suffering. The suffering inherent in painful feeling; the suffering inherent in conditions; and the suffering inherent in perishing.²⁸⁹ These are the three forms of suffering.”
- 1.6 “But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for completely understanding these forms of suffering?”
- 1.7 “There is.” ...

SN 38.15

A Question About Substantial Reality

Sakkāyapañhāsutta

- 1.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘substantial reality’.²⁹⁰ What is substantial reality?”
- 1.3 “Reverend, the Buddha said that these five grasping aggregates are substantial reality. That is, form, feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness. The Buddha said that these five grasping aggregates are substantial reality.”
- 1.6 “But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for completely understanding this substantial reality?”
- 1.7 “There is.” ...

SN 38.16

A Question About What’s Hard to Do

Dukkarapañhāsutta

- 1.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, in this teaching and training, what is hard to do?”²⁹¹

289. See SN 45.165 and notes for discussion.

290. See notes at SN 22.105:1.4 and SN 22.22.

291. This discourse marks a shift in Jambukhādaka’s spiritual development. No longer just interested in clarifying terms, he is curious about the path. There is no record of whether he followed through.

- “Going forth, reverend, is hard to do in this teaching and training.” 1.2
- “But what’s hard to do for someone who has gone forth?” 1.3
- “When you’ve gone forth it’s hard to be satisfied.” 1.4
- “But what’s hard to do for someone who is satisfied?” 1.5
- “When you’re satisfied, it’s hard to practice in line with the teaching.” 1.6
- “But if a mendicant practices in line with the teaching, will it take them long to become a perfected one?” 1.7
- “Not long, reverend.” 1.8

The Linked Discourses with Jambukhādaka are complete.

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH
SĀMAṆḌAKA

The Chapter with Sāmaṇḍaka

SN 39.1–15

With Sāmaṇḍaka on Extinguishment

Sāmaṇḍakasutta

At one time Venerable Sāriputta was staying in the land of the Vajjis 1.1
near Ukkacelā on the bank of the Ganges River.²⁹² Then the wan-
derer Sāmaṇḍaka went up to Venerable Sāriputta and exchanged
greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation
were over, he sat down to one side and said to Sāriputta:

“Reverend Sāriputta, they speak of this thing called ‘extinguish- 2.1
ment’. What is extinguishment?”

“Reverend, the ending of greed, hate, and delusion is called extin- 2.3
guishment.”

“But, reverend, is there a path and a practice for realizing this 2.5
extinguishment?”

“There is, reverend.” 2.6

“Well, what is it?” 3.1

292. See notes on DN 16:2.1.2, SN 47.13:1.1, and SN 47.14:1.1. The Buddha taught there in MN 34. | The commentary requires the reading *uk kacelā* (“cloth firebrand”) but its story is contrived. The variant *ukkavelā* (“firebrand shore”) suggests there may have been a lighthouse there.

- 3.2 “It is simply this noble eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion. This is the path, the practice, for realizing this extinguishment.”
- 3.5 “Reverend, this is a fine path, a fine practice, for realizing this extinguishment. Just this much is enough for diligence.”
(Tell in full as the Linked Discourses with Jambukhādaka.)

SN 39.16

Hard to Do

Dukkarasutta

- 1.1 “Reverend Sāriputta, in this teaching and training, what is hard to do?”
- 1.2 “Going forth, reverend, is hard to do in this teaching and training.”
- 1.3 “But what’s hard to do for someone who has gone forth?”
- 1.4 “When you’ve gone forth it’s hard to be satisfied.”
- 1.5 “But what’s hard to do for someone who is satisfied?”
- 1.6 “When you’re satisfied, it’s hard to practice in line with the teaching.”
- 1.7 “But if a mendicant practices in line with the teaching, will it take them long to become a perfected one?”
- 1.8 “Not long, reverend.”

The Linked Discourses with Sāmaññaka are complete.

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH
MOGGALLĀNA

The Chapter with Moggallāna

SN 40.1

A Question About the First Absorption

Paṭhamajhānapaṇhāsutta

- 1.1 At one time Venerable Mahāmoggallāna was staying near Sāvattī in Jeta’s Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika’s monastery.²⁹³ There Venerable Mahāmoggallāna addressed the mendicants: “Reverends, mendicants!”
- 1.4 “Reverend,” they replied. Venerable Mahāmoggallāna said this:
- 2.1 “Just now, reverends, as I was in private retreat this thought came to mind: ‘They speak of this thing called the “first absorption”. What is the first absorption?’ It occurred to me: ‘It’s when a mendicant, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unskillful qualities, enters and remains in the first absorption, which has the rapture and bliss born of seclusion, while placing the mind and keeping it connected. This is called the first absorption.’
- 2.7 And so ... I was entering and remaining in the first absorption.²⁹⁴ While I was in that meditation, perception and focus accompanied by sensual pleasures beset me.
- 3.1 Then the Buddha came up to me with his psychic power and said, ‘Moggallāna, Moggallāna! Don’t neglect the first absorption,

293. This chapter is similar to SN 21.

294. See note on tenses at SN 21.1:2.8.

brahmin! Settle your mind in the first absorption; unify your mind and immerse it in the first absorption.’

And so, after some time ... I entered and remained in the first 3.4
absorption.

So if anyone should be rightly called a disciple who attained to 3.5
great direct knowledge with help from the Teacher, it’s me.”

SN 40.2

A Question About the Second Absorption

Dutiyajhānapañhāsutta

“They speak of this thing called the ‘second absorption’. What is the 1.1
second absorption? It occurred to me: ‘As the placing of the mind
and keeping it connected are stilled, a mendicant enters and remains
in the second absorption, which has the rapture and bliss born of
immersion, with internal clarity and mind at one, without placing the
mind and keeping it connected. This is called the second absorption.’

And so ... I was entering and remaining in the second absorption. 1.6
While I was in that meditation, perception and focus accompanied
by placing the mind beset me.

Then the Buddha came up to me with his psychic power and 2.1
said, ‘Moggallāna, Moggallāna! Don’t neglect the second absorption,
brahmin! Settle your mind in the second absorption; unify your
mind and immerse it in the second absorption.’

And so, after some time ... I entered and remained in the second 2.4
absorption.

So if anyone should be rightly called a disciple who attained to 2.5
great direct knowledge with help from the Teacher, it’s me.”

SN 40.3

A Question About the Third Absorption

Tatiyajhānapañhāsutta

- 1.1 “They speak of this thing called the ‘third absorption.’ What is the third absorption? It occurred to me: ‘With the fading away of rapture, a mendicant enters and remains in the third absorption, where they meditate with equanimity, mindful and aware, experiencing for themselves the bliss of which the noble ones declare, “Equanimous and mindful, one meditates in bliss.” This is called the third absorption.’
- 1.6 And so ... I was entering and remaining in the third absorption. While I was in that meditation, perception and focus accompanied by rapture beset me.
- 2.1 Then the Buddha came up to me with his psychic power and said, ‘Moggallāna, Moggallāna! Don’t neglect the third absorption, brahmin! Settle your mind in the third absorption; unify your mind and immerse it in the third absorption.’
- 2.4 And so, after some time ... I entered and remained in the third absorption. So if anyone should be rightly called a disciple who attained to great direct knowledge with help from the Teacher, it’s me.”

SN 40.4

A Question About the Fourth Absorption

Catutthajhānapañhāsutta

- 1.1 “They speak of this thing called the ‘fourth absorption.’ What is the fourth absorption? It occurred to me: ‘It’s when, with the giving up of pleasure and pain and the disappearance of former happiness and sadness, a mendicant enters and remains in the fourth absorption, without pleasure or pain, with pure equanimity and mindfulness. This is called the fourth absorption.’

And so ... I was entering and remaining in the fourth absorption. 1.6
While I was in that meditation, perception and focus accompanied by pleasure beset me.

Then the Buddha came up to me with his psychic power and said, ‘Moggallāna, Moggallāna! Don’t neglect the fourth absorption, brahmin! Settle your mind in the fourth absorption; unify your mind and immerse it in the fourth absorption.’ 2.1

And so, after some time ... I entered and remained in the fourth absorption. 2.4

So if anyone should be rightly called a disciple who attained to great direct knowledge with help from the Teacher, it’s me.” 2.5

SN 40.5

A Question About the Dimension of Infinite Space

Ākāśānañcāyatanapañhāsutta

“They speak of this thing called the ‘dimension of infinite space’. What is the dimension of infinite space? It occurred to me: ‘It’s when a mendicant, going totally beyond perceptions of form, with the disappearance of perceptions of impingement, not focusing on perceptions of diversity, aware that “space is infinite”, enters and remains in the dimension of infinite space. This is called the dimension of infinite space.’ 1.1

And so ... I was entering and remaining in the dimension of infinite space. While I was in that meditation, perception and focus accompanied by forms beset me. 1.6

Then the Buddha came up to me with his psychic power and said, ‘Moggallāna, Moggallāna! Don’t neglect the dimension of infinite space, brahmin! Settle your mind in the dimension of infinite space; unify your mind and immerse it in the dimension of infinite space.’ 2.1

And so, after some time ... I entered and remained in the dimension of infinite space. 2.4

- 2.5 So if anyone should be rightly called a disciple who attained to great direct knowledge with help from the Teacher, it's me."

SN 40.6

A Question About the Dimension of Infinite Consciousness

Viññāṇañcāyatanapañhāsutta

- 1.1 "They speak of this thing called the 'dimension of infinite consciousness'. What is the dimension of infinite consciousness? It occurred to me: 'It's when a mendicant, going totally beyond the dimension of infinite space, aware that "consciousness is infinite", enters and remains in the dimension of infinite consciousness. This is called the dimension of infinite consciousness.'
- 1.6 And so ... I was entering and remaining in the dimension of infinite consciousness. While I was in that meditation, perception and focus accompanied by the dimension of infinite space beset me.
- 2.1 Then the Buddha came up to me with his psychic power and said, 'Moggallāna, Moggallāna! Don't neglect the dimension of infinite consciousness, brahmin! Settle your mind in the dimension of infinite consciousness; unify your mind and immerse it in the dimension of infinite consciousness.'
- 2.4 And so, after some time ... I entered and remained in the dimension of infinite consciousness.
- 2.5 So if anyone should be rightly called a disciple who attained to great direct knowledge with help from the Teacher, it's me."

SN 40.7

A Question About the Dimension of Nothingness

Ākiñcaññāyatanapañhāsutta

“They speak of this thing called the ‘dimension of nothingness’. What 1.1
is the dimension of nothingness? It occurred to me: ‘It’s when a mendicant, going totally beyond the dimension of infinite consciousness, aware that “there is nothing at all”, enters and remains in the dimension of nothingness. This is called the dimension of nothingness.’

And so ... I was entering and remaining in the dimension of nothingness. While I was in that meditation, perception and focus accompanied by the dimension of infinite consciousness beset me. 1.6

Then the Buddha came up to me with his psychic power and said, 2.1
‘Moggallāna, Moggallāna! Don’t neglect the dimension of nothingness, brahmin! Settle your mind in the dimension of nothingness; unify your mind and immerse it in the dimension of nothingness.’

And so, after some time ... I entered and remained in the dimension of nothingness. 2.4

So if anyone should be rightly called a disciple who attained to 2.5
great direct knowledge with help from the Teacher, it’s me.”

SN 40.8

A Question About the Dimension of Neither Perception Nor Non-Perception

Nevasaññānāsaññāyatanapañhāsutta

“They speak of this thing called the ‘dimension of neither perception 1.1
nor non-perception’. What is the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception? It occurred to me: ‘It’s when a mendicant, going totally beyond the dimension of nothingness, enters and remains

in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is called the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception.’

1.6 And so ... I was entering and remaining in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. While I was in that meditation, perception and focus accompanied by the dimension of nothingness beset me.

2.1 Then the Buddha came up to me with his psychic power and said, ‘Moggallāna, Moggallāna! Don’t neglect the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, brahmin! Settle your mind in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception; unify your mind and immerse it in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception.’

2.4 And so, after some time ... I entered and remained in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception.

2.5 So if anyone should be rightly called a disciple who attained to great direct knowledge with help from the Teacher, it’s me.”

SN 40.9

A Question About the Signless

Animittapañhāsutta

1.1 “They speak of this thing called the ‘signless immersion of the heart’. What is the signless immersion of the heart? It occurred to me: ‘It’s when a mendicant, not focusing on any signs, enters and remains in the signless immersion of the heart. This is called the signless immersion of the heart.’

1.6 And so ... I was entering and remaining in the signless immersion of the heart. While I was in that meditation, my consciousness followed after signs.

2.1 Then the Buddha came up to me with his psychic power and said, ‘Moggallāna, Moggallāna! Don’t neglect the signless immersion of the heart, brahmin! Settle your mind in the signless immersion of

the heart; unify your mind and immerse it in the signless immersion of the heart.’

And so, after some time ... I entered and remained in the signless immersion of the heart. 2.4

So if anyone should be rightly called a disciple who attained to great direct knowledge with help from the Teacher, it’s me.” 2.5

SN 40.10

With Sakka

Sakkasutta

And then Venerable Mahāmoggallāna, as easily as a strong person would extend or contract their arm, vanished from Jeta’s Grove and reappeared among the gods of the thirty-three.²⁹⁵ Then Sakka, lord of gods, with five hundred deities came up to Mahāmoggallāna, bowed, and stood to one side. Mahāmoggallāna said to him: 1.1

“Lord of gods, it’s good to go for refuge to the Buddha. It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. It’s good to go for refuge to the teaching. It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. It’s good to go for refuge to the Saṅgha. It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.” 2.1

“My good Moggallāna, it’s good to go for refuge to the Buddha ... the teaching ... the Saṅgha. It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.” 3.1

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with six hundred deities ... 4.1

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with seven hundred deities ... 4.2

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with eight hundred deities ... 4.3

295. As at SN 55.18 and SN 55.19; see too MN 37:6.1.

- 4.4 Then Sakka, lord of gods, with eighty thousand deities ...
- 7.1 Then Sakka, lord of gods, with five hundred deities came up to Mahāmoggallāna, bowed, and stood to one side. Mahāmoggallāna said to him:
- 8.1 “Lord of gods, it’s good to have experiential confidence in the Buddha: ‘That Blessed One is perfected, a fully awakened Buddha, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, holy, knower of the world, supreme guide for those fit for training, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.’ It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.
- 9.1 It’s good to have experiential confidence in the teaching: ‘The teaching is well explained by the Buddha—apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.’ It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.
- 10.1 It’s good to have experiential confidence in the Saṅgha: ‘The Saṅgha of the Buddha’s disciples is practicing the way that’s good, direct, systematic, and proper. It consists of the four pairs, the eight individual persons. This is the Saṅgha of the Buddha’s disciples that is worthy of offerings dedicated to the gods, worthy of hospitality, worthy of a religious donation, worthy of greeting with cupped palms, and is the supreme field of merit for the world.’ It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.
- 11.1 It’s good to have the ethical conduct that’s loved by the noble ones, unbroken, impeccable, spotless, and unmarred, liberating, praised by sensible people, not mistaken, and leading to immersion. It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.”
- 12.1 “My good Moggallāna, it’s good to have experiential confidence in the Buddha ... the teaching ... the Saṅgha ... and to have the ethical conduct that’s loved by the noble ones ... It’s the reason why

some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.”

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with six hundred deities ... 16.1

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with seven hundred deities ... 16.2

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with eight hundred deities ... 16.3

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with eighty thousand deities ... 16.4

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with five hundred deities came up to Mahāmoggallāna, bowed, and stood to one side. Mahāmoggallāna said to him: 25.1

“Lord of gods, it’s good to go for refuge to the Buddha. It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. They surpass other gods in ten respects: heavenly lifespan, beauty, happiness, glory, sovereignty, sights, sounds, smells, tastes, and touches. 26.1

It’s good to go for refuge to the teaching ... 27.1

It’s good to go for refuge to the Saṅgha. It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. They surpass other gods in ten respects: heavenly lifespan, beauty, happiness, glory, sovereignty, sights, sounds, smells, tastes, and touches.” 28.1

“My good Moggallāna, it’s good to go for refuge to the Buddha ...” 29.1

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with six hundred deities ... 32.1

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with seven hundred deities ... 32.2

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with eight hundred deities ... 32.3

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with eighty thousand deities ... 32.4

Then Sakka, lord of gods, with five hundred deities came up to Mahāmoggallāna, bowed, and stood to one side. Mahāmoggallāna said to him: 37.1

“Lord of gods, it’s good to have experiential confidence in the Buddha: ‘That Blessed One is perfected, a fully awakened Buddha ... teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.’ It’s the reason why some sentient beings, when their body breaks up, after death, are reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm. They surpass other 38.1

gods in ten respects: heavenly lifespan, beauty, happiness, glory, sovereignty, sights, sounds, smells, tastes, and touches.

- 39.1 It's good to have experiential confidence in the teaching ...
 40.1 It's good to have experiential confidence in the Saṅgha ...
 41.1 It's good to have the ethical conduct that's loved by the noble ones ...
 42.1 "My good Moggallāna, it's good to have experiential confidence in the Buddha ..."
 46.1 Then Sakka, lord of gods, with six hundred deities ...
 46.2 Then Sakka, lord of gods, with seven hundred deities ...
 46.3 Then Sakka, lord of gods, with eight hundred deities ...
 46.4 Then Sakka, lord of gods, with eighty thousand deities ...

SN 40.11

With Candana, Etc.

Candanasutta

- 1.1 Then the godling Candana ...²⁹⁶
 2.1 the godling Suyāma ...²⁹⁷
 3.1 the godling Santusita ...
 4.1 the godling Sunimmita ...
 5.1 the godling Vasavatti ...
 (*Tell in full as in the Discourse With Sakka.*)

The Linked Discourses on Moggallāna are complete.

296. See note on SN 2.15:1.1.

297. The remaining deities are the chiefs of their respective realms, as Sakka is of the thirty-three (AN 8.36).

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH
CITTA THE HOUSEHOLDER

The Chapter with Citta

SN 41.1

The Fetter

Saṃyojanasutta

- 1.1 At one time several senior mendicants were staying near Macchikāsaṇḍa in the Wild Mango Grove.²⁹⁸ Now at that time, after the meal, on return from almsround, several senior mendicants sat together in the pavilion and this discussion came up among them:
- 1.3 “Reverends, the ‘fetter’ and the ‘things that tighten the fetters’: do these things differ in both meaning and phrasing? Or do they mean the same thing, and differ only in the phrasing?”
- 1.4 Some senior mendicants answered like this: “Reverends, the ‘fetter’ and the ‘things that tighten the fetters’: these things differ in both meaning and phrasing.”
- 1.6 But some senior mendicants answered like this: “Reverends, the ‘fetter’ and the ‘things that tighten the fetters’ mean the same thing; they differ only in the phrasing.”

298. Macchikāsaṇḍa was a township in Kāśī (Kd 11:18.1.3), known only through its connection with Citta. The name probably means “Fisher’s Forest”.

Now at that time the householder Citta had arrived at Migapathaka on some business.²⁹⁹ He heard about what those senior mendicants were discussing.³⁰⁰

So he went up to them, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to them, “Sirs, I heard that you were discussing whether the ‘fetter’ and the ‘things that tighten the fetters’ differ in both meaning and phrasing, or whether they mean the same thing, and differ only in the phrasing.”

“That’s right, householder.” 3.7

“Sirs, the ‘fetter’ and the ‘things that tighten the fetters’: these things differ in both meaning and phrasing. 4.1

Well then, sirs, I shall give you a simile. For by means of a simile some sensible people understand the meaning of what is said. 4.2

Suppose there was a black ox and a white ox yoked by a single harness or yoke. Would it be right to say that the black ox is the yoke of the white ox, or the white ox is the yoke of the black ox?”³⁰¹ 4.4

“No, householder. The black ox is not the yoke of the white ox, nor is the white ox the yoke of the black ox. The yoke there is the single harness or yoke that they’re yoked by.” 4.7

299. The householder Citta, often identified as “of Macchikāsaṇḍa”, was a chief lay disciple (AN 2.132:1.2), foremost in teaching Dhamma (AN 1.250). His boldness and intelligence mark his distinctive personality. Likely he was born under the asterism Citrā (the star Spica), a manifestation of Agni (see Pāṇini 4.3.34, *vārttika* 1). The primordial myth of the asterism attributes to it the power to enable one of lower status (the titans) to challenge those of higher status, the gods (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 2.1.2.13–17). Citta the householder is likewise noted for his brilliant insight that surpasses the monks; moreover, on several occasions in his presence the most junior monastic surpasses the senior. | Migapathaka (“place of the animal track”) is only mentioned here.

300. The use of *kira* here shows that he did not hear them directly, but heard a report. Hence below he says “I heard that ...” (*sutaṃ metāṃ*), similar to the phrase “so I have heard” (MN 127:17.4).

301. This example is not attributed to the Buddha in the canon, so the question arises where Citta heard it. It is found in a discussion between Mahākoṭṭhita and Sāriputta (SN 35.232:4.3), but perhaps more relevant, between Kāmabhū and Ānanda (SN 35.233:4.3). Kāmabhū discussed Dhamma with Citta (SN 41.5, SN 41.6), so perhaps Citta learned it from him.

- 4.10 “In the same way, the eye is not the fetter of sights, nor are sights the fetter of the eye. The fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them.
- 4.12 The ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind is not the fetter of ideas, nor are ideas the fetter of the mind. The fetter there is the desire and greed that arises from the pair of them.”
- 4.19 “You’re fortunate, householder, so very fortunate, to traverse the Buddha’s deep teachings with the eye of wisdom.”

SN 41.2

With Isidatta (1st)

Paṭhamaisidattasutta

- 1.1 At one time several senior mendicants were staying near Macchikāsaṇḍa in the Wild Mango Grove.
- 1.2 Then Citta the householder went up to them, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to them, “Sirs, would the senior monks please accept tomorrow’s meal from me?”
- 1.4 They consented with silence. Knowing that the senior mendicants had consented, Citta rose from his seat, bowed, and respectfully circled them, keeping them on his right, before leaving.
- 1.6 Then when the night had passed, the senior mendicants robed up in the morning and, taking their bowls and robes, went to Citta’s home, and sat down on the seats spread out.
- 2.1 Then Citta went up to them, bowed, sat down to one side, and asked the senior venerable, “Honorable Senior, they speak of ‘the diversity of elements.’³⁰² In what way did the Buddha speak of the diversity of elements?”³⁰³

302. The term of address “Honorable Senior” (*bhante therā*) is found only in this sutta and the next two. Note that when *bhante therā* is used above, the plural *therā* is nominative, whereas here the singular is vocative.

303. This question is also asked at SN 35.129:1.4.

- When he said this, the senior venerable kept silent.³⁰⁴ 2.4
- For a second time ... 2.5
- And for a third time, Citta asked him, “Honorable Senior, they 2.9
speak of ‘the diversity of elements’. In what way did the Buddha
speak of the diversity of elements?”
- And a second time and a third time the senior venerable kept 2.12
silent.
- Now at that time Venerable Isidatta was the most junior mendi- 3.1
cant in that Saṅgha.³⁰⁵ He said to the senior venerable, “Honorable
Senior, may I answer Citta’s question?”
- “Answer it, Reverend Isidatta.” 3.4
- “Householder, is this your question: ‘They speak of “the diversity 3.5
of elements”. In what way did the Buddha speak of the diversity of
elements?’”
- “Yes, sir.” 3.8
- “This is the diversity of elements spoken of by the Buddha.³⁰⁶ 3.9
- The eye element, the sights element, the eye consciousness ele- 3.10
ment ...
- The mind element, the idea element, the mind consciousness 3.11
element.
- This is how the Buddha spoke of the diversity of elements.” 3.12
- Then Citta, having approved and agreed with what Isidatta said, 4.1
served and satisfied the senior mendicants with his own hands with
delicious fresh and cooked foods. When the senior mendicants had
eaten and washed their hands and bowls, they rose from their seats
and left.

304. The expression “senior venerable” (*āyasmā thero*), found in this sutta and the next, is rare, and in early Pali invariably associated with some failing of the senior monastics. In SN 21.10 a “Venerable Senior” is suggested to be senior in name only, while in SN 22.90 the advice of the senior venerables is ineffectual. Perhaps the piling up of excessive titles was felt to be a sign of pomposity.

305. Isidatta’s verse is at Thag 1.120. This is not the chamberlain Isidatta of Māgadha (SN 55.6:1.4).

306. The primary text is at SN 14.1.

- 4.3 Then the senior venerable said to Venerable Isidatta, “Isidatta, it’s good that you felt inspired to answer that question, because I didn’t. So when a similar question comes up, you should also answer it as you feel inspired.”

SN 41.3

With Isidatta (2nd)

Dutiyaaisidattasutta

- 1.1 At one time several senior mendicants were staying near Macchikāsaṇḍa in the Wild Mango Grove.
- 1.2 Then Citta the householder went up to them, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to them, “Sirs, would the senior monks please accept tomorrow’s meal from me?”
- 1.4 They consented with silence. Then, knowing that the senior mendicants had consented, Citta rose from his seat, bowed, and respectfully circled them, keeping them on his right, before leaving.
- 1.6 Then when the night had passed, the senior mendicants robed up in the morning and, taking their bowls and robes, went to Citta’s home, and sat down on the seats spread out.
- 2.1 So he went up to them, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to the senior venerable:
- 2.2 “Honorable Senior, there are many different views that arise in the world. For example: the cosmos is eternal, or not eternal, or finite, or infinite; the soul and the body are one and the same, or the soul is one thing, the body another; after death, a realized one still exists, or no longer exists, or both still exists and no longer exists, or neither still exists nor no longer exists. And also the sixty-two misconceptions spoken of in ‘The Divine Net.’³⁰⁷ When what exists

307. The Brahmajālasutta (DN 1). It is referred to by name at Kd 21:1.8.8 and Vb 17:21.3, and by the list of views, numbered sixty-three at Snp 3.6:42.1 and sixty at SN 8.2:5.1 = Thag 21.1:9.1.

do these views come to be? When what doesn't exist do these views not come to be?"

When he said this, the senior venerable kept silent. 3.1

For a second time ... 3.2

And for a third time, Citta said to him: 3.3

"Honorable Senior, there are many different views that arise in the world. ... When what exists do these views come to be? When what doesn't exist do these views not come to be?" 3.4

And a second time and a third time the senior venerable kept silent. 3.8

Now at that time Venerable Isidatta was the most junior mendicant in that Saṅgha. He said to the senior venerable, "Honorable Senior, may I answer Citta's question?" 4.1

"Answer it, Reverend Isidatta." 4.4

"Householder, is this your question: 'There are many different views that arise in the world ... When what exists do these views come to be? When what doesn't exist do these views not come to be?'" "Yes, sir." 4.5

"Householder, there are many different views that arise in the world. For example: the cosmos is eternal, or not eternal, or finite, or infinite; the soul and the body are one and the same, or the soul is one thing, the body another; after death, a realized one still exists, or no longer exists, or both still exists and no longer exists, or neither still exists nor no longer exists. And also the sixty-two misconceptions spoken of in 'The Divine Net'." 4.10

These views come to be when substantialist view exists. When substantialist view does not exist they do not come to be."³⁰⁸ 4.13

"But sir, how does substantialist view come about?" 5.1

"It's when an unlearned ordinary person has not seen the noble ones, and is neither skilled nor trained in the teaching of the noble 5.2

308. According to the commentary, "substantialist view" (*sakkāyadiṭṭhi*) is the sixty-third view mentioned at Snp 3.6:42.1.

ones. They've not seen true persons, and are neither skilled nor trained in the teaching of the true persons.

5.3 They regard form as self, self as having form, form in self, or self in form. They regard feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness as self, self as having consciousness, consciousness in self, or self in consciousness.

5.8 That's how substantialist view comes about."

6.1 "But sir, how does substantialist view not come about?"

6.2 "It's when a learned noble disciple has seen the noble ones, and is skilled and trained in the teaching of the noble ones. They've seen true persons, and are skilled and trained in the teaching of the true persons.

6.3 They don't regard form as self, self as having form, form in self, or self in form. They don't regard feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness as self, self as having consciousness, consciousness in self, or self in consciousness.

6.8 That's how substantialist view does not come about."

7.1 "Sir, where has Master Isidatta come from?"³⁰⁹

7.2 "I come from Avanti, householder."³¹⁰

7.3 "Sir, there's a friend of mine named Isidatta who I've never met. He's gone forth from a good family in Avanti. Have you met him?"

7.5 "Yes, householder."

7.6 "Sir, where is that venerable now staying?" When he said this, Isidatta kept silent.

7.8 "Sir, are you that Isidatta?"

7.9 "Yes, householder."

7.10 "Sir, I hope Master Isidatta is happy here in Macchikāsaṇḍa, for the Wild Mango Grove is lovely. I'll make sure that Master Isidatta is provided with robes, almsfood, lodgings, and medicines and supplies for the sick."

7.13 "That's nice of you to say, householder."

309. Citta consistently uses the honorific *ayya* rather than the standard *āyasmā*.

310. Over 800 km to the south-west.

Then Citta, having approved and agreed with what Isidatta said, 8.1
served and satisfied the senior mendicants with his own hands with
delicious fresh and cooked foods. When the senior mendicants had
eaten and washed their hands and bowls, they rose from their seats
and left.

Then the senior venerable said to Venerable Isidatta, “Isidatta, it’s 8.3
good that you felt inspired to answer that question, because I didn’t.
So when a similar question comes up, you should also answer it as
you feel inspired.”

But Isidatta set his lodgings in order and, taking his bowl and robe, 8.7
left Macchikāsaṇḍa, never to return.³¹¹

SN 41.4

Mahaka’s Demonstration

Mahakapāṭihāriyasutta

At one time several senior mendicants were staying near Macchikā- 1.1
saṇḍa in the Wild Mango Grove.

Then Citta the householder went up to them, bowed, sat down 1.2
to one side, and said to them, “Sirs, would the senior monks please
accept tomorrow’s meal from me in my milkshed?”³¹²

They consented with silence. Then, knowing that the senior men- 1.4
dicants had consented, Citta rose from his seat, bowed, and respect-
fully circled them, keeping them on his right, before leaving.

Then when the night had passed, the senior mendicants robed 1.6
up in the morning and, taking their bowls and robes, went to Citta’s
milkshed, and sat down on the seats spread out.

311. His reason for leaving is not explained. Perhaps he did not wish to be seen
as a favorite of the famous supporter. See similar occurrences at SN 41.4:6.9
and AN 3.126:7.5

312. *Gokula* is unique in early Pali. For the sense “milkshed” see Harivaṃśa
Purāṇa 2.17.4; Bṛhatkathakośa 21.29–33.

- 2.1 Then Citta served and satisfied the senior mendicants with his own hands with delicious milk-rice made with ghee. When the senior mendicants had eaten and washed their hands and bowls, they rose from their seats and left. Citta instructed that the leftovers of the food be distributed, then followed behind the senior mendicants.³¹³
- 2.4 Now at that time it was boiling hot. And those senior mendicants walked along as if their bodies were melting, as happens after a meal.
- 3.1 Now at that time Venerable Mahaka was the most junior mendicant in that Saṅgha.³¹⁴ Then Venerable Mahaka said to the senior venerable, “Wouldn’t it be nice, Honorable Senior, if a cool wind blew, a cloud canopy formed, and a gentle rain drizzled down?”
- 4.1 “It would indeed be nice, Reverend Mahaka.” Then Mahaka used his psychic power to will that a cool wind would blow, a cloud canopy would form, and a gentle rain would drizzle down.
- 4.3 Then Citta thought, “The most junior mendicant in this Saṅgha has such psychic power!”
- 4.5 When they reached the monastery, Mahaka said to the senior venerable, “Honorable Senior, is that sufficient?”
- 4.7 “That’s sufficient, Reverend Mahaka, you’ve done enough and offered enough.” Then the senior mendicants entered their dwellings, and Mahaka entered his own dwelling.
- 5.1 Then Citta went up to Mahaka, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him, “Sir, please show me a superhuman demonstration of psychic power.”
- 5.3 “Well, then, householder, place your upper robe on the porch and spread a handful of grass on it.”
- 5.4 “Yes, sir,” replied Citta, and did as he was asked.
- 5.5 Mahaka entered his dwelling and latched the door. Then he used his psychic power to will that a flame shoot out through the keyhole and the chink in the door-panel, and it burned up the grass but not

313. Like the King of the Kurus at MN 82:28.1.

314. Mahaka is unknown apart from this passage. The novice Mahaka of Kd 1:52.1.2 was a different person.

the upper robe.³¹⁵ Then Citta shook out his upper robe and stood to one side, shocked and awestruck.

Mahaka left his dwelling and said to Citta, “Is that sufficient, householder?” 5.7

“That’s sufficient, sir, you’ve done enough and offered enough. I hope Master Mahaka is happy here in Macchikāsaṇḍa, for the Wild Mango Grove is lovely. I’ll make sure that Master Mahaka is provided with robes, almsfood, lodgings, and medicines and supplies for the sick.” 6.1

“That’s nice of you to say, householder.” 6.7

But Mahaka set his lodgings in order and, taking his bowl and robe, left Macchikāsaṇḍa, never to return.³¹⁶ 6.8

SN 41.5

With Kāmabhū (1st)

Paṭhamakāmabhūsutta

At one time Venerable Kāmabhū was staying near Macchikāsaṇḍa in the Wild Mango Grove.³¹⁷ 1.1

315. The Buddha’s position on psychic displays is discussed at AN 3.60. He asked Sāgata to make a demonstration for householders (Kd 5:1.7.4), but later dismissed such displays as vulgar and unworthy, making it an offense of wrongdoing to perform them in front of laypeople (Kd 15:8.2.23). Either this event was before the rule was laid down, or Mahaka is breaking the Vinaya. This passage is quoted at Visuddhimagga 393–94.

316. By displaying a psychic power, Mahaka had stepped up to and possibly over the line of behavior suitable for a mendicant. Perhaps he did not want to be seen as currying favor with an influential figure, as Devadatta had done (Kd 17:2.1.12).

317. Kāmabhū discussed Dhamma with Ānanda at Ghosita’s Monastery near Kosambī in SN 35.233.

- 1.2 Then Citta the householder went up to Venerable Kāmabhū, bowed, and sat down to one side. Kāmabhū said to him,³¹⁸ “Householder, there is this saying:
- 3.1 ‘With faultless parts and white canopy,
the one-spoked chariot rolls on.
See it come, untroubled,
with stream cut, unbound.’
- 4.1 How should we see the detailed meaning of this brief statement?”
- 4.2 “Sir, was this spoken by the Buddha?”
- 4.3 “Yes, householder.”³¹⁹
- 4.4 “Well then, sir, please wait a while as I consider the meaning of this.” Then after staying silent for a while, Citta said to Kāmabhū:
- 5.1 “Sir, ‘faultless parts’ is a term for ethics.³²⁰
- 5.2 ‘White canopy’ is a term for freedom.³²¹
- 5.3 ‘One spoke’ is a term for mindfulness.³²²
- 5.4 ‘Rolls on’ is a term for going forward and coming back.³²³
- 5.5 ‘Chariot’ is a term for this body made up of the four principal states, produced by mother and father, built up from rice and por-

318. Verses connecting parts of the Dhamma to a chariot are also found at SN 1.46 and SN 45.4.

319. At Ud 7.5:6.1, upon seeing the enlightened monk Bhaddiya the Dwarf.

320. *Nelaṅga*: of “faultless” (*na ela*) “parts” (*aṅga*). | *Ela* is unusual, perhaps unique, in early Pali. It corresponds to Sanskrit *enas*, “fault, offense, sin” (Rig Veda 5.3.7; Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 14.1.1.26). Thus the primary sense of the word is an ethical fault, and it is secondarily applied to the chariot’s parts. | The “parts” of a chariot are discussed at MN 58:10.3. Ethics is a “part” of the spiritual life (AN 4.196:3.1).

321. A white canopy was the height of luxurious style (SN 45.4:1.4), like the white parasol held over a prince (Snp 3.11:11.3, AN 3.39:1.5, MN 123:20.2).

322. Perhaps because mindfulness is always useful (SN 46.53:15.4), or because it leads to unification (MN 10:2.1).

323. In the original setting, Bhaddiya is seen approaching and thus inspiring the whole verse. The phrase “going forward and coming back” is often used of a mendicant’s deportment, especially when entering the village for alms-round.

ridge, liable to impermanence, to wearing away and erosion, to breaking up and destruction.³²⁴

Greed, hate, and delusion are troubles.³²⁵ A mendicant who has ended the defilements has given these up, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, and obliterated them, so they are unable to arise in the future. That's why a mendicant who has ended the defilements is called 'untroubled'. 5.6

'The one who comes' is a term for the perfected one. 5.9

'Stream' is a term for craving.³²⁶ A mendicant who has ended the defilements has given this up, cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, and obliterated it, so it's unable to arise in the future. That's why a mendicant who has ended the defilements is said to have 'cut the stream'. 5.10

Greed, hate, and delusion are bonds. A mendicant who has ended the defilements has given these up, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, and obliterated them, so they are unable to arise in the future. That's why a mendicant who has ended the defilements is called 'unbound'. 5.13

So, sir, that's how I understand the detailed meaning of what the Buddha said in brief: 5.16

'With faultless parts and white canopy,
the one-spoked chariot rolls on. 6.1

324. Kaṭha Upaniṣad 3.3 says the mind is the charioteer, and the body is the chariot (*śarīraṃ ratham eva*). This is part of a series of very Buddhist-sounding verses about how when one lacks understanding and mindfulness the senses will be out of control. The image is also used by the Buddha at DN 16:2.25.11.

325. The Pali *anīgha* is elsewhere only found in negative. It is sometimes traced to Sanskrit *rgḥā*, "propensity to violence" (Jamison/Brereton "mettle"). Here, however, the non-negative form is *nīgha*, casting doubt on that etymology. Sanskrit *nīgha* does not seem to occur (except as a Buddhist back-formation from *anīgha*), but we do find *nighna* in the sense "smiting, striking" (Rig Veda 1.55.5; Atharva Veda 10.1.27). The commentary explains it as "suffering". "Trouble" and its negative "untroubled" seem to more-or-less fit the Pali cases, although perhaps something like "uncombative" might be more precise.

326. As at AN 4.5:5.4, Snp 3.11:37.2, Iti 109:3.3.

See it come, untroubled,
with stream cut, unbound.’”

- 7.2 “You’re fortunate, householder, so very fortunate, to traverse the Buddha’s deep teachings with the eye of wisdom.”

SN 41.6

With Kāmabhū (2nd)

Dutiyakāmabhūsutta

- 1.1 At one time Venerable Kāmabhū was staying near Macchikāsaṇḍa in the Wild Mango Grove. Then Citta the householder went up to Venerable Kāmabhū, sat down to one side, and said to him:
- 1.3 “Sir, how many processes are there?”³²⁷
- 1.4 “Householder, there are three processes. The physical process, the verbal process, and the mental process.”³²⁸
- 1.6 Saying “Good, sir,” Citta approved and agreed with what Kāmabhū said. Then he asked another question:
- 1.7 “But sir, what is the physical process? What’s the verbal process? What’s the mental process?”
- 1.8 “Breathing is a physical process. Placing the mind and keeping it connected are a verbal process. Perception and feeling are a mental process.”

327. Excepting the final question, Citta’s questions echo those of the layman Visākha to the nun Dhammadinnā (MN 44:13.1).

328. These three “processes” (*saṅkhāra*) apply, as we shall see, in the development of meditation (DN 18:24.1). They must be distinguished from the similarly named three kinds of “choices” (*saṅkhāra*) that define volitional activity determining rebirth (i.e. karma, MN 57:8.2). In the three “processes”, the final item is always *cittasaṅkhāra* (“mental process”), whereas in the three “choices” the final item is usually *manosaṅkhāra*. While *mano* and *citta* both mean “mind”, *mano* leans to the sense of “volition”, while *citta* leans to the sense of “awareness”. It is a quirk of the Pali texts that they usually have *cittasaṅkhāra* in the context of dependent origination (but see SN 12.25:13.1), where the Sanskrit has the expected *manasamkāraḥ* (SF 165 Ādisūtra, Arv 5.2 Arthavinīśayasūtra, SF 238 Pratītyasamutpādādivibhaṅganirdeśa).

Saying “Good, sir,” he asked another question: 2.1

“But sir, why is breathing a physical process? Why are placing the mind and keeping it connected a verbal process? Why are perception and feeling a mental process?” 2.2

“Breathing is physical. It’s tied up with the body, that’s why breathing is a physical process.³²⁹ First you place the mind and keep it connected, then you break into speech. That’s why placing the mind and keeping it connected are a verbal process.³³⁰ Perception and feeling are mental. They’re tied up with the mind, that’s why perception and feeling are a mental process.”³³¹ 2.3

Saying “Good, sir,” he asked another question: 3.1

“But sir, how does someone attain the cessation of perception and feeling?” 3.2

“A mendicant who is entering such an attainment does not think: ‘I will enter the cessation of perception and feeling’ or ‘I am entering the cessation of perception and feeling’ or ‘I have entered the cessation of perception and feeling.’ Rather, their mind has been previously developed so as to lead to such a state.”³³² 3.3

Saying “Good, sir,” he asked another question: 4.1

“But sir, which cease first for a mendicant who is entering the cessation of perception and feeling: the physical, verbal, or mental process?” 4.2

329. Breathing is referred to as a “physical process” in the context of breath meditation to emphasize the natural stilling that occurs as the meditation settles. | As in MN 43, the questions are laying the groundwork for a discussion of deep meditation. Hence in these definitions what is being discussed is not “processes” in general, but the very last residue of activity or disturbance whose cessation marks the transition to a deeper level of consciousness.

330. *Vitakka* and *vicāra* have a more basic sense in ordinary states of mind (“thought” and “exploring”) and a more refined sense in the elevated consciousness of *jhāna* (“placing the mind” and “keeping it connected”). They act as a condition for breaking into speech, so any hint of such movement, no matter how subtle, must be abandoned.

331. As with the verbal process, it is the two taken together that constitute a “process”.

332. Compare MN 43:28.2.

- 4.3 “The verbal process ceases first, then physical, then mental.”³³³
- 5.1 Saying “Good, sir,” he asked another question:
- 5.2 “What’s the difference between someone who has passed away and a mendicant who has attained the cessation of perception and feeling?”
- 5.3 “When someone dies, their physical, verbal, and mental processes have ceased and stilled; their vitality is spent; their warmth is dissipated; and their faculties have disintegrated. When a mendicant has attained the cessation of perception and feeling, their physical, verbal, and mental processes have ceased and stilled. But their vitality is not spent; their warmth is not dissipated; and their faculties are very clear. That’s the difference between someone who has passed away and a mendicant who has attained the cessation of perception and feeling.”
- 6.1 Saying “Good, sir,” he asked another question:
- 6.2 “But sir, how does someone emerge from the cessation of perception and feeling?”
- 6.3 “A mendicant who is emerging from such an attainment does not think: ‘I will emerge from the cessation of perception and feeling’ or ‘I am emerging from the cessation of perception and feeling’ or ‘I have emerged from the cessation of perception and feeling.’ Rather, their mind has been previously developed so as to lead to such a state.”
- 7.1 Saying “Good, sir,” he asked another question:
- 7.2 “But sir, which arise first for a mendicant who is emerging from the cessation of perception and feeling: the physical, verbal, or mental process?”
- 7.3 “The mental process arises first, then physical, then verbal.”
- 8.1 Saying “Good, sir,” he asked another question:

333. The verbal process ceases in the first absorption, the breath in the fourth absorption (SN 36.11:2.19), and feeling and perception in the attainment of cessation.

“But sir, when a mendicant has emerged from the attainment of the cessation of perception and feeling, how many kinds of contact do they experience?” 8.2

“They experience three kinds of contact: emptiness, signless, and undirected contacts.”³³⁴ 8.3

Saying “Good, sir,” he asked another question: 9.1

“But sir, when a mendicant has emerged from the attainment of the cessation of perception and feeling, what does their mind slant, slope, and incline to?” 9.2

“Their mind slants, slopes, and inclines to seclusion.”³³⁵ 9.3

Saying “Good, sir,” Citta approved and agreed with what Kāmabhū said. Then he asked another question: 10.1

“But sir, how many things are helpful for attaining the cessation of perception and feeling?”³³⁶ 10.2

“Well, householder, you’ve finally asked what you should have asked first! Nevertheless, I will answer you. Two things are helpful for attaining the cessation of perception and feeling: serenity and discernment.” 10.3

SN 41.7

With Godatta

Godattasutta

At one time Venerable Godatta was staying near Macchikāsaṇḍa in the Wild Mango Grove. Then Citta the householder went up to Venerable Godatta, bowed, and sat down to one side. Godatta said to him: 1.1

334. See the discussion on various “releases of the heart” at MN 43:26.1ff. Here, when emerging from cessation, the higher form of release is meant, as the meditator’s mind naturally inclines toward liberating insight.

335. Here the higher sense of “seclusion” is meant, namely Nibbāna.

336. Here MN 44 shifts to discuss feeling.

- 1.3 “Householder, the limitless release of the heart, and the release of the heart through nothingness, and the release of the heart through emptiness, and the signless release of the heart: do these things differ in both meaning and phrasing? Or do they mean the same thing, and differ only in the phrasing?”³³⁷
- 1.4 “Sir, there is a way in which these things differ in both meaning and phrasing. But there’s also a way in which they mean the same thing, and differ only in the phrasing.”³³⁸
- 2.1 And what’s the way in which these things differ in both meaning and phrasing?
- 2.2 It’s when a mendicant meditates spreading a heart full of love to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full of love to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will. They meditate spreading a heart full of compassion ... They meditate spreading a heart full of rejoicing ... They meditate spreading a heart full of equanimity to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full of equanimity to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will. This is called the limitless release of the heart.
- 3.1 And what is the release of the heart through nothingness? It’s when a mendicant, going totally beyond the dimension of infinite consciousness, aware that ‘there is nothing at all’, enters and remains in the dimension of nothingness. This is called the release of the heart through nothingness.

337. This question was asked by Mahākoṭṭhita of Sāriputta at MN 43:29.5, and by Pañcakaṇṇa of Anuruddha at MN 127:4.5.

338. Text ends this sentence with close *-ti* indicating end of quote, yet throughout the vocative *bhante* is used, indicating that it is Citta speaking. The particle is absent from the exact parallel at MN 43:30.2, but present in the dialogue at MN 127:5.3, which features more back-and-forth between the speakers.

And what is the release of the heart through emptiness? It's when 4.1
a mendicant has gone to a wilderness, or to the root of a tree, or
to an empty hut, and reflects like this: "This is empty of a self or
what belongs to a self." This is called the release of the heart through
emptiness.

And what is the signless heart's release? It's when a mendicant, not 5.1
focusing on any signs, enters and remains in the signless immersion
of the heart.³³⁹ This is called the signless release of the heart.

This is the way in which these things differ in both meaning and 5.4
phrasing.

And what's the way in which they mean the same thing, and differ 6.1
only in the phrasing?

Greed, hate, and delusion are makers of limits. A mendicant who 6.2
has ended the defilements has given these up, cut them off at the
root, made them like a palm stump, and obliterated them, so they
are unable to arise in the future. The unshakable release of the heart
is said to be the best kind of limitless release of the heart. That
unshakable release of the heart is empty of greed, hate, and delusion.

Greed is something, hate is something, and delusion is something. 6.6
A mendicant who has ended the defilements has given these up, cut
them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, and obliterated
them, so they are unable to arise in the future. The unshakable release

339. The suttas say little about this signless (*animitta*) meditation. Its defining characteristic is that consciousness does not "follow after signs" (*nimittānusāri viññāṇam*, eg. AN 6.13:5.3). This is explained in MN 138:10.2 as not being distracted or affected by the features of sense impressions, as the "signs" are created by greed, hate, and delusion (MN 43:37.1). It is distinguished from the four kinds of mindfulness meditation (SN 22.80:8.4). The mental unification (*ekattaṃ*) based on this practice is listed after the form (and formless) *jhānas*, so it is very advanced. It is nonetheless a conditioned state (MN 121:11.4), so it is possible that a mendicant might fall from it and disrobe (AN 6.60:8.10). However it may also be used to describe the meditation of an arahant (SN 41.7:6.12). It is clear from MN 121:10.5 that the six senses are still functioning, unlike in deep serenity meditations. It seems that in such a state, the Buddha was able to function normally while seeing through the pain in his body (DN 16:2.25.13).

of the heart is said to be the best kind of release of the heart through nothingness. That unshakable release of the heart is empty of greed, hate, and delusion.

- 6.10 Greed, hate, and delusion are makers of signs. A mendicant who has ended the defilements has given these up, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, and obliterated them, so they are unable to arise in the future. The unshakable release of the heart is said to be the best kind of signless release of the heart. That unshakable release of the heart is empty of greed, hate, and delusion.
- 6.14 This is the way in which they mean the same thing, and differ only in the phrasing.”
- 6.15 “You’re fortunate, householder, so very fortunate, to traverse the Buddha’s deep teachings with the eye of wisdom.”

SN 41.8

The Jain Ascetic of the Ñātika Clan

Nigaṇṭhanāṭaputtasutta

- 1.1 Now at that time the Jain ascetic of the Ñātika clan had arrived at Macchikāsaṇḍa together with a large assembly of Jain ascetics.³⁴⁰
- 1.2 Citta the householder heard that they had arrived. Together with several lay followers, he went up to the Jain Ñātika and exchanged greetings with him.³⁴¹
- 1.4 When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side. The Jain Ñātika said to him, “Householder, do you have faith in the ascetic Gotama’s claim that there is a state of immersion without placing the mind and keeping it connected; that there is the cessation of placing the mind and keeping it connected?”

340. This is Mahāvīra, who according to Buddhist accounts died before the Buddha, so if this is a genuine encounter it must have been while the Buddha was still alive. The whole story seems a little parodic, although Citta’s eagerness to trounce Mahāvīra is very much in character.

341. Compare MN 58.

“Sir, in this case I don’t rely on faith in the Buddha’s claim that 2.1
there is a state of immersion without placing the mind and keeping
it connected; that there is the cessation of placing the mind and
keeping it connected.”

When he said this, the Jain Ñātika looked up at his assembly and 2.3
said, “See, good sirs, how straightforward this householder Citta is!
He’s not devious or deceitful at all. To imagine that you can stop
placing the mind and keeping it connected would be like imagining
that you can catch the wind in a net, or dam the Ganges River with
your own hand.”³⁴²

“What do you think, sir? Which is better—knowledge or faith?” 3.1

“Knowledge is definitely better than faith, householder.”³⁴³ 3.3

“Well sir, whenever I want, quite secluded from sensual pleasures, 3.4
secluded from unskillful qualities, I enter and remain in the first
absorption, which has the rapture and bliss born of seclusion, while
placing the mind and keeping it connected. And whenever I want,
as the placing of the mind and keeping it connected are stilled ... I
enter and remain in the second absorption. And whenever I want,
with the fading away of rapture ... I enter and remain in the third
absorption. And whenever I want, giving up pleasure and pain ... I
enter and remain in the fourth absorption.

And so, sir, since I know and see like this, why should I rely on 3.8
faith in another ascetic or brahmin who claims that there is a state of
immersion without placing the mind and keeping it connected; that
there is the cessation of placing the mind and keeping it connected?”

When he said this, the Jain Ñātika looked askance at his own 4.1
assembly and said, “See, good fellows, how crooked this householder
Citta is! He’s so devious and deceitful!”

342. It is not easy to trace details of early Jain meditation. For the most part they focused on austerities and self-mortification, which the Buddha found to be counterproductive to deep meditation (MN 36:33.2).

343. Citta uses the same technique employed so often by the Buddha: start by finding something in common. The superiority of knowledge over faith is a philosophical point in which Buddhism and Jainism are in agreement.

- 5.1 “Sir, just now I understood you to say: ‘See, good fellows, how straightforward this householder Citta is! He’s not devious or deceitful at all.’ But then I understood you to say: ‘See, good fellows, how crooked this householder Citta is! He’s so devious and deceitful!’ If your first statement is true, the second is wrong. If your first statement is wrong, the second is true.
- 5.7 And also, sir, these ten legitimate questions are relevant. When you understand what they mean, then, together with your assembly of Jain ascetics, you can rebut me. ‘One thing: question, summary, and answer.’³⁴⁴ Two ... Three ... Four ... Five ... Six ... Seven ... Eight ... Nine ... Ten things: question, summary, and answer.’”
- 5.19 Then Citta rose from his seat and left without asking the Jain Ñātika these ten legitimate questions.³⁴⁵

SN 41.9

With Kassapa, the Naked Ascetic

Acelakassapasutta

- 1.1 Now at that time the naked ascetic Kassapa, an old friend of Citta in the lay life, had arrived at Macchikāsaṇḍa.³⁴⁶
- 1.2 Citta the householder heard that he had arrived. So he went up to him, and they exchanged greetings.

344. This passage echoes AN 10.27:9.2, where the Buddha recommends asking this series of questions of a sectarian in order to stump them. | The grammar of these questions is peculiar, for which see Bodhi’s note 323 in *Connected Discourses* and 2003 in *Numerical Discourses*.

345. This whole passage is, I think, Pali for: “You are so pwned. Delete your account.”

346. The phrase *purāṇagihisahāya* (“old friend from the lay life”) appears only here and at MN 124:2.1. There it is also said of a naked ascetic (*acela*) called Kassapa, which cannot be a coincidence. The events of that discourse happened many decades after the Buddha’s death.

When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat 1.4
down to one side and said to the naked ascetic Kassapa, “Honorable
Kassapa, how long has it been since you went forth?”

“It’s been thirty years, householder.” 1.6

“But sir, in these thirty years have you achieved any superhuman 1.7
distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones, a
comfortable meditation?”

“I have no such achievement, householder, only nudity, baldness, 1.8
and pokes in the buttocks.”³⁴⁷

Citta said to him, “Oh lord, how incredible, how amazing, how 1.9
well explained the teaching is. For in thirty years you have achieved
no superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the
noble ones, no comfortable meditation, only nudity, baldness, and
pokes in the buttocks.”

“But householder, how long have you been a lay follower?” 2.1

“It’s been thirty years, sir.” 2.2

“But householder, in these thirty years have you achieved any 2.3
superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble
ones, a comfortable meditation?”

“How, sir, could I not?³⁴⁸ For whenever I want, quite secluded 2.4
from sensual pleasures, secluded from unskillful qualities, I enter
and remain in the first absorption, which has the rapture and bliss
born of seclusion, while placing the mind and keeping it connected.
And whenever I want, as the placing of the mind and keeping it
connected are stilled ... I enter and remain in the second absorption.
And whenever I want, with the fading away of rapture ... I enter and
remain in the third absorption. And whenever I want, giving up
pleasure and pain ... I enter and remain in the fourth absorption.

347. For *nippḥoṭanā* (“pokes”), cf. Sanskrit *prasphoṭana*, “striking”. Apparently
a reference to the discomfort of sitting on bare ground with bare buttocks.

348. Read *kiñhi no siyā* per BJT.

- 2.9 If I pass away before the Buddha, it would be no wonder if the Buddha declares of me: ‘The householder Citta is bound by no fetter that might return him to this world.’”³⁴⁹
- 2.11 When this was said, Kassapa said to Citta, “Oh lord, how incredible, how amazing, how well explained the teaching is. For a white-clothed layperson can achieve such a superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones, a comfortable meditation. Householder, may I receive the going forth, the ordination in this teaching and training?”
- 3.1 Then Citta the householder took the naked ascetic Kassapa to see the senior mendicants, and said to them:
- 3.2 “Sirs, this is the naked ascetic Kassapa, who in lay life was an old friend of mine. May the senior monks give him the going forth, the ordination. I’ll make sure that he’s provided with robes, almsfood, lodgings, and medicines and supplies for the sick.”
- 3.5 And the naked ascetic Kassapa received the going forth, the ordination in this teaching and training. Not long after his ordination, Venerable Kassapa, living alone, withdrawn, diligent, keen, and resolute, soon realized the supreme culmination of the spiritual path in this very life. He lived having achieved with his own insight the goal for which gentlemen rightly go forth from the lay life to homelessness.
- 3.7 He understood: “Rebirth is ended; the spiritual journey has been completed; what had to be done has been done; there is nothing further for this place.” And Venerable Kassapa became one of the perfected.

349. That is to say, he was a non-returner.

SN 41.10

Seeing the Sick

Gilānadassanasutta

Now at that time the householder Citta was sick, suffering, gravely ill. 1.1

Then several deities of the parks, forests, trees, and those who haunt the herbs, grass, and big trees came together and said to Citta, “Householder, make a wish to become a wheel-turning monarch in the future!” 1.2

When they said this, Citta said to them, “That too is impermanent! That too will pass! That too will be left behind!” 2.1

When he said this, his friends and colleagues, relatives and kin said, “Be mindful, master! Don’t babble.” 2.3

“What have I said that makes you say that?” 2.5

“It’s because you said: ‘That too is impermanent! That too will pass! That too will be left behind!’” 2.7

“Oh, well, that’s because the deities of the parks, forests, trees, and those who haunt the herbs, grass, and big trees said to me: ‘Householder, make a wish to become a wheel-turning monarch in the future!’ So I said to them: ‘That too is impermanent! That too will pass! That too will be left behind!’” 2.9

“But what reason do they see for saying that to you?” 2.13

“They think: ‘This householder Citta is ethical, of good character. If he makes a wish to become a wheel-turning monarch in the future, his heart’s wish will succeed because of the purity of his ethics. And then as a proper, principled king he will provide proper spirit-offerings.’ That’s the reason they see for saying to me: ‘Householder, make a wish to become a wheel-turning monarch in the future!’ So I said to them: ‘That too is impermanent! That too will pass! That too will be left behind!’” 2.15

“Then, master, advise us!” 3.1

“So you should train like this: 3.2

- 3.3 We will have experiential confidence in the Buddha: ‘That Blessed One is perfected, a fully awakened Buddha, accomplished in knowledge and conduct, holy, knower of the world, supreme guide for those fit for training, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed.’
- 3.5 We will have experiential confidence in the teaching: ‘The teaching is well explained by the Buddha—apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.’
- 3.7 We will have experiential confidence in the Saṅgha: ‘The Saṅgha of the Buddha’s disciples is practicing the way that’s good, direct, systematic, and proper. It consists of the four pairs, the eight individual persons. This is the Saṅgha of the Buddha’s disciples that is worthy of offerings dedicated to the gods, worthy of hospitality, worthy of a religious donation, worthy of greeting with cupped palms, and is the supreme field of merit for the world.’
- 3.9 And we will share without reservation all the gifts available to give in our family with those who are ethical and of good character.”
- 3.10 Then, after Citta had encouraged his friends and colleagues, relatives and kin in the Buddha, the teaching, the Saṅgha, and generosity, he passed away.

The Linked Discourses on Citta the Householder are complete.

LINKED DISCOURSES WITH CHIEFS

The Chapter on Chiefs

SN 42.1

Fury

Caṇḍasutta

1.1 At Sāvattḥī.

1.2 Then Fury the chief went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:³⁵⁰

1.3 “What is the cause, sir, what is the reason why some people are regarded as furious, while others are regarded as gentle?”

1.5 “Take someone who hasn’t given up greed. So they get annoyed by others, and they show it. They’re regarded as furious. They haven’t given up hate. So they get annoyed by others, and they show it. They’re regarded as furious. They haven’t given up delusion. So they get annoyed by others, and they show it. They’re regarded as furious. This is the cause, this is the reason why some people are regarded as furious.

350. “Fury” (*caṇḍa*) is a descriptive epithet used as a nickname. Such nicknames were a feature of the culture. Sometimes, texts invent a character as a vehicle for the teaching; such artifice may well have been intentional and received as such. By translating such names where appropriate, I aim to call attention to the way names are used to add a dimension of meaning. | *Gāmaṇi* is literally a “village headman”. Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 5.4.4.18 establishes that the village headman ranks beneath the *sūta* (“equerry”, see SN 19.8:1.4 and note). However, it is used for a chief in general: in the next Sutta it is a “dancing master”, and in the one after that, a military rank.

But take someone who has given up greed. So they don't get 2.1
 annoyed by others, and don't show it. They're regarded as gentle.
 They've given up hate. So they don't get annoyed by others, and
 don't show it. They're regarded as gentle. They've given up delusion.
 So they don't get annoyed by others, and don't show it. They're
 regarded as gentle. This is the cause, this is the reason why some
 people are regarded as gentle."

When he said this, Fury the chief said to the Buddha, "Excellent, 3.1
 sir! Excellent! As if he were righting the overturned, or revealing the
 hidden, or pointing out the path to the lost, or lighting a lamp in the
 dark so people with clear eyes can see what's there, the Buddha has
 made the teaching clear in many ways. I go for refuge to the Buddha,
 to the teaching, and to the mendicant Saṅgha. From this day forth,
 may the Buddha remember me as a lay follower who has gone for
 refuge for life."

SN 42.2

With Tālapuṭa

Tālapuṭasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha in the Bamboo 1.1
 Grove, the squirrels' feeding ground. Then Tālapuṭa the dancing
 chief came up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said
 to him:³⁵¹

351. His verses at Thag 19.1 speak eloquently of the tension between the worldly and the spiritual life. | The name *tālapuṭa* is explained by the commentary as due to his face being the color of a fresh palmyra fruit (*tāla*). This, however, leaves the element *puṭa* ("pouch") unexplained. *Tālapuṭa* is known in Jain texts as a kind of poison (Uttarādhyayana Sūtra 16, verse 13; Trīṣaṣṭīśalākāpuruṣa Caritra 1.2). *Tāla* can mean "yellow orpiment", a kind of arsenic used for coloring (Thig 14.1:28.1), so *tālapuṭa* would mean "pouch of arsenic". As to why someone would have such a name, the protagonist of Isibhāsiyāim 10.13—a government minister (*amacca*) named Tetaliṭṭa—recounts having survived *tālapuṭa* poisoning. His life was, it seems, a series of tragedies leading him to an elaborate series of failed suicide attempts. While his story is unlike Tālapuṭa's,

- 1.3 “Sir, I have heard that the dancers of the past who were tutors of tutors said: ‘Suppose a dancer entertains and amuses people on a stage or at a festival with mixed truth and lies. When their body breaks up, after death, they’re reborn in the company of laughing gods.’ What does the Buddha say about this?”
- 1.6 “Enough, chief, let it be. Don’t ask me that.”
- 1.7 For a second time ...
- 1.12 And for a third time Tālapuṭa said to the Buddha:
- 1.13 “Sir, I have heard that the dancers of the past who were tutors of tutors said: ‘Suppose a dancer entertains and amuses people on a stage or at a festival with mixed truth and lies. When their body breaks up, after death, they’re reborn in the company of laughing gods.’ What does the Buddha say about this?”
- 2.1 “Clearly, chief, I’m not getting through to you when I say: ‘Enough, chief, let it be. Don’t ask me that.’ Nevertheless, I will answer you.
- 2.5 When sentient beings are still not free of greed, and are still bound by greed, a dancer in a stage or festival presents them with even more arousing things. When sentient beings are still not free of hate, and are still bound by hate, a dancer in a stage or festival presents them with even more hateful things. When sentient beings are still not free of delusion, and are still bound by delusion, a dancer in a stage or festival presents them with even more delusory things. And so, being heedless and negligent themselves, they’ve encouraged others to be heedless and negligent. When their body breaks up, after death, they’re reborn in the hell called ‘Laughter’.
- 2.12 But if you have such a view: ‘Suppose a dancer entertains and amuses people on a stage or at a festival with mixed truth and lies. When their body breaks up, after death, they’re reborn in the com-

the rhetoric is curiously similar: both rely on repeated, plaintive rhetorical questions to express emotional torment; for Tālapuṭa it is “when will it be?”, for Tetaliṭputta “who will believe me?” I wonder whether these stories share some connection. Perhaps the similar-sounding names have become confused, or perhaps he became known for the poison he survived.

pany of laughing gods.’ This is your wrong view. An individual with wrong view is reborn in one of two places, I say:³⁵² hell or the animal realm.”

When he said this, Tālapuṭa cried and burst out in tears. 3.1

“This is what I didn’t get through to you when I said: ‘Enough, chief, let it be. Don’t ask me that.’” 3.2

“Sir, I’m not crying because of what the Buddha said. But sir, for a long time I’ve been cheated, tricked, and deceived by the dancers of the past who were tutors of tutors, who said: ‘Suppose a dancer entertains and amuses people on a stage or at a festival with mixed truth and lies. When their body breaks up, after death, they’re reborn in the company of laughing gods.’” 3.4

Excellent, sir! Excellent! As if he were righting the overturned, or revealing the hidden, or pointing out the path to the lost, or lighting a lamp in the dark so people with clear eyes can see what’s there, the Buddha has made the teaching clear in many ways. I go for refuge to the Buddha, to the teaching, and to the mendicant Saṅgha. Sir, may I receive the going forth, the ordination in the Buddha’s presence?” 3.7

And Tālapuṭa the dancing chief received the going forth, the ordination in the Buddha’s presence. Not long after his ordination, Venerable Tālapuṭa became one of the perfected. 3.11

SN 42.3

A Warrior

Yodhājīvasutta

Then Dustin the warrior chief went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:³⁵³ 1.1

352. Also at MN 57:3.4, DN 12:10.15.

353. A “warrior” (*yodhājīva*) is a professional soldier. I have taken the liberty of using the name “Dustin” in honor of Dustin Cheah, my sponsor while making this translation in Qi Mei, Taiwan. Dustin (literally “Thor’s stone”) has the connotation of “valiant fighter”. | Together with the following discourses, these make up three of the four branches of the military: foot soldiers, elephant

- 1.2 “Sir, I have heard that the warriors of the past who were tutors of tutors said: ‘Suppose a warrior, while striving and struggling in battle, is killed and finished off by his foes. When his body breaks up, after death, he’s reborn in the company of the gods of the fallen.’ What does the Buddha say about this?”
- 1.5 “Enough, chief, let it be. Don’t ask me that.”
- 1.6 For a second time ...
- 1.7 And for a third time Dustin the warrior chief said to the Buddha:
- 1.8 “Sir, I have heard that the warriors of the past who were tutors of tutors said: ‘Suppose a warrior, while striving and struggling in battle, is killed and finished off by his foes. When his body breaks up, after death, he’s reborn in the company of the gods of the fallen.’ What does the Buddha say about this?”
- 2.1 “Clearly, chief, I’m not getting through to you when I say: ‘Enough, chief, let it be. Don’t ask me that.’ Nevertheless, I will answer you.
- 2.4 When a warrior strives and struggles in battle, their mind is already low, degraded, and misdirected as they think: ‘May these sentient beings be killed, slaughtered, slain, destroyed, or annihilated!’ His foes kill him and finish him off, and when his body breaks up, after death, he’s reborn in the hell called ‘The Fallen.’³⁵⁴
- 2.8 But if you have such a view: ‘Suppose a warrior, while striving and struggling in battle, is killed and finished off by his foes. When his body breaks up, after death, he’s reborn in the company of the gods of the fallen.’ This is your wrong view. An individual with wrong view is reborn in one of two places, I say: hell or the animal realm.”

marshals, and cavalry. Sanskrit dictionaries acknowledge *grāmaṇī* as a military officer as well as a village headman.

354. Another instance of kamma at death influencing rebirth is found at MN 97:38.7, where Dhanañjāni the corrupt tax collector has a deathbed conversion and goes to heaven. In Theravada circles today, it is commonly held that one’s mental state at death determines one’s rebirth. These examples show that this is true only in exceptional cases where one is actively making strong good or bad kamma at the time of death.

When he said this, Dustin the warrior chief cried and burst out in tears. 3.1

“This is what I didn’t get through to you when I said: ‘Enough, chief, let it be. Don’t ask me that.’” 3.2

“Sir, I’m not crying because of what the Buddha said. But sir, for a long time I’ve been cheated, tricked, and deceived by the warriors of the past who were tutors of tutors, who said: ‘Suppose a warrior, while striving and struggling in battle, is killed and finished off by his foes. When his body breaks up, after death, he’s reborn in the company of the gods of the fallen.’” 3.4

Excellent, sir! Excellent! ... From this day forth, may the Buddha remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.” 3.7

SN 42.4

An Elephant Marshal

Hatthārohasutta

Then an elephant marshal chief went up to the Buddha ...³⁵⁵ “From this day forth, may the Buddha remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.” 1.1

SN 42.5

A Cavalryman

Assārohasutta

Then a cavalry chief went up to the Buddha ... 1.1

“From this day forth, may the Buddha remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.” 4.1

355. This discourse and the next are to be expanded per SN 42.3.

SN 42.6

With Asibandhaka's Son

Asibandhakaputtasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Nālandā in Pāvārika's Mango Grove.³⁵⁶
- 1.2 Then Asibandhaka's son the chief went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:³⁵⁷
- 2.1 "Sir, there are western brahmins garlanded with aquatic flowers who carry pitchers, immerse themselves in water, and serve the sacred flame.³⁵⁸ When someone has passed away, oh! they lift them

356. Pāvārika means "blanket-weaver". Places were often named for their primary economic activity. Probably there was a community of blanket weavers and the park was owned by their leading merchant. See too note at MN 56:2.1.

357. Asibandhaka's son appears in each discourse up to SN 42.9. His father's name "Swordstrap", following on the previous discourses, suggests a military connection (cf. *asibaddha*, "sword-strapped", Śāṅkhāyana Śrautasūtra 14.22.20); but the texts do not confirm this.

358. The "western brahmins" (*brāhmaṇā pacchā bhūmakā*) hail from lands such as Kuru and Pañcālā or further west to Gandhārā. They are depicted as adherents of ritualism, in contrast with the brahmins of the lands of the Buddha, especially Kosala, who were more aligned with the contemplative and philosophical teachings of the Upaniṣads. This tension is felt in the Upaniṣads themselves, as Yājñavalkya is accused of flouting the teachings of the Vedic scholars of Kuru and Pañcālā (Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 3.9.19). | A "pitcher" (*kāmaṇḍalu*) of water was carried at all times to ensure personal hygiene (Manu 4.36). | I have not been able to identify the practice of "garlanding with aquatic flowers" (*sevālamālikā*). The term appears a couple of times in the Harivaṁsa (*śaivālamala*), but of trees (55.53) or a disheveled woman (83.38), where it seems to mean "moss". It seems unlikely that brahmins would smear moss on themselves. The commentary says, "Bright and early, having taken *sevāla* or lotus, etc. from the water, they make a decorative garland for the sake of identifying those who believe in purification by water." The emphasis on collecting the flowers at dawn hints at a connection with the Sun, who rises from the ocean each day (cf. Sāhityakaumudī 10.258). The malicious *yakkha* of DN 23:23.13 intimates the presence of water with his garland of yellow lotus (*kumudamāli*); he appears on a trade journey, probably to the west. The plant was probably a

up, send them well, and convey them to heaven.³⁵⁹ But what about the Blessed One, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha: is he able to ensure that the whole world will be reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm when their body breaks up, after death?”

“Well then, chief, I’ll ask you about this in return, and you can answer as you like. 3.1

What do you think, chief? Take a person who kills living creatures, steals, and commits sexual misconduct. They use speech that’s false, backbiting, harsh, or nonsensical. And they’re covetous, malicious, and have wrong view. A large crowd were to come together to offer up supplication and entreaty, circumambulating them with cupped palms and saying:³⁶⁰ ‘When this person’s body breaks up, after death, may they be reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm!’ What do you think, chief? Would that person be reborn in heaven because of their supplications?”³⁶¹ 4.1

“No, sir.” 4.7

“Chief, suppose a person were to throw a broad rock into a deep lake. And a large crowd were to come together to offer up supplication and entreaty, circumambulating it with cupped palms, and saying: ‘Rise, good rock! Float, good rock! Float to shore, good rock!’ What do you think, chief? Would that broad rock rise up or float because of their supplications?” 5.1

“No, sir.” 5.6

“In the same way, take a person who kills living creatures, steals, and commits sexual misconduct. They use speech that’s false, backbiting, harsh, or nonsensical. And they’re covetous, malicious, and have wrong view. Even though a large crowd were to come together 5.7

kind of *Vallisneria*, which grows profusely underwater, sending its small white flowers to the surface.

359. I take the particle *nāma* here as indicating wonder. | Resolve *saññāpentī* as *saṃ yāpentī*, “they send them well”.

360. For “supplication” (*āyācana*) see too AN 5.43:3.1 and DN 13:16.2. | For *anuparisakkeyya* (“circumambulate”), see Sanskrit *ṣvaṣk*, “go, move”.

361. The Buddha argues that personal action rather than religious ritual determines rebirth.

to offer up supplication and entreaty ... when their body breaks up, after death, they're reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell.

6.1 What do you think, chief? Take a person who doesn't kill living creatures, steal, or commit sexual misconduct. They don't use speech that's false, backbiting, harsh, or nonsensical. And they're contented, kind-hearted, with right view. And a large crowd were to come together to offer up supplication and entreaty, circumambulating them with cupped palms and saying: 'When this person's body breaks up, after death, may they be reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell!' What do you think, chief? Would that person be reborn in hell because of their supplications?"

6.7 "No, sir."

7.1 "Chief, suppose a person were to sink a pot of ghee or oil into a deep lake and break it open. Its shards and chips would sink down, while the ghee or oil in it would rise up.³⁶² And a large crowd were to come together to offer up supplication and entreaty, circumambulating it with cupped palms and saying: 'Sink, good ghee or oil! Descend, good ghee or oil! Go down, good ghee or oil!' What do you think, chief? Would that ghee or oil sink and descend because of their supplications?"

7.6 "No, sir."

8.1 "In the same way, take a person who doesn't kill living creatures, steal, or commit sexual misconduct. They don't use speech that's false, backbiting, harsh, or nonsensical. And they're contented, kind-hearted, with right view. Even though a large crowd were to come together to offer up supplication and entreaty ... when their body breaks up, after death, they're reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm."

362. At Chāndogya Upaniṣad 6.6.2–3, Uddālaka compares the ghee that arises as curd is churned to the mind.

When he said this, Asibandhaka's son the chief said to the Buddha, 8.4
 "Excellent, sir! ... From this day forth, may the Buddha remember
 me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life."

SN 42.7

The Simile of the Field

Khettūpamasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying near Nālandā in Pāvārika's 1.1
 Mango Grove. Then Asibandhaka's son the chief went up to the
 Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:

"Sir, doesn't the Buddha live full of sympathy for all living beings?" 1.3

"Yes, chief." 1.4

"So why then, sir, do you teach some people thoroughly and others 1.5
 less thoroughly?"

"Well then, chief, I'll ask you about this in return, and you can 1.6
 answer as you like. What do you think? Suppose a farmer has three
 fields: one is good, one is average, and one is poor—bad ground of
 sand and salt. What do you think? When that farmer wants to plant
 seeds, where would he plant them first: the good field, the average
 one, or the poor one?"

"Sir, he'd plant them first in the good field, then the average, then 1.9
 he may or may not plant seed in the poor field. Why is that? Because
 at least it can be fodder for the cattle."

"To me, the monks and nuns are like the good field. I teach them 2.1
 the Dhamma that's good in the beginning, good in the middle, and
 good in the end, meaningful and well-phrased. And I reveal a spiri-
 tual practice that's entirely full and pure. Why is that? Because they
 live with me as their island, asylum, shelter, and refuge.³⁶³

To me, the laymen and laywomen are like the average field. I also 2.5
 teach them the Dhamma that's good in the beginning, good in the

363. Compare AN 3.51:2.4.

middle, and good in the end, meaningful and well-phrased. And I reveal a spiritual practice that's entirely full and pure.³⁶⁴ Why is that? Because they live with me as their island, asylum, shelter, and refuge.

2.9 To me, the ascetics, brahmins, and wanderers of other religions are like the poor field, the bad ground of sand and salt. I also teach them the Dhamma that's good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, meaningful and well-phrased. And I reveal a spiritual practice that's entirely full and pure. Why is that? Hopefully they might understand even a single sentence, which would be for their lasting welfare and happiness.

3.1 Suppose a person had three water jars: one that's uncracked and nonporous; one that's uncracked but porous; and one that's cracked and porous. What do you think? When that person wants to store water, where would they store it first: in the jar that's uncracked and nonporous, the one that's uncracked but porous, or the one that's cracked and porous?"

3.3 "Sir, they'd store water first in the jar that's uncracked and nonporous, then the one that's uncracked but porous, then they may or may not store water in the one that's cracked and porous. Why is that? Because at least it can be used for washing the dishes."

4.1 "To me, the monks and nuns are like the water jar that's uncracked and nonporous. I teach them the Dhamma that's good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, meaningful and well-phrased. And I reveal a spiritual practice that's entirely full and pure. Why is that? Because they live with me as their island, asylum, shelter, and refuge.

4.5 To me, the laymen and laywomen are like the water jar that's uncracked but porous. I also teach them the Dhamma that's good in

364. In the context of renunciate life, *brahmacariya* implies "celibacy" (DN 1:1.8.5), the explanation being that Brahṃā, as a being created by the practice of absorption, is beyond sensual desires. In the Brahmanical system, it referred to the period of study of a chaste young man under a teacher before marriage. Here, however, we see that it is used of layfolk in a more general sense of "spiritual practice" or "divine conduct".

the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, meaningful and well-phrased. And I reveal a spiritual practice that's entirely full and pure.³⁶⁵ Why is that? Because they live with me as their island, asylum, shelter, and refuge.

To me, the ascetics, brahmins, and wanderers of other religions 4.9
are like the water jar that's cracked and porous. I also teach them the Dhamma that's good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, meaningful and well-phrased. And I reveal a spiritual practice that's entirely full and pure. Why is that? Hopefully they might understand even a single sentence, which would be for their lasting welfare and happiness.”

When he said this, Asibandhaka's son the chief said to the Buddha, 5.1
“Excellent, sir! Excellent! ... From this day forth, may the Buddha remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.”

SN 42.8

A Horn Blower

Saṅkhadhamasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying near Nāḷandā in Pāvārika's 1.1
Mango Grove.

Then Asibandhaka's son the chief, who was a disciple of the Jains, 1.2
went up to the Buddha, and sat down to one side. The Buddha said to him, “Chief, how does the Jain ascetic of the Ñātika clan teach his disciples?”

“Sir, this is how the Jain Ñātika teaches his disciples: ‘Everyone 1.4
who kills a living creature, steals, commits sexual misconduct, or lies goes to a place of loss, to hell. You're led on by what you frequently live by.’³⁶⁶ This is how the Jain Ñātika teaches his disciples.”

365. Here and below read *tesaṃ pāhaṃ* for text's *tesāhaṃ*.

366. This saying echoes Sūtrakṛtāṅga 1.5.1.4–5, but appears to misrepresent the Jain text. There, Mahāvīra says a person who “relentlessly kills movable and immovable beings for the sake of his own comfort, who injures them, who takes

- 1.8 “‘You’re led on by what you usually live by’: if this were true, then, according to what the Jain Ñātika says, no one would go to a place of loss, to hell.
- 2.1 What do you think, chief? Take a person who kills living creatures. If we compare periods of time during the day and night, which is more frequent: the occasions when they’re killing or when they’re not killing?”
- 2.3 “The occasions when they’re killing are less frequent, while the occasions when they’re not killing are more frequent.”
- 2.4 “‘You’re led on by what you usually live by’: if this were true, then, according to what the Jain ascetic of the Ñātika clan says, no one would go to a place of loss, to hell.
- 3.1 What do you think, chief? Take a person who steals ...
- 4.1 Take a person who commits sexual misconduct ...
- 5.1 Take a person who lies. If we compare periods of time during the day and night, which is more frequent: the occasions when they’re lying or when they’re not lying?”
- 5.2 “The occasions when they’re lying are less frequent, while the occasions when they’re not lying are more frequent.”

what is not freely given, who does not train at all in what is to be cultivated, the impudent sinner who, unsated, injures many beings will go to hell” (translation adapted from Jacobi). The closeness of the two passages is shown by the form: the first phrase speaks of the ill deeds that are done, while the second phrase in both cases uses the word *bahuṇa/bahula*, “frequently, repeatedly, usually”. The use of “relentlessly” (*tivva*, Pali *tibba*, Sanskrit *tīrva*) implies a violent and excessive action. As quoted in the Pali, the first phrase of Mahāvīra’s view suggests that anyone at all who kills will go to hell. This sense is conveyed through the emphatic distributive pronoun *yo koci* (“everyone who”), whereas the Jain text has the unemphatic *je* (“one who”). The Jain text restricts the distributive to one who does not train “at all” (*kimci*). Thus the thrust of the Jain passage is that one who frequently kills for their own pleasure, without even trying to do better, will go to hell. The sense of the Pali passage is both more severe and less coherent, as the first phrase implies that any killer goes to hell, while the second speaks of habitual action.

“You’re led on by what you usually live by’: if this were true, then, 5.3
according to what the Jain *Nātika* says, no one would go to a place
of loss, to hell.

Take some teacher who has this doctrine and view: ‘Everyone 6.1
who kills a living creature, steals, commits sexual misconduct, or
lies goes to a place of loss, to hell.’ And there’s a disciple who is
devoted to that teacher. They think: ‘My teacher has this doctrine
and view: “Everyone who kills a living creature, steals, commits
sexual misconduct, or lies goes to a place of loss, to hell.” But I’ve
killed living creatures ... stolen ... committed sexual misconduct
... or lied.’ They get the view: ‘I too am going to a place of loss, to
hell.’ Unless they give up that speech and that thought, and let go of
that view, they will be placed in hell as if delivered there.

But consider when a Realized One arises in the world, perfected, 7.1
a fully awakened Buddha, accomplished in knowledge and conduct,
holy, knower of the world, supreme guide for those fit for training,
teacher of gods and humans, awakened, blessed. In many ways he
criticizes and denounces killing living creatures, saying: ‘Stop killing
living creatures!’ He criticizes and denounces stealing ... sexual
misconduct ... lying, saying: ‘Stop lying!’ And there’s a disciple
who is devoted to that teacher.³⁶⁷ Then they reflect: ‘In many ways
the Buddha criticizes and denounces killing living creatures, saying:
“Stop killing living creatures!” But I have killed living creatures to a
certain extent. That’s not right, it’s not good, and I feel remorseful
because of it. But I can’t undo what I have done.’ Reflecting like
this, they give up killing living creatures, and in future they don’t kill
living creatures. That’s how to give up this bad deed and get past it.

‘In many ways the Buddha criticizes and denounces stealing ...’ 8.1

‘In many ways the Buddha criticizes and denounces sexual mis- 9.1
conduct ...’

367. The following passage shows a healthy response to one’s own ethical lapses,
lost neither in guilt nor in denial, but acknowledging the mistake and determin-
ing to do better.

- 10.1 ‘In many ways the Buddha criticizes and denounces lying, saying: “Stop lying!” But I have lied to a certain extent. That’s not right, it’s not good, and I feel remorseful because of it. But I can’t undo what I have done.’ Reflecting like this, they give up lying, and in future they refrain from lying. That’s how to give up this bad deed and get past it.
- 11.1 They give up killing living creatures.³⁶⁸ They give up stealing. They give up sexual misconduct. They give up lying. They give up backbiting. They give up harsh speech. They give up talking nonsense. They give up covetousness. They give up ill will and malevolence. They give up wrong view and have right view.
- 12.1 That noble disciple is rid of desire, rid of ill will, unconfused, aware, and mindful. They meditate spreading a heart full of love to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full of love to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will.³⁶⁹ Suppose there was a powerful horn blower. They’d easily make themselves heard in the four quarters.³⁷⁰ In the same way, when the heart’s release by love has been developed and cultivated like this, any limited deeds they’ve done don’t remain or persist there.³⁷¹

368. These are the “ten ways of doing skillful deeds” (*dasakusalakammāpathā*). There is a detailed explanation at MN 41:7.1.

369. Established on skillful deeds of body, speech, and mind, they undertake the set of four meditations known in later traditions as either the “divine meditations” (*brahmavihārā*) or the “immeasurables” (*appamaññā*). These are four wholesome emotional states that can be developed as a basis for *samādhi*. They were evidently pre-Buddhist, although they have not been traced as a group in pre-Buddhist texts. However, they are shared with later non-Buddhist texts such as Yogasūtra 1.33 and the Jain Tattvārthasūtra 7.11. | “Love” (*mettā*) is a universal positive regard and well-wishing free of personal desires or attachments.

370. See MN 99:24.4, DN 13:77.1.

371. The mind in *jhāna* is so powerful that it effectively overrides any limited kamma, including ordinary good or bad deeds. Unless they have committed serious crimes with a fixed kammic result such as matricide, etc., the meditator will be reborn in a Brahmā realm.

Then that noble disciple is rid of desire, rid of ill will, unconfused, 13.1 aware, and mindful. They meditate spreading a heart full of compassion ...³⁷² They meditate spreading a heart full of rejoicing ...³⁷³ They meditate spreading a heart full of equanimity to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full of equanimity to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will.³⁷⁴ Suppose there was a powerful horn blower. They'd easily make themselves heard in the four quarters. In the same way, when the heart's release by equanimity has been developed and cultivated like this, any limited deeds they've done don't remain or persist there."

When he said this, Asibandhaka's son the chief said to the Buddha, 14.1 "Excellent, sir! Excellent! ... From this day forth, may the Buddha remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life."

SN 42.9

Families

Kulasutta

At one time the Buddha was wandering in the land of the Kosalans 1.1 together with a large Saṅgha of mendicants when he arrived at Nāḷa-ndā.³⁷⁵ There he stayed near Nāḷandā in Pāvārika's Mango Grove.

372. "Compassion" (*karuṇā*) is the quality of empathy with the suffering of another or oneself and the wish to remove it.

373. "Rejoicing" (*muditā*) is joyful celebration in the success of others or oneself, free of jealousy or cynicism.

374. Equanimity (*upekkhā*) is literally "close watching", not interfering but standing ready when needed. It is not indifference, which is why it emerges only at the end, after the positive emotions are developed.

375. There seems to be some confusion in the location, as Nāḷandā is in Magadha, not Kosala. See notes below and another possible confusion at SN 42.11:1.1.

- 2.1 Now at that time Nālandā was undergoing famine and scarcity, with crops blighted and turned to straw.³⁷⁶ At that time the Jain ascetic of the Nātika clan was residing at Nālandā together with a large assembly of Jain ascetics.³⁷⁷ Then Asibandhaka's son the chief, who was a disciple of the Jains, went up to the Jain Nātika, bowed, and sat down to one side. The Jain Nātika said to him:
- 2.4 "Come, chief, refute the ascetic Gotama's doctrine. Then you will get a good reputation: 'Asibandhaka's son the chief refuted the doctrine of the ascetic Gotama, so mighty and powerful!'"
- 3.1 "But sir, how am I to do this?"
- 3.2 "Here, brahmin, go to the ascetic Gotama and say to him: 'Sir, don't you in many ways praise kindness, protection, and sympathy for families?' When he's asked this, if he answers: 'Indeed I do, chief,' say this to him: 'So what then are you doing, wandering together with this large Saṅgha of mendicants during a time of famine and scarcity, with crops blighted and turned to straw?'³⁷⁸ The Buddha is practicing to annihilate, collapse, and ruin families!³⁷⁹ When you put this dilemma to him, the Buddha won't be able to either spit it out or swallow it down."

376. Read *duhitikā setaṭṭikā* as proposed by von Hinüber ("The Ghost Word Dvīṭhitikā and the Description of Famines in Early Buddhist Literature") and adopted by Bodhi (*Connected Discourses*, note on this passage).

377. Jain tradition holds that Mahāvira passed at a Pāvā near Nālandā. Buddhist texts know only the Pāvā of the Mallians to the north. Evidently there has been some confusion, and perhaps "Pāvārika's mango grove", the site of discussions with Jains here and at MN 56, is the Pāvā known to the Jains. Note, however, that the earliest Jain source for Mahāvira's passing, the Kalpasutra, does not say where Pāvā is. But it does say the events were commemorated by the rulers of Kāsī and Kosala, and the Mallians and the Licchavis. The absence of Magadha and the presence of Malla sit better with the location of Pāvā in Malla rather than Magadha. Malla bordered Kosala and may have been considered under its sway (as was Sakya).

378. Cf. Mahākassapa's criticism of Ānanda at SN 16.11.

379. Renunciates, relying on alms offered by the lay community, were careful to not put them under undue pressure. This is discussed often in the Vinaya, for example the introduction to Bu Ss 6.

“Yes, sir,” replied Asibandhaka’s son. He rose from his seat, bowed, 3.9
and respectfully circled the Jain Nātika, keeping him on his right.
Then he went to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said
to him:

“Sir, don’t you in many ways praise kindness, protection, and 4.1
sympathy for families?”

“Indeed I do, chief.” 4.2

“So what then are you doing, wandering together with this large 4.3
Saṅgha of mendicants during a time of famine and scarcity, with
crops blighted and turned to straw? The Buddha is practicing to
annihilate, collapse, and ruin families!”

“Well, chief, I recollect ninety-one eons back but I’m not aware 4.5
of any family that’s been ruined merely by offering some cooked
almsfood.³⁸⁰ Rather, rich, affluent, and wealthy families—with lots
of gold and silver, lots of property and assets, and lots of money
and grain—all acquired their wealth because of giving, truth, and
restraint.³⁸¹

Chief, there are eight causes and reasons for the ruin of families. 4.7
Their ruin stems from rulers, bandits, fire, or flood. Or they lose their
savings. Or their business fails due to not applying themselves to
work. Or a wastrel is born into the family who squanders and fritters
away their wealth. And impermanence is the eighth.³⁸² These are
the eight causes and reasons for the ruin of families.

Given that these eight reasons are found, suppose someone says 4.10
this: “The Buddha is practicing to annihilate, collapse, and ruin fami-

380. This is the time of the Buddha Vipassī (DN 14:1.4.1).

381. Read *saññama* (“restraint”) per BJT and PTS rather than MS *sāmañña* (“equality”). Compare the stock list, “giving, self-control, restraint, and truthfulness” (SN 42.13:18.6).

382. This passage is unique, but see SN 3.19:3.3, MN 14:9.3, AN 8.54:3.4. | Follow MS reading *nihitaṃ vā ṭhānā vigacchati*, “what is laid down disappears from its place” i.e. they lose their savings. BJT and PTS have *nihitaṃ vā nādhigacchati*, “does not find their savings”. Compare Kp 8:4.1, *nidhi vā ṭhānā cavati*, “savings shift from their place”.

lies!’ Unless they give up that speech and that thought, and let go of that view, they will be placed in hell as if delivered there.”

- 5.1 When he said this, Asibandhaka’s son the chief said to the Buddha, “Excellent, sir! Excellent! ... From this day forth, may the Buddha remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.”

SN 42.10

With Mañicūḷaka

Mañicūḷakasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the squirrels’ feeding ground.³⁸³ Now at that time while the king’s retinue was sitting together in the royal compound this discussion came up among them, “Gold and currency are proper for ascetics who follow the Sakyan. They accept and receive gold and currency.”³⁸⁴
- 2.1 Now at that time the chief Mañicūḷaka was sitting in that assembly.³⁸⁵ He said to that retinue, “Good masters, don’t say that. Gold and currency are not proper for ascetics who follow the Sakyan. They neither accept nor receive gold and currency. They have set aside gems and gold, and quit using gold and currency.” He was able to persuade that assembly.
- 2.6 Then Mañicūḷaka went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and told him what had happened. He then said, “Answering this way, I trust that I repeat what the Buddha has said, and don’t misrepresent him with an untruth. I trust my explanation is in line with

383. A century after the Buddha, the use of money by the mendicants of Vesāli precipitated a crisis in the Saṅgha. This led to the Second Council, at which the prohibition was reaffirmed. The current discourse is one of several cited against the use of money (Kd 22:1.4.1).

384. Literally “gold and silver” (*jātarūparajata*), but *rajata* is explained in Bu NP 18:2.8 as currency made from any material that serves as a medium of exchange.

385. Despite his impressive name (“Jeweled Crest”), this chief does not appear elsewhere.

the teaching, and that there are no legitimate grounds for rebuttal or criticism.”

“Indeed, in answering this way you repeat what I’ve said, and don’t 3.1
misrepresent me with an untruth. Your explanation is in line with
the teaching, and there are no legitimate grounds for rebuttal or
criticism.

Gold and currency are not proper for ascetics who follow the 3.2
Sakyan. They neither accept nor receive gold and currency. They
have set aside gems and gold, and quit using gold and currency.

If gold and currency were proper for them, then the five kinds of 3.3
sensual stimulation would also be proper. And if the five kinds of
sensual stimulation are proper for them, you should categorically
regard them as not having the qualities of an ascetic or a follower of
the Sakyan.

Rather, chief, I say this: Straw may be looked for by one needing 3.5
straw; wood may be looked for by one needing wood; a cart may be
looked for by one needing a cart; a workman may be looked for by
one needing a workman.³⁸⁶ But in any case, there is no way they can
accept or look for gold and currency, I say.”

SN 42.11

With Bhadraka

Bhadrakasutta

At one time the Buddha was staying in the land of the Mallas, near the 1.1
Mallian town named Uruvelakappa.³⁸⁷ Then Bhadraka the village

386. This principle is still followed today. Mendicants generally should not ask for things. But they may ask for necessities from appropriate people, such as monastery attendants, people who have offered an invitation, or relatives.

387. Uruvelakappa of the Mallas is mentioned a few times in the Suttas (SN 48.52:1.2, AN 9.41:1.1). Elsewhere I can only find an Urubilvākalpa in the Lalitavistara (Vaidya 297), which however is apparently a town past Gāyā in Magadha.

chief went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:³⁸⁸

1.3 “Please, sir, let the Blessed One teach me the origin and disappearance of suffering.”³⁸⁹

1.4 “Chief, if I were to teach you about the origin and disappearance of suffering in connection with the past, saying ‘this is how it was in the past,’ you might have doubts or uncertainties about that.³⁹⁰ If I were to teach you about the origin and disappearance of suffering in connection with the future, saying ‘this is how it will be in the future,’ you might have doubts or uncertainties about that. Rather, chief, I will teach you about the origin and disappearance of suffering as I am sitting right here and you are sitting right there. Listen and apply your mind well, I will speak.”

1.10 “Yes, sir,” Bhadraka replied. The Buddha said this:

2.1 “What do you think, chief? Are there any people here in Uruvelakappa who, if they were executed, imprisoned, fined, or condemned, it would cause you sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress?”³⁹¹

2.3 “There are, sir.”

388. Bhadraka appears only here.

389. While this might seem like a generic question, the phrase “origin and disappearance of suffering” appears elsewhere only in the context of dependent origination (SN 12.43:1.2, SN 35.106:1.1). It is unusual to see an obscure lay person directly asking on this topic. The Buddha’s response shows that he did not think Bhadraka would understand the standard explanation, in terms of the arising of sense activity leading to continuation of rebirth. But rather than dismissing the problem as too hard, he takes an approach that Bhadraka can relate to.

390. Dependent origination is realized at the time of stream-entry, when a person finally overcomes all doubt, including doubts such as “Did I exist in the past?” or “Will I exist on the future?”

391. Notice that, while the Buddha is focusing on the present, he does not mean narrowly, “the present moment arisen in awareness”. It is a broader sense of present requiring reflection and inference regarding hypotheticals.

“But are there any people here in Uruvelakappa who, if they were executed, imprisoned, fined, or condemned, it would not cause you sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress?” 2.4

“There are, sir.” 2.5

“What’s the cause, chief, what’s the reason why, if this was to happen to some people it could cause you sorrow, while if it happens to others it does not?” 2.6

“The people regarding whom this would give rise to sorrow are those I have desire and passion.³⁹² The people regarding whom this would not give rise to sorrow are those I don’t have desire and passion.” 2.7

“With this present phenomenon that you have seen, understood, immediately attained, and fathomed, you can apply the same method to the past and future:³⁹³ ‘All the suffering that arose in the past was rooted and sourced in desire. For desire is the root of suffering. All the suffering that will arise in the future will be rooted and sourced in desire. For desire is the root of suffering.’” 2.9

“It’s incredible, sir, it’s amazing! How well said this was by the Buddha! ‘All the suffering that arises is rooted and sourced in desire.³⁹⁴ For desire is the root of suffering.’³⁹⁵” 2.14

I have a boy called Ciravāsi, who resides in a house away from here. I rise early and dispatch someone, saying: ‘Go, lad, and check on my boy Ciravāsi.’ Until they get back I worry: ‘I hope nothing’s wrong with Ciravāsi!’” 2.18

392. The Buddha has led him to realize for himself the crucial link in dependent origination: suffering stems from craving.

393. Compare the “inferential knowledge” of SN 12.33. The Buddha wants him to understand that this dynamic does not just apply to his present situation, but to any possible life in the past or future.

394. The Buddha has not in fact said this exact line, although he subsequently endorses Bhadraka’s words. Perhaps the phrase has been lost from the text above.

395. While Bhadraka endorses the Buddha’s teaching, his response is still limited to his experience in this life, despite the Buddha urging him to apply it to past and future. This confirms the Buddha’s intuition that Bhadraka was not ready to understand the deeper principles of the Dhamma.

- 3.1 “What do you think, chief? If Ciravāsi was executed, imprisoned, fined, or condemned, would it cause you sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress?”
- 3.3 “How could it not, sir?”
- 3.4 “This too is a way to understand: ‘All the suffering that arises is rooted and sourced in desire. For desire is the root of suffering.’
- 4.1 What do you think, chief? Before you’d seen or heard of Ciravāsi’s mother, did you have any desire or passion or fondness for her?”
- 4.3 “No, sir.”
- 4.4 “Then was it because you saw or heard of her that you had desire or passion or fondness for her?”
- 4.6 “Yes, sir.”
- 5.1 “What do you think, chief? If Ciravāsi’s mother was executed, imprisoned, fined, or condemned, would it cause you sorrow, lamentation, pain, sadness, and distress?”
- 5.3 “How could it not, sir?”
- 5.4 “This too is a way to understand: ‘All the suffering that arises is rooted and sourced in desire. For desire is the root of suffering.’”

SN 42.12

With Rāsiya

Rāsiyasutta

- 1.1 Then Rāsiya the chief went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:³⁹⁶
- 1.2 “Sir, I have heard this: ‘The ascetic Gotama criticizes all forms of mortification. He categorically condemns and denounces those fervent mortifiers who live rough.’³⁹⁷ I trust those who say this repeat what the Buddha has said, and do not misrepresent him with an

396. Nothing further is known of this chief. His name means “heaper”, perhaps in reference to the wealth that is heaped up and the suffering that is worn away.

397. See AN 10.94.

untruth? Is their explanation in line with the teaching? Are there any legitimate grounds for rebuttal and criticism?”

“Chief, those who say this do not repeat what I have said. They 1.4
misrepresent me with what is false, hollow, and untrue.

These two extremes should not be cultivated by one gone forth.³⁹⁸ 2.1
Indulgence in sensual pleasures, which is low, crude, ordinary, ignoble, and pointless. And indulgence in self-mortification, which is painful, ignoble, and pointless.

Avoiding these two extremes, the Realized One understood the 2.3
middle way of practice, which gives vision and knowledge, and leads to peace, direct knowledge, awakening, and extinguishment.

And what is that middle way of practice? It is simply this noble 2.4
eightfold path, that is: right view, right purpose, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right immersion.

This, chief, is the middle way of practice that was understood by 2.7
the Realized One, which gives vision and knowledge, and leads to peace, direct knowledge, awakening, and extinguishment.

There are these three pleasure seekers in the world.³⁹⁹ What three? 3.1
Take a pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using illegitimate, coercive means, and who doesn’t make themselves happy and pleased, or share it and make merit. Next, a pleasure seeker seeks wealth using illegitimate, coercive means. They make themselves happy and pleased, but don’t share it and make merit. Next, a pleasure seeker seeks wealth using illegitimate, coercive means. They make themselves happy and pleased, and they share it and make merit.

Next, a pleasure seeker seeks wealth using means both legitimate 4.1
and illegitimate, and coercive and non-coercive. They don’t make themselves happy and pleased, or share it and make merit. Next, a

398. The Buddha repeats the opening of the First Sermon (SN 56.11). The text goes on to illustrate these two extremes and the middle way. The lengthy explanation suggests that Rāsiya was slow of understanding.

399. This is the first extreme, sensual indulgence. A similar analysis is at AN 10.91.

pleasure seeker seeks wealth using means both legitimate and illegitimate, and coercive and non-coercive. They don't make themselves happy and pleased, or share it and make merit. Next, a pleasure seeker seeks wealth using means both legitimate and illegitimate, and coercive and non-coercive. They make themselves happy and pleased, and they share it and make merit.

5.1 Next, a pleasure seeker seeks wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. They don't make themselves happy and pleased, or share it and make merit. Next, a pleasure seeker seeks wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. They make themselves happy and pleased, but don't share it and make merit. Next, a pleasure seeker seeks wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. They make themselves happy and pleased, and they share it and make merit. They enjoy that wealth tied, infatuated, attached, blind to the drawbacks, and not understanding the escape. Next, a pleasure seeker seeks wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. They make themselves happy and pleased, and they share it and make merit. And they enjoy that wealth untied, uninfatuated, unattached, seeing the drawbacks, and understanding the escape.

6.1 Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using illegitimate, coercive means, and who doesn't make themselves happy and pleased, or share it and make merit. They may be criticized on three grounds. What three? They seek wealth using illegitimate, coercive means. This is the first ground for criticism. They don't make themselves happy and pleased. This is the second ground for criticism. They don't share it and make merit. This is the third ground for criticism. This pleasure seeker may be criticized on these three grounds.

7.1 Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using illegitimate, coercive means, and who makes themselves happy and pleased, but doesn't share it and make merit. This pleasure seeker may be criticized on two grounds, and praised on one. What are the two grounds for criticism? They seek wealth using illegitimate, coercive means. This is the first ground for criticism. They don't

share it and make merit. This is the second ground for criticism. What is the one ground for praise? They make themselves happy and pleased. This is the one ground for praise. This pleasure seeker may be criticized on these two grounds, and praised on this one.

Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using illegitimate, coercive means, and who makes themselves happy and pleased, and shares it and makes merit. This pleasure seeker may be criticized on one ground, and praised on two. What is the one ground for criticism? They seek wealth using illegitimate, coercive means. This is the one ground for criticism. What are the two grounds for praise? They make themselves happy and pleased. This is the first ground for praise. They share it and make merit. This is the second ground for praise. This pleasure seeker may be criticized on this one ground, and praised on these two. 8.1

Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using means both legitimate and illegitimate, and coercive and non-coercive, and who doesn't make themselves happy and pleased, or share it and make merit. They may be praised on one ground, and criticized on three. What is the one ground for praise? They seek wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. This is the one ground for praise. What are the three grounds for criticism? They seek wealth using illegitimate, coercive means. This is the first ground for criticism. They don't make themselves happy and pleased. This is the second ground for criticism. They don't share it and make merit. This is the third ground for criticism. This pleasure seeker may be praised on this one ground, and criticized on these three. 9.1

Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using means both legitimate and illegitimate, and coercive and non-coercive, and makes themselves happy and pleased, but doesn't share it and make merit. They may be praised on two grounds, and criticized on two. What are the two grounds for praise? They seek wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. This is the first ground for praise. They make themselves happy and pleased. This is the second ground for praise. What are the two grounds for criticism? They seek 10.1

wealth using illegitimate, coercive means. This is the first ground for criticism. They don't share it and make merit. This is the second ground for criticism. This pleasure seeker may be praised on these two grounds, and criticized on these two.

11.1 Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using means both legitimate and illegitimate, and coercive and non-coercive, and who makes themselves happy and pleased, and shares it and makes merit. They may be praised on three grounds, and criticized on one. What are the three grounds for praise? They seek wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. This is the first ground for praise. They make themselves happy and pleased. This is the second ground for praise. They share it and make merit. This is the third ground for praise. What is the one ground for criticism? They seek wealth using illegitimate, coercive means. This is the one ground for criticism. This pleasure seeker may be praised on these three grounds, and criticized on this one.

12.1 Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means, but who doesn't make themselves happy and pleased, or share it and make merit. They may be praised on one ground, and criticized on two. What is the one ground for praise? They seek wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. This is the one ground for praise. What are the two grounds for criticism? They don't make themselves happy and pleased. This is the first ground for criticism. They don't share it and make merit. This is the second ground for criticism. This pleasure seeker may be praised on this one ground, and criticized on these two.

13.1 Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means, and who makes themselves happy and pleased, but doesn't share it and make merit. This pleasure seeker may be praised on two grounds, and criticized on one. What are the two grounds for praise? They seek wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. This is the first ground for praise. They make themselves happy and pleased. This is the second ground for praise. What is the one ground for criticism? They don't share it and make merit.

This is the one ground for criticism. This pleasure seeker may be praised on these two grounds, and criticized on this one.

Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means, and who makes themselves happy and pleased, and shares it and makes merit. But they enjoy that wealth tied, infatuated, attached, blind to the drawbacks, and not understanding the escape. They may be praised on three grounds and criticized on one. What are the three grounds for praise? They seek wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. This is the first ground for praise. They make themselves happy and pleased. This is the second ground for praise. They share it and make merit. This is the third ground for praise. What is the one ground for criticism? They enjoy that wealth tied, infatuated, attached, blind to the drawbacks, and not understanding the escape. This is the one ground for criticism. This pleasure seeker may be praised on these three grounds, and criticized on this one. 14.1

Now, consider the pleasure seeker who seeks wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means, and who makes themselves happy and pleased, and shares it and makes merit. And they enjoy that wealth untied, uninfatuated, unattached, seeing the drawbacks, and understanding the escape. This pleasure seeker may be praised on four grounds. What are the four grounds for praise? They seek wealth using legitimate, non-coercive means. This is the first ground for praise. They make themselves happy and pleased. This is the second ground for praise. They share it and make merit. This is the third ground for praise. They enjoy that wealth untied, uninfatuated, unattached, seeing the drawbacks, and understanding the escape. This is the fourth ground for praise. This pleasure seeker may be praised on these four grounds. 15.1

These three fervent mortifiers who live rough are found in the world.⁴⁰⁰ What three? 16.1

400. This is the second extreme, self mortification.

- 16.3 Take a fervent mortifier who has gone forth out of faith from the lay life to homelessness, thinking: ‘Hopefully I will achieve a skillful quality! Hopefully I will realize a superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones!’⁴⁰¹ They mortify and torment themselves. But they don’t achieve any skillful quality, or realize any superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.
- 17.1 Take another fervent mortifier who has gone forth out of faith from the lay life to homelessness, thinking: ‘Hopefully I will achieve a skillful quality! Hopefully I will realize a superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones!’ They mortify and torment themselves. And they achieve a skillful quality, but don’t realize any superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.
- 18.1 Take another fervent mortifier who has gone forth out of faith from the lay life to homelessness, thinking: ‘Hopefully I will achieve a skillful quality! Hopefully I will realize a superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones!’ They mortify and torment themselves. And they achieve a skillful quality, and they realize a superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones.
- 19.1 In this case, the first fervent mortifier may be criticized on three grounds. What three? They mortify and torment themselves. This is the first ground for criticism. They don’t achieve a skillful quality. This is the second ground for criticism. They don’t realize a superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones. This is the third ground for criticism. This fervent mortifier may be criticized on these three grounds.
- 20.1 In this case, the second fervent mortifier may be criticized on two grounds, and praised on one. What are the two grounds for criticism?

401. In Buddhism, a “skillful quality” would refer to the “ten ways of doing skillful deeds”, which are good qualities for a human life lived well. Beyond that are the “superhuman” states realized by advanced meditators, namely absorptions, psychic powers, and stages of awakening (Bu Pj 4:4.1.3.1).

They mortify and torment themselves. This is the first ground for criticism. They don't realize a superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones. This is the second ground for criticism. What is the one ground for praise? They achieve a skillful quality. This is the one ground for praise. This fervent mortifier may be criticized on these two grounds, and praised on one.

In this case, the third fervent mortifier may be criticized on one 21.1 ground, and praised on two. What is the one ground for criticism? They mortify and torment themselves. This is the one ground for criticism. What are the two grounds for praise? They achieve a skillful quality. This is the first ground for praise. They realize a superhuman distinction in knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones. This is the second ground for praise. This fervent mortifier may be criticized on this one ground, and praised on two.

There are these three kinds of wearing away that are apparent in 22.1 the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know them for themselves.⁴⁰² What three?

A greedy person, because of greed, intends to hurt themselves, 22.3 hurt others, and hurt both. When they've given up greed they don't have such intentions. This wearing away is apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.

A hateful person, because of hate, intends to hurt themselves, hurt 22.6 others, and hurt both. When they've given up hate they don't have such intentions. This wearing away is apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.

402. The middle way is described as a "wearing away" (*nijjara*). The Jains believed that through the practice of austerities one could "wear away" past bad deeds (MN 14:17.5) and future suffering (MN 14:17.8). The Buddha distinguishes the term from self-mortification and adapts it for Buddhist use, with "wearing away" applied to the defilements that produce suffering. It is applied to the tenfold path at AN 10.106.

- 22.9 A deluded person, because of delusion, intends to hurt themselves, hurt others, and hurt both. When they’ve given up delusion they don’t have such intentions. This wearing away is apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know it for themselves.
- 22.12 These are the three kinds of wearing away that are apparent in the present life, immediately effective, inviting inspection, relevant, so that sensible people can know them for themselves.”
- 23.1 When he said this, Rāsiya the chief said to the Buddha, “Excellent, sir! Excellent! ... From this day forth, may the Buddha remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.”

SN 42.13

With Pāṭaliya

Pāṭaliyasutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying in the land of the Koliyans, where they have a town named Uttarakā.⁴⁰³ Then Pāṭaliya the chief went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat down to one side, and said to him:⁴⁰⁴
- 1.3 “Sir, I have heard this: ‘The ascetic Gotama knows deceit.’⁴⁰⁵ I trust those who say this repeat what the Buddha has said, and do not misrepresent him with an untruth? Is their explanation in line with the teaching? Are there any legitimate grounds for rebuttal and criticism? For we don’t want to misrepresent the Blessed One.”
- 2.3 “Chief, those who say this repeat what I have said, and don’t misrepresent me with an untruth. Their explanation is in line with the

403. The Koliyans were south-eastern neighbors of the Sakyans, with whom they had close ties in marriage and customs.

404. For derivation of this name, see note on DN 16:1.19.2.

405. *Māyā* means “illusion, trick, deceit”. Perhaps a reference to the “conversion trick” of which the Buddha was accused at MN 56:8.3 and AN 4.193:15.8. In his reply, the Buddha employs a careful logical method to demonstrate that his teaching is based on reason, not trickery.

teaching, and there are no legitimate grounds for rebuttal and criticism.”

“Sir, we didn’t believe that what those ascetics and brahmins said 2.4
was really true. But it seems the ascetic Gotama is deceitful!”

“Chief, does someone who says ‘I know deceit’ also say ‘I am 2.6
deceitful’?”

“That’s right, Blessed One! That’s right, Holy One!” 2.7

“Well then, chief, I’ll ask you about this in return, and you can 2.8
answer as you like.

What do you think, chief? Do you know the Koliyan officers with 3.1
drooping headdresses?”

“I know them, sir.” 3.3

“And what’s their job?” 3.4

“To put a stop to bandits and to deliver messages for the Koliyans.” 3.5

“What do you think, chief? Are the Koliyan officers with drooping 3.6
headdresses moral or immoral?”

“I know that they’re immoral, of bad character, sir. They are among 3.8
those in the world who are immoral and of bad character.”⁴⁰⁶

“Would it be right to say that Pāṭaliya knows the Koliyan officers 3.9
with drooping headdresses who are immoral, of bad character, so he
too must be immoral and of bad character?”

“No, sir. I’m quite different from the Koliyan officers with droop- 3.11
ing headdresses; we have quite different characters.”

“So if you can know those officers of bad character while you 3.13
are not of bad character, why can’t the Realized One know deceit,
without being deceitful?

I understand deceit and its result. And I understand how the 3.14
deceitful practice so that when their body breaks up, after death,
they’re reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell.

I understand killing living creatures and its result. And I under- 4.1
stand how those who kill living creatures practice so that when their
body breaks up, after death, they’re reborn in a place of loss, a bad

406. It seems that police corruption is not new.

place, the underworld, hell. I understand stealing ... sexual misconduct ... lying ... backbiting ... harsh speech ... talking nonsense ... covetousness ... ill will ... wrong view and its result. And I understand how those who have wrong view practice so that when their body breaks up, after death, they're reborn in a place of loss, a bad place, the underworld, hell.

5.1 There are some ascetics and brahmins who have this doctrine and view: 'Everyone who kills living creatures experiences pain and sadness in this very life.'⁴⁰⁷ Everyone who steals ... commits sexual misconduct ... lies experiences pain and sadness in this very life.'

6.1 But you can see someone, garlanded and adorned, nicely bathed and anointed, hair and beard dressed, taking his pleasure with women as if he were a king. You might ask someone: 'My man, what did that man do?'⁴⁰⁸ And they'd reply: 'My man, that man attacked the king's enemy and killed them. The king was delighted and gave him this reward. That's why he's garlanded and adorned, nicely bathed and anointed, hair and beard dressed, taking his pleasure with women as if he were a king.'

7.1 And you can see someone else, his arms tied tightly behind his back with a strong rope. His head is shaven and he's marched from street to street and from square to square to the beating of a harsh drum. Then he's taken out the south gate and there, to the south of the city, they chop off his head. You might ask someone: 'My man, what did that man do?' And they'd reply: 'My man, that man is an enemy of the king, and he has murdered a man or a woman. That's why the rulers arrested him and inflicted such punishment.'

8.1 What do you think, chief? Have you seen or heard of such a thing?"

8.3 "Sir, we have seen it and heard of it, and we will hear of it again."

407. This uses the emphatic distributive form as at SN 42.8:1.5.

408. *Ambho* is not usually used by itself as a vocative, but rather as an interjection. This would work for this sentence ("Oh my, what did that man do?") but not for the response below. It seems a vocative sense is demanded; perhaps we should read *ambho purisa, ayaṃ puriso*.

“Since this is so, the ascetics and brahmins whose view is that everyone who kills living creatures experiences pain and sadness in this very life: are they right or wrong?” 8.4

“They’re wrong, sir.” 8.6

“But those who speak hollow, false nonsense: are they moral or immoral?” 8.7

“Immoral, sir.” 8.8

“And are those who are immoral, of bad character practicing wrongly or rightly?” 8.9

“They’re practicing wrongly, sir.” 8.10

“And do those who are practicing wrongly have wrong view or right view?” 8.11

“They have wrong view, sir.” 8.12

“But is it appropriate to have confidence in those of wrong view?” 8.13

“No, sir.” 8.14

“You can see someone, garlanded and adorned ... ‘My man, that man attacked the king’s enemy and took their valuables. The king was delighted and gave him this reward. ...’ ...” 9.1

And you can see someone else, his arms tied tightly behind his back ... ‘My man, that man took something from a village or wilderness, with the intention to commit theft. That’s why the rulers arrested him and inflicted such punishment.’ What do you think, chief? Have you seen or heard of such a thing?” 10.1

“Sir, we have seen it and heard of it, and we will hear of it again.” 10.8

“Since this is so, the ascetics and brahmins whose view is that everyone who steals experiences pain and sadness in this very life: are they right or wrong? ... Is it appropriate to have confidence in them?” 10.9

“No, sir.” 10.12

“You can see someone, garlanded and adorned ... ‘My friend, that man had relations with the wives of an enemy king. The king was delighted and gave him this reward. ...’ ...” 11.1

And you can see someone else, his arms tied tightly behind his back ... ‘My friend, that man had relations with women and maidens

of good families. That's why the rulers arrested him and inflicted such punishment.' What do you think, chief? Have you seen or heard of such a thing?"

12.9 "Sir, we have seen it and heard of it, and we will hear of it again."

12.10 "Since this is so, the ascetics and brahmins whose view is that everyone who commits sexual misconduct experiences pain and sadness in this very life: are they right or wrong? ... Is it appropriate to have confidence in them?"

12.13 "No, sir."

13.1 "And you can see someone, garlanded and adorned ... 'My man, that man amused the king with lies. The king was delighted and gave him this reward. ...' ...

14.1 And you can see someone else, his arms tied tightly behind his back ... 'My man, that man has ruined a householder or householder's child by lying.⁴⁰⁹ That's why the rulers arrested him and inflicted such punishment.' What do you think, chief? Have you seen or heard of such a thing?"

14.9 "Sir, we have seen it and heard of it, and we will hear of it again."

14.10 "Since this is so, the ascetics and brahmins whose view is that everyone who lies experiences pain and sadness in this very life: are they right or wrong?"

14.12 "They're wrong, sir."

14.13 "But those who speak hollow, false nonsense: are they moral or immoral?"

14.14 "Immoral, sir."

14.15 "And are those who are immoral, of bad character practicing wrongly or rightly?"

14.16 "They're practicing wrongly, sir."

14.17 "And do those who are practicing wrongly have wrong view or right view?"

14.18 "They have wrong view, sir."

14.19 "But is it appropriate to have confidence in those of wrong view?"

409. See AN 5.178.

“No, sir.

14.20

It’s incredible, sir, it’s amazing! I have a guest house, where there are cots, seats, water jars, and oil lamps. Whenever an ascetic or brahmin comes to stay, I share what I have as best I can. Once it so happened, sir, that four teachers of different views, beliefs, and opinions came to stay at my guest house.⁴¹⁰

15.1

One teacher had this doctrine and view:⁴¹¹ ‘There’s no meaning in giving, sacrifice, or offerings. There’s no fruit or result of good and bad deeds. There’s no afterlife. There’s no such thing as mother and father, or beings that are reborn spontaneously. And there’s no ascetic or brahmin who is rightly comported and rightly practiced, and who describes the afterlife after realizing it with their own insight.’

16.1

One teacher had this doctrine and view: ‘There is meaning in giving, sacrifice, and offerings. There are fruits and results of good and bad deeds. There is an afterlife. There are such things as mother and father, and beings that are reborn spontaneously. And there are ascetics and brahmins who are rightly comported and rightly practiced, and who describe the afterlife after realizing it with their own insight.’

17.1

One teacher had this doctrine and view: ‘The one who acts does nothing wrong when they punish, mutilate, torture, aggrieve, oppress, intimidate, or when they encourage others to do the same. Nothing bad is done when they kill, steal, break into houses, plunder wealth, steal from isolated buildings, commit highway robbery, commit adultery, and lie.⁴¹² If you were to reduce all the living creatures of this earth to one heap and mass of flesh with a razor-edged chakram, no evil comes of that, and no outcome of evil. If you were to go along the south bank of the Ganges killing, mutilating, and torturing, and encouraging others to do the same, no evil comes of that, and no outcome of evil. If you were to go along the north

18.1

410. The ascetic teachers are normally located in Magadha, but here we see that, like the Buddha, the wandered extensively.

411. Attributed to Ajita of the hair blanket at DN 2:23.2.

412. Attributed to Pūraṇa Kassapa at DN 2:17.2.

bank of the Ganges giving and sacrificing and encouraging others to do the same, no merit comes of that, and no outcome of merit. In giving, self-control, restraint, and truthfulness there is no merit or outcome of merit.’

19.1 One teacher had this doctrine and view: ‘The one who acts does a bad deed when they punish, mutilate, torture, aggrieve, oppress, intimidate, or when they encourage others to do the same. A bad deed is done when they kill, steal, break into houses, plunder wealth, steal from isolated buildings, commit highway robbery, commit adultery, and lie. If you were to reduce all the living creatures of this earth to one heap and mass of flesh with a razor-edged chakram, evil comes of that, and an outcome of evil. If you were to go along the south bank of the Ganges killing, mutilating, and torturing, and encouraging others to do the same, evil comes of that, and an outcome of evil. If you were to go along the north bank of the Ganges giving and sacrificing and encouraging others to do the same, merit comes of that, and an outcome of merit. In giving, self-control, restraint, and truthfulness there is merit and outcome of merit.’

20.1 I had doubt and uncertainty about that: ‘I wonder who of these respected ascetics and brahmins speaks the truth, and who speaks falsehood?’”

21.1 “Chief, no wonder you’re doubting and uncertain. Doubt has come up in you about an uncertain matter.”

21.3 “I am quite confident that the Buddha is capable of teaching me so that I can give up this state of uncertainty.”

“Chief, there is immersion based on understanding of principle.”⁴¹³ 22.1
 If you gain such mental immersion, you can give up that state of uncertainty.⁴¹⁴

And what is immersion based on understanding of principle? It’s 22.3
 when a noble disciple has given up killing living creatures, stealing, sexual misconduct, lying, backbiting, harsh speech, talking nonsense, covetousness, ill will, and wrong view.

Then that noble disciple is rid of desire, rid of ill will, unconfused, 23.1
 aware, and mindful. They meditate spreading a heart full of love to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full of love to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will.

They reflect thus: “That teacher who had this doctrine and view: 23.2
 “There’s no meaning in giving, sacrifice, or offerings. There’s no fruit or result of good and bad deeds. There’s no afterlife. There’s no such thing as mother and father, or beings that are reborn spontaneously. And there’s no ascetic or brahmin who is rightly comported and rightly practiced, and who describes the afterlife after realizing it with their own insight.” If what this good teacher says is true, it’s

413. *Dhammasamādhī* (“immersion based on understanding of principle”) is a unique term, and appears to have caused some confusion. The commentary offers various explanations (see Bodhi’s note in *Connected Discourses*). MA 20 has 有法之定，名曰遠離, translated by Analayo/Bucknell as “there is a Dharma meditation called abandoning.” The context, however, makes the sense clear. *Samādhī* has its usual meaning of “immersion”. *Dhamma* means the “principle” of cause and effect, as in “observation of principles” (*dhammānupassanā*), “investigation of principles” (*dhammavicaya*), or “discernment of principles” (*dhammavipassanā*). This discourse describes how a meditator who has already entered absorption can then use wisdom to reflect on the principles of causality, which gives rise to joy and further immersion.

414. *Tatra ce* does not mean “if in that” (meditation state), but “if regarding that, if in that case”, and may often be translated simply as “if” (eg. AN 6.64:12.1, MN 22:38.1, Plī Tv Bu Pm:41.3).

a sure bet for me to not hurt any creature firm or frail.⁴¹⁵ I hold a winning hand on both counts, since I'm restrained in body, speech, and mind, and when my body breaks up, after death, I'll be reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.⁴¹⁶

23.7 Joy springs up in them. Being joyful, rapture springs up. When the mind is full of rapture, the body becomes tranquil. When the body is tranquil, they feel bliss. And when blissful, the mind becomes immersed in samādhi. This is that immersion based on understanding of principle. If you gain such mental immersion, you can give up that state of uncertainty.

24.1 Then that noble disciple is rid of desire, rid of ill will, unconfused, aware, and mindful. They meditate spreading a heart full of love to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full of love to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will.

24.2 They reflect thus: 'That teacher who had this doctrine and view: "There is meaning in giving, sacrifice, and offerings. There are fruits and results of good and bad deeds. There is an afterlife. There are such things as mother and father, and beings that are reborn spontaneously. And there are ascetics and brahmins who are rightly comported and rightly practiced, and who describe the afterlife after realizing it with their own insight." If what this good teacher says is true, it's a sure bet for me to not hurt any creature firm or frail. I hold a winning hand on both counts, since I'm restrained in body, speech, and mind, and when my body breaks up, after death, I'll be reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.'

415. Compare MN 60, which likewise uses a careful conditional logic, while employing the language of gambling to assess outcomes after death.

416. "Winning hand" (*kaṭaggaha*) is an expression from the classical Vedic game of chance. A large quantity of *vibhītaka* ("bedda") nuts were placed in a hollow, from which players would take a handful. If the number of nuts was divisible by four, it was said to be a "perfect" (*kaṭa*) "hand" (*gāha*).

Joy springs up in them. Being joyful, rapture springs up. When the mind is full of rapture, the body becomes tranquil. When the body is tranquil, they feel bliss. And when blissful, the mind becomes immersed in samādhi. This is that immersion based on understanding of principle. If you gain such mental immersion, you can give up that state of uncertainty. 24.7

Then that noble disciple is rid of desire, rid of ill will, unconfused, aware, and mindful. They meditate spreading a heart full of love to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full of love to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will. 25.1

They reflect thus: ‘That teacher who had this doctrine and view: 25.2
 “The one who acts does nothing wrong when they punish, mutilate, torture, aggrrieve, oppress, intimidate, or when they encourage others to do the same. Nothing bad is done when they kill, steal, break into houses, plunder wealth, steal from isolated buildings, commit highway robbery, commit adultery, and lie. If you were to reduce all the living creatures of this earth to one heap and mass of flesh with a razor-edged chakram, no evil comes of that, and no outcome of evil. If you were to go along the south bank of the Ganges killing, mutilating, and torturing, and encouraging others to do the same, no evil comes of that, and no outcome of evil. If you were to go along the north bank of the Ganges giving and sacrificing and encouraging others to do the same, no merit comes of that, and no outcome of merit. In giving, self-control, restraint, and truthfulness there is no merit or outcome of merit.” If what this good teacher says is true, it’s a sure bet for me to not hurt any creature firm or frail. I hold a winning hand on both counts, since I’m restrained in body, speech, and mind, and when my body breaks up, after death, I’ll be reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.’

Joy springs up in them. Being joyful, rapture springs up. When the mind is full of rapture, the body becomes tranquil. When the body is tranquil, they feel bliss. And when blissful, the mind becomes im- 25.11

mersed in samādhi. This is that immersion based on understanding of principle. If you gain such mental immersion, you can give up that state of uncertainty.

26.1 Then that noble disciple is rid of desire, rid of ill will, unconfused, aware, and mindful. They meditate spreading a heart full of love to one direction, and to the second, and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below, across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full of love to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity and ill will.

26.2 They reflect thus: ‘That teacher who had this doctrine and view: “The one who acts does a bad deed when they punish, mutilate, torture, aggrieve, oppress, intimidate, or when they encourage others to do the same. A bad deed is done when they kill, steal, break into houses, plunder wealth, steal from isolated buildings, commit highway robbery, commit adultery, and lie. If you were to reduce all the living creatures of this earth to one heap and mass of flesh with a razor-edged chakram, evil comes of that, and an outcome of evil. If you were to go along the south bank of the Ganges killing, mutilating, and torturing, and encouraging others to do the same, evil comes of that, and an outcome of evil. If you were to go along the north bank of the Ganges giving and sacrificing and encouraging others to do the same, merit comes of that, and an outcome of merit. In giving, self-control, restraint, and truthfulness there is merit and outcome of merit.” If what this good teacher says is true, it’s a sure bet for me to not hurt any creature firm or frail. I hold a winning hand on both counts, since I’m restrained in body, speech, and mind, and when my body breaks up, after death, I’ll be reborn in a good place, a heavenly realm.’

26.11 Joy springs up in them. Being joyful, rapture springs up. When the mind is full of rapture, the body becomes tranquil. When the body is tranquil, they feel bliss. And when blissful, the mind becomes immersed in samādhi. This is that immersion based on understanding of principle. If you gain such mental immersion, you can give up that state of uncertainty.

Then that noble disciple is rid of desire, rid of ill will, unconfused, 27.1
 aware, and mindful. They meditate spreading a heart full of compas-
 sion ... rejoicing ... equanimity to one direction, and to the second,
 and to the third, and to the fourth. In the same way above, below,
 across, everywhere, all around, they spread a heart full of equanimity
 to the whole world—abundant, expansive, limitless, free of enmity
 and ill will.

They reflect thus: ‘If what this good teacher says is true, it’s a sure 31.1
 bet for me to not hurt any creature firm or frail. I hold a winning
 hand on both counts, since I’m restrained in body, speech, and mind,
 and when my body breaks up, after death, I’ll be reborn in a good
 place, a heavenly realm.’

Joy springs up in them. Being joyful, rapture springs up. When the 31.11
 mind is full of rapture, the body becomes tranquil. When the body
 is tranquil, they feel bliss. And when blissful, the mind becomes im-
 mersed in samādhi. This is that immersion based on understanding
 of principle. If you gain such mental immersion, you can give up that
 state of uncertainty.”

When he said this, Pāṭaliya the chief said to the Buddha, “Ex- 32.1
 cellent, sir! Excellent! ... From this day forth, may the Buddha
 remember me as a lay follower who has gone for refuge for life.”

The Linked Discourses on chiefs are complete.

LINKED DISCOURSES ON THE UNCONDITIONED

Chapter One

SN 43.1

Mindfulness of the Body

Kāyagatāsatisutta

At Sāvatthī.

1.1

“Mendicants, I will teach you the unconditioned and the path 1.2
that leads to the unconditioned.”⁴¹⁷ Listen ...

417. In Vedic usage, something that is *saṅkhata* (Sanskrit *saṃskṛta*, “conditioned”) has been worked through a process (*saṅkhāra*) that shapes it into its “completed” or “perfected” form (eg. Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 7.1.2.6). To be *saṅkhata* is to be “equipped” for battle (Rig Veda 8.33.9) or “prepared” for the ritual (Śatapatha Brāhmaṇa 8.6.1.1). When natural language is “refined” through meticulous grammar, it becomes *saṅkhata*, or as we say today, “Sanskrit”. Linguistically, it is a past participle, describing something that has been made into this form. But it also conveys the sense of something “readied” or “energized” or “charged” and thus fit for purpose, “potent” to perform its function. The Buddha inverts the Vedic value system, positioning the “unconditioned” Nibbāna as independent of Vedic or other rituals of “potentization”. *Asaṅkhata* conveys the sense of “unworked” (as a natural gem), or “unconsecrated” (by Vedic rites) and thus implies a raw or natural state. In Pali, *asaṅkhata* is used as an adjective describing something; but that something is unstated as the referent is empty. So whereas in English we say, “the unconditioned”, in Pali it is just “unconditioned” and does not imply an existent state or reality that is unconditioned. The prefix *saṃ* is sometimes said to mean “together” yielding the sense “compounded”, but usage suggests the primary sense of *saṃ* here is “good, well, perfect”. Nor does *saṅkhata* convey the sense “created” or “fabricated”, but rather “processed”. This aligns with the Buddhist rejection of creation from nothing. Existence is an ongoing process, inheriting what was made in the past, processing and

- 1.4 And what is the unconditioned? The ending of greed, hate, and delusion.⁴¹⁸ This is called the unconditioned. And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? Mindfulness of the body.⁴¹⁹ This is called the path that leads to the unconditioned.
- 2.1 So, mendicants, I’ve taught you the unconditioned and the path that leads to the unconditioned. Out of sympathy, I’ve done what a teacher should do who wants what’s best for their disciples. Here are these roots of trees, and here are these empty huts. Practice absorption, mendicants! Don’t be negligent! Don’t regret it later! This is my instruction to you.”

SN 43.2

Serenity and Discernment

Samathavipassanāsutta

- 1.1 “Mendicants, I will teach you the unconditioned and the path that leads to the unconditioned. Listen ...
- 1.3 And what is the unconditioned? The ending of greed, hate, and delusion. This is called the unconditioned. And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? Serenity and discernment.⁴²⁰ This is called the path that leads to the unconditioned. ...”

potentizing it and thereby shaping the future. The English word “conditioned” conveys these senses quite well, implying something dependent on conditions, shaped into a specified state, or prepared for a given purpose.

418. The unconditioned is not “produced” by the eightfold path, but rather, the practice of the path leads to the cessation of greed, hate, and delusion, which are the conditions for suffering. This series of discourses all make the same point, each highlighting a particular way of describing the path.

419. Treated in detail in the Kāyagatāsatisutta (MN 119).

420. AN 4.170.

SN 43.3

Placing the Mind and Keeping it Connected

Savitakkasavicārasutta

“And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? Immersion 1.1
with placing the mind and keeping it connected. Immersion without
placing the mind, merely keeping it connected. Immersion without
placing the mind or keeping it connected. ...”⁴²¹

SN 43.4

Emptiness Immersion

Suññatasamādhisutta

“And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? Emptiness 1.1
immersion; signless immersion; undirected immersion. ...”⁴²²

421. This threefold presentation of the process of absorption focuses on *vitakka* (“placing the mind”) and *vicāra* (“keeping it connected”), looking closely at how they cease (see also DN 33:1.10.121, DN 34:1.4.7, MN 128:31.4, and AN 8.63:3.1). The standard *jhāna* formula focuses more on the refinement of feelings, from which perspective the first two stages of immersion here fall under the “rapture and bliss born of seclusion”, while only the third qualifies as “rapture and bliss born of immersion”. Thus Analayo describes the two descriptions as “complementary perspectives on the same process of deepening concentration” (*Comparative Study*, vol. ii, pg. 739, note 263).

422. See MN 43:27.1 for emptiness and signless immersion, and SN 47.10 for the undirected.

SN 43.5

Mindfulness Meditation

Satipaṭṭhānasutta

- 1.1 “And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned?”⁴²³ The four kinds of mindfulness meditation. ...”⁴²⁴

SN 43.6

Right Efforts

Sammappadhānasutta

- 1.1 “And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? The four right efforts. ...”⁴²⁵

SN 43.7

Bases of Psychic Power

Iddhipādasutta

- 1.1 “And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? The four bases of psychic power. ...”⁴²⁶

423. From here through to SN 43.11 we find the seven sets of practices later renowned as the 37 “qualities on the side of awakening” (*bodhipakkhiyadhammā*). These are repeated with more details at SN 43.12. These also form the main topics of the Mahāvagga of the Saṃyutta, to which I give references.

424. MN 10, SN 47.

425. SN 49.

426. SN 51.

SN 43.8

Faculties

Indriyasutta

“And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? The five faculties. ...”⁴²⁷ 1.1

SN 43.9

Powers

Balasutta

“And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? The five powers. ...”⁴²⁸ 1.1

SN 43.10

Awakening Factors

Bojjhaṅgasutta

“And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? The seven awakening factors. ...”⁴²⁹ 1.1

427. SN 48.

428. SN 50.

429. SN 46.

SN 43.11

The Path

Maggāṅgasutta

- 1.1 “And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? The noble eightfold path.⁴³⁰ This is called the path that leads to the unconditioned.
- 1.4 So, mendicants, I’ve taught you the unconditioned and the path that leads to the unconditioned. Out of sympathy, I’ve done what a teacher should do who wants what’s best for their disciples. Here are these roots of trees, and here are these empty huts. Practice absorption, mendicants! Don’t be negligent! Don’t regret it later! This is my instruction to you.”

430. SN 45.

Chapter Two

SN 43.12

The Unconditioned

Asaṅkhata-sutta

“Mendicants, I will teach you the unconditioned and the path that leads to the unconditioned.⁴³¹ Listen ...

And what is the unconditioned? The ending of greed, hate, and delusion. This is called the unconditioned.

And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? Serenity. This is called the path that leads to the unconditioned.

So, mendicants, I’ve taught you the unconditioned and the path that leads to the unconditioned.

Out of sympathy, I’ve done what a teacher should do who wants what’s best for their disciples. Here are these roots of trees, and here are these empty huts. Practice absorption, mendicants! Don’t be negligent! Don’t regret it later! This is my instruction to you.”

“Mendicants, I will teach you the unconditioned and the path that leads to the unconditioned. Listen ...

And what is the unconditioned? The ending of greed, hate, and delusion. This is called the unconditioned.

And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? Discernment. This is called the path that leads to the unconditioned. ...”

“And what is the path that leads to the unconditioned? 3.1

431. This discourse repeats and sometimes expands the previous chapter.

- 3.2 Immersion with placing the mind and keeping it connected. ...
 Immersion without placing the mind, merely keeping it connected.
 ... Immersion without placing the mind or keeping it connected. ...
- 4.1 Emptiness immersion. ... Signless immersion. ... Undirected immersion. ...
- 5.1 A mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the body—keen, aware, and mindful, rid of covetousness and displeasure for the world. ... A mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of feelings ... A mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of the mind ... A mendicant meditates by observing an aspect of principles ...
- 6.1 A mendicant generates enthusiasm, tries, makes an effort, exerts the mind, and strives so that bad, unskillful qualities don't arise. ... A mendicant generates enthusiasm, tries, makes an effort, exerts the mind, and strives so that bad, unskillful qualities are given up. ... A mendicant generates enthusiasm, tries, makes an effort, exerts the mind, and strives so that skillful qualities arise. ... A mendicant generates enthusiasm, tries, makes an effort, exerts the mind, and strives so that skillful qualities that have arisen remain, are not lost, but increase, mature, and are fully developed. ...
- 7.1 A mendicant develops the basis of psychic power that has immersion due to enthusiasm, and active effort. ... A mendicant develops the basis of psychic power that has immersion due to energy ... immersion due to mental development ... immersion due to inquiry, and active effort. ...
- 8.1 A mendicant develops the faculty of faith, which relies on seclusion, fading away, and cessation, and ripens as letting go. ... A mendicant develops the faculty of energy ... mindfulness ... immersion ... wisdom, which relies on seclusion, fading away, and cessation, and ripens as letting go. ...
- 9.1 A mendicant develops the power of faith ... energy ... mindfulness ... immersion ... wisdom, which relies on seclusion, fading away, and cessation, and ripens as letting go. ...
- 10.1 A mendicant develops the awakening factor of mindfulness ... investigation of principles ... energy ... rapture ... tranquility ...

immersion ... equanimity, which relies on seclusion, fading away, and cessation, and ripens as letting go. ...

A mendicant develops right view ... right purpose ... right speech 11.1
... right action ... right livelihood ... right effort ... right mindfulness ... right immersion, which relies on seclusion, fading away, and cessation, and ripens as letting go.

This is called the path that leads to the unconditioned. 11.16

So, mendicants, I've taught you the unconditioned and the path 11.17
that leads to the unconditioned.

Out of sympathy, I've done what a teacher should do who wants 11.18
what's best for their disciples. Here are these roots of trees, and here are these empty huts. Practice absorption, mendicants! Don't be negligent! Don't regret it later! This is my instruction to you."

SN 43.13

Uninclined

Anatasutta

"Mendicants, I will teach you the uninclined ..."⁴³² 1.1
(*Tell in full as in the unconditioned in the previous chapter.*)

SN 43.14–43

Undefined, Etc.

Anāsavādisutta

"Mendicants, I will teach you the undefined ..." 1.1
"the truth ..." ⁴³³ 1.1
"the far shore ..." ⁴³⁴ 1.1

432. Here begins a series of synonyms for Nibbāna the unconditioned. I provide a comment for the less common term. | "Uninclined" (*anata*) occurs at Ud 8.2:3.1. See SN 12.40:1.4 and SN 35.87:11.5 and notes.

433. Nibbāna is the truth since delusion has ceased (MN 140:26.2).

434. This is a common metaphor, eg. Snp 5.18:1.3.

- 1.1 “the subtle ...”⁴³⁵
 1.1 “the very hard to see ...”
 1.1 “the undecrepit ...”⁴³⁶
 1.1 “the everlasting ...”⁴³⁷
 1.1 “the not worn out ...”⁴³⁸
 1.1 “the invisible ...”⁴³⁹
 1.1 “the unproliferated ...”⁴⁴⁰
 1.1 “the peaceful ...”
 1.1 “freedom from death ...”
 1.1 “the sublime ...”
 1.1 “the state of grace ...”⁴⁴¹
 1.1 “the sanctuary ...”⁴⁴²
 1.1 “the ending of craving ...”
 1.1 “the incredible ...”⁴⁴³
 1.1 “the amazing ...”
 1.1 “the untroubled ...”⁴⁴⁴
 1.1 “the not liable to trouble ...”

435. For this term and the next, see Dhp 36:1, Thag 2.46:2.3.

436. “Undecrepit” (*ajajjara*) doesn’t appear elsewhere in Pali. However, Buddhist Sanskrit texts sometimes use *jarjara* (“decrepitude”) in definitions of old age in dependent origination (Nidānasamyukta 16.15, Pratītyasamutpāḍavibhaṅgasūtra 15b, Pratītyasamutpāḍādivibhaṅganirdeśasūtra 118, Dharmaskandha 16v2).

437. “Everlasting” (*dhuva*) is normally a synonym of “permanent” (*nicca*). It is used of Brahmā (SN 6.4:1.4), and of Nibbāna at Iti 43:4.4.

438. “Not worn out” (*apalokita*) is apparently unique in this sense. “Wearing out” (*paloka*) is a characteristic of conditioned things (SN 35.84:2.3).

439. Normally *anidassana* means “invisible” (DN 33:1.10.76) or “formless” (MN 21:14.8), although it is sometimes interpreted to mean Nibbāna (DN 11:85.18). While Nibbāna is, of course, formless and invisible, I believe this is the only place *anidassana* unambiguously refers to Nibbāna.

440. AN 6.15:6.2, Dhp 254:4.

441. *Siva*, see SN 2.21 and notes.

442. SN 7.11:6.2.

443. This term and the next are commonly used of individuals who have realized Nibbāna (AN 6.46:6.5, SN 51.22:2.2).

444. Snp 5.19:7.3.

“extinguishment ...”	1.1
“the unafflicted ...” ⁴⁴⁵	1.1
“dispassion ...”	1.1
“purity ...”	1.1
“release ...”	1.1
“not clinging ...” ⁴⁴⁶	1.1
“the island ...” ⁴⁴⁷	1.1
“the asylum ...”	1.1
“the shelter ...”	1.1
“the refuge ...”	1.1

SN 43.44

The Final Haven

Parāyanasutta

“Mendicants, I will teach you the final haven and the path that leads 1.1
to the final haven.”⁴⁴⁸ Listen ...

And what is the final haven? The ending of greed, hate, and delu- 1.3
sion. This is called the final haven.

And what is the path that leads to the final haven? Mindfulness of 1.6
the body. This is called the path that leads to the final haven.

So, mendicants, I’ve taught you the final haven and the path that 1.9
leads to the final haven. Out of sympathy, I’ve done what a teacher
should do who wants what’s best for their disciples. Here are these
roots of trees, and here are these empty huts. Practice absorption,

445. Normally a term for the mind developed through love, etc. (MN 21:11.14), or for good acts with pleasant outcomes (AN 3.23:2.1, MN 57:9.2).

446. “Not clinging” (*anālaya*) is part of the standard definition of the third noble truth (SN 56.11:4.7).

447. Snp 5.11:3.2. | This series of terms is used of the Buddha (SN 42.7) or one’s own good deeds (AN 3.51:2.4).

448. *Parāyana* means “culmination” or “ultimate goal”. When it appears with the preceding terms the sense is “last refuge”, “final haven”.

mendicants! Don't be negligent! Don't regret it later! This is my instruction to you."

(Tell in full as in the unconditioned.)

The Linked Discourses on the unconditioned are complete.

LINKED DISCOURSES ON THE UNDECLARED

The Chapter on the Undeclared Points

SN 44.1

With Khemā

Khemāsutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Sāvaththī in Jeta’s Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika’s monastery.⁴⁴⁹
- 1.2 Now at that time the nun Khemā was wandering in the land of the Kosalans between Sāvaththī and Sāketa when she took up residence in Toraṇavatthu.⁴⁵⁰ Then King Pasenadi was traveling from Sāketa to Sāvaththī, and he too stayed in Toraṇavatthu for a single night.
- 1.4 Then King Pasenadi addressed a man, “Please, my man, check if there’s a suitable (male) ascetic or brahmin in Toraṇavatthu to whom I can pay homage.”⁴⁵¹

449. The “undeclared points” are a stock series of propositions typically raised by non-Buddhists. It seems they formed a kind of scheme for evaluating and positioning different philosophies, which were assumed to answer them definitively. They are discussed many times in the Suttas, eg. SN 16.12, SN 24.15–18, SN 33.1–55.

450. Khemā was extolled as the foremost nun in great wisdom (AN 1.236); her verses are at Thig 6.3; see SN 17.24:1.7. | Toraṇavatthu (“the site of the arch”) appears only here.

451. Pasenadi uses the default masculine forms, the significance of which becomes apparent below.

“Yes, Your Majesty,” replied that man. He searched all over Tora- 2.1
ṇavattu, but he couldn’t see a suitable ascetic or brahmin for the
king to pay homage to.

But he saw that the nun Khemā was staying there, so he went to 2.2
the king and said to him, “Your Majesty, there’s no (male) ascetic
or brahmin in Toraṇavattu for the king to pay homage to. But
there is the nun Khemā, who’s a disciple of the Blessed One, the
perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha. She has a good reputation
as being astute, competent, intelligent, learned, a brilliant speaker,
and eloquent. Your Majesty may pay homage to her.”⁴⁵²

Then King Pasenadi of Kosala went up to the nun Khemā, bowed, 4.1
sat down to one side, and said to her:⁴⁵³

“Ma’am, does a realized one still exist after death?”⁴⁵⁴ 4.2

“Great king, this has not been declared by the Buddha.” 4.3

“Well then, does a realized one no longer exist after death?”⁴⁵⁵ 4.5

“This too has not been declared by the Buddha.” 4.6

“Well then, does a realized one both still exist and no longer exist 4.8
after death?”⁴⁵⁶

“This has not been declared by the Buddha.” 4.9

452. Pasenadi was used to having philosophical conversations with his wife, Queen Mallikā (SN 3.8:1.2).

453. The king bows to the nun, just as he would to the Buddha.

454. That is, an awakened one, whether the Buddha or anyone else, exists after death, for example in heaven or an eternal state of Nirvana. | Here “realized one” (*tathāgata*) pertains to any arahant, as at SN 54.12. The Pali commentary says that a “living being” (*satta*) is meant. However, *tathāgata* and *satta* are exact verbal parallels: *tathā* (“real”) + *gata* (“come to the state of”) and *sa* (“real”) + *tta* (“state of”). Thus it seems likely that this was originally intended as a mere verbal gloss to explain the compound. That it does not mean just any sentient being is established at SN 22.86:1.5.

455. A sage ceases to exist at the time of death. This assumes there is an enduring “self” that is done away with.

456. This kind of “both A and not A” statement is not meant to be paradoxical or mystical. Rather, they represent some state that combines elements of both. For example, their body does not exist but their mind does.

- 4.11 “Well then, does a realized one neither still exist nor no longer exist after death?”⁴⁵⁷
- 4.12 “This too has not been declared by the Buddha.”
- 5.1 “Ma’am, when asked these questions, you say that this has not been declared by the Buddha. What’s the cause, what’s the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha?”
- 6.1 “Well then, Great King, I’ll ask you about this in return, and you can answer as you like. What do you think, Great King?”
- 6.3 Do you have any accountant or finger-tallier or reckoner who can count the grains of sand in the Ganges, that is,⁴⁵⁸ how many grains of sand there are, how many hundreds or thousands or hundreds of thousands of grains of sand?”
- 6.5 “No, ma’am.”
- 6.6 “Do you have any accountant or finger-tallier or reckoner who can count the water in the ocean, that is, how many gallons of water there are, how many hundreds or thousands or hundreds of thousands of gallons of water?”
- 6.8 “No, ma’am. Why is that? Because the ocean is deep, immeasurable, and hard to fathom.”
- 6.11 “In the same way, Great King, any form by which a realized one might be described has been cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated, and unable to arise in the future. A realized one is freed from reckoning in terms of form. They’re deep, immeasurable, and hard to fathom, like the ocean. To say that after death, a realized one still exists, or no longer exists, or both still exists and no longer exists, or neither still exists nor no longer exists: none of these apply.
- 7.1 Any feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness by which a realized one might be described has been cut off at the root, made

457. Likewise, “neither A nor not A” is not meant to be a paradox, but to indicate something that cannot be characterized by the original term. For example, a sage persists after death in a subtle state that is not what we normally consider existence.

458. Accountant (*gaṇaka*), finger-tallier (*muddika*), and reckoner (*saṅkhāyako*) are terms for the job that used to be called “computer”.

like a palm stump, obliterated, and unable to arise in the future. A realized one is freed from reckoning in terms of consciousness. They're deep, immeasurable, and hard to fathom, like the ocean. To say that after death, a realized one still exists, or no longer exists, or both still exists and no longer exists, or neither still exists nor no longer exists: none of these apply."

Then King Pasenadi approved and agreed with what the nun 9.5
Khemā said. Then he rose from his seat, bowed, and respectfully circled her, keeping her on his right, before leaving.

Then on a later occasion King Pasenadi of Kosala went up to the 10.1
Buddha, bowed, and sat down to one side. He asked the Buddha exactly the same questions he had asked the nun Khemā, and received the same answers.

He said, "It's incredible, sir, it's amazing! How the meaning and 13.1
the phrasing of the Teacher and the disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!"⁴⁵⁹ This one time I went to the nun Khemā and asked her about this matter. And she explained it to me with these words and phrases, just like the Buddha. It's incredible, sir, it's amazing! How the meaning and the phrasing of the Teacher and the disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!

Well, now, sir, I must go. I have many duties, and much to do." 13.7

"Please, Great King, go at your convenience." 13.9

Then King Pasenadi approved and agreed with what the Buddha 13.10
said. Then he rose from his seat, bowed, and respectfully circled him, keeping him on his right, before leaving.

459. Text has *virodhayissati* ("contradict"), whereas AN 11.7:10.2 has variant *viggayhissati* ("conflict").

SN 44.2

With Anurādhā

Anurādhāsutta

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying near Vesālī, at the Great Wood, in the hall with the peaked roof.⁴⁶⁰
- 1.2 Now at that time Venerable Anurādhā was staying not far from the Buddha in a wilderness hut. Then several wanderers of other religions went up to Venerable Anurādhā and exchanged greetings with him.
- 1.4 When the greetings and polite conversation were over, they sat down to one side and said to him:
- 1.5 “Reverend Anurādhā, when a realized one is describing a realized one—a supreme person, highest of people, who has reached the highest point—they describe them in these four ways: After death, a realized one still exists, or no longer exists, or both still exists and no longer exists, or neither still exists nor no longer exists.”
- 1.7 “Reverends, when a realized one is describing a realized one—a supreme person, highest of people, who has reached the highest point—they describe them other than these four ways: After death, a realized one still exists, or no longer exists, or both still exists and no longer exists, or neither still exists nor no longer exists.”
- 1.9 When he said this, the wanderers said to him, “This mendicant must be junior, recently gone forth, or else a foolish, incompetent senior mendicant.” Then, after rebuking Venerable Anurādhā by calling him “junior” and “foolish”, the wanderers rose from their seats and left.
- 2.1 Soon after they had left, Anurādhā thought, “If those wanderers were to inquire further, how should I answer them so as to repeat what the Buddha has said, and not misrepresent him with an untruth? How should I explain in line with his teaching, so that there would be no legitimate grounds for rebuttal and criticism?”

460. This is the same as SN 22.86.

Then Venerable Anurādhā went up to the Buddha, bowed, sat 2.4
down to one side, and told him what had happened.

“What do you think, Anurādhā? Is form permanent or imper- 3.1
manent?”

“Impermanent, sir.” 4.1

“But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 5.1

“Suffering, sir.” 6.1

“But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be 7.1
regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”

“No, sir.” 8.1

“Is feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness permanent 9.1
or impermanent?”

“Impermanent, sir.” 10.1

“But if it’s impermanent, is it suffering or happiness?” 11.1

“Suffering, sir.” 12.1

“But if it’s impermanent, suffering, and perishable, is it fit to be 13.1
regarded thus: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self’?”

“No, sir.” 14.1

“So, Anurādhā, you should truly see any kind of form at all— 15.1
past, future, or present; internal or external; solid or subtle; inferior
or superior; far or near: *all* form—with right understanding: ‘This
is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’ Any kind of feeling
... perception ... choices ... consciousness at all—past, future, or
present; internal or external; solid or subtle; inferior or superior; far
or near: *all* consciousness—with right understanding: ‘This is not
mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’

Seeing this, a learned noble disciple grows disillusioned with form, 15.6
feeling, perception, choices, and consciousness. Being disillusioned,
desire fades away. When desire fades away they’re freed. When
they’re freed, they know they’re freed.

They understand: ‘Rebirth is ended, the spiritual journey has 15.8
been completed, what had to be done has been done, there is nothing
further for this place.’

- 16.1 What do you think, Anurādhā? Do you consider that the label ‘realized one’ applies to form?”⁴⁶¹
- 16.3 “No, sir.”
- 16.4 “Do you consider that the label ‘realized one’ applies to feeling?” ... “... perception?” ... “... choices?” ... “... consciousness?”
- 16.11 “No, sir.”
- 16.12 “What do you think, Anurādhā? Do you consider that the label ‘realized one’ applies in relation to form?”
- 16.14 “No, sir.”
- 16.15 “Do you consider that the label ‘realized one’ applies apart from form?”
- 16.16 “No, sir.”
- 16.17 “Do you consider that the label ‘realized one’ applies in relation to feeling?” ... “... apart from feeling?” ... “... in relation to perception?” ... “... apart from perception?” ... “... in relation to choices?” ... “... apart from choices?” ... “... in relation to consciousness?” ... “... apart from consciousness?”
- 16.26 “No, sir.”
- 17.1 “What do you think, Anurādhā? Do you consider that the label ‘realized one’ applies to one who has form?” ... “... feeling?” ... “... perception?” ... “... choices?” ... “... consciousness?”⁴⁶²
- 17.3 “No, sir.”
- 17.4 “What do you think, Anurādhā? Do you consider that the label ‘realized one’ applies to that one who is without form?” ... “... feeling?” ... “... perception?” ... “... choices?” ... “... consciousness?”
- 17.6 “No, sir.”
- 17.7 “In that case, Anurādhā, since a realized one is not found by you as a genuine fact in this very life, is it cogent for you to declare: ‘Reverends, when a realized one is describing a realized one—a supreme person, highest of people, who has reached the highest point—they

461. This passage relies on the label usage of the nominative, as indicated by the particle *-ti*. It is a tricky passage to render consistently and coherently, so I make the syntax explicit.

462. See note on SN 22.85:10.2 for a discussion of this passage.

describe them other than these four ways: After death, a realized one still exists, or no longer exists, or both still exists and no longer exists, or neither still exists nor no longer exists’?”

“No, sir.”

17.11

“Good, good, Anurādha! In the past, as today, what I describe is suffering and the cessation of suffering.”

17.12

SN 44.3

With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (1st)

Paṭhamasāriputtakotṭhikasutta

At one time Venerable Sāriputta and Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita were staying near Varanasi in the deer park at Isipatana. 1.1

Then in the late afternoon, Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita came out of retreat, went to Venerable Sāriputta, and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to Sāriputta: 1.2

“Reverend Sāriputta, does a realized one still exist after death?” 2.1

“Reverend, this has not been declared by the Buddha.” 2.2

“Well then, does a realized one no longer exist after death? ... 2.4

Does a realized one both still exist and no longer exist after death? 2.7

...

Does a realized one neither still exist nor no longer exist after death?” 2.10

“This too has not been declared by the Buddha.” 2.11

“Reverend, when asked these questions, you say that they have not been declared by the Buddha. What’s the cause, what’s the reason why they have not been declared by the Buddha?” 3.1

“Reverend, ‘Does a realized one still exist after death?’ is included in form. ‘Does a realized one no longer exist after death?’ is included in form. ‘Does a realized one both still exist and no longer exist after death?’ is included in form. ‘Does a realized one neither still exist nor no longer exist after death?’ is included in form. 4.1

- 4.5 ‘Does a realized one still exist after death?’ is included in feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness. ‘Does a realized one no longer exist after death?’ is included in consciousness. ‘Does a realized one both still exist and no longer exist after death?’ is included in consciousness. ‘Does a realized one neither still exist nor no longer exist after death?’ is included in consciousness.
- 4.21 This is the cause, this is the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha.”

SN 44.4

With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (2nd)

Dutiyasāriputtakotṭhikasutta

- 1.1 At one time Venerable Sāriputta and Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita were staying near Varanasi in the deer park at Isipatana. ...
(The same down as far as:)
- 1.3 “What’s the cause, reverend, what’s the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha?”
- 1.4 “Reverend, not truly knowing and seeing form, its origin, its cessation, and the practice that leads to its cessation, one thinks ‘a realized one still exists after death’ or ‘a realized one no longer exists after death’ or ‘a realized one both still exists and no longer exists after death’ or ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’
- 1.8 Not truly knowing or seeing feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness, its origin, its cessation, and the practice that leads to its cessation, one thinks ‘a realized one still exists after death’ or ‘a realized one no longer exists after death’ or ‘a realized one both still exists and no longer exists after death’ or ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’
- 2.1 Truly knowing and seeing form ... feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness, its origin, its cessation, and the practice that leads to its cessation, one doesn’t think ‘a realized one still exists

after death’ or ‘a realized one no longer exists after death’ or ‘a realized one both still exists and no longer exists after death’ or ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’

This is the cause, this is the reason why this has not been declared 2.10
by the Buddha.”

SN 44.5

With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (3rd)

Tatīyasāriputtakoṭṭhikasutta

At one time Venerable Sāriputta and Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita were 1.1
staying near Varanasi in the deer park at Isipatana. ...

(The same down as far as:)

“What’s the cause, reverend, what’s the reason why this has not 1.3
been declared by the Buddha?”

“Reverend, if you’re not rid of greed, desire, fondness, thirst, pas- 1.4
sion, and craving for form ... feeling ... perception ... choices ...
consciousness, you think ‘a realized one still exists after death’ ... ‘a
realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’

If you are rid of greed for form ... feeling ... perception ... choices 1.11
... consciousness, you don’t think ‘a realized one still exists after
death’ ... ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after
death.’

This is the cause, this is the reason why this has not been declared 1.17
by the Buddha.”

SN 44.6

With Sāriputta and Koṭṭhita (4th)

Catutthasāriputtakoṭṭhikasutta

At one time Venerable Sāriputta and Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita were 1.1
staying near Varanasi in the deer park at Isipatana.

- 1.2 Then in the late afternoon, Venerable Sāriputta came out of retreat, went to Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita, and they greeted each other. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side and said to Mahākoṭṭhita:
- 1.4 “Reverend Koṭṭhita, does a realized one still exist after death?” ...
- 1.5 “Reverend, when asked these questions, you say that this has not been declared by the Buddha. What’s the cause, what’s the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha?”
- 2.1 “Reverend, if you like, love, and enjoy form, and don’t truly see the cessation of form, you think ‘a realized one still exists after death’ or ‘a realized one no longer exists after death’ or ‘a realized one both still exists and no longer exists after death’ or ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’
- 2.5 If you like, love, and enjoy feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness, and don’t truly see the cessation of consciousness, you think ‘a realized one still exists after death’ ... ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’
- 3.1 If you don’t like, love, and enjoy form ... feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness, and you truly see the cessation of consciousness, you don’t think ‘a realized one still exists after death’ ... ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’
- 3.8 This is the cause, this is the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha.”
- 4.1 “But reverend, could there be another way of explaining why this was not declared by the Buddha?”
- 4.2 “There could, reverend. If you like, love, and enjoy existence, and don’t truly see the cessation of continued existence, you think ‘a realized one still exists after death’ ... ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’ If you don’t like, love, and enjoy existence, and you truly see the cessation of continued existence, you don’t think ‘a realized one still exists after death’ ... ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’ This too is a way of explaining why this was not declared by the Buddha.”

“But reverend, could there be another way of explaining why this 5.1
was not declared by the Buddha?”

“There could, reverend. 5.2

If you like, love, and enjoy grasping, and don’t truly see the ces- 5.3
sation of grasping, you think ‘a realized one still exists after death’ ...
‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’

If you don’t like, love, and enjoy grasping, and you truly see the 5.5
cessation of grasping, you don’t think ‘a realized one still exists after
death’ ... ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after
death.’

This too is a way of explaining why this was not declared by the 5.7
Buddha.”

“But reverend, could there be another way of explaining why this 6.1
was not declared by the Buddha?”

“There could, reverend. 6.2

If you like, love, and enjoy craving, and don’t truly see the ces- 6.3
sation of craving, you think ‘a realized one still exists after death’ ...
‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death.’

If you don’t like, love, and enjoy craving, and you truly see the 6.5
cessation of craving, you don’t think ‘a realized one still exists after
death’ ... ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after
death.’

This too is a way of explaining why this was not declared by the 6.7
Buddha.”

“But reverend, could there be another way of explaining why this 7.1
was not declared by the Buddha?”

“Seriously, reverend, what more could you want? For one who is 7.2
freed due to the ending of craving, there is no cycle of rebirths to be
found.”

SN 44.7

With Moggallāna

Moggallānasutta

- 1.1 Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to Venerable Mahāmoggallāna, and exchanged greetings with him.⁴⁶³ When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to Mahāmoggallāna:
- 2.1 “Worthy Moggallāna, is this right: ‘the cosmos is eternal’?”⁴⁶⁴
- 2.2 “Vaccha, this has not been declared by the Buddha.”
- 2.4 “Then is this right: ‘the cosmos is not eternal’ ... ‘the cosmos is finite’ ...⁴⁶⁵ ‘the cosmos is infinite’ ... ‘the soul and the body are one and the same’ ...⁴⁶⁶ ‘the soul is one thing, the body another’ ... ‘a realized one still exists after death’ ... ‘a realized one no longer exists after death’ ... ‘a realized one both still exists and no longer exists after death’ ... ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death’?”

463. See SN 33.1:1.2 and note for Vacchagotta. | This discourse introduces the full set of ten undeclared points.

464. *Loka* originally meant “light”, hence the sky bright with gods (stars), from which developed the meanings “heaven”, a “world”, and the “cosmos”. Sometimes Vedists believed that an “eternal world” was won by those worthy (DN 1:1.31.5). However, the Suttas often discuss the Upaniṣadic notion that the “self and the cosmos are eternal” (DN 1:1.30.1, MN 102:14.2), where *loka* means the “cosmos” as a whole, not a specific heavenly “world”. But the distinction is not always clear-cut. See also next note.

465. The distinction between a limited “world” and an infinite “cosmos” was said to depend on the wisdom and spiritual depth of the individual: “Those who venerate (water, breath, and moon) as finite win only a limited world, whereas those who venerate them as infinite win a world without limit” (Bṛhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 1.5.13, Olivelle translation).

466. The term “soul” (*jīva*) was favored by the *samaṇas*, as opposed to the “self” (*attā*) of the brahmins. Both are rejected by the Buddha as forms of “metaphysical” self: they postulate the absolute, eternal existence of entities that cannot be established empirically. The repeated demonstrative pronouns (*taṃ jīvaṃ taṃ sarīraṃ*) assert an emphatic identity.

“This too has not been declared by the Buddha.” 2.29

“What’s the cause, worthy Moggallāna, what’s the reason why, 3.1
when the wanderers of other religions are asked these questions, they
declare one of these to be true? And what’s the reason why, when
the ascetic Gotama is asked these questions, he does not declare one
of these to be true?”

“Vaccha, the wanderers of other religions regard the eye like this: 4.1
‘This is mine, I am this, this is my self.’ They regard the ear ... nose
... tongue ... body ... mind like this: ‘This is mine, I am this, this is
my self.’

That’s why, when asked, they declare one of those answers to be 4.4
true.

The Realized One, the perfected one, the fully awakened Buddha 4.7
regards the eye like this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not
my self.’ He regards the ear ... nose ... tongue ... body ... mind like
this: ‘This is not mine, I am not this, this is not my self.’

That’s why, when asked, he does not declare one of those answers 4.10
to be true.”

Then the wanderer Vacchagotta rose from his seat and went to the 5.1
Buddha and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and
polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side. He asked the
Buddha the same questions, and received the same answers.

He said, “It’s incredible, worthy Gotama, it’s amazing! How the 8.1
meaning and the phrasing of the Teacher and the disciple fit together
and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!
Just now I went to the ascetic Mahāmoggallāna and asked him about
this matter. And he explained it to me with these words and phrases,
just like the worthy Gotama. It’s incredible, worthy Gotama, it’s
amazing! How the meaning and the phrasing of the Teacher and the
disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes
to the chief matter!”

SN 44.8

With Vacchagotta

Vacchagottasutta

- 1.1 Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to the Buddha and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to the Buddha:
- 1.3 “Worthy Gotama, is this right: ‘the cosmos is eternal’?”
- 1.4 “This has not been declared by me, Vaccha.” ...
- 1.5 “Then is this right: ‘a realized one neither still exists nor no longer exists after death’?”
- 1.6 “This too has not been declared by me.”
- 2.1 “What’s the cause, worthy Gotama, what’s the reason why, when the wanderers of other religions are asked these questions, they declare one of these to be true? And what’s the reason why, when the worthy Gotama is asked these questions, he does not declare one of these to be true?”
- 3.1 “Vaccha, the wanderers of other religions regard form as self, self as having form, form in self, or self in form. They regard feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness as self, self as having consciousness, consciousness in self, or self in consciousness.
- 3.6 That’s why, when asked, they declare one of those answers to be true.
- 3.9 The Realized One doesn’t regard form as self, self as having form, form in self, or self in form. He doesn’t regard feeling ... perception ... choices ... consciousness as self, self as having consciousness, consciousness in self, or self in consciousness.
- 3.14 That’s why, when asked, he does not declare one of those answers to be true.”
- 4.1 Then the wanderer Vacchagotta rose from his seat and went to Venerable Mahāmoggallāna, and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one

side. He asked Mahāmoggallāna the same questions, and received the same answers.

He said, “It’s incredible, worthy Moggallāna, it’s amazing. How 7.1
the meaning and the phrasing of the Teacher and the disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter! Just now I went to the ascetic Gotama and asked him about this matter. And he explained it to me with these words and phrases, just like the worthy Moggallāna. It’s incredible, worthy Moggallāna, it’s amazing! How the meaning and the phrasing of the Teacher and the disciple fit together and agree without contradiction when it comes to the chief matter!”

SN 44.9

The Debating Hall

Kutūhalasālāsutta

Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to the Buddha and ex- 1.1
changed greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to the Buddha:

“Worthy Gotama, a few days ago several ascetics, brahmins, and 2.1
wanderers who follow various other religions were sitting together in the debating hall, and this discussion came up among them:⁴⁶⁷ ‘This Pūraṇa Kassapa leads an order and a community, and tutors a community. He’s a well-known and famous religious founder, deemed holy by many people. When a disciple passes away, he declares that this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there. And as for a disciple who is a supreme person, highest of people, having reached the highest point, when they pass away he also declares that this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there.’

This bamboo-staffed ascetic Gosāla ... the Jain ascetic of the Nā- 3.1
tika clan ... Sañjaya Belaṭṭhiputta ... Pakudha Kaccāyana ... Ajita of

467. Compare the similar passage at MN 77:6.3, which also introduces the six ascetic teachers.

the hair blanket leads an order and a community, and tutors a community. He's a well-known and famous religious founder, deemed holy by many people. When a disciple passes away, he declares that this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there. And as for a disciple who is a supreme person, highest of people, having reached the highest point, when they pass away he also declares that this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there.

4.1 This ascetic Gotama leads an order and a community, and tutors a community. He's a well-known and famous religious founder, deemed holy by many people. When a disciple passes away, he declares that this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there.

4.4 But as for a disciple who is a supreme person, highest of people, having reached the highest point, when they pass away he doesn't declare that this one is reborn here, while that one is reborn there. Rather, he declares that they have cut off craving, cast off the fetters, and by rightly comprehending conceit have made an end of suffering.' I had doubt and uncertainty about that: 'How on earth can I understand the ascetic Gotama's teaching?'"

5.1 "Vaccha, no wonder you're doubting and uncertain. Doubt has come up in you about an uncertain matter.

5.3 I describe rebirth for someone who grasps fuel, not for someone who does not. It's like a fire which only burns with fuel, not without fuel.⁴⁶⁸ In the same way I describe rebirth for someone who grasps fuel, not for someone who doesn't grasp fuel."

6.1 "But when a flame is blown away by the wind, what does the worthy Gotama say is its fuel then?"

6.2 "At such a time, I say that it's fueled by the wind. For the wind is its fuel then."

468. The simile of the fire going out for lack of fuel is famously discussed with Vacchagotta in MN 72.

“But when someone who is attached has laid down this body and 6.4
has not been reborn in one of the realms, what does the worthy
Gotama say is their fuel then?”⁴⁶⁹

“When someone who is attached has laid down this body, Vaccha, 6.5
and has not been reborn in one of the realms, I say they’re fueled by
craving. For craving is their fuel then.”

SN 44.10

With Ānanda

Ānandasutta

Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to the Buddha and ex- 1.1
changed greetings with him. When the greetings and polite con-
versation were over, he sat down to one side and said to the Buddha:

“Worthy Gotama, does the self survive?”⁴⁷⁰ But when he said 1.3
this, the Buddha kept silent.

“Then does the self not survive?” But for a second time the Bud- 1.5
dha kept silent. Then the wanderer Vacchagotta rose from his seat
and left.⁴⁷¹

469. This is one of several passages that acknowledge an “in-between state” after death and before rebirth. See also SN 12.11:1.3, SN 35.87:11.8, SN 46.3:9.5. | In parallel phrases, *aññataraṃ* qualifies the realm of rebirth (eg. AN 6.34:1.5: *aññataraṃ brahmalokaṃ upapanno*). This must be the meaning of the second *kāya* here, rather than “body”. | I read *satto* as “attached”, since one who has been freed would not be reborn.

470. For “does the self survive” (*atthattā*, resolving to *atthi attā*), compare “my self survives” (*atthi me attā*, MN 2:8.2) and “do gods survive” (*atthi devā*, MN 90:13.2). In each case the question is whether the self continues to exist (*atthi*) or not (*natthi*) after death. We find a similar usage in Kaṭṭha Upaniṣad 1.20, where Naciketa wonders what happens to a man after he dies, as “some say he survives, while others say he does not survive” (*astīty eke nāyam astīti caike*).

471. Compare the behavior of Mogharāja at Snp 5.16. He has asked his question twice, but the Buddha was silent. Patiently, he asks a third time, and is answered at last. We have seen ample evidence of Vacchagotta’s relentless questioning. Here it is not the Buddha who loses patience, but Vacchagotta, who is so used to getting the answers he wants. It seems he is at some sort of crisis point.

- 2.1 And then, not long after Vacchagotta had left, Venerable Ānanda said to the Buddha:
- 2.2 “Sir, why didn’t you answer Vacchagotta’s question?”⁴⁷²
- 2.3 “Ānanda, when Vacchagotta asked me whether the self survives, if I had answered that ‘the self survives’ I would have been siding with the ascetics and brahmins who are eternalists.⁴⁷³ When Vacchagotta asked me whether the self does not survive, if I had answered that ‘the self does not survive’ I would have been siding with the ascetics and brahmins who are annihilationists.⁴⁷⁴
- 2.5 When Vacchagotta asked me whether the self survives, if I had answered that ‘the self survives’, would that have facilitated the arising of the knowledge that⁴⁷⁵ all things are not-self?”
- 2.7 “No, sir.”
- 2.8 “When Vacchagotta asked me whether the self does not survive, if I had answered that ‘the self does not survive’, Vacchagotta—who is already confused—would have got even more confused, thinking: ‘It seems that the self that I once had no longer survives.’”⁴⁷⁶

SN 44.11

With Sabhiya Kaccāna

Sabhiyakaccānasutta

- 1.1 At one time Venerable Sabhiya Kaccāna was staying at Nātika in the brick house. Then the wanderer Vacchagotta went up to him,

472. The Buddha gives four answers. In the first pair he explains his theoretical objections: a straight yes/no answer would have aligned him with the eternalists or annihilationists. In the second pair, he considers what would have been helpful for Vacchagotta in his current state.

473. Things that *atthi* (“exist”, here to “continue to exist” or “survive”) were truly real and hence immortal. Thus “existence” or “survival” of the self implies eternalism. See SN 12.15:2.1 and note.

474. That is to say, there is currently a self that will cease to exist.

475. The existence or survival of the self is incompatible with the Buddha’s teaching of not-self.

476. That is, he would have taken it for the annihilationist view.

and exchanged greetings with him. When the greetings and polite conversation were over, he sat down to one side, and said to Sabhiya Kaccāna:

- “Worthy Kaccāna, does a realized one still exist after death?” 1.4
- “Vaccha, this has not been declared by the Buddha.” 1.5
- “Well then, does a realized one no longer exist after death?” 1.7
- “This too has not been declared by the Buddha.” 1.8
- “Well then, does a realized one both still exist and no longer exist after death?” 2.1
- “This has not been declared by the Buddha.” 2.2
- “Well then, does a realized one neither still exist nor no longer exist after death?” 2.4
- “This too has not been declared by the Buddha.” 2.5
- “Worthy Kaccāna, when asked these questions, you say that this has not been declared by the Buddha. What’s the cause, what’s the reason why this has not been declared by the Buddha?” 3.1
- “In order to describe him as ‘formed’ or ‘formless’ or ‘percipient’ or ‘non-percipient’ or ‘neither percipient nor non-percipient’, there must be some cause or reason for doing so. But if that cause and reason were to totally and utterly cease without remainder, how could you describe him in any such terms?” 3.14
- “Worthy Kaccāna, how long has it been since you went forth?” 3.16
- “Not long, reverend: three years.” 3.17
- “One who has learned this much in this time, reverend, has learned a lot, who can say what lies ahead!” 3.18

The Linked Discourses on undeclared questions are complete.

THE BOOK OF THE SIX SENSE FIELDS IS FINISHED.

Colophon

The Translator

Bhikkhu Sujato was born as Anthony Aidan Best on 4/11/1966 in Perth, Western Australia. He grew up in the pleasant suburbs of Mt Lawley and Attadale alongside his sister Nicola, who was the good child. His mother, Margaret Lorraine Huntsman née Pinder, said “he’ll either be a priest or a poet”, while his father, Anthony Thomas Best, advised him to “never do anything for money”. He attended Aquinas College, a Catholic school, where he decided to become an atheist. At the University of WA he studied philosophy, aiming to learn what he wanted to do with his life. Finding that what he wanted to do was play guitar, he dropped out. His main band was named Martha’s Vineyard, which achieved modest success in the indie circuit.

A seemingly random encounter with a roadside joey took him to Thailand, where he entered his first meditation retreat at Wat Ram Poeng, Chiang Mai in 1992. Feeling the call to the Buddha’s path, he took full ordination in Wat Pa Nanachat in 1994, where his teachers were Ajahn Pasanno and Ajahn Jayasaro. In 1997 he returned to Perth to study with Ajahn Brahm at Bodhinyana Monastery.

He spent several years practicing in seclusion in Malaysia and Thailand before establishing Santi Forest Monastery in Bundanoon, NSW, in 2003. There he was instrumental in supporting the establishment of the Theravada bhikkhuni order in Australia and advocating for women’s rights. He continues to teach in Australia and globally,

with a special concern for the moral implications of climate change and other forms of environmental destruction. He has published a series of books of original and groundbreaking research on early Buddhism.

In 2005 he founded SuttaCentral together with Rod Bucknell and John Kelly. In 2015, seeing the need for a complete, accurate, plain English translation of the Pali texts, he undertook the task, spending nearly three years in isolation on the isle of Qi Mei off the coast of the nation of Taiwan. He completed the four main Nikāyas in 2018, and the early books of the Khuddaka Nikāya were complete by 2021. All this work is dedicated to the public domain and is entirely free of copyright encumbrance.

In 2019 he returned to Sydney where he established Lokanta Vihara (The Monastery at the End of the World).

Creation Process

Primary source was the digital Mahāsaṅgīti edition of the Pali Tīpiṭaka. Translated from the Pali, with reference to several English translations, especially those of Bhikkhu Bodhi.

The Translation

This translation was part of a project to translate the four Pali Nikāyas with the following aims: plain, approachable English; consistent terminology; accurate rendition of the Pali; free of copyright. It was made during 2016–2018 while Bhikkhu Sujato was staying in Qimei, Taiwan.

About SuttaCentral

SuttaCentral publishes early Buddhist texts. Since 2005 we have provided root texts in Pali, Chinese, Sanskrit, Tibetan, and other languages, parallels between these texts, and translations in many

modern languages. Building on the work of generations of scholars, we offer our contribution freely.

SuttaCentral is driven by volunteer contributions, and in addition we employ professional developers. We offer a sponsorship program for high quality translations from the original languages. Financial support for SuttaCentral is handled by the SuttaCentral Development Trust, a charitable trust registered in Australia.

About Bilara

“Bilara” means “cat” in Pali, and it is the name of our Computer Assisted Translation (CAT) software. Bilara is a web app that enables translators to translate early Buddhist texts into their own language. These translations are published on SuttaCentral with the root text and translation side by side.

About SuttaCentral Editions

The SuttaCentral Editions project makes high quality books from selected Bilara translations. These are published in formats including HTML, EPUB, PDF, and print.

You are welcome to print any of our Editions.